

LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Tuesday, December 20, 1994/Agrahayana 29,
1916 (SAKA)

(The Lok Sabha met at
Eleven of The Clock.)

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

[English]

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dumdum): Sir, in today's List of Business, nothing has been mentioned about the revised ATR...

(Interruptions)...There is no mention of modified ATR...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow): Mr. Speaker, Sir, before concentrating on the questions, it would be necessary to inform the House that the Government had assured to table the ATR in the House. Earlier, it was to be tabled on 19th instant but the Government asked for one more day. Today is 20th but there is no mention of ATR in the list of Business. Whether the Government is renegeing from its promise or it has taken you into confidence? Why did not they consider it necessary to take the House into confidence?

Mr. Speaker, Sir, if you can make the position clear, the House can proceed with the Question Hour. Otherwise, it would create obstacles in the Question Hour.

[English]

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: We are making the same point...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am on my legs to give you the information which you would like. Yesterday, we had not received any notice for the presentation of the revised ATR. But today, in the morning, I have received a notice and they are going to present the Report today.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): At what time ... (Interruptions)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK (Ahmedabad): Sir, we would like to know at what time they are going to present this Report.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: You should tell the House about this...(Interruptions)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No Report, no Session. (Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (DEPARTMENT OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS) AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKUL WASNIK): Sir, the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, Shri Shukla, had assured the House that the revised Action Taken Report on the JPC recommendations would be tabled today. (Interruptions) It was clearly stated by Shri Shukla that it would be presented not later than 28th and we stand by that commitment which we had made to the House. The hon. Finance Minister has also written to the hon. Speaker that he should be allowed to lay the Report on the Table today..... (Interruptions)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: At what time? (Interruptions)

SHRI MUKUL WASNIK: We would be laying the Report on the Table today. We stand by the commitment which we had made. Unnecessarily if you are going to shout like this, it is not going to help you. If you are just wanting to make a flouting type of situation, that is not going to help you.

We stand by the commitment which we have made and we would lay the Report today only....(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, whether the Government have informed you about the time of tabling the Report in the House or it is to be decided by you?

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Before the rising of the House.

[Translation]

SHRI HARIN PATHAK: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Government had assured that the revised ATR would be presented in the House on 20th. Why did not they give a notice on 19th and included it in the List of Business.

[English]

If the Government is concerned, why did you not bring it in the regular business.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Before 4 O' clock that we asked for...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Gandhi Nagar): Mr. Speaker, Sir, you would remember that on the very first day of this session everybody had expressed the dissatisfaction that even after three months period, the Government could not present the revised ATR in the House. However, the Government had assured in the House then that the Report will certainly be tabled in the House. Today we find that the Government did not give the notice on 19th and instead gave it in the morning of 20th. However, there is no mention of time in that notice.

[English]

I think they do not realise that the issue of corruption at high levels has become a national issue over which the whole country is convulsed and they continue to take the Parliament as well as the people for granted. I would like to stress that the House and the country today is less interested in reports, it is more interested in action...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

We will also do something.

[English]

You said "before the rising of the House." This is once again a deliberate attempt to take the House for granted.

[Translation]

Even if the ATR is presented in the House in the evening and the things are not found there clear it would not satisfy the members.

[English]

My protest is against the attitude of the Government to the whole House... (Interruptions).

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Mayiladuturai): Is this permitted? I wish to express my dissatisfaction. (Interruptions). You are not permitting me to speak. (Interruptions).

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I seek your protection. I will not sit down. (Interruptions)

..

(Interruptions) Thank you. Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to thank Shri Advani ji for having helped restore order in the House. Thank you very much for this. I wish to register the protest of the majority of the Members of this House against continued efforts by the Opposition to disrupt the proceedings. (Interruptions) Sir, I wish to appeal once again to Shri Advani ji to please ask his colleagues to behave, to help restore order in the House. (Interruptions) Do you not have the courage to listen to one man? (Interruptions) You do not have the courage to listen to one man. Do you know anything about democracy? I have the right to speak when the Speaker recognises me. I am not going to yield. I will not yield. I am not going to be bullied... I believe in democracy. This is not democracy.

(Interruptions) I would register, on behalf of the majority of the Members of this House, our very strong protest against the repeated efforts that have been going on since April 1994 to disrupt the proceedings of this House. Shri Advani claims that corruption is the single biggest issue before this nation. I entirely agree with him. We want to discuss the issues of corruption that have been alleged with respect to sugar, with respect to the securities scam, with respect to any other subject that any Member of this House would like to raise. But we cannot discuss these matters unless we are given the opportunity of discussing them. This opportunity of discussing it is being prevented by a series of procedural tricks being played upon this House by the Opposition.

Sir, I refer to the statement made by Shri Jaswant Singh when he claimed in this House that placing the Report of the Gyan Prakash Committee in the Library was a fudge. I quote him. He said that it was a fudge. Who demanded this fudge? His own leader demanded this. It was Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee who demanded that this Report be placed in the Library. Shri Vajpayee asked for it. We conceded. Then, his Deputy Shri Jaswant Singh gets up and says that is a fudge. They call themselves a disciplined party. We saw their discipline on the 6th of December, 1992 when they destroyed the Babri Masjid. (Interruptions) They talk about corruption. (Interruptions) Sit down.

I will speak as long as the Speaker recognises me.

