

the *Scylla* and *Charybdis*. If I do not allow the discussion, people may say that I am not allowing the discussion; if I allow the discussion, the objection would be that it is for hitting the institution. That is why, since all the Members have spoken very responsibly, I think, we can wait for sometime and if the information is with the hon. Home Minister, it can be ...

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: I also request you to call the meeting of the leaders once again.

MR. SPEAKER: I will request that they should encourage us by accepting our invitation.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Sir, the institutions are not badly hit simply by a discussion. Even the reports that are appearing affect the institutions, their prestige and their creditability. Therefore, merely not having a discussion is no way protecting those institutions. But, I do not see why the Government, which allows its own Members to raise this issue, persist in it and feel happy when our side also raises the same issue, is reluctant to come forth to the House with a statement, on the basis of which a proper discussion can take place. Now, a demand has been made by me, by Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singhji and by Shri Mukul Wasnik that a statement must precede a discussion on this issue. I think, he is also willing to do it provided you advise him to do it.

MR. SPEAKER: I am sitting in the Chair, but I am very junior Member. I would rather like to give the advice of all the senior Members in my Chamber and then we will decide. Until that time, may I request you, Madam, not to raise it?

(Interruptions)

DR. KARTHIKESWAR PATRA (Balasore): Mr. Speaker, Sir, yesterday, the Excise Commissioner of Punjab, when he was on his way to his office, was gunned down by two terrorists of Punjab. His driver was injured and his gunman was also injured. The spray of bullets were on the car. His injured driver has taken him to the hospital

where he was declared dead. Earlier, when the auction of liquor was going on, there was a threat on his life and he was given proper security. But, after the auction was over, the security was withdrawn. Anyway he was very well-known to me. He was a man of Orissa and he was the son of my very old friend, Shri Trilochan Misra.

Sir, he was also a very young and energetic officer having clean sense of responsibility. He was very loyal to his duties and to the Government throughout.

Now, through you, I urge upon the Government that they should come forward with a proposal to give adequate compensation to his family and to old parents. This is my demand before you. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: You have not given anything in writing.

[Translation]

I do not know what you are going to raise.

13.16 hrs

RE. BOFORS ISSUE

[Translation]

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES (Muzaffarpur): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am not raising any controversial points. On the 23rd April the Prime Minister made a statement in this House. That statement was made with reference to a news item that had appeared in the newspaper on 22nd April in regard to the Bofors issue and the hon. Prime Minister had not come to the House on that day and on the 23rd April an announcement to the effect was made on behalf of the ruling party that the Prime Minister would come. Before he came to the House, I had written a long letter to him on the 22nd and during the discussion which took place in the House on the 23rd April the Prime Minister referred to my letter terming it as Georgian Christian. His statement was not only confined to my

letter but he spoke other things also to which I will reply. Mr. Speaker, Sir, I had received the Prime Minister's letter yesterday in the morning at 7.30 in which...

MR. SPEAKER: No, please.....

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is not my question.... (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF STEEL (SHRI SONTOSH MOHAN DEV): How many times Bofors would be discussed? We want to know it from the hon. Speaker. It cannot go on like that.

[*Translation*]

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: The discussion shall continue as long as it is necessary.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, even on the 23rd the same thing had happened with me. It took one hour and 10 minute to allow me to make a 10 minute statement. Mr. Speaker, Sir,, it is my question. Please listen to me.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: You should come under some rule.

[*Translation*]

SHRIGEORGE FERNANDEES: Under which rule should I come?

MR. SPEAKER: You tell us.

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: I am telling you. I would like to say that this is not my question. The statement the Prime Minister had made in the House...

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. George, lengthy discussions have taken place on this issue. Discussions have taken place 5-6 times. The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs will tell

how many times the discussion, have taken place. You may speak.

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Will you yield for a moment?

SHRIGEORGE FERNANDES: I am not yielding at this moment.

SHRIGHULAM NABI AZAD: I am also not yielding. This is the eighth time in this Session, you have raised this issue.

[*Translation*]

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: The Government wants to suppress the truth. How can it suppress it?

[*English*]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura): We will have to discuss it. What you have said last week? You have assured that within seven days, the Prime Minister will give the information. (*interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Gandhi Nagar): I am sorry that the Parliamentary Affairs Minister should have intervened in this manner and said in the blatant manner, "I am also not going to yield". After all, when my colleague, Shri George Fernandes stood up to make, it was with the permission of the Chair. It is an established convention that if he yields, anyone else can intervene. But if he does not yield, then another Member cannot say, "I am also not going to yield." When this is said by the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs...

