

Saturday, 8th March, 1919

***THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL***

**Vol 57**

**6 Feb. - 10 March**

**1919**

**Book No 2**

**P L**

**PROCEEDINGS  
OF  
*THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL***

***ASSEMBLED FOR THE PURPOSE OF MAKING***

**LAWS AND REGULATIONS**

**VOL. LVII**

**Gazettes & Debates Section:  
Parliament Library Building  
Room No. FB-025  
Block 'G'**

**PUBLISHED BY AUTHORITY OF THE GOVERNOR GENERAL .**



**PRINTED BY THE SUPERINTENDENT OF GOVERNMENT PRINTING INDIA**



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.  
LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ASSEMBLED UNDER  
THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA ACT, 1915.  
(5 & 6 Geo. V, Ch. 61.)

The Council met at the Council Chamber, Imperial Secretariat, Delhi, on  
Saturday, the 8th March, 1919.

PRESENT :

The Hon'ble SIR GEORGE LOWNDES, K.C.S.I., K.C., *Vice-President, presiding,*  
and 54 Members, of whom 47 were Additional Members.

**INDIAN CRIMINAL LAW (AMENDMENT) BILL.**

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent** :—“ Sir, I beg to present the 11 A.M.  
Report of the Select Committee on the Bill providing for an amendment of the  
Indian Penal Code and the Criminal Procedure Code, 1898.”

**FINANCIAL STATEMENT, 1919-20.**

SECOND STAGE.

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President** :—“ The Council will now  
proceed to the second part of the Budget discussion.”

**RESOLUTION RE REDUCTION OF LOAN FROM £10  
TO £4 MILLIONS.**

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—“ Sir, I beg to 11-1 A.M.  
move the following Resolution :—

‘ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the Budget allotment  
providing for the flotation of a loan of £10 millions be reduced by £4 millions.’

[*Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

I acknowledge with humility the fact that not being a business-man I am apt to make larger errors in speaking to the Resolution on the present occasion than those connected with business might fall into, still I have ventured to bring it forward hoping that this Council will be able to find ample reason for a justification of the proposition that I have advanced. This Resolution and the Resolution coming at the third stage marked 10\* are intimately connected, and I dealt at some length with Resolution No. 10 in making my remarks on the Budget yesterday. These are inter-dependent, but I think the question can be looked at from two independent standpoints. I shall try first to approach this Resolution from the point of view as to whether in the interests of India it would be wise for the Government to venture to go into the loan market and ask for an additional loan of £10 millions this year to meet the needs of the Exchequer. The main grounds on which I propose to defend this Resolution are that the normal capacity of the loan market as exhibited by the increase of paid-up capital of joint stock companies and the deposits in the banks and otherwise has not been such in past year as to justify the Government in coming forward with such a large flotation. The experience of the last two years cannot be relied upon to any great extent, because we could rely upon the resources derived from excess profits due to artificial causes upon the flotation of artificial credit and the special exertions on the part of Government officials in securing the success of the loans. I think it would be politically unwise to make any experiments of this kind this year. I think to increase the rate of interest which is very high at present would be disastrous to business concerns, to private commercial men, to all trading men in India. I also plead that it would be unwise when large sums of money have been exported by means of contributions in the last two years to add to the export, for that would virtually be the effect of this, to add to the export in any considerable degree by increasing our expenditure. There would also be a tendency or temptation to use rigorously the powers of the Company Restriction Act lest private concerns should compete with Government. The first point that I would respectfully submit is that during the years 1913-14-15-16 for which I have figures, we find that the increase in the paid-up capital of joint stock companies has not been more than 416 lakhs in the highest year; the average for 15 years from 1901 to 1915 is 240 lakhs and it never exceeded in any year 6 crores of rupees. There was an increase in the Presidency Banks between 1913-16, the highest amounts in private deposits were 600 lakhs but that was after a fall, and the exchange banks show an average growth of 175 lakhs and for Indian Joint Stock Companies the figures were 212 in 4 years or an average of 55; or in all 4½ crores or £8 millions. I am not talking of the increase in the Post Office Savings Banks, for the Government have that capital at their command. Now £6 millions is a fairly large sum to be raised in a poor country like India, and in this year after the war when everybody's efforts should be directed towards the flotation of companies for the purpose of increasing the industrial development of the country. Now, Sir, I pitched upon this figure of £6 millions for the reason that inasmuch as the excess profits derived during and from the war are estimated to be about that figure, it might be reasonable on the part of Government to look to the flotation of a loan of £6 millions and ask the merchants to invest that amount in Government loans though the excess profits derived from business should normally go towards increasing the capital of the concerns for industrial undertakings especially in a country like India. The experience of the last two years should not encourage us very much in anticipating large investments by the public. It is well known that Rajahs, Maharajas, noblemen, merchants, in fact all loyal subjects have strained their resources by borrowing largely from banks and otherwise on credit instruments for the purpose of taking part in the 100 million loan. Such enthusiasm and such incentives are not likely to be forthcoming the next year, and it would be dangerous politically to ask the man in the street to invest in this

\* This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the Budget allotment of £177 millions for the construction of railways, etc., 1918 (page 101) be reduced by £5 millions.

RESOLUTION *RE* REDUCTION OF LOAN FROM £10 TO £4 763  
MILLIONS.

[ 8<sup>TH</sup> MARCH, 1919. ] [ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.* ]

because it would be likely to lead to the impression that the object of Government is to raise as much money as possible from the people. I say it is a wrong impression. But it seems to me that we have to take the circumstances of India into consideration, and I hope that the Government will not look to the average man for investment. We find that in the United Kingdom and elsewhere there are banks which were started during the war for the purpose of encouraging industries. There are also amalgamations of Banks, amalgamations of Trusts, for the same purpose, and they have been to a certain extent helped morally, if not financially, by the Government; in some instances they are helped financially also. Under those circumstances, how can India even begin the faint traces of industrialism if the Government do not encourage private capitalists to combine together for the purpose, by encouraging the formation and growth of capital reserves for improving the industries of this country. I therefore think that although it is a very good proposition in theory that a debt of this description especially should be floated within the country so that it may fructify here, although it is very good as an abstract proposition, still we must have regard to the limitations of the time, and I think this year especially would not be a fairly good year for an experiment in that direction. I said that it would be practically increasing the export of capital. Well, I am not now here on the question as to whether what we have done is right or wrong; it may be that we were right, that those people who have encouraged contributions are in the right and have taken a long view of things and it is unnecessary to quarrel over that proposition. But the net result has been that the money which might otherwise have remained in India and fructified here has been, for a worthy cause it may be, exported out of India, and the question is inasmuch as this money also will necessarily have to be employed largely outside India, inasmuch as Indian business-men cannot utilise it for their own purposes, would it be wise to export the money out of India unless the necessities of the situation are so grave that there is no alternative but to face it. Therefore, we are naturally driven back to the question which I raised yesterday and which I have to raise later on, as to whether the Railway loan for this purpose is of such an emergent character, so insistent in its demand that it cannot be reasonably postponed without incurring such a considerable risk to the general financial situation.

"Then I said that you should not encourage the money market in India to look to a very large rate of interest from the Government. I think there is a large question of policy involved here. Now there are a number of persons who have invested money in Government securities carrying a low rate of interest. Of course they have been hard hit during the war, and that could not be helped, but are we to add further to the depreciation of those securities by throwing again into the money market securities of the Government carrying a larger interest than even 5 per cent? I do not think as a business proposition it would be very practicable to reduce the rate of interest to very much below what we had to pay last year especially having regard to the interest that is being paid by the average borrower in the money market in India. Well, that being so, if an impression should prevail that money can be kept back until the Government pay this amount, I think in the future there would be some handicap to Government flotations, and therefore we must think twice as to whether we should embark on a policy of that description. We must remember, Sir, in this connection that what we are asking to-day is virtually not to raise a flotation of 10 millions but really of 16·9, because we are asking for the withdrawal from the reserve 6·9 million pounds which, I believe, was really money, borrowed, and we must also face the fact that we shall have to meet in the coming years the payments of large sums of money towards the discharge of the loan raised to make the one hundred million gift. These are, Sir, some of the reasons from the point of view of the money market which I thought would be ample reasons for justifying a proposition of this kind.

"Then to turn to the Railways. I shall not go into the details which I may have to go into when I take up that particular point. I said yesterday that

721 RESOLUTION RE REDUCTION OF LOAN FROM £10 TO £4 MILLIONS.

[*Ran Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Sir James Meston.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

we were trying to meet, to overtake, the arrears of the last four years. I think on examination it will be found that the money that was being employed prior to the war only on rolling-stock was a much smaller sum than I had given yesterday, and you will also find on examination of the figures that the produce traffic in 1919-1920 would be very much smaller than what was put in 1914-15, owing to insufficient rain-fall in many parts. However, inasmuch as I shall have to take up the Council's time on that point later on I shall not deal with it at greater length now. I hope therefore that the Council will see that there are ample reasons for asking that this loan should be restricted in the manner I have proposed."

11-17 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:—**

"Mr. Vice-President, I strongly support the Resolution which has been moved by my friend Mr. Sarma. In addition to the reasons which he has urged, I would ask the Council to take one more point into consideration, and that is this. Hitherto we have never worked up to a programme like what is proposed for the next year. I feel that it is a larger programme than can reasonably be expected to be carried out if there is not really to be extravagance and waste which would be deplorable in the present state of the country. I think, Sir, therefore, that Mr. Sarma's proposal is a reasonable one. It is proposed to spend 17 crores and odd on the improvement of rolling-stock. The improvement of rolling-stock is a matter of great interest and concern to the public. I do not grudge a reasonable amount of expenditure on this item. But I consider, Sir, in view of the present industrial situation, due to the war, the expenditure proposed is excessive. We must not forget that this is the year of the war not yet closed. Peace has not yet been signed. Industries have been disorganized in England also, and I wonder how the Government expect to get during the year all the material with the money that they are budgetting for will purchase. Of course they may be able to import railway material from America, but I do not think that the patriotism of Englishmen or of Scotchmen either, will permit of that course being adopted, and if you are not to go to other countries I do not know whether you will be able to get all the material in time to be able to carry out the programme within the year for which you are budgetting.

"Secondly, assuming that you get over all the tonnage and shipping difficulties and that you get all the materials in time, I do not know if, without incurring an amount of waste in working up this programme here, you would be able to utilise the full amount within the course of the year. For these reasons I support the proposition which has been moved by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma. Even if the proposition is accepted, the amount which will be left will be a large one. It would enable the Government to keep up the Railways in a sufficiently efficient condition, and we can look forward to further progress in the years that lie before us. I hope, though it is almost hopeless to hope, that the Hon'ble the Finance Member may yet see his way to curtail the programme, to reduce the amount which is budgetted for to the extent suggested, and at any rate if not exactly by that amount, then at least by something less. In the present state of the country the need for expenditure in other directions is very great, and the provision of such an enormous expenditure on the improvement of railway rolling-stock seems to me to be unjustifiable. For these reasons, I support the Resolution which has been moved by my friend Mr. Sarma."

11-20 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir James Meston:—**"Sir, when the Hon'ble Member, who has moved this Resolution, fulfils the prophesy that was made last evening and occupies this seat ten years hence, I hope that he will be a little more insistent on Hon'ble gentlemen explaining what underlies somewhat cryptic Resolutions. As this Resolution is worded it gave us all in the Finance Department a certain amount of interesting food for speculation. We had no idea what the Hon'ble Member meant or on what grounds he was going to justify his somewhat drastic proposal. I had, I confess, a sort of wild hope that

[ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ] [ *The Hon'ble Sir James Meeson.* ]

he was going to produce out of his pocket some new and pleasant method of raising the funds without going on the money market, and I was looking forward with great anticipation to his nostrum. However, Mr. Howard, with constitutional caution, dissuaded me from entertaining any such aspiration, and then we looked down the long series of Resolutions which stand in the Hon'ble Member's name and we attempted to do a little arithmetic. We saw that on one side he proposed to reduce the expenditure on railways by £5 millions, and that he was going to cut down the Loan by £4 millions, which left one million for some other purposes, probably for the purposes stated in his three further Resolutions. However, when we added up the expenditure advocated in the next three Resolutions it came, instead of £1 million to £2 millions, and we knew the Hon'ble Member was too good an arithmetician to make a mistake of that sort, and so we came into the Council still in a position of bewilderment as to what actually the Hon'ble Member meant. He has now in an interesting and lucid speech dissolved our bewilderment, and he tells us that his sole purpose is to associate this Resolution with the Resolution which stands as No. 10 in to-day's Agenda; and in anticipation of his moving that Resolution we have had his proposal supported by my friend the Hon'ble Pandit, who takes strong exception to the extended railway programme, and tells us that it is impossible to spend the money that we have budgeted for without waste and extravagance. I am content to leave him to the tender mercies of my Hon'ble Colleague on my left when he proceeds to deal with Resolution No. 10, and I shall proceed to answer, as far as in me lies, the suggestions and the criticisms that have been made by the Hon'ble Mover of this specific Resolution before us. He says that he wants us to stay out of the market this year except to the extent of £8 millions, in order, I take it, to give the market a rest, to give the market an opportunity of fulfilling other demands upon it and so on; and that is in substance his first substantial reason for reducing our loan. He says the shortage of floating money is apparent from the returns of the savings banks, and that we shall be unable now to raise more than £8 millions. I have listened with profound respect, but I am afraid with very little conviction, to the Hon'ble Member's *a priori* arguments on that aspect. We can at least have a try and see what the market will give us. The same argument would have deterred us from raising loans during the last two or three years, and still we did not do so very badly with those loans, as he will find if he will look at the statistics of our borrowing operations. We have intentionally very largely reduced our demands for this year in order to give the very opportunity which he is anxious for, in order to give new companies an opportunity of coming on the market or old companies an opportunity of increasing their capital, and I may say that they are already beginning to do so on a very satisfactory scale. Another reason the Hon'ble Member has suggested for our not showering money upon railways is that we, by pursuing such a policy, would be exporting more of our own money. There is already a great deal of money of ours lying in London, and he says he does not want us to add to it. If that were the result of our borrowing, I should most cordially agree with him, but fortunately the result of what we are proposing to do is exactly the opposite. What we are going to do is to import money, we are going to bring out not gold or silver, but wealth. After all money is only a token of wealth. We are going to bring out wealth in the form of railway material against this £4 millions, and the wealth will be used for remunerative purposes. I do not think the Hon'ble Member need be afraid that there is any financial heresy or economic fallacy underlying these proposals.

" Briefly, Sir, the Hon'ble Member's proposition involves one of two consequences. The first consequence is that we should reduce our loan and retain the railway figure. This assumes that the present Resolution is dealt with without reference to its corollary later. If we accept this consequence, it implies that we have to pinch our Ways and Means; we have got to refrain from paying for something else. If you will turn to page 86, you will see the sort of thing you will have to cut down; we should have to cut down the discharge of our Treasury Bills, or go without paying for the silver we have

[*Sir James Meston; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

purchased from America: or we might probably have to refrain from paying His Majesty's Government certain dues which we owe them. I am sure the Hon'ble Member, like myself, has a constitutional objection to postpone or reduce the payment of our lawful dues, and yet that is the position into which he is forcing us. The second alternative would be to assume that, along with the reduction of the loan, we are going to reduce our railway programme. Of course we still have to see whether the Council approve of any such suggestion, but if they did take the extreme step and reduce our railway programme correspondingly, what is the Hon'ble Member doing? He is preventing us from doing the very thing that he advised us to do last night. He was telling us how gravely wrong we are in allowing our paper currency to be inflated to the extent that it is; he was telling us that we are gravely wrong in having so many Treasury Bills floating about the market. I do not say we are right in this, and if circumstances had not been too much for us, we certainly would not have fallen into these uncomfortable habits. But even if our railway programme were reduced, would not the Hon'ble Member let us have our £4 millions in order to help in clearing these floating loans to which he takes such strong, such just exception? Would he not allow us to pay off our Treasury Bills and withdraw some of our surplus currency notes? I think the Hon'ble Member is hardly consistent. On the Resolution as it stands, without reference to any other subsidiary arguments based on the Resolution which is yet to be moved, the Government must oppose his motion."

