

9. It has been held by earlier Speakers that Members cannot read even letters received by them from the President unless President's specific permission to do so has been obtained by them. Also, members are not allowed to refer to any private talks which they may have had with the President. So far as any talks between the Prime Minister or the Council of Ministers and the President or any letters exchanged between them are concerned, they are entirely between them and not the concern of the House. Also, such official correspondence and discussions at the highest level—between the President and his advisers (the Ministers)—are in their very nature, confidential, privileged and protected.

10. I may also add that Rule 352 (v) provides that conduct of persons in high authority cannot be discussed except on a substantive motion drawn in proper terms. Thus, in the case of Ministers, their conduct can be discussed only on a Motion of Censure or No Confidence. It should, however, be stressed that even during the discussion on a motion of censure or no confidence in the Ministers, the name of the President, the relationship between the President and the Prime Minister or the Council of Ministers including the advice tendered or received or correspondence, if any, exchanged between them cannot be allowed to be brought in to influence the debate.

11. In view of the express provisions of the Constitution, the Rules, the precedents and the earlier rulings, I do not consider that any case has been made out requiring me to reconsider the matter. Accordingly, I reiterate my ruling and withhold my consent to the matter being raised as a question of privilege or otherwise. No Member has my consent to raise this issue again on the floor of the House in any form.

12. The high institutions created by the Constitution including those of the President and the Council of Ministers with the Prime Minister at its head are embodiments of our national aspirations. I am absolutely clear in my mind that any debate on the floor of the House which brings in the name of the President into any controversy or which tends to discuss the relationship between the President and his Council of Ministers, must

be avoided at all costs in the wider interests of the nation. We are still in the process of developing sound conventions and traditions. Let us not, in the heat of the moment, do something which might hamper this process.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You have got no decency. I am on my legs. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing goes on record without my permission.

(Interruptions)\*\*

MR. SPEAKER : While confirming my earlier rulings, I would, therefore, again appeal to all sections of the House to desist from making it a political or party issue to be debated or a matter for points to be scored against each other.

(Interruptions)\*\*

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing goes on record, whatever they say.

(Interruptions)\*\*

12.14 hrs.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

[English]

Inland Waterways Authority of India  
Rules, 1986, Annual Administrative  
Reports and Reviews on the wor-  
king of Paradeep Port Trust  
for 1985-86 and Bombay  
Port Trust for 1985-86  
etc. etc.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE  
MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT  
(SHRI RAJESH PILOT) : I beg to lay on  
the Table :

- (1) A copy of the Inland Waterways Authority of India Rules, 1986 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. G. S. R.

\*\*Not recorded.

1275 (E) in Gazette of India dated the 10th December, 1986 under section 36 of the Inland Waterways Authority of India Act, 1985.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3985/87.]

(2) (i) A copy of the Annual Administration Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Paradeep Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Paradeep Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3986/87.]

(3) (i) A copy of the Annual Administration Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Bombay Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Bombay Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3987/87.]

(4) A copy each of the following papers (Hindi and English versions) under sub-section (2) of section 103 of the Major Port Trusts Act, 1963 :

(a) (i) Annual Accounts of the Kandla Port Trust for the year 1985-86 and the Audit Report thereon.

(ii) Review by the Government on the Audited Accounts of the Kandla Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3988/87.]

(b) (i) Annual Accounts of the Paradeep Port Trust for the year 1985-86 and the Audit Report thereon.

(ii) Review by the Government on the Audited Accounts of the

Paradeep Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3989/87.]

(c) (i) Annual Accounts of the Cochin Port Trust for the year 1985-86 and the Audit Report thereon.

(ii) Review by the Government on the Audited Accounts of the Cochin Port Trust for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3990/87.]

**Detailed Demands of Grants of the Ministry of Home Affairs for 1987-88**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI CHINTAMANI PANIGRAHI) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Detailed Demands for Grants (Hindi and English versions) of the Ministry of Home Affairs for 1987-88.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3991/87.]

