

and economic emancipation. They would work hard at other places and they would try to educate their children. And thus, there would be a qualitative change in their lives. So this is the demand of the time that you should accept this Amendment. I do not know the reason of your insisting upon me to withdraw my Bill. I may withdraw it provided you assure me of doing some positive things in this regard. You have appreciated the spirit of this Bill and have said that you agree with its provisions. If you agree with the provisions of the Bill, you should assure us of bringing comprehensive Amendment Bill in this regard after discussing it in the council of Ministers. If you assure as such, I will withdraw this Bill.

SHRI RAMJI LAL SUMAN: I would like to submit that all of us are aware of the dignity of the courts. As I have already said that the Supreme Court has given its verdict on this issue. As far as our taking any step regarding this is concerned, we shall do it after we get the advice of the Ministry of Finance. I assure you that your suggestions and feelings would be kept in mind. You are my old colleague. We shall do all the best from our side if any positive result comes out through the discussion between us. I would like to assure you further that our Government is equally concerned for the welfare of the scheduled castes and scheduled tribes and we shall do all the possible things for them. Hence, I request you to withdraw your Bill.

SHRI RAM LAL RAHI: I think that the hon. Minister's assurance of protecting the interests of the weaker sections of the society, included in the concerned lists is in the interest of national welfare. As he has said that the High Court in its judgement has said that the High Court in its judgement has said that the varied conditions of different places have been considered in preparing those lists, in this context I would like to say that despite these varying conditions the said lists are based on the equal conditions. The High Court and the Supreme Court cannot ignore these facts. With the above words I withdraw this Bill.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Has the hon. Member leave of the House to withdraw his Bill?

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

The Bill was by leave, withdrawn

19.49 hrs.

ELECTROPATHY SYSTEM OF MEDICINE (RECOGNITION) BILL

By Shri Jagannath Singh

[English]

SHRI JAGANNATH SINGH (Sidhi): I beg to move:

"That the Bill to provide for the recognition of electropathy system of medicine and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto, be taken into consideration."

[Translation]

Mr. Chairman, Sir, many years ago doctors' prospects seemed to be very dark but now with the advent of new system of medicine i.e. electropathy it appears to be very bright. Electropathy is a new system of medicine. In our country there are four systems of medicine namely Allopathy, Ayurvedic, Yunani and Homeopathy which have recognition at the national level. Allopathy system has come from foreign countries and is also known as Western Medical Science. Only Ayurved and Unani systems are our indigenous systems. But the Government of our country did not recognise these systems despite the demand made by thousands and lakhs of Ayurved doctors in this connection. First of all, the German Government recognised the Ayurvedic system in view of its properties. When our Government found that the system evolved in India has been recognised by the

[Sh. Jagannath Singh]

German Government then they realised it and recognised the Ayurvedic and Unani Systems.

Homeopathy system has come from Germany. Its founder was Dr. Samuel Hahnemann who came from a *Kumhar* family. He had obtained a degree of Doctor of Medicine in allopathy and was working as a Deputy C.M.O. On seeing the side effects and reaction of Allopathy medicines, he burnt all his degrees and started looking for a new system of medicine. Then he invented the Homeopathy system of medicine. The Maharaja of Lahore Maharaja Ranjit Singh, brought this system of medicine to India in the year 1839 with the help of Dr. Honi Burger. In India, various organisations propagated and patronised the Homeopathic system of medicine from 1839 to 1948. Finally, when many State Governments put pressure on Health Ministry, the Central Government constituted a Homeopathy enquiry committee in the year 1948. This committee submitted its report to the Health Ministry in 1950 and on the basis this report the government of India recognised this system of medicine.

Our country is the second largest populated country in the world. With the increase in population our country is facing many adverse circumstances. The main problems are that of poverty and lack of good health. Because of poverty the condition of a common man is so pitiable that he does not even has a piece clothe to cover his body and one square meal to eat. He can not get quality food. He is unable to get all the nutritious elements required to maintain sound health. If a man is not healthy he is likely to be afflicted by various diseases.

Today, medical science has developed wonderful equipments and medicines. But all these wonderful medicines are of no use for a common man. The medicines and the equipments are so costly that the common man is not in a position to afford them. The people living in the villages are very poor.

Food, clothing and Housing are their main problems. As they are very poor they should have such a system of medicine which is cheaper. Medicines are costly and are beyond their reach. So we need such system of medicine which helps common man in curing their ailments at a very low cost.

