

criminatory nature shall be made by a member against any persons unless the member has given adequate advance notice to the Speaker and also to the Minister concerned.....”

Now Dr. Vijay Kumar Malhotra is, I believe, normally a sensible and balanced person. I do not expect him to say such a thing. If he has said that, he should apologise. This is against the elementary rules..... (Interruptions)

SHRIYADVENDRA DATT: He has made no allegation.

PROF. P. J. KURIEN (Mavelikara): Sir, it is amply clear that Mr. Malhotra has taken the name of Mr. Akbar.....(Interruptions) We only request an apology from him. Please direct him to apologise before this House. Not only he has brought disrespect to Mayawati Ji but also violated the rules. I request you to kindly ask Mr. Malhotra to apologize.

MR. SPEAKER: I have asked Mr. Akbar to give his personal explanation.

(Interruptions)

PROF. P. J. KURIEN: It is not a question of personal explanation. It is in violation of rules and disrespect to the Member. He should apologise.

MR. SPEAKER: It is customary that if a Member's name is taken, he is given the right to explain. I have allowed him to explain.

(Interruptions)

PROF. P. J. KURIEN:..... (Interruptions) Please direct him to apologise..... (Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI P. UPENDRA): If there is any objectionable word, you can delete it from the proceedings.

MR. SPEAKER: I will go into the record. No allegation of a personal nature would go on record. Yes, Mr. Sathe. I am now allowing you to make a submission.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

SHRI P. C. THOMAS (Muvattupuzha): Sir, I have a point of order. Can junior Members raise point of order?

MR. SPEAKER: What is it you are asking? There is no junior or senior Member.

SHRI P. C. THOMAS: Then, I have a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: What is the point of order? under what rule? (Interruptions)

SHRI P. C. THOMAS: Under Rule 376. I raise this point of order. Now Dr. Malhotraji..... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Regarding that, I have said what I have to say. There is no point of order.

Mr. Sathe, please be brief.

RE: QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

12.39 hrs.

[English]

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Wardha): I will be very brief Sir. Sir, there is a healthy convention and a tradition in this House started right from the beginning and I would like to quote the rulings of your learned predecessors when the matter was brought to their notice by senior Members of the House like Shri Indrajit Guptaji, Shri Dandavateji and others. This has been very clearly stated. I would only like to reiterate that..... (Interruptions)

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Have you given the consent, Sir?..... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Are they not your friends?

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, I will not take much time. I know the rules. I know that a statement of policy or a proposal of policy made outside, when the House is in session, is not technically a breach of privilege..... (*Interruptions*)

AN HON. MEMBER: Do you know that?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Yes, I know it. I am not, therefore, urging it. I have raised it because as a convention- this House also goes by healthy conventions it has been held repeatedly, right from the beginning of our parliament, that any such statement made outside is an act of impropriety and Government or Ministers should not do it. I will only read two portions from your predecessors' decisions, nothing more.

MR. SPEAKER: Is it necessary?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Yes, it is, Sir. It is for the guidance of you and us, Sir. On March 7, 1988, on a point raised by Shri Dandavate and Shri Indrajit Guptaji, the Speaker had to make this observation..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It is not necessary.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Yes, Sir, it is. I will not take much time.

MR. SPEAKER: Within a second you finish it.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, kindly don't say like that. I am doing it for the sake of

interest of the House..... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I am permitting him.

[*English*]

SHRI VASANT SATHE: I am reading out, Sir: "No breach of privilege. It is disallowed. However, it is well-established that when Parliament is in session, policy decisions must first be announced on the floor of the House. It is a matter of judgement whether the present decision amounts to a policy decision or not. I do feel that when Parliament is in session, it would have been more desirable to take the House into confidence and inform it of the proposed action, instead of Members knowing of important developments only through the newspapers." here, Sir, it is also television-"I have mentioned it as a matter of propriety and hope that in future such decisions would be first announced on the floor of the House." This was in 1988. But let us go back as early as..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You have said it now.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, I will like also to quote Sardar Hukam Singh deciding on May 1st, 1959. This is when it was raised by Tyagiji and Feroze Gandhi..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mayawatiji, please take your seat..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Take your seat please. I have not permitted you..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Sathe, please conclude.....