11-29 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, it is difficult at the stage at which we have arrived for the Government to do otherwise perhaps than what they have done, namely, oppose the Resolution, but I must confess that I have not been able to be convinced by the Hon'ble Member's arguments. Of course it is easier for me to be convinced than for the Hon'ble Member to be convinced by my arguments, because I have got no particular position to defend, and I should therefore have very gladly accepted the Hon'ble Member's conclusions if I had felt that there was considerable force in his remarks. Well, Sir, I have already alluded to the experience of the last two years in my original remarks and tried to show how that cannot afford any standard whatsoever for a judgment as to what is likely to happen this year unless a somewhat similar attempt be made by the Government to push forward their scheme of flotation of this loan. I have not the slightest doubt that if the Government will it, they will have this £10 millions, and even more, but the only question is whether they should will it having regard to these circumstances, nor have I the slightest doubt that next year the Hon'ble Sir James Meston will be able to say—"Mr. Sarma said the loan could not be floated, but we have been able to find the £10 millions easily." But that would not be any justification for saying that the previous market experience has to be altogether neglected and that we ought to rely only or mainly on the experience of the last two years. I shall not deal with that point at greater length.

"Then it was said that my Resolution did not give any reasons whatsoever for the reduction, and that therefore the Finance Department were naturally at a loss to know exactly what was in my mind when I framed my Resolution. I am very sorry for not having been more argumentative, or rather, for not having been argumentative at all; but I was afraid I might be caught by the rule which says that Members should not be argumentative when they frame Resolutions. I shall attempt to give my reasons hereafter. But I may say, Sir, that one object I had in view in moving this Resolution was to have a reserve available to the Government which, along with other resources on which I shall dwell when I come to the next Resolution, would give me the monies that I want on the second, third and fourth Resolutions. That was one of my objects, and there is no need for concealing that fact. I ask for 2 millions and there is a surplus of 1·868 millions. I had hoped to be able to show that expenditure marked as 'Contingent' could be easily utilised by the Government, who had only car-marked revenue for indefinite purposes, for the purposes that I suggest; so that there should

RESOLUTION *RE* REDUCTION OF LOAN FROM £10 TO £4 767  
MILLIONS; RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET  
ALLOTMENT FOR SANITATION.

[ 5TH MARCH, 1919. ] [ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.* ]

be no difficulty whatsoever in the Government finding money to spend in the ways which I shall indicate when I come to the next Resolutions; and this one million was particularly meant for that purpose. But apart from that I tried to put this matter from two standpoints. The first was independent of the railway programme; but I never said the two were unconnected. I did not wish to detain the Council with any lengthy remarks on the last proposition, because I thought it would be wrong on my part to deal with that at great length now. These are inter-dependent propositions, as I have already said; and I am confident that I can put myself in the hands of the Legislative Council on the merits of this Resolution viewed apart from the railway Resolution as well as in conjunction therewith."

The Resolution was put and rejected.

**RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOT-  
MENT FOR SANITATION.**

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, I beg to put 11-35 A.M.  
the next Resolution:—

"This Council recommends to the Governor-General in Council that the Budget allotment '24-B.—Sanitation, etc.,' be increased by Rs50 lakhs towards the equipment and improvement of the Health Department, and by Rs50 lakhs for the improvement of water-supply in rural areas."

"I trust and hope that now that we are to have the full loan of 10 millions, the Government will be able to view this Resolution more sympathetically than they did the last Resolution. What I feel is that the Government and the Legislative Council will be at one in thinking that the money should be found for this object if it can be found for any object at all.

"Sir, supposing the statesmen attending the League of Nations in Europe; or for the matter of that any of us, were to open a morning newspaper and read there that on account of some preventible cause or some preventible calamity the whole of the population of Greece and Servia, or Belgium or one of the smaller countries of Europe, or for the matter of that, Scotland or Ireland, was swept away. What would their sensations be; what would their feelings be like? Would they give way to a fatalistic formula or would drastic attempts be made to meet a situation of a similar character should it unfortunately ever arise? I do not propose to be theatrical in dealing with this proposition because the hard facts of the situation are sufficiently clear, potent, influential and convincing to need any mere display of sentimentality. The country seems to have taken the loss of 5 million souls owing to influenza rather coolly and cynically. The Eastern temperament, which accepts with abject submission what it conceives to be the decrees of Providence, has never been known to do better; but we expect the Western statesmen ruling our destinies to put more force into the machinery in order to avoid such calamities. Put from the purely business point of view, what does the loss of these 5 million men, women and children amount to? I tried to say yesterday that at the very, very low figure Rs. 60 per human being the loss would amount to 30 crores per annum, and capitalised at 20 times it would amount to 600 crores. But Rs. 60 per head is a very low figure. It may be said that influenza is admittedly one of those visitations which cannot be exactly foreseen and prevented. But what about the preventible mortality that is going on in this country? Seven millions are being carried away, partly owing to inevitable causes and partly owing to preventible causes. I think it is acknowledged on all hands that deaths from cholera could be prevented. Deaths from dysentery and diarrhoea, which really largely come under the head 'Cholera' and even if they come under dysentery and diarrhoea are equally largely preventible, help to swell the list of mortality. Small-pox is another annual visitant, to say nothing of malarial fever, which

[ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.* ] [ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

carries away more than 4 millions in a single year. If we take the normal death-rate in Europe at 14 to 17 per cent. and the normal death-rate here during the last ten years for which figures are available at 31.8 per cent., we see at once the remarkable disparity between them; and even if we assume that owing to an Eastern country being in question the rate of mortality would be naturally higher, I think the preventible deaths can be assumed to be not less than 2½ millions a year. I ask you again to look at it from the business point of view, the sordid business point of view, let alone from the higher moral or humanitarian point of view. What does the loss amount to? I am bringing these facts, Sir, prominently to your notice to ask the Council and the Government to accept a new principle, a departure from orthodox methods, in dealing with this situation. I know I shall be told that the pagoda tree cannot be shaken, that after meeting the ordinary needs of the country we are trying to do what we can in the way of giving medical help, in the way of promoting sanitation, and that possibly the Government can show that they have done more than other Governments in the past. But I ask you to depart from that doctrine; I ask you to look at it from the Western standpoint, to look upon the expenditure that you should incur hereafter as a sort of national insurance against debility, death and starvation, insurance against industrial fatiguing causes, industry-defeating causes, production-decreasing causes. I ask you to look at it from that point of view and find the necessary money for sanitation, for medical help. If you look at it from that point of view, I think that even 80 crores a year would not be a bad sum to start with. But I know that that is a ridiculously high figure and one which need not be entertained for a minute. I have put my proposition now on the Agenda chiefly for the purpose of getting the principle accepted at the nearest possible date, and for something being done to start the principle into active vital enforcement. That is the reason, Sir, why I have asked that this 50 lakhs should be provided for the health department and 50 lakhs for the water-supply in rural areas. Yesterday we were told that the Governments of the Provinces had exceeded the Budget estimates of the previous year by as much as 40 lakhs, had exceeded the sum which was generally utilised in previous years, and therefore we should thank our stars that in spite of there being no specific instructions the Local Governments were very wise in using their discretion in drawing upon their ancient hoards for the purpose of meeting these new disbursements. We are thankful that there has been an increase, and we deeply regret that in some of the provinces there is a large surplus still available which has not been utilised owing to the indifference, the reckless indifference I would call it, of the Provincial Governments in not foreseeing expenditure and not planning beforehand what their proposals should be in case money was available. At any rate, Sir, it is the duty of the Government of India, having the supreme control, to whip up the Local Governments into active work, if they fail to do their duty. I do not see what the Government of India are for if they do not discharge that duty. Now, what is 40 lakhs when the task is so gigantic? I was very much amused when these increased estimates and percentages were indulged in yesterday. I know that some of us when dealing with percentages open ourselves to the same remark. I remember when I was young some students in colleges newly started used to boast of cent. per cent. successes of the students that went up from those colleges, whereas the percentage of successes in older established college was very poor. Well, if the number sent up is one and that one passes, the percentage is 100. If a hundred boys are sent up and only 20 pass, the percentage is only 20, but still the number who have passed is 20. Similarly, when you deal with percentages, you must be very careful as to whether the money you spend has been proportionate to the undertaking and the increased ratio has a relative significance when there is a large expenditure in the past, whereas when you were spending very little in the past any small addition would swell the percentage. I think my remarks would be perfectly justified when you look at the ridiculously small sums that you have spent on sanitation in past years. Therefore there is no reason why we should be exultant over the

RESOLUTION ~~RE~~ INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR 769  
SANITATION.

[8TH MARCH, 1919.] [Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Vice-President.]

percentages, or think that it is such a glorious record when we indulge in the pastime of dwelling on percentages to suit our own arguments. I submit, Sir, that I understand the limitations of the purse and that it is impossible to fly in the air and make a very large provision, but I hope I have said enough to convince you that on the first part of the Resolution there is need to depart in principle from our ancient practice and look upon the health department as a national insurance department just as much or just as little as the War Office is. Is then the 50 lakhs I have asked for too much? There are 1,100 divisions with an average population of 200,000 roughly in India. Even if you give one assistant surgeon and two sub-assistant surgeons with the necessary staff and a little money to spare, each division or sub-division would not have more than Rs. 45,000. But you will have a nucleus of a staff which can be developed. I believe, Sir, that it is absolutely necessary that the Government of India and possibly the Provincial Governments should have sanitary experts at the head to warn, to think out these problems, to understand what is going on in the rest of the world, to inform intelligently and in time the responsible Governments of the needs of the situation, to advise Provincial Governments and local bodies as to what is being done to bring the delinquencies, the omissions, the irregularities and the lapses of these subordinate administrative bodies to the notice of higher authorities for correction and reproof. I know that the present medical administration is doing splendid work, has been very, very sorely exercised during the last few years, and it would be ridiculous, wrong, cruel and mad to attribute to them any lack of industry or zeal to do what lies in human power to meet the situation. But it is impossible to expect from such a meagrely staffed body results at all proportionate to the needs of the situation. I therefore respectfully submit that the day should not be postponed, should not be unduly postponed, when we should give these bodies the necessary staff to undertake this task.

“Much of what I have to say with reference to this and the next Resolution would cover a portion of the Financial Statement. I hope to be well within my time, Sir, but if I trespass my time-limit on this I shall curtail my speech on the next. I respectfully request the indulgence of the Chair because I do not wish to take up the time of the Council unnecessarily . . .

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—“I am afraid that to-day I must hold Hon'ble Members strictly to the time-limit.”

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—“Well, then Sir, that is so far as the first part of the Resolution is concerned. Then, with regard to the second part, I have only to say this. I have in my mind a vivid picture of what is passing with regard to this water-supply in rural areas, both where there is an abundant source of supply available and where there is no water at all. In dry villages the task is how to find water, and how to assist materially in adding to the amenities of life. From the industrial point of view you will save a large waste of time by women not having to spend two to three hours in seeking to get a pot of water for their daily use. It need not be expatiated upon. In other parts, in delta and other tracts, where water is available, it is so filthy that the first flushes bring cholera and dysentery. With a little organisation you can improve it. I therefore hope that this item of expenditure need not be further expatiated upon to recommend itself to the acceptance of Council.

“Then we come to the question as to whether there is money for it. We have a surplus of £688,000. In dealing with this proposition apart from the question of the surplus, I ask you to consider whether it is not time for the Government to act upon the principle of the Reform proposals, in framing their Budget. I ask you to do this for the reason that apart from normal expenditure on the Army you budgetted for nearly 180 lakhs from revenue in trying to get the money that was promised last year. The excess profits duty is

[ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Mr. W. A. Ironside.* ] [ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

estimated at Rs. 7.5 millions, therefore if we make allowances for the fact that the rest of the money has been taken from revenue whereas it is a legitimate loan charge or taxation charge, I am within my rights in asking that the Imperial surplus should be used for this purpose. I said yesterday that if you leave the normal growth of revenue under land-revenue, court-fees, etc., you would have 175 lakhs to be given to the provinces or minus income-tax 160 lakhs. I ask that at least indulgence might be shown if this is to be a Provincial burden. You may treat it as a gift by the Imperial Government to the Provinces, the Provinces being left to utilise what is likely to be their own in the near future. Any way the money is theirs and, together with the 201 lakhs you propose to leave the Provinces on the Budget figure of 1917-18, there will be ample money in the Provinces to meet this expenditure. I beg that you may treat this money as a gift from the Imperial Government because the Reform proposals have not come into effect. Money is necessary for the purposes I have set out, and I am insistent for this reason that if we ignore the true Imperial surplus there is every risk of the military expenditure being swollen to enormous proportions so that you will practically get out of the country in the shape of Imperial taxation every pice leaving nothing for Provincial development. The matter should be looked at from that point of view. There is not the same surplus available in all Provinces alike, in Madras it is 100 lakhs; in three Provinces taken together it is 7.4 lakhs. I think the matter should be viewed from this point of view, and I therefore request that the Government may be pleased to take this Resolution into their sympathetic consideration and vote the money."

11-56 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. A. Ironside:**—"Sir, I did not intend to rise again to-day, for I thought after yesterday's experience that Mr. Sarma would have hesitated to get up and repeat some of the arguments then used as to the financial troubles of this country, but apparently like the brook of poetic fame he goes on for ever. I listened with much interest to his exposition and explanation of the financial features of the Budget. Am I to understand that this is the financial view as made in Madras? because if that is so I can quite understand the libel which has been levelled at that Presidency. In regard to the views put forward by Mr. Sarma on the subject of the necessities of sanitation, medical relief and water-supply, I may say that there is no one more insistent, more eager, than I am that these should be provided throughout India, but in questions of finance, no matter whether one is dealing with Imperial finance, Provincial finance, commercial finance, or shopkeeper's finance, one has to cut one's coat according to one's cloth. At the present time the Hon'ble the Finance Member has gone out of his way to put every rupee into the pool, and it has been done in a most extraordinarily generous manner on behalf of each and every department. When one deals with finance, and especially expenditure, the immediate necessity is to see what expenditure gives the quickest return. Now, as I pointed out yesterday, if railways are to be run less efficiently everything else in the chain of economic progress must be checked, retarded, and ultimately, if the plan be continued, stopped. I should be more inclined to listen to Mr. Sarma if I felt that this expenditure on sanitation were to have immediate effect. Only yesterday I read the Bengal Government's Report on some of the municipalities of that Province, and there a statement is made of the utter incapacity of the educated classes to grasp the value of sanitation. I refer to the Dacca Municipality; we have any number of other similar cases. I know that industrial concerns in Bengal and Bihar and Orissa are daily spending money on water-supply schemes and on sanitation; and if we could but get the assistance, the practical assistance and the advice, of the educated people in our midst, our task would be so much lessened. We spend money day after day on this or that scheme for the amelioration of the people, and one of our main desires is to get the educated classes to assist us in the task of ours. So Mr. Sarma must not think that I am against the principle of Sanitation. I am not. But when he talks on this subject, I think

[8TH MARCH, 1919.]

[*Mr. W. A. Ironside; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee.*]

it will be fair to say, he is wasting the time of this Council on expounding views which are economically unsound, and I feel that it is necessary to make some protest against some of them, otherwise without a protest they might be accepted outside this Council as correct."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee:**—"Sir, I did not want to take any part at all in the discussions of to-day, and I had imposed upon myself what I would call the vow of silence. But I am obliged to break that vow in consequence of the observations of my Hon'ble friend to my left. 12 P.M.

"My Hon'ble friend was pleased to say in the course of the observations which he has addressed to us that the educated classes—I suppose he has in his mind the educated classes in Bengal with whom he is in close touch—that the educated classes have exhibited an utter incapacity to grasp sanitary problems. I distinctly challenge that statement, and I say that whatever sanitary progress has been made in my Province has been largely due if not to the initiative, at any rate, to the persistent and strenuous efforts of the educated classes. I am not content with making a general statement of that kind. Every general statement should be tested by reference to concrete facts, and I desire to call the attention of my Hon'ble friend and of this Council to facts which, I think, will completely disprove the allegation which my Hon'ble friend has made with reference to the incapacity of the educated classes to grasp sanitary problems. Let us come to facts. My fact No. 1 is—The complete change in the sanitary condition of the town of Faridpur has been due to the initiative, the public spirit and the foresight of the Chairman of that Municipality, Mr. Amvica Charan Muzumdar, who was in 1916 the President of the Lucknow Congress and who was in consequence of his sanitary efforts congratulated by Sir John Woodburn, then Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, as the Grand Old Man of East Bengal. He it was who projected the water-works of Faridpur. He it was who raised the funds for those water-works. He it was who completed those works, and the Government thanked him on the completion of those water-works.

