

Thursday, 22nd March, 1945

COUNCIL OF STATE DEBATES

(OFFICIAL REPORT)

VOLUME I, 1945

(15th February to 14th April, 1945)

EIGHTEENTH SESSION

OF THE

FOURTH COUNCIL OF STATE, 1945



PUBLISHED BY THE MANAGER OF PUBLICATIONS, DELHI,
PRINTED BY THE MANAGER, GOVERNMENT OF INDIA PRESS, NEW DELHI
1945

CONTENTS

	Pages.		Pages.
Thursday, 15th February, 1945—		Wednesday, the 14th March, 1945—	
Members Sworn	1	Questions and Answers	251—271
Questions and Answers	1—11	Notice of Motion for Adjournment —Disallowed	271—272
Notices of Motions for Adjournment— Disallowed	11—13	Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	272
Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	13—19, 27—28	Statements, etc., laid on the table	272—273
Statements, etc., laid on the table	20—27, 28—41	Standing Committee for the De- partment of Information and Broadcasting	274
Messages from His Exoellency the Viceroy and Governor General	42	Standing Committee for the Civil Defence Branch of the Defence Department	274
Committee on Petitions	42	Standing Committee on Emigration	274
Congratulations to recipients of Honours	43	Resolution re Working of the Defence of India Act and Rules —Negatived	274—283
Governor General's assent to Bills Bill passed by the Legislative Assembly laid on the table	44	Resolution re Post-war develop- ment of industries, etc.—Negat- ived	283—308
Presentation of the Railway Budget, 1945-46	44-52	Resolution re Economic sanctions against South Africa— <i>To be continued</i>	309
Friday, 16th February, 1945—		Wednesday, 21st March, 1945—	
Member Sworn	53	Members Sworn	311
Questions and Answers	53—57	Questions and Answers	311—325
Death of Khan Bahadur Muham- mad Yahya	73	Notice of Motion for Adjourn- ment—Disallowed	326—328
Resolution re Cottage industry of dyeing and printing (cotton cloth)— <i>To be continued</i>	73—74	Standing Committee for the Legislative Department	328—329
Resolution re Accidents caused by military vehicles—Withdrawn	74—82	Standing Committee for the Department of Posts and Air	329
Resolution re Reservation of ac- commodation on railways for the civilian population—With- drawn	82—92	Standing Committee for the Home Department	329
Resolution re Future recruitment, etc., to the Civil Services con- trolled by the Secretary of State— Negatived	92—102	Standing Committee for the Labour Department	329
Tuesday, 20th February, 1945—		Standing Committee for the War Transport Department	329—330
Member Sworn	103	Central Advisory Council for Rail- ways	330
Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	103—116	Resolution re Representation at the Conference of Allied Na- tions to be held at San Francis- co—Negatived	330—363
General Discussion of the Railway Budget, 1945-46	116—150	Resolution re Cottage industry of dyeing and printing (cotton cloth)— <i>To be continued</i>	363
Thursday, 22nd February, 1945—		Thursday, 22nd March, 1945—	
Questions and Answers	151—157	Questions and Answers	363—391
Resolution re Amendment of the Council of State Electoral Rules —Negatived	157—171	Resolution re Application of eco- nomic sanctions against South Africa—Adopted	391—402
Wednesday, 23rd February, 1945—		Caste Disabilities Removal Bill— Introduced	402
Members Sworn	173	Delhi Sikh Gurdwara and Religious Endowment Bill—Introduced	402
Presentation of the General Budget, 1945-46	173—187	Resolution re Daily broadcast in Hindi—Negatived	402—421
Wednesday, 7th March, 1945—		Code of Criminal Procedure (Amend- ment) Bill—Considered and pas- sed	421—422
Questions and Answers	189—207	Tuesday, 27th March, 1945—	
Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	207—211	Member Sworn	423
Statements, etc., laid on the table	211	Questions and Answers	423—439
Standing Committee for the De- partment of Information and Broadcasting	211	Statements, etc., laid on the table	439
Standing Committee on Emigration	211	Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	439
Standing Committee for the Civil Defence Branch of the Defence Department	212	Standing Committee for the Food Department	439—440
General Discussion of the General Budget, 1945-46	212—249	Defence Consultative Committee	440

Pages.	Pages.
Tuesday, 27th March, 1945—<i>contd.</i>	
Standing Committee for the Industries and Civil Supplies Department	440
Central Committee of the Tuberculosis Association of India	440
Standing Committee for the External Affairs Department	440—442
Standing Committee for the Planning and Development Department	442
Standing Committee for Education	442
Standing Committee for Agriculture and Forests	442
Standing Committee for the Department of Education, Health and Lands	443
Standing Committee for the Commerce Department	443
Standing Committee for the Supply Department	443
Standing Committee for the War Transport Department	443—444
Resolution <i>re</i> Further amendments to the Resolution on Road Development—Adopted	444
Standing Committee for Roads, 1945-46	445
Indian Tea Control (Amendment) Bill—Considered and passed	445
Resolution <i>re</i> Cottage industry of dyeing and printing (cotton cloth)—Adopted	445—453
Statements of Business	453—454
Messages from His Excellency the Governor General	454
Indian Finance Bill, 1945—Laid on the table	454
Statement of Business	455
Wednesday, 28th March, 1945—	
Questions and Answers	457—469
Notice of Motion for Adjournment—Disallowed	469
Statements, etc., laid on the table	469—471
Finance Bill—Motion to consider— <i>to be continued</i>	471—498
Thursday, 29th March, 1945—	
Short Notice Question and Answer	499
Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	499—502
Finance Bill—Considered and passed	502—542
Statement of Business	542
Reply by the Honourable Sir Jeremy Baisman to the felicitations of members	542
Friday, 6th April, 1945—	
Short Notice Questions and Answers	543, 558
Questions and Answers	543—557
Notices of Motions for Adjournment—Disallowed	559—561
Bills passed by the Legislative Assembly laid on the table	561
Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	561—562
Resolution <i>re</i> Religious endowments—Withdrawn	562—564
Resolution <i>re</i> India's sterling balances—Adopted	564—576, 579—583
Standing Committee for the Department of Information and Broadcasting	576
Standing Committee on Emigration	576
Standing Committee for the Civil Defence Branch of the Defence Department	576—577
Standing Committee for the Posts and Air Department	577
Standing Committee for the Labour Department	577
Central Advisory Council for Railways	577
Standing Committee for the Legislative Department	577
Standing Committee for the Home Department	577
Standing Committee for the War Transport Department	577
Standing Committee for the Food Department	577
Defence Consultative Committee	578
Standing Committee for the Industries and Civil Supplies Department	578
Central Committee of the Tuberculosis Association of India	578
Standing Committee for the Commerce Department	578
Standing Committee for the Supply Department	578
Standing Committee for the External Affairs Department	578
Standing Committee for Education	578
Standing Committee for Agriculture and Forests	578
Standing Committee for the Department of Education, Health and Lands	578
Standing Committee for the Planning and Development Department	579
Standing Committee for Roads	579
Resolution <i>re</i> Emigration of labour to Burma, Malaya, etc.—Adopted	583—591
Statement of Business	592
Wednesday, 11th April, 1945—	
Questions and Answers	593—606
Short Notice Questions and Answers	607—608
Notices of Motions for Adjournment—Disallowed	608—610
Statements, etc., laid on the table	610, 610—611
Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	610
Standing Committee for the Defence Department	611
Standing Committee for Roads, 1945-46	611—612
Factories (Amendment) Bill—Considered and passed	612—613
Indian Companies (Amendment) Bill—Considered and passed	613
Indian Merchandise Marks (Amendment) Supplementary Bill—Considered and passed	613

	Pages.		Pages.
Wednesday, 11th April, 1945—contd.		Saturday, 14th April, 1945—	
Repealing and Amending Bill— Considered and passed	613—614	Death of President Roosevelt	625—627
Indian Army (Amendment) Bill —Considered and passed	614—615	Questions and Answers	627—628
Indian Air Force (Amendment) Bill—Considered and passed	615	Information promised in reply to questions laid on the table	628—629
Statement of Business	615—616	Notice of Motion for Adjourn- ment—Withdrawn	629—630
Thursday, 12th April, 1945—		Bill passed by the Legislative Assembly laid on the table	630
Questions and Answers	617—622	Aligarh Muslim University (Amend- ment) Bill—Considered and passed	630, 631—632
Bill passed by the Legislative As- sembly laid on the table	622	Mines Maternity Benefit (Amend- ment) Bill—Considered and passed	631
Standing Committee for the Defence Department	622—623	Statement of Business	632
Standing Committee for Roads, 1945-46	623		
Indian Patents and Designs (Amendment) Bill—Considered and passed	623		

COUNCIL OF STATE

Thursday, the 22nd March, 1945

The Council met in the Council Chamber of the Council House at Eleven of the Clock, the Honourable the President in the Chair.

MEMBERS SWORN :

The Honourable Mr. Henry Carlos Prior (Labour Secretary).

The Honourable Mr. Narayana Raghavan Pillai (Commerce Secretary).

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

AUTHORISED CAPITAL OF COMPANIES REGISTERED IN PROVINCES

173. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state the number and the authorised capital of companies registered in each Province including Delhi from 1st January, 1943 to 31st December, 1944.

THE HONOURABLE MR. N. R. PILLAI : Sir, I lay on the table a statement giving the information asked for in respect of the period from 1st January, 1943 to 30th June, 1944. I regret that later information is not available.

(Statement showing the number and the authorised capital of companies registered in each Province including Delhi from the 1st January, 1943 to 30th June, 1944.)

Provinces.	January 1943		February 1943		March 1943		April 1943		May 1943		June 1943	
	No.	Authorised Capital Rs. (in thousands).	No.	Authorised Capital Rs. (in thousands).	No.	Authorised Capital Rs. (in thousands).	No.	Authorised Capital Rs. (in thousands).	No.	Authorised Capital Rs. (in thousands).	No.	Authorised Capital Rs. (in thousands).
Madras	20	38,55	27	1,16,69	38	2,20,20	36	3,06,40	34	1,71,71	10	52,85
Bombay	34	82,23	49	4,00,19	44	2,61,81	33	5,48,36	32	4,12,64	36	2,70,60
Bengal	38	4,88,80	29	1,42,70	46	4,41,10	67	2,19,89	69	3,92,70	19	76,40
United Provinces	6	36,10	13	70,70	11	66,40	6	58,00	6	11,02,80	10	46,00
Punjab	16	44,80	24	2,79,55	30	56,00	21	89,50	36	1,72,90	26	1,46,91
Bihar	2	5,20	1	25,00	2	10,00	2	2,98	2	5,10	3	6,50
• Central Provinces and Berar	1	1,50	1	10,00	1	5,00	1	2,60	5	1,80
Assam	2	1,20	1	89	1	50
North-West Frontier Province	1	3	9,40
Sind	2	1,00	1	5,00	3	4,10	3	70,10	1	2,00
Orissa
Ajmer-Merwara
Baluchistan	1	5,00
Delhi	12	1,49,11	6	18,00	5	5,70	7	78,20	8	41,70	6	1,09,20
Coorg

* PRICE OF COPPER

174. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state whether the price of copper is 12 annas per pound in U. K. and rupee one and annas ten in India ? If so, what are the reasons for this great difference ? If not, what are the facts ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : The price of copper ingot is about annas six a lb. in U. K. and annas ten pies nine a lb. in India for copper issued from Government stocks. Government issue price is fixed on the basis of indigenous copper price, of which cost of production is higher.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Is it available in the market at this controlled rate ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : It is issued under control directions ; so you can only get it on permits.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Is copper sold in the market or not ? And has any rate been fixed for it in respect of sales in the market ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : There is no controlled price in that sense.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : To what kind of copper does this rate apply, because there are different varieties ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I said 10 annas and 9 pies is the price fixed for copper which is issued from Government stocks.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Copper of what particular variety ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Is it sheets or ingots ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : Copper ingots.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will the Honourable Member give us the rate for copper sheets ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : If you put in another question.