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Mayawati Ji, please sit

down You should not speak without my permission

(Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER Mayawati Ji you cannot speak without my permission

[English]

(Interruptions)

SHRI P UPENDRA Sir she cannot hold the House to ransom like this

MR SPEAKER Miss Mayawati if you don't behave properly, if you repeatedly disobey the Chair I will be compelled to ask you to quit the House Please take your seat

(Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER Yes Mr Sathe

SHRI VASANT SATHE When it was brought to my notice I requested all hon Members who are Ministers not to make statements outside When the House is in session, matters of policy must first be communicated to this House and thereafter through other sources Therefore, it is a matter of regret that important matters like the LIC Report should have been noticed in the newspapers

MR SPEAKER That is all right That is not necessary

SHRI VASANT SATHE It is necessary, Sir

'Again and again questions are put and the Government answers the questions by saying that the report has no doubt been received but it is under consideration But before it is ultimately brought to this House, every person other than a Member of this House seems to know it It is rather unfortunate I do wish that it should be rigorously taken note of that no statement shall be made by any Minister outside this House Otherwise,

this House could become only a rubber stamp for anything that is happening elsewhere "

So, Sir, my submission is this Yesterday the Prime Minister gave a statement Sir, that statement-nearly verbatim-has appeared in the newspapers earlier Sir, the decision was taken by the Political Affairs Committee, presided over by the Prime Minister and, Sir, it was announced on the Television which is the medium under the Government in those very terms that were later on quoted Sir, what is the sanctity? When the news came the next day that was absolutely quoted Sir I would beg of you that just to play with a word here and say that it is not our policy but a proposal has no meaning It is a proposal as also a policy Therefore, I would like you, Sir kindly to give a ruling that this is a breach of healthy precedent, well-established conventions and kindly ask the Government not to do this In fact, I would have requested the Prime Minister to express regret to this House That being so, if the Government tries to justify this, I feel that the House is reduced to a rubber stamp and a mockery

MR SPEAKER It is well established that no privilege of the House is involved if statements on matters of public interest are not first made in the House and are made outside In the instant case, I find that the Prime Minister has taken the first opportunity to inform the House about Government's proposal to reserve 5-10% of jobs in Government services for people belonging to economically weaker sections and for providing more job opportunities for the youth

Hence no question of privilege is involved The notices given under Rule 22 by S/Shri K V Thomas, Vasant Sathe, P C Thomas and Era Anbarasu are out of order

Now, Mr Kumaramangalam

MR SPEAKER Mr Kumaramangalam

(Interruptions)

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Wardha) We

are walking out in protest.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I have given my Ruling.

(Interruptions)

PROF. P. J. KURIEN (Mavelikara): Are you disregarding the Rulings of your learned predecessors? You should have commented on the impropriety committed by the Prime Minister. We are walking out in protest.

(At this stage, Prof. P. J. Kurien and some other hon. Members left the House)

12.51 1/2 hrs.

49 PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Oil and Natural Gas Commission (Death, Retirement and Terminal Gratuity (Amendment) Regulations, 1989

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Now Papers Laid on the Table. Shri Gurupadaswamy.

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI P. UPENDRA): Sir, on behalf of Shri M.S. Gurupadaswamy, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Oil and Natural Gas Commission (Death, Retirement and Terminal Gratuity) (Amendment) Regulations, 1989 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. Sec/RR/3.7.89 in Gazette of India dated the 24th February, 1990 under sub-section (4) of section 32 of the Oil and Natural Gas Commission Act, 1959. [Placed in the Library. See No. LT—1347/90]

12.52 hrs.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS

350 Third Report — 320

[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Sir, I beg to present the Third Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on Public Undertakings on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Sixty-first Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on India Tourism Development Corporation Limited.

12.53 hrs.

BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Sixteenth Report

[English]

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM (SHRI SATYA PAL MALIK): Sir, I move:

"That this House do agree with the Sixteenth Report of the Business Advisory Committee presented to the House on 27th August 1990"

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM NAIK (Bombay North): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the notice I gave.....

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Naik ji, your notice was received, but it was too late. That is why you are not being permitted.