MR. SPEAKER: I did not know what he was going to raise. I was taken by surprise.

SHRILAL K. ADVANI: But you permitted him to make a submission. I would like to plead with you and plead with the Government also in this particular case that the Prime Minister has told this House that as far as the detailed questions that have been posed in

the course of the debate, whether by Shri George Fernandes or others, he would reply to them.

MR. SPEAKER: That is not correct. He has replied to his questions.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: The reply has come to Mr. Jaswant Singh also. It is in the fitness of things to see what he has said. He said, all the details are not available with me, at the moment. What is available with me, I am giving it to the House.

Whatever else is not available, I will look at the files and give the reply.

My point is that let the Government consider, is it a matter only between the Prime Minister and Mr. George Fernandes, and the Prime Minister and Mr. Jaswant Singh.

I can appreciate that the proper way can be found but the question that have been raised in that debate still remain unanswered even after these two letters and, therefore, an opportunity should be found and the Government itself should be in search of an opportunity to see that all the misgivings are removed and all the questions are properly answered. Please do not try to shut this House. Please do not do it. It is not in your interest and, therefore, I wish you permit Mr. George Fernandes and my colleagues also, those who want to speak on this, to speak on this and fix up time for that. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This matter was discussed in the Business Advisory Committee. It was decided that it would be discussed in the House. It was discussed for seven hours or eight hours, I suppose.

Again this was raised in the zero hour time.

This was again discussed for two three hours.

This was raised again in zero hour. Again it was discussed.

Again breach of privilege notice was given. Again it was tried to be discussed.

The letter is there. Again you are trying to discuss.

Can we do like this? That is the question. You should have waited. You can do it at one go. You can discuss it for any number of hours. But every day you are raising this matter.

And supposing you give a letter, the Prime Minister replies to you. You say that this is not replied. You want a reply. Again a reply is given. Then you interpret it in some other fashion. How can it go in like this?

[*Translation*]

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: First of all you please listen to me. The letter which I had given was not the subject of a personal discussion. In that letter I had written.

[*English*]

"I am listing here below some of the questions with a request that they may be answered by you in the statement you are due to make in the House tomorrow."

[*Translation*]

The Prime Minister had finished the discussion on that day.

[*English*]

He was to put it to a discussion.

[*Translation*]

He had said that he would give reply to questions only after going through the files. The reply that has been given now does not give any answer to my questions about which the Prime Minister had promised to give a reply. If that promise is not fulfilled, then where should I go? (*Interruptions*) Then where should I leave the question (*Interruptions*) How should the matter be

raised, kindly enlighten me. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I gave you 8 hours' time for discussion.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK (Buldhana): We discussed this matter several times. You have rightly pointed out that this was discussed several times. We are aware that no reply is going to be to their total satisfaction. This cannot be raised again and again. If we are concerned about institutions at the State level, are we not concerned about the institutions at the Centre? This issue is being raised only to malign the prime Minister. The prime Minister will reply. He will never be satisfied. It cannot be the satisfaction of the Opposition. They will be satisfied only when the Congress is out of power and that satisfaction we are not prepared to give to them.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dumdum): We do not want to malign. Therefore, we want the Papers to be laid on the Table.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL (Bhadra): What do they do during that time?

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK: It was their dream to expose. It was their dream to malign Shri Rajiv Gandhi. They could not malign Shri Rajiv Gandhi. Now they are trying to malign Shri P.V. Narasimha Rao. This cannot be allowed. Continuously this is happening. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, let us hear Shri Jaswant Singh.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh): Sir, I think there are two or three valid points. There is some validity in these points. Of course, we did discuss it earlier. But these points have to be answered. They should

allow me to speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK: This is happening continuously. We have never been afforded any discussion. It was Shri Jasant Singh who pointed out that day that he was relieved that the prime Minister is not involved. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I will just take only two minutes. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MRUTYUNJAYA NAYAK (Phulbani): What they are saying is absolutely incorrect.

SHRI PARITHIVIRAJ D. CHAVAN (Karad): We have given a notice.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK: Sir, that day when the Prime Minister made the statement saying that he is not involved in it, Shri Jaswant Singh expressed his satisfaction. He said that he was relieved that the Prime Minister is not involved in that affair. But every day they come out with something new.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI KODIKKUNIL SURESH (Adoor): We will not allow him to raise the Bofors issue. We want to raise some other issue.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): There is no import of his proceedings on the ending party.