The Government of India had recognised Homeopathy in the year 1953. After that no other system of medicine could be propagated in this country. Apart from the existing four system of medicines, there is another system of medicine which is totally different from them and is known as Electrotherapy. I feel that this system of medicine should be adopted and propagated in our country. Government should patronise and recognise it. It would be better to recognise a system of medicine which is cheaper. As a matter of fact an Italian Dr. Count Cæsar Matty of Germany was the founder of Electrotherapy. He was also Member of Parliament of Rome and while working as Government servant he discovered this system. This was a new system in the field of medical science which is widely known as Electrotherapy in Germany. Dr. Matty made a thorough study of Homeopathy and found that all other systems were incomplete. He started looking for a cheaper and more effective system. The Electrotherapy theory of Dr. Count Matty is based on the principles of fluid-substance and blood. According to fluid-substance and blood are such constituents of human body that if they are pure and healthy human body would remain free from all diseases. In case fluid-substance in the body or blood or both get infected then man would fall sick. Keeping this basic principle in mind, Dr. Count Matty prepared two groups of medicines. One to purify the blood and the other to purify the fluid-substance and cough. These medicines purify the fluid-substance and the blood in human body and keep the human body free from all diseases. Dr. Matty combined a number of effective medicines to prepare the medicines under this system. In this way these medicines proved extremely effective and useful. These medicine work on human body at an electric

speed as such this system has been named as electropathy.

20.00 hrs.

According to Dr. Matty, human body is not made up of a single constituent. The constitution of human body is complex. As such to keep the body fit, a system of complex medicines have been evolved. A reference has also been made in our old text "Ayurved" about the complex constitution of our body. According to it human body is made up of five constituents viz Earth (soil), Sky, Air, fire and water. Even medical science recognizes the above complex constitution of our body. Despite this, other systems have not accepted the idea of using complex medicines for curing diseases. For example, in Homeopathy for treatment of one ailment, the principal of one medicine at a time has been adopted, whereas it has been proved that the entire human body gets infected once a disease is there. To overcome this deficiency Dr. Count Matty discovered electropathy which is based on a scientific and complex theory and prepared medicines to treat the human body having complex constitution.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, the medicines under this system are prepared purely from vegetation. In electropathy there are only sixty medicines which are enough to treat all the ailments of human body. In all 114 types of plants are used for preparing the entire lot of medicines. All these plants are easily available in our country. Dr. Matty had read the philosophy of an international scientist Dr. Paraselses who had stated that in every plant there is an electric force which is known as Odd-Force. If its full 'force' or power is derived without any damage to it and if it is effectively used on human body, it can root out the disease itself within a very short period. It is true that the scientists throughout the world have by and large categorized particular herbs to be effective for certain diseases. On this very basis, Allopathic and Ayurvedic systems of medicine have been manufacturing medicines out of these herbs. Dr. Matty collected the roots and buds of the

herb of which he wanted to extract the essence.....

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Say only what you want to say, please do not describe the whole system.

[Translation]

SHRI JAGANNATH SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to submit that this new system of medicine which is called electropathy is most useful for a poor country like ours. In this scientific age of today, four systems of medicine are prevalent in our country. If this new system of medicine is popularised and recognised, the masses in our country would be definitely benefited.

Here I would like to point out that Dr. Narendra Kumar Awasthi is the founder of electropathy system of medicine in India. There are 60 medical colleges of this system of medicine throughout the country. Presently a free-of-cost Hospital of this system is running in Janakpuri, New Delhi I have personally seen it. 60 colleagues are being run under Naturo Electro Homeo Medicos of India (N.E.H.M. of India) and its head office is located at C-2C/1123, Pocket-12, Janakpuri, New Delhi. In fact nominal charges are taken from the patients for equipments that are used in this system of medicine. The poor are particularly benefited. Therefore I want that this system of medicine must be recognised so that the masses are benefited. Those who take up medical courses in this system are awarded BEMS and DEHM Degrees and Diplomas. A committee was constituted by the Health Ministry to look into the question of giving recognition to this system of medicine. The committee found out that the institutions which are running under this system are functioning satisfactorily. The committee had reviewed the working of 4 institutions which was found to be satisfactory. The report of the committee in regard to recognition should suffice. I think that keeping in view the merits of these institutions, there is nothing which goes

[Sh. Jagannath Singh]

against granting recognition to these institutions. This new system of medicine was discovered by Dr. Count Matty of Germany. It should be provided protection and recognition in our country also. The present systems of medicine are not available in remote rural areas particularly inhabited by Harijans and backward classes. With a view to provide health care facilities to them, granting of recognition to this system of medicine is very essential..... (*Interruptions*) The masses in rural areas do not get adequate health care facilities. Therefore, this new system of medicine is the need of the hour for the poor masses of this country and it should be given recognition by the Government.