"Then let us take case No. 2. Take the case of the district of Krishnagar. The water-works are about to be undertaken. Who was it that initiated these water-works? Again, a non-official Chairman of the Krishnagar Municipality, my respected friend Rai Bishambar Nath Bahadur. They are appealing to Government for funds.

"Take again the case of Hoogli, which has a history behind it, and I need not go into it here. There again the water-works were initiated by my friend the Chairman of the Municipality, Rai Manindra Chandra Mitter Bahadur, and the water-works were completed, and, I think, he himself made a very large contribution towards the water-works.

"Then, Sir, coming nearer home, here is my friend to my right the Hon'ble the Maharaja of Kassimbazar than whom there is not in Bengal a more patriotic, a more liberal, a more philanthropic public man. We have got the water-works at Berhampur, and I think he was Chairman of that Municipality for some little time, and these works have completely transformed the sanitary condition of the place. Who was it, again I ask, who initiated those water-works and bore the burden of them? I think my friend paid about half a lakh. No, I stand corrected, my friend paid two lakhs for those water-works. The health of Berhampur is very different now from what it was twenty years ago. It was the hot bed of malaria. People used to run away from Berhampur. But now Berhampur, I will not say, is a sanitarium, but at any rate it is largely free from the scourge of malarial fever. There is that great educational institution the Krishnath College towards which my friend has paid a large sum of money, and I think he contributes about 3 lakhs of rupees a year towards the maintenance of educational institutions and the college is attended by 1,100 boys, healthy and strong young men, and the

[ *Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee ; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.* ] [ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

town is healthy owing to the water-works initiated by my friend, and the people of Berhampur feel deeply grateful to him for them.

"Take again the case of Murshidabad. Here again the initiative is due to Indian gentlemen who, I am told, are unfit to grasp sanitary problems. I am sorry that a statement of that kind should have been made by my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Ironside, for whom I have great personal respect. I am truly sorry that such an observation should have been made. Whether you pass this Resolution or not, that is another matter, but I am here to vindicate the character of my countrymen against the unjust aspersions which have been cast in this Council Chamber, and I should have rejoiced, speaking to the Resolution itself, I should have rejoiced if the Hon'ble the Finance Member could see his way to accept the Resolution of my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma. Wherever water-works have been extended, they have been attended with the greatest improvement in the sanitary condition of the place. Malaria has considerably abated, if it has not altogether disappeared. It is the one boon which the people appreciate ; it is the one boon for which they are prepared to make sacrifices, and it is the one boon which the Government ought to extend to the people.

"My friend has referred to the incapacity of the people. There is another matter which I forgot to allude to. A Conference was held not long ago for the purpose of supplying water-works to the riparian municipalities. I was a member of that Conference. It was held in the Presidency Commissioner's office. The estimates came to about 36 lakhs of rupees, and the representatives of the municipalities, and I was one of them, were willing to pay the taxes that would be necessary for the water-works. Educated India appreciates the boon of sanitation, and no stronger evidence of the fact could be found than in the constant appeals which are renewed year after year in this Council Chamber for sanitary grants and the enhancement of the sanitary grants. My friend's Resolution itself is proof positive of the eager and keen interest which we feel in sanitary problems and in the improvement of sanitary areas. I do hope that my friend the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, if he can see his way, will accept this Resolution."

12-10 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya** :—"Mr. Vice-President, I give my hearty support to the proposal put forward by my friend Mr. Sarma. I do not wish to say anything more with regard to the remarks which the Hon'ble Mr. Ironside made, because I take it that he will withdraw those remarks and express his regret for having made them. I think, Sir, the proceedings of this Council and of the Provincial Legislative Councils bear most eloquent if also painful testimony to the strenuous efforts which educated Indians have been making towards the improvement of the sanitation of the country, and I think they bear also regrettable proof of the unwillingness of the Government to do as much as is needed in this direction.

"Now here we are in this year with a large Budget in which a very heavy sum is being set apart for expenditure on military purposes, and in which a very large programme of railway construction has been provided for. In these circumstances, I do not think it is a sin for an Indian who feels that there should not be so many preventible deaths in his country to appeal to the Government to set apart more money for the health department and for supplying drinking water to the people. My friend Mr. Sarma has pointed out how great, how pressing, is the need for more money being spent on the health department. I know from my little experience as President of the Seva Samiti in Allahabad how great is the need for supplying medical relief to the people in the villages. Our volunteers have gone into the villages during the time of influenza and distributed medicines so far as they could ; but medicines have been asked for from long distances and we have not been able to supply them. The need for medical relief is patent, it is crying, it is insistent. I think, Sir, a Government which spends so much on other departments, which is anxious to be up-to-date in other departments, ought to find

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR 773  
SANITATION.

[ 8TH MARCH, 1910. ] [ *Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Mr. W. A. Ironside; Vice-President.* ]

money to give the necessary amount of medical relief and protection to the people. The heavy death-roll to which my friend Mr. Sarma has referred speaks for itself. It is high time that the Government made a resolve to reduce this death-rate and made a strenuous effort to achieve that end. We have this sad fact that six millions of people, according to official calculation, have been carried away by influenza. There are some people who imagine that these deaths from influenza could not be avoided. I can say from my personal knowledge and experience of the work we have done that these were preventable deaths, most of which, if not all, could have been avoided. They were deaths brought about by insufficient food, by insufficient sanitary surroundings, by want of early medical help, by want of milk to give to the patients when they were down, and by want of other remedies and ameliorating conditions which the Government and the people working together could secure and should have secured to the people. Apart from this influenza, the ordinary death-rate also has been very high. I do not want to take up the time of the Council, by repeating the figures which we have been used in the past to refer to in this Council, but I ask the Council, when it is providing for expenditure on other departments, to find the 50 lakhs which is asked for to increase and strengthen the Medical department.

"As for the second item, the item for providing pure drinking water, it seems to me a sad thing that in this Council, consisting of so many European members and consisting of Indian members from all the Provinces, it should be necessary to argue this matter with the Government. One would have expected that the Government would have itself made ample provision for providing healthy drinking water in areas where it is not available. But when a Resolution has been brought forward, I hope the Government will see their way to accept it. The want of good drinking water has been responsible for numerous deaths which could have been prevented. My friend Mr. Banerjee has referred to his experience in Bengal. We have the same experience in our United Provinces. Everywhere where good drinking water has been provided, cholera has nearly died out, at any rate has become a less frequent visitor than it used to be, and we have found the health of the people generally improved. My friend Mr. Ironside said that he did not feel sure that expenditure on the head which Mr. Sarma has asked for was going to bring the quickest return. He also said that if the expenditure on sanitation were to have an immediate effect, he would have supported the Resolution. I cannot understand my friend. I do not know that there is any expenditure which would have a more immediate effect than the provision of good drinking water for the people. Everywhere that has been the experience. Of course it will not bring a quick return in the shape of pounds, shillings and pence, it will not bring any quick return in the shape of rupees, but that is not the only return which Government may be concerned with. Business-men may lay too much stress upon that aspect of the question, but the Government has a larger business, a more humanitarian programme before it, and it has to consider what money is needed in order to prevent the premature death among people who should live normally to an old age. For these reasons, I would urge that the Government should accept this Resolution and provide the money that is asked for. If this is done I hope that the havoc of the last epidemic, such a death-rate, as we have had the misfortune to witness this year will not be repeated in future years. If this provision is not made, there will be widespread feeling in the country, that the Government is not sufficiently alive to the medical needs of the people, and to the sanitary needs of the people, and I regret to think that they will have justification for taking such a view. I commend this Resolution to the acceptance of the Government."

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. A. Ironside:**—"Sir, in making . . . 12-16 P.M."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"We will certainly hear any explanation Mr. Ironside would like to make."

[ Mr. W. A. Ironside; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea; Sir Dinshaw Wacha. ] [ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. A. Ironside** :—" Sir, in making the remarks I made just now I knew they would raise a storm of protest....."

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya** :—" Condemnation, not protest."

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. A. Ironside** :—" Very well then, condemnation, from Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea. When one makes a statement like that, surely it may be taken for granted that I did not do so without knowledge of the subject and without a thorough grasp of the facts, and I agree there are many individuals who are working hard, spending money, using their influence in favour of this most desirable object. But we cannot get away from the fact that a great proportion of the educated classes have failed to support the schemes for sanitation that have been provided by friends like those on my right here, and the case has been brought to my personal knowledge by facts, where the surrounding educated classes of the inhabitants could have done so much to render sanitary schemes with which I have been connected far more beneficial to the surrounding people. I withdraw anything in the shape of an imputation against individuals, it was never intended . . . ."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea** :—" Against us as a class."

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. A. Ironside** :—" Against the great majority of them."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea** :—" I rise to point out that the imputation was not against individuals. 'Educated class,' I think those were the words used, and I submit that my friend, in view of the statement which he himself has made, will be good enough to withdraw the allegation so far as the class is concerned. Individuals you may pillory as much as you like, but I think I am entitled to ask my Hon'ble friend to withdraw the imputation as against the class."

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. A. Ironside** :—" I leave it to Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea. I am quite prepared to withdraw it, but I cannot get away from the fact that if we are going to spend money, if it is to be on railways or on sanitation, it should be spent where it may secure the quickest return, and where I have spent money on sanitation my difficulty has been to get that return by reason of the apathy of the large number of educated people whom one would ordinarily have expected would have grasped the benefits placed at the disposal of their less educated neighbours."

12-20 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha** :—" I am very glad, Sir, that Mr. Ironside has seen the advisability of withdrawing the accusation made against the educated classes. I read generally the annual Administration Reports of almost all the Presidencies and Provinces, and, as far as sanitation is concerned, during the last ten or fifteen years, I have seen that in every municipality and district board the educated classes are perfectly alive to the advantages of a good supply of potable water of a health-giving kind, and also to conservancy and other matters which help to prevent a high mortality. That being the case, I say, I am glad, Sir, that Mr. Ironside has thought fit to withdraw this allegation, which certainly is a libel against the educated classes. Apart from that, Sir, I am a member (though I will cease to be so on the 30th March) of the Bombay Municipal Corporation for thirty years, and nobody will deny at any rate that I have

[8TH MARCH, 1919.] [Sir Dinshaw Wacha; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Vice-President.]

been one of the foremost members there to do every thing in my power, whenever the occasion arose, not only to increase the water-supply but also to see that medical relief and sanitation had the best chances of success from the Municipality as far as funds permitted. I do not mean to say that I am the only member of the Municipality who has done this; the whole of the Bombay Municipal Corporation has been insistent and useful in these directions. In Bombay, it was the educated classes who, in 1885, first raised the very big question of a large supply of pure water from the Tansa Lake at a cost of 1½ crores of rupees.

"The population increased, and only two years ago we were able to construct what we call a duplicate main at the cost of another crore. Even then we find now that the water-supply will not suffice, and what are we doing to meet the inadequacy? At the present moment my Corporation is very busy attempting to get an estimate for a third supply of water, which will cost perhaps another crore. In ten years' time the Bombay Municipality will nearly have spent something like 4 to 5 crores on water-supply alone.

"Then look at our conservancy, which means cleansing the streets and removing nightsoil and other things which, if not removed, would cause great nuisance and high mortality. They are doing everything in Bombay for preventing the spread of cholera and other infectious diseases. They did everything to check the influenza epidemic when the latter was at its worst in September last, and when there was a heavy holocaust of as many as 750 deaths a day. Every educated young man—particularly from the colleges, volunteered to go about the worst parts of the town and very ably seconded the efforts of the Municipality—so ably that the whole press eulogised the services of every one of these young educated men. That certainly showed the spirit of our educated classes as to sanitation and prevention of diseases. Not only in the city but in other places too, like Poona and Ahmedabad, they did similar work....."

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:**—"Some of those young men died."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"Order, order."

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:**—"I was only reminding my Hon'ble friend that some of these young men have died doing the work."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"Hon'ble Members should address to the Chair any remarks they may have to make."

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha:**—"Exactly, that is the rule we follow in the Bombay Corporation. We always address all remarks to the Chair. That is a constitutional procedure and you, Sir, have ruled rightly.

"Of course, my Hon'ble friend Pandit Malaviya is right when he says that some of these educated young men died while doing their duty. I know of a very able young man, Mr. Netrajan, who sacrificed his life for this purpose while ministering to the afflicted. But, Sir, we need not further pursue this subject. I do admit that there are backward municipalities and other district and local boards which cannot go ahead for want of funds; but the spirit is there, and if there was more money they would do a great deal more in the way of water-supply and conservancy. As far as the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma's Resolution is concerned, I think it is a pertinent one. I myself yesterday told the Council what I thought was done by the Imperial Government itself in regard to sanitation. The accounts for 1917-18 showed an expenditure of £698,000 and the Budget estimate is for £998,000. I do not consider the revised estimates as complete, and I therefore compare the completed accounts of 1917-18

[*Sir Dinshaw Wacha; Mr. Malcolm Hogg; Rai Sitanath Ray Bahadur.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

with the Budget estimate of the coming year. I find that we have increased the sanitation expenditure by nearly 57 per cent. As I said yesterday, when referring to this question, as far as sanitation is concerned, I think there is a bigger problem looming even than that of water-supply, because once the water-supply is put on a proper footing, there is an end to it. But a more serious problem of a permanent nature is the housing of the poorer classes in every part of the country. Insanitary housing is the cause of a greater holocaust of lives than even want of good drinking water. Therefore I observed that whatever is done in future by the Government in co-operation with private enterprise for the better sanitary housing of the poorer classes of the people would go a great way to reduce the prevailing heavy death-rate in India. That being my conviction, I associate myself with the Hon'ble Mr. Banerjea and say that, if the Hon'ble the Finance Minister could see his way to increase the grant in spite of the exigencies of the financial estimates, I for one would be very glad to support the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma's proposition."

12-23 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Malcolm Hogg** :—" Sir, in according in a limited degree of support to this Resolution, I do not wish it to be understood that I necessarily consider that the figure of 50 lakhs suggested by the Hon'ble Mover is feasible under the circumstances of this year; but I do feel that the need for increased expenditure on sanitation and medical relief in particular in this country is so great that I cannot let this Resolution pass without according to it a degree of support, in principle, at any rate."

"I do not wish to take up the time of the Council by going lengthily into the whole question of the need for sanitation and medical relief; nor do I want to follow my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Ironside, into the somewhat thorny question as to whether people always take the best possible advantage of such facilities as are afforded them. I know of cases within my own experience where certain mofussil municipalities have shown a regrettable indifference to the necessities of sanitation. But that seems to me to be a question which is rather beside the point in discussing this Resolution. That might be an argument if we were discussing under whose control the expenditure of money granted for sanitation should be. But we are not discussing that question to-day fortunately. The only question before us now is as to whether there is a need for increased expenditure on these subjects in this country, and I do not think that can be denied. I should like to give just one very brief instance as showing the sort of conditions that I imagine prevail over very large parts of this country. During the recent influenza epidemic in a district which I know well and in which I have industrial interests, the only medical relief open to a large number of villages, the only means of coping with the epidemic at all, was our own doctor, employed at our own mills there primarily for the purpose of looking after the people who resided in our own village. The local authorities had to come to us and ask us to lend our doctor to the surrounding villages and to supply the medicines. We were very glad to do so, but I do not think it is right that a considerable number of villages should be entirely dependent for medical relief on the chance fact that private interests happen to maintain a doctor and a dispensary in the neighbourhood."

12-29 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rai Sitanath Ray Bahadur** :—" Sir, I beg to associate myself and to express my sympathy with the Resolution which has been moved by my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Sarma, by giving it my humble support. In doing so, I also beg to refute the charge that the educated classes, so far as Bengal is concerned (I do not know what is the case in other Provinces), are backward in supporting any movement to improve sanitation and water-supply. So far as I know, and so far as I personally am concerned, I have all my life advocated the desirability of supplying good drinking water to rural areas, and I have in my humble way spent some money in supplying filtered water in one place alluded to by my Hon'ble friend....."

RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR 777  
SANITATION.

[8TH MARCH, 1919.] [Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea; Rai Sitanath Ray  
Bahadur; Vice President; Rai Bahadur  
Krishna Sahay.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea:**—"How much?"

**The Hon'ble Rai Sitanath Ray Bahadur:**—"Rupees 25,000 only. It may be that the educated classes on account of their poverty have not always been to the fore in supporting movements which go to improve their sanitary surroundings or to improve the water-supply; but may I at the same time point out to the Hon'ble Mr. Ironside that whilst it is very easy to level criticism at the educated classes for their backwardness in these matters, what has the Calcutta Improvement Trust done so far to improve the condition, to remove congestion and bring about better sanitary conditions in the northern quarter of the town of Calcutta?"