[*English*]

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK: On the earlier issue, we had shown some restraint because of the feelings expressed by the Chair. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let Shri Jaswant Singh speak now.

SHRI PRAFUL PATEL: He should not speak on the Bofors subject.

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear Shri Jaswant Singh at least for two minutes. Let us hear him what he has to say. Please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear Shri Jaswant Singh for two minutes.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You can bear with him for two more minutes.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Kumaramangalaji: Let us hear what points he has to make. Not like this.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I think, of the points that have been made, certainly two are very valid points. Indeed the hon. Minister for parliamentary Affairs pointed out and you were good enough to observe from the Chair that there has been discussion on this session, on the issue of Bofors and the hon. the Minister for parliamentary affairs also said the same things and said something like that we have had discussions eight times. But that really begs the question. Perforce, we have had to have a discussion eight times on the same subject because if the Treasury Bench were to finally settle the matter and provide all the answers, then would not be any need for a discussion even the second time. That is the point. We are not having a discussion just now. We are making a submission to you. We are not holding a discussion just now and the submission that we are making to you all is precisely on two points. On the discussion that was held here. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Jaswant Singhji, I thank you very much that you are putting it in a different tone, in a different fashion. I would

like to bring to your notice that there are provisions and provisions in the rule book, not at one place but in many places. I am reading from Rule 58 (v). It says;

" the motion shall not revive discussion on a matter which has been discussed in the same session;"

I am reading Rule 186 which says:

" it shall not revive discussion of a matter which has been discussed in the same session;"

Again I read it. It says that a motion shall not be raised on a question substantially identical with one on which the House has given a decision in the same session. Of course, this is not applicable.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOBHANADREESWARA RAO VADDE(Vijayawada): We want only answer and not the discussion. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: One of the rules requires that we have other subjects also which have to be discussed.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Absolutely, Sir. You are entirely right and you are very correct. Indeed, the Chair is always correct. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I would say, the Chair is supposed to be correct.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: No, Sir. The Chair is always correct. Whatever the Chair will rule, it is entirely acceptable to us. I am merely making a submission during Zero Hour. I am not moving a motion; I am not asking for a discussion, I am making a submission.

MR. SPEAKER: That is exactly the point I made. When you give a regular notice, when you give a notice for a resolution, you are not allowed to do it. But in Zero Hour you are allowed to do it.

SHRIJASWANT SINGH: I am making a submission to the Chair. That is why, it is called the Zero Hour. I am making a submission to the Chair with the permission of the Chair.

MR. SPEAKER: Do not take me left and right.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: You have permitted me.

MR. SPEAKER: I just wanted you to say something but not this way.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am only making a submission. And the submission that I am making is that when the discussion took place on Bofors the hon. the prime Minister was good enough to reply to some very direct queries that were raised. For example, I raised this query. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Mayiladuturai): Sir, he asked for two minutes and two minutes are over. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I will take for instance *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Sir, people who cannot be enable about the amount of time they take, how can we take it as honourable what they have to say in this House? *(Interruptions)*

SHRIJASWANT SINGH: That was very simple. I was giving an illustration. For example, we have made a request and I remember very distinctly, asking the hon. the Prime Minister: did you or did you not meet the director- General of C.B.I., on the 23rd and the Prime Minister said *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI RANGARAJAN

KUMARAMANGALAM) : Sir, it is not agreeable. Let us see whether they can give a notice and then only we will see according to the rules. Sir, it is not going to be allowed. *(Interruptions)* We cannot allow this to go on record. All the time, we are hari-splitting this issue. We are creating a history. A lie told a million times would not make a truth out of it. There is no rationale. Even Goebles would have been shy of it. I am extremely sorry, Mr. Speaker, that we cannot agree to this. *(Interruptions)* We are determined not to allow this. There is a rule, there is Parliament and it has got a method. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: This House has not shut out the discussion.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Were you not given an opportunity to discuss and criticise this matter? it is not so. So much time has been given yet you got no solution. How can it be allowed to have discussion on this issue repeatedly? The question is about environment policy. *(Interruptions)* You want to discuss Dunkel's proposal and you want to keep aside the other issue and you want to discuss the same matter again and again. Had time been not allotted for discussion, you could have complained. But even after discussing it for five or six hours, there is no scope for any complaints.