With these words, I conclude.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion moved:

"That the Bill to provide for the recognition of electropathy system of medicines and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto be taken into consideration "

Now, Mr. Kabde.

DR. VENKATESH KABDE (Nanded):
Mr. Chairman, Sir, I wish to raise certain points in connection with this Bill.

As you know, in our country, we have different systems of medicine and predominantly, it is the Allopathic system, that is being followed by a large number of people. In fact, it is now a universal system with largest number of people in the world following Allopathic system. The Allopathic system has become most acceptable in the world because of certain qualities inherent in it and because of its effectiveness and reproducibility.

In our country, the other systems of medicine which have been mentioned, namely Unani, Homeopathic and Ayurvedic

systems of medicine have been granted recognition by the Government. A certain number of people have been following this system of medicine. However, as compared to Allopathy, the other system forms a very small percentage.

I would like to mention here that it is a sad reflection on some of these paths that Government is spending large sums of money for Ayurvedic Unani and homeopathic education. But, the doctors who are turned out from these institutions do not practise what they have been taught. For example, I would like to tell you that after getting about seven years of Ayurvedic education, the doctors come out of the Ayurvedic institutions. But, it is common knowledge that they mostly use only Allopathic medicine. This may result in lot of problems for the patients in the sense of wrong use of medications and other complications.

With the introduction of this Bill, we are now trying to promote another pathy in our country. I would say that it is a very new introduction because most of the people in our country are not aware of electropathy. It came into existence in 1865. It is based on certain assumptions that there is electrical energy in the body. In this treatment, certain active principles from the vegetable plants are used for during different diseases.

I do not claim that one system of medicine could be called superior to the others because their argument can go on and it is endless. However, there have been certain methods of verifying whether ascertain medicine is useful or not or, a certain modality of treatment is useful or not. This kind of hard acid test has to be applied to all systems of medicine. I think it would be appropriate to see that some kind of test has applied to see the effectiveness of electropathy system of medicine regarding certain diseases. If it is found that the diseases are not cured in a controlled fashion or in a random fashion, then the amount of emphasis the Government has to give will decrease.

I would like to mention that in our country,

by and large, it is quite right, as the hon. Member has mentioned, that people from the rural areas do not have any means of getting proper medical care. We do not have the sympathy from the doctors, let alone all those different pathys. That sympathy also we do not get from the doctors at the time of need. So, people are victimised by different quacks and different superstitions. They fall a prey to different superstitions. We do not want to have another pathy which will create problems for our patients because in the rural areas anything can be sold in a very improper fashion and people can be very easily heated.

I have already seen many sign-boards in the name of electrotherapy in different cities now. Many colleges are coming up. They are mushrooming. Now, in our country a stage has come where medical and engineering education is being commercialised to a very great extent. Many private medical colleges are coming up without getting proper recognition from the Medical Council and they are giving degrees of MBBS. They are giving admissions to candidates on the basis of money.

My question is, are we again introducing another system by in which we are going to mushroom institutions of corruption in our country. It has been mentioned in this Bill that there is no authority or sanction, and there is no Council, but a large number of institutions of electrotherapy have been set up all over the country. This is something which the Government has to take into consideration because I am sure that this will promote lot of confusion. It will mislead lots of students and it will also lead to a lot of malpractices. So, due care has to be taken. I might say that I have nothing against electrotherapy system of medicine. To me its utility is yet to be proven. I would like to say what this Bill may be referred to an Expert Committee or the whole matter of formation of this system, the Council or Authority may again be critically evaluated by the Government before according any kind of recognition to this system of medicine. Electrotherapy will add one more item to the plethora of many non-effective systems which

endanger the lives of millions of people in our country. Although I have already stated that I have nothing against electrotherapy, but at this stage, I oppose this Bill.

[Translation]

