

Tuesday, September 14, 1920

***THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL***

**Vol 59**

**20 Aug. - 16 Sept.  
1920**

**P L**

# Proceedings of The Indian Legislative Council

Assembled for the  
purpose of making  
Laws and Regulations

---

---

VOL. LIX.



Published by Authority of the Governor General.

Gazettes & Debates Section  
Parliament Library Building  
Room No. FB-025  
Block 'G'

CALCUTTA  
SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA  
1921



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ASSEMBLED UNDER  
THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA ACT, 1915.  
(5 & 6 Geo. V, Ch. 61.)**

---

The Council met at the Council Chamber, Viceregal Lodge, Simla, on  
Tuesday, the 14th September, 1920.

PRESENT :

The Hon'ble Sir GEORGE LOWNDES, K.C.S.I., K.C., *vice-President presiding*  
and 49 Members of whom 41 were Additional Members.

---

**STATEMENT LAID ON THE TABLE.**

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent :**—"Sir, I lay on the table <sup>at 11 A.M.</sup> a statement\* regarding Publicity Boards which was promised in reply to a question asked by the Hon'ble Mr. Sachchidananda Sinha on the 25th February 1920."

**QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.**

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee** asked :—

1. "Have Government under consideration any definite and constructive policy with regard to (a) the wider extension of cattle farms for purposes of breeding and storage of fodder at important centres, and (b) the effective measures which are necessary for the adequate production of milk and milk products?"

---

\* *Vide Appendix A.*

( 215 )

[*Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma ; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee ; Sir George Barnes.*] [14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied :—

"For information regarding cattle-breeding farms and milk supply the attention of the Hon'ble Member is invited to the answer which was given to a similar question put by the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde on the 27th August last.

As regards fodder storage, the question was discussed last month at a Conference held at Simla and the recommendations made are now under consideration."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee** :—"Sir, may I ask a supplementary question? Will the Hon'ble Member please give us an idea as to the time when these recommendations are likely to be given effect to?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—"I may assure the Hon'ble Member that the matter will receive the earliest possible attention and we hope to be able to issue a Resolution on the subject before the end of next month."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee** asked :—

Increase of  
pay of Super-  
intendents  
of Post  
Offices.

2. "(a) Was any petition submitted by the Superintendents of Post Offices in February last for an increase of their pay? If so, what action was taken on it?"

(b) Have the Superintendents memorialised Government again for an increase on the ground that the scale of pay recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State is inadequate in view of the present high cost of living, and incommensurate with their duties and responsibilities?

(c) Is it a fact that the scales of pay recently sanctioned for Deputy Collectors and Extra Assistant Commissioners in all the provinces and for Telegraph officers, both Imperial and Provincial, are higher than those recommended by the Public Services Commission, while in the case of Superintendents of Post Offices the maximum and minimum are the same as those recommended by that Commission?

(d) Is it a fact that the minimum pay now sanctioned for Postal Superintendents does not in effect represent any increase over the minimum fixed in 1871 and that all Superintendents of the last grade were drawing in pay and acting allowance Rs. 250 before the introduction of the time-scale?

(e) Is it a fact that the maximum pay, *viz.*, Rs. 700 recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State is the same as that proposed by Sir Charles Stewart Wilson as Director-General of Post Offices many years ago?

(f) Do Government propose to consider the present application of the Superintendents of Post Offices favourably?"

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes** replied :—

"(a) The memorials submitted by the Superintendents of Post Offices were withheld on the ground that the Secretary of State had sanctioned a revised scale of pay for these officials.

(b) Yes.

(c) Yes.

(d) In 1871 the minimum pay of Superintendents of Post Offices was Rs. 200. It is now Rs. 250. When the time-scale was introduced, practically all Superintendents in the lowest grade were drawing salary at the rate of Rs. 250 a month.

(e) Yes.

(f) The memorials will receive the careful consideration of Government."

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee ; Sir George Barnes ; Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi ; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*]

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—**" Sir, may I ask when final orders are likely to be passed on this memorial ? "

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes :—**" I cannot give the Hon'ble Member an exact date, but I may inform him that I am receiving a deputation of these Superintendents next week."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi asked :—**

3. (a) Has the attention of Government been drawn to an unstarred question asked by the Hon'ble Babu Brojendra Kishore Roy Choudhury at a meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on the 4th August last, regarding the amount of costs of settlement operations in the district of Mymensingh, and the reply of the Local Government thereof, particularly the statement that the alleged excess collection has been automatically credited to the Government of India ?

(b) Will Government lay on the table a copy of their ' general orders ' referred to in the said reply ?

(c) Is contribution by the State of  $\frac{1}{4}$  (one fourth) or any proportion of the costs of settlement and record-of-rights operations entirely discretionary, or is there any rule or well-established practice in that behalf ?

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma replied :—**

" (a) and (b) The Government of India have not seen the question and answer referred to, which, so far as they are aware, have not yet been published.

(c) The arrangement under which one-quarter of the cost of settlement operations is debited to Imperial revenues was sanctioned by the Secretary of State in 1894. In 1918 with his approval the liability of Imperial Revenues for the cost of original survey and settlement operations in districts for which estimates have not been sanctioned was fixed at Rs. 200 per square mile until such time as the Financial Settlement with the Government of Bengal is revised. Under the reformed constitution no part of the cost of Survey and Settlement operations will fall on Imperial revenues."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi asked :—**

4. (a) Has the attention of Government been drawn to two cables of Reuter, dated London, August 5, reporting the reply given by the Secretary of State to a question in the House of Commons by Mr. A. M. Samuel, regarding export of rice from India to Europe ?

(b) If so, are Government in a position to lay on the table a copy of the official Report and the statement of the Government of India referred to by the Secretary of State in his reply ?

(c) What is the exact nature of India's present commitments to the other countries in regard to food grains and the understanding with the Royal Commission on Wheat Supplies in that behalf ?

(d) Has the attention of Government been drawn to the report that a Japanese firm has recently acquired a large interest in the rice trade of Burma and has been acquiring a large stock of rice ?

(e) If so, is there any truth in the report ?

(f) In what manner has the steamer freight for carrying rice from Burma to the different parts in India varied since 1914 ?

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma replied :—**

" (a) Government have seen the cables referred to.

[*Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi.*] [14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

(b) Copies \* of Mr. A. M. Samuel's question and of the Secretary of State's reply thereto which contains the Government of India's statement on the subject are laid on the table.

(c) Statements \* are also laid on the table showing the allotments of rice (Burma and Indian), wheat and other minor food-grains sanctioned for export to foreign countries during the year 1920. The exportable surplus of Burma rice is being dealt with in the manner explained in the press communiqué of the 24th December 1919, a copy\* of which is laid on the table. Allotments of Burma rice, after providing for the estimated and stated demands of India, are being made to foreign countries according to their requirements. There is no understanding with the Royal Commission on Wheat Supplies in regard to any exports either from India or Burma.

(d) and (e) Government have seen the report in the press. A Japanese firm has bought a mill at Dawbong at a price of Rs. 9 lakhs, and has purchased paddy equivalent in amount to 4,000 tons of cargo rice.

(f) Government have not the material from which the required information can be obtained but a statement\* is laid on the table showing pre-war rates and rates in force since the institution of the Burma rice control."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi** asked:—

Exportation  
of bovine  
cattle from  
India.

5. "(a) Will Government be pleased to make a statement of their policy in regard to the export of bovine cattle from India? Is it a fact that they regard such export as an incentive towards improvement in the breed and quality of cattle?

(b) What is the number of such cattle exported since January, 1920, month by month, from the different provinces?

(c) Are Government aware of a strong feeling among the Indian public against such export?

(d) Have Government any approximate idea as to the total number of bovine cattle in each province?

(e) Is it a fact that the said number has been on the decline for some time, and the type is deteriorating, in some provinces at least?

(f) What steps have been taken by Government in the different provinces for improving and increasing the supply of bovine cattle?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied:—

"(a) The question received the attention of the Government of India in 1907 and 1908 when the view was taken that a foreign demand for cattle of good quality would probably tend to encourage sustained efforts on the part of Indian cattle owners to improve the breed. In 1914 the Government of India caused the Board of Agriculture to consider at its meeting in 1916 the policy which should be adopted in regard to the export of cattle to foreign countries. A committee was appointed by the Board to examine the question and arrived at the conclusion that the most suitable action to meet the situation would be, not to restrict the export of cattle that are in demand abroad, but to maintain pure herds of such cattle in the middle of the breeding tracts and to assist such breeders in every suitable way to extend and improve their present operations. The Board of Agriculture accepted the report and recommended that, as the export of cattle stimulates breeding, it should not be discouraged. The Government of India informed Local Governments that they were inclined to accept this recommendation, but added that at the same time the possibility of the depletion of the best breeds was a matter that deserved attention. In cases where particular Indian breeds were in demand abroad they were asked to consider how far the depletion of indigenous breeds could and should be checked by the maintenance by Government of pure herds as suggested by the Committee of the Board of Agriculture. The question whether steps should be taken to restrict export was referred once more to the Board of Agriculture last year. A sub-committee was appointed last December to consider the question and it reported that the evidence before the Committee did not prove that deterioration was taking place to any marked

\* Not included in these Proceedings.

[11TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Rao Bhadur B. N. Sarma; Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi.]

degree, or that any such possible deterioration was due to the export of cattle. It found that in any case the export abroad at present forms a negligible fraction of the total export trade from breeding areas and considered that control was not called for immediately. The committee expressed the opinion that the inherent instinct for gain and consequent incentive to breed good animals would be developed by encouraging trade. After careful consideration of the question from all points of view the Government of India generally accepted these conclusions, but they have addressed local Governments and Administrations impressing on them the desirability of keeping a careful watch on the nature of the export trade, particularly with a view to observing the class of animals exported. Local Governments are also being asked for statistical information regarding the extent to which good breeding cattle are being exported, and when this information is available the whole question will be reconsidered.

(b) It is not possible to obtain figures of export from each province. A statement\* showing the number of bovine cattle which have left India from the maritime provinces since January 1920 is placed on the table.

(c) The Government of India have received a large number of representations urging the prohibition or restriction of exports.

(d) Yes. A statement\* giving the figures of the recent cattle census which was taken during the period December 1919 to April 1920, so far as they have been received, is laid on the table.

(e) As regards the first part of the question, the figures contained in the Agricultural Statistics of India for 1917-18 show that there was a steady increase in the number of bovine cattle from 1908 to 1917. In 1917-18 there was a slight decrease. A statement\* showing the total number of bovine cattle for the years 1908-09 to 1917-18, which are the latest available in the Agricultural Statistics, is laid on the table. The figures of the recent census are still incomplete owing to the absence of figures for Ajmer-Merwara, but if the figures for that area be also excluded from the returns of 1917-18 the census figures for the rest of India show a fall of about 3 per cent, doubtless due to the wide-spread fodder famine of 1918-19. For the reasons stated on page vii of the report submitting the Agricultural statistics for 1917-18, no useful comparison can be made between the total figures for any years, as these totals do not actually represent the number of stock in the year against which the figures are shown owing to the fact that the stock had not been enumerated simultaneously all over India prior to the recent census.

As regards the second part of the question there is, as stated in the reply to Part (a) no evidence of deterioration of type.

(f) The Hon'ble Member is referred to Chapter VI of the Report on the progress of Agriculture in India for 1918-19 which contains a brief account of the measures taken in the several provinces, and also to the Annual Reports on the working of the provincial Agricultural and Veterinary departments.

The Imperial cattle breeding and dairying scheme has now been initiated."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi**  
asked :—

6. "(a) How far has the Indian Tariff (Amendment) Act, 1919, affected the export of hides and skins from India?"

The Indian  
Tariff  
Amendment  
Act, 1919.

(b) To what extent has it benefited the Indian tanning and leather industry?

(c) Is it a fact that the Indian traders in hides and skins have been very hard hit by its operation?

(d) Will Government be pleased to make a statement showing the quantities and values of hides and skins exported to the different parts of the British Empire, as also to other countries, since the aforesaid legislation, as compared with the pre-war average thereof?

(e) Has the tariff system introduced under the said legislation been objected to by any of the importing countries?"

[Sir George Barnes; Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi; Colonel W. D. Waghorn; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes** replied :—

"(a), (b) and (c) The attention of the Hon'ble Member is drawn to my reply to the Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma's question at the meeting of the Imperial Legislative Council held at Delhi on the 25th February last. I then informed the Hon'ble Member that it was too early to judge of the effect of the duty. Government are not yet in a position to add to this reply. The world-wide depression in the leather and raw hide trades, which has developed since the beginning of this year, has so reacted upon the Indian market that the effect of the export duty, whether on shipments of raw hides or on the development of the tanning industry in India, cannot be determined. The position of Indian traders in raw hides is not satisfactory. But this condition is practically universal, and compared with other more general causes, the Government of India believe that the export duty has had little to do with the present depressed state of the raw hide trade.

(d) A statement\* giving, so far as is available, the information required by the Hon'ble Member is laid on the table.

(e) From replies given to interpellations in Parliament it appears that of the Allied and Associated Governments, France, Italy and the United States of America have made representations against the differential duty on raw hides and skins. They dwelt mainly on the harm likely to result from duties to their industries and consumers of leather."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi** asked :—

Extension of  
railway line  
between  
Rajshahi  
and Ishurdi.

7. "(a) Is any proposal for linking up Rajshahi with Nator or Ishurdi by railway now under consideration ?

(b) If so, will Government indicate the alignment of such proposed railway and the time when it may be expected to be carried into effect ?"

**The Hon'ble Colonel W. D. Waghorn** replied :—

"(a) The reply is in the affirmative.

(b) The alignment at present under consideration is Ishurdi-Bampur Boalia-Nachoul. Government are not in a position to say when the project is likely to materialise."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi** asked :—

Profiteering  
in rice by  
traders in  
Bengal.

8. "(a) Are the Government of India aware that reports received by the Government of Bengal from some District Magistrates and Sub-Divisional Officers refer to the prevalence of profiteering in rice by traders and to the fact that most of the cultivators are not benefited to any considerable extent by the prevailing high price of rice ?

(b) Are Government also aware of allegations as to the purchase of standing crops by traders and speculators in Bengal much in advance of the harvesting seasons ?

(c) Are Government aware of similar reports in respect of any other provinces ?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied :—

"(a) and (b) The Government of India have no information of any reports and allegations of the kind referred to by the Hon'ble Member.

(c) No."

\*Not included in these Proceedings.



[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi; Sir George Barnes; Mr. Shafi; Mr. G. S. Khaparde.*]

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi**  
asked :—

9. "(a) Has a memorial recently been submitted by the Superintendents of Post Offices regarding the inadequacy of their pay as lately sanctioned by the Secretary of State? Pay of Superintendents of Post Offices.

(b) Is it a fact that no action was taken on a memorial submitted by the Superintendents in February last, on the ground that a revised scale of pay had been sanctioned by the Secretary of State?

(c) Is it a fact that the minimum pay now sanctioned for the Superintendents does not really indicate any increase over the pay sanctioned in the year 1871, and that a last grade Superintendent of Post Offices was already getting as his pay and acting allowances Rs. 250?

(d) Is it a fact that the maximum pay recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State, namely, Rs. 700, is the same as that recommended by Sir Charles Stuart Wilson as Director-General of Post Offices many years ago, and by the last Public Services Commission?

(e) Is it a fact that the scales of pay recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State for the members of Provincial Executive Services and the Provincial Officers of the Telegraph Department, are substantially more than those recommended by the Public Services Commission for those services?