(Interruptions)

SHRIJASWANT SINGH: An assurance was given in the House that the hon. Prime Minister will reply to the questions. If the assurance was given in the House, questions cannot be answered through these papers. My submission is that answer should be given on the floor of the House.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please excuse me, I am rising again and again, but I shall not rise later on. Though there is no convention in the House to give reply to questions after a

statement is made, yet I allowed to do that. When it was raised during the Zero Hour that too was allowed and it was allowed to do under Rule 197 also. When you gave letter out side the House that too was replied. Would you like to continue the debate even after that.

(Interruptions)

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: Answer has not been given at all.*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: We are not going to agree on this issue. *(Interruptions)* They are using this parliamentary system to disinform, to tell the untruth and to adopt the Gabbles's theory.*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: If it could not be answered for three years. What should I do?

MR. SPEAKER: Reply has been given to you.

SHRI GEORGE FERNANDES: I have not received that reply. Such statements mislead the House. It was a simple question, but it was not replied. Where should I go? *(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: There is a similarity between Shri Fernandes and Goebbles. This is not agreeable. They are using the parliamentary system to spread a systematic disinformation and to tell the untruth. What are they doing? Even Goebbles would be ashamed. They are telling untruth a million times, to make the untruth, a truth.

(Interruptions)

It is surprising to see as to where from they raise the issue.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I make a simple submission, I want to speak only two things. Whatever has been stated in the House, whatever assurance has been given in the House, whatever questions have been raised in the House...

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: Complete assurance was given, complete answer was given, yet the hon. Member could not satisfy himself. This is only a political drama.*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: The way the hon. Minister and the congressmen are standing and waving their hands is not correct.*(Interruptions)* Look at their faces, how are they looking? *(Interruptions)* What is it all like. *(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: This is not correct. This is not agreeable.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOBHANADREESWARA RAO VADDE (Vijayawada): Mr. Speaker, Sir, through you, I draw the attention of this Government to a very important and a sad state of affairs of non-payment of sugarcane prices.*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): I have given notice. The hon. Prime Minister cannot protect himself.*(Interruptions)* Please call him in the House. There should be a discussion on Bofors.*(Interruptions)* Shri Arjun Singh, call the hon. Prime Minister. Where is he? This will not do. We want to know as to who give the letter and at whose behest? *(Interruptions)* Bofors is not an ordinary issue. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: He has wasted the time of the House..*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: We want

to know the truth. We want to know as to who is the real culprit. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 3.45 p.m.

13.45 hrs

The Lok Sabha then adjourned for Lunch till forty-five minutes past Fourteen of the Clock.

14.48 hrs

The Lok Sabha reassembled after Luch at forty eight minutes past Forteen of the clock

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

[*Translation*]

RE. BOFORS ISSUE-CONTD

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): MR. Deputy Speaker, Sir, when you were not in the Chair, I had raised the Bofors issue here and I had requested that the hon. Prime Minister should be called. (*Interruptions*) In this connection, he has written a letter to Mr. Fernandes, but there is nothing of this sort in that letter. The matter concerns the entire nation as well as the House, so the Government should make a statement in the House. The clarification should be given in the House and the Government should inform the House about it because till now the Government has not given its reply. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I know you are all agitated.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Chandigarh): Agitated for what? For no reason, they are agitated.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, they have the freedom to feel agitated. But let us make some progress with regard to our business first. Let us take up papers laid on the Table.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you do not cooperate, how can we function? Under Rule 377, hon. Members want to raise many important issues. They must be given a chance.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Sir, the Prime Minister should clarify the position. This is a matter of shame for our country. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK (Buldhana): When the hon. Deputy Speaker is on his legs, the Member should not get up like that. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: We are requesting you with all respects that the Hon. Prime Minister had made an assurance in the House and we would like to request Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad to call the hon. Prime Minister and ask him to give clarification on Bofors issue. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM): I think the Zero Hour is over. If there is any motion let them bring it. If you do not want the House to go on, it is a different matter. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA (South Delhi): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, efforts are being made to hide facts from the House. This is very simple. Why does the Government want to hide facts. Only two questions arise here. Firstly, who is that