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE AND DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY (SHRI DASAI CHOWDHARY): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Member said just now that four systems of medicine are already working in our country and the hon. member has brought this Bill which seeks to provide recognition to this fifth system of medicine viz. Electro-Homeopathy. At the outset I would like to submit that there are many requirements for giving recognition to a particular system of medicine and lot of deliberations are done before giving recognition. The criteria is the history of the system, health care, concept of the system of medicine, scientific achievement in respect of diseases, logical and scientific conclusions. Just now my friend Shri Jagannath Singh pointed out that this system of medicine was discovered by Count Matty of Germany. I would like to inform him that Electro-Homeopathy is not practiced anywhere in the world. We have made a lot of enquiry about it, but it could not be proved that Electro-Homeopathy system of medicine is a recognised form of treatment in any part of the world. The doctors of Electro-Homeopathy claim that their system of medicine is similar to Homeopathy. In Homeopathy, medicine is formulated in a particular measure, whereas in Electro-Homeopathy medicines are manufactured with the help of a number of mixtures. Therefore, Electro-Homeopathy cannot be compared with Homeopathy in any respect. The Ministry has received requests from several Ministers, social workers, MPs and MLAs that Electro-Homeopathy should be recognised as fifth system of medicine. In view of these requests, Government had set up a committee in September 1988 under the Chairmanship of Dr. Paintal who was Director-General of ICMR to enquire into Electro-Homeopathy system of medicine. The committee collected

[Sh. Dasai Chowdhary]

information from a number of places where Electro-Homeopathy System of medicine was being practiced. The Committee did not find enough reason to recognise Electro-Homeopathy as fifth system of medicine when we already had four systems of medicine working effectively. I would like to quote the recommendation of the committee and I hope you would bear with me as it would take a few more minutes. It would be evident from it as to what is the opinion of the committee regarding this system of medicine and why we do not want to recognise it. At the outset the report mentions that this system of medicine, which is being claimed by Indian Doctors as fifth system of medicine is plant based system of medicine. Instead of curing the symptoms, this system of medicine lays emphasis on rooting out the disease itself. Under this system, there are 36 basic formulations derived from 115 plants. Secondly, the committee stated that there are many books written by Indian authors on Electro-Homeopathy and after going through them, it has been found that this system has been developed only in 19th century. The Committee could not find enough evidence that Electro-Homeopathy has been recognised in any part of the world. The medicines used by the doctors of this system are manufactured and exported to developing countries like India by Germany alone. It has been said that this system of medicine is being practiced as a system of medicine, but claims are made on the basis of some books that it is very effective. No information is available on pathological tests that are conducted in this system of medicine. The committee suggested that in order to cure and check certain peculiar diseases, research should be conducted on a long term basis in the field of Electro-Homeopathy and pathological tests should also be included in it. According to the information available there, there does not appear to be much similarity between Electropathy or Electro-Homeopathy and other modern systems of medicine or Ayurveda, Homeopathy or Unani System of medicine. All these systems of medicine are based on different concepts,

principles and opinions. Electro-Homeopathy seems to be based completely on the opinion of Court Matty, which he propagated in 1865 and all the available literature is based on his comments and observations. There is no authentic medical literature available on this system of medicine. There are many colleges of Electro-Homeopathy which are imparting education in this system. There is no recognised State level or National Council to which these colleges are affiliated. Many of these Institutions are registered under the Societies Registration Act. Even the degrees that are awarded by these institutions are not uniform. The teachers in many of these institution are Homeopathic or allopathic doctors. In some of them, they are even part-time teachers of modern system of medicine.

In 1970 when Homeopathy was not a recognised system of medicine, there were many Homeopathic institutions in the country and a large number of Homeopathic doctors were practising without recognition from the Government. Almost same is true of Electro-Homeopathy. In spite of the committees' report, the experts of Health Ministry constituted another committee to explore the possibilities of the action that could be taken on the report. We think that granting of recognition to fifth system of medicine is not practicable. Therefore, I would request the hon. Member to withdraw this Bill.

SHRIJAGANNATH SINGH (Sidhi): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Committee was constituted to decide whether Electro-Homeopathy system of medicine should be recognised or not on the basis of its merits and demerits but the Government should have included doctors and specialists in the field of Electro-Homeopathy in that committee. The Members of the Committee were related to Allopathy Homeopathy and other system of medicines. It is fact that the specialists who are related to other systems of medicine which are flourishing in our country would not like the expansion, publicity and introduction of new system of medicine. Therefore, at the time of constitution of the Committee it should have been ensured that the

specialists in Electrotherapy were also included in the committee.

The hon. Minister said that it hardly made any difference. The Government should have collected necessary information about it whether it is appropriate for our country or not, where Electrotherapy is being practised in the country and how many medical colleges are being run in the country. Under this system of medicine, about 62 medical colleges are being run in the country and definitely some people are misusing it by giving false names to this system at different places and in different cities in the country. And if the Government intend to recognise this new system, it should conduct an extensive survey and the concerned Ministry should associate the specialists of this system of medicine so that they may make the Ministry aware of the merits and demerits of the system. The other system of medicines have the possibilities of side-effects whereas there is no possibility of any side-effect in this system. So in the circumstances, it is more appropriate to recognise this system which would benefit the poor people of this country.