(f) If so, will Government state the reasons for this differential treatment of the case of the Postal Superintendents?"

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes** replied :—

"(a) to (c) I would refer the Hon'ble Member to the answers given to the questions asked by the Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee on the same subject.

(f) The case of each service must be considered on its merits."

**The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi**  
asked :—

10. "(a) What is the approximate date on which it is proposed to bring the Dacca University Act into operation? The Dacca University.

(b) What arrangements are proposed to be made for the control and supervision of Intermediate Colleges within the territorial limits of the Dacca University?

(c) Is it contemplated to make provision for a Department of Sanskritic Studies?"

**The Hon'ble Mr. Shafi** replied :—

"(a) It is hoped that the Dacca University Act will be brought into operation next year.

(b) and (c) The Government of India have no information. The questions could be more conveniently put in the local Legislative Council."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde** asked :—

11. "(a) Have Government received any memorials dated the 29th May, 1919, and 26th June, 1920, regarding the protection and preservation of Indian cattle from the Mahishyas of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Chota Nagpur and Assam? Memorials from the Mahishyas community re. the preservation of Indian cattle.

(b) If the answer to (a) be in the affirmative what action has been taken or is contemplated with regard to the prayers contained in the said two memorials?"

[*His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief; Sir William Marriis.*] [14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]  
[*His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief; Sir William Marriis.*]

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied :—

" (a) Petitions dated 5th August 1919 and 15th June 1920 were received from a Mr. P. C. Sarkar, Assistant Secretary of the Bengal Mahishyas Association, praying for certain steps to be taken to deal with a decrease in the number of cattle in India. The Government of India are unable to refer to these petitions which were returned to the sender under the rules as they had not been submitted through the local Government.

(b) Mr. Sarkar was informed by letter of the policy which the Government of India are pursuing in the matter. For a statement of this policy the Hon'ble Member is referred to my reply to the question on this subject put by the Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Maandra Chandra Nandi. "

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde** asked :—

Contract with the Peninsula and Oriental Company.

12. "(a) Will Government lay on the table a copy of the existing mail contract with the Peninsula and Oriental Company, and state—

- (i) the amount borne by the Indian Exchequer of the mail subsidy, and
- (ii) the date on which the existing contract with the Company will expire?

(b) Will Government state approximately the ratio of the Indian passengers carried by the Peninsula and Oriental Company by their mail steamers to the total number of non-Indian passengers carried by them during the last two years?"

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes** replied :—

" (a) A copy\* of the existing mail contract with the P. & O. Company is placed on the table.

(a) (i) The share of the mail subsidy borne by the Indian Exchequer is Rs. 6,86,820 a year.

(a) (ii) The existing contract will expire on July 31st, 1922.

(b) It is regretted that no information on the point is available. "

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde** asked :—

Total strength of Indian troops employed abroad.

13. "(a) What is the total strength of Indian troops employed in Egypt, Palestine, Mesopotamia, Turkey and Persia, and when are they likely to return to India?

(b) Is India in any way responsible for the pay, pensions, allowances, etc., of Indian troops employed as mentioned above?"

**His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief** replied :—

" (a) It would be contrary to public policy to publish the number of Indian troops now serving in the countries named. Large reductions will have been effected by March 1921.

(b) The reply is in the negative. "

**The Hon'ble Mr. C. S. Khaparde** asked :—

Representation of Coorg in the new Legislative Council.

14. "Has the question of the representation of Coorg either by election or nomination in the Indian Legislative Assembly and the Council of State been considered, and if so, with what result?"

**The Hon'ble Sir William Marriis** replied :—

" It has been decided to provide, when necessary by nomination, for the representation in the Indian legislature of all the minor provinces except Delhi, to which an elected seat in the Legislative Assembly has been assigned. "

[14TH SEITE (BER, 1. 20)]

[Mr. G. S. Khaparde; Sir George Barnes;  
Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde asked:—**

15. "(a) Is it proposed to appoint a Committee to consider and report on the extent to which the existing excise regulations in the different provinces require amendment in view of the possibility of the manufacture of industrial alcohol on a large scale being taken up in the near future?" Excise Regulations.

(b) If the answer to (a) be in the affirmative, how many Indians, official and non-official, are to be placed on the said Committee?"

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes replied:—**

"(a) The reply is in the affirmative.

(b) The personnel of the Committee is given in the Press Communiqué issued on the 20th of August, a copy of which is laid on the table. It will be seen that no Indian official or non-official has been placed on the Committee in question. I may remark that in constituting this Committee the sole guiding principle was that it should be composed entirely of experts, i.e., of men selected by reason of their knowledge of a particular branch of the subject, and entitled to speak with authority on that branch."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde asked:—**

16. "(a) What action, if any, has been taken on the petition addressed to the Secretary of State by the Superintendents of Post Offices in February, 1920?" Memorial from Superintendents and Deputy Postmasters-General for increase of pay.

(b) What action, if any, has been taken on the petition submitted in May last by the Deputy Postmasters-General for an increase of their pay?"

(c) Has the attention of Government been drawn to a memorial addressed to His Excellency the Viceroy by the Superintendents of Post Offices expressing disappointment with the scale of pay recently sanctioned for them?"

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes replied:—**

"(a) These memorials were withheld on the ground that the Secretary of State had sanctioned a revised rate of pay for the officers in question.

(b) These memorials are at present under examination.

(c) Yes."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde asked:—**

17. "Is it a fact that the Postal Officers' Association has prayed for a reference of the question of pay of the Deputy Postmasters-General and Superintendents of Post Offices to the Postal Enquiry Committee now sitting? If so, is any enquiry into the conditions of pay of these officers by that or any other Committee contemplated?" Pay of Postal officials.

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes replied:—**

"The request was made, but it is not proposed to refer the question of the pay of these officers to the Postal Enquiry or any other Committee."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde asked:—**

18. "With reference to the answer given on the 20th August last to my question on the subject will Government be pleased to state their policy with regard to the slaughter of milch cows and agricultural cattle generally in British India?" Slaughter of milch cows and Agricultural Cattle.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma replied:—**

"The Hon'ble Member will see from a reply which I gave to the Hon'ble Maharaja of Kassimbazar that the Government of India have taken active measures for the preservation of cattle by encouraging and initiating schemes of

\*Not included in those Proceedings.

[*Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma*; *Mr. G. S. Khaparde*; *Mr. W. M. Hailey*; *Khan Sahib Shah Nawaz Bhutto*.]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920]

cattle-breeding. They directed a census of cattle to be taken throughout British India during the cold weather of 1919-20 and the figures from nearly all the Provinces which have just arrived are being scrutinized. A conference of representatives from the British Provinces and Indian States principally concerned has been convened to consider the question of fodder storage. The conference met at Simla in August and submitted its report, which is being considered by the Government. It will thus be seen that the Government of India have been taking active steps to ascertain facts with a view to remedial measures being taken and increase the cattle wealth of the country. They have no intention of associating themselves with any measures that may be deemed to encourage the slaughter of useful cattle or are likely unnecessarily to wound the religious feelings of the people. The Government propose to address the local Governments to consider what further steps, if any, may be taken to secure an increase of the cattle wealth of the country."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde** asked :—

Scale of pay recommended by the Public Services Commission for the Provincial Service.

19. "Are the scales of pay recently sanctioned for the Provincial Executive Service, the Provincial Telegraph Service, and the Enrolled Officers of the Finance Department and several other similarly recruited services, substantially in excess of those recommended by the Public Services Commission ?

(b) If so, will Government lay on the table a comparative statement showing the scales recommended by the Commission in regard to the said services and those ultimately sanctioned for them ?"

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey** replied :—

"(a) and (b) I lay on the table a statement\* showing the rates proposed by the Public Services Commission and those actually sanctioned for the various services in question."

**The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Shah Nawaz Bhutto** asked :—

Export of rice from Karachi.

20. "(a) Is it a fact that permits for the export of rice are auctioned by Government at Karachi ?

(b) If so, what profit has Government made by such auctioning ?

(c) Are Government aware that the method of auctioning such permits is regarded by the landed classes as imposing on them an additional and heavy taxation ?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied :—

"(a) Yes. In accordance with an announcement made in a Press Communiqué of the Government of India dated the 18th March 1920, licenses for the export of rice from Karachi to foreign destinations have since April last been sold by public auction. This system was discussed and approved at the 2nd meeting of the Select Committee on High Prices held on the 17th February 1920 at which the Hon'ble Member was present.

(b) A sum of Rs. 35,14,645-6-5 has been realised by Government from the auctions so far held on export allotments of 47,979 tons of rice from April to September inclusive.

(c) The Government of India have received complaints that the auction system in force at Karachi has adversely affected the zamindars in Sind, but I have nothing to add to the reply which was sent to the Hon'ble Member himself in answer to a letter which he addressed to my predecessor, Sir Thomas Holland, on the subject on the 8th May last, namely, that the Government of India are inclined to the view that this system, in so far as it tends to reduce prices, is to be welcomed."

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Khan Sahib Shah Nawaz Bhutto ; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

**The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Shah Nawaz Bhutto** asked :—

21. "(a) Is it a fact that out of one lakh tons of Sind rice assigned by Government for export outside India from last year's produce only 30,000 tons have been exported and the remaining quantity of 70,000 tons is still held up and has considerably deteriorated? <sup>Export of rice from Sind.</sup>

(b) Is it a fact that owing to the system of auctioning permits the license-holders enjoy a monopoly and that the local rates of rice have been brought down from Rs. 75 a kandy to Rs. 55, 50 and Rs. 48?

(c) Do Government propose to consider the desirability of removing the restrictions as soon as possible?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied :—

"(a) No specific quantity of Sind rice has been assigned by Government for export outside India. The total allotment of rice sanctioned from Karachi to foreign destinations from 1st January to end of September 1920 amounts to 56,395 tons.

The Government of India are aware that surplus stocks of Sind rice, alleged to amount to 70,000 tons, are said to be available in Sind for export. The question of finding an outlet for these stocks was recently discussed by me with a deputation of rice millers and merchants from Sind and the result of their enquiries in foreign markets is awaited. They were also informed that their representations on this subject would be taken into account when allotments are fixed for export during the quarter October to December 1920.

(b) It is a fact that the system in force at Karachi for the sale of export licenses by public auction does tend to confer a monopoly upon license-holders, and that the price of 'joshi' rice has thereby been reduced, from about Rs. 70 to about Rs. 48 per kandy. The views of the Government of India in regard to the reduction of the local prices of rice have already been explained to the Hon'ble Member in my replies to his previous questions on this subject.

(c) The Government of India cannot agree to the removal of the restrictions during next quarter but it is their policy to remove restrictions as soon as circumstances permit."

**The Hon'ble Khan Sahib Shah Nawaz Bhutto** asked :—

22. "(a) Are Government aware that there is a strong feeling among the landed classes that while all articles of foodstuffs, cloth and labour, have gone up three or four times the pre-war rates, the only produce they cultivate is subjected to control? <sup>Control system of foodstuffs.</sup>

(b) Are Government aware that the control system is keenly resented by the agricultural and merchant classes owing to the belief that it is adopted by Government merely in their own interest as well as in the interest of Government employees?

(c) Do Government propose to consider the desirability of removing the control system immediately?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** replied :—

"(a) Government are aware that control over export of foodstuffs is not to the interests of the landed classes, but they consider that it is justified in the interests of the consumers and of the country as a whole. They have reason to believe that public opinion, including that of some of the leaders amongst the landed classes, is in favour of the continuance of this control.

(b) The belief that the system was adopted by Government merely in their own interests and those of its employees is entirely unfounded.

(c) In reply to (c) I would refer the Hon'ble Member to the reply which I gave to a similar question put by him in regard to rice."

[*Mr. K. V. Rangaswami Aiyangar*; *Colonel W. D. Waghorn*; *Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khan*; *Sir William Vincent*] [14TH SEPTEMBER, 19.0.]

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswami Aiyangar asked :—**

Articles left  
by passengers  
in the  
Railway  
trains or  
stations.

23. "(a) Is it the present practice of railways to appropriate articles left behind by passengers in trains or stations?"

(b) If so, do Government propose to issue orders to all Railways and to the Police to take all possible steps to trace the owners of such articles?"

**The Hon'ble Colonel W. D. Waghorn replied :—**

"(a) and (b) The practice of railways is as follows :—

Endeavour is made by railway administrations to trace the owners of articles left behind by passengers in trains or at stations, but the success of these endeavours is in many cases dependent on the information given by those who have lost their property. It is plainly the duty of those who have lost property to claim it and to help the railway administration to trace it for them. Lost property for which no owner is found is kept for six months and then sold by public auction, of which previous notice is given by advertisement in the newspapers."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khan asked :—**

Release of  
the accused  
in the  
Krishnagar  
Dacoity  
case.

24. "(a) Will Government state whether the accused in the Krishnagar dacoity case will be released? Is it a fact that they have been brought to India from the Andamans, and are kept in Hyderabad (Sind) Jail? If so, why?"

(b) Is it a fact that they are not allowed to communicate with their families in Bengali and are much inconvenienced thereby?"

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent replied :—**

"(a) Presumably the Hon'ble Member refers to the accused convicted in the Pragpur-Khalipur dacoity case who were tried at Krishnagar. Of the four persons convicted in that case, one, namely Gopendra Lal Roy is being interviewed by a representative of the Bengal Government, and if his attitude is found to be satisfactory his sentence will be remitted. The other three persons are not being released as Government are not satisfied that this step would be compatible with the public safety. These prisoners have not been brought to India from the Andamans and kept in Hyderabad (Sind). Two of them, viz., Phani Bhusan Ray and Ashutosh Lahiri, are it is understood still in the Andamans, the third, Kshitish Chandra Sanjal, is in the Central Jail, Sabar-mati, Bombay Presidency, and the fourth, Gopendra Lal Roy, has recently been transferred from the Coimbatore Jail to the Alipore Central Jail.

(c) They are permitted to correspond with their relatives in Bengali."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khan asked :—**

The Provin-  
cial Execu-  
tive Service

25. "(a) Will Government place on the table a comparative statement showing the improvement in the pay and prospects of the Provincial Executive Service in the various provinces in India?"

(b) Why have different scales of pay been sanctioned for different provinces?"

(c) Is it a fact that in Bengal and Bihar the scale of pay is lower than in the Punjab and even in minor administrations like Assam and the Central Provinces? If so, why?"

(d) Do Government propose to consider the desirability of having a uniform scale of pay for the various provinces?"

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Sir William Vincent; Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khan; Mr. Srinivasa Sastri.*]

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent** replied :—

" (a) A comparative statement\* is laid on the table.

(b) The pay of provincial services is principally a question for the provinces themselves. They have accordingly been authorised to frame scales of pay subject to certain general limits and restrictions laid down by the Secretary of State.

(c) The Hon'ble Member is referred to the comparative statement\* laid on the table. The reason for provincial differences is explained in the answer to (b) above.

(d) Government do not propose a uniform scale of pay for the various provinces for the reason stated already."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khan** asked :—

26. "(a) Will Government state how many detenus in Bengal are not yet released? Release of detenus in Bengal.

(b) Is it a fact that Probodh Chandra Das Gupta has not been released? If so, why?"

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent** replied :—

" (a) There are at present 15 persons detained in Bengal under Regulation III of 1818.

(b) Probodh Chandra Das Gupta has not been released as Government are not yet satisfied that his release would be compatible with the public safety."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khan** asked :—

27. "(a) Has the attention of Government been drawn to a report of the Peshawar Khilafat Committee in connection with the death of two Mahajarins (Habibulla Khan and another) at Kacha Gari Railway Station as published in the *Tribune* of the 18th July last? Death of two Mahajarins at Kacha Gari Railway Station.