anonymous person who handed over the letter. His name should be disclosed. Secondly, what action has been taken by the hon. Prime Minister from 24th April to 2nd May. The hon. Minister had told that he would make a statement here within a week. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: I am on a point of order. Is the Zero Hour over or not? (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: We can make a little progress.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, the Government wants to hide the facts. Since the Hon. Prime Minister told that he would give a reply to the letter and clarify the entire position before the House, why his reply is not coming? The hon. Prime Minister should clarify the position here. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let us finish papers to be laid on the Table of the House.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA (Cuttack): Before lunch, we were raising an issue and the Treasury Benches including the Minister of Parliamentary affairs were not allowing the Opposition to make their view point. (*Interruptions*) We are prepared to listen to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs (*Interruptions*) They are trying to stall the proceedings of the House. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Cooperation from both sides is absolutely essential.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: Let the Prime Minister come to the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RABI RAY (KENDRAPADA): I want to make some suggestion (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr. Rabi Ray wants to make some suggestion to get out of the deadlock.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RABI RAY (KENDRAPADA): Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to help you in running the House smoothly. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: On which subject there should be discussion? What do you want to discuss? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: Do you want to convert this House into Parliament on Bofors? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RABI RAY: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, you have been observing the mood of the House, I would like to submit only this much that on the day Prime Minister had (*Interruptions*) The issue relating to letter was referred... (*Interruptions*) Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I may tell you that to continue with this type of barracking is not good, I do not believe in barracking and if you indulge in it. I want to say something with a view to help the Deputy Speaker and I am on my legs with his permission. It is not be good on your part. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

I want to make some suggestions. You cannot barrack me like this. I am not yielding.

[*Translation*]

I am not used to such things. I am on my legs with the permission of Deputy Speaker.

[English]

I am not yielding.

[Translation]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Hon. Member should not be disturbed. (Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dumdum): This is the difference. We want to listen to the Prime Minister. They do not want to listen to anybody.

[Translation]

SHRI RABIRAY: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir. I am requesting my ruling party friends to do some introspection and tell whether the smooth running of the House is not the responsibility of all of us. (Interruptions) Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir. I am again submitting that it is not a good sign. I respect Shri Kumaramangalam very much but he was indulging in barracking for fifteen minutes by rising again and again during Zero Hour. It is not good for Parliamentary Affairs Minister to barrack opposition members. (Interruptions) Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to thank Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad for making a statement when Shri Shivraj Patil was in the chair that Shri George Fernandes would receive reply to his question from the Prime Minister within a week. Now as per his assurance reply has been received yesterday. All this has created a new situation. (Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI KODIKKUNIL SURESH (Adoor): Why have you allowed them?

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARA-MANGALAM: Shri Rabi Ray, I have lot of respect for you. But please do not violate the ruling of the Speaker. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House

stands adjourned till 3.45 P.M.

14.57 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Forty-five minutes past Fifteen of the Clock.

15.46 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at forty-six minutes past Fifteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER in the Chair]

RE. BOFORS ISSUE- Contd.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA (South Delhi): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, we want Prime Minister to be present in the House. You should call him to the House. He had promised the people of the country that he would not hide any fact. He had also promised to make a statement. So there is no other question. He should come to the House and clarify the position.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Chandigarh): Which facts have been hidden? (Interruptions)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: We should at least be informed about the person who handed over that letter. I am at a loss to understand as to why so many persons have stood up in the support of Congress? Why Prime Minister himself is not coming to the House?

[English]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let us have some patience in the evening at least. Now the leaders of all political parties are sitting with the hon. Speaker and they trying to solve the issue.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

SHRIMADAN LAL KHURANA: Is Prime Minister also present then?

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: My dear friends, we should observe norms. When the Chair is speaking, Members should observe certain norms. The Members as and when, they want, spring up and speak. The leaders of all political parties and the hon. Speaker are discussing as to how to get out of this hurdle. They are trying to solve the issue.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: You please adjourn the House till then.

SHRI MOHAMMAD ALI ASHRAF FATMI (Darbhanga): We must be informed as to what was going on inside. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dumdudm): Sir, Please adjourn the House till the solution is found. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have already lost enough time. Let us do some justice to the business before us. The leaders of all political parties are discussing this issue. In the meanwhile, let us complete two items, one is Papers to be laid on the Table and the other is Matters under Rule 377. They are trying to solve the issue which is agitating in your mind. In the meeting which is taking place in Speaker's Chamber, the reasur benches are represented; all parties are also represented. Within fifteen minutes, they will arrive at just, fair and a reasonable decision. Therefore, kindly permit me to transact two items - one is Papers to be laid on the Table and the other is Matters under Rule 377.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your cooperation is required.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA (Cuttack): Please adjourn the House for half-an-hour. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

*SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: You please adjourn the House for half an hour.

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am sure, within fifteen in minutes, all our leaders, who are the Speaker, will arrive at a just and fair decision.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: Mr. Deputy Speaker. Sir. Our request is only this much that prime Minister should come to the House and give clarification.