PRICE OF ALUM

175. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state the following facts about the price of ferrous alum :—

(a) landed cost or import price ;

(b) price demanded by I. C. I. ; and

(c) price asked by or being paid to Indian manufacturers ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (on behalf of Supply Department) : (a) Approximate c. i. f. price of ferrous alum (alumina ferric) in slabs is £9-15-0 per ton, and of powder in bags £12-10-0 per ton. This cost includes War Risk Insurance.

(b) I. C. I. selling price f.o.r. main ports for 14/15% slabs of alumina ferric is Rs. 196 per ton.

(c) The latest quotations against Government demands received from indigenous producers for similar material range from Rs. 160 to Rs. 290 per ton.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will the Honourable Member explain in which Department this is dealt with—Commerce or Industries and Civil Supplies ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : Supply Department.

IMPORT OF AN AMMONIUM SULPHATE PLANT FROM THE U. S. A.

176. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state : (a) When and on what conditions have the Government of India consented to Travancore's proposal to buy ammonium sulphate plant from America ? (b) Have the British Dollar Control and the Empire Bureau of areas given their consent ? (c) What arrangement for shipping space has been made ? (d) What is the capacity of the plant

ordered and its estimated cost ? and (e) What method of manufacture has been adopted for this plant ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (on behalf of Supply Department) : (a) Government have no direct concern with the project and the question of conditions does not, therefore, arise. The grant of dollar facilities was agreed to in September, 1944.

(b) Dollar exchange was sanctioned by the Indian control as the project was regarded as of immediate war-time importance.

(c) It is primarily for the Company to make shipping arrangements but the good offices of the Indian Supply Mission will be made available, if necessary.

(d) The capacity of the plant is understood to be 50,000 tons per annum and its cost rupees one crore.

(e) Government have no definite information.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Was this scheme started in consultation with the Government of India or without ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : It is a scheme by the Government of Travancore.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : But was it started in consultation with the Government of India ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : They might have been consulted.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I want to know whether this will have any effect on the producing capacity of the Singhereni plant ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : No, it will not have any effect.

NATIONAL WAR FRONT

177. **THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM** : Will Government lay on the table the following information about the National War Front : (a) The names and the special qualifications of and the honoraria and privileges given to the Provincial leaders ? (b) Honoraria and the privileges given to the District leaders ? (c) The quantity of petrol sanctioned in each province for the leaders ? and (d) The estimated expenditure this year in each Province on National War Front ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : A statement showing the required information is laid on the table of the House.

STATEMENT

(a) *Names and special qualifications of and honorarium and privileges given to the provincial Leaders of the National War Front.*

(i) Name of province.	Leader.
Madras	His Excellency the Governor.
Orissa	His Excellency the Governor.
Punjab	The Hon. Honorary Major Nawabzada Malik Khizar Hayat Tiwana.
Sind	The Hon. Sir Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah.
Assam	The Hon. Sayied Sir Md. Saadulla.
Bengal	Dr. Sir A. F. Rahman.
Bombay	Sir Rustom Masani.
Bihar	Mr. C. P. N. Singh, C.I.E.
C. P. & Berar	Sir Morapant Joshi.
U. P. & N.-W. F. P.	No Leaders.

(ii) *Qualifications.*—Except in the case of Bengal, Bombay, Bihar and Central Provinces all the Leaders are either Governors of Provinces or Prime Ministers. In these four Provinces the Leaders are prominent members of the public.

(iii) *Honorarium and privileges.*—The Provincial Leaders do not draw any salary or honorarium nor do they enjoy any special privileges. The non-official Leaders draw travelling expenses for tours undertaken for the National War Front.

(b) The District Leaders of the National War Front wherever they exist do not draw any honorarium nor do they have any special privileges. They however draw travelling allowances for tours undertaken for National War Front work.

(c) Quantity of petrol sanctioned in each province for District Leaders.

Name of province.	Quantity of petrol sanctioned per month.
Bengal	8 gallons each.
Bombay	350 gallons for 25 District Leaders and 3 Bombay City Directors.
Sind	Up to 10 gallons each.
Orissa	Up to 30 gallons each.
Bihar	10—35 gallons in accordance with the size of the District
Other Provinces	On merits of each case.

(d) Estimated expenditure on National War Front in each province in 1944-45.

	Rs.
Madras	8,32,000
Bombay	3,58,100
Bengal	4,33,000
United Provinces	3,87,600
Punjab	3,64,700
Bihar	3,75,300
C. P. & Berar	1,87,900
Orissa	1,61,000
N.-W. F. P.	1,84,500
Assam	3,02,700
Sind	92,200
Total	36,79,000

COMMUNAL COMPOSITION OF GAZETTED OFFICERS IN THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

178. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government lay on the table a statement about the Planning and Development Department showing : (a) The communal composition of the Gazetted Officers on 31st January, 1945 ? (b) The names, salaries, qualifications and the method of selection of directly recruited staff from 1st April, 1944 to end of February, 1945 ? (c) Whether it is proposed to increase the number of officers ? and (d) Whether communal ratio is applicable to these appointments or not ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : (a) and (b). Statements are laid on the table of the House.

(c) As the necessity arises.

(d) The communal rule is applicable to all direct recruitment but not to transfers or promotions or recruitment to posts involving the possession of specialist or technical qualifications.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Has any proportion been fixed for direct appointments and promotions ? The Home Department might enlighten us on that subject.

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : I must ask for notice of the question.

(a) Statement showing the Communal Composition of Gazetted Officers on 31st January, 1945

Hindus	7
Muslims	1
Other Minorities	1
Europeans	1
Total	10

(b) *Directly recruited staff upto 28th February, 1945.*

Name.	Salary. Rs.	Qualifications.
(i) Dr. D. N. Wadia	2,000	Retired Geologist, Geological Survey of India. Formerly Chief Geologist, Ceylon Government. Twice appointed chairman of the Indian Science Congress (Geological Section). Author of several books on Geology.
(ii) Prof. C. N. Vakil	2,500	University Professor of Economics & Director, School of Economics & Sociology, University of Bombay. Author of several books on Indian Economic Problems. Ex-President, Indian Economic Conference, Patna, 1934. One of the Senior Economists in the country.

Method of selection.—Government looked round for suitable candidates of the qualifications required and with the permission of the F. P. S. C. appointed them.

COLLECTION OF SAUDI DUES

179. **THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM :** Will Government state the result of representations made to the Saudi Government regarding the rupee-riyal exchange rates? Is it a fact that during the last Haj pilgrimage local rate in Mecca was Rs. 1-4-0 to a riyal, whereas Government charged at Rs. 1-12-0 to a riyal, resulting in a loss of Rs. 125 to each pilgrim? When and how were the Saudi dues paid to Hejaz Government?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : The Government of India have been told that other countries have accepted the exchange rates fixed by the Saudi Arabian Government and that preferential treatment cannot be accorded to Indians. That Government have however been again pressed for the refund and their reply is awaited.

Government have no accurate information as regards the market rate of Riyal in the Hejaz, but complaints received from pilgrims indicate that it was about Rs. 1-4-0 per riyal. Government collected pilgrim dues at the rate of Rupee one and annas eleven per riyal. The Saudi dues were paid to the Hejaz Government in rupees through the usual agency of banks in February.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : February of 1945?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : Yes.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What was the Riyal exchange at that time?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : I have no information; but that will not be relevant, because recoveries had to be made in October and November.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Do the Government propose to change this arrangement for the future, or will they have the same system for the next Haj season?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : I may inform the Honourable Member that attempts were made in the past to do so, and even this year we conveyed to the Saudi Arabian Government the objections of our Muslim population to this system, but we were told definitely that unless we fell in with this system it would not be possible for Indian Muslims to participate in the Haj pilgrimage.

I may also add, Sir, that the rate is not as unjustifiable as would appear at first sight. Further information received since shows that during the Haj season the rupee exchange rate of Riyal always goes down and if we were to allow these Rs. 28 lakhs to be placed on the local market during the Haj season, it is quite possible that the rupee rate would have been very much lower than what we have enforced in making recovery of our dues.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Can a reply become a speech when we put a supplementary question, Sir?

THE HONOURABLE SIR RAHIMTOOLA CHINYOY : As I understand from the reply, the rate paid to Government was Rs. 1-4-0 and that charged to the Hajj was Rs. 1-11-0.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : That was the rate at which the dues were paid to the Hejaz Government.

THE HONOURABLE SIR RAHIMTOOLA CHINOY : In your reply you said that the market rate was Rs. 1-4-0 ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : The market rate was Rs. 1-4-0 at the time but we had to make recoveries at the rate prescribed by the Hejaz Government.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Would Government consider the possibility of paying in gold or allowing the passengers to pay in gold ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : That was also done, Sir, but, as the Honourable Member is aware, there is a ban on the export of gold on any large scale. So, we cannot avail ourselves of that.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will the Finance Department relax it to a little extent and save seven annas per rupee ?

(No answer.)

MUSLIMS IN THE CADRE OF INCOME-TAX OFFICERS

180. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state the steps taken to maintain the prescribed percentage of Muslims in the cadre of Income-tax Officers, Class I, in the reorganisation of Income-tax Services ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : The Class I Service of Income-tax Officers will consist of two grades. Appointments to the 1st Grade will be made by promotion and consequently without regard to communal considerations. 80% of vacancies in grade II will be filled by direct recruitment and consequently in accordance with the existing orders 25% of such vacancies will be reserved for Muslims.

APPOINTMENT OF PERSONAL ASSISTANT TO THE COMMISSIONER OF INCOME-TAX

181. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state: (a) Whether the normal tenure of the post of the P. A. to the Commissioner of Income-tax is three years ?

(b) Whether there is a convention in the Punjab that Muslims and Hindus should hold the post of P. A. alternately ?

(c) If the reply to (b) is in the affirmative, will Government state why a Muslim was appointed in 1943 after a lapse of over four years ? and

(d) Why was the Muslim who was appointed to the post of P. A. in April, 1943 and removed from that post in June, 1943 not succeeded by a Muslim ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : (a) The post of Personal Assistant to the Commissioner of Income-tax is not technically a tenure post, but under the Board's instructions, it is not the practice ordinarily to retain any particular incumbent in the post for more than three years.

(b) No. The post of Personal Assistant is filled by the most suitable junior officer available at the time, having regard to all circumstances.

(c) Does not arise.

(d) The Honourable Member's attention is invited to my reply to part (b) of this question. The most suitable junior officer available at the time happened to be a non-Muslim.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : With respect to part (b), has it been the practice in the past to appoint Hindus and Muslims alternately ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : Not as a matter of principle.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : As a matter of fact, it has been so ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : I do not think so, but I cannot state definitely.

APPOINTMENT OF ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER OF INCOME-TAX

182. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM: Will Government state whether any Muslim officer has been appointed as Assistant Commissioner of Income-tax since 1st January, 1944, and how many non-Muslims have been appointed upto 28th February, 1945?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES: Since 1st January, 1944 13 officers have been appointed on a permanent basis as Assistant Commissioners. Of these five are Muslims and eight non-Muslims.

USE OF CONGRESS FLAGS AS DUSTERS.

183. THE HONOURABLE MR. NARAYANDAS GIRDHARDAS: (a) Has the attention of Government been drawn to the reports published in the newspapers about pulling down from private buildings the Congress flags and using them as dusters in some Delhi Courts?

(b) If so, do they propose to take suitable action to publicly express their disapproval of such action and state whether they propose to take suitable action against the persons responsible for such actions to prevent recurrence of such incidents in future?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH: (a) and (b). Yes. The reports were incorrect and no action on them is necessary.

ALLOTMENT OF QUARTERS TO MEMBERS OF THE CENTRAL LEGISLATURE

184. THE HONOURABLE MR. NARAYANDAS GIRDHARDAS: Will the Government of India state the policy and principles on which quarters are allotted at New Delhi to the members of the Central Legislature and by whom such allotments are made?

THE HONOURABLE MR. SHAVAX A. LAL: Presumably the Honourable Member has in mind allotments for the session period. Such allotment in the case of members of the Council of State is made by the Joint Secretary, Legislative Department and in the case of members of the Legislative Assembly by the Secretary Legislative Assembly Department. Two circulars giving the desired information are laid on the table.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT

Circular No. XXXIII

To

ALL MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL OF STATE.