(b) Are Government aware that the said event has created a strong feeling in the minds of people?

(c) Have Government ordered any enquiry into the matter? If not, do Government propose to order an enquiry into the matter by a committee of officials and non-officials and publish the result of the enquiry at the earliest possible opportunity?"

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent** replied :—

" (a) Yes. One Muhajir only was killed.

(b) Yes.

(c) The District Magistrate has already held an inquest and the matter has also been the subject of a military court of enquiry. Orders have issued for the trial of Private Chilcott by court martial. No further enquiry is necessary."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Srinivasa Sastri** asked :—

28. "(a) Are temporary I. M. S. officers, who might be disabled by injury or disease when on field service, entitled to compensation? Compensation to disabled temporary I. M. S. officers.

(b) If so, in how many cases has it been awarded?"

\* Not included in these Proceedings.

[His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief; Mr. Srinivasa Sastri; Sir George Barnes; Mr. Rayaningar; Sir William Marris.] [14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

**His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief** replied :—

“(a) The reply is in the affirmative.

(b) Three cases.”

**The Hon'ble Mr. Srinivasa Sastri** asked :—

The Indian  
Telegraph  
service.

29. “(a) Is it a fact that the general scale of the Indian Telegraph service is now thrown open to Indians as well as non-Indians ?

(b) If so, when was the change made ?

(c) How many Indians have been admitted to the general scale, first by promotion from the lower ranks, and secondly, by direct recruitment ?”

**The Hon'ble Sir George Barnes** replied :—

“(a) and (b) It has always been the practice in exceptional cases to transfer Indians from the Local Service to the General Service. In April 1918, it was decided that 25 per cent. of future vacancies in the General Service should be filled by the promotion of Indians from the Local Service, this proportion to be raised subsequently when conditions permit.

(c) The number of Indians in the General Service on the 1st August 1920, was 193, all of whom were transferred from the Local Service. No direct recruitment of Indians to the General Service has yet been made, but 12 Indian probationers are now under training, and they will be appointed to the General Service as soon as they are qualified.”

**The Hon'ble Mr. Rama Rayaningar** asked :—

Estimated  
annual  
expenditure  
under  
the reformed  
constitution.

30. “(a) What is the estimated annual extra cost on the whole of the Central and Provincial administrations under the reformed constitution ?

(b) Do Government propose to consider the desirability of appointing Central and Provincial Committees of officials and non-officials to offer suggestions to the Central and Provincial Governments in what respects retrenchment of the cost of administration can be effected ?”

**The Hon'ble Sir William Marris** replied :—

“(a) As regards the extra cost of the reformed provincial administrations the Hon'ble Member is referred to the last sentence of the reply given to question No. 42, asked by the Hon'ble Maharaja Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi on March 17, 1920, which was as follows :—

“If, however, the reference is to the cost of the reformed provincial Governments as compared with that of the existing Provincial Governments, then the answer is that the amount of the additional expenditure which will be involved depends in part upon factors, some of which, e.g., the number of Ministers to be appointed, the salaries which may be voted for them by the Legislative Councils, and the consequential changes in headquarters offices and the cost of Council chambers, are not yet known, and cannot therefore be estimated at the present moment.”

Government are not yet in a position to add to this statement, nor can they furnish at present any detailed estimate of the extra expenditure to be incurred in connection with the administration of the central Government, since this too will depend on factors some of which e.g., the salaries of the President and Deputy President of the Legislative Assembly, the cost of travelling allowances for members of both chambers, and the cost of council chambers are not yet known.

(b) The appointment of provincial committees for the purpose suggested by the Hon'ble Member is a matter entirely within the discretion of the Provincial Governments. The appointment of a central committee would not in the



[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Sir William Morris; Mr. Rayanagar; Mr. W. M. Hailey; Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh Majithia; Sir William Vincent.*]

opinion of the Government be productive of any advantage, since the extra expenditure to be incurred is a direct consequence of the provisions of the Act, and can only be varied within very narrow limits. The Hon'ble Member may rest assured, however, that the Government are fully alive to the need for exercising economy not only in regard to expenditure in connection with the Reforms scheme, but also in regard to expenditure not directly affected thereby."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Rama Rayanagar** asked :—

31. "(a) Is it a fact that Guzerati, Marwari, Scindhi, Bhora, Khoja and Memon merchants, resident in Madras, carrying on business there, are required to submit to the Income-tax authorities their accounts in vernaculars other than their own or in English ?

Submission of accounts of certain merchants in Madras to the Income-tax Authorities.

(b) Have these merchants memorialised Government pointing out the hardship they are put to by the notification requiring them to submit accounts in languages they do not know ? If so, what steps have been taken to revoke the notification complained against ?"

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey** replied :—

"(a) The Government of Madras in exercise of the powers delegated to them under the Act, have ordered that when the production of accounts is required under section 18 (2) of the Act, and those accounts are not maintained either in English, Tamil, Telegu, Malayalam, Kanarese or Oriya, they shall be accompanied with a true translation in one or other of the named languages.

(b) Yes. The telegraphic memorial was referred for disposal to the Madras Government through whom it should have been submitted."

**The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sunder Singh Majithia** asked :—

32. "(a) Will Government make a statement showing the salaries drawn by Civil Assistant Surgeons on their first appointment in the different provinces of India ?

Pay and prospects of the Civil Assistant Surgeons in the Punjab.

(b) Are Government aware of the dissatisfaction prevailing amongst the Civil Assistant Surgeons owing to the smallness of their pay as compared with other services and to the fact that the high prices have equally hit this class of public servants ?

(c) Have the recommendations of the Royal Commission on Public Services been given effect to so far as Civil Assistant Surgeons are concerned ?

(d) Will Government state what steps, if any, they have taken to improve the pay and prospects of Civil Assistant Surgeons ?"

**The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent** replied :—

"(a), (b), (c) and (d) The pay of civil assistant surgeons on appointment is Rs. 100 a month in all Provinces, excepting the United Provinces and Burma, where it is Rs. 130 and Rs. 200 a month, respectively. Government believes that there is some dissatisfaction amongst this class of public servants and doubtless they are affected by the prevailing high prices like everybody else. The Government of India recognised this and accordingly telegraphed their proposals for the revision of the pay of these officers to the Secretary of State on the 16th July 1920. In making their recommendations the Government of India took into consideration the proposals of the Public Services Commission. The Secretary of State in a telegram of the 1st September 1920 has accepted the recommendations of the Government of India and orders have accordingly been issued to Local Governments. The pay of these officers is mainly a matter of provincial concern and therefore the exact rates of pay which will be sanctioned will be determined by the Local Governments concerned. I am glad to say, however, they will, however, be able to fix rates which will allow of a very substantial improvement in the pay of these officers."

[*The Vice-President ; Mr. G. S. Khaparde ;* [14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]  
*Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar ; Mr.*  
*A. P. Muddiman.]*

### THE CUTCHI MEMONS BILL.

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"In the absence of the Hon'ble Mr. Jaffer, I propose to hold over his presentation of the Report of the Select Committee on the Cutchi Memons Bill.

"The Council will now proceed with Resolutions."

### RESOLUTIONS.

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"In the absence of the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda, I call on the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde to move his Resolution No 4."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde:**—"I ask for permission to withdraw the Resolutions Nos. 4 and 5."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"No permission is required. The Hon'ble Member does not move the Resolutions."

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar:**—"I want to withdraw....."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"I cannot hear the Hon'ble Member."

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar:**—"There are grave reasons which I have explained in my letter....."

**The Hon'ble Mr. A. P. Muddiman:**—"Do you withdraw your Resolutions?"

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"The Hon'ble Member must either move his Resolutions or withdraw them. No other course is open to him."

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar:**—"I am not going to move them."

Resolutions Nos. 6 and 7 were withdrawn.

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President:**—"In the absence of the Hon'ble Mr. Jaffer, I call on the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde to move his Resolution No. 10."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde:**—"I withdraw that Resolution."†

11-20 A.M.

\*4. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that in view of the fact that India is now an original member of the League of Nations a Committee composed of the elected members of this Council be appointed to advise the Government of India on points that are or may hereafter be raised, and references that are or may hereafter be made, by the said League.'

5. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the Indian Delegates to the International Labour Conference to be held next year be elected either by this Council or by the Legislative Assembly, according as the one or the other is in existence at the time of the nomination and appointment of the said delegates.'

†6. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that an Indian Member be nominated to the Railway Board'

7. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council the preparation and introduction into this Council of a Bill as an enabling measure whereby, subject to suitable conditions, a proprietor of a landed estate in full and exclusive ownership thereof will be enabled to constitute it into an impartible estate descendible according to the essential principles of the law of primogeniture.'

†10. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that he may be pleased to submit for the consideration of the Secretary of State for India the opinion of this Council that the Indian Members of the Imperial and Provincial Executive Councils should be selected from the class of non-officials who have taken part in the public life of the country and are in touch with public feeling and sentiment, and that Indians in the service of Indian States should in no case be so appointed.'

[14TH 8 PTAMBER, 1920.]

[*Mr. Sachchidananda Sinha; Mr. Srinivasa Sastri; Dr. Sir Debaprasad Sarbadhikari; Sir Umar Hayat Khan.*]

**The Hon'ble Mr. Sachchidananda Sinha :—**"Sir, I withdraw the resolutions standing in my name."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Srinivasa Sastri :—**"Sir, I also withdraw my Resolutions."

**The Hon'ble Dr. Sir Debaprasad Sarbadhikari :—**"Sir, I had an opportunity of discussing matters with Colonel Waghorn and Sir George Barnes. I do not move the Resolution in view of the explanation they have been good enough to give."

### RESOLUTION RE FRANCHISE FOR DISCHARGED SOLDIERS.

**The Hon'ble Sir Umar Hayat Khan :—**"Sir, to comply with the H-35 a.m. rules I formally move the Resolution standing in my name."

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that he may be pleased to recommend to His Majesty's Government that all the discharged soldiers who have fought during the world war should be given the franchise for the period of ten years irrespective of the revenue and taxation they may be paying to the Government; and that the representatives they elect should be from amongst those who have taken part in the war.'

"While I was in England I came to know that the soldiers who had fought during the war and whose services were rewarded to a great extent by the introduction of the Reforms were not to get a vote. There was misunderstanding in various quarters that soldiers would be paying that amount of money as land revenue for which the standard has been fixed for franchise. I repudiated the idea and pointed out that most of those who pay the standard of revenue fixed for franchise will be those who had not taken part in the war while nearly all the soldiers would not be paying that amount and thus would not get franchise. This would have created a novel situation in the villages

\*11. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that early steps be taken to transfer to the Government of the Punjab, the administration of the Districts of Peshawar, Hazara, Kohat, Bannu and Dehra Ismail Khan from the North-West Frontier Province.'

\*12. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that he may be pleased to transmit to the Secretary of State for India the following expression of opinion of this Council:—That in making appointments of Indians as members of the Executive Council of the Governor General and also of that of the Governors of the various provinces, the Secretary of State should advise His Majesty the King-Emperor to confer these offices on non-official Indians who, while qualified by their education, ability and integrity duly to discharge, the duties appertaining thereto, may also be fully conversant with Indian public affairs and in intimate touch with the public life of the country or the province, as the case may be.'

\*13. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that a mixed committee of officials and non-officials be appointed to formulate a scheme for the early introduction of the separation of Judicial from Executive functions in the administration of criminal justice in the provinces known as Regulation provinces and in such non Regulation provinces or tracts as may be considered sufficiently advanced for the purpose.'

\*14. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that a mixed committee of non-officials and officials be appointed to formulate proposals for the early amendment of the Code of Criminal Procedure and any other adjective or substantive law which still sanctions any qualifications or disqualifications, in practice or procedure, founded merely upon race or nationality, and for the removal from the Indian Statute Book at once and completely every judicial qualification or disqualification which is based merely on race distinction.'

\*15. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that steps be taken without delay for the removal of all distinctions that exists in the Code of Criminal Procedure between classes of His Majesty's subjects on the ground of race or nationality.'

\*16. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that legislation be undertaken for extending to the whole of British India the remedy of *Habeas Corpus*, which is at present confined to the ordinary original civil jurisdiction of High Courts.'

\*17. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that Local Government may be empowered to grant loans on easy terms and money subsidies to societies formed on the lines of the English Public Utility Societies with a view to enable them to erect suitable dwelling houses for the poor in cities and towns.'

\*18. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that if control in the matter of allotment of wagons for coal be still considered necessary and desirable such control be entrusted to a Board or Committee consisting of representatives of the interests vitally concerned, viz., mining, industry and railways.'

[*Sir Umar Hayat Khan; Vice-President;*  
*Mr. G. S. Khaparde.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

as there would be people side by side with those having franchise who had taken no part in the war while the soldiers would not have possessed the privilege. I strongly represented the matter at the *India Office* and presented my written evidence to the *Joint Parliamentary Committee* in which I said :—

'I urge that those classes from which the Army is recruited ought to have something more as a proof that regard is due to them for their services during the war. This would also give them an impetus to render further good service when required. As the Army expects a special voice after rendering such faithful service to the Crown it should be given the franchise on a large scale, and should be allowed to elect their own representatives. The franchise was extended to soldiers of the other dominions, and also to the British. Similarly, the Indian Army should not be deprived of its well-earned right'.

"I also saw many Members of Parliament and asked their help in the matter. When I was coming back to India I had a mind to pursue the same course here and it was in the steamer that I wrote my questions and this Resolution. As Government very kindly gave satisfactory answers to my questions that the soldiers have got the franchise, one portion of my Resolution is met, and I heartily thank the authorities on behalf of the soldiers for their generous decision.

"As regards the other portion, I had in my mind that only those people could represent the soldiers better who had actually seen the work in the field and knew what a rough time they had had during the War. As it will be in the hands of the soldiers to choose their own men, I do not press this point.

"At the end I want to point out that as the authorities in England did not examine any representative of the martial classes and the masses and had examined only those representing a small fraction no wonder that such a representation was never properly advocated to them before.

"Now that the matter has been put right I again thank the Government and ask leave to withdraw the Resolution, but not in the manner that my other friends have done. I withdraw my Resolution because my points have been met."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President :—**"I understand the Hon'ble Member desires to withdraw his Resolution."

The resolution was by leave of the Council withdrawn.

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde :—**"I withdraw my Resolution" No. 20."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde :—**"I withdraw Resolution" No. 21."

**The Hon'ble the Vice-President :—**"In the absence of the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda, I call on the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde to move his Resolution" No. 23."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde :—**"I withdraw that Resolution. I withdraw my Resolution" No. 24 also."

\*20. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that steps be taken by legislation and otherwise to discourage and wherever practicable prevent, the slaughter of milch cows and agricultural cattle and their export out of British India.'

†21. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council, that he be pleased to move the Secretary of State for India to appoint a mixed Committee of Indians and Europeans to consider the reorganization of the Students Department in London and the Advisory Committees in India.'

‡22. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council the appointment of a Committee to examine and report on the creation of additional war and post-war establishments in the Secretariat and Subordinate Offices in the Government of India with a view to economy.'

§23. 'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that it is admissible to incorporate the Province of Coorg with the Presidency of Madras.'

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Mr. G. S. Khaparde.]

**RESOLUTION *RE* TROUBLES IN GOVERNMENT PRESSES.**

**The Hon'ble Mr. C. S. Khaparde:**—"Sir, the Resolution which I beg to move reads as follows:—

"This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council the appointment of a mixed Committee of officials and non-officials to investigate and report on the causes of the troubles in the Government presses in Simla, Delhi and Calcutta, and propose remedial measures."