**Notification under Customs Act, 1962**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of Notification No. S. O. 168 (E) (Hindi and English versions) published in Gazette of India dated the 10th March, 1987 together with an explanatory memorandum regarding revised rate of exchange for conversion of Pound Sterling into Indian currency or *vice-versa* under section 159 of the Customs Act, 1962.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3992/87.]

**Annual Reports and Reviews on the working of Indian Institute of Technology for 1985-86 and Regional Engineering College, Srinagar for 1985-86, etc. etc.**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENTS OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI KRISHNA SAHI) : I beg to lay on the Table :

(1) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Indian Institute of Technology, Kanpur, for the year 1985-86.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Indian Institute of Technology, Kanpur, for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3993/87.]

(2) A statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3993/87.]

(3) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Regional Engineering College, Srinagar, for the year 1985-86.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Regional Engineering College, Srinagar, for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3994/87.]

(4) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the National Council of Science Museums, Calcutta, for the year 1985-86.

(ii) A copy of the Annual Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the National Council of Science Museums, Calcutta for the year 1985-86 together with Audit Report thereon.

(iii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the National Council of Science Museums, Calcutta, for the year 1985-86.

(5) A statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay

in laying the papers mentioned at (4) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3995/87.]

(6) A copy of the Annual Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the Malaviya Regional Engineering College, Jaipur for the year 1985-86 together with Audit Report thereon.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3996/87.]

(7) A statement (Hindi and English versions) explaining the reasons for not laying the Audited Accounts of the India Institute of Technology, Bombay, for the year 1985-86 within the stipulated period of nine months after the close of the Accounting Year.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3997/87.]

(8) A statement (Hindi and English versions) explaining the reasons for not laying the Audited Accounts of the Indian Institute of Technology, Kanpur, for the year 1985-86 within the stipulated period of nine months after the close of the Accounting Year.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3998/87.]

Annual Accounts of Central Council for Research in Ayurveda and Siddha, New Delhi for 1985-86 and statement for delay in laying these papers Annual Report and Review on the working of Central Council of Indian Medicine, New Delhi for 1985-86 and statement for delay in laying these papers

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE) : I beg to lay on the Table :

(1) A copy of the Annual Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the Central Council for Research in Ayurveda and Siddha, New Delhi, for the year 1985-86 together with Audit Report thereon.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-3999/87.]

(2) A statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

(3) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Central Council of Indian Medicine, New Delhi, for the year 1985-86 along with Audited Accounts.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Central Council of Indian Medicine, New Delhi, for the year 1985-86.

(4) A statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (3) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-4000/87.]

12.15 hrs.

#### MESSAGES FROM RAJYA SABHA

[English]

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report the following messages received from the Secretary-General of Rajya Sabha:

(i) "In accordance with the provisions of sub-rule (6) of rule 186 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to return herewith the Appropriation Bill 1987, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 13th March, 1987, and transmitted to the Rajya Sabha for its recommendations and to state that this House has no recommendations to make to the Lok Sabha in regard to the said Bill."

(ii) "In accordance with the provisions of sub-rule (6) of rule 186 of the

Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to return herewith the Appropriation (No. 2) Bill, 1987, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 13th March, 1987, and transmitted to the Rajya Sabha for its recommendations and to state that this House has no recommendations to make to the Lok Sabha in regard to the said Bill."

(iii) "In accordance with the provisions of sub-rule (6) of rule 186 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to return herewith the Appropriation (Vote on Account) Bill, 1987, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 13th March, 1987, and transmitted to the Rajya Sabha for its recommendations and to state that this House has no recommendations to make to the Lok Sabha in regard to the said Bill."

(iv) "In accordance with the provisions of sub-rule (6) of rule 186 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to return herewith the Cotton, Copra and Vegetable Oils Cess (Abolition) Bill, 1987, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 6th March, 1987, and transmitted to the Rajya Sabha for its recommendations and to state that this House has no recommendations to make to the Lok Sabha in regard to the said Bill."

(v) "In accordance with the provisions of rule 111 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to enclose a copy of the Delhi Municipal Corporation (Amendment) Bill, 1987, which has been passed by the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 18th March, 1987."