"We, two or three Indian members of the Calcutta Improvement Trust, have been crying ourselves hoarse to improve the sanitary condition of the northern quarter of the town; but all the efforts of the Trust have been practically directed to improve the areas to the south of Chowringhee, and not to the improvement of the northern quarter of the town. I hope Mr. Ironside will kindly try and find out whether this is so or not. We have been submitting note after note—making suggestions for the improvement and opening up of the northern portion of Calcutta but to no effect . . . . ."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"I think the Hon'ble Member is travelling very far from the Resolution. This is not the Calcutta Improvement Trust."

**The Hon'ble Rai Sitanath Ray Bahadur:**—"I referred to that only in order to show that Indian members are not at all apathetic to the improvement of sanitation. With these few words I beg to say that I wholeheartedly support the Resolution, especially that part of it which says that provision should be made in the Budget to allot 50 lakhs more for the improvement of water-supply in rural areas."

**The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Krishna Sahay:**—"Sir, I accord my hearty support to both parts of the Resolution which my friend, Mr. Sarma, has moved. It can hardly be contended that the allotment under the head of sanitation, etc., is at all adequate. At any rate it is not commensurate with the requirements of the Provinces. I believe all Provinces stand in need of larger expenditure under the head of sanitation—particularly for my Province of Bihar and Orissa I find that there is an allotment of Rs. 5,89,000 only for sanitation. If you take into account the vast population of that province, about 34 millions, it will at once appear that the provision made here is grossly inadequate. I find also another curious thing. The allotment under that head as regards another Province, namely, Bombay, with a population of 19 millions only, is 23 lakhs. First of all we have to see whether an allotment of 5 lakhs and odd is sufficient for a population of 34 millions. I submit that it is not.

12-33 P.M.

"It is hardly necessary for me to enter the lists against the remark which has been made, unfortunately, by my friend, Mr. Ironside, as regards the incapacity of the educated people of this country to appreciate the problems of sanitation. I may remind my friend, that so far as my Province is concerned, this question of medical relief, as well as water-supply, has been times without number brought forward not only by the educated classes in the Provincial Council of which at one time both my friend and I were members, but also in the mofussil district boards and municipalities. A perusal of the proceedings of the Council and of the municipalities and district boards will, I am sure, convince my friend that far from their incapacity to appreciate problems of sanitation they have studied it, they have felt the need for a proper solution of the problem and have incessantly applied their minds to a solution of the problem. I think

778 RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR  
SANITATION.

[*Rai Bahadur Krishna Sahay; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea; Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul; Vice-President; Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Shafi; Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda; Sir James Meston.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

it was an uncalled for remark on the part of Mr. Ironside when he said that the educated classes in the country did not appreciate the problems of sanitation. . . .

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea:**—"May I be permitted to make a suggestion, Sir, that this unhappy controversy should be allowed to drop, having regard to the fact that Mr. Ironside has withdrawn the allegation he made against the educated community?"

**The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Krishna Sahay:**—"I said, therefore, that it was not necessary to enter the lists, in view of the fact that Mr. Ironside withdrew his remark. But I was just going to convince him that so far as my Province is concerned his remark would not apply. With these words I support the Resolution."

12-36 P.M. **The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul:**—"Sir, on behalf of the Central Provinces and Berar I rise to submit my emphatic protest against the . . .

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"I must call the Hon'ble Member's attention to the fact that the allegation has been withdrawn."

**The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul:**—"Yes, but not against the educated classes, Sir. As coming from the backward parts of the Central Provinces I do assure the Council that the members of the backward municipalities are as keenly interested in the question of adequate water-supply as the members of advanced municipalities like Bombay and Calcutta, and as such I submit that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister will kindly see his way to accept the suggestion made by my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Sarma. In my Budget speech last year I pointed out how the allotment for sanitation was not adequate so far as the Central Provinces were concerned, and I now find to my regret that the situation has not very much improved. With these words I commend the Resolution of my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Sarma, to the acceptance of this Council."

12-37 P.M. **The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad Shafi:**—"Sir, the Resolution moved by my friend, the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma, has been so thoroughly discussed that I shall content myself with merely saying that I associate myself entirely and whole-heartedly with the object which my friend has in view, and I trust that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister will see his way to accede to the request embodied in this Resolution."

12-38 P.M. **The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda:**—"Sir, I will follow my friend, the Hon'ble Mr. Shafi's example, in simply associating myself with the Resolution moved by my friend Mr. Sarma. In fact in my remarks yesterday I think I went beyond what he said, and I earnestly hope that the Finance Member will see his way to accept this Resolution."

12-39 P.M. **The Hon'ble Sir James Meston:**—"Sir, the Hon'ble Mover in his opening speech said that he had no intention of being either theatrical or sentimental, and in replying to the Resolution I shall endeavour to follow his excellent example. I shall therefore express no sort of resentment against the suggestions that have been made that we, Government officials, do not regret the appalling calamity that has visited us in the course of the last few months or that we do not wish to see an enormous development of medical and sanitary work, or that we do not recognise that such medical and sanitary services as are

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR 778  
SANITATION.

[6TH MARCH, 1919.] [Sir James Meston; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma;  
Sir James Meston.]

available to rural areas are at present gravely inadequate or in fact generally speaking that we do not think as much as the Hon'ble Member does of the thirst of the people, whether it is.....

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:—**" May I make an explanation, Sir. I never meant that the Government did not have the people's welfare at heart or did not think of it at all. I simply ask them to think more about it, that they should give their millions to it."

**The Hon'ble Sir James Meston:—**"I was going to make that clear. The Hon'ble Member's speech was all that could be desired; but some of his followers moved a little further in that direction than I think he did. I do not want to exacerbate this debate in any way whatever. I do want to say that we are fully aware of the deficiencies of the system of sanitation and water-supply. As a Government we are fully aware of what I was going to describe as the thirst of the people, whether it was for pure drinking water in the literal sense or for education in a metaphorical sense. I say nothing further on those points. I have no desire to enter into the merits of the case. I subscribe cordially to the statement that has been made by my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Banerjee, that great energy and great generosity have been displayed by individuals and by large groups of the educated classes in providing water-supply for large towns. The discussion, however, has rather tended to drift away from the precise terms of the Resolution before us which do not apply to large towns, but apply directly and specifically to rural areas. Well, the real fact of the matter is, as the Hon'ble Mover has said and as Mr. Hogg who supported him has emphasised, that this Resolution endeavours to establish a principle. I accept the principle; I gladly accept the principle and in opposing the Resolution I do it purely on technical grounds. I have to oppose the Resolution on technical grounds, and I may say at once that for the same reason, on the same grounds, I shall have to oppose the next Resolution that stands in the Hon'ble Member's name.

"Public health, rural sanitation, primary education all stand on the same footing; and the reasons I have to urge upon the Council to-day for not accepting these specific proposals for large grants to them are the same in each case. There are three or four good reasons to my mind why these Resolutions should not be accepted in the form in which they stand. In the first place, it is, if I may say so, the duty of this Council to insist upon the salutary rule that when an Hon'ble Member rises to propose large additional expenditure, he should say where that expenditure is to come from. The Hon'ble Mover in his speech referred in a general way to various possible sources, and he referred specifically to the Imperial surplus. Well, I ran down the list of proposals that stand in his name and I find the extra grants he asks for come to 3 crores; the Imperial surplus is just a little over one crore; it obviously therefore cannot go round. He does not propose that we should impose extra taxation; the sources from which we are to find this extra grant are vague and indeterminate. I think it would be a beneficial thing to lay upon ourselves a self-denying ordinance that when we put forward proposals for extra grants we should specify clearly where the money is to come from. This is the first ground on which I shall oppose these two Resolutions. The second ground is that they are both opposed to the whole idea of provincial autonomy which now holds the field. We are endeavouring to get Local Governments to develop their own resources and surpluses and not to come cap in hand to the Government of India for assistance whenever they have any deserving proposals to put forward. The Hon'ble Member in that connection is doubtful whether the Local Governments have sufficient freedom to draw on their balances. As to that I can only refer him to the figures. The third ground on which I oppose the Resolution is that the provision of water-supply for rural areas, the development of their own

760 RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR  
SANTATION.

[ Sir James Meeson ; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma ; [ 21st MARCH, 1919. ]  
Vice-President.]

Health Departments, the extension of primary education, are all matters for the Local Governments; they have to draw up plans and to lay out programmes, and it will then be for us to consider the grant of assistance if they come and tell us exactly to what extent they wish the Central Government to co-operate. We have no suggestions in the current Budget from any of the Provincial Governments for extra grants. I cannot charge my memory with any single case in which a sanitary scheme or an education scheme has been rejected by the Central Government. The fourth and last reason why I ask the Council not to accept this Resolution in its present form is, that it is reviving the old, the discredited, the dead system of doles. It will be within the memory of a good many of the members of this Council that there was a time when doles were very much in fashion. There was the historic case in which India was reeling in money which accrued from the opium habit of the Chinese. There was a great deal more money than we knew what to do with, and enormous sums were offered to Local Governments for various beneficial purposes. What happened? I can speak from personal experience. At least one Government received a very considerable amount for education, and we had to set to work to prepare schemes for the best employment of these funds. If we had employed them straightaway we should have been involved in recurring expenditure to an extent which our Provincial funds were utterly inadequate to provide. If we employed them, as we ultimately did, very largely on non-recurring expenditure, we required time to mature our schemes to see that we were using the money to the best advantage. Those doles were not a blessing in disguise, very much the reverse. I believe that in the balances of Local Governments there are still lying considerable sums, dating from that period which Local Governments have not been able wisely to employ. It is a very easy thing to offer largesses to Local Governments; it is very easy to go and say 'my predecessor has taxed you, my colleague has imposed an unwelcome policy upon you; but here is the Finance Department, or any other department of Government, coming to solace you with money'; in other words, 'Oodlin is your friend not Shortt.' That is an easy policy but it is an embarrassing policy, and to my mind an unwise policy. I trust the Government of India will continue to resist temptation of that sort and get the relations between the Central and the Provincial Governments on a healthier and more permanent basis henceforth. I have to oppose the Resolution as it stands, and I shall have to adopt the same attitude as regards the next Resolution, but in view of the strong feeling that has been expressed in this Council, I desire to say that I shall be very glad to consider, in consultation with the Hon'ble Sir Saubaran Nair, who is in charge of these departments, the insertion in the final Budget for next year of whatever sum he considers reasonable for the development of central investigation into influenza or similar epidemics and measures for dealing with occurrences of that sort. Speaking generally, I am prepared to do that, but this does not apply to the suggestion about the improvement of the water-supply in rural areas which is entirely a Provincial matter. I do not know if my Hon'ble friend accepts that as sufficient, or whether he will still press his Resolution."

12-50 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" Sir, I have just to make a few observations with regard to the remarks which have fallen from my esteemed friend Mr. Ironside . . . . ."

**The Hon'ble the Vice President** :—" If the Hon'ble Member is going to refer to what has been withdrawn then he is out of order."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" I am not going to speak of what was said of the educated classes, but certain remarks fell from the Hon'ble Member with reference to myself and the proposition I advanced."

[8TH MARCH, 1919.] [Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

If he does not desire to press the point against me, I have no desire to indulge in any controversy, but if these remarks stand against me then it is my duty to reply to them.

"Sir, the Hon'ble Member has alluded to certain positions which I have taken up with reference to this debate and to financial questions in general, and has made a grave indictment against me. Speaking personally about my own position I have been accustomed to these attacks for the last thirteen years in the Legislative Councils with one break, and my reputation can be allowed to take care of itself. But my Hon'ble friend has dragged the dear name of the presidency to which I belong into question, and I must protest in the most emphatic terms against the suggestion that the Province has suffered cruelly at my hands.

"Well, Sir, in view of the support which I have received from the representative of the Bombay commercial community and the sympathetic remarks from the Hon'ble the Finance Member and of all my non-official colleagues, I do not think those remarks require any refutation whatsoever in detail. But when he made those remarks I literally trembled in my shoes as to whether he was going to follow up those vague charges with any substantial reasons, or whether he was going to indulge in them simply because that he was angry because I have suggested certain retrenchments possibly in other directions which hurt the interests he advocates. I may be permitted to say, Sir, that his remarks, though they show a general lip sympathy for the object which all of us have at heart, are, if construed rightly, a libel on the European commercial community, because he brings in the question of immediate financial returns when I ask for expenditure on sanitation and on the equipment of the Health Department. I do not think the mercantile world, the Indian mercantile world among whom some of the best intellects, cultured intellects, find a place, would deal with a proposition of this description in the manner in which the Hon'ble Mr. Ironside proposes to deal with it.

"I said, Sir, that I wanted an acceptance of the principle that we should look upon the Health Department as a national insurance department. He has not one word to say by way of argument against it. Is my proposition of such a stupid, fallacious character as to deserve that condemnation from him?

"Then I asked for Rs. 50 lakhs. For what object? For the equipment of the Department of Health. I suppose it is a monstrous financial proposition, a gross fallacy, that I have advocated in this Council wasting the time of this Council which does not appeal to my Hon'ble friend.

"And what is the third object? I asked for Rs. 50 lakhs for rural water-supply, and he brings in the question of the educated classes. Wherein is there any connection between the educated classes and rural areas, I wonder? And I was asking chiefly for the funds for wells and other objects in which educated classes would not take any part at all, and in which the machinery of the Government, largely official, would take part, and therefore was there any fallacy in my argument even there? I fail to see any unless I am told wherein it lies.

"Then, Sir, the Hon'ble Mr. Ironside says the general objects to which I alluded are economically unsound financial propositions. Now what did I ask for? I simply said that the general Exchequer would have to find funds to adopt ways and means to meet this pressing situation, whatever may be the nature of the other difficulties with which we are confronted, even at the expense of risking a certain amount of diminishing expenditure under the favourite head 'Railways.' Most certainly in the Hon'ble Member's estimate Railways are better than the lives of His Majesty's Indian subjects! That is a new proposition that has been expounded to us here to-day.

"Well, Sir, I stand unconvinced by any of the arguments.

"Then with reference to the remarks of the Hon'ble Sir James Meston, I cordially appreciate the position that he takes. But, Sir, I have not asked for any interference with provincial autonomy. I have simply pointed out that if the spirit of the Reform proposals be carried out, then obviously this money that I am asking for would not be really the money of the Imperial Department

782 RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT FOR SANITATION; RESOLUTION RE EXTENSION AND IMPROVEMENT OF PRIMARY EDUCATION.

[ Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Mr. Malcolm Hogg; [ 5TH MARCH, 1919. ]  
Vice-President. ]

which they would be doling out to Provincial Governments, but money of the Provincial Governments, money which is legitimately and rightfully their own. Therefore, the question of interference with provincial autonomy, that impolicy of dolcs, does not, I submit respectfully, come in here.

"Then, Sir, I am asked whether I have suggested additional taxation or addition to the resources. The rules of course prohibit me, they prohibit any non-official Member from raising any questions of taxation, and therefore that cannot be flung in my face, but I have suggested increased customs on beer, etc. But having regard to what he has said and to his decision, if possible, to find money if the Sanitary Department wants it, I do not think any useful object would be served by my pressing this Resolution on the further attention of this Council, and I therefore withdraw it."

12-58 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Malcolm Hogg** :—" Sir, I would like to [make a personal explanation. The Hon'ble Mover has referred to the support which I gave him on this Resolution. I just wish to make it clear that my support was limited to the general principle of allotting more mouey for medical relief, and did not necessarily extend to the methods by which my Hon'ble friend proposed to provide it."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" I did not understand it."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President** :—" I understand the Hon'ble Member desires to withdraw the Resolution with the leave of the Council ? "

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" Yes, Sir."

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

**RESOLUTION RE EXTENSION AND IMPROVEMENT OF PRIMARY EDUCATION.**

1 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" The next Resolution, Sir, that I have the honour to move is—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the expenditure under education be increased by Rs. 150 lakhs to provide for the extension and improvement of primary education.'

"I shall not take up the time of the Council very much on this question. This is a hardy annual as was put last year by one of the Hon'ble Member, and it is unnecessary to ask this Council to accept the principle of extension of primary education. My object, Sir, in bringing forward the Resolution this year is of a two-fold character.