As the hon. Minister stated that there is no mention of any institution of this system in the report of the committee constituted for this system, so I would reiterate that 62 medical colleges are being run under this system. Under this system a free hospital is being run at Janakpuri, New Delhi where poor people are availing medical facilities. This system of medicine has been registered under Society Act and in this way the expansion and publicity of the Electrotherapy is being done.

I would, therefore, request if the poor people in our country are not able to get medical facilities and if this system can benefit the poor people of our country, I think it would be appropriate to recognise this system of medicine. So far as the merits and demerits of the system are concerned, the Health Ministry of the Government of India will investigate into it whether it so infact beneficial for the people of the country or not. Any Conclusion can be drawn on the basis of

merits and demerits of the system. Therefore, Sir, I would like to say that this conclusion cannot be drawn from the report of the committee that this system of medicine is not useful. So far as the question of foreign countries are concerned, different systems of medicines are flourishing there after getting them registered but only in India, Bangladesh and Pakistan, Government protection is necessary and institutions of different systems of medicines are run accordingly and through them the provision have been made to provide health facilities to the people.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I think if a system of medicine with which the future of thousands of students is linked and its medicines also are useful, cheap and with no possibility of any side-effect, this system of medicine should be recognised in the interest of the people of the country.

SHRI DASAI CHOWDHARY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, as the hon. Member has said that no person related to the Electro-Homeopathy was included in the committee constituted for the purpose, so, for the information of the hon. Member I would like to tell that Dr. Narendra Kumar, Secretary of the Medical Council of the Indian Electro national Homeopathy, was invited to the committee and after that report of the committee was finalised. Secondly, I have to say that since the hon. Member has no authentic knowledge or authority over the subject so it was not possible to include him in the official committees. Thirdly, relating to students and colleges, I would say that as per the information received by the Ministry it is true that such colleges are being run in some States in the name of trust which are related to the State Governments and it is purely a matter related to the States. We have nothing to do with it but we would make consultation in the Ministry and we want that directions be issued to the State Governments that they would recognise the Electro-Homeopathy study and it will be the sole responsibility of the State Governments to take care of the colleges which are being opened and the Centre has nothing to do with it. Therefore, I would

[Sh. Dasai Chowdhary]

request the hon. Member to withdraw the Bill. Our Ministry would make further investigation into the report of the committee and the Government would take further steps accordingly.

SHRI JAGANNATH SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would say that Dr. Narendra Kumar Awasthi was included in the committee constituted for the purpose but he was not invited to the meetings of the said committee held from time to time and that is why he disassociated himself from the committee. Therefore, I once again would like to say that 62 medical colleges relating to Electro-Homoeopathy are running in the country and their headquarters is at Janakpuri, New Delhi. I would request the Government that when those institutions are being run properly, they should be recognised. If the Government desires, it can make investigation whether there is any Central headquarters of the organisations or not. The Government should constitute a committee to find out whether institutions based on this system of medicine are going on in the country or not. The Committee should submit its report to the Government and on the basis of such report, the Government can draw conclusion whether this system of medicine should be recognised or not. If I get such assurance from the Government I can withdraw the Bill. I want a clear cut assurance from the Government.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, he has given some assurance.

[Translation]

SHRI DASAI CHOWDHARY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have told it very clearly that the report of the committee which we have received...

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are not giving

assurance. The Hon. Member has a difference of opinion. If you can rectify thing, he is ready to withdraw. If you are giving some assurance, he is ready to withdraw. Otherwise, he says that on what basis he should do that.

DR. VENKATESH KABDE: I want to have a clarification. It is a very important item.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No clarification at this stage. Mr. Jagannath Singh, are you withdrawing this thing?

[Translation]

SHRI JAGANNATH SINGH: At least the Government do give some assurance.

SHRI DASAI CHOWDHARY: Mr. Chairman, I have told the hon. Member very clearly that the committee which was constituted for the purpose had submitted its report. The Committee has given some suggestions about the recognition that an inquiry can be made in this regard. We shall ask the expert committee of the Ministry of to make fresh enquiry into it and the sentiments expressed by the hon. Member would also be placed before the committee. After that, whatever the committee recommends, we would take further actions accordingly.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are you withdrawing it or not?

[Translation]

SHRI JAGANNATH SINGH: I would submit that a clear cut assurance should come from the hon. Minister, which is not coming. Only after that I can decide about the withdrawal of the Bill. The Government should constitute a committee to find out as to how many medical colleges based on this system of medicine are there in the country and it should be ensured that specialists and experts in the field of Electrotherapy should be included in the committee. The committee