"In moving this Resolution I should like to preface it with the remarks made by His Excellency the Viceroy when he opened the first meeting of this session of the Legislative Council. He said—

"The recent rise in the cost of living coupled with the growing consciousness of the workers has led to considerable industrial unrest. Among working men there is no little dissatisfaction with the conditions under which they live. So far, the chief manifestation of this unrest has been an epidemic of strikes in several parts of the country. I need hardly impress upon you the necessity of reducing strikes and lock-outs to a minimum."

"After a few sentences the next paragraph says—

"I would earnestly impress upon employers the necessity for sympathetic consideration of the claims of Labour. It has too often proved the case that employers, after a long and ruinous struggle, have been forced to concede claims that they might have allowed with honour and with profit as soon as they were presented. It too frequently happens that employers are in imperfect contact with those they employ, and are consequently unable to redress grievances that finally result in very serious disputes. Workers are beginning to demand not merely the right to live in comfort but a living interest in their work. This is a claim that must be taken seriously."

"These are the words which led me to frame my Resolution and to phrase it in the form in which I did.

"There is no doubt about the fact that there has been a rise in prices, and wages to-day are found to be inadequate. I believe that a month or two ago some sort of an allowance was given to the Press workers but that allowance has proved to be very inadequate.

"The last portion of His Excellency's speech referring to employers being in imperfect contact with those they employ is very important. It shows that employers must recognise the just claims of those whom they employ and they should combine and work together and organise Indian industry. It might be called a system somewhat on the lines of the system which obtains in England at the present time. Not exactly arbitration committees but what are called foremen of the steel works. The steel workers form themselves into a kind of a committee or union to look after and protect the interest of the employees. In view of certain circumstances into which I shall go later, I need not apologise to this honourable Council for bringing this matter before them, especially in view of the fact that something like 8,000 people in Calcutta alone are concerned and their representatives came to see me. There are about 1,000 more in Simla and an equal number in Delhi so there are over 10,000 people concerned in this matter.

"Now I should like to explain to the Council in some detail the nature of the work of the people who work in the Presses. Those in question are called piece-workers; that is to say that work is given to them in the morning by a person called the section-holder. He calls the piece-workers together and distributes the work among them for that particular day. The piece-workers are really contractors. They are paid according to a certain scale and according to the work they produce. That scale of pay was fixed a long time ago and I will deal with it hereafter. They are really not contractors because at the end of their service, if they work long enough, they get a pension and that pension is based on their average earnings for the last six years of their service. So that they are not contractors nor yet servants but something between the two. They are neither fish, nor flesh nor fowl but they are practically something in the nature of each. From this it will be seen that their position is somewhat anomalous—they do not know exactly where they are.

"There is another position which is anomalous and that is as to whether the recent trouble was a strike or a lock-out. It appears that something was

[*Mr. G. S. Kheparde.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

given to them in July which, for various reasons, did not fully satisfy them, but I do not think it is necessary for me to enter into that question now. They served a notice saying that they would not work from a certain day.

"On that day, before lunch time an order was issued. I have the original with me. It runs--

'Mr. Chatterjee authorises me to inform the compositors that Sir Thomas Holland will return to Simla on Sunday when their representations will be put before him. Mr. Chatterjee says that he will consider certain modifications of the resolutions which have been submitted by the Calcutta men.'

"This was given to them on Saturday morning. They went out for their lunch to think over the answer and to await the return of Sir Thomas Holland to Simla. By the time they returned from their lunch they found policemen there who prevented them from going in. It is interesting to note that their time had not expired and they had not given notice. They had not struck; they intended returning to work until the return of Sir Thomas Holland to Simla but they were turned out by the policemen. Do you call this a strike or a lock-out? It is a difficult question to answer, I think. They were willing to go back but were not permitted to do so.

"Now what is the system, I may say the peculiar system under which these compositors work? They assemble in the morning and the section-holder, as I believe I said before, distributes the work for the day. They have generally to compose papers or documents of some kind, which they send to the printers in order to get a proof which is given to the section-holder. The section-holder passes the proofs to readers who see if there are any mistakes and correct them if there are any. If there are any mistakes then another proof has to be made in order to correct those mistakes. When the corrected proof is ready it is sent to the section-holder and a copy sent to the compositor, who is sitting somewhere and wishes to see exactly what spaces are left.

"Of course the man who does the work has got an idea that he will earn so much and the other gentleman deducts this and that, and he computes it. All right, that computation business is done. Then it comes back to the section-holder again. Then the compositor is supposed to make out a bill and he says 'this man will be paid so much.' That finishes what is called fresh work or what we should call original work, that is new paper coming in to be printed. But there is another kind of paper that comes in, which is called author's work. That is a good name. It does not mean that the man has composed anything at all. It is only when a piece of paper has gone in, has been printed and is returned to be recorrected, sometimes a line to be taken out or some words to be put in, that is supposed to be the work of the author. After correction it has again to be distributed. This time it is not distributed so easily. The gentleman who distributes it sits down and says 'I divide you into twenty classes from 19 to 29. This is the number of the classes. In the first class, in the 19 class, a man gets four annas an hour; in the second class he gets 3 annas and it goes on reducing by infinitesimally small amounts, by fractions of pies until it reaches class No. 29. To the first class he says 'you will get four annas,' to the next class 'you will have three annas,' to another man 'you will have two annas' and so on, distributing work as he thinks best. Then again he goes through the same form of proofs being prepared and at last the work goes again to the compositor and he again looks at it and he says 'I will make this change.' The man says the work took one hour. The compositor says 'you may have taken one hour, but half an hour was necessary,' and he cuts down the bill. Ultimately the bill is made out, and after a great deal of talking some result is arrived at. It is not so easy to reach, for, in order to carry out his printing, the compositor has got to run continually to the storekeeper and say 'the types of T are wanting, and he gets the types of T. Then he runs and says 'give me types of U.' The compositor has to go backwards and forwards between the storekeeper and his own work, and in that way the work gets done. At the end of the day each man submits the amount of work he has done. These are

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Mr. G. S. Khoparde.]

put together at the end of each month and the pay of each man is made out and he gets this amount.

"This is really a cumulous kind of system. First of all it leaves too much in the hands of the compositor, the compositor and impositor. There is an impositor, though I do not know what the word really means. After going through all this trouble, some result is reached, and that something this man gets. The inconvenience of this system is that younger and more active people get a great deal more work and they earn more. As a man gets older he gets more efficient, I suppose, but his body is not so active as it was before. So a man begins to lose on the pay side, when he becomes very old he earns so little, that, ultimately, when he has got to retire and his six years' earnings are put together, they come to be much less than they were in his younger days, and in the evening of his life he gets very little indeed and is very sorry he took up service and got mixed up in this compositor's job. In old age a man expects to have a more comfortable life, but here things are entirely the other way round.

"Then, how is he paid? I see he is paid according to a book which is called a hand-book. I tried to get hold of a copy of it, but, I suppose, being a hand-book, it is rather rare. That hand-book is supposed to have fixed the rates as to how much a man is to get if he composes a whole page of the smaller type called 'pica' or some other type; each type has got a different scale for it. This book was prepared—the date cannot be exactly ascertained—but I am told it was some time in 1881 or thereabouts, and the scale has never been revised. It has been going on these 40 years, and one can easily understand that the rates of payments made in those days, in 1881, are not suitable now, and they cause a great deal of difficulty and heartburning. It is true that in July an attempt was made to give them a little more. They used to get sometimes Rs. 50 and that was increased by 25 or 20 or something of that kind. But these people complain that what was increased under this head has been taken away continually by these computers and impositors.

"As I have endeavoured to show, this was not originally the system. Originally, they were all servants and, as in other private presses, these people served for so much money, and there the matter ended. I suppose that occasionally they got a little rise or promotion, or something of that kind. This was originally so. In 1881 this new system of piece-work, as it is called, was introduced. Originally they were Government servants and they got what they usually get. In 1881 this new system of piece-work was introduced and this piece-work system has been working since, during the last 40 years. I enquired if there were any strikes and I am glad to hear there were none except one which was an incipient kind of thing and soon ended. That was about 17 years ago, in 1905 or thereabouts. These press people then felt dissatisfied and they were thinking of striking. Then the Superintendent or gentleman in charge came to hear of it, he spoke to them, and the matter ended there. This is practically the first time such a situation has arisen. As I said, it is not a strike, but a lock-out because they were turned out without previous notice and without being told that they would be turned out. A lock-out means 'either you conform to these conditions or I shall not employ you hereafter.' None of these conditions were complied with and something happened. In place of this complicated system which is rather unworkable, I propose that these people should be all converted into Government servants and like all other Government servants they should get their pay, their promotions, their allowances and whatever else they may be entitled to. This proposal appears to have been put forward by my friend Mr. Chakravarti for the people in Bengal. To that the answer made by the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland was that there were no data on which their pays could be fixed, and until such data were ascertained, no pays could be fixed. My reply to that is that the data are supplied by what they get every month. You ultimately calculate their pensions on their six years' last earnings. Why cannot you calculate their pays upon what they have been earning up to this time? Give them that pay plus whatever allowances you ought to give them for dearness of food, money troubles and so forth. You can start them on that to-day as much as at any other time.

[Mr. G. S. Khaparde.]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

"The argument that there are no data on which you can fix their pay does not sound to me in the least convincing. It appears to me that there are data in the office and you can fix their pay accordingly. The advantages of giving them this would be that their pays would be regularised and they would not be liable to the Irish promotion that they get now. When a man is played out and begins to get old and feeble he gets less and less, his pay gradually tapering off until he is told to go home with nothing at all ! This kind of Irish promotion is neither reasonable nor desirable. Then, if these men get into service, I suppose they will get some kind of leave, sick leave or other kind of leave, such as other Government servants are entitled to.

"Then there is another thing. We know that within the last 10 years and more the pays of many establishments have been revised because of the dearness of grain and so on. Now the scale which was fixed in 1881 for these unfortunate people has never been revised at all ; while the fines and cliques to which I have referred are perhaps going on faster. A system of such intricacy, some portion of the men being paid according to time others according to piece-work and a third portion according to a third way, will be done away with under my proposals.

"There is further at present a great deal of heartburning that necessarily arises from the present system under which a section-holder, who has to distribute the work, may give one man work of an easy kind while he gives another man more difficult work, such as a manuscript that is illegible. No man can being could carry out the section-holder's duties without laying himself open to some such charge. As human nature is human nature, I suppose, we all like some people better than others. Similarly, the work of composition, deductions and other things which it involves, also give rise to a large number of complaints. I do not like to mention all these complaints, but there is at present a tremendous amount of heartburning and complaints of favouritism and all that.

"Now all this will be taken away if you convert them into regular establishments, paying them on the basis of their average earnings. I have tried to do this on paper—of course in a rough way because I have not got all the figures and papers with me—and I have found that you could make a saving of Rs. 2,304-2-8, or roughly speaking Rs. 2,400 a month on the existing system. You would effect that saving if you put them on pay and all these superfluous people, assistants and sub-assistants, were taken away. In my own rough way, again I found that something like Rs. 6,000 or Rs. 7,500 are spent upon these compositors. If you put them on pay, that figure will be increased by about Rs. 1,000 or Rs. 1,500 or liberally speaking, even Rs. 2,000. But you will save another Rs. 2,000, as I have shown, on the other side ; so Government stands to lose nothing and to have a more efficient and contented service. The establishment would also be considerably reduced. Where you now have 15 section-holders you could do with 7, because each man would have his work cut out for him ; and similarly all the other establishment would be reduced by half. That is where the saving comes in. There are other directions too in which you could save, of which the men spoke to me but I have not put them down. They seemed to think that some of the superior staff, who get large pays, could be dispensed with. If those people go, there will be still greater saving. So taken altogether, I think that if we introduce the pay system, engaging the men as servants and paying them so much a month, it will be easier and cheaper, and I believe the work turned out also will be better ; whereas the present system is too complicated and troublesome. We see in the Government itself here that all presses are not managed on this piece-work system. For instance, the Private Secretary's Press and the Foreign Office Press are on the pay system and are fully paid, getting leave and other allowances like all ordinary servants of Government. Free quarters are given to them in Simla, whereas these piece-workers in the Central Government Press, get no quarters. Why is that ? Why these people, the Private Secretary's Press and the Foreign Office Press, get quarters I understand is because their work is not regular at all. They have to wait a long time and then they get a little work to do, then they wait again for some more work, and so on. There is not enough, it seems, to occupy them the whole day, though they have to attend all day, and therefore they are kept on pay and quarters are provided for them, their



[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Mr. G. S. Khaparde; Sir Thomas Holland.]

work being so irregular. But these unfortunate men of the Central Press have to suffer because their work is more regular. They have to do a great deal more, yet they get no free quarters, no fixed pay, and what little they do get is liable to be cut and clipped in the way I have explained. This seems to me rather hard. What do people who have private printing presses do? They keep their men on by the month, giving them so much a month. It is this Government alone, and only in the Central Press, that all these complications are allowed to come in. I could get no explanation of this state of things and I have not been able to imagine one; but probably there is some good explanation forthcoming. But there the thing stands. There is a complicated system, a system under which a man is not sure what he will get; somebody interferes to reduce it; he complains and he finds it difficult to have his complaint attended to because nobody likes to be bothered. My Hon'ble friend on my right, the Hon'ble Babu Surendra Nath Banerjee, keeps a large press and is at the head of a large newspaper. He probably knows more than I do; but these private people have always kept paid servants and carried on their work in that way. Government also does the same thing. I have enquired and found that the Punjab Government does the same. When they go to the hills, the Punjab Government give their men *plus* allowances. I have also found out that the United Provinces Government, when it moves up to the hills, converts all its pressmen into so many servants and pays them so much a month. So it is only these unfortunate people of the Central Press that have to be in the hills and yet are paid on this peculiar piece-work system. I hope I have made it clear that there is this trouble and this difficulty to be met. That is the reason I have moved this Resolution. It is a modest Resolution. I only say kindly appoint a small committee to go into all these matters. I am not qualified to judge of it, but those two or three gentlemen whom this honourable House appoints will be able to go into the whole matter, into all these complaints. There are also other complaints of which I have said nothing here because they will take time and are probably difficult to substantiate. But there are other complaints, and all these complaints will be looked into by the committee who will devise remedial measures. If they decide to convert the pressmen into so many Government servants, paying them what on an average they have been earning up to this time, *plus* allowances for the hills, the thing can be done in no time at all. There will be no difficulty on that head. So my proposal is that a mixed committee of officials and non-officials be appointed to investigate and report on the causes of the troubles—I call it 'troubles,' I do not call it a 'strike' because it is not a lock-out and therefore I describe it by the non-committal name of 'troubles' in the Government presses in Simla, Delhi and Calcutta, and propose remedial measures.

"With these words I submit this Resolution for the acceptance of this honourable Council."

**The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland:**—"Sir, my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Khaparde, has described a strike that he says is not exactly a strike and he has described a lock-out that is not exactly a lock-out. I congratulate him on also demonstrating a form of non-co-operation in this Council that is not entirely non-co-operation. I am perfectly sure that Hon'ble Members will now be quite clear about the operations of a large Government Press. I am very much obliged to Mr. Khaparde for explaining the details in such picturesque language. The only fault that I have to find with the picture is that it does not exactly agree with the photograph I have brought away myself. Now, Mr. Khaparde has given his impressions as to the cause of the troubles in the press and it might assist the Council if they were provided at the same time with some other relevant facts. Some of the figures which Mr. Khaparde gave are not exactly those that we have at our disposal. I am correct, I think, in remembering that he spoke of 12,000 piece-workers as on strike. Our numbers in the Government of India Presses amount to about 2,000, many of whom are already back. Now, I am afraid, Sir, that the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde in dealing with some of the facts and figures he has been provided with has been what one might say in the vernacular talking through his head-dress! It was the intention of Sir George Barnes to institute, as soon as possible a

12-10 P.M.