"The first is that this year and as early as possible we should recognise that the Provincial Governments should be given funds for the immediate development of primary education in the Provinces. My object is to draw the attention of the Council to the fact that this question cannot be indefinitely postponed, that we should not be satisfied with mere paper Acts passed in the various Legislative Councils about compulsory primary education; that we should not labour under any delusions that the progress is going to be rapid if we are to be satisfied with the acceptance of the principle. Time was when the Government fought even the question of principle, but we seem to think that inasmuch as the Government have accepted the principle, we have gained 90 per cent. of the goal, that we are within measurable reach of victory, that our ideal will be realised in practice, that the Local Governments by passing paper Acts will be able to extend primary education. I want the Legislative Council clearly to realise that, in spite of the Act which my Hon'ble friend Mr. Patel had the honour of introducing and getting passed in

[8TH MARCH, 1919.] [*Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.*]

the Bombay Council and similar Acts passed elsewhere, not much seems to have been done because the sinews of war have not been provided; there is no finance to back up the proposals. Now you will say 'this is going to be left to the people hereafter under the proposals for reform, therefore why worry us now about it?' Accept that principle if you please, but give us the money which is really the Provincial Governments' money. I will not deal with this matter at length, because I have dealt with it already and I have shown that if the Provincial Governments get their own revenues there would be more than 200 lakhs to their credit out of which they could meet this 150 lakhs. Be consistent, give them that, otherwise I ask you to accept the responsibility of the Imperial Council to provide funds from out of the general Exchequer this year. What after all am I asking for? Hon'ble Members will realise that we have during the last five years increased the total revenues of the country from £88 to £123 millions, or there has been an increase of £40 millions; in other words, Rs. 60 crores. I know that about Rs. 261 lakhs net have been added for education, that means about 4 per cent. I ask you to add 150 lakhs more, which would work out at 6 per cent. of the whole increase of revenues that I am asking to be devoted to education on which everybody is agreed the future salvation of India depends. Is that an excessive proportion? Is that a large sum? Am I to be told the Army wants this, the Railways want that, a third administration wants money, therefore we cannot provide for the prime necessities of education? I ask Hon'ble Members to see what is being done in other countries; people elsewhere are not satisfied with mere talk such as is indulged in here; they have been formulating proposals as to how even primary education should be supplemented by education up to the age of 16 and 18, how extension classes should reach everybody, how even University education should be within the reach of all deserving youths. That is the way they are proceeding about their task in order to equip the people of their countries with facilities to meet the growing competition of the world; to make the men and women worthy of their lives. But what are we doing? We are in an anti-diluvian era, thinking that every proposition is financially unsound, is economically unripe, and that a poor country cannot solve this question. I ask, Sir, that the Council should rise to the height of the occasion and should have this money. I am not asking for doles, I am not asking for provincial autonomy being interfered with, I want restoration of the old policy, that during the transition stage about 2½ per cent. be given out of the increase of revenue during the last five years."

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:**—"Mr. Vice-<sup>1.5 P.M.</sup> President, I heartily support the proposal which has been put before the Council. In doing so I will only add this much that if the Hon'ble the Finance Member cannot find the money in other ways, I should go the length of suggesting that this money should be provided out of the loan which it is proposed to take for the purpose of expenditure on railways, that to that extent the amount to be provided for railways should be reduced and the money should be set apart for education. I venture to think that if we will remember the history of the question of primary education in this Council and the Provinces, my suggestion would not seem to be altogether a wild one. Ordinarily the money needed for primary education should be found from ordinary revenues, but we find that adequate sums are not provided for it out of the ordinary revenue; but the purpose of providing primary education for the people ranks in importance not lower than any other question. And if the Government, after making a strenuous and earnest effort to find the money out of the revenues to an adequate extent for this purpose, find themselves unable to do so, then I say that rather than delay progress by one year, they should borrow the money for one year and provide it for education, partly for non-recurring expenditure in the shape of buildings, partly for the creation of normal schools, and also to meet partly the expenditure of ordinary schools for the year, and then make a strenuous effort in the next year to find the money out of revenue. If they should not be able to do that, then I should say they should go on borrowing for a few years, *i.e.*, until they are able to find the necessary money out of

[*Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya ; Sir James Meston ; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

revenue rather than allow the extension of primary education to be delayed year after year. We have expenditure found for building Delhi, we have money found for increasing military expenditure up to the extent asked for by the military authorities of the day ; we have an immense sum found for expending it on railways. It is time we found sufficient money for education. I know a certain sum has been spent on primary education ; we recognise that a certain amount is being spent on it ; but that amount is not adequate to the needs of the situation, and this question of primary education is of greater importance from every possible point of view than any other question. For these reasons I suggest that the Finance Department should find the money asked for by Mr. Sarma out of revenues by cutting down expenditure in other directions, which I cannot suggest, but which the Department themselves are in a better position to find out ; and if they cannot do so, then they should provide the amount out of borrowed money to the extent that has been suggested. I strongly urge that for the sake of humanity, do not let the progress of education be delayed any longer. The work that has been done is appreciated, but that is very small compared to what is needed, and I ask Government to find the money somehow, either out of revenues, or by borrowing, to push on the progress of this very beneficent reform which lies at the root of all other reforms so far as the welfare of the people is concerned."

1-8 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir James Meston** :—"Sir, the Hon'ble Member has been brief in opening his proposal, and again I shall follow his example. I have indeed very little to add to what I said in reply to the last Resolution. I am still in a state of considerable uncertainty as to the Hon'ble Member's financial intentions. He assures me that he does not want doles, and if the Resolution in the form in which it stands does not mean doles, I am unable to attach any other interpretation to it. The Hon'ble Member said that there was a time when Government was opposed to the principle, I take it the principle of the extension of primary education. I do not remember that time . . ."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—"Compulsory education."

**The Hon'ble Sir James Meston** :—"That is another question. My friend the Hon'ble Pandit Malaviya has advised us that we should borrow this million sterling for the purposes of education. I think it is quite conceivable that in the near future we may have to borrow for capital purposes such as the Hon'ble Pandit mentions, the erection of new buildings, normal schools, training institutions and so on, but I would point out that to borrow £1 million this year is certainly not going to provide the pivot of the system, the trained teacher. If I understand anything about primary education, it is that the whole success in the future depends on the provision of trained teachers, men who are able to come forward and occupy the schools that we build and take over the classes which are now being in many cases somewhat inadequately taught, men who have a thorough appreciation of the science of education and who are prepared to undertake the profession of education in the necessary missionary spirit. So that if my Hon'ble friend with his proposal for Rs. 150 lakhs, could take me with him to a shop where this product is turned out ready-made for immediate use, I should gladly provide the Rs. 150 lakhs. If he would give me 15,000 teachers for Rs. 1,000 each, I should take them and pay the money down ; or even 1,500 teachers at Rs. 10,000 each, I should take them and pay the money down. But I am afraid the product is not available, and so the money could not be spent, and I must oppose the Resolution."

1-11 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—"Just one word, Sir. I listened with some surprise to the last argument that has been advanced by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister. It is an argument that has been advanced for the last ten years, I think, by almost every Finance Minister, both in the Provinces and in the Government of India. When is that

RESOLUTION *RE* EXTENSION AND IMPROVEMENT OF 786  
PRIMARY EDUCATION.

[8TH MARCH, 1919.]

[Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

psychological moment to arrive when the Government is going to start schools and prepare these teachers. Are we to be told year after year that that millenium must arrive, and until that millenium arrives nothing will be done. We are arguing in a vicious circle. What my friend the Hon'ble Pandit Malaviya said was, if the money cannot be spent straightaway in equipping teachers for primary schools, use the money for starting normal schools, for building purposes and for a thousand other purposes, for which, I think, estimates are being prepared during the last ten years in the Education Department. You want crores of rupees in the shape of non-recurring expenditure. You want crores of rupees in the shape of recurring expenditure; and to be told that the Education Department cannot find use for these 150 lakhs is, I think, to be told what it is rather difficult to believe. I think there is not much strength in that part of the argument.

"Then the Hon'ble Member says it is a question of doles really. Of course it will be a question of doles so long as the ancient system of finances as between the Imperial and the Provincial Governments continues. I believe that it has been discarded. But so long as it is in force, the ancient practice of finding something even in the most difficult years for these essential departments, Education, Sanitation, etc., should not be departed from and some money should be found. Precedent is in my favour. Whether you look upon it as a dole or as the Provinces getting back what is recognised to be their own, is not essential, so long as the money is forthcoming. I hope the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, though he may not be able to accept the Resolution, will change his mind and before the 21st find some money for the improvement of this essential branch of Indian administration."

The Resolution was put and the Council divided as follows :—

<i>Ayes—18.</i>	<i>Noes—32.</i>
The Hon'ble Sir Gangadhar Chitnavis.	His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief.
" Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea.	The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill.
" Raja of Mahmudabad.	" Sir Sankaran Nair.
" Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.	" Sir William Vincent.
" Mr. S. Sastri.	" Sir James Meston.
" Mr. R. Ayyangar.	" Sir Thomas Holland.
" Mr. B. N. Sarma.	" Sir Arthur Anderson.
" Mir Asad Ali, Khan Bahadur.	" Mr. W. A. Ironside.
" Mr. V. J. Patol.	" Mr. H. F. Howard.
" Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy.	" Sir James DuBoulay.
" Maharaja Sir Macindra Chandra	" Mr. A. H. Ley.
" Nandi.	" Mr. H. Sharp.
" Rai Krishna Sabay Bahadur.	" Mr. R. A. Mant.
" Khan Bahadur Mian Muhammad	" Major-General Sir Alfred
" Shafi.	" Bingley.
" Khan Zulfikar Ali Khan.	" Sir Godfrey Fell.
" Sardar Sundar Singh.	" Mr. F. C. Rose.
" Mr. G. S. Khaparde.	" Mr. C. H. Kesteven.
" Rai B. D. Shukul Bahadur.	" Mr. D. deS. Bray.
" Mr. K. K. Chanda.	" Lieutenant-Colonel R. E.
	" Holland.
	" Surgeon-General W. R.
	" Edwards.
	" Mr. G. R. Clarke.
	" Mr. P. L. Moore.
	" Sir Dinshaw Wacha.
	" Mr. M. N. Hogg.
	" Mr. T. Emerson.
	" Mr. E. H. C. Walsh.
	" Mr. C. A. Kincaid.
	" Sir John Donald.
	" Mr. P. J. Fagan.
	" Mr. W. J. Reid.
	" W. F. Rice.
	" Mr. J. T. Marten.

The Resolution was therefore negatived.

[At this stage the Council adjourned for Lunch till 2-30 P.M.]

**RESOLUTION RE GRANT TO ASSAM COLLEGE.**

2-33 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda** :—"Sir,—I beg to move the following Resolution :—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the grant to the Assam Government be increased by a non-recurring grant of Rs. 11 lakhs and a recurring grant of Rs. 1 lakh for the Murarichand College at Sylhet.'

"Sir, in the first place I think I owe an explanation to the Council for bringing up an apparently local matter before this Council, so that there may be no prejudice against it on that score. I ought to assure the Council at once that I do not come here over the head of my Government. I am not an appellant against its decision, rather I am in the position of a co-plaintiff with the Local Government against the Government of India. The facts are these :—We had a private second grade college called the Murarichand College established and maintained by the premier zamindar of the district, the late Raja Girishchandra Roy. It was a very efficient and successful institution. Its boys on more than one occasion secured the highest places in the University. During the swadeshi agitation the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam decided to have control of the educational institutions, and negotiations were opened with the proprietor of the college to hand over charge of the college. A part of the contract was that it was to be raised to a fully equipped first grade college. The sanction of the Secretary of State was obtained for it, but in the meantime the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam became defunct, and the Assam Administration was formed, and the Surma Valley districts of Sylhet and Cachar, I may say in passing, in the teeth of our opposition, were attached to Assam. However, it now devolved upon the Assam Government to provincialise the college and it was done while my Hon'ble friend sitting on my right was then Chief Secretary of the Assam Administration. The question of raising its status to the B. A. standard was then taken up. Some time was spent in a dispute regarding the site to be located, and after calling several conferences the Chief Commissioner, Sir Arohdale Earle, visited Sylhet, and after consulting local opinion selected a site, and land was acquired by Government. But then unfortunately the war broke out and all work had to be stopped. But our boys then were in a fix. Although Bengalees, they were strangers in Bengal and could not find admission in Bengal because they were in Assam, and although they were in Assam they were strangers because they were Bengalees and not Assamese and could not find admission in the Assam College at Gauhati, and hundreds of boys were turned out, and the difficulty was to obtain accommodation for them in any college, and parents were not anxious to send them to Calcutta for various reasons and some of them were not able to afford it either.

"In this state of things the Chief Commissioner, Sir Arohdale Earle, visited Sylhet in the cold weather of 1916, and we waited on him in deputation and placed our grievances before him. He fully went into the matter and was satisfied about the justice of our claim. But he observed that owing to the war funds would not be forthcoming for some time. If we agreed to pay a portion of the cost, about half, that would be required for the kutchha buildings to open B. A. classes and part of the cost of the staff for a year, he thought that matters might be expedited, and the local public agreed to these terms, and nine of the leading men of the town gave an agreement in writing to pay the sum of Rs. 18,000 which was estimated by Government. We now thought that the whole thing was all right and that the college would be sanctioned in no time, and we were directed to make our application for affiliation up to B. A. degree of the University. This was done, and I believe the Chief Commissioner addressed the Government of India, but apparently the Government of India was not anxious to pay any heed to it, and the University in its turn informed us that owing to a recent ruling of the Government of India, our application for affiliation was out of time.

[ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ] [ *Mr. Kamini Kumar Thanda.* ]

"During the Budget debate of the Assam Council in March 1916,—I was then a member of the Assam Council,—we mentioned this matter and the Chief Commissioner invited some of us who were interested in the college to meet him. It was then decided that I was to come up to Simla to place our case personally before the Education Member. Accordingly, armed with a letter of authority from the Chief Commissioner, I came in April 1916 and interviewed my Hon'ble friend Sir Sankaran Nair and Sir Edward MacLagan. I believe my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sharp was then away to Kashmir. I gratefully acknowledge that both my Hon'ble friend Sir Sankaran Nair and Sir Edward MacLagan were pleased to take a favourable view of the application, and removed the bar which stood in the way of the University to consider our application for affiliation. With that decision I went down to Calcutta, and approached the Syndicate. They then granted affiliation of the B. A. classes in Pass, and the classes were opened in kutchra buildings for which we paid the cost. In a short time the enrolment was exceeded by more than double of what was estimated, and the result of the University Examination was more than gratifying. We now found that the college was flooded by hundreds of boys, but we had no accommodation and the staff was insufficient, and the affiliation was inadequate being confined to a Pass. We, therefore, approached the Government to place the college on a proper footing in accordance with the undertaking that was given to us, and the Assam Government pressed the matter to the notice of the Government of India. But the Government of India was unmoved and raised all sorts of difficulties. They objected to the site selected by the Chief Commissioner himself. They objected to give more money, and the University refused to grant affiliation in Honours until the defects were removed, until all the conditions were fulfilled, and I do not think that the University could do anything else. I am sure I could not support the application under the circumstances from my place in the Senate. So the college was confined to Pass course, and classes were held in kutchra buildings and the staff remained inadequate. After that we had to accept the suggestion of the Government of India and abandon the old site and selected a new site. But where is the money to come from? The Hon'ble Sir James Meeson told us yesterday that the Assam Government had 34 lakhs at its disposal, but the Assam Government cannot pay for a single project out of this sum. Nor can it finance a first grade college without a grant from the Government. I, therefore, appeal to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister to give us this money. We have done everything we had to do. Every condition that had to be fulfilled by us has been fulfilled, and it is the Government of India which has to fulfil its part. I am sure if it was a private party we could sue him for a breach of contract, but of course we cannot sue the Government of India for breach of faith. Apart from this you took the college from us on the understanding that you would maintain a fully equipped first grade college to teach up to the B. A. standard. You took Rs. 18,000 from us on the understanding that after a year the college would be placed on a permanent footing. We have selected the site which you insisted on, and what more can we do? You must give us the money now. Apart from any breach of contract, there is a moral duty which the Government owes to Assam as we have been separated from Bengal. When we were attached to Assam we protested, but then we were told that we would be granted all these things in Assam. When we waited in deputation on the Chief Secretary to the Government of Eastern Bengal, Mr. P. O. Lyon, he told me 'why do you wish to be in Bengal: in Bengal you will be the tail end. But you will be the premier district in Assam.' Where are we now?

