

## Sixteenth Loksabha

>

Title: Regarding Rafale deal negotiations.

**PROF. SAUGATA ROY (DUM DUM):** Madam, there is a report that the Defence Ministry had objected against the Prime Minister's Office undermining Rafale negotiations. It seems that while there was a Negotiating Committee consisting of the Deputy Chief of the Indian Air Force. The Prime Minister's Office and particularly the National Security Advisor, Shri ... [\*] was conducting a parallel negotiation in Paris with the French people. The Defence Ministry had objected that this parallel negotiation by the Prime Minister's Office and his well-known and notorious National Security Advisor, ... \* was undermining the bargaining capacity of the Government.

**HON. SPEAKER:** Any Paper will write anything and you will raise the matter here! Is the Prime Minister nobody?

**PROF. SAUGATA ROY:** Madam, the Defence Secretary had given a note. Please listen to me, Madam. It is very serious. It concerns the national security. The Defence Secretary Said, "RM may please see. It is desirable that such discussions be avoided by the PMO as it diminishes our negotiating position seriously". So, actually it is undermining the negotiation. Rafales were ultimately bought....(*Interruptions*) Madam, please listen to me.

**HON. SPEAKER:** Any newspaper will write anything and you want to raise it here in the House.

**PROF. SAUGATA ROY :** Madam, 36 Rafael aircraft were ultimately bought for Rs.59,000 crore. The price went so high because the offset was given to ... \* owned Reliance Defence, in order to help him, by the Prime Minister Mr. Modi himself. The Modi... \*duo is destroying the defence of the country by undermining the negotiations by the Air Force. ...

(*Interruptions*) The Modi... \* duo, the triumvirate consisting of... \*– the *trimurti* – is destroying the backbone of the Defence of the country.

Now, after such a thing has happened, I just saw the hon. Defence Minister leaving because she does not want to face the House. (*Interruptions*) Please come and face the House. ...(*Interruptions*)

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES, RIVER DEVELOPMENT AND GANGA REJUVENATION (SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL):** She is ready to face the House. ...(*Interruptions*)

**PROF. SAUGATA ROY:** She is leaving the House. Let her face the House. ... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL:** She is ready to face the House. ...(*Interruptions*)

**HON. SPEAKER:** I am unable to understand as to why you are raising this matter every now and then.

**PROF. SAUGATA ROY:** Madam, the slogan '*Chowkidar Chor Hai*' is resounding all over the country.

**HON. SPEAKER:** Only because some newspaper has said something, you are raising it here. This matter was discussed here for one hour.

**PROF. SAUGATA ROY :** This is the demand of the youth of the country. ...(*Interruptions*)  
When this whole negotiation had gone into and when the Defence Department and the Indian Air Force were negotiating the whole thing, at that time, why should the Prime Minister's Office interfere about the price? It diminishes and undermines the negotiating capacity of the Defence Negotiating Team headed by the Deputy Chief of the Indian Air Force. The Rafale is standing out to be the biggest scandal.

**HON. SPEAKER:** It is nothing like that. Kharge Ji, do you also want to say something? Ask your people to go back to their seats.

...(Interruptions)

**HON. SPEAKER:** Please go to your seats. I do not understand as to why you are raising the matter every day. Any newspaper will write something and the hon. Prime Minister is responsible. You are taking the responsibility for everything. You should not take it. What is all this?

...(Interruptions)

**12 16 hrs**

*At this stage, Shri Gaurav Gogoi and some other hon. Members*

*went back to their seats.*

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे (गुलबर्गा):** मैडम स्पीकर, यह छोटी बात नहीं है या यह छोटी सी समस्या नहीं है । ...  
(व्यवधान)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** ये मुझे भी मालूम है ।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे:** मैडम, यह बहुत बड़ी समस्या है ।

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** सब डिस्कशन हो चुका है। सब एक्सप्लेनेशन हो चुका है ।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे:** आप यह नहीं कह सकते हैं कि यह पेपर में आया है। यह पहली बार नहीं है। इससे पहले भी एन. राम ने हिन्दू में फ्रंट पेज पर लिखा था ।

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** सब कुछ हुआ था, मगर यहां डिस्कशन भी हो चुका है ।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे :** अब यह नोट के साथ पब्लिश हो गया है । प्राइम मिनिस्टर के ऑफिस में क्या हुआ? डिफेंस मिनिस्टर के ऑफिस में क्या हुआ? यह सभी अब बाहर आया है । कल ये कह रहे थे, प्राइम मिनिस्टर कि कांग्रेस पार्टी लड़ाकू जहाज खरीदने से रोक रही है, देशद्रोही है । अरे देशद्रोही तो ये हैं। ... (व्यवधान) इन्होंने रोका

है और रोक कर आप हमसे पूछ रहे हो। “चोरी” तो तुम कर रहे हो और उल्टा हम पर धब्बा लगा रहे हो। जो 126 राफेल खरीदने का मेमोरेण्डम ऑफ अण्डरस्टैंडिंग हमने किया था, 126 के बजाय आपने 36 किया। ... (व्यवधान) आज एक तरफ डिफेंस मिनिस्ट्री लड़ रही है, एक तरफ प्राइम मिनिस्टर लड़ रहे हैं और दूसरी तरफ पी.एम.ओ. में कोई और बात हो रही है। इसके अलावा भी एयर मार्शल सब कुछ बोल रहे हैं। ... (व्यवधान) मैडम, ये सारी चीजें इसमें आई हैं। इसीलिए बार-बार इसके ऊपर चर्चा की आवश्यकता नहीं है। ज्वॉइंट पार्लियामेंट्री कमेटी कॉन्स्टीट्यूट कीजिए। सब कुछ बाहर आएगा। हम ...\* बोल रहे हैं, सभी फाइलें सामने आएंगी। जे.पी.सी. के सामने सभी की फाइलें सामने आएंगी। ... (व्यवधान) उनका क्या कहना है वह भी आएगा। इसलिए हम दूसरा कुछ नहीं मांगते हैं, एक ही हमारी डिमाण्ड है। आप वह कर सकते हैं। जे.पी.सी. कॉन्स्टीट्यूट करो, उसके लिए हम तैयार हैं। We do not want any explanation. उनका एक्स्प्लेनेशन हमने बहुत सुना है। प्राइम मिनिस्टर का भी सुना। वही बात हमारे पास आती है। हिन्दू पेपर कोई ऑर्डिनरी पेपर नहीं है।