New Delhi, the 15th December 1944

Sir,

I am directed to address you in connection with accommodation during the ensuing Session which will commence in New Delhi about the middle of February, 1944, and to inquire whether you desire to reserve any of the quarters noted below:—

(a) 4 single and 2 married Suites in the Western Court intended for those who live in European style.

(b) 13 Orthodox Quarters at Windsor Place, Ferozshah Road and Queensway.

(c) 13 Orthodox Officers' Bungalows.

2. A statement (Enclosure No. 1) giving details of the accommodation contained in these quarters and showing the rents which have been fixed on the basis of a daily and a session's tenancy is attached. A quarter taken on the former basis may be relinquished at any time and rent will be charged only for the actual period of occupation but in that event no lien on the quarter will be permissible. For a quarter taken on the latter basis a lien will be allowed but rent will be charged for the whole session whether the quarter is occupied or not. A relaxation of this rule will only be permissible under very special circumstances at the discretion of the Joint Secretary, Legislative Department. Attention is specially invited to this rule and to the requirement of three days notice of arrival to be given to the Executive Engineer, 'A' Division, Central P. W. D., New Delhi.

The rents, which are provisional, include the rent for the sanctioned scale of furniture only and extra rent must be paid for additional furniture taken, a receipt for the same being signed. Bed linen and towels are not supplied.

3. Applications for accommodation should clearly state whether it is required at the daily or sessional rate. In the absence of such information it will be assumed that the quarter is required on a sessional basis. Preference will be given to applications at sessional rate.

4. The residences are intended for Members only and under no circumstances should unauthorised persons be permitted to occupy them. This applies even to cases where residences are vacated before the expiry of the period for which they were allotted. It is, therefore, requested that they should be made over to the Central P. W. D. authorities on vacation.

5. Residences can only be occupied one week before the commencement of the Session and one week after its termination unless a Member's presence is required on business connected with the Legislature.

6. Permission to occupy residences for any period before or after the period of the Session must be previously obtained from the Estate Officer, Central P. W. D., New Delhi.

7. Double quarters will only be allotted to Members who are bringing their families.

8. The contract for messing arrangements for those living in European style at the Western Court has been given to a caterer whose charges have been fixed as shown in Enclosure No. 2. Residence here will be conditional on payment of the daily rates for messing as shown in the said enclosure during the period they are in residence. Musical instruments including gramophones and wireless sets should not be played in the Western Court so as to be a source of annoyance to other residents and in no case should they be played after 11 P.M. without the prior consent of the Manager.

9. Applications for accommodation should state whether a garage is also required.

10. A reply to this letter is requested by the 15th January, 1945. Applications received after 1-30 P.M. on that date will not be entertained.

Enclosure No. 1.

Statement showing the particulars of accommodation and rents of quarters in the Western Court, Windsor Place, Ferozshah Road, and Queensway, and of Orthodox Officers' Bungalows in New Delhi available for Members of the Council of State.

Nos. of quarters	Particulars of Accommodation.	Rate of rent (provl.).	
		Sessional	Daily
		Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
WESTERN COURT.			
<i>Unorthodox Married Suites.</i>			
No. 12	2 bed rooms and 1 bath room (The second bed room can be used as a sitting room).	176 15 0	5 3 0
No. 53	Ditto		
<i>Unorthodox single Suites.</i>			
No. 5	1 bed room and 1 bath room	104 2 0	3 1 0
No. 54	Ditto		
No. 8	Ditto		
No. 7	Ditto		
ORTHODOX QUARTERS			
<i>Windsor Place.</i>			
Nos. 6, 7, 8, 10 and 16	1 hall 1 sitting room 1 dining room 1 bed room 1 bath room 1 kitchen 1 store 1 water closet 1 courtyard	216 0 0	6 6 0
No. 9	The accommodation in this quarter is the same as in the above, but the courtyard is smaller.		

Nos. of quarters	Particulars of Accommodation.	Rate of rent (provl.).	
		Sessional	Daily
		Rs. A P.	Rs A. P.
<i>Ferozshah Road.</i>			
Nos. 12-A and 12-E	1 hall 1 sitting room 1 bed room 1 kitchen 1 store 2 water closets 1 dressing room and bath room combined 1 courtyard	214 2 0	6 5 0
Nos. 12-B and 12-D No. 12-C	Ditto The accommodation is the same as in the above, but the rooms are larger.		
<i>Queensway</i>			
Nos. 23 and 25	1 hall 1 sitting room 1 dining room 1 bed room 1 kitchen 1 store 2 water closets 1 dressing room and bath room combined 1 courtyard	213 6 0	6 4 0
ORTHODOX OFFICERS' BUNGALOWS			
<i>Canning Lane</i>			
No. 1	3 bed rooms 2 dressing rooms 1 sitting room 1 dining room 1 kitchen 1 store 1 bath room 2 latrines 2 servants' rooms 1 courtyard 1 garden (enclosed)	218 0 0	6 6 0
ORTHODOX OFFICERS' BUNGALOWS			
<i>Ferozshah Road.</i>			
Nos. 1 and 2	3 bed rooms 2 dressing rooms 1 sitting room 1 dining room 1 kitchen 1 store 1 bath room 2 latrines 2 servants' rooms 1 courtyard 1 garden (enclosed)	218 0 0	6 6 0
<i>Electric Lane.</i>			
No. 3	Ditto		

Nos. of quarters.	Particulars of Accommodation.	Rate of rent (provl.).	
		Sessional	Daily
NEW BUNGALOWS ORTHODOX			
<i>Canning Lane</i>			
Nos. 7, 9 and 11	2 bed rooms 1 drawing room 1 dining room 1 lobby 1 spare room 1 kitchen 1 store room 2 water closets 2 bath rooms 2 servants' quarters 1 servants' closet 1 courtyard 1 garden (enlosed)	Rs. A. P. 218 0 0	Rs. A. P. 6 6 0
<i>Ferozshah Road</i>			
Nos. 7, 9, 10, 11, 18 and 33	Ditto	218 0 0	6 6 0

Notes.—(1) The sessional rent is based on a seven weeks period of occupation. For any period in excess of seven weeks rent will be recovered at the monthly rate for the actual period of occupation.

(2) Members are reminded that the Western Court is conducted on the lines of an hotel. No private arrangements for cooking are permitted. Linen is not supplied in the bed rooms.

(3) The rents include provision for electric current, water and replacement of lamps during the period of occupancy.

(4) In no case have garages and stables been included in the rents of quarters. Servants' quarters have been excluded in the case of the Western Court. Within the numbers available these outhouses will be allotted according to the demand of tenants at the following rates:—

Outhouses—	Sessional	Daily
	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
Garage	6 13 0	0 8 0
Stable	5 2 0	0 6 0
Servant's quarter	5 2 0	0 6 0

Current consumed by fans, radio sets, etc., will be recovered in addition when they are connected at the following rates:—

(i) Ceiling fan at Rs. 4 per mensem.

(ii) Table fan at Rs. 2 per mensem.

(iii) Radio set at Rs. 2/8 per mensem.

(iv) Heaters, irons, kettles, etc., at Rs. 9 per mensem each at Western Court and Rs. 5 at other residences.

Enclosure No. 2.

WESTERN COURT, NEW DELHI

Schedule showing the Rates of Catering

Season, 1945

*A.—Daily Rate—	B.—Guests—	
	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
1. Single person	5 8 0	
Married couple	10 8 0	Breakfast . 1 8 0

*These rates are subject to revision.

*A—Daily Rate—contd.

2. Children—

	Rs. A. P.		Rs. A. P.
under 3 years	2 0 0	Lunch	2 0 0
between 3 and 6 years	2 8 0		
between 6 and 9 years	3 0 0	Tea	0 12 0
between 9 and 12 years	4 0 0		
above 12	5 8 0		

3. European servant

5 0 0	Dinner	3 0 0
-------	------------------	-------

These cover the ordinary meals; special teas or special dishes at dinner will be the subject of special arrangements.

C.—If meals (i.e., breakfast, lunch or dinner) are served in rooms, there will be an extra charge of 3 annas a meal except in the case of illness when no charge will be made in which case the residents must send their own servants for the meals.

Meals if taken to rooms will only be served half an hour before or after the time fixed for regular meals.

D.—(a) Fuel (coal or wood) will be supplied by the caterer at market rates.

(b) Hot water for baths will be provided free daily during the hours from 6 to 9 A.M. and 7 to 9 P.M. Hot water if taken between the hours 9 A.M. and 7 P.M. and after 9 P.M. will be charged at the rate of one anna per can.

E.—The caterer will issue to residents such glass, crockery, cutlery, etc., as may be required in their rooms and the residents will be required to give a receipt for the same which will be returned when the equipment is returned to the caterer.

F.—Hours of meals are as follows :—

Breakfast	7-30 to 9 A. M.
Lunch	1 to 2 P. M.
Dinner	8 to 9-30 P. M.

G.—Residents who have given previous notice of absence on tour or otherwise will not be charged the daily rates for messing for the period of their absence but no rebate in the messing charges will be made for a period of absence of less than 48 hours.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY DEPARTMENT

Circular No. LVII

New Delhi, the 18th December, 1944

To

ALL MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

:SIR;

I am directed to address you in connection with your accommodation for the next Session so be held in New Delhi and to inquire whether you desire to apply for any of the residences noted below or whether you will make your own arrangements.

The accommodation which will be available for allotment to Members of the Legislative Assembly is as follows :—

(a) 14 single and 5 double suites in the Western Court at New Delhi intended for Members who live in European style.

(b) 14 Orthodox houses at Windsor Place, New Delhi.

(c) 7 Orthodox Bungalows on Ferozshah Road and Canning Lane, New Delhi.

(d) 24 New type Orthodox Bungalows on Ferozshah Road, Electric Lane and Canning Lane.

Besides the above-mentioned accommodation, 23 Orthodox residences on Queensway and Ferozshah Road and an Orthodox Bungalow in Electric Lane will also be available. But these will not be allotted to Members so long as any of the accommodation referred to in parts (b), (c) and (d) of the preceding sub-paragraph remains unallotted. These residences have been shown in Statement II attached.

2. Statements giving details of the accommodation contained in these residences and showing the rents which have been fixed on the basis of a session's tenancy is attached. A Member taking a residence will be charged a lump sum as rent and will have a lien on the residence for the whole session and will be liable for the rent whether the residence is occupied by him or not. Such a residence is, however, liable to re-allotment to another Member on the waiting list who has not been provided with accommodation if it remains unoccupied for more than three days after the commencement of the session; provided that if it is not so re-allotted the original allottee will still be liable for the rent except for any special reasons. The rent fixed for all the residences available include the rent for the sanctioned scale of furniture only and extra rent must be paid for any extra furniture taken, and a receipt for such furniture should be signed. Bed linen and towels are not supplied in any of the residences.

3. The following general principles will be followed in allotting residences :—

(a) separate allotments will be made by the Legislative Assembly Department for the session and separate allotments will be made by the Estate Officer, Central Public Works Department, New Delhi, for the non-session period for purposes of Committees, etc. which may be held in advance of the session. Residences allotted for Committees, etc., in advance of the session period must be vacated for the session, unless the Members have secured the same residences for the session;

(b) preference will be given—

firstly, to Members bringing their families, for which purpose "family" means the wife and/or the near female Members of a Member's family. A Member, who secures a residence on the ground that he will be accompanied by his family, should inform the Secretary, Legislative Assembly Department, in writing before he actually occupies the residence that he has actually brought his family or that his family will be arriving on a particular date. If a Member fails to give this information, or, if it is subsequently discovered that he has given wrong information, his name will not be included in the ballot list for the next session, but will be kept only on the waiting list and he will be considered only if any residence is available after all legitimate demands are met, and

secondly, to single applicants;

(c) separate ballots will be held for the two classes mentioned above;

(d) In the case of single suites in the Western Court two such suites will only be allotted to one Member if they are actually available after the requisitions of the Members have been met.

4. In no case will an allotment, once made, be cancelled except in unavoidable circumstances such as when a Member is unable to attend the session on account of ill-health or for other valid reason.

5. The attention of the Members is invited to the fact that the residences allotted to them can only be occupied* after the 2nd February, 1945, and for one week after the termination of the session unless their presence is required in Delhi on duties connected with the Legislature as stated in paragraph 3 (a).

