

the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe (Prevention of Atrocities) Act, 1989 was registered. 22 people connected with the incident, including the eight persons named in the FIR have been arrested and chargesheets have been submitted to the Courts on 7.2.1994. Of these 22 persons, eight of the accused have, in addition, also been detained under the NSA. Arms licences of all the accused have been suspended.

The Chairman of the Revenue Board of Uttar Pradesh was deputed to inquire into the matter. He has already submitted his report which is being examined by the State Government.

Action has also been taken against the defaulting police officers. The Additional S.P., the Circle Officer, and four other Police officers have been placed under suspension and the Senior Superintendent of Police of Allahabad has been transferred. Adequate security has been provided for the family of the victims, Financial assistance of Rs. 1,10,000 has been disbursed. The State Government has reported that action has been taken by it to see that this incident which is reported to be confined to a dispute between two families does not emerge into an inter-caste clash. The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Home Affairs, Shri Ram Lal Rahi, also visited the village on 22.1.1994.

I would like to take this opportunity to assure the Members of this hon. House that the Government views all incidents of this type with most serious concern and has been advising the State Governments, from time to time, regarding the need to take timely preventive, punitive and rehabilitative measures. The Home Minister has also written to the Chief Ministers of various States, including Uttar Pradesh, in this regard. The Home Minister has also particularly addressed a demi official letter

to the Chief Minister of Uttar Pradesh in regard to this case.

Government will continue to closely monitor the incidents of crime against Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and women and also continue effective coordination with the Ministry of Welfare in this regard.

12.23 hrs.

[English]

RE: ATROCITIES ON WOMEN IN WEST BENGAL- CONTD.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (CALCUTTA SOUTH): The same should come from the Home Minister about West Bengal. We condemn the incidents in U.P. regarding West Bengal also the Minister should look into the matter.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Roder): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I raised this matter on the 22nd instant. This incident in regard to which he has replied, is not an isolate case. Doses such incidents have taken place and Uttar Pradesh is not an exception... [Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: I am allowing Shri Guman Mal Lodha.

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA (Pali): Mr. Speaker, Sir, when the Allahabad incident took place, I was not allowed to raise the matter. No problem. However, in the light of this report...

MR SPEAKER : You come to the point.

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY: The report was submitted later only after various woman organisations came out on the roads and blocked traffic for 3 hours. Even then, I would like to congratulate the Government for taking such a stringent step in this matter of injustice to a woman and for suspending all the police officials right from the S.P. to Constable. I would like to submit that in the case of atrocities on women, we must rise above party lines and religion, because dishonour of a woman is not a one time affair, but a permanent stigma. Therefore, Rs. 1 lakh cannot, in any case be adequate compensation for that dishonour and life long stigma. I would like to submit that the issue raised by Mamtaji be considered above party politics and firm action taken. If atrocities are committed on any woman....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Let us turn this House into a Court and take up all such cases here.

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY: Here, I would like to submit that clear cut directions should be given to the Government that in the case of atrocities on women and cases where the Police is found guilty of not taking any action, then immediately penal action should be taken against the erring officials for complicity in dishonouring any woman. On a number of occasions, you have stated that discussion will be allowed. Sir, incidents of atrocities are increasing daily...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: If you go beyond this, I will refer this matter to the Privileges Committee to find out whether it is a breach of privilege or not.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You are exceeding the limit.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY: Whatever you may say, but I am making these submissions because it is a good thing which get a president. I would like to further submit that all the Governments should follow this president and only then atrocities on women will come to an end. (Interruptions)

SHRI MOHAN SINGH (DEORIA): Mr. Speaker, Sir, you must be in a jovial mood during the Zero hour.

MR. SPEAKER: You behave properly.....

(Interruptions)

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA : Sir, there is a village called 'Nigam' in Vardhman district in West Bengal where the people belonging to the Scheduled Castes live in large number. Last month, on the 25th the village was attacked by 3,000 persons and in the genocide that followed 300 scheduled caste persons were killed and their houses were set ablaze..(Interruptions)...Both men and women were dragged out of the houses and subjected to atrocities.

[English]

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE: I have visited the village....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Well, you are all very learned and knowledgeable Members. You know what is the jurisdiction of the Parliament, what is the jurisdiction of the Court and what is the jurisdiction of the State

Legislature....

[English]

[Interruptions]

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA : I must request Mr. Chatterjee to go himself

[Translation]

Sir, let him himself find out that the huts of scheduled castes were set on fire and scheduled castes people were attacked. Scheduled Caste people of the Nigam village have lodged a complaint in advance that they apprehended attack. This attack was the fallout of the fact that in the Gram Panchayat elections the BJP candidates emerged victorious and the villagers were being penalised for the same. Sir, till date the police has not taken any action in this case ...[Interruptions]..

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE: I would like to urge the hon. Minister of Home Affairs to make a statement on West Bengal....[Interruptions]...

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA: Sir, I would like to submit that this is not an isolated incident, but in whole of West Bengal, political repression is on.

[English]

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE: There is no human right. There is no democratic right - nothing....[Interruptions]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): Today is the West Bengal day. Minister of Home Affairs to make a statement regarding the incident of 'Nigam' village to make it clear. Whether the huts of 300 scheduled caste persons were gutted or not?....[Interruptions]...Let the Government enquire into it and also make a statement in this regard.

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA): According to the convention followed in this House, I would request the Minister of Home Affairs to call for a report from the State Government....[Interruptions]..... After getting the report from the State Government, he should make a statement on this matter here.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: May I seek a clarification? [Interruptions] Do not go on like this [Interruptions] Let them make such statements. I do not mind it. [Interruptions] But you must have the honesty to refer every matter raised in relation to every State. [Interruptions] You must have that political honesty, Mr. Shukla. Therefore, do not try to stop us from raising issues relating to a State.

When the obliging Minister is there to make a statement in regard to West Bengal, he must have the political honesty! [Interruptions]

[Translation]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): MR. SPEAKER, Sir, I would like to know whether we will be allowed to raise such issues in future or not, because in regard to a particular incident here they have started a political wrangling? Therefore, all should be allowed to raise such issues.[Interruptions]..

Today, Shri V.C. Shukla is prepared to call the reports on all incidents. Sir, I want only one protection that daily if we raise such issues in the House, then the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs should respond in the same manner. Except for this I don't want any other thing [Interruptions]

[English]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA (Cuttsj): Today, since the Parliamentary Affairs Minister took the position that Home Minister will make a statement, after Lodhaji and Mamataji raised a State's law and other situation, let the Home Minister suo motu make a statement everyday on the law and order situation of any State.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Jena, please take your seat.

[Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: What is going on here when I am standing? Please sit down. I am allowing Mr. Fatmi to speak. You should please understand that you have insisted, not once but many times, for a statement from the Government.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: The point raised in relation to UP was regarding Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes but in the case of West Bengal, it is a politically motivated issue [Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: I am of the view that matters relating to individuals should not be raised on the floor of the House. The forum for decision on individual matters is not the Parliament or the State Legislature. The forum is the Magistrate's Court and there it is decided as to whose statement is correct and whose statement is wrong. But we are at a loss to understand as to why this kind of matters are raised from all sides! And when the matter comes up, somebody insists on a statement and somebody else insists that a statement should not be made. Only two minutes before the Home Minister was asked to make a statement of an incident that has taken place in UP. And in the same

fashion, without alleging anything against any individual and without alleging anything against any party, if a matter about a lady is raised and if you think that the parameters of the matter cover the entire treatment given to ladies in general and if a suo motu statement is likely to be made by the Minister, I should have no objection. But I would say one thing. Let us please refrain from raising such matters.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Yes.

MR. SPEAKER: And if Shri Somnathji says 'yes', he should see to it that such matters are not raised here.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Kindly give me a half a minute. So long as the lady Member was referring to some alleged incident, I completely kept quiet. But when she started making reckless allegations against my Party, only then I stood up...

MR. SPEAKER: But those remarks were not a part of the proceedings.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: That is all right. But nobody tried to stop her. Let me state that any atrocity against women is a matter of shame. Whenever it occurs, it is a matter of national shame. If something has happened in West Bengal, all corrective steps will be taken and should be taken. But the alacrity with which the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs responds, whenever any matter relating to West Bengal is referred to, indicates political overtones... [Interruptions]

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA): The procedure that we follow here is as per the traditions established in the House. Whenever there

are atrocities against Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and women, such matters are sometimes raised here. After obtaining the reports from the respective State Government, the Home Minister makes a statement, as has happened today in the case of UP. Similarly, allegations have been made about atrocities committed against Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe women in the State of West Bengal. The Home Minister will obtain the report from the Government of West Bengal and based on that report, he will make a statement here. Whatever action requires to be taken, will be taken according to the report of the State Government. So, there should be no objection. I am not setting any new tradition....[*Interruptions*]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh) Then you should do it every day!

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: When I am on my legs, you must sit down.

[*Interruptions*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I will see to the matter. When you are sitting here in the Chair, you can say what you like, but not while sitting there! Please do understand that as far as possible, we are trying to accommodate the feelings of the Members. But if it is going beyond a certain limit, it becomes very difficult. Now, this Parliament does have certain jurisdiction. But your jurisdiction is not extended to alleging certain things against individuals without evidence and without even knowing what has happened. But you express views here against individuals or against organisations or against parties which have no opportunity to defend themselves. Then what do we do? You make the law here and you yourselves

break the law here! That should not be the case. But sometimes if we have accommodated certain matters, that should not be the rule. At least those Members who understand the constitution and jurisdiction of legislature, judiciary and executive may please help us by not raising this kind of matters here! [*Interruptions*]

[*Translation*]

SHRIMATI VIJAYARAJE SCINDIA (Guna): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am sorry to say that when we come to know of such incidents everyday, our heads hang in shame. The incident 'Draupadi Cheerharan' took place only once in Mahabharata, but nowadays such incidents have become quite frequent. If we cannot allow a discussion on this matter in the Parliament which is the supreme institution of the country, where else such matters can be discussed. In the present case a poor woman was disgraced and the police refused to lodge her FIR for one month just for the reason that the victim had no money and she was not in a position to take her case to the court. If an hon. Member raises this issue here, it is not proper on your part to object to it and say that such matters should not be raised here everyday. I would humbly submit that since it is the supreme body, it is not inappropriate on the part of an hon. Member to request the Government to inquire into the case of atrocity against a woman whose voice went unheard. It would be better on our part to constitute a court where those helpless and poor women could seek the redressal of their grievances which remained otherwise unattended.

MR. SPEAKER: I appreciate your feelings. Such incidents do take place and we all are sorry for it. I respect each and every word you have spoken. We should have the sort of approach. But the difficulty is that ours is a large country and innumerable

incidents take place here. Hence it would be of no use to discuss all these things everyday. If you wish to have a comprehensive discussion for one, two or even four hours on this subject, we may do it, I do respect your feelings, but I would like to make a request that we should also have a discussion on other matters.

SHRIMATI VIJAYARAJE SCINDIA: I am grateful to you. We should have such discussions.

[English]

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE (Panskura): Sir, I want to seek a clarification on your ruling. Am I allowed?

MR. SPEAKER: It is not a practice. but I will allow Geetaji.

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE: Sir, as far as I am concerned, I am on record that I am of the view that all atrocities on women must be dealt with raising above petty political considerations. There is no doubt about that. I still stand by it and I believe all the other Members should also stand by it. I wanted to seek a clarification in this regard.

MR. SPEAKER: I am not subject to giving clarifications. Anyway, I will allow you.

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE: Today, I have given a notice on a subject not in respect of any State but, it is in respect of a Central Department. It is regarding an Officer committing sexual assault against a woman. Should I be heard on that or not?

MR. SPEAKER: I will give the explanation. Supposing this is correct, it is reprehensible and we should condemn it. But, it is very difficult to know the truth. We should not jump to the conclusions. This is

not a forum where we should jump to conclusion.

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE: I did not jump to any conclusion. Sir, through you, I wanted to appeal to the Minister to take it up by himself.

MR. SPEAKER: You please understand. This is not the forum, otherwise, you will have to give judicial powers to Parliament and let it decide. There is a court for that purpose. The affected party can go to the court. I do understand that many people cannot go to court because they do not have the money.

How do you expect the Parliament to deal with the matters which are happening in the country every day? We will look at the matter in a comprehensive manner at one go or many times. House is yours; its time is yours. You can utilize the time of the House in raising such matters but, I am finding it very difficult to adjust these every day happenings which are being raised here without even knowing the actual fact.

[Translation]

SHRIMATI BHAVANA CHIKHAJIA (Junagarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, though the Commission for women has been constituted, it is not working.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Then, you raise it while participating in the President's Address.

[Translation]

SHRI MOHAMMAD ALI ASHRAF FATMI (Darbhanga): Mr. Speaker, Sir, while coming to the House in the morning today, I was arrested.

MR. SPEAKER: You understand that what kind of statement you are making here.

[Translation]

SHRI MOHAMMAD ALI ASHRAF  
FATMI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, today, when I was coming to the House...

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Why do not you give it in writing to me?

[Translation]

SHRI MOHAMMAD ALI ASHRAF  
FATMI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, please listen to me. We were arrested at the gate of the Parliament House when we wanted to put the garland on Mahatma Gandhi's statue just to lodge our protest against Dunkel Proposals, we were told that for violating Section 144 in force there, we were taken into custody. For this reason, we could not even attend the proceedings of the House. Since I and Shri Manjay Lal had been arrested at the Parliament House Gate, it is not a simple matter in any case.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Fatmi, please understand that if we all Members come to the Parliament for these kinds of things every time, what will happen to the Parliament? You please sit down now...

[Translation]

SHRI MRUTYNJAYA NAYAK  
(Phulban): If the hon. Member wants to garland the statue of Mahatma Gandhi, he should go to Rajghat.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA (Cuttacj):  
The hon. Member was arrested from the main gate of the Parliament House.....[Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: You give me in writing. I will enquire into it and if your statement is not correct then I will send it to the Privileges Committee.

[Translation]

SHRI HARI KISHORE SINGH  
(Shehar): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to raise a matter regarding telecast of a serial on Doordarshan. Doordarshan has earned a lot of disrepute due to its absurd programmes. As a result thereof even the Government had to go to the Zee TV for the Budget telecast. Besides this, the day before yesterday there was a line appearing in the classified columns of the Times of India which read as under

"V.P. SINGH TURNS 75 TODAY."

MR. SPEAKER: In case this thing has not been publicised enough you are giving it more publicity with your action.

SHRI HARI KISHORE SINGH: No, no, I am referring to it only because it is an example of indirect character assassination.

[English]

Now everyone is after his money.

[Translation]

What is this? Doordarshan has now become totally unattractive. So it has started its move or character assassination to gain cheap popularity by raking up Shri V.P.

Singh's name who is otherwise the former Prime Minister and a leading politician of this country. I would like the Government to ban immediately the telecast of this serial at the prime time and call for explanations of the concerned Minister.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh is being taken for a ride. Here, I have a written note which reads.

[English]

Note: All the Characters in this serial are fictitious and any resemblance to any living person is purely coincidental."

[Translation]

By making this statement, they have ensured their safety from any action under the law while on the other hand they mentioned that

[English]

V.P. Singh turns 75 today.

[Translation]

It is a comedy serial.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (ROSERA): If it is a matter related to Doordarshan, there is more scope for a disciplinary action to be taken against them. In case it relates to an individual, then it is something different. If such derogatory words have been used by Doordarshan, the hon. Minister should apologize immediately because it is not an ordinary matter.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: It is a case of character assassination [Interruptions]

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: This is not going on record.

[Interruptions]\*

MR. SPEAKER: I have a ruling on this. I am going to give a ruling on this

[Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: This is not appreciated; this is not in keeping with the dignity of the Members also.

[Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: You give a notice. If it constitutes a breach of privilege, I will send it to the Committee of Privileges. If it does not constitute a breach of privilege, you can go to the court of law and file a suit for defamation. All the Members should know what to do and how to do.

There are many caricatures coming in the newspapers. For every caricature, we do not take action.

[Interruptions]

[Translation]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Please listen to me for a minute. It is a matter of ridicule caused by television.....[Interruptions]

MR. SPEAKER: You people are doing those dirty things in the House here.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Please just listen to me. I would like to draw your attention to a particular sentence.



MR. SPEAKER: You please try to understand. If you think that there is case of Breach of Privileges, then you should give a notice. If not, it may be taken up as a case of defamation. At the same time, I may be delegated special powers under the rules framed for that purpose to empower me to take action against those who are bringing out caricatures of hon. Members of this House.

12.52 Hrs

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

**Sugar (Price Determination for the year 1993-94 Production order, 1993**

[English]

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF FOOD (SHRI KALP NATH RAI):

I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Sugar (Price Determination for 1993-94 production) Order, 1993 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. G.S.R.670(E) in Gazette of India dated the 22nd October, 1993 under sub-section (6) of section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955. (Placed in library. See No. LT 5402/94)

**Notification under Environment (Protection) Act, 1986**

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI KAMAL NATH):

I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Notification No.S.O.60(E) (Hindi and English versions) published in Gazette of India dated the 27th January, 1994 directing that

expansion or modernization of any activity if pollution load is to exceed the existing one, or new project listed in Schedule I annexed to the notification shall not be undertaken in any part of India unless it has been accorded environmental clearance by the Government in accordance with the procedure specified in the notification with effect from the 27th January, 1994 issued under sub-section (2) of section 3 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986. (Placed in library See No. LT 5403/94)

**Annual Report and Review on the Working of Indian Railway Welfare Organisation, New Delhi for 1992-93.**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI K.C.LENKA): I beg to lay on the Table:-

- (1) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Indian Railway Welfare Organisation, New Delhi, for the year 1992-93, alongwith Audited Accounts.
- (2) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the Indian Railway Welfare Organisation, New Delhi, for the year 1992-93. (Placed in the library, See No. LT 5404/94)

**Notification under Essential Commodities Act, 1955**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL SUPPLIES, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI KAMALUDDIN AHMED):

I beg to lay on the Table a copy each of the following Notifications (Hindi and