"I must therefore ask you, Sir, to let us have the money to place the college on a permanent footing. I have reasons to believe that my official colleagues sitting on my right will, if appealed to, support my case. It may be he may not support every remark I make against the Government, but I am sure so far as the prayer for the college is concerned, he will give it his support, and I trust the Council will be pleased to accept this Resolution."

[ Mr. Reid; Sir James Meston; Mr. Kamini [8TH MARCH, 1919.]  
Kumar Chanda.]

2 45 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Reid:**—" Sir, as the Commissioner of the Division in which the college is situated, my sympathies are entirely with the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda. But when he says that he appears as a co-plaintiff for the Government of Assam I do not think I can support him. I have no instructions on the subject from my Chief Commissioner. I do not know that he would consider this project as the one most immediately necessary for Assam. I am quite sure that if he were offered any additional grant whatsoever for any purpose whatsoever he would gladly accept it. That, however, is a different matter.

" The Hon'ble Mr. Chanda has stated the case on the whole accurately, although I cannot endorse a few of his remarks. It is, perhaps, not quite relevant to the discussion, but it is not in accordance with facts to say that the districts of Sylhet and Cachar were taken away from Bengal in 1912. These districts have formed part of the Chief Commissionership of Assam since its creation. During the brief period that the province of Eastern Bengal and Assam was in existence, they formed part of that Province, and in 1912 they came back to Assam.

" Then the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda says that he has a grievance against Government for breach of contract. At first I was not sure whether it was against the Local Government or the Government of India that he had a grievance for breach of contract. He has now made it clear that his grievance was against the more august body. I am not sufficiently familiar with the negotiations that took place when the Murarichand College at Sylhet was handed over to Government to state the precise terms of the agreement. One material fact is a comparison of the number of students at that time with the number of students at the present time. It has increased manifold. In so far as Mr. Chanda argues that the college is an urgent need of the Surma Valley, in so far as he says that there is not enough accommodation for the young men who wish to go to college, in so far as he says that they are not welcome in Gauhati, he is perfectly correct. But whether on these facts a claim can be made for what is apparently the whole of the initial and recurring expenditure on account of this college, is a matter which it is not for me to decide."

2 48 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir James Meston:**—" Sir, I am not a sufficient lawyer to say whether the withdrawal of a co-plaintiff in a suit means that the suit falls to the ground. Probably it does not, and unfortunately I could not catch a good many of the arguments that were placed with fluency and eloquence before us by the original plaintiff. The Hon'ble Mover, however, has probably achieved his purpose in demonstrating to the world his affection and enthusiasm for this scheme, and personally I am quite prepared to accept his statement of the merits of the Murarichand College, supported as it has been by the Hon'ble Mr. Reid. On the Resolution, Sir, I am afraid there is nothing for me to do except to offer my unfortunate usual opposition. I find that a very short time ago when the scheme was officially before the Government in the Education Department, the local administration was told that the expenditure would fall on the Provincial revenues. That is still the situation, and it is not in my power, especially as there has been no suggestion to that effect from the Local Government, to impose doles upon them for the purpose. I must, therefore, oppose the Resolution."

2 50 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda:**—" Sir, after the decision of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister I do not think it is very useful to go on with the discussion and take up the time of the Council. I think, therefore, I must withdraw this Resolution."

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT 769  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.

[8TH MARCH, 1919.] [Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

**RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOT-  
MENT FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDA-  
TIONS OF THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.**

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma :—**"Sir, I beg to 8-51 P.M.  
move the next Resolution that stands in my name :—

'That this Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the allotment '26 B.—Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments' be increased by Rs. 50 lakhs for carrying out the recommendations of the Industrial Commission.'

"We had a very sympathetic reply yesterday to some remarks which fell from Hon'ble Members on this question during the last stage of the debate. The question, therefore, stands thus, that the Finance Minister will be pleased to consider during the course of the year favourably any need that there may be felt for giving effect to the recommendations of the Industrial Commission. The objection to any grant at the present moment seems to be that the recommendations of the Industrial Commission have not been finally approved by the Government in any practicable form, and therefore for Budget purposes, it is a trifle premature to allot any funds. Sir, I respectfully submit that reasons, and very cogent reasons, may be urged for a way out of the situation which has been presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Member. Now, it is absolutely necessary to waste the time of the Council in urging the imperative importance of giving immediate effect to the recommendations of the Industrial Commission. We are not at the stage now to discuss the merits of definite proposals, but, I think, everybody is agreed that we must set in practical motion the machinery for enabling the industrial advancement to keep pace with the times without any appreciable or undue delay. Now the real point is as to whether amongst these various recommendations of the Industrial Commission involving an expenditure of 25 lakhs of rupees (Rs. 24,63,000) Imperial and about Rs. 98 lakhs Provincial, or an aggregate recurring expenditure of 128 lakhs, there are not schemes to which effect can be given as having been universally consented to, immediately and during the course of this year. Besides items of recurring expenditure the Committee recommended the expenditure of 150 lakhs of rupees on certain schemes towards the capital expenditure that may be involved, and another 66 lakhs was foreshadowed as being possible expenditure on schemes that may be approved. Now the point is as to whether, amongst these numerous objects, the Government of India cannot find some objects at least which are universally acknowledged to be the right objects upon which immediate attention should be riveted and to which money should be devoted. Of course, there may be differences amongst Provincial Governments as to whether the control by the Imperial Government should be rigorous or should be merely of an advisory character, as to whether greater latitude should be given to the Provinces in the development of their own industries, or the whole should be controlled by an Imperial Department. On this there may be some difference of opinion, but even that, I submit, should be settled during the course of the year and before long. I think we have had this wrangle for the last 30 years, really. I have been reading this literature on industrial development for the last 30 years, and have seen the Resolution of the Government of India expressing its hearty sympathy with the objects and proposing schemes and asking that something should be done. The time has now come when practical effect should be given to the schemes and we should not any longer delay. I need hardly allude to what is going on in other countries, and the practical effect which is being given and which was given even during the course of the war to various schemes of national importance. Therefore, Sir, I submit that provision should be made to some extent because we are sure to have some Imperial Department. What the relations of that Department to the local department may be is another matter, and there will be some subjects within the control of that Department,

[Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Sir Fazulbhoy] [5TH MARCH, 1919.]  
Currimbhoy.

Similarly, with regard to non-recurring expenditure we shall hope to construct technological schools, etc., and money could be employed on them. Therefore, I do not think, any valid reason can be urged in favour of a policy of *laissez faire*, the policy of doing nothing during the current year on the ground that Local Governments are not ready with the formulation of their proposals. I do not think I need say more. Local Governments I know are being given a fair impetus by the special officer appointed by the Government of India. I think we must thank the Government for the manner in which they are trying to meet the solution of this question, but I submit the proposals must be given some shape during the course of the year, and I think some expenditure must be allotted during the course of the year in order to throw the onus of proving that the machinery cannot be set on foot upon the Government of India and the Local Governments. I put it as a secondary reason. The first reason, I urge, is that amongst these new schemes there are various schemes which are ready and ripe for expenditure. I put it as a secondary ground that the need of proving that the money cannot be spent should be upon the Imperial and the Provincial Governments. I think that will give a greater impetus to the carrying out of proposals all of us have at heart than merely saying, 'if the Department ask, we will give it.' The Department may not ask out of courtesy to the Government of India, or out of courtesy to the Provincial Government. I think the whip hand must be taken with more vigour. There are such things as lapses in Provincial expenditure and Imperial expenditure, and I do not think therefore, we need be so very sorry after all if there be any lapse of money provided for this purpose, and there will not be much in any case because the money I am asking for is so infinitesimally small in amount when compared with the needs and the proposals of the departments. I have only to say that the expenditure during the last five years under Imperial has grown by three lakhs only, from 39.43 to 42.21 Imperial, and the total expenditure has grown only by 33 lakhs, 98 being the expenditure as against 60. Surely that is a very small item having regard to the needs of the subject. I therefore, submit that the Finance Member will kindly see his way not to oppose this Resolution."

2-59 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy:**—"Sir, I am in entire sympathy with the object my friend has in view. I must say that for the last two or three years the Government have been very active with regard to the promoting of industries in the country. An Industrial Commission was appointed, and I had the honour to be one of the members, and we submitted our report last November. The Government were very anxious that we should make our report earlier, but unfortunately we were unable to do so owing to certain reasons. But the Government as soon as they got the report, have specially appointed, as my friend said, an officer, Mr. Low, who has been travelling in every Province and taking the opinions of the different Governments. If my friend Mr. Sarma had carefully read the report of the Commission he would have seen that there are many matters on which the Government of India have to consult the Local Governments, such as how they divide the different departments of industry, and whether an Imperial department of Industry is to be established. These are questions which the Government of India cannot undertake unless they consult the Local Governments. Sir, the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma also mentioned that there were institutions such as technological colleges which should be established, but that also is a question on which the Government of India must consult local opinion. He has himself admitted that the Hon'ble the Finance Member in reply to the Budget speeches made here has distinctly told us that he will be able to give the money if it is wanted by the Member for Commerce. I think under these circumstances when the Government are alive to the situation, he should withdraw this Resolution. I can assure the Hon'ble Member that the Government are very keen and they will do as much as they can in

791

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.

[ 5TH MARCH, 1919. ]      [ *Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy; Mr. Malcolm Hogg; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.* ]

the way of adopting the recommendations of the Commission. With these few words, I will ask my friend to withdraw his Resolution."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Malcolm Hogg** :—" Sir, I do not think it is 3 P.M. necessary for me to say more than a sentence or two on this Resolution. My real difficulty is in understanding exactly what is in the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma's mind. Does he think that the Hon'ble Member for Commerce and Industry has been unable to prevail upon the hard heart of the Hon'ble the Finance Member to give him the funds he requires; or does he think that the Hon'ble Member for Commerce and Industry, who was himself the President of the Industries Commission, has been so lacking in energy and enthusiasm as not to have asked for necessary funds? One or other of these hypotheses is necessary for the support of this Resolution. I find equal difficulty in accepting either."

**The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya** :—" Sir, 3-1 P.M. I am quite prepared to answer my Hon'ble friend Mr. Hogg's question. The Hon'ble Mr. Sarma's Resolution does not imply any reflection on the Hon'ble Member for Commerce and Industry on the score of want of a desire to push forward the recommendations of the Commission. Nor does it imply any insinuation of unwillingness on the part of Government to recognise the need of expenditure in that direction. The Hon'ble Mr. Sarma has himself referred to what the Hon'ble the Finance Member said yesterday and appreciated the fact that the Government has said that when the schemes have matured the Finance Department will find money for them. But I agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma that there is a need for providing a large amount in the Budget for the purpose for which he asks for it, and I will give my reasons for it. No doubt the Local Governments have to be consulted about various important proposals which have been made by the Commission; but there are certain proposals about which we might presume that there is an agreement in principle between the Provincial Governments and the Government of India, and provision for carrying out those proposals requires a very large amount to be set aside. I will draw attention here to only a few of these important recommendations. For instance, there are to be two Departments of Industries, an Imperial and a Provincial Department. The Imperial Department is to cost 24 lakhs, and the Provincial Departments are to cost 98 lakhs. Now, let us assume for a moment that there is a difference of opinion—as no doubt there is—about the creation of an Imperial Department of Industries; but about the need of a Provincial Department of Industries there can be no difference. Both the Provincial Governments and the Government of India are likely to agree that a Department of Industries must be established in the Provinces: Departments of Industries already exist in most Provinces, and a development in that direction is bound to take place.

"Then let us take a few other items. Among the schemes recommended for capital expenditure you will find a proposal for providing industrial schools, and the amount of 55 lakhs is recommended for this purpose. Take again, technological institutes. A tabular statement in the Report shows the amount which the Commission think ought to be provided in each Province for technological institutes, *viz.*—

	Lakhs.
Bombay . . . . .	5
Bengal . . . . .	10
United Provinces . . . . .	6
Madras . . . . .	5
Bihar and Orissa . . . . .	13
Burma . . . . .	8

making a total of 47 lakhs for technological institutes. There is likely to be very little difference of opinion about the need of these institutes; the Provincial Governments and the Government of India are not likely to disagree about it.

792 RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.

[*Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Sir Thomas Holland.*] [8TH MARCH, 1919.]

"Then let us take the training of mechanical engineers, upon which the Commission has laid very great stress. For the technical training of mechanical engineers this Report recommends 10 schools at a capital charge of 40 lakhs. Now confining ourselves to these few items alone, the technical training of mechanical engineers, the technological institutes, and the industrial schools, all this is expenditure which has to be incurred in the Provinces, and it seems to me that making a very large and liberal allowance for differences of opinion between Provincial Governments and the Government of India, regarding the rate of expenditure recommended or the extent of the undertakings to be started, we may clearly say that a crore will not be a pie too much to be set aside to carry out the recommendations of the Industries Commission, about which there will be general agreement. It is important that this provision should be made. The general promise made by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister that when the schemes mature he will find money for them is not sufficient in a case like this. The need for expenditure is great and insistent, and we have lost much precious time. We should not lose any more time. We should therefore urge upon the Hon'ble the Finance Member and the Government of India to make a clear provision of at least a crore of rupees for expenditure on those items among the recommendations of the Industries Commission about which we may fairly expect to be in general agreement. If such provision is made, it will be recognised that there is a determination to push things on and that things shall be pushed on. If it is left merely to the general contingency of the recommendations maturing and money being then found for them, I apprehend with all respect to the Hon'ble the Finance Member, that satisfactory progress will not be made this year. We should note what Japan has done and is doing. During the years of the War Japan has stolen a march over us. Last year the value of Japanese imports into this country amounted to 52 crores. The United States of America also have been pouring in their imports into our country. It was high time that India also moved forward in the right direction. There are numerous schemes waiting to be taken up. Those schemes will bring money not only to the people, but also to the Government, but unless you provide money for encouraging private effort, and unless you tell Local Governments that you are ready to help them in pushing those schemes, you will lose another year which will be very greatly injurious to the cause of industrial development. I therefore urge with all the emphasis that I can command that the Resolution, which asks only for a modest sum, a sum which is not at all adequate to the needs of the situation, ought to be accepted and that the Government should provide the sum in the Budget."

2-8 P. 2. **The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland:**—"Sir, it is possible that Hon'ble Members may regard my action in recommending the rejection of this Resolution as not wholly consistent with my position as President of the Industrial Commission. Nevertheless, reconciliation of my two points of view does not necessitate the linguistic dexterity with which my Hon'ble friends, Messrs. Ironside and Hogg, during the debate on the Excess Profits Tax, advocated the interests of their constituents against their own personal convictions.

"Being one of the authors of the recommendations which the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma presses on the attention of Government, my parental instincts naturally respond sympathetically to the spirit of the Resolution. But I am none the less anxious for our offspring to reach the light under favourable and healthy conditions of birth; and I am consequently constrained to oppose any action that might result in premature parturition. It is for this reason, and this reason only, that the Government think it would be unnecessary, and even unwise, to make a separate allotment, of the dimensions suggested, for expenditure during the coming financial year.

"The Hon'ble Sir James Meston told the Council yesterday that Government had been by no means dilatory in dealing with the recommendations of

RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT 793  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.

[ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ] [ *Sir Thomas Holland.* ]

the Commission. The Report did not reach the Government of India until late in October. It was placed under analysis in all Departments at once; and early in December, the Government of India had referred to the Local Governments the issues which concerned them, whilst their views on the questions that affect the Central Government were forwarded at once to the Secretary of State. So much for the steps taken by the Government of India to deal with those recommendations of the Commission that affect them.

" Now if the Hon'ble Mover will read the report once more, he will realise that the majority of our recommendations bear on questions for which Local Governments are responsible; for in spite of impressions that seem to have gained currency, our intention was to show that—to use a loose phrase that has lately got into general use—industries form essentially a provincial subject. Not only do most of our recommendations deal with questions about which Local Governments must take the initiative, but many of the small remainder deal with matters about which Local Governments must be consulted before the Government of India can reach the stage of spending large sums of money with economic advantage.

" Those who support this Resolution also forget that, whilst there is no special allotment, distinctly marked as such, for the objects of the Industrial Commission, many of the proposals that we have made or supported are being taken up already under other heads. They are scattered throughout the Budget according to the old classification of heads.