6. The residences are primarily intended for Members only and under no circumstances should unauthorised persons be permitted to occupy them when once they have been vacated; and this applies even to cases where the residences are vacated before the expiry of the period for which they were allotted. Members are, therefore, requested to make over their residences to the P. W. D. authorities on vacation.

7. Musical instruments, including gramophones and wireless sets, should not be played in the Western Court, New Delhi, so as to be a source of annoyance to other residents, and in no case should they be played after 11 P.M. without the prior consent of the Manager.

8. Members to whom accommodation is allotted are required to give three days' notice of arrival to the Executive Engineer, 'A' Division, Central Public Works Department, New Delhi, and for the Western Court to the Manager, Western Court, New Delhi.

9. The contract for messing arrangements for Members living in European style at the Western Court has been given to a caterer whose charges have been fixed as shown in the attached Schedule. Residence in the Court will be conditional on Members paying the daily rates for messing as set out in the Schedule during the period they are in residence in the Court.

10. Members are requested when applying for residences to state whether they will require a garage reserved and in the case of the Western Court, whether they will also require servants quarters reserved. No garages will be allotted by the Public Works Department. Garages will only be made over to Members by the Public Works Department after they have been allotted by the Legislative Assembly Department. Members are therefore advised to ensure that garages are formally allotted to them by the Legislative Assembly Department before they arrive in Delhi or within 24 hours of their arrival.

11. A reply to this letter is requested by the 6th January, 1945. The allotments will be finally made by ballot as usual on the 10th January, 1945 at 12 Noon in the Assistant Secretary's room in the Council House.

*As certain important conferences are being held by the Govt. the residences will not be available for occupation for this session before the 3rd February, 1945, i.e., 5 days before the commencement of the session instead of a week as usual.

Nos. of Residences.	Particulars of accommodation.	Rent.	
		Seasonal.	
STATEMENT I.			
<i>Showing the particulars of accommodation and rents of residences in the Windsor Court, Windsor Place, and of the Orthodox Gazetted Officers' Bungalows on Ferozshah Road and Canning and Electric Lanes, New Delhi, available for Members of the Legislative Assembly.</i>			
WINDSOR PLACE.			
Nos. 2, 5, 11, 13 and 19	One hall, one sitting room, one dining room, one bed room, one bath room, one kitchen, store, two water-closets and courtyard. The accommodation in these residences is the same as in the above but the courtyard is smaller.	254	2 0
Nos. 1, 3, 4, 12, 14, 15, 17, 18, and 20.			
WESTERN COURT. (Married Suites.)			
Nos. 2, 16, 17, 26 and 27 (Single Suites.)	Two bed rooms and one bath room. (The second bed room can be used as a sitting room.)	208	2 0
Nos. 1-A, 28, 50 and 51	One bed room and one bath room	122	8 0
Nos. 21, 21-A, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39 and 40.	Ditto	124	0 0
ORTHODOX GAZETTED OFFICERS' BUNGALOWS.			
Nos. 3, 4, 5, 6 and 8, Ferozshah Road.	Three bed rooms, two dressing rooms, one sitting room, one dining room, one kitchen, one store, one bath room, two latrines, two servants' rooms, one courtyard, one garden (enclosed).	256	8 0
Nos. 3 and 5, Canning Lane			
New-type Bungalows Nos. 13, 15, 17, 19, 21, 23, 25, 27, 29 and 31, Ferozshah Road.	Two bed rooms, one drawing room, one dining room, one small room (passage) one kitchen, one store two water-closets, two bath rooms, two servants' quarters, one servant's water closet, one courtyard, one garden (enclosed).	256	8 0
New-type Bungalows Nos. 9 and 11, Electric Lane.			
New-type Bungalows Nos. 2, 13, 15, 17, 19, 21, 23, 25, 27, 29, 31 and 33, Canning Lane.			
STATEMENT II.			
<i>Showing the particulars of accommodation and rents of residences on Queensway and Ferozshah Road and of Orthodox Gazetted Officers Bungalows in Electric Lane, New Delhi, which will only be available for Members of the Legislative Assembly after the allotment of accommodation mentioned in Statement I. is complete.</i>			
QUEENSWAY.			
No. 28	One hall, one sitting room, one dining room, one bed room, one kitchen store, two water-closets, one dressing and bath room combined and a courtyard. The accommodation in these residences is the same as in the above but the rooms are smaller.	251	0 0
Nos. 24, 31 and 32			
Nos. 26, 27, 29 and 30	Ditto		
FEROZSHAH ROAD.			
Nos. 13-C, 14-C and 16-C	One hall, one sitting room, one dining room, one bed room, one kitchen, store, two water-closets, one dressing and bath room combined and a courtyard. Accommodation in these residences is the same as in the above but the rooms are smaller.	251	14 0
Nos. 13-A, 14-A, 16-A, 13-E, 14-E and 16-E.*			
Nos. 13-B; 14-B, 16-B, 13-D, 14-D and 16-D.	Ditto		
ORTHODOX GAZETTED OFFICERS' BUNGALOW.			
No. 1, Electric Lane	Three bed rooms, two dressing rooms, one sitting room, one dining room, one kitchen, one store, one bath room, two latrines, two servants' rooms, one courtyard one garden (enclosed).	256	8 0

*N.B.—Residence 16-E, Ferozshah Road is reserved as an Enquiry Office for the convenience of Members.

NOTE.

(1) The seasonal rent is based on two months' period of occupation. For any period in excess of two months, rent will be recovered at the monthly rate for the actual period of occupation.

(2) The rents include the rent for the sanctioned scale of furniture only and extra rent at the rate of 2 per cent. per mensem (on the value of furniture) must be paid for any extra furniture taken.

(3) Members are reminded that the Western Court is conducted on the lines of a hotel. No private arrangements for cooking are permitted and residents are liable to pay the caterer's charges whether they take their meals or not. Linen is not supplied in the bedrooms.

(4) The rents include provision for electric current for light only; water and replacement of lamps during the period of occupancy. They do not include charges for current consumed by fans and radio sets which will be charged for at the following provisional rates on receipt of connection reports from the Electrical Engineer, Central Public Works Department :—

- (i) Ceiling fans at Rs. 4-0-0 per mensem per fan.
- (ii) Table fans at Rs. 2-0-0 per mensem per fan.
- (iii) Radio sets at Rs. 2-8-0 per mensem per set.
- (iv) Heaters at Rs. 9-0-0 per mensem per heater at the Western Court and Rs. 6-0-0 per mensem per heater at other residences.

(5) In no case have garages and stables been included in the rents of residences. Servants' quarters have been excluded in the case of the Western Court. Within the numbers available these outhouses will be allotted according to the demand of tenants at the following rates :—

Outhouses—	Monthly
	Rs. A. P.
Garages	4 0 0
Stables	3 0 0
Servants' quarters	3 0 0

(6) The residences in Windsor Place and the New-type Bungalows have one European pattern and one Indian-pattern water closet.

WESTERN COURT, NEW DELHI

Schedule showing the rates of catering

BUDGET SEASON, 1945

A.—Daily rate—	Rs. A. P.
1. For single person	5 8 0
For married couple	10 8 0
2. Children—	
Under 3 years	2 0 0
Between 3 and 6 years	2 8 0
Between 6 and 9 years	3 0 0
Between 9 and 12 years	4 0 0
Above 12 years	Full rates.
3. European servant	5 0 0
B.—Guests—	
Breakfast	1 8 0
Lunch	2 0 0
Tea	0 12 0
Dinner	3 0 0

These cover the ordinary meals ; special teas or special dishes at dinner will be subject to special arrangements.

C.—If meals (i.e., breakfast, lunch or dinner) are served in rooms, there will be an extra charge of 3 annas a meal except in the case of illness when no charge will be made, in which case the residents must send their own servants for the meals.

Meals if taken to rooms will only be served half an hour before or after the time fixed for regular meals.

D.—(a) Fuel (coal or wood) will be supplied by the caterer at market rates.

(b) Hot water for baths will be provided free daily during the hours from 6 to 9 A.M. and 7 P.M. Hot water if taken at other hours will be charged at the rate of 0-1-0 per gal.

E.—The caterer will issue to residents such glass, crockery, cutlery, etc., as may be required in their rooms and the residents will be required to give a receipt for the same which will be returned when the equipment is returned to the caterer.

F.—Hours of meals are as follows :—

Breakfast	8-30 to 9-30 A. M.
Lunch	1-30 to 2-30 P. M.
Dinner	8 to 9 P. M.

G.—Residents who have given previous notice of absence on tour or otherwise will not be charged the daily rates for messing for the period of their absence, but no rebate in the messing charges will be made for a period of absence of less than 48 hours.

PROPOSAL TO REVIEW CASES OF POLITICALS BY A JUDICIAL TRIBUNAL

185. THE HONOURABLE MR. NARAYANDAS GIRDHARDAS: Will the Government of India state whether they propose to submit the cases of all political prisoners now in detention without trial for review by a competent and independent judicial tribunal and release such of the detenues against whom a charge is not judicially proved or framed or who have not been convicted by any judicial authority on trial?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH: No, Sir.

CONFERENCE ON "RECONSTRUCTION PROBLEMS OF ASIA" HELD AT NEW YORK

186. THE HONOURABLE RAJA YUVERAJ DUTTA SINGH: Will Government make a statement as to what transpired at the Conference, which was held in New York on the "Reconstruction Problems of Asia," at which India is said to have been represented by Dr. S. Chandra Sakhar?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN: Government have seen a press report of a conference on this subject sponsored by a body known as the Research Bureau for Post-war Economics of New York. The Conference was not official and Government have no information as to what transpired.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: Are Government making inquiries and trying to get information on this subject?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN: I do not think it is worthwhile making inquiries.

OCCUPATION OF GERMANY BY THE ALLIED NATIONS

187. THE HONOURABLE RAJA YUVERAJ DUTTA SINGH: Are Government aware that according to the joint statement issued by Messrs. Winston Churchill, Roosevelt and Stalin "forces of the three Powers will each occupy a separate zone of Germany after her defeat"? If so, will India be given a hand in the plan of co-ordinate administration and control of the German zone, in recognition of the glorious part played by her in the war? Will they make a statement on the plan referred to above?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (on behalf of Defence Department): I would refer the Honourable Member to the answer given by the Honourable the Defence Member to his question No. 12 on the 15th February, 1945, to which I am not at present in a position to add.

ATLANTIC CHARTER

188. THE HONOURABLE RAJA YUVERAJ DUTTA SINGH: (a) Has the attention of Government been drawn to the following joint statement issued by Messrs. Churchill, Roosevelt and Stalin: "This is the principle of the Atlantic Charter—the right of all peoples to choose the form of government under which they will live—restoration of sovereign rights and self-government to the peoples who have been forcibly deprived of them by aggressor nations"?

(b) Have Government formulated plans for translating the principle of the Atlantic Charter to the political conditions prevailing in India?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (a) I have seen the newspaper reports of the statement referred to by the Honourable Member.

(b) I can only repeat what I said in reply to a question by the Honourable Member on the 22nd February last, that the policy of His Majesty's Government in regard to the future of India has been made clear in various pronouncements made from time to time, and that I cannot usefully add to them.

Note.—Questions against the Hon. Raja Yuveraj Dutta Singh were put by the Hon. Mr. G. S. Motilal.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Do we understand, Sir, that important pronouncements of Messrs. Churchill, Roosevelt and Stalin have not been officially communicated to the Government of India ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : That question does not arise here.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : It is in the question itself. You have said that you have seen press reports. I ask whether Government got official intimation or not?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : They may or they may not, but that is not the point. Any statement made is known to us as it is known to you.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Have Government taken official cognizance of the statement made by Messrs. Churchill, Stalin and Roosevelt at the Yalta Conference with regard to the application of the Atlantic Charter ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : I must ask for notice of that question to answer it definitely.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Mr. President, the question is : " Has the attention of Government been drawn to the following joint statement, etc. " and the Honourable the Leader replied that he has seen press reports. I ask whether Government has official cognizance of it or not ? It is part of the question.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : All I say is that we have seen newspaper reports. More than that I am not able to say at present.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : I want to know—

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : You cannot argue now.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : I submit to the President that sufficient notice has been given and we want to know the answer to part (b), whether Government is taking any action on that ?