[*Sir Thomas Holland.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

systematic revision of the pay of the piece-workers, for it is the piece-workers we are considering—it is not the salaried men who are out on strike except a very few sympathisers—but the piece-workers ; and when I became responsible for the administration of this department this was one of the first questions that was taken up. It was soon evident that many of the men had been working unduly long hours, presumably because they could not otherwise earn sufficient wages. It was obvious also that the burden of work was unequally and unfairly distributed, as Mr. Khaparde has so graphically described, in such a way that some of the men were suffering possible damage to their health and consequent harm to their dependent families. Every grievance brought to our notice was most minutely examined ; we have not been content with the reports of the press Superintendents and of the Controller, but we have deliberately encouraged the men to bring their grievances direct during our visits to the presses as well as out of office hours. I have myself seen the men at work and discussed their grievances at numbers of interviews. In fact, many of my Sundays during the past three months have been devoted to this work. My colleague, Mr. Chatterjee, has been equally accessible, whilst a considerable portion of the office staff have devoted more time to this question than would be practicable in ordinary cases. We have analysed every petition closely ; we have examined the conditions of each class in consultation with the Financial Adviser ; and we have been freely accessible to the men's legal representatives as well as to the men themselves. Altogether this question has deliberately been made an object lesson of intensive study, not only out of sympathy for the men immediately concerned, but because of the new spirit regarding labour, which the most enlightened employers in India now recognise to be both fair and commercially wise.

“ Further ‘chewing of the cud’ by a new committee will not benefit the men ; what we want is an actual practical test of the revised rates of pay and of the new conditions of work. Some of the men, however, have imbibed the spirit of other visionaries and have adopted the gospel of non-co-operation. We tried to explain to the men verbally and by circular that whilst going on strike against a private firm might sometimes secure immediate commercial advantages, striking against Government would only prevent our helping them. The loss of wages would be entirely their own ; for Government printing is a luxury intended for the convenience of the general public ; it brings no revenue. No further discussion of the piece rates can get beyond our own calculations, which show clearly the number of hours actually worked by the men last year and the increased wages they will receive if they work at the same rate (though for fewer hours) in the future. I have told the men repeatedly that if the terms sanctioned in the Government Resolution of the 15th of July do not demonstrate that they would get higher wages for shorter hours of work I would tear up the Government Resolution, and that I would revise the rates and again revise them until the men could demonstrate that they are able with these terms to earn a decent living by working during decent hours. I have told the men also that I will review their pay-sheets month by month in order that we may have an exact idea of the effect of the new piece-rates.

“ As an example of the many misleading statements supplied by some of the politicians who have done the talking at meetings of the strikers, one speaker told the Calcutta strikers that Sir Thomas Holland had persuaded the Simla press-workers to give the new system a trial for a month, and accordingly these men worked for a month, but now they had found out that under the present system their earnings would be less than what they were before. The Simla piece-workers did work for the best of a month, and any Hon'ble Member here is at liberty to satisfy himself by reference to the pay sheets that this statement supplied to the strikers at Calcutta is nothing less than an unqualified lie—a lie disseminated by an irresponsible politician who loses nothing by the strike whilst the poor men who were deluded by it have lost their wages and will continue to do so as long as they are out on strike. Now, although we have a certain number of discontented individuals among the Simla workers, the men as a whole stuck fairly to work for nearly a month, when the agitators, assisted by delegates from Calcutta and Delhi (realising that if the men completed a full month at the new rates they would merely demonstrate their advantages and so destroy the possibility of being

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Sir Thomas Holland.*]

put on fixed salaries) persuaded the men to come out on strike. Mr. Khaparde has described the incidents of the strike in Simla, but the order of events as told by him is not exactly the order of events as they are according to our records. The men gave their first notice on the 10th of August, returning the Resolution, and as they said, refusing it with thanks. They were asked on the 11th of August to wait until my return from tour; they answered that on the 12th of August by demanding the result within 24 hours; (the period counting from the 12th August) and 'if unfortunately we are disappointed, again, we will be forced to stop our work just after the expiry of the period of our notice mentioned above,' that is, the 13th morning. Now, no man has been prohibited from coming to work. What we do not want in the press are men who will not only stand idle themselves but will interfere with other people's work. The men who came back to the press were the men who promised to work; and every man who promised to work here or at Delhi or at Calcutta has been allowed to come in.

"Let us now take the results obtained during that month. Let us see whether this statement made in Calcutta is true or not. There are a few days missing, but the men worked until nearly the end of the month. The month began on the 15th July and would have ended on the 15th of August. The men struck on the 12th, or gave notice on the 12th and stopped work on the 13th. There were thus two definite days missing and there were one or two other days missing because of a certain amount of time wasted in meetings and agitation in the press.

"The compositors affected in Simla number 160. During July-August, that is under the new rates, these men put in a total of 34,445 hours and they earned at the new rates Rs. 9,948. During the preceding full month of June-July the same men worked a total of 32,217 hours, and earned under the old rates Rs. 7,517 including the war allowance of approximately 35 per cent. of their original wages.

"The average wages earned per man in June-July was, thus, Rs. 47; whilst the average earned in the partially completed month following at the new rates was Rs. 62. This is an immediate rise of 32 per cent. on the *actual* earnings; but the comparison would not be fair to the men unless we compared also the number of hours actually worked. It will be noticed that in the second month the total hours of work recorded are more than in the month before. This is partly due—and this is a point to which Mr. Khaparde has referred very briefly—to an important reform introduced by the Government Resolution, namely, that the piece-workers are to be paid at their standard time rates if, for any accident in the flow of work, they are not kept in full employment during factory hours. These idle hours are now included in each man's total.

"If, now, we compare the average earnings, hour by hour, we find that under the old system the men earned 3.73 annas an hour, whilst at the new rates their earnings have amounted to 4.62 annas an hour, or an average rise of 24 per cent. for all classes—good and bad.

"One of the objectionable features of the old system was the fact that some of the men worked excessively long hours—often 11 and 12, sometimes even over 13, hours a day for long periods. Obviously, this could not be good for a man's health, physical or mental; and one object of the Government Resolution was to make this both impossible and unnecessary. The Washington Labour Conference laid down for India a standard 60-hour week, or 10-hour day. If, then, we give a man five or six days' holiday during the month, he would put in 250 hours in 25 days. Our object in drawing up the new rates was to enable any man to earn in 250 hours an income suitable to his class of life.

"If, again, we take these two consecutive months (one under the old rates and the nearly completed month under the new rates) we find that, according to the hourly rate actually earned, a compositor working 250 hours at the old rate would obtain an average monthly pay of Rs. 58.3 and at the new rates Rs. 72.2.

"But the average increase of earnings which has now been definitely proved in actual practice, by no means expresses the full advantages that have been obtained by the new scale of rates. The figures which I have quoted for the Simla compositors apply to all classes—good and bad, experienced men and learners.

[*Sir Thomas Holland.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

"One advantage of the piece-rate system is that we obtain, automatically, an annual classification of the workers for the purpose of establishing their hour-rates, the rates at which they are paid when correcting proof, or when, for any chance, under the new system they are accidentally kept idle during factory hours. This system of checking a man's piece-work every year puts him in his place automatically, not by favouritism.

"Our compositors range from beginners in Class 29 to the best workers in Class 19. Now, out of 160 compositors here, 33 of them are in Class 19, and it is especially in this class that individuals worked excessive hours under the old system. In June-July 13 of these 33 men exceeded the 250-hour standard limit by a total of 318 hours: one man worked as much as 308 hours. Under the new system only five of these men passed this standard limit, and by a total between them of only 15 hours, due to their remaining on occasionally to complete partially finished jobs.

"These 33 men put in 7,785 hours in June-July, and earned a total pay, including war allowance of Rs. 2,453. In July-August under the new system, exactly the same men put in 7,693 hours for a pay of Rs. 3,266. I have taken care to remove all men who did not work both months, so as to have an exact comparison. In other words, they worked 182 hours less for an increased income of Rs. 783, and, at the same time, no individual man was over-worked. Thus, on the 250-hour basis these men earned an average of Rs. 80 under the old system and Rs. 107 under the new system—an average rise of 34 per cent. It will be seen, therefore, that, although every class of compositor, without exception, obtained an increase, the best workers obtained the best results, and by the piece-rate system every worker can hope to attain to the best class without promotion by favouritism, which we are told is the characteristic of Government service. There is therefore no doubt that this system is an advantage to the real worker.

"It is important to note (1) that these percentage increases are on the war rates, not pre-war rates; (2) that exactly the same men have been compared in two successive months, for I have cut out the few who did not work in both months; and (3) that these are not mere calculations but are actual wages earned, and, in spite of statements to the contrary, wages actually paid to the men.

"But, whilst the men as a whole have obtained an increase of 24 per cent. and the best class has obtained an increase of 34 per cent, it is important to be sure that no individual is required to work over long hours for the sake of an increased income: this, obviously would not pay any man in the long run. I referred to one man, for instance, who put in 308 hours in June-July, and, so, must have worked over 12 hours a day on 23 working days; for this he received Rs. 94.

"In July-August, the same man put in only 255 hours i.e., slightly over 10 hours a day, and he then earned Rs. 112. He thus received Rs. 18 more for 53 hours less work. Another man put in 280 hours, or over 11 hours a day, and received Rs. 110 in June-July, whilst the same man put in 251 hours in July-August, when his income jumped up to Rs. 135. Almost exactly the same result was obtained by another man who put in 280 hours for Rs. 118 in June-July, whilst in July-August he worked 249 hours for Rs. 135. Only one man out of the whole lot earned less under the new system; but, as he happens to be more of a politician than a compositor, he has now the compensating satisfaction of seeing his fellow-workers wasting their savings whilst out on strike.

"It will be stated, of course, that the experiment has been tried only in Simla, where the sanctioned rise in rates has been 50 per cent, whilst the sanctioned rise for Calcutta and Delhi is only 40 per cent. This difference was adopted because of the estimated differences in the cost of living at Simla, and we hope in the near future, by the construction of quarters for the men, to remove them from the clutches of profiteering landlords.

"As to whether the new rates (which have now been proved in actual practice to be so advantageous in Simla) will be advantageous also to the men in Calcutta and Delhi, we have worked out the average monthly earnings per head for the men in each press during the full year 1919-1920 and have calculated the men's average incomes from the hour-rates so obtained. We know exactly the number of hours worked by each man, the amount of money paid to each man, and we can work out the new rate for exactly the same number of hours of work in

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Sir Thomas Holland.]

the next year. But we have gone further than that. We have reduced the number of hours, so that the men will work within decent limits and we have estimated his future income for 250 hours per month. Last year, in Calcutta, the men actually put in on average as much as 275 hours a month, and for that they earned an average of Rs. 53-9-0 a month. Under the new rates they will obtain just a little over Rs. 60, not for 280 hours but for 250 hours a month. I have said that the men will earn *at least* Rs. 60; almost exactly the same results were obtained in Delhi, and I say *at least* advisedly and for good reason, for this calculation does not include the amount that the men will be paid for hours during which they remain idle for lack of piece work. These idle hours were never paid for before. The rise in the average pay at Calcutta will also be greater than is shown by these actual calculations. But we want especially the men to realise that they can earn this income (which I think is fair and which compares very favourably indeed with the rates paid to compositors elsewhere) during decent hours work and that they need not work overtime in order to get higher wages.

"Now let us take the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde's suggested salary system. What salaries would be fair for each class? Let us try to work it out. Take Class 19 at Simla. They earned under the improved rates an average of Rs. 107 in the month. They earned that by piece work; that was not their salary, and they earned it in 250 hours in the month. Now suppose we assumed Rs. 107 a month to be a fair salary for a man of that class. That salary would be nearly double that earned by good compositors anywhere else in India. Out of the 33 men who earned this average of Rs. 107, there were 15 whose wages in July-August ranged from 110 to Rs. 135. Now naturally these 15 men would have a grievance if their incomes were cut down to Rs. 107, which is the average salary of their class, and it is not unnatural to expect that they would feel justified in slacking off to some extent. If, then, Rs. 107 is now the average value of these men to the tax-payers, and nearly a half of them slacked off to Rs. 107 level, the average of the whole must be something less than Rs. 107; and, if then the salary be placed below Rs. 107, there will still be a larger number of men who will regard it as fair to slack off. In other words, the average value of the class will soon tend to depreciate to the value of the least efficient in the whole lot. That will be the result of the salary system. It is quite obvious that, if we place the majority of these men on a salary less than their average earnings, there will always be a majority who will be discontented and who will presumably go on strike again. What guarantee have we got that they will not go on strike again?

"The lesson which we have learnt from the Simla piece-workers is not that they should be put on fixed salaries, but that the system of piece-working ought rather to be extended. I agree entirely with one of the political speakers at a Calcutta strike meeting, when he said that he would like to see the result of paying all Government officials—from Governors down—at piece rates. In the interests of the tax-payers this reform would be desirable if practicable; and, for selfish reasons, I should like to see it extended to Members of the Executive Council.

"Now I should like to know from those Hon'ble Members who use the press for political warfare, whether they pay their average, or even their best compositors, Rs. 72 a month; for that is the average pay actually earned last month by the Simla men who are now out on strike, and these men, if their breach of service be condoned, will be eligible also for a pension calculated on their average earnings for the last three years of their service, and this is a privilege which men in private presses do not enjoy. Our information shows that in Calcutta the principal private firms pay their compositors from Rs. 20 to Rs. 65. That is about the average range. If, therefore, we placed these men on fixed salaries, and, with due regard to the tax-payers, at current market rates, these men would lose seriously. But are we justified in paying the men at higher rates than the average market rates? It does not require very much imagination, I think, to realise the difference between the speed of a compositor's hand at piece rates and on fixed salary. This is one way of handling a type and that is the other. The difference is about 100 per cent. We should have to double our compositors, we should have to increase the supervising staff, double our building accommodation and double our capital outlay on type-metal, while you will get less work done and the tax-payer's money would be wasted.

"Now the rates for piece work require constant revision. That is really the whole point. The rate, not the system, is the point to watch and to revise.

[*Sir Thomas Holland.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

We want to know whether a man can earn a decent wage without over-working himself? That we have proved to be the case by the experiment in Simla, but to abandon a system which encourages every man to be industrious and efficient, and secures for every efficient man a corresponding reward, would be a backward step which will not be favoured so long as I am responsible to the Indian tax-payers. The piece-rate for compositors has been maintained in Government presses, not since 1881, but since 1875.

"It is also the custom in large presses elsewhere except in what are known as jobbing presses and in form printing, where the nature of the work is too variable, to permit of a fair average rate. In small presses like some of the private presses in this country they have the salary system, as Mr. Khaparde has told us, but so long as I can show, by actual work that the men can earn better salaries and still return value to the tax-payer on the piece-work system, that system will not be altered.

"I have dealt at some length with the piece-work rates, but it is only fair to mention that there are other improvements introduced by Government and I will pass over these very briefly.

"Men on the temporary list who have put in continuous service will, under the new system, be allowed to count all their service towards pension.

"Then, as I said before, we have also allowed meal hours to be counted and to be paid for at time-scale rates.

"We propose to introduce a provident fund for new employees that will replace the pension system, thus enabling the men to obtain this form of deferred pay whenever they leave the service, enabling them also to leave something for their families, because naturally a pension dies with the pensioner.