(Interruptions) I have the right to be heard in this House. I was elected by a larger majority than any Member of the BJP. Why am I not permitted to speak. I have the right to be heard....(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I rise to seek a personal clarification. Shri Aiyar has mentioned my name in his speech. It is good that he also want a discussion on corruption. The Government of their party indulges incorruption...(Interruptions)...He has also admitted it.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I do not want to go into the details of this question. You would remember that when a discussion was held in your chamber over Gyan Prakash Committee's Report, we were informed that the Government was not prepared to present the preliminary Reports or Administrative Reports in the House. Later on, it was demanded that the Report should be tabled in the House. When the Government was adamant on its stand, I had tried to find a way out. At that time I had asked for showing the Report in the Hon'ble Speaker's Chamber. However, after seeing the Report, we arrived at the conclusion that all the Members should be given a chance to go through the Report and it should be made public. Even then, the Government did not accept this view. When the Government refused to submit, the opposition obviously took the rigid stand. It is a very serious matter. Now, they are again preparing for rising.

[English]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I am still on my feet. I yielded to him.

[Translation]

You can interrupt me but why are you giving a speech?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I am not giving a speech. I am giving a clarification.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: I would listen to you only on one condition that when my turn will come to speak, you would ask your colleagues to keep quite. If you cannot do so, then why should we keep quite? You always cause embarrassment to us.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, if he would level allegation on my party, I would deny them.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Atal is the senior most Member of this House.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, they are trying to discipline us. When we were in the Government, how had they behaved? Today, we are leading in maintaining the dignity of this House.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Are you saying that I do not have the permission to speak? Sir, I was speaking... (Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: I am fully in agreement.... (Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: There is no doubt in what Shri Vajpayee has stated. He has always been helping us in running the House smoothly.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, he is not allowing me to complete my clarification...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: After he completes...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: A way was found out that the Report should be kept in the library. Now, the discussion is taking place here and merely keeping the Report in the library will not suffice. The Report should be presented in the House. Further, every member should have access to it. They have made certain allegations against Bhartiya Janata Party. These should be excluded from the proceedings.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, he has mentioned my name.

[English]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I yield to none in my respect for Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee. I totally agree with him that he is a total democrat, that his behaviour in this House is always perfect. I always regard him as something like a guru for a first time back bencher like me. But I would request that the behaviour that Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee exhibits in this House be also followed by those sitting behind him. It is me who is being prevented from having my word. Why? Why can I not be allowed to speak by Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee's colleagues? Thanks to Shri Advani, I was given the opportunity, I started speaking. Every time I come out with a sentence which is even mildly critical of them, they just prevent me from speaking.

I do not think this is fair, Sir. I was making the point that it is extremely important that issues relating to corruption be discussed in this House. I was saying that the anxiety to discuss this issue of corruption which, I agree with Shri Advaniji, is the number one item on the national agenda. It is an anxiety which we on this side of the House share as such as they. But, we cannot discuss issues in this House unless we are given an opportunity of discussing them and the opportunity of discussing issues is given, Sir, by you, it is not given by anybody else. And you yourself are not entirely a free agent. There are traditions, there are rules, there are laws, there are procedures, there are precedents. These have been there and it is in accordance with these that you are laying down the procedure. Now, the revised List of Business is not issued by the Government. The revised List of Business is issued by the Secreariat of the Lok Sabha Speaker. In that there is no provision given, as of just now, for a discussion on the ATR or even for the presentation of the ATR. However, totally in keeping with the assurance that our Treasury Benches had given to the House that by the 20th of this month, the revised ATR would be presented, a letter was sent to you reiterating that assurance saying that the revised ATR will be presented before the rising of this House. At the moment, we are supposed to be discussing, we are supposed to be in Question Hour and therefore, it was not surprising that the Parliamentary Minister was not

present. We are expecting that the House would be allowed to continue doing its very serious business of discussing questions during the Question Hour and at 12 o'clock there would be an opportunity for the House to proceed to other matters. Now, I find the Parliamentary Minister has come. I request, through you, all Members of this House to please allow us to get on with the scheduled business of discussing questions for another forty minutes, at the end of which, I appeal to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to give us a clarification in this House as to when he is going to place the Report. But, it is only an appeal on my part. I beg you, Sir to please ensure that this House, whose proceedings are being disrupted repeatedly by the Opposition, be allowed to proceed regularly. In my view the only action that could be taken is, for the Opposition to be disciplined to behave as are required to behave under the rules that you repeatedly circulate to us at the start of every Session. Thank you, Sir.

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA): Under the Rules of Procedure, the document that has to be tabled has to be sent along with the Notice for tabling the document. There was some reprinting necessary after the Cabinet had a look at this document and that reprinting took some time and now the printed copies have been received and the revised ATR will be tabled in the House today at 2.30 p.m. Sir, I must make one thing very clear that we do not take the House for granted as some of the Members may do. We are very serious about it...(Interruptions). We made a promise that it will not be later than 20th and we are keeping up our promise and it is extremely unfair for the hon. Members sitting opposite to make any allegation of any kind as if we are trying to evade or trying to delay. Nothing of that sort. If there was no requirement of reprinting the document, we would have presented it right at 12 o'clock. It will be only two-and-a-half hours later than that. [Interruptions]

[Translation]

SHRI RAM NAIK: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member used abusive words against Bhartiya Janta Party which we objected to. However, you did not give your ruling. We can also use such words...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Question No. 181.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): Mr. Speaker, Sir, through you, we would like to get some information. There is a mention of the Ministry of Civil Supplies, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution...

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: I have received a letter. Shri Bhardwaj is going to reply.

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA (Pali): Who has sent the letter?

MR. SPEAKER: The Prime Minister.

SHRI RAM NAIK (Bombay North): There is an improvement!