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I cannot control the action of the Government of India regarding these matters.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Have they received an official report ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : Whether it is an official report or an unofficial report, I say we have seen what has been stated in the papers.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What specific action have you taken ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : There is no action necessary on our part.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : You are incompetent to take action !

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Order, order.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : A subordinate Government cannot initiate action !

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : You go on saying that for year and sit there, in the Opposition !

INDIAN CIVIL SERVICE AND INDIAN POLICE

189. **THE HONOURABLE RAJA YUVERAJ DUTTA SINGH :** (a) Will the strength of the Indian Civil Service and the Indian Police Service be increased to meet administrative requirements in the post-war period ?

(b) Was a conference in this connection held recently at Dehra Dun between the Home Department of the Central Government and the Chief Secretaries of the Provinces ?

(c) Will Government make a statement on the subject, indicating the plan they have in view ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : (a) The question whether the present strength of the Indian Civil Service and the Indian Police would be adequate to meet the requirements of Government in the post-war period is under examination,

(b) No. The Conference that was held in Dehra Dun in December last was convened with the object of discussing problems connected with post-war recruitment to vacancies in civil services reserved for candidates with "war service".

(c) As stated in (a) above the question is still under examination and no plans have yet been formulated.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Which is the agency which is examining the question of the administrative requirements of the Indian Civil Service and of the Indian Police Service ? I understood the Honourable Mr. Conran-Smith to say that the question was under examination. Which is the agency which is examining the question ? Is there any sub-committee for that purpose or is it administratively examined by any particular administrative officer or is the Home Department itself examining the question ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : It is being examined by the appropriate agency, the Home Department. We have an Officer on Special Duty for the purpose.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Do Government propose to get provincial opinions on the subject ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : Most certainly ; we are getting them.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : In the case of section 93 provinces what method have they adopted to get the public view ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : Consulting the Provincial Government.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : But it is not representative of the people of the province ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : That is a matter of opinion. In any case it is for the Provincial Governments themselves to ascertain the public view if they so wish.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Has the Government issued any direction to section 93 provinces to consult public opinion on the point ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Do they propose to issue such direction ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : No, Sir.

FUEL PIPE LINE FROM INDIA TO CHINA

190. **THE HONOURABLE RAJA YUVERAJ DUTTA SINGH :** Will any part of the cost of building and maintaining the new 2,000-mile lend-lease fuel pipe line from India to China; fall on the Indian revenues ? If so, what is the total estimate of the cost of this undertaking, and how much of it is likely to be borne by India ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : I would refer the Honourable Member to the reply given by me to part (a) of his question No. 126 on 14th March, 1945. The Government of India have no information about the total estimated cost of this project.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Have Government got any information with regard to part of the line which is within India ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : I answered this question fully on the 14th March, 1945 and in reply to various supplementary questions asked on that date.

191. THE HONOURABLE RAJA YUVERAJ DUTTA SINGH : (a) Is it a fact that some 5,000 Indians live in the Western States of U. S. A., and about 20 per cent. of them indirectly own land, as direct ownership is not allowed to Asiatics, but control is allowed through third parties, sons and daughters, born in the United States, who are permitted to own lands ?

(b) Will Government make an inquiry into this, and make a statement on the subject, indicating the steps taken to relieve the present anomalous position and redress the grievances of Indians ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : (a) The number of Indians living in the Western States of the U. S. A. is about 2,500 ; and it is believed that roughly 12 per cent. of these own land indirectly in the manner described by the Honourable Member.

(b) The position arises from the present ineligibility of Indians to acquire citizenship rights in the U. S. A. The Agent General for India in Washington has repeatedly brought to the notice of the State Department the importance which the Government of India attach to the early enactment of measures for the removal of this disability.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What action has the Government taken after the dropping of the Bill by the Senate of the U. S. A. ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : Will the Honourable Member tell me the date on which it was dropped ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : It was announced three days ago.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : Does the Honourable Member expect Government to take action within such a short time ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Do the Government propose to take any action ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : I must ask for notice of the question, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : The best thing for Government members to do when this kind of question is put to sit tight and not answer them. It will at least save public time.

MR. KHOSLA, MEMBER OF THE N. W. R. ADVISORY COMMITTEE

192. THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : (a) Is it a fact that Mr. Khosla is a member of the N. W. Railway Advisory Committee ? If so, since when ?

(b) Has he taken any contract for the supply of aerated waters on any section of the N. W. Railway ?

(c) Does he own any aerated water factory ? If so, which, where and since when ?

(d) What is his previous experience in this line of business ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : - (a) Yes. From December, 1927 to June, 1932. From March, 1937 to July, 1938. From July, 1940 to date.

(b) The firm of Messrs. Kanshi Ram Khosla and Madan Mohan have been granted the contract for the sale of ice and aerated water on the eastern section of the North Western Railway.

(c) It is understood that the firm owns aerated water factories at Ambala Cantonment and Dehra Dun. As far as I have been able to ascertain, the Dehra Dun factory has been operating since 1938. As regards the Ambala factory inquiries are still in progress.

(d) It is understood that Mr. Madan Mohan has been in the aerated water manufacturing business for many years, and that Mr. Khosla has catering experience.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : In what way was he in business ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : He has been in the manufacturing business for many years.

CONTRACTS PLACED WITH MEMBERS OF THE CENTRAL LEGISLATURE, ETC.

193. **THE HONOURABLE MR. NARAYANDAS GIRDHARDAS :** Will Government lay on the table a list of contracts of all descriptions since the beginning of the war which were placed with the members of the Central Legislature or any firm or concern in which they may be interested as partners, directors or in any other capacity ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (on behalf of Supply Department): The information is not available. Its collection will entail an expenditure of time and labour incommensurate with the results to be achieved, and I regret that this cannot be undertaken.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Is it a fact that the Supply Department ask for a list of contractors and partners of the firm when they give contracts to firms or companies ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : I must ask for notice of the question.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : The Honourable Member in charge of Supply is here. He could give the information.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : I have given the reply on his behalf.

NAMES OF RAILWAY LINES DISMANTLED IN MADRAS

194. **THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW :** Will Government state the names of the railway lines which have been dismantled in the Province of Madras for purposes of war, and the length of each line ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : The Railway lines in the Madras Presidency dismantled for purposes of the war, and their lengths are as follows :—

B.G. Coconada-Kotipalle, M. & S. M. R.	29 miles.
B. G. Shoranur-Nilambur, S.I.R.	41 „
M.G. Madura-Bodinayakkanur, S.I.R.	56 „
B.G. Bobbili-Salur, B.N.R.	10 „

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Has the Government any definite proposals to restore these lines after the war ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : The matter is under consideration and consultations are taking place with Provincial Governments as to the lines they want restored.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Will the Provincial Governments consult public opinion before they offer their own opinion in the matter ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : The Government of India must assume that Provincial Governments do take such steps as are necessary to consult public opinion.

RE-GROUPING OF THE B. N. R., M. & S. M. R. AND S. I. R.

195. **THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW :** Are there any proposals for re-grouping the B. N., M. S. M. and South Indian Railways ? If so, what are the zones into which they are proposed to be re-grouped ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : The general question of a more rational regrouping of railways is under the active consideration of Government but no conclusions have so far been reached.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Do Government propose to give a more provincialised colour to the railways or what are the methods which they propose to adopt ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SATYENDRA NATH ROY : I have said that the matter is under consideration and no conclusions have been reached. I cannot add anything more.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What are the considerations which Government will take into consideration ?

(No answer.)

SCARCITY OF CLOTH IN BENGAL

196. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Have Government investigated the cause of cloth famine which is prevalent in Bengal ?

(b) Is the Textile Control Board making arrangements to meet the demands for cloth made by that Province ?

(c) Is the Bengal Government the distributing agency of the cloth supplied to that Province ?

(d) Have the Government of India any control over the distributing agency ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : (a) There is no absolute shortage of cloth in Bengal, as during the five months ending November, 1944 cloth was made available to Bengal at a rate equivalent to 13·9 yards per head per annum against a quota of 10 yards per head. In those months there was made available in all 236,453 bales for Bengal, 54,768 bales from local mill production, 44,596 bales from handloom and 137,089 bales from outside. The Central Government's responsibility stops with the making of the cloth available to Bengal. Internal distribution is the responsibility of the Bengal Government. I am, however, aware that there is a considerable shortage of cloth in the Bengal market despite the supplies made. This would appear to be due primarily to the hoarding and profiteering of Bengal dealers.

(b) Government is supplying Bengal with cloth fully up to the quota laid down for that Province ; it is not however, possible to meet the full Bengal demand.

(c) No. Distribution continues to be done by the trade. The Bengal Government only controls it.

(d) The trade are governed by Control orders issued and prices fixed by the Central Government. Immediate supervision of them, however, is a function not of the Central Government but of the Bengal Government.

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR ROY CHOWDHURY : Is the Honourable Member aware of the statement made by the Honourable Mr. Suhrawardy, Minister for Civil Supplies, that the quota given to Bengal is sufficient only for one pair of dhoties or one pair of sarees for each adult person in Bengal ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I am not aware of the particular statement to which the Honourable Member refers.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the rumour that cloth is being smuggled into China ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I have heard that statement, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Has the Customs Department of the Central Government taken any steps to control the smuggling of cloth outside Bengal ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : We are taking such steps as we can to control smuggling on all the frontiers of India.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Has the Central Government considered the advisability of changing the period in which sales can be made in order to compel dehoarding ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I do not understand the question, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I will explain it to you. Under the orders cloth can be sold up to one year from the time of manufacture. Now in the case of Bengal if they make the change that they must sell within six months or eight months that might force the cloth to be sold.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : As the Honourable Member is aware, the original time fixed was six months but we had to change it as owing to the transport difficulties it was not always possible to ensure cloth reaching the Province of destination within a reasonable number of months after it left the mills.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Now the Honourable Member has stated that the despatch has been rapid and therefore he can go back to the old time limit if he wants.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I did not say that the despatch has been rapid. What I stated was that the correct number of bales was reaching the Province for which they were intended. It does not follow that the cloth produced in the mill today necessarily leaves the mill within a month or two. The mill may have to keep it in stock for more than two or even three months.

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR ROY CHOWDHURY : Will Government consider the desirability of appointing Government-controlled stores for cloth ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I have already stated, Sir, that the internal distribution is a matter entirely for the Provincial Government.

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR CHOWDHURY : Will the Honourable Member advise the Provincial Government to that effect ?

(No reply.)

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Is it correct that all the hoarding and profiteering is being done by the trade and not by any other persons.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : Well, Sir, by citizens also.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Can the Honourable Member explain how it is being done by citizens ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : Yes, I will. If I have a pair or two of dhotis or saris, and yet I go into the market and buy one more because I am afraid that possibly in the event of difficulty I won't get a fresh one, that today would be hoarding.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : That is the only answer which the Government can give.

FALL OF PRODUCTION IN TEXTILE MILLS

197. **THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW :** (a) Has the outturn in textile mills fallen on account of depleted supplies of coal ? Have Government computed the fall in production ? If so, what is it in yards for the year 1944 ?

(b) Do they propose to help the production of yarn by hand-spinning ?

(c) Have they considered the recommendation of the Textile Control Board that Rs. 10 crores may be granted to the All-India Spinners' Association for stimulating the production of hand-spun yarn ?

(d) Do the Government of India propose to take the co-operation of the All-India Spinners' Association in the production of more yarns and more cloth to relieve the distress ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : (a) Yes. Total loss of production during the year 1944 was 121,398,769 yards of cloth.

(b) No specific measures have been taken to assist hand-spinning. There is however, nothing to stop production of yarn by hand-spinning.

(c) The Board has made no such recommendation.

(d) Government welcomes co-operation from every quarter towards the production of more yarn and cloth.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Have they sought the assistance of the All-India Spinners' Association in augmenting the production of yarn by hand spinning ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : No.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Do they not consider it is a good source of increasing the quantity of yarn in this country ?

(No reply.)