"Then, to meet the individual grievances that may occur—and there must be many particulars we cannot get hold of, for instance, their hours of attendance, whether it be from 7 to 5 or from a later hour to a later hour; their treatment by supervisors; and the many troubles of that kind when the new shoe pinches unequally. To meet these troubles we have established a system of Works Committees which will be composed of representatives of all classes. The complaints that are heard by these Committees and their proceedings will be reviewed by my Department methodically. We are sure that these Committees will not only reveal and rectify grievances if they occur but, what is much more important, their institution will prevent grievances that would otherwise occur.

"Now I want to say one final word about the strikers. We quite recognised that before the terms were revised the men had real grievances and had developed a strike habit of mind. They failed to realise that their grievances would be repaired. They had been waiting a long time and they thought that the strike was a fashionable instrument. This mental attitude, one can quite understand, might become fixed in men who are not sufficiently educated to realise what it really means. It doubtless has been fostered by irresponsible agitators who have shown that same callous disregard of the men's interests, as those agitators who, taking care to save their own skins, sent many thousands of honest Moslems to their ruin by encouraging them to sell their lands and goods at knock-down prices in order that they might emigrate to 'a land flowing with milk and honey,' where officials cease from troubling and where at least the dead may rest.

"My sympathies are still with the strikers and with their families. Nothing has been done so far to prevent or to discourage their return. The wages of the strikers have been paid in full. Those who have returned to work have been admitted and no penalties of any sort have been inflicted. I have so far definitely refused to issue any orders of dismissal, in order that no man shall lose his chance of being restored to the pension list, and at Delhi, where the men occupy Government quarters, not a single striker has been evicted. But I really cannot help men who are impressed by those agitators who find a genetic relationship between Jallianwala Bagh and the new piece-rates, or those who see a similarity between my promises and those attributed to Mr. Lloyd George regarding Turkey.

"We have, however, obtained some very useful lessons by the strike; Government Departments have learnt to economise; they have learnt to reduce their demands for printing; they have found that they can get many odd jobs

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Sir Thomas Holland ; Mr. A. R. Murray.*]

done by private presses and we have pushed on our scheme for machine printing which will reduce our necessity for the ordinary compositor, and therefore for the piece-worker.

"I see no chance of any committee of this Council devoting to the press questions either a half or a quarter of the time that my colleagues and I have given to the subject. I have no desire to feed the men any longer with false hopes and I have no intention whatever of giving up the healthy and inspiring piece-rate system for the sleepy security of fixed salaries ; only actual work will prove whether these new rates are fair. If the men will come back and work under the new rates, we shall be able to help them, but we can help no man who remains out on strike.

"There is one more point I should like to mention and that is that our office records are available to the Hon'ble mover of this Resolution, as he well knows and to any other Hon'ble Member who wishes to advise the press-workers in their real interests. The only work for a committee that I can suggest is an enquiry into the motives of those who have fed a body of honest workers with false insinuations and misleading statements. Nevertheless, I welcome this opportunity of explaining to the Council the exact facts as we know them with regard to the strikers and I shall be only too glad to welcome the intervention of the Hon'ble Member for the purpose of getting the men to return to work for their own sakes."

**The Hon'ble Mr. A. R. Murray:**—"Sir, I rise to oppose this Resolution. 12-49 PM.

"There may be differences of opinion as to the causes of the prolongation of the troubles in the Government presses, but after listening to the explanation of the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland I am of the opinion they are not such, as to justify the appointment of a committee to investigate them.

"The Resolution of the Government of India to which Sir Thomas has referred, gives a very full and detailed account of what the position was when the strikes commenced. I do not think the appointment of a committee will throw any more light on that stage of the proceedings. Different causes of the troubles and of the continuation of the troubles have been freely given in the newspapers. One thing is quite clear, namely, that the men went on strike after revised emoluments had been notified by the Government of India. And that, too, in spite of the fact that considerable improvements had been effected in the wages, as well as in prospects, pensions, etc., of the men both salaried and piece workers. I understand it is practically the piece workers alone who have struck work because they object to the continuation of the piece system. The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland has already dealt with the details and I need not follow him into these details, but I would like to refer in general terms to the subject matter of this Resolution as it appears to me. So far as I understand it, the whole crux of the position is—should the Government of India give way on the question of the piece work system? This seems to me an unprecedented demand for workers in India to make, specially in view of the fact that the piece work system is in vogue in all organised industries in most parts of the world, as well as in India. Payment by piece work is recognised, and in my opinion, rightly recognised, as the best method of paying skilled workers that has yet been devised. When rates are framed on a fair basis, they form an incentive to workers to do their best. A keen and steady worker reaps the reward of his industry, and the system of bonuses, that is usually included in this method of payment, offers an additional inducement to everybody to give of their best.

"The chief objection, indeed, the only real objection, in other countries to the system of piece work, is the fact that when good workers have earned wages above the average, masters have been known to reduce the piece work rates in order to bring back the skilled and industrious worker to the level of his less skilled and usually lazier companions. This was, and is, a very wrong thing to do; and if I were a skilled worker, I certainly would object to being paid by piece work if my piece work rates were to be reduced because I was producing more work and earning more wages than my neighbours.

"Speaking from a long experience of Indian industries, I have never heard of any employers in India reducing the piece work wages because any worker was earning too much. I know that all the skilled workers, for instance, in the

[*Mr. A. R. Murray*; *Sardar Sunder Singh Majithia*.]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

Jute Mills in Calcutta where about 300,000 workers are employed, are paid by piece work. As they have become more skilled, they have gone on drawing larger earnings, but I have never heard of a single instance in which wages have been reduced.

"Perhaps, my Indian friends will excuse me if I tell them that the average Indian worker is not yet as skilled as his Western competitor in certain industries. It is only by giving the Indian worker an incentive to earn higher wages for himself that he will be induced to increase his output and raise the Indian standard of production nearer the Western level. This is where payment by piece work comes in, and I fear nobody would be better pleased to hear of the end of the piece work system in India than would workers in other countries. These foreign workers know that so long as our Indian workers are paid by piece work, there is every likelihood of their exerting themselves to become more skilled in order to earn higher wages. Immediately you stop the piece work system and put all Indian workers on a common level, the foreign competitors will then know that there is no longer anything to be feared from Indian competition.

"Now as to the appointment of a committee of enquiry, I do not see what object is to be served by this. It is true that the English Industrial Courts Act of 1919 makes provision for courts of enquiry being established to investigate strikes and labour troubles at home, but I would point out that these courts of enquiry are constituted in the United Kingdom mainly for the purpose of ascertaining and publishing the facts, and thereby influencing the parties to settle their differences in accordance with public opinion as expressed in the newspapers and in the street. India is not yet ripe for courts of enquiry of this description, and even if it were, I personally would strongly object to the introduction of courts of enquiry or committees of this description in this country.

"I am one of those who consider that workers are quite entitled to ask for increases of pay if they think they are underpaid. I go further and say that if they don't get what they want and think they can get it by means of a strike, then they should be at liberty and strike unless perhaps in special services such as certain works of public utility. Similarly I maintain that employers are at liberty to refuse increases of pay when they consider the demands of the workers are not justified and unreasonable.

"I believe that it is in the best interests of all concerned that the settlement of disputes of this description should be left to the employers and the workers themselves. There are few independent persons in India with sufficient knowledge of industrial conditions to justify their appointment as a committee to enquire into the causes of industrial troubles and to propose remedial measures. But even assuming that such a committee were formed what guarantee is there that the result of their enquiries will be acceptable to either workers or employers. There is no means of enforcing their award or of giving effect to whatever remedial measures the committee may propose. In other countries workers are highly organized, they pay contributions to their Trade Unions and the office bearers in these Unions can exercise a considerable amount of control over the rank and file by withholding strike pay, without which workers nowadays cannot stay long out of work, at home at least. Here there are no recognized leaders and there is no power by which, or no authority, through which, the workers can be compelled to accept the result of any enquiry. That being so, I maintain no advantage is to be gained by the appointment of a committee such as is suggested in this Resolution. I therefore oppose this Resolution."

12-57 P.M. **The Hon'ble Sardar Sunder Singh Majithia** :—"Sir, there are two sides of the picture as have been presented to this Council, one by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Khaparde, who seems to have spent a good deal of time and labour in studying the subject of the press management, and the other side presented by the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland, who has done so in his official position and as it appeared to him. If what has been placed before this Council by the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland is correct, no reasonable man, I should say, would object to getting more wages out of Government if he is able to get them; but, if what the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde says is true, that the wages they get are not sufficient, then, I think, the case for an enquiry has been made out. At any rate there are two sides to the picture, and I would certainly suggest that an enquiry on the subject might be conceded by the acceptance of this Resolution."



[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea ; Mr. G. S. Khaparde.*]

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea:**—"Sir, I interested myself in this matter in a personal way and I tried, so far as the Calcutta strike was concerned, to settle the differences and bring about a reasonable compromise. I had nearly succeeded and the leaders of the strike—I hope my friend will permit me to use that term—came to the Bengalee office and promised, after certain suggestions and certain offers had been made by Mr. Chatterji, that they would return to their work on a specified day. The specified day came, but the men did not return to their work. The truth is that there was an extreme section among the strikers and they prevented the men from rejoining their work. 12-59 P.M.

"I have listened with great interest to the lucid statement of the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland and in justice to him and the Department which he represents I am bound to say that their attitude throughout has been most conciliatory and they did their level best to bring about a reasonable settlement of this very unfortunate dispute.

"There are one or two points, however, in regard to which further action seems to me to be necessary. It is obvious that the remuneration has decidedly increased under the new scale and that with less work the men get more pay. But what about holidays, what about sick leave!

"These men cannot work for 12 months without a holiday. There are seasons and occasions when they fall sick and when they cannot work. These were the points which I ventured to press upon the attention of Mr. Chatterji when we met in conference to consider this matter, and he was good enough to tell me that they would receive attention. Upon one point, and one only, the Government seems to be inexorable, namely, that they will on no account give up the piece-work system and introduce the salaried scale. That, I think, represents the attitude of the Government in this connection. But as my Hon'ble friend, Sirdar Sundar Singh Majithia, has just pointed out, there is this difference of standpoint between the employers and the employed, between the Government and the pressmen. There being these two sides to the question, would it not be desirable in the interests of the Government itself to appoint a small committee for the purpose of considering the *pros* and *cons* of the case? I am sure my Hon'ble friend in moving this Resolution has echoed the sentiment and the opinion of the strikers themselves. The appointment of a committee would strengthen the hands of the Government if the committee decide in favour of the present system. On the other hand, if the verdict of that committee went against Government, I am perfectly certain the Government would accept it and adopt such modifications in the present system as may be required. It does seem to me that this is not altogether an unreasonable position. The adoption of it would satisfy strikers and their friends; and the Government would lose nothing by it. On the other hand, if the committee support the position of the Government, that would enormously strengthen their hands. It therefore seems to me that on this occasion the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland might see his way to accept the Resolution of my Hon'ble friend."

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde:**—"Sir, in listening to this debate I was reminded of a story I used to read in my schooldays. It was about a French General who argued that according to a certain rule he surely had won the battle; while the English General said—'Whatever the arguments, the fact stands that I have taken the positions which you held.' The French General depended on the rule and the English General depended on taking over the position held by the French General. 1-2 P.M.

"The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland has given us a long table regarding the new system and the old system, all of which makes me wonder if this world has changed suddenly and human nature is no longer what it was. Has it come to this, that people who are getting more do not want to work? The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland demonstrates that these people not only get more but that they are kindly treated, that every complaint is very carefully looked into and everything done for them. And yet they run away! Why? Because they have been got at by irresponsible politicians. The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland has got it into his head that everybody who complains has been approached by irresponsible politicians. I have not made the acquaintance of this sort of irresponsible politician here and I do not know whether he really exists. If

[Mr. G. S. Kheparde.]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland knows of such, he can no doubt find them out. But in questions which affect the pay and comfort of a man—whatever, in short, touches his stomach, he is more likely to listen to the pangs inside than to the arguments outside. These outside arguments appear to me to be very skilfully framed and forcibly urged, but unfortunately they are altogether unconvincing. For if these men were so well looked after and everything done for them, as the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland says, then I ask has this world become so topsyturvy that they will not accept such good treatment?

Then with regard to another argument which I put forward, it has been clearly said by the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland that so long as he is responsible for the Department this pay system will not be introduced; that it will always be the piece-work system and these people had better come in: if they do not so much the worse for them. Now that kind of attitude is unreasonable. The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland recognises that they do not understand the new system. They have been trying it. I should like to know how many have been working under it. As far as I know, most of them have been out and the few who are inside will probably only stay on a little longer. But that would not demonstrate any system to be good.

"A further point is that these people wanted arbitration and suggested various names. Unfortunately under the Department rules those men will not be able to do anything for them and the matter has to be dropped. Still, the fact remains that if these people are so carefully looked after, why are they out of work? That is the plain question which I wish to ask and which has got to be answered, I suppose, some day or other.

"The other question which I wish to ask is this. The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland, in giving an example, said that people working in class 19 get so much. I say that is exactly what I complain about—I mean this arbitrary division into classes from 19 to 29, and two more classes, I understand, have recently been added, making the number 31. How is this classification effected? By one man sitting there who is called a section holder or whatever it is, and another man sitting in another place called something else. Why is this system so very good and if it is, why not dispense with all establishments? You say to a man 'I give you this paper to copy; you take so much', and on this principle let us do away with the whole of the ministerial establishment of Government. If the scheme is so good, it should be introduced all over the world; why confine it to the Central Press and to these unfortunate pressmen?

"I submit that nothing will be lost by an enquiry if the system is really good. On the contrary, the enquiry will bring out all its good points and the people who will carry out the enquiry will be satisfied. I have not named these people, but I have no doubt they will be selected with care and I am sure only responsible people will be appointed and not irresponsible politicians. Well, let those responsible people go there and let them say what they think of it: otherwise the position is inexplicable. The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland has failed to find the irresponsible human being known as the irresponsible agitator on whose head all the blame has been put; and the Hon'ble Member's attitude explains what His Excellency the Viceroy said in his opening speech the other day about the imperfect contact between employers and employed. This is just a case of imperfect contact between employers and employed. Obviously somebody whom the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland suspects has brought about all this trouble, and people who have served in the Press for 35 years leave their work and sit at home for the mere pleasure of doing so. That seems to me an impossible argument to accept, and I still urge that this committee may be appointed. As I have said before, it can do no harm and it may do good. If the Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland's system is really so excellent, the enquiry will bring out its good points. If there are any faults and I am afraid there are many—I myself suspect there are many more than we can speak of on the surface here; if one-tenth of what I was told be true, it makes out a case for overhauling the entire system from top to bottom. I therefore submit that the honourable Council may accept this Resolution and appoint the committee for which I ask. I have given no names; I am not partial to any, and I hope there are no irresponsible people here—at least, on my side of the bench. When that committee is appointed, the whole matter can be gone into."

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[Sir Thomas Holland.]