" I will draw your attention to one or two illustrations only. The Commission drew attention to the importance of the tanning industry and the necessity of investigating natural tanstuffs. In November last, Government secured the services of a distinguished expert for one year in order to survey the situation, and to advise us as to whether, and in what ways, our amateur efforts required reform.

" The industry, as you know, made great progress during the war, and some 600 tanneries, working on rigidly uniform lines and with fixed prices, turned out Army leather in a way which earned the warm commendation and thanks of the War Office. I was only too anxious to secure this industry as a permanent source of wealth, and what is equally important to preserve the standard of quality which had been attained under conditions of education that cannot be imitated by any University.

" To supplement the work of the tanner, and to give him the advantage of the raw materials now lying idle in our jungles, research work was carried out on a commercial scale, and our results are now being published in a convenient form for the use of the trade.

" Last summer we had some anxiety about the supply of Army boots; and, after inquiry at home, the India Office secured the services of Sir Henry Ledgard, who consented to come out without remuneration to help us in the organisation of this industry. Before Sir Henry arrived, the war was over; but he has now consented to remain for a year without salary in order to give us the benefit of the lessons learnt about Army boots at home, and to advise manufacturers as to how their methods might be improved to meet that demand for European boots which seems to increase as one of the visible signs of modern education. I should like to take this opportunity of expressing the Government's appreciation of Sir Henry Ledgard's public spirited action, which is really due to the spirit which dominates many healthy and successful men—an irresistible desire to see a job done well.

" My Hon'ble Colleague in charge of Revenue and Agriculture worries me at intervals regarding his proposals for extending the research facilities, and his plans for training Indian forest officers, at Dehra Dun. He will tell the Council later what is being done to utilise forest products for industries. Satisfactory results are being obtained in our efforts to extend the use of Indian timbers, large quantities of which have been sent to Egypt, Salonika, Palestine and Mesopotamia.

791 RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.

[ *Sir Thomas Holland.* ] [ 5TH MARCH, 1919. ]

"A special survey of the coal situation has been arranged and Mr. Trehearne Kees has been selected by the Institution of Mining Engineers to advise Government as to the necessity of improving our methods of mining and using coal, in order that our limited resources in mineral fuel may be more economically turned to advantage. This is the Government reply to our demand for inquiry into the causes of waste :

' Experimental work has been in progress for some time at the Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore, in order to test the possibilities of turning our waste and cheaper forms of wood to account by destructive distillation and the recovery of by-products. The results obtained at Bangalore are now under consideration of the Madras Government and the Mysore Durbar, both of whom may find it possible to turn the laboratory results to commercial account.'

"In dealing with the fuel question, the Commission drew attention to the fact that water-power in India might be turned to account for industrial purposes, and have recommended a survey of our resources. Based on the recommendations made on this question in our Report, the Government have appointed two Engineers to make a preliminary survey with a view of locating the most promising power-sites for detailed investigation. This work is now in progress.

"I will not weary the Council with further illustrations of Government activity in the directions recommended by the Commission, but I ought to draw your attention to the fact that some of the proposals made by the Commission require further examination by specialist Committees before it is possible to take any line of action with safety; for example, we have recommended Committees to investigate the possibility of establishing scientific services, for the development of industrial banks and for the institution of a system of purchasing Government stores in India.

"This last question of the purchase of stores, I regard as the most important of the measures by which Government can assist local industries in a healthy way, and in order that we may not lose the benefit of the organisation created under war conditions by the Munitions Board, we are preserving, in a modified form, an agency for the purchase of stores for the Army and for those civil departments that find it convenient to obtain their materials through a central organisation. This Branch of the Munitions Board scrutinises all indents submitted for transmission to the India Office; it removes all items that certainly can be met with safety in this country, and gives advice to indenting officers as to the sources in India from which they are able to purchase their own stores.

"With regard to the activities of Local Governments, I am only partially informed; but I receive frequent communications from some Governments with requests for advice and help in the organization of their Provincial Departments of Industries. The chief difficulty with them, and with us, is that of obtaining suitable officers to organise the work.

"My Hon'ble friend and former colleague, Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya, gave illustrations of questions about which he thought action could be taken at once, as they are questions about which there is little difference of opinion. As illustrations, I think he referred to the formation of Provincial technological institutions. Judging by the experience of the past, there are few subjects about which differences of opinion have caused greater delay in action. For many years before I left India, discussions were in progress regarding the development of the Engineering College at Sibpur, the institution of a Mining School on the coal-fields and the development of a central technological institute in Calcutta. These questions, which are interrelated, appear to be no nearer solution now than they were ten years ago.

"In 1907, my Hon'ble friend shared with me the work of a Conference at Naini Tal, when we recommended to Government the establishment of a technological institute at Cawnpore. This question has been under discussion

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT 795  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION.

[5TH MARCH, 1919.]

[*Sir Thomas Holland; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*]

ever since and has been attacked by three successive heads of the Local Government without final result or action of immediate value to the industries in that district.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Sarma suggests that they might at any rate start the buildings that will be required, as buildings, in any case, will be wanted. This pre-supposes unanimity of opinion regarding location, dimensions and the government of the institutions projected. It is obviously useless to gallop unless your horse's head is in the right direction !

"Under the circumstances which I have described, I cannot recommend the acceptance of the Resolution in its present form, not because I do not sympathise with its object, but because until we have drawn our plans to fit the rest of the Government machinery, we cannot economically spend more money than has been already provided under various heads. The Hon'ble Mover will remember that my Hon'ble colleague, Sir James Meston offered yesterday to find the money necessary for schemes that may attain reasonable maturity during the coming financial year. Possibly, after this explanation, the Hon'ble Mover may not now think it necessary to press his Resolution in its present form."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, I shall profit by the advice that has been very kindly given me by the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland and the Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj. I can assure them that I have read the report with some care, but I promise to do so with greater care. I realise the interdependence of the various recommendations of the Industrial Commission's report, and that is why I have not pressed for larger provision being made in the current year which I would have done, having regard to the importance of the subject, though I know what the fate of such a Resolution would have been. But I know something of the difficulties of Government machinery. I recollect very well when I was Chairman of a Municipality that I could not carry out the construction of a drain for three years, though the matter had been under consideration for five or six years previously, owing to some technical difficulty or another. I fully realise the difficulties of Government departments getting through their work, but the needs of the hour are very urgent, and I hope technical considerations and delicacy and the fear of wounding the susceptibilities of Provincial departments will not continue to keep us in the same position in which we have been for the past 80 years. Sir Thomas Holland has told us what has been done by the Government; we are extremely interested in this and very thankful, but if he analyses his argument he will find that he has given me a very good reason for proceeding with my Resolution. He tells us that, notwithstanding the fact that no final conclusions have been arrived at by the Government of India in regard to the various recommendations of the Industrial Commission, the Government have started various inquiries and that the department has done a thousand other things in the way of carrying out the recommendations made. I do not say that the whole thing should be done at once. What I have said is that you should not wait till the whole scheme has been scrutinised. What I suggested was that something should be done now; that something should be begun during the gestation period; otherwise it is very probable that the gestation will be unduly prolonged, and there may be some doubt as to the parentage. I hope, therefore, that Sir Thomas Holland will not leave India before he pushes this scheme through. Here is a subject, industrial education, statement II at page 227. I do not go through the details, because I do not wish to take up more time; the Provinces surely have some knowledge of this, the machinery is there; why not provide funds for it, whether a department is a department to be divided horizontally or vertically, whether it is to be Imperial or Provincial, should not interfere with providing for a department about which there can be no doubt, My position is that something must be done this year. Is

3-20 P.M.

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF BUDGET ALLOTMENT  
FOR CARRYING OUT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF  
THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION; FINANCIAL STATE-  
MENT, 1919-20.

[ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Sir Claude Hill.* ] [ *SUN MARCH, 1919.* ]

that a sound proposition or an unsound proposition? Could not ways and means be found to spend usefully another 50 lakhs during 1919-20? That is a fair proposition. If the Government say that our machinery has been such that we cannot spend these 50 lakhs usefully, I must accept the inevitable, but I submit respectfully that it cannot be so, and that at least 50 lakhs should be found. There are some portions of the scheme which do not depend on the exact relations of the Government of India and Provincial Governments. However, let us not rely on technicalities, and say 'this is not the business of the Government of India, or that is not the opinion of the Provincial Government.' I submit respectfully that my Resolution should be accepted."

The motion was put and negatived.

FINANCIAL STATEMENT, 1919-20.

THIRD STAGE.

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill:**—"Sir, I now beg to open the third stage of the discussion on and to introduce the following heads of the Financial Statement:—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Land Revenue.	Land Revenue.
Provincial Rates.	Provincial Rates.
Forest.	Forest.
Agriculture.	Agriculture.
Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments.	Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments.
Irrigation.	Famine Relief.
Civil Works.	Protective Works, Irrigation.
	Irrigation.
	Civil Works.
	Capital outlay on Irrigation.

"In dealing with these heads I think it would be convenient if I advert to some of the observations which have been made in the earlier stages of the discussion of the Budget in reference to matters with which my departments are concerned. I turn in the first place to the observations which fell from my Hon'ble friend Mr. Shukul. My Hon'ble friend has given his annual personation of Mrs. Gummidge on behalf of the ryots and has stated that he is 'a poor lone creature'. I am bound to admit that on the present occasion there is considerable justification for his attitude of persistent gloom, but I venture to think that, before I conclude, I shall show the Council that there is good reason for believing that there is a bright lining to the cloud that undoubtedly hangs over India from the point of view of agriculture at the present time, and that there is no necessity for the excessively gloomy attitude which my Hon'ble friend has taken up. My Hon'ble friend went on to assert that the Government of India were doing nothing to assist and promote agriculture, and he proceeded further to fortify his statement by a quotation from the reminiscences of Sir O'Moore Creagh, from which he inferred that instead of endeavouring to improve the principles of land revenue administration in this country, the Government of India were purely concerned with the collection of revenue. Well, Sir, Sir O'Moore Creagh was a distinguished soldier and in regard to matters pertaining to the army, I have no doubt that his criticisms in his reminiscences will receive that consideration to which they are entitled. But

[ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

[ *Sir Claude Hill.* ]

I should like to put up one personal petition to this Council in this connection. We all know the proverb, or rather the quotation, about Satan and idle hands. My hands will be idle next year when I take my pension, and it is possible that I may be susceptible to temptations. I may be tempted to write my own reminiscences, though I hope I shall not. I may even be tempted in the course of those reminiscences to give expression to views regarding my friend His Excellency Sir Charles Monro's conduct of the administration of Army headquarters and of the Government of India in the Army Department. Should I be so rash, then at least I would beg any of my friends who are at present Members of this Council and who may then be Members of this Council to have sufficient regard for me as to refrain from quoting me in this Council.

" Now, Sir, in regard to the actual condition of affairs in India, it is quite true that we have been faced with a very bad year and that it has been a very anxious time, and the questions which have been asked in this Council have shown how keenly Hon'ble Members have appreciated the anxieties of the situation. I laid on the table of this Council on the 19th February a full statement of the situation so far as we know it and of the remedial action taken by the Government of India to meet the situation. From the purely financial standpoint, with which we are chiefly concerned for the moment, I should like to point out in what a very advantageous position we are as compared with corresponding calamities on previous occasions. Although the failure of the monsoon has been perhaps more widespread than on any previous occasion, certainly since 1899-1900, the actual situation as disclosed by the numbers on relief works at present contrasts in the most startling and favourable manner with the situation in 1900. On the week ending the 3rd of March 1900 there were on relief or test works 4,400,000 people. There were on the week ending on the 1st of March of this year on relief or test works 120,000 people. Now, I suggest, Sir, that those are facts from which we cannot get away and that we are not entitled to take the gloomy view which has been suggested by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Shukul in regard to the relative economic position of India, in regard to the relative prosperity of the ryots, and in regard to the relative capacity of those ryots to withstand the difficulties of the situation. I have said that the failure of the monsoon is at least as widespread as in the year 1900; and yet we have this startling contrast in the numbers of the people whose condition has compelled them to resort to relief.

" But, Sir, while in regard to direct famine expenditure there will be comparatively little cost as compared with past occasions, the indirect cost will this year be very heavy. An aggregate sum of Rs. 2,18,94,000 has been allotted to Takavi grants, while considerable remissions and suspensions of land-revenue are anticipated.

" The next subject to which I should like to turn to is that of agricultural education, and I am very glad, as evidenced by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma's question, that the subject continues to retain the interest of this Council, because I have dealt at such length in the past with the matter that I have almost feared to weary the Council with my iteration of the anxiety of Government to develop agricultural education to the highest possible degree. Last year I described what had been done towards stimulating action in the Provinces and towards the establishment, in accordance with the recommendations of the Board of Agriculture, and of the Agricultural Educational Conference, of Agricultural Middle Schools. I am glad to be able to say, as has already been made known in the statement which I laid on the table in response to Mr. Sarma's question, that nearly every Province but one in India has now taken steps to initiate agricultural middle schools. This step has been largely rendered possible by the grant which Sir William Meyer was enabled to make last year of 30 lakhs for technical and agricultural education. Of that sum, I am glad to say I was able to snatch as much as 21 lakhs, a much larger portion than my fair share, from my Hon'ble colleague Sir Sankaran Nair, who did not happen to be quite ready when the flag fell; and these 21 lakhs were supplemented by a sum of Rs. 1,80,000 available from the wheat profits. It will be seen from the statement that we have succeeded

[ *Sir Claude Hill.* ]

[ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

in spending that,—I think my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma will agree,—in a very useful manner, by distribution to the Provinces for the establishment of institutions for tuition in agriculture. I should like to explain, since it is relevant to a good many of the arguments which we have heard here to-day in connection with other grants, that the reason why we were able to usefully spend that and why we did not come within the category of the objections to doles which obtain in ordinary times, was that for the previous three years, thanks to the energy of the Agricultural Adviser, Mr. Mackenna and his Department, we had been maturing schemes deliberately, in consultation with Local Governments, with a view to being ready to meet any windfalls that might occur. This year, unfortunately, I shall not be able to establish such a preponderating claim, and I am afraid my Hon'ble colleague Sir Sankaran Nair has put in a demand for half. Only 15 lakhs will be available, but I can assure the Council that it will be spent to the very great advantage of agricultural education.

“Last year I referred, at some length, I am afraid, to what we had in view in constituting the Indian Cotton Committee. That Cotton Committee sat through the cold weather of 1917-18 and got through its work very quickly. We had every hope, in May 1918, that we should get the Report published about June last. But we very unwisely, I am sorry to say, permitted two of the members of the Indian Cotton Committee to proceed Home in anticipation of their signing the Report, since they had agreed to all the important items in it. When the Report was despatched Home for their signature they developed points of difference in regard to minor matters which compelled us to withhold the Report, and the result is that we were not able to get those small points of difference settled until one of them returned again to India. I earnestly hope that we shall be able to make the Report available to the public very soon, and I may say at once that, although it will have in the ordinary course to be referred to Local Governments on many points for consultation, there are one or two main points in regard to which I hope that we shall be able to take action immediately the Report is published.

“The newspapers have referred, one or two of them, to the admirable opportunity which presents itself to my Hon'ble colleague Sir James Meston and myself for spending large sums of money on the development and improvement of agriculture.

“I need only say in regard to that suggestion that I am quite confident that Sir James Meston will do precisely what his distinguished predecessor Sir William Meyer did, and that is to support, and, if possible, to find the money for, any schemes which I am able to demonstrate to him are justified on their intrinsic merits. I have never found the Finance Department refusing any schemes that we could justify on those grounds, and I am perfectly certain that attitude will be continued. But it is quite likely that the resources upon which Sir James Meston can count may sometimes be inadequate, because, as I think Hon'ble Members know, having been engaged during the last three years in evolving schemes of development throughout India, both Imperial and Provincial, we shall be submitting very shortly, or rather we have submitted in some cases, and shall hope to be getting sanction very shortly for, some very large measures of development costing very large sums of money indeed, and it will thus be a problem as to how far and how rapidly the finances of India will permit those schemes to develop. The progress of agricultural development in India has of course been, and still is, enormously handicapped by the relative shortage in India of the requisite number of research officers. We have now, including the provinces, between 30 and 40 scientific research officers in agriculture in India, and this of course compares lamentably with the number, for instance, in the United States. That is one of the prime factors which we hope to place on a better footing by our proposed development.