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** नहीं, मैं पेपर का सवाल नहीं कर रही हूँ। I am sorry. डिस्कशन हो चुका है।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे:** इसकी क्रेडिबिलिटी है। सौ साल से ऊपर हो गया है। ये प्रेसीडियल पेपर है। अगर आप इसको कागज के टुकड़े जैसा समझें तो ऐसा नहीं है।

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** मैं नहीं बोल रही हूँ, आप कुछ भी बोलो। I am not saying anything. I am only saying that इस पर डिस्कशन हो चुका है।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे:** इन्वेस्टीगेशन उसी वक्त हो सकती है, जब जे.पी.सी. कॉन्स्टीट्यूट करेंगे। सच्चाई बाहर आएगी। दूध का दूध पानी का पानी होगा। That is why, we want JPC. We do not want to listen anything.

**ग्रामीण विकास मंत्री, पंचायती राज मंत्री, खान मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्री (श्री नरेन्द्र सिंह तोमर):** माननीय अध्यक्ष महोदय, विपक्ष की तरफ से राफेल पर चर्चा की मांग की गयी। सरकार चर्चा के लिए तैयार थी। ... (व्यवधान) चर्चा पूरी हुई। रक्षा मंत्री जी ने बिंदुवार सारी चीजों का जवाब दिया। दूध का दूध पानी का पानी हो चुका है। इस मामले पर सुप्रीम कोर्ट का निर्णय आ चुका है। कोई भी अखबार को लेकर और इस प्रकार से सदन की कार्यवाही को बाधित करना, देश के बजट को बाधित करना, यह किसी भी प्रकार से उचित नहीं है। ये जो अखबार है, जो अखबार आप दिखा रहे हो, ये अखबार भी सही नहीं है। इस अखबार में यह नहीं लिखा है, जिस प्रकार का अखबार आप दिखा रहे हो। ... (व्यवधान)

माननीय अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपसे अनुरोध करना चाहूंगा कि जो विषय इन्होंने उठाया है, रक्षा मंत्री जी यहां उपस्थित हैं, वह अपना वक्तव्य रखेंगी।

**12 20 hrs**

*At this stage, Shri Rajeev Satav, Shri Jayadev Galla and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

*... (Interruptions)*

**THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN):** Madam, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. If they are really concerned about this matter and they have raised this issue based on a newspaper report, I would like to point out a few things in this regard ...*(Interruptions)*. When the newspaper itself has chosen to say or point out in detail the then Defence Secretary's comment which was meant for the attention of the then Raksha Mantri, it should have also put the reply of the Raksha Mantri which was also given in writing. If the newspaper wanted to bring the truth out, I would have thought that it was incumbent upon that newspaper to put the reply of the then Raksha Mantri also on record ...*(Interruptions)*.

The Opposition Leaders who want a reply should now know what the reply of the then Raksha Mantri, Shri Parrikar was. The then Raksha Mantri, Shri Parrikar, had very clearly said in response to the file noting of the then Defence Secretary to 'remain calm, there is nothing to worry, things are going all right'. To that extent, a detailed reply was given by the then Raksha Mantri, Shri Parrikar Ji ...*(Interruptions)*.

In all fairness, it should have been the duty of the newspaper which has published this to also put it on record the comment of the Defence Secretary and that the reply given was this ...*(Interruptions)*.

Madam Speaker, I would like to remind the House that during my reply on 4<sup>th</sup> January, 2019, I had very clearly pointed out this particular allegation also about the suspected interference by the PMO and gave a reply even on the 4<sup>th</sup> January about it that when periodically, PMO enquires about the progress of any work cannot be construed as interference ...(*Interruptions*).

I would like to remind the entire House what was the interference by the National Advisory Council (NAC) led by Shrimati Sonia Gandhi ...(*Interruptions*).

**12 23 hrs**

*At this stage, Shri Kalyan Banerjee and some other hon. Members*

*came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

Did she interfere? Was that interference? If that was interference then talk about it. At that time, the NAC was running the PMO. Was that an interference? Will that be reported? Above all, I want to question the ethics of the Newspaper and the ethics of the Opposition. Did *The Hindu* newspaper also put on top 'Chowkidar chor hai'. You have added that. How right is that? How ethical is that? ...(*Interruptions*)

Therefore, every question on Rafale is over and done with. The newspaper and the Opposition Parties are flogging a dead horse. In other words, they are like what the hon. Prime Minister said yesterday playing into the hands of multinational corporations and with vested interests keeping the issue alive ...(*Interruptions*). They are not interested in the Indian Air Force getting powerful. They are not interested in the Indian Air Force becoming empowered. They are working to the tunes of multinational corporate warfare. They are damaging this country. I charge them with that offence ...(*Interruptions*).

**12 24 hrs**

(Shri Kalraj Mishra *in the Chair*)