**The Hon'ble Sir Thomas Holland :—**" Sir, I hope that my Hon'ble friend does not consider that I regard him as an irresponsible politician. I never even said that he is a politician at all. As I said in my reply to him, I welcome his intervention. I should have welcomed the good advice of any Member of this Council given to these workers. My Hon'ble friend is anxious to know why it is if these conditions are so extremely favourable the men do not go back to work. Well, I have given what I think is the explanation of it. One reason is that there is a certain attitude of mind which it is difficult to get over : The men have got into the strike habit ; they think that they can only get what they want by striking. They think it would be disloyal to their own caste if they did not strike. It has become quite fashionable to strike. That is one explanation. Another is the explanation given by the men that they do not like piece work ; they do not like having to be kept up to the collar, because a majority of them, like a majority of many other workers, want a little easier time. They want to be sure of their income without having to work for it. Now, that does not satisfy some of the best men ; the men who have come forward and talked with me have not been the slackers and have not been the men who were so earnest in getting a fixed salary. Those were the men who were willing to work at piece rates, but they were under the impression from calculations put before them that the piece rates were not fair. I have got this from several sources, from Calcutta, from Delhi, from Simla from their lawyer leaders—I will not speak any longer of irresponsible politicians ; the calculations, they say, put before them have shown that the men on an average lose by the new rates instead of gaining ; that is because they have not been interpreted correctly. Now, we have worked out our own estimate of what the men did last year and what the men will get by the new rates this year ; what we have done is to reduce the period from 274 hours in Calcutta and 284 in Delhi to a standard 250 hours, and we find that the men still gain according to our calculations. They do not believe our calculations ; they prefer the calculations of their leaders, and all I have got to put before them—that has not been done until to-day—is the result of the actual test of the new rates in Simla. What we want now is no more talking and no more playing with calculations ; we have finished that and you cannot improve on it ; what we want is to see the rates tested by actual practice. I promise the men that I will tear up the Government Resolution if they do not get a better income for shorter hours of work. Now, if the Hon'ble Mr. Khaparde wants to extract a promise I will give him one. Next year after these men are back at work, I am quite willing to lay the whole result before a committee of this Council, to allow that committee to judge whether I have been fair to the workers or fair to the tax-payers. I am almost tempted to suspect, from the results of one month's working, that we are not being fair to the tax-payer ! We are being generous right enough to the workers, but what about the tax-payer ! Supposing this committee came to the conclusion that we were paying the men too much, what will happen to the men then ! Will they accept the decision ! As my Hon'ble friend said, the Government will accept it, but will the men accept the decision ! More likely they will go on strike. That is the kind of thing that Mr. Murray referred to. You must leave these matters to be settled between the two parties concerned if you are sure that both the parties are trying to get together. There is not the slightest doubt of the sympathy with the workers that my colleague, Mr. Chatterjee has shown, and I am not sure whether Mr. Chatterjee does not think that I am leaning a little bit too much towards the workers myself. At any rate we are anxious that these men shall get an honest day's wage for an honest day's work, and I will leave this Council to judge next year as to whether we have been fair or not ; but I do not want any further discussion of the matter now ; the men are holding out, according to the reports from Calcutta, to hear the result of Mr. Khaparde's Resolution to-day. They say ' hold out for another week and we shall see what Mr. Khaparde does.' I do not want the men to hold again for a committee ; and how long will the committee take to do its work ! It has taken us three months to go into these calculations, examine the men individually and find out their views. Are the men going to stay out another three months ! Let the men come back to work and let the committee sit next year to test the results."

The Resolution was put and declared rejected.

**248 RESOLUTION *RE* TROUBLES IN GOVERNMENT PRESSES; THE CUTCHI MEMONS BILL; RESOLUTION *RE* REFRESHMENTS FOR VOTERS.**

[*Khan Bahadur Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer ;  
Mr. Rama Rayaningar.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

A division was asked for, and the Council divided as follows :—

<i>Ayes.</i> —18.	<i>Noes.</i> —36.
The Hon'ble Maharaja Sir M. C. Nandi of Kasimbazar.	His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor.
" Mr. S. N. Banerjee.	" Sir George Barnes.
" Mr. G. S. Khaparde.	" Sir William Vincent
" Sir Umar Hyat Khan.	" Mr. M. M. Shafr.
" Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sundar Singh, Matithia.	" Mr. W. M. Hailey.
" Haji Chaudhuri Muhammad Ismail Khan.	" Sir Thomas Holland.
" Mr. S. Sinha.	" Rno Bahadur B. N. Sarma.
" Sir D. P. Sarbadhikari.	" Sir William Morris.
" Khan Salub Sha Nawaz Bhutto.	" Col. W. D. Waghorn.
" Mr. Rayaningar.	" Mr. R. D. Tata.
" Mr. V. S. Sastri.	" Mr. H. M. R. Hopkins.
" Mr. R. Ayyangar.	" Mr. J. Mackenna.
	" Saiyid Muhammad Ali.
	" Mr. B. N. Mitra.
	" Mr. H. N. Hutchinson.
	" Major General W. R. Edwards.
	" Mr. S. P. O'Donnell.
	" Mr. J. Holland.
	" Mr. J. A. Richey.
	" Mr. M. M. S. Gubbay.
	" Mr. H. Sharp.
	" Mr. H. Macpherson.
	" Mr. C. A. Innes.
	" Sir Sydney Crookshank.
	" Major General Sir Alfred Bingley.
	" Mr. A. P. Muddiman.
	" Mr. N. E. Marjoribanks.
	" Mr. A. H. Froom.
	" Mr. C. A. Kincaid.
	" Mr. A. R. Murray.
	" Mr. K. C. De.
	" Mr. L. F. Morabead.
	" Mr. H. A. Casson.
	" Mr. D. C. Allen.
	" Mr. E. R. Elenkinson.

The Resolution was therefore rejected.

The Council here adjourned for lunch.

The Council re assembled at 3 P.M.

**THE CUTCHI MEMONS BILL.**

2-2 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer :—**

"Sir, I beg to present the report of the Select Committee on the Bill to declare that the members of the Cutchi Memon community are subject to Muhammadan Law."

**RESOLUTION *re* REFRESHMENTS FOR VOTERS.**

2-4 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Rama Rayaningar :—** "Sir, I have great pleasure to move the Resolution which stands in my name: the Resolution reads :—

"This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that provision be made by Government to provide light refreshments for voters who have to travel any distance exceeding 5 miles to attend at polling stations for the purpose of recording their votes at elections to the Reformed Legislative Councils."

"Sir, I was rather late in giving notice of this Resolution. I really feared the Resolution might not be reached. Thanks however for the courtesy of the Council. I have been given the chance to move the Resolution. Surely I am not going to abuse this courtesy and detain the Council long. Nor does the Resolution require any lengthy statement. I shall briefly state the reason why

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

[*Mr. Rama Rayanagar; Sir Umar Hayat Khan.*]

provision has to be made by Government for supplying light refreshments to voters who have to travel long distances in order to record their votes.

"Sir, only the other day, last week, we passed the Indian Election Offences Act. According to this Act treating of the electors by the candidates is an offence punishable under the Indian Penal Code. Any candidate offering even a cup of coffee will be regarded as having committed the offence. In enacting this law we have followed the English law. I need hardly mention that what may be good election law in England may not be so in India. So far as electioneering is concerned, the conditions that prevail in England are altogether different from the conditions in India. In England voters as a class are well-to-do and can afford to spare a shilling or two for buying refreshments. They are politically enlightened; they realize the value of the franchise. But in India the voters are too poor to spare even a few annas for the purchase of refreshments. They do not know the value of their vote. In these circumstances it is almost impossible to expect the rural voters in India to undertake travelling long distances to record their votes.

"Sir, question may be asked as to why Government should undertake this expenditure of providing the electors with light refreshments. My reply is that because Government arranges polling stations for some voters far away from their villages and accordingly those voters have to travel long distances. To such voters Government must supply refreshments. Sir, so much of the taxpayer's money is spent on the travelling allowance bills of the Legislative Council Members and in various other ways. It is not fair that considerations of economy should come in when the poorest of the tax-payers have to be provided with light refreshments and that when they have to leave their place and travel long distances for the purpose of recording their votes. If in spite of what is stated above Government considers that the cost cannot be incurred by them, Government may insist on contending candidates in the election to contribute the required funds. With these observations I place my Resolution before the Council."

**The Hon'ble Sir Umar Hayat Khan:**—"Sir, I cordially support my friend who has stuck to his guns and has not been taken away by the gusts of the ideas of the coming elections or make the rotten cause a sacred one. There are many considerations. I think that if people were allowed not light but even heavy refreshments that would not make any difference one way or the other, because the whole thing which had to be done is already done. Before the Corrupt Practices Bill was passed, many people for months past have been going about the country and taking thumb impressions from various people and have got them in their possession. Some have taken a sort of oath which according to Mahommedan law is equal to saying 'if I don't be on your side, the divorce of the wife will take place', and nobody is going to face that unless he is particularly tired of his wife. In the same way there are shrines in many places to which men come from a long distance. They cannot possibly break that time-honoured reverence to the shrines and their custodians. If any of the custodians stands he will always have their votes. After all, I do not think any amount of refreshments will make some people who have already taken strong oaths change their minds. In the same way, if a man has got a shrine, it will be something like the House of Lords as long as that shrine is there, because people for the sake of light or heavy refreshments would not desert the man. I think under these circumstances it will be much better if Government were to provide light refreshments to voters who will be travelling long distances for the purpose of recording their votes, otherwise Government will be indirectly making people do wrong things. If a man comes from a long distance, I would rather like to give him a dinner or refreshments, because it is the custom in this country that if a man comes from a long distance we cannot possibly shirk our hospitality to him. But if under the law, treating of such people is made an offence,

[*Sir Umar Hayat Khan ; Sardar Sunder Singh Majithia ; Sir William Marris.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

then what people will do is, only to fulfil the obligations entailed by the law, will tell a friend 'to do the needful' or they will give a *bania* or somebody a lump sum and ask him to entertain such people who come from a long distance for the purpose of recording their votes. Anyhow the thing would be done, so I think it would be much better if Government were to make some provision for supplying light refreshments only for those voters who have to travel a long distance. If Government undertakes to defray the expenses out of their own revenues, well and good ; otherwise the cost may be debited, as my Hon'ble friend has suggested, to the contending candidates. If this cannot be done, then I think one should be allowed to entertain one's friends. With these remarks, Sir, I strongly support the Resolution."

9-11 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sardar Bahadur Sardar Sunder Singh Majithia:**—"Sir, I happened to be on the Advisory Committee when the rules were being framed, and at that time I pressed that something should be done to provide for the refreshment of voters not of the sort that some people do by making voters drink and get their votes, but light refreshments in the ordinary way that we generally from a religious point of view provide for guests who come to our house from a long distance. But there may be some objection in certain quarters that if this Resolution were carried, Government will be accused of influencing elections. I think personally Government will not be blamed for influencing the elections if some provision of the kind as suggested in the Resolution were made for supplying light refreshments only for those people who come from a long distance. With these words I support the motion."

9-13 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir William Marris:**—"Sir, as my Hon'ble friend Sardar Sunder Singh has just told the Council, this question was very carefully examined in the Advisory Committee and the difficulties which the Hon'ble mover brought out as likely to attend the conduct of elections in rural areas were anxiously considered. We reminded ourselves that the Indian voter was likely to be poor, that communications were bad, that there was a lack of accommodation in villages for voters coming from long distances and that the ordinary rural voter could not be expected to realise the value of his vote in the same way as the value of a vote is realised in countries more advanced. All these difficulties, I venture to say, were fully discussed, and we considered also various expedients for meeting them. One idea to which we devoted some time was the suggestion that joint funds should be provided by both candidates for the entertainment of voters coming from a long distance, but after some discussion that proposal really found no serious advocates. Although much attention was given to the subject, I do not remember that anyone went quite as far as the Hon'ble mover in suggesting that the State itself should defray the expenses of the entertainment of these distant voters.

"I think there are great practical difficulties in the way of accepting his suggestion. But at the outset I admit that it has one conspicuous advantage, namely, that the provision of so many free meals, say for a million or two million voters, would afford an excellent test of the strength of the principle of non-co-operation ; but apart from that consideration I think the arguments are against the Hon'ble mover. He suggested in the first place that light refreshments should be provided. A certain doubt attaches to the meaning of the term 'light refreshment' and it is indeed somewhat more in keeping with the amenities of the boudoir or buffet than with those of the polling booth. It is a suggestion put forward from Madras, but the two Hon'ble Members from the Punjab who have just spoken might conceivably want to know, whether considering the conditions of a cold winter's morning in the Punjab, what the Hon'ble mover might regard as light refreshments in Madras would adequately satisfy the requirements of a sturdy Punjabi voter. One practical difficulty certainly is as to how the provision of light refreshments is to be made. You may say that the

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.] [Sir William Marris; Mr. Rama Rayanagar.]

registers would give you the number of voters residing at long distances, and I suppose that to prevent misappropriation in connexion with the provision of meals it would be necessary to issue vouchers to each voter, which might be further distinguished by conspicuous colours according to the requirements of the particular voter. But imagine the feelings of a man who comes, not from a distance of five miles, but from a village which is four miles and seven furlongs distant, and is then refused his light refreshment. Imagine with what vehemence he would impugn the accuracy of the District Surveyor's measurement of the distance. These are only some of the difficulties. What you cannot do is to anticipate the number of voters who would turn up from those outlying areas. You could not calculate on what scale to provide meals. You would have to avoid, on the one hand, the difficulty of providing too few meals and on the other hand the difficulty of preparing too many. It would be worse, if I may say so, than the anxiety on a similar score which attends a Collector's garden party.

"Apart altogether from difficulties of this sort I think there is a weightier reason why it is difficult for Government to accept the Hon'ble Member's proposal, and it is this. We are starting out on this new scheme of reforms from the root principle that the existing franchise is far too narrow; that the electorate should be enormously enlarged; and that there are scattered over the length and breadth of India in villages—for after all the greater part of the people of India live in villages—something like 5 million voters, who, illiterate and unpracticed as they may be in the exercise of their civic rights, still may be expected to come forward now and exercise their personal choice of the representatives they wish to sit in the Councils. That is the root basis of the whole scheme; and it seems to me that simultaneously with it, we cannot put up our names to a proposition which surely implies that a large proportion of the Indian voters will not come forward and exercise his power to vote, at the cost of a little difficulty and inconvenience, unless he is actually encouraged to do so by the stimulus of a free meal from Government. That would be too much like a stultification of our main position, and, indeed, I think it would be a proposition that would not reflect creditably upon the repute of the country.

"Finally, Sir, this Council is an expiring body; its time has come, so to speak and its '*nunc dimittis*' is about to be pronounced. It meets to-day almost with one foot in the grave. At the same time it is welcoming its own demise, knowing that it will be replaced by something more representative of the population as a whole. It does not seem to me that this Council at such a time as this—actually in *articulo mortis*—should be invited, as its expiring pronouncement on matters of public policy to put its name to a proposition, which, as I have said, implies that the average Indian elector is unready to exercise and likely to be backward in exercising the privileges and opportunities which are being offered to him.

"For these reasons, Sir, the Government, although they appreciate the difficulty and entirely agree that it is a real one, can only conclude that the difficulty is one which must be faced; and they are thus unable to accept the Hon'ble Member's Resolution."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Rama Rayanagar:**— "Sir, I am sorry the Hon'ble Sir William Marris could not see his way to accept the Resolution. Two of the objections he raised, are no objections at all. I think they can be easily answered. The first objection is that according to the Resolution there is a limit of 5 miles to be travelled to entitle one for refreshments and that if a voter came from a distance of 4 miles and 7 furlongs he would not be entitled to have refreshments and that would cause unnecessary heart-burning. I think the arrangement will work all right. In all these matters a limit is necessary. 3-30 P.M.

[*Mr. Rama Rayaninger.*]

[14TH SEPTEMBER, 1920.]

"The second objection is that it is not worth while to consider the question of providing electors with refreshments, if refreshments are to be provided as an inducement to voters to go to the polling booth. I did not mean refreshments should be given as an inducement. I only wished to convey that voters would not take the trouble of going to the polling stations if they had to go a long distance and return with empty stomachs, or had to lay out extra money for that purpose.