“The next important matter which I hope to take up and which I hope will form the subject of investigation in the ensuing year is sugar; and I hope a Sugar Committee will be appointed to investigate in particular the commercial

[ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

[ *Sir Claude Hill.* ]

side of the development of the industry. I have already told the Council on previous occasions what has been done by Dr. Barber of Coimbatore on the scientific side, and the enormous amount of material which we have accumulated there for scientific guidance in regard to the botanical side of the sugarcane problem; and it is now chiefly the industrial side which we want to investigate with a view to co-operation in the general scheme of industrial development, which, under theegis of Sir Thomas Holland's Report, we hope to further in the near future.

"Then I ought to refer for a moment to Mr. Lefroy's silk report which I mentioned last year. It has recently been published and we are now asking for the appointment of the special officer, recommended in the report, to make research into the disease of pebrine and other diseases connected with silkworms, and we hope to get him to work very shortly, without waiting for the development of the other measures with regard to the silk industry, which Mr. Lefroy advocated.

"The conditions of the monsoon of 1917 were so widely different from those of 1918, and as a result of abundant rain there was so much water, throughout the country that it developed to a very serious extent—an extent which greatly alarmed His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief—the disease known as Surra; and we have taken steps to appoint a Standing Committee in Surra, and that Standing Committee is to direct investigations as to the best method of research and the application of preventive measures, and it is hoped that that Committee will see its way eventually to make recommendations which may have far-reaching effects on this devastating disease.

"I now turn for a moment to forest matters. The war, as I explained last year has, during the past four years, by depriving us of many of our forest officers, slowed down the rate of progress which we hoped to show in the matter of forest development, but, in spite of this handicap, the United Provinces and the Punjab have made large strides in advance in the matter of industrialising some kinds of their forest produce, notably resin; and we are now, as I think Sir Thomas Holland adumbrated just now, taking steps for the selection and appointment of a wood technologist to be attached to the Dehra Dun Research Institute, whose business will be to investigate thoroughly the properties of Indian timbers with a view to placing them on the market in India, thus to utilise for indigenous forests instead of importing timber from abroad. The United Provinces Government have established, in pursuance of their desire to push forest produce as far as possible, a utilization branch in charge of a special conservator. Another matter to which I have referred before, and which I think Hon'ble Members were interested in, is the appointment of forest engineers. A large number of these officers will, we hope, be appointed during the ensuing year, and as soon as suitable officers can be found, there will be a forest engineer or engineers in nearly every Province in India.

"The only other matter connected with forests which I wish to mention is the lac industry, the value of which is perhaps greater than is generally supposed. It amounts to £1½ million a year. With a view to develop that if possible and place it on a sound footing the Board of Forestry, which is to sit in Dehra Dun next month, is going to consider the whole matter in consultation with experts, manufacturers and others, and I hope the result may be that the lac industry will be developed to a very considerable extent.

"I will now turn very briefly indeed to the operations of the Public Works Department. I do not propose to notice minor points, nor do I propose to go again over the ground which has been traversed by the Financial Statement of Sir James Meston in regard to the bigger works; but I should like in reference to the criticisms that have been made of the smaller allotments, both in the case of the productive and protective irrigation works, to make one or two observations in this connection. The critics have been Mr. Sarma, Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj and others, and criticism has also been made in the written statement which has been put forward by my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Ayyangar. Mr. Ayyangar, in particular, has asked what has happened to the Cauvery scheme and why the Cauvery scheme should not

be proceeded with? That is a very big scheme with which of course Mr. Ayyanagar is familiar; but it is held up because it cannot properly be provided with pending the settlement of certain disputes which have arisen in connection with the Kannambadi reservoir, between the Mysore Darbar and the Madras Government. It would not be right, we hold, to permit the Cauvery scheme to be proceeded with until that dispute is settled. I should like also to say generally with reference to the criticisms relating to the suggestion that productive and protective irrigation should have a larger allotment and the railways a lesser allotment than has been given by Sir James Meeson, that, in the first place, our development of productive and protective irrigation works has been necessarily limited by the human equation; our establishments have been low and we could not have proceeded at the normal rate in any circumstances. But there are other reasons which have operated to deter the Public Works Department on the irrigation side, from pressing for a larger allotment as against railways. One of them—I do not think I have heard this mentioned during the debate—is this. I think nobody who had experience of, or came into contact with, the threatened difficulty last September, October and November, owing to the shortage of rolling-stock and other equipment on the railways, or who realize the imminence of a block in the transfer from one part of India to another of necessary supplies of foodstuffs—I believe no one who had experience of that time of anxiety—would hesitate to say that the first plank in the protection of India from the ravages of scarcity and famine is to place our railways on such a plane of efficiency that there should be no risk of the repetition of the threat of such a calamity. At that time—I am speaking of September, October and November, when the war was still on—the chief anxiety of those who realized the apprehended scarcity in various parts of India was that it would be impossible to transfer foodstuffs sufficiently rapidly from one part of India to another owing to the depletion of rolling-stock and other equipment. Therefore, having been through that time of anxiety, I for one am fully convinced that the first essential, both in regard to industrial development and to the prevention of famine and its consequences through a shortage of foodstuffs, is the urgent need for restoring our railways to their former grade of efficiency.

“On the financial side, I should like to mention that the productive irrigation system gave us a net profit last year of 345 against 341 lakhs which we anticipated, and those who have read the Statement will see that we anticipate a revenue of 361 lakhs next year, the increase being due to the development of irrigation.

“One point remains: We have appointed Messrs. Barlow and Mearns to examine, and make a preliminary survey of, the potentialities of India for the utilisation of water-power for the development of industries; and we hope to get preliminary notes from them commencing from June next. Of course these preliminary reports will not be conclusive: they will be merely indications of where and how there seem to be probabilities of developing hydro-electric power to industrial advantage.

“That, I think, represents all the matters with which I need trouble the Council at present. But I should like to communicate a piece of information which we have just received, namely, that before the end of this month, the amount of wheat from Australia which we hope will have actually arrived will be 63,200 tons.

“And that reminds me of a criticism which was made also by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Shukul. I began with my Hon'ble friend and I propose to finish with him. He said that we had recklessly exported foodstuffs when we ought to have known better, thereby imperilling the well-being of the people of India. I interjected a question to ask the date to which he was referring, and he said 'before we prohibited exports.' We actually began to check exports before September. We actually prohibited exports of the major foodgrains at the beginning of October, and we had the situation carefully under observation from the time of the Nagpur Conference, that is, the 15th August. Hon'ble Members will perhaps still recollect that there was a war on at that time; and we anticipated

[8TH MARCH, 1919.]

[*Sir Claude Hill; Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul.*]

that the war might continue for at least another year. I am perfectly certain that every Member of this Council desired that, up to the last moment that it was safe, India should continue to give all the assistance in her power to the allied cause; and it was for that reason that up to the last safe moment we held our hands and refrained from prohibiting the export of foodgrains designed to help our Allies. But so soon as it became evident that it was unsafe to permit unrestricted export, we restricted export, and we have since then, as is evidenced from the information I have just given, taken steps to ensure that the stocks in India shall, as rapidly as possible, be reinforced by imports from abroad."

## RESOLUTION *RE* EXTENSION AND IMPROVEMENT OF AGRICULTURAL EDUCATION.

**The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul :—**" Sir, I beg to 8-57 P.M.  
move that—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the provision for expenditure under Agriculture be increased by Rs. 50 lakhs to provide for the extension and improvement of Agricultural Education.'

" Sir, before I make any observations on this Resolution, I wish to express my regret that my Hon'ble friend Sir Claude Hill seems to be under the impression that I stated the other day that Government did nothing for the improvement of Agriculture. So far as I remember, I never meant to say that. What I really meant to say was that whatever the Government had done was not commensurate with the needs and requirements of the country; and to that position I still adhere. What I think is that very much more has yet to be done, and that all that could be done has not been done.

" Now, coming to my present Resolution, I shall not detain the Council very long, for the reason that the cause of agriculture in my humble opinion needs no advocacy especially before this Council which is responsible for the permanent improvement of the moral and material well-being of the Indian population of whom more than 85 per cent. draw their sustenance directly or indirectly from the land.

" It is indeed a sad irony of fate that the question of agricultural education upon which solely hinges the further advancement of the cause of agriculture and the very success of the Agricultural Department itself, failed for a long time to receive such attention of the Government of India as was its due, and that even though the Government has of late taken a greater interest in the subject, yet the Government policy with regard to agricultural education should have proved a failure. This I say on the strength of the statement found in paragraph 324 of the Quinquennial Report of the Progress of Education in India for 1912-1917 to the effect that 'the results have hitherto been disappointing.'

" Although it was so far back as 1880 that the Famine Commission expressed the view that 'no general advance in agricultural system can be expected until the rural population had been so educated as to enable them to take a practical interest in agricultural progress and reform,' and although Sir Edward Buck pointed out at the Sinha Agricultural Conference in October 1896 that 'it was no longer a matter of choice whether agricultural departments could take up the subject of agricultural education or not, but it was a positive duty which they could not evade unless released by the Secretary of State from the obligations put upon them.' Yet adequate attention was not paid to it for a long time. However, it is a matter of great satisfaction that of late the Government of India have begun to take a more real interest in the subject as is reflected in the prolonged and close attention which has been paid

507 RESOLUTION *RE* EXTENSION AND IMPROVEMENT OF  
AGRICULTURAL EDUCATION.

[ *Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul; Mr K. V. Rangaswami Ayyangar; The Vice-President; Sir Claude Hill.* ] [ *SPEECH* MARCH, 1919. ]

to the question by the conferences of agriculturists and educationists which met at Pusa in February 1916 and again at Simla in June 1917. For this I cannot but express my deep sense of gratitude to the Government of India as well as to my Hon'ble friend, Sir Claude Hill, the Minister in charge of the portfolio of agriculture.

"I admit, Sir, that there is a machinery to bring into effect the intentions of the Government. I know the good-will is also there, but what we require now is enthusiasm and money. Without money, *i.e.*, without adequate funds, no Local Government will be in a position to carry into effect a substantial advance so as to produce a tangible result upon the system of agriculture in India. The conclusions which have been arrived at by the latest conference held to discuss the subject, especially the Resolutions recommending the establishment of a large number of agricultural middle schools and institutions for the training of teachers for such schools, have to be complied with.

"Sir, I think the present allotment made in the Budget under the head of Agriculture will not be quite sufficient for the undertaking of this ambitious object. Although I am glad to notice an improvement of about 25 lakhs in the Financial Statement under this head as compared with that of last year, yet, I think, it is inadequate. Reference to the statement furnished by my friend, the Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill, in reply to the question put by the Hon'ble Mr Sarma, would show that out of Rs. 20 lakhs spent on agricultural education out of the special grant of 30 lakhs sanctioned for the current year for the purpose of technical and agricultural education, a sum of 4 lakhs only was spent for the establishment of agricultural middle schools in this country, and what was the result? We could only get two schools for Madras, three for Bombay, two for Bengal, one for the United Provinces and one for the Central Provinces, that is nine in all for the whole of this country. Well, Sir, I beg to ask, is this a rate of progress with which the Government of India should rest satisfied? Does not the importance and the urgency of the subject demand a more forward policy to be adopted with regard to it, and is it too much for me to expect that the Government will see their way to spend a much larger sum under this head, intimately connected as it is with the immediate moral and material prosperity of the people who contribute so largely to the Imperial revenues? For these reasons, Sir, I beg to commend this Resolution to the acceptance of the Council with all the earnestness and emphasis that I can command."

4-3 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswami Ayyangar:**—"In the agenda paper it is said that this subject is to be taken up on the 10th March; so I suggest, Sir, that this be postponed till the 10th March."

4-4 P.M.

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"I propose like Sir Claude Hill to finish with Mr. Shukul."

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill:**—"I hope, Sir, my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Shukul, will not place the malicious meaning upon the word 'finish with' which that word might seem to suggest. I hope that I will end up with Mr. Shukul on our usual terms of mutual regard and friendship. It goes to my heart, Sir, to have to oppose a Resolution which offers to give me for expenditure an additional sum of money. It is rather like biting the hand that feeds one, and I feel that I lay myself open to the charge of ingratitude; but the simple facts of the case are these. Agricultural education, like so many other things, is essentially Provincial, and the situation of the Government of India *vis à vis* the development of agricultural education is one of applying a stimulus and inducing Local Governments to make a start, sometimes rather reluctantly; I am afraid; though in some Provinces a good start has been already made. My Hon'ble friend has hardly referred to the grant which was made

[ 5TH MARCH, 1919. ] [ *Sir Claude Hill; Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul.* ]

last year and to the 22 lakhs which have been expended in the development, chiefly of agricultural education, by the aid of that grant; but I may mention that the 22 lakhs which were sanctioned to Local Governments last year practically covered, or covered a very large majority of, the schemes put to us by Local Governments. With the 15 lakhs which I have secured as the moiety of the grant this year, I cannot say that Provinces are prepared at present with schemes which would justify me in asking for more than that 15 lakhs. And here I should like, from my experience as a Member of a Provincial Government, to endorse what fell from Sir James Meston on the subject of doles. I happen to have been a member of the Bombay Government and my experience of these doles, if I may use an un-Parliamentary expression, was that they were an unmitigated nuisance. We were given instructions that we were to spend within a given period a given sum on a given object; and the result of that was unquestionably uneconomical expenditure of public funds. Local Governments did not have the time to consider and evolve satisfactory schemes for meeting the objects which they were directed to meet from these doles, and personally I should be most reluctant to be a party to any system which implied that without full consultation with the Provinces a grant of public money should be made by the Government of India, and that the Provinces should be ordered to spend that grant upon agricultural middle schools and agricultural high schools or whatever the particular object might be. I suggest that the addition to the grant for agricultural education at present suggested might be actually mischievous,—not only not beneficial, but actually mischievous,—and in any case I feel that while there is no question that in a short time we shall be in a position to spend very much larger sums of money annually upon agriculture and agricultural education, we are not at the moment ready for this grant. We only began, as the Hon'ble Mr. Shukul will bear me out, to mature the lines upon which agricultural education should develop two years ago, and it is rather premature to force the pace now, universally, among the Provinces, (Provinces as I say which in some cases are reluctant to move) until results make us certain of the correctness of the policy we have laid down. For these reasons, Sir, I fear I shall not feel justified in urging on my Hon'ble colleague, Sir James Meston, the acceptance of the Resolution moved by my Hon'ble friend."

**The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur B. D. Shukul** :—" Sir, in view 4-3 P.M. of the explanations given by my Hon'ble friend, I do not think I shall press the Resolution. Yet, I have one or two points which I wish to bring to the notice of my Hon'ble friend. The first point to which I wish to draw his attention is, that I do not understand how it is that while in other countries, such as England and America, provision is to be found for the expansion of agricultural education and agricultural developments even during the time of the war, as a special war-measure, why in India alone agriculture should have been relegated to a backward position. My submission to Government, therefore, is that early steps should be taken to give prominence to agricultural reforms, and the principle should be recognised that agricultural reforms have as strong a claim upon the finances of the State as any other reforms. The second point to which I have to draw the attention of the Hon'ble Member is this : I tried to find out in the Financial Statement how much money was provided for agricultural education and how much was spent on it from year to year, but there is no comparative statement or anything of the kind to show how expenditure on this particular head was incurred. In future, I would therefore request the Hon'ble Member in charge of Finance and the Hon'ble Member in charge of Revenue and Agriculture that more precise and clear information should be given in the Financial Statement as to what amount is to be allotted for this purpose, and how much is spent, so that in future we may have the advantage of a comparative statement to find out how the position stands. With these words I beg to resume my seat. I do not wish to press the Resolution."

804 RESOLUTION RE EXTENSION AND IMPROVEMENT OF  
AGRICULTURAL EDUCATION.

[ *Mr. H. F. Howard; The Vice-President.* ] [ 8TH MARCH, 1919. ]

4-10 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. H. F. Howard** :—" Sir, may I rise to offer an explanation. The Financial Secretary's Memorandum was circulated to all the Members of this Council, and if the Hon'ble Mr. Shukul will turn to paragraph 227 thereof at page 98, he will find the information he requires."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President** :—"The Hon'ble Member desires to withdraw his Resolution."

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

The Council then adjourned to Monday, the 10th March, 1919, at 11 A.M.

DELHI,  
The 17th March, 1919. }

H. M. SMITH,  
*Offg. Secy. to the Govt. of India,*  
*Legislative Department.*