

213 *Re: Question of Privilege* PHALGUNA 9, 1907 (SAKA) *Re: Question of Privilege* 214
against the Minister of State
in the Ministry of Finance *against the Minister of*
Finance

be added to it. If you want I can read it out.

SHRI BHATTAM SRIRAMAMURTY :
Please read it.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM PYARE PANIKA (Roberts-ganj) : Sir, some miscreants fired indiscriminately, in the presence of the police, on a function being held on the occasion of Ravidas Jayanti on Monday in Ghoswal, located in my constituency, Mirzapur in which two Harijans were killed and several persons injured (Interruptions).

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: As long as the Government exists in the State I cannot handle it. Not allowed.

(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot,

[Translation]

I have called Shri Tewary.

[English]

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : Will you kindly recall that you had assured the House that you would allow a discussion on the fast deteriorating conditions in Punjab and influx of terrorists from across the border.

MR. SPEAKER : I am already seized of the situation.

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : People are being killed daily. The Golden Temple has become the sheet anchor of extremists and separatists. In this condition the Home Minister should make a statement on the situation and should make a statement on the situation and also about the situation in Jammu & Kashmir...

MR. SPEAKER : I am seized of the situation very much. And every one is agitated in the House, because it has become a sort of butchery ground there. I think. the

Government is anxious to deal with it. And at an appropriate time I will get back to you.

SHRI P. NAMGYAL : It is not only the concern of Punjab but the whole country including Jammu & Kashmir. The situation in Jammu & Kashmir is not good ..

MR. SPEAKER : This is something else and that is something else. These two subjects cannot be co-related. These are not inter-linked.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : When I have already assured you, then why are you taking the time of the House unnecessarily ?

12.10 hrs.

RE: QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE AGAINST THE MINISTER OF FINANCE FOR ALLEGEDLY RELEASING TO THE PRESS ON 10.2.1986 ESTIMATES OF PROJECTED REVENUE AND EXPENDITURE OF CENTRAL GOVERNMENT BEFORE PRESENTATION OF BUDGET.

MR. SPEAKER : Shri S.M. Bhattam, Prof. Madhu Dandavate, Sarvashri V. Sobhanadreeswara Rao, Thampan Thomas and M. Raghuma Reddy gave separate notices of question of privilege against Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh, Minister of Finance for allegedly releasing to the Press on 10th February, 1986 estimates of the projected revenue and expenditure of the Central Government for 1986-87, while addressing a Press Conference.

The Members in their notices have referred to the following news report published in the *Hindustan Times* dated 11th February, 1986, under the heading "86-87 revenue estimates released" :—

"Breaking all conventions, Union Finance Minister V.P. Singh today released a head of the Budget, estimates of the projected revenue and expenditure of the Central Government for 1986-87 as per the long-term fiscal policy, which place the revenue to

be raised from public enterprises at Rs. 4,704 crore more than the current year's Rs. 6,753 crore to finance the Annual Plan of Rs. 19,845 crore.

Mr. Singh made it plain at a Press Conference that there was hardly any escape from increase in administered prices as a resource raising measure. The other alternative was to cut down the Plan itself. He did not say what will be his own preference which will be known when he presents the budget."

The Members have contended that by releasing these figures to the Press before presenting the Budget to the House, the Finance Minister has violated all established norms and conventions and has committed contempt of the House.

The notices of the Members were sent to the Minister of Finance for his comments. The Minister of Finance in his reply dated 20th February, 1986 has denied that the figures relating to the 1986-87 Budget were released to the Press. He has stated *inter alia* :—

"It is not a fact that the revenue estimates for 1986-87 were released to the Press. The figures furnished to the Press were the results of a shadow exercise presented to the Members of the Consultative Committee to estimate the receipts and expenditure for 1986-87 on the basis of a Central Plan outlay of Rs. 19,845 crores equivalent to Rs. 18,000 crores at 1984-85 prices as projected for the year in the long term fiscal policy. These figures are based on the Seventh Plan, which has already been released to the public. The exercise was to work out the various estimates of receipts and expenditure, including the contributions required to be made by the public enterprises, on the basis of the relative percentages of different resources and plan and non-plan expenditures assumed in the Seventh Plan document.

In view of the resource requirements for financing the Seventh Plan, it is useful to have a wider debate in

the Press and the public on the avenues of raising resources, the priorities in allocating resources and the efficiency levels which are required to be achieved by all including the public enterprises...such a debate will go to strengthen the democratic institutions in the country.....no figures relating to the 1986-87 Budget were given either to the Consultative Committee or to the Press."

Now, first according to the categorical statement of the Finance Minister the newspaper report has no factual basis and there has been no release of the revenue estimates for 1986-87 to the Press.

Secondly, it is well established and has been held repeatedly by me and by my distinguished predecessors that leakage of budget proposals cannot form any basis for a breach of privilege. Until the financial proposals are placed before the House, they are an official secret.

I do not, therefore, give my consent for raising the matter in the House as a question of privilege under rule 222.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur) : Sir, I gave regrets to Professor Trivedi for having given this...(Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER : Shri P. Shiv Shanker.

12.14 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

[English]

Notifications under Export (Quality Control and Inspection) Act, under Warehousing Corporation Act, Rice-Milling Industry (Regulation) Act

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE AND FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER) : I beg to lay on the Table :