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Has the Government taken any steps to steep up deliveries in the mill areas ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : Yes, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What are the steps taken ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : Well, Sir, the effect is clear from the actual results. The deliveries in recent months have shown a steady improvement.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Have Government any specific objection to encouraging hand-spinning ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I have said, Sir, no objection.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Is there any objection to their taking it up directly or by subsidising institutions that are meeting the real demand in this country now ?

(No reply.)

TRAINING OF LABOUR OFFICERS IN THE U. K.

198. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Is it a fact that a number of labour officers are being sent to the United Kingdom for training ? If so, what is the number ? What is the estimated cost of training each officer ?

(b) Are any special qualifications necessary for selection ? If so, what are they ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. C. PRIOR : (a) Yes. It is proposed to send, in the first instance, three batches of 20 officers each, consisting of 12 officers of the Central Government and 8 of the Provincial Governments and States. Financial sanction has been accorded to the sending of 12 Central Government officers with the first batch of trainees.

The cost per officer including the pay of the substitute, if appointed, will be about Rs. 8,600.

(b) The officers should be in Government employment or designated to fill posts under Government and should have experience of welfare work or administration of labour legislation. Officers having high educational qualifications will be given preference.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Are these appointments made by the Federal Public Service Commission or by the Labour Department themselves ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. C. PRIOR : The selection is made partly by the Labour Department and partly by Provincial Governments.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : What is the educational qualification which has been prescribed for these Labour Officers ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. C. PRIOR : No particular educational qualification has been prescribed.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Could Government give us any indication of the communal composition of the service—how many Depressed Classes people are there in the service ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. C. PRIOR : I am afraid I must ask for notice.

RESTRICTION IN AREA UNDER COTTON

199. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Have the Government of India restricted the area for growing cotton with a view to maintaining price level ?

(b) What was the total acreage and the quantity of cotton output last year and what is the proposed reduction ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. JOGENDRA SINGH : (a) The Government of India asked certain provinces and states last year to reduce the area under short staple cotton in order to make extra land available for the cultivation of food crops.

(b) The total acreage under cotton during 1943-44 was 20·4 million acres of which short and low grade medium staple cotton cover 11 million acres. The total output was 5·1 million bales of 400 lbs. each. The proposed reduction is nearly 30 per cent of the area under short and low grade medium staple cotton or about 3 million acres.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Has not the reduction in the area of cotton growing any direct effect on the production of yarn and cloth in this country ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : I do not think so. The Government had to purchase a very large number of bales of short staple cotton for which there was no market.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Could the Honourable Member tell us whether these figures are for geographical India or for British India ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : I think they include Indian States also.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Could the Honourable Member tell us what is happening in Indian States ? Is it a fact that instead of discouraging cotton growth some of the States are encouraging the growth of cotton ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : I do not think so, because for short staple cotton there is no market since the Japanese disappeared from the market.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Have Government collected any figures for the Indian States ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : I would require notice of that question, Sir.

POST-WAR PLANS FOR COTTON TEXTILES

200. **THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW :** (a) Have Government constituted any panel with regard to the textile production in this country in their post-war scheme of planning ?

(b) Is India producing the quantity of cloth that is necessary for all its requirements at present ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : (a) Yes. A special Committee of the Textile Control Board has been set up to act as panel.

(b) No.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government give the composition of the panel.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : Yes, Sir. The names are :—

Mr. Sakarlal Balabhai.

Mr. Kasturbhai Lalbhai.

Mr. R. C. Jall.

Mr. Chaturbhuj Das Chimanlal.

Mr. B. M. Bagri.

Sir Sri Ram.

Mr. B. W. Batchelor.

Mr. J. Tinker.

Diwan Bahadur C. S. Ratnasabapathi Mudaliar.

Mr. Dharamsey Mulraj Khatau.

Mr. Neville Wadia.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Is there any representative representing the consumers' interests on the Board.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Are they all representatives of the managing agent firms.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : They are all representatives of the cotton textile industry.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Do Government propose to add some more people to represent consumers' interests on that Board ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Are any economists to be associated with this panel ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Economists are purchasable commodities these days !

INCREASE IN SPINNING AND WEAVING MILLS TO MEET THE DEMAND FOR CLOTH

201. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Will Government state whether there is room for bringing into existence more spinning and weaving mills to meet the demand for cloth ? If so, do they propose to help the starting of new mills immediately after the war by giving facilities for the import of necessary machinery and providing the necessary sterling assets or dollar exchange ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : The answer to both parts of the question is in the affirmative. I must add however that in view of the tightness of our dollar position Government would not be able to arrange for dollar exchange for machinery which can be bought from within the sterling area.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : May I bring to the notice of the Honourable Member that the other day the Finance Member said that he would be able to release 20 million dollars—

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : What is the question ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : The Honourable Member is now saying that the dollar position is tight. I want to know if from the 20 million dollars released by the Finance Member arrangements could not be made for the import of machinery also.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : What I have said is that " in view of the tightness of our dollar position Government would not be able to arrange for dollar exchange for machinery which can be bought from within the sterling area ". That means, dollars will be made available for the purchase of machinery which cannot be bought within the sterling area.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will the quantum of price be any criterion in judging whether it can be obtained from the U.S.A. or the U.K. ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : That factor will also be taken into consideration.

IMPORT OF CONSUMER GOODS BY THE UNITED KINGDOM COMMERCIAL CORPORATION

202. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Have Government given any licence to the United Kingdom Commercial Corporation for importing consumers' goods into India ? If so, what are the categories of goods and the cost of the goods involved ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. N. R. PILLAI : No, Sir. The second part does not arise.

SUPPLY OF TEXTILE STORES AND MACHINERY TO THE MADRAS SPINNING AND WEAVING MILLS

203. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Are Government aware that the Madras Spinning and Weaving Mills, popularly known as the Chula Mills, have suspended their operations for some years ?

(b) In view of the demand for more cloth in this country, do Government propose to supply the required textile stores and other machinery to these weaving mills to enable them to re-start the work ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : (a) Yes.

(b) The question of re-starting this mill has been fully examined in consultation with the Government of Madras and the Millstores and Priority Assistance Committee of the Textile Control Board and the members of the Industries Committee representing South India. It was decided not to supply the required stores, spare parts and coal to enable the mill to re-start firstly because its machinery is old and inefficient and even with full supplies of all requisites before the war the owners found it very difficult to keep the mill going. Secondly, the present owners themselves sold their stores earlier in the war and thirdly, the position of millstores and coal is very tight and more production can be obtained by supplying the stores and coal available to more efficient mills. Particularly, the re-starting of a mill would involve supplying several times the stores required to obtain equivalent production from a mill already running. For example this mill would require to re-start :

(i) 4,225 gross bobbins, which is the annual requirement of two mills of equivalent size already in running order.

(ii) 32,388 rings for starting which is the annual requirement of ten mills of equivalent size already in running order.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Could the Honourable Member give us an idea as to how many mills of this nature are lying idle ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. M. PATEL : I must ask for notice.

RICE PRODUCTION IN THE ARAKAN

204. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Will Government state the figures with regard to the capacity of rice production in the Arakan before the war ?

(b) Is the United Kingdom Commercial Corporation being given facilities to export rice and other commodities from this area to outside places ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. B. R. SEN : (a) The normal pre-war production of the Arakan Division of Burma, in terms of rice, was about 438,000 tons.

(b) No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Since the Arakan area has been re-occupied, have the Government of India any information whether they can get some rice to India from that area ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. B. R. SEN : We have had some reports to the effect that there is some rice in the Arakan Division, but whether that rice is surplus to the requirements of the liberated area as a whole is yet to be known.

PROPERTIES LOST BY INDIAN BUSINESSMEN IN BURMA

205. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Will Government lay on the table a list of all the Indian businessmen who lost properties in Burma and were evacuated during the time of enemy occupation of Burma ?

(b) Do Government propose to enable the Indian evacuees to return to Burma and identify and claim the properties which were left behind when they came out of Burma ?

(c) Are Government aware of any blue-prints which are being made by the Government of Burma in Simla for eventual rehabilitation of normal Government in the territories as they are re-conquered ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : (a) Many such Indian businessmen have registered their claims with the Government of Burma but no list of those businessmen is available.

(b) Government propose to do everything in their power for securing these objects.

(c) Government of India are aware that the Government of Burma are engaged in drawing up plans for the rehabilitation of Burma after the re-occupation of that country. They will consult the Government of India regarding matters affecting Indian interests.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Have the Government made any arrangements to see that Indians are not placed at any disadvantage as compared with what was their condition before the war ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : I would like to know if the Honourable Member is referring to disadvantage regarding entry only ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : No, Sir. About business, and facilities for starting manufactures.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : Government have no reason to presume at this stage that any discrimination will be made against Indians in this respect.

JUTE CULTIVATION IN BRAZIL

206. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Has the attention of Government been drawn to a news published in the *Hindustan Times* of the 27th February, 1945, morning edition, that Brazil in South America has brought a large area of acreage under jute production and that the Indian jute trade will be adversely affected in the North and South America ?

(b) Have Government any plan to conserve and protect the position which India enjoys in jute in the world market ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. N. R. PILLAI : (a) Yes.

(b) Government are watching the position carefully, and will take such steps as may be necessary to ensure that the position of Indian jute in export markets is not endangered.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Can the Honourable Member give us the nature of the steps which the Government are going to take to ensure that the position of jute is not affected—one or two examples of the steps Government propose to take to safeguard the interests of jute ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. N. R. PILLAI : As is implied in my answer, we have something better than a long range-plan ; we have a continuous plan. We are watching the situation most carefully and with the closest attention, and we shall take appropriate action at the appropriate time. We cannot disclose any details now.

ESTABLISHMENT OF A TECHNOLOGICAL INSTITUTE

207. THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : (a) Will Government state who are the representatives of the Madras Province on the Committee appointed with Mr. N. R. Sarkar as its Chairman, to consider the establishment of a high-grade technological institute in India to provide advance instruction and training in technology ?

(b) Do Government propose to give representation to the Indian Industrialists of experience from Madras Province on this Committee ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : (a) There are no representatives of Provinces as such on the committee.

(b) Adequate representation has been given to all the interests, including industrial, mainly concerned with the proposed Institute. There is a prominent businessman from Madras.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : May I know his name ? Perhaps Mr. Ladden, representative of the Simpson Company ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : Yes. Then there is Dr. K. Venkataraman.

THE HONOURABLE SIE GOPALASWAMI AYYANGAR : He is now in Bombay.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Could the Honourable Member lay the list of members on the table of the House ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : It is a tentative list ; it has to be completed.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I am only anxious to see that Muslims are there.

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : I will lay the list on the table when it is complete.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Are Muslims adequately represented ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : I can not say whether they are adequately represented. I will lay the list when it is completed.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will the Honourable Member lay it on the table as it is, and add to it afterwards ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : No. It would not be right to publish an incomplete list.

Khuraki ALLOWANCE PAID TO INFERIOR STAFF.

208. THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will Government state :
(a) Whether it is a fact that the *Khuraki* Allowance paid to the inferior staff of the Government of India has been converted into conveyance allowance and has been reduced from annas six to annas four in respect of duffries ?

(b) Do they propose to increase the allowance in respect of duffries and peons in view of the prevailing high prices ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : (a) The reply is in the negative. The position is that conveyance allowance at different rates were being paid from their contingent grants by the various departments of the Government of India to members of the inferior staff who were detained for duty beyond certain hours in the evening in the interest of the public service. Since there was no uniformity of practice, general orders were issued to the effect that inferior servants would be granted four annas for being detained on duty after 8 P.M.

(b) Government have no reason to believe that the allowance is inadequate for the purpose for which it is given.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will the Honourable Member not evade the question, and will he tell us what was the practice formerly ; from what hour to what hour were they expected to work ; and whether they used to get six annas or four annas ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : I have explained that in the answer—that the practice in different Departments was varied. Some Departments gave nothing ; some Departments gave four annas. One Department—the Defence Department—gave six annas. Presumably it was some disgruntled inferior servant from the Defence Department who prompted this question. A number of departments gave nothing. Some gave allowances if the servants were detained after 8-30. Some gave allowances if the servants were detained after eight. Some gave allowances if they were detained after 7-30. In order to avoid discontent as between Departments, orders were issued which would govern all Departments, giving an allowance of four annas to inferior servants of any Department detained, under proper authority, on duty after 8 P.M.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What are the working hours of these inferior servants ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : Unfortunately in the Secretariat there are no normal working hours.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : May I suggest that the hours of work should be applied to these servants ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR CYRIL JONES : I do not think Government have ever recognised the principle of giving overtime allowances to ministerial servants who have to sit late as a general matter.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Could the Government be more generous in this connection ?

(No answer.)

APPOINTMENT OF UNQUALIFIED CLERKS AND ASSISTANTS

209. **THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM :** Will Government state: (a) Whether it is a fact that a large number of persons have been appointed as clerks and assistants on the establishment of the Government of India Secretariat without passing the Federal Public Service Commission's prescribed examination ?

(b) If the answer to part (a) is in the affirmative, are persons appointed on the result of the Federal Public Service Commission Examination given no preference over these persons ?

(c) If the answers to parts (a) and (b) are in the affirmative, do Government propose to give these qualified candidates some preference over those unqualified ones ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : (a) Yes, but only on a temporary basis.

(b) and (c). The question does not specify the matters in respect of which the Honourable Member requires information regarding the preference to be given but the question of the relative claims of the two classes of persons referred to is under consideration at the moment and I am not in a position to make any statement at present.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Will those who have been provisionally appointed be made permanent without examination ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : I have told the Honourable Member that the whole question of permanent appointments is under consideration, and I cannot make any statement at present. But the Honourable Member has not made clear what he means by preference, whether he means preference in initial appointments, preference in promotion, or preference in post-war appointments. It is quite impossible to answer so vague a question.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I shall explain personally.

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. CONRAN-SMITH : Very good.

RESOLUTION RE APPLICATION OF ECONOMIC SANCTIONS AGAINST SOUTH AFRICA.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU (United Provinces Southern : Non-Muhamadan) : Mr. President, I read out my Resolution* before the Council broke up on the 16th. I shall invite the attention of the Council to the specific recommendations which I have made in this Resolution. They are that the Governor General in Council may be pleased to apply economic sanctions against South Africa and to recall the High Commissioner from South Africa. The circumstances which have given rise to the present strained relations between South Africa and India were narrated at length by the Honourable Mr. Banerjee in the speech which he made in this House on the 17th November, 1944. They have been stated very correctly and ably by him and I do not think it is necessary for me to narrate them over again. I will, however, just invite the attention of the House to a few landmarks in our relations with South Africa.

In 1927, there was the Class Disabilities Bill, and a controversy raged over it. In order to settle that controversy, and improve relations between India and South Africa a deputation went out from this country to South Africa and eventually we had the Cape Town Agreement in 1927. In 1927

* "This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that in view of the attitude of the South African Government he may be pleased to apply (a) economic sanctions against South Africa and (b) recall the High Commissioner from South Africa."

[Mr. P. N. Saprū.]

the South African Government accepted their responsibility for the welfare of the Indian community. They accepted the position that they were as a Government bound to do everything they could to advance the material and educational welfare of the Indian population resident in South Africa. In order that the Cape Town Agreement may be properly implemented, the Government of India decided to send a High Commissioner to South Africa to watch the interests of residents in South Africa. He was to be our diplomatic agent in South Africa. Now, the position, as I understand it, is this. The Government of India have no objection in principle to economic sanctions being applied against South Africa. They have no objection in principle to the High Commissioner being recalled from South Africa. In fact, when the Assembly met in the last session, the Honourable the Commonwealth Relations Member indicated that he had both these solutions in mind and that he would not hesitate to use economic sanctions or to recall the High Commissioner if he felt that it was necessary in the interests of the country to take those steps against South Africa. That was the position in November last. Now, Sir, our former High Commissioner, Sir Shafaat Ahmad Khan retired somewhere in February, 1945 and Mr. Deshmukh left India some time in February, 1945. I think he left about the time the other House met on the 9th February to debate this question. The question is whether it was necessary, in view of the fact that Sir Shafaat Ahmad Khan had finished his term of office, to appoint a new High Commissioner. Anyway, the step was taken by the Commonwealth Relations Department and we have our new High Commissioner now in South Africa, and the question is whether we should not now recall him.

The second question is whether we should not apply economic sanctions against South Africa. I will just state the case for the application of economic sanctions against South Africa. In April, 1943, an Act which is now known as the Pegging Act was passed by the South African Government. Before 1943, Indians could acquire land without any difficulty anywhere they chose. What the Pegging Act does is to restrict the transfer or sales by Europeans to Indians in localities which are predominantly European in character. They will not be permitted to transfer these lands under the Act without the previous permission of the Minister of the Interior. I think I have stated correctly the general purport of the Pegging Act. After the Pegging Act was passed, there was a great deal of agitation both in South Africa and in this country against the Pegging Act. Protests were sent by the Indian Government to the South African Government. A cable was sent by the Viceroy to Field Marshal Smuts and the Indians waited in deputation on Field Marshal Smuts, and what is known as the Pretoria Agreement was arrived at between a majority of the Natal Indian Congress and the Government of General Smuts. Now, Sir, whether the Pretoria Agreement was a mistake or was not a mistake is a question into which I will not go. Under the Pretoria Agreement there was to be no restriction on the acquisition of property. There was to be a Licensing Board of two Europeans and of two Indians and a European of judicial experience as Chairman and it was for this Licensing Board to give permits for the acquisition of property for occupational purposes. I think I am stating the purport of the Pretoria Agreement correctly. The Licensing Board was to control the future occupation of property for residential purposes in such urban areas where the question of Indians living in close proximity to Europeans was likely to cause friction. There was to be no restriction under that Agreement of the right of Indians to acquire property of any kind in the country. As I have said, I am not going into the question whether the Government of India was right or wrong in acquiescing in this Agreement. The point is that this Agreement was followed up by an Ordinance which was going to embody the terms of this Agreement. When the Ordinance came before the Natal Council it was referred to a Select Committee on the 19th of June and the Ordinance was amended in vital respects by the Select Committee. The amended Ordinance was called the Regulation of Property of Indians Ordinance and under this Ordinance both occupation and acquisition of residential properties is to be allowed only on a licence issued by a Licensing Board. It will be seen that there is a violent departure in this Ordinance from the principles which were accepted by the Preto-

ria Agreement. Acquisition of property has also been brought in under this Ordinance. Further the Licensing Board for the occupation and occupation of residential property is to be immediately extended to all areas in the province of Natal. The original Agreement provided that in granting licences for occupation the Licensing Board should make allowance for the natural expansion of Indians who were pressed for living space. The amended Ordinance made it incumbent on the Board to take into account the views of local bodies in which Indians have no representation when any town-planning scheme is contemplated by them. There is, as we know, a programme of town-planning and the position is that so far as Indians are concerned they have no municipal franchise. Of course they have no parliamentary franchise. Two Ordinances were passed on the 22nd November, 1944, the Residential Property Ordinance, Natal Housing and Natal Expropriation Ordinance and General Smuts himself admitted that the Residential Property Regulation Ordinance was not in accordance with the Pretoria Agreement. I have given you the history in brief of these Ordinances. But the position in regard to these Ordinances is that they have been held to be *ultra vires*. They are no longer in force. But that is not a very satisfactory position from our point of view. It is true that the Ordinances are no longer in force. But the result is that the Pegging Act has come automatically into operation—

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : On a point of information, Sir. The Ordinances have never been in force because they have not yet received the assent of the Governor General.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : They have never received the assent of the Governor General, but the position is that the Ordinances having been held to be *ultra vires* we go back to the position as it was when the Pegging Act was passed. I hope I am right in stating that we go back to the position as it was when the Pegging Act was passed.

THE HONOURABLE DR. N. B. KHARE : That is correct.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : The question is what are we to do so far as South Africa is concerned? We have tried the method of negotiation. We have been making representation after representation to the South African Government, but the South African Government refuses to see the light of day. It refuses to listen to the voice of reason. It takes the attitude that it will continue to be guided by those racial considerations, by those racial policies, which the leaders of the United Nations profess to denounce in the case of Nazi Germany. It professes to emulate without any apologies the example of Nazi Germany so far as the Asiatic and the African peoples are concerned. We are not directly concerned with the African people; we are concerned with the Indians in South Africa. The line it takes is this. We are an independent country. We can afford to do anything we like. You dare not interfere with us because you represent a Government which is not in a position to give us battle. We will not listen to reason at all. That being their attitude, it is incumbent on us to assert our self-respect. I am not going into past history. I am not going to suggest that the Commonwealth Relations Member was wrong in showing the exemplary patience that he has shown to the South African whites. He has shown exemplary patience in dealing with them. Well, I am not going to suggest that he was wrong in showing this exemplary patience with them. The question which worries me is not the past; the question which worries me is the future. Are we going to continue to show this patience with these people who have shown no desire at any time to enter into friendly relations with this country? Are we going to allow the Indian in South Africa to remain a hewer of wood and drawer of water in a country, the prosperity of which he has helped to build up? The Indians who have gone to South Africa went there in order to help the prosperity of the South African people. They went there with certain assurances from the Government. They were encouraged by the Government of India to go to South Africa. The Government of India, therefore, has got a responsibility towards these Indians who are settled in South Africa. One of the difficulties of the South African problem is that of the 2½ lakhs of Indians who are settled in South Africa nearly 2 lakhs are in Natal Province and that the town of Durban has about 45 per cent.

[Mr. P. N. Saprū.]

Indians. Well, we are not responsible for the mal-distribution of population in South Africa. South Africa ought not to deny to its nationals their proper rights because it wants to maintain what is called the white character of the civilization. Well, I think this white character is a curse so far as humanity is concerned. I think it makes the white man inhuman because this is really what South Africa has been doing. Inhumanity in its treatment towards Indians is the marked feature and characteristic of South African policy. Therefore there are two alternatives before us. We can either keep quiet and do nothing. You have applied certain provisions of the Reciprocity Act. I do not say that you were wrong in applying the provisions of the Reciprocity Act against the South African Government. It was a measure which we welcomed but even in regard to the matter of reciprocity there are certain directions in which a move was possible and in which a move has not been made. For example, no step has yet been taken to deprive the South Africans of their franchise rights in this country. Parliament will have to be moved in this matter. I do not think it will be possible for us to deprive the South Africans of their right of franchise without Parliamentary sanction, but we want steps to be taken in that direction. The second thing is that South African officers continue to serve in the Indian Army. Now, Sir, we want these gentlemen, who have been serving here, to be given the sack. We want to tell them that we are prepared to pay for their passports. Please go out of this country. We do not wish to see you in this country any more.

Then, Sir, there is the question of trade agreement. Now we have a monopoly in regard to jute. Nearly 99 per cent. of South Africa's jute imports come from this country. She is dependent for her jute products upon India. We have an agreement with the South African Government. It will be necessary for us, if we want to break trade relations with South Africa, to give notice of the termination of that agreement. I think under the agreement it is necessary for us to give the South Africans three months' notice and we want this agreement to be terminated. The first thing is to stop the export of jute to South Africa. Stop the export of textiles to South Africa. Then from South Africa we get wattle bark and brandy which may be relished by the European residents in this country and by some Anglicised Indians like—well, I am one of them (*Laughter*)—but it is not necessary for the people of this country. We get canned fruit from South Africa.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW : Cashew nuts, cashew seeds.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Now, Sir, these are the things in which we have an import and export trade with South Africa. The Honourable Dr. Khare stated in the other place that the matter was under the consideration of the Supply Department ; they were looking into the figures of trade between South Africa and India. How long is this process of examination of the statistical material to continue ? There must be some finality about our decisions. Either we are prepared to pocket the insults which this country is heaping upon us or we are not. If we are not, and if we are sincere and if we are honest in the application of the policy of sanctions, then we must make up our mind early. Now, I do not want the Honourable Mr. Banerjee to tell me that he is going to apply the sanctions to-morrow. I know that it is difficult for him to give an undertaking that he will apply the sanctions to-morrow. He may have in his possession information which I have not which may make him hope that something may come out of negotiations even at this late stage. I am quite prepared to recognise that he may have material which is not in my possession which may encourage him to hope that a possible solution of this problem is possible. I am prepared therefore to give him time to enforce these sanctions. I want him to accept the policy, Sir. There is no word, I think, so far as my Resolution is concerned which suggests that the application of the sanctions is to be immediate, that the recall of the High Commissioner is to be immediate and therefore I have worded my Resolution deliberately in a moderate form so that it may be possible for Government, without fettering its discretion, to accept the principle of this Resolution.

Then, Sir, so far as the implementation of this Resolution is concerned I am prepared to leave its implementation in the hands of the Commonwealth Relations Member and in implementing this Resolution I am sure that he will consult the

Standing Immigration Committee. What I am anxious is that we should show to the South African people that we are determined to assert our self-respect. Field-Marshal Smuts talks with different voices. He and so many others have been talking about the Asiatic question. They say it is a very grave question. But I find there is very little difference between Field-Marshal Smuts and Dr. Malan so far as we are concerned; they both represent an identical point of view. Therefore we should show some firmness in dealing with that intransigent country.

With these words, I commend my Resolution to the House.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: It would be advisable for the Honourable Secretary to the Commonwealth Relations Department to speak at this stage and let the Council know the Government's policy on the subject; and then, if it is necessary, other members will address the House.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R.N. BANERJEE (Commonwealth Relations Secretary): Sir, at the very outset I would like to assure the House that there is no lack of appreciation on the part of Government of the intensity of the feeling of the House and the Indian public in this matter. As there has been no remarkable advance since the matter was last discussed in the other House, I hope the House will bear with me if my statement involves a certain amount of repetition.

I am very grateful to my Honourable friend Mr. Sapru for telling us so unreservedly that delay in complying with the mandate of the House has not been taken by him as non-compliance. Since this matter was discussed in the House last, there have been certain developments which are rather hopeful. The House will remember that we entreated the Union Government towards the end of October last to stay further action regarding the enactment of the Ordinances. There was no response, and the Union Government rushed through the Ordinances by the 1st or 2nd of November, I think. Since then, however, Field-Marshal Smuts has made a statement in which he has admitted that the question of the acquisition and ownership of land by Indians has never been raised during the last 40 years. He has also admitted that the introduction of the control on acquisition is a serious departure from the Pretoria Agreement. And he has further admitted that the Residential Property Regulation Ordinance is not strictly in accordance with the spirit of the Pretoria Agreement and cannot be said to be an implementation of it. Not only that; as the Honourable Mover of the Resolution has said, the Ordinances have now been held to be *ultra vires*, and the assent of the Governor General, without which they would not become law, has so far been withheld. We have been told that it has been reserved. We have no doubt gone back to the position as it existed after the passing of the Pegging Act, but we have been told that the Pretoria Agreement will be scrapped pending an alternative settlement being explored. There is thus a distinct promise to explore a fresh settlement. In a speech made only the other day, the Prime Minister of the Union Government also envisaged legislation which would retain in the hands of the Union Government the power of expropriation of land. This, Sir, is an advance from the point of view of the Indian community.

It thus appears that the Union Government have at least stayed further action in the matter. We have also just been able to complete our consultations with our last High Commissioner who returned to the country last month. The House will also appreciate the anxiety of Government to obtain from our new High Commissioner an up-to-date appreciation of the latest developments. In the other House the Honourable Member also drew attention to certain symptoms which indicate that the liberal elements in the European population in South Africa are now inclined to treat the Indian question less light heartedly. I need only mention the speech which Mr. Hofmeyr made the other day before the South African Institute of Race Relations in which he unreservedly recognised the justice of the Indian claim to equality of treatment. Honourable Members have also no doubt been following the proceedings of the Commonwealth Relations Conference which has just completed its session in the heart of the Commonwealth. At this Conference distinguished Indian leaders have set forth with patriotic vigour India's case for equality of status in the Commonwealth. Representatives of the Union Government have also been present at these Conferences

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL (Bombay : Non-Muhammadan) : Who represented India in this Conference ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Sir Mahomed Zafrulla Khan.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Who else ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : It is not too much to expect that the representatives of South Africa, so far as we can make out from their published reactions, may reinforce the unofficial efforts of the liberal elements in the European population for a reorientation of the European attitude regarding the Indian question.

It is not being claimed that these developments have met our demands, or that they justify, as the Honourable Member stated in the other House the other day, any radical reorientation of our policy regarding the withdrawal of the Pegging Act. These are, however, grounds to feel that the action already taken has brought home to the Union Government in a much greater degree than ever before the depth and intensity of Indian resentment at the Union Government's action and the earnestness of our determination to obtain a solution of the Indian problem. The action taken so far has thus yielded some results which we feel make it worth our while giving all parties concerned some breathing time. I hope the House will agree that this does not necessarily mean climbing down. Our main object in enforcing measures like economic sanctions has been to bring pressure to bear on the Union Government and on the European public of South Africa. We have brought pressure to bear on them and I think it is not too much to hope that both the Union Government and the European public there do realise that further pressure may be exerted. I can assure the House that Government are not attaching any undue importance to these developments. But the position has become temporarily static and signs of better counsel prevailing are not wanting. The House will perhaps agree that Government may take a little more time in finding out how the land lies. I can again repeat the assurance given by the Honourable Member in the other House that no final decision has been taken in this matter either by His Majesty's Government or by the Government of India. So, Government have kept an open mind.

A word about the High Commissioner. It is perhaps not generally realised that the usual diplomatic element of reciprocity is lacking in the case of our High Commissioner in South Africa. The Union Government, have no diplomatic representative in this country. Government, therefore, genuinely believe that the presence of the High Commissioner is of some advantage to the Indian cause even during the present juncture and in view of the peculiarly difficult position in this matter, it will be unwise for us to deprive ourselves of any weapon which may be of the slightest help to us. This is what we feel so long, at least, as a final decision is not taken about economic sanctions. All that Government will press for is, therefore, a little more time. It is possible that, as has happened in the past, our patience even on this occasion may turn out to have been misplaced. But we shall not be in the wrong by letting the forces of goodwill and compromise have a chance. Our cause is not likely to be in any way impaired by a little further delay. It is easy enough for Government to carry out the formal mandate of the House. But the House will realise that Government's responsibility does not end with simply enforcing, technically these measures. The responsibility for a final and decisive settlement of the Indian question to the satisfaction of our nationals in South Africa and the Indian public would continue to rest on Government even after these measures have been enforced. I hope, Sir, the House will agree that this being the position, Government may be allowed to handle these weapons with an eye to their ultimate effect and in such a manner as will yield the maximum benefit.

While talking on this subject last time in this House I said :—

" Our grievances are 60 years old and I hope the House will agree with me that lightning speed is not perhaps essential in all the circumstances of the case. Now that the Government and the people are at one with each other in this matter; I feel that the public should not deny Government some margin of discretion in regulating the pace and dimensions of their diplomatic operations "

I plead for the same this time also. I would conclude by commending to the attention of the House a statement made last week by Senator Clarkson, Minister of the Interior in the Union Government, in the Union Parliament. Senator Clarkson

has said that the Indian question was in a delicate stage at present. Negotiations were taking place and he did not think this was the time to go further into the matter. He thought the question could be solved if there was goodwill on both sides. In view of such signs of better counsel prevailing and of some improvement in the attitude of the South African Government, we feel that nothing will be lost by extending some reciprocity to the sentiments expressed by the Minister of the Interior. I hope, Sir, the Honourable Mover and the House are satisfied that such delay as has occurred on the part of Government in implementing the mandate of the House has been due to very good reasons and that in a matter like this, a little further delay is not likely to do any irreparable harm to our cause. If the Honourable Member is satisfied of this position, I hope, Sir, he will be pleased to withdraw the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR ROY CHOWDHURY (West Bengal : Non-Muhammadan) : What about Dr. Malan's statement ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : Dr. Malan does not represent the Government now and the Prime Minister's latest statement was in reply to Dr. Malan's and in that statement Field-Marshal Smuts has referred to legislation to retain for the Union Government the power of expropriation.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT (to the Honourable Mr. Sapru) : The Honourable Member will now consider the appeal of the Honourable Mr. Banerjee to give Government some breathing time. In my opinion that would be very right.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : So far as breathing time is concerned my Resolution gives it to them. I did not suggest that action should be taken immediately. Subject to that qualification the Resolution may be passed by the House. I think it will be unfortunate if a Resolution of this nature, having been moved in the House, was defeated or withdrawn.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Whatever decision you may arrive at I think it is needless to continue the debate.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I quite appreciate the point of view of Mr. Banerjee. I am quite prepared, having waited so long, to give some further time to the South African Government. Meanwhile, we can pass this Resolution subject to the qualification that its implementation is to be left to the discretion of the Commonwealth Relations Member in consultation with the Standing Committee. I am not inclined to withdraw the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I do not think it is necessary to make long speeches again. Members have already expressed their views on the subject fully in the past in this House and elsewhere. If you suggest a condition, you will have to amend the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : May I suggest for your consideration that the Resolution does not say that economic sanctions should be applied here and now.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Supposing we add "as early as possible" after "to apply", that will meet my Honourable friend's point.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : While Government will be prepared to consider implementing a Resolution of this type as and when Government is satisfied of the necessity for such action, I think it will be rather difficult for Government to commit themselves at this stage to taking such action. In any case I hope the Honourable Member would not insist on that.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Withdrawal is the best thing.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : What is the precise amendment that Government would suggest to the Resolution ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : Addition of the words "as and when expedient" at the end.

THE HONOURABLE SAIYED MOHAMED PADSHAH SAHIB BAHADUR (Madras : Muhammadan) : I have a more definite amendment.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I have no objection to the addition of the words "as and when expedient" at the end.

THE HONOURABLE SAYED MOHAMED PADSHAH SAHIB BAHADUR :
I suggest the addition of—

“ That in the event of the negotiations now taking place between the Indian Government and the Union not yielding any fruitful results in the appreciably near future, etc. and without avoidable delay ”.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : If it becomes necessary to take action, the Department will do so. The point is covered by “ as and when expedient ”.

THE HONOURABLE DR. N. B. KHARE (Commonwealth Relations Member): Sir, my Honourable friend has praised my exemplary patience. I want to declare on the floor of this House that I do not claim to deserve that praise at all. I am the most impatient fellow going and when I have said that I have fully informed the House of my own reaction. I also know that this is a matter involving more than anything else our self-respect, and our self-respect Government has in a large measure vindicated. This self-respect means tit for tat. I claim that we have vindicated our self-respect in a very large measure and in double quick time—within 48 hours. The Ordinances were passed in Natal Council on the 2nd of November and we have applied the Reciprocity Act, as I have said, on the 4th of November last. So this measure will show how promptly Government acts when it is necessary. Our difficulty is that at present very complicated kinds of negotiations are going on between the two Governments and this is a question which after all is not of recent origin. It is an old sore of more than three generations, and under these conditions it will not be reasonable to expect negotiations will terminate very soon. After all in the case of negotiations two parties are required. It is not in the hands of one party alone to accelerate the pace of negotiations. Under these conditions I think the House should give us some latitude to see the end of the negotiations. Till then I am sorry to say our hands are tied down. But that time will not last eternally. It must come to an end some time or other.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM (Bihar and Orissa : Mohammadan) : No indicatable period ? One year, two years ?

THE HONOURABLE DR. N. B. KHARE : How can I say ? It may take 2 months, 4 months or one year. It is a very complicated problem. It may have been solved very early, if I may say so, if India had been independent or a Dominion with equal status. There is no doubt about that fact. I may cite a very recent example of how this handicap of India affects her in other respects also. I may tell the House that about 6 or 10 months ago, the U. S. A. passed a Bill permitting Chinese people to enter U. S. A. and acquire citizenship rights. I thought that India also would get similar treatment, because it was also an Ally of the United Nations such as China, if not more. But I was sorry to see yesterday in the papers that the Indian Immigration Bill in U. S. A. has been shelved indefinitely and the person who has made this motion for shelving it has declared unequivocally that India cannot compare with China because China is our Ally. As if India is not ? And China is independent and India is not. He has made no bones about it. He has told us very frankly. The House will realise that this constitutional drawback, this handicap, comes in our way and nothing else. So the Government of India need not be blamed for these delays and lack of enthusiasm. I may tell the House, that I