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have to jobs to complete. One is Papers to be Laid on the Table of the House and the other is Matters under Rule 377.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: Since the various leaders are with the Speaker in the Speaker's Chamber, we can surely discuss that matter also here. (*Interruptions*)

MR DEPUTY SPEAKER: Leaders are discussing it. If you also want to discuss it here, it may not help.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI DAU DAUAL JOSHI (Kota): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, the entire country is concerned about it. Is Prime Minister present in the meeting going on in the chamber of hon. Speaker between Government and

Minister should be called in the House and further proceeding should be started only then.

[*English*]

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE : The prime Minister should be present here. He has to fulfil his commitment. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: The prime Minister has to come to the House to clarify the of Bofors issue. otherwise, it will be difficult for us to cooperate. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The leaders of the various political parties are with the Speaker.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MOHAN SINGH (Deoria): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir it is not on issue just between George Fernandes and the prime Minister.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: Let them sort it out. I do not know what is the problem here. The problem is that the prime Minister had made a commitment on the floor of this House Minister and made a commitment on the floor of this House that will give all the information (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: hon. Members, within fifteen minutes, they will be arriving at a decision. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: Why all the details cannot be placed on the Table of the House. The question was raised on the floor of the House? He has not answered to all the questions. What is the reason that the note which has been given by Shri Madhavsingh Solanki to the External Affairs Minister of Switzerland cannot be placed on the Table of the House? (*Interruptions*) Last week he also gave this assurance that the Prime Minister would give all the information to the House. But why the Prime Minister has not furnished this information so far?.. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: If the Prime Minister does not fulfil the assurance given by him, his credibility would be dangled

[*English*]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: What is the reason? Why this cannot be placed on the Table of the House? (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Whatever relevant points various hon. Members have raised in the morning, on those points the hon. Opposition parties' leaders are discussing inside. Headed by the Speaker, they are discussing this matter and they will come to the House with a proper solution. Therefore, my request to you is to kindly cooperate for fifteen minutes so that we can complete two items at least.

(*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No adjourn the House till then..

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Shri Rabi Ray ji, the former Speaker of this House, wants to say something.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: let us know his views...

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK: Sir, we respect Mr. Rabi Ray but that is an entirely different .. (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: In the best interest of the entire House, I request all the Members to please carry on the proceedings on smooth lines. Shri Rabi Ray Ji will give some suggestion how to solve this problem. He is a senior Member. Let us hear him.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 4.30 p.m. By that time we will have some solution.

15.58 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till thirty minutes past Sixteen Clock.

16.31 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Thirty one minutes past sixteen of the Clock

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Well, in the Leaders' meeting it is decided to meet again at 10.00 AM tomorrow and proceed with the business today. We have certain matters to be disposed of. We will take up Papers to be laid and afterwards I will request hon. Minister Shri Arjun Singh to make a statement and then the legislative business can be taken up.

Now Papers to be laid on the Table.

16.32 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Annual Report, Annual Accounts and Review on the working of central Wakf council for 1990-91 etc.

[English]

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF WELFARE (SHRIMATI K. KAMALA KUMARI): Sir, on behalf of Shri Sitaram Kesri, I beg to lay on the Table-

- (1) (i) A copy of the annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Central Wakf Council for the year 1990-91.
- (ii) A copy of the Annual Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the Central Wakf Council for

the year 1990-91 together with Audit Report thereon.

- (iii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Central Wakf Council for the year 1990-91.

- (2) A statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-1945/92]

Memorandum of Understanding for 191-92 between metal scrap Corporation Limited and Ministry of steel etc.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIGHULAM NABIAZAD): Sir, on behalf of Shri Sontosh Mohan Dev, I beg to lay on the Table-

- (1) A copy of the Memorandum of Understanding for the year 1991-92 between the Metal Scrap Trade Corporation Limited and the Ministry of Steel (Hindi and English versions). [Placed in Library See No. LT-1946/92]

- (2) A copy of the Memorandum of Understanding for the year 1991-92 between the Ferro Scrap Nigam Limited and the Ministry of Steel (Hindi and English versions). [Placed in Library See No. LT-1947/92]

Notification on Under Central Reserve Police force Act 1949.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRIRANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGLAM): Sir, on behalf of Shri M.M. Jacob, I beg to lay on the table a copy of the Indo-Tibetan Border Police, Sub-Inspector (Compounded/stores/Pharmacist) Recruitment Rules, 1992 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. G.S.R. 104 in Gazette of India dated the 7th March