"However in view of the other reasons which Sir William Marris has advanced I do not wish to press the Resolution."

The Resolution was by leave of the Council withdrawn.

The Council then adjourned till Thursday, the 16th instant, at 11 a.m.

A. P. MUDDIMAN,

*Secretary to the Government of India,  
Legislative Department.*

SIMLA ;

*The 30th September, 1920.*



## APPENDIX A.

## Statement.

*Objects and Methods of Publicity Work.*

The main object of appointing publicity officers is to provide a regular medium of communication between Government and the Public. The work of the publicity officer consists in making available to the public in a suitable form information likely to be of general interest and in supplying facts on public questions, the activities of Government and the reasons for their policy. The main channel of communication with the public is through the press, by lectures and by leaflets.

*Estimated expenditure incurred on Provincial Publicity work.*

Province.	Name of Officer-in-charge of publicity work and salary drawn by him.	Total estimated annual expenditure details.	Amount.	Remarks.
Madras ...	Mr. J. T. Gwynn, I.C.S. ... Salary. Salary in regular grade, i.e., Rs. 1,700 per mensem plus Rs. 250 overseas allowance plus Rs. 250 deputation allowance plus Rs. 160 conveyance allowance.	Salary of Officer-in-charge ... Pay of clerical establishment, including menials. Contingencies (approximately) Total ...	Rs. 27,600 8,552 30,200 66,152	
Bombay ...	Major A. J. Dawson ... Salary Rs. 2,000 per month.	Salary of Officer-in-charge ... Cost of establishment ... Expenses in connection with Karachi un-official publicity committee (approximately). Total ...	24,000 8,412 10,000 42,412	
Bengal ...	Mr. R. Douglas Story ... Salary Rs. 2,000 per month.	Salary of Officer-in-charge ... Annual expenditure on Department (excluding above) Total ...	24,000 1,943 25,948	
United Provinces.	No Publicity Board ...	...	...	Details of the approximate expenditure in connection with the United Provinces Journal were laid on the table at the Council Meeting of the 26th February 1920.
Punjab ...	Mr. E. Candler (Secretary) ... Salary Rs. 1,500 per mensem. Khan Sahib Abdul Aziz (Joint Secretary). Salary Rs. 500 per mensem	Salary of Officers-in-charge ... Annual expenditure on Department (excluding above). Total ...	24,000 1,50,200 1,74,200	Against this expenditure the receipts of the sale of the "Hag bulletin" published by the Publicity Board are estimated at Rs. 50,000 per annum.
Burma ...	Mr. J. J. Nolan ... Salary Rs. 1,500 per mensem plus Rs. 100 house allowance.	Salary of Officer-in-charge and other expenses.	425,000	* (of Rs. 40,520 when a newspaper is started).
Bihar and Orissa.	A part-time officer of the Indian Educational Service Mr. C. J. Hamilton assisted by a full-time Assistant Publicity Officer Mr. Bijoy Kumar Sen, two translators and a small office staff.	Duty allowance of Publicity Officer at Rs. 200 per mensem. Salary of Assistant Publicity Officer at Rs. 200 per mensem. Annual expenditure on Department (excluding above). Total ...	2,400 2,400 5,200 10,000	

## APPENDIX B.

*Statement showing the number of bovine cattle which have left India from the Maritime provinces since January 1920.*

	January.	February.	March.	April.	May.	June.	July.
Bengal ...	102	161	7	Nil	28	641	17
Madras ...	1,162	1,033	968	1,288	1,269	1,481	1,686
Bombay excluding Sind	205	115	147	Nil	275	Nil	Nil
Portugal { Foreign ...	Nil	Nil	Nil	7	5	Nil	4
Portugal { India ...	Nil	Nil	Nil	3	5	3	Nil
Karachi ...	Nil	Nil	Nil	50	Nil	Nil	Nil
Ceylon ...	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil

*Statement giving the figures of bovine cattle in the several provinces of India (except Ajmer-Merwara) as ascertained by the cattle census held during December 1919 to April 1920.*

Provinces.	CATTLE.				BUFFALOES.		
	Fem.	Bulls.	Cows.	Young stock (Calves).	Male buffaloes.	Cow buffaloes.	Young stock (Buffaloe calves).
Bengal ...	11,25,789	82,89,750	81,12,235	62,25,844	6,89,143	2,60,051	1,26,574
Madras ...	27,14,558	44,80,021	57,00,110	86,61,007	14,12,818	25,51,199	17,78,021
Bombay {	Prwy. ...	4,45,692	26,20,000	16,36,703	15,97,728	2,21,303	9,87,845
	Sind ...	28,787	5,17,736	6,10,972	3,02,454	7,476	2,17,823
U. P. ...	Agra ...	17,960	66,72,222	41,26,170	42,53,385	5,36,297	25,45,601
	Oudh ...	9,063	32,01,653	30,84,798	10,80,292	2,97,812	10,50,625
Bihar and Orissa ...	1,41,120	82,59,700	50,23,943	47,12,825	8,02,418	15,80,976	10,78,512
Punjab ...	12,077	39,45,766	27,33,544	80,85,897	4,30,427	24,31,497	17,48,591
Burma ...	5,94,443	17,80,877	19,93,125	10,31,041	3,71,564	3,82,705	3,07,969
Central Provinces ...	1,66,298	29,18,555	26,16,537	22,57,548	4,58,897	6,37,362	4,70,151
Bihar ...	1,02,902	7,27,856	5,48,660	3,77,191	26,707	2,16,051	1,22,958
Assam ...	3,00,144	15,27,622	16,75,953	14,79,386	1,92,578	2,46,807	1,47,392
N. W. F. Province ...	1,650	3,95,094	2,86,044	2,02,004	13,402	1,59,386	73,702
Ajmer-Merwara ...			Not yet received.				
L. M. ...	312	34,847	27,169	34,897	742	21,424	16,639
Coorg ...	4,823	44,064	39,551	33,426	11,845	6,700	4,380
Mysore Pargana ...	347	1,517	1,515	1,162	111	664	239
Total ...	53,68,800	4,33,40,733	3,70,34,329	31,35,713	51,65,040	1,32,86,081	96,74,913

14,56,00,351

*Statement showing total numbers of bovine cattle in British India for the years 1908-09 to 1917-18.*

1908-09	...	...	...	...	114,834,387
1909-10	...	...	...	...	119,379,323
1910-11	...	...	...	...	120,658,081
1911-12	...	...	...	...	120,908,899
1912-13	...	...	...	...	128,125,453
1913-14	...	...	...	...	143,179,088
1914-15	...	...	...	...	147,238,894
1915-16	...	...	...	...	148,871,749
1916-17	...	...	...	...	149,852,696
1917-18	...	...	...	...	149,111,087
Census of 1920	...	...	...	...	*146,900,231

\* Excludes Ajmer-Merwara.

## APPENDIX C.

Service.	Pay proposed by the Public Service Commission.	Pay sanctioned.
Agricultural Department.	<p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 150 during first 2 years.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—40/3—450—50/3—500.</p> <p>Selection posts—As need is felt.</p>	<p>Left to the local Government subject to following limits:—</p> <p><i>India</i>—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Minimum Rs. 250—Efficiency bar Rs. 550—Maximum Rs. 750.</p> <p><i>Burma</i>—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 250.</p> <p>Minimum Rs. 300—Efficiency bar 600—Maximum Rs. 850.</p>
Civil Veterinary Department.	<p><i>India</i>—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 150.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—40/3—450—50/3—500.</p> <p><i>Burma</i>—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—40/3—500—50/3—550.</p>	<p>Left to local Governments subject to following limits:—</p> <p><i>India</i>—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Minimum Rs. 250—Efficiency bar Rs. 650—Maximum Rs. 750.</p> <p><i>Burma</i>—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 250.</p> <p>Minimum Rs. 300—Efficiency bar Rs. 600—Maximum Rs. 800.</p>
Provincial Education Service.	<p><i>India</i>—</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—40/3—450—50/3—500.</p> <p>Selection posts—Rs. 500—40—700.</p> <p><i>Burma</i>—</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—40/3—500—50/3—550.</p> <p>Selection posts—Rs. 550—40—750.</p>	<p>Left to local Governments subject to following limits:—</p> <p>Minimum—Rs. 250.</p> <p>Maximum—Rs. 800.</p>
Factory Inspection Department.	<p><i>Inspectors, Madras, United Provinces, Punjab and Burma.</i></p> <p>India recruited—Rs. 300—25—800—Europe recruited—Rs. 400—30—1,000.</p> <p><i>Junior Inspectors, Bombay, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and Assam.</i></p> <p>India recruited—Rs. 200—25—700—Europe recruited—Rs. 400—30—900.</p> <p><i>Central Provinces and Berar—</i></p> <p>India recruited { Senior Inspector—Rs. 550—25—800. Junior Inspector—Rs. 300—25—550.</p> <p>Europe recruited { Senior Inspector—Rs. 700—30—1,000. Junior Inspector—Rs. 400—30—700.</p> <p>General Scale for Chief Inspectors—Rs. 1,000—40—1,350.</p>	<p><i>Bengal—</i></p> <p>Chief Inspectors—Rs. 1,200—100—1,500.</p> <p>Inspectors—Rs. 300—50—800.</p> <p><i>Other Provinces—</i></p> <p>Left to local Governments subject to observance of ordinary financial rules.</p>

Service.	Pay proposed by the Public Services Commission.	Pay sanctioned.
Boiler Inspection Department.	<p>Chief Inspector: Bombay—Rs. 1,000—50—1,250—appointment made pensionable.</p> <p>Chief Inspector: Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and Assam—Rs. 1,000—50—1,250.</p> <p>First Inspector: Madras and Burma—Rs. 700.</p> <p>Salary for certain other posts left to authorities in India.</p> <p>Central Provinces and Berar.—Inspectors are also Inspectors of Factories.</p>	<p>Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and Assam.</p> <p>Chief Inspectors—Rs. 1,200—100—1,500.</p> <p>Pay of staff left to local Governments subject to observance of ordinary financial rules.</p>
Indian Finance Department.	<p>(1) Class II—<math>\begin{cases} \text{Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.} \\ \text{Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—50/3—50/3—50—1,050.} \end{cases}</math></p> <p>(2) Class I—Rs. 1,200—40—1,500.</p> <p>(3) Class I—(I.C.S.)—1,500—60—1,800.</p> <p>(4) Accountants General—Rs. 2,000—125—2,750.</p>	<p>(1) Rs. 350—50—1,400.</p> <p>(2) and (3)—Rs. 1,500—60—1,800.</p> <p>(4) Rs. 2,350—100—2,750—3,000.</p>
Forest Department	<p>India—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 150.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—20—55—600—700.</p> <p>Burma—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—20—600.</p>	<p>India—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—20—55—Efficiency bar—Rs. 570—20—750.</p> <p>Burma—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 250.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—20—600—Efficiency bar—Rs. 62—20—800.</p>
Provincial Civil Service	<p>Executive Branch—</p> <p>India—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 150.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—40/3—45/3—50/3—500.</p> <p>Burma—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—40/3—500—50/3—550.</p> <p>Selection posts—600—40—Rs. 800 and 1,000.</p> <p>Judicial Branch—</p> <p>India—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 200.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—40/3—500—50/3—550.</p> <p>Burma—</p> <p>Probationary Grade—Rs. 250.</p> <p>Ordinary Scale—Rs. 500—40/3—550—50/3—600.</p> <p>Selection posts—Rs. 600—40—800 and 1,000.</p>	<p>Left to local Governments within the limits:—</p> <p>Minimum—Rs. 250 or 300—2 efficiency bars—Maximum—Rs. 850.</p> <p>Selection grades from—Rs. 850 to 1,200.</p> <p>Left to local Governments within the limits:—</p> <p>Minimum—Rs. 300 or 350.</p> <p>Maximum—Rs. 850.</p> <p>Selection posts—Rs. 850 to 1,200.</p>

Service	Pay proposed by the Public Service Commission.	Pay sanctioned.
Land Records (Burma)	Probationary Grade—Rs. 200. Assistant Superintendents—Rs. 250. <i>Superintendents—</i> Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—20—500. Selection posts—Rs. 600, 700, 800. Assistant Director—Rs. 1,000—50—1,250.	Probationary Grade—Rs. 150 for 20 months. Rs. 175 for further 18 months. Rs. 200 until occurrence of vacancy. Assistant Superintendent—Rs. 250. Superintendents—Rs. 300—20—800. Assistant Director—Rs. 1,000—50—1,250.
Provincial Police	<i>India—</i> Probationary Grade—Rs. 150. Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—40/3—450—50/3—550. <i>Burma—</i> Probationary Grade—Rs. 200. Ordinary Scale—Rs. 300—40/3—500—50/3—550. Selection posts—Rs. 600, 700.	Probationary Grade—Rs. 200 for two years. Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—25—300—20—500—20/2—550—20—600. Selection posts—Rs. 700.
Post Office	Probationary Grade—Rs. 150. Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—40/3—450—50/3—550. Selection posts—Rs. 600—40—700.	Probationary Grade—Rs. 200. Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—25—300—20—700.
Northern India Salt Revenue.	*Commissioner—Grade pay + allowance of Rs. 250, upto maximum Rs. 2,400. †Deputy Commissioner—Rs. 1,200—40—1,400. Assistant Commissioner—Rs. 1,000. " " —Rs. 900. " " —Rs. 700—25—800. Superintendents—Rs. 600. " —Rs. 300—50/3—500. Assistant Superintendents—Rs. 250. Probationers—Rs. 150.	* Still under consideration. † Present pay continued. Assistant Commissioner—Rs. 1,000. " " —Rs. 700—25—800. <i>Superintendents—</i> Probationary Grade—Rs. 200. Ordinary Scale—Rs. 250—50/3—600.
Salt and Excise Department.	Deputy Commissioners (Madras)—Rs. 1,200—40—1,400. Distillery Experts (Madras)—Rs. 800—25—1,000—50—1,300. Distillery Experts (Bombay)—Rs. 650—50—1,300. Distillery Experts (Bengal)—Rs. 650—50—1,300. Distillery Experts (Bihar and Orissa)—Rs. 750—50—1,000. Distillery Experts (United Provinces)—Rs. 800—50—1,300. Chief Superintendent, Burma—Rs. 1,000—50—1,250. Assistant Commissioners, Madras and Bombay—Rs. 1,000. Assistant Commissioners, Madras and Bombay—Rs. 900.	Left to local Governments to regulate subject to observance of ordinary financial rules.

Service.	Pay proposed by the Public Service Commission.	Pay sanctioned.
Salt and Excise Department— <i>contd.</i>	<p>Assistant Commissioners, Madras and Bombay—Rs. 600—36—600.</p> <p>Assistant Commissioners, Bengal and Bihar and Orissa—Rs. 550—50—1,000.</p> <p>Assistant Commissioner, Sind—Rs. 500—30—800.</p> <p>Superintendent, Burma—Rs. 800.</p> <p>Superintendents, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Burma—Rs. 700.</p> <p>Superintendent, United Provinces—Rs. 600—26—700.</p> <p>Superintendents, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Burma—Rs. 600.</p> <p>Superintendents, Madras, Bombay, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Assam, United Provinces—250—40/3—450—50/3—500. (Probationers Rs. 150.)</p> <p>Superintendent, Burma—Rs. 300—20—500.</p> <p>Assistant Superintendent, Burma—Rs. 350 (300 during probation).</p>	Left to local Governments to regulate subject to observance of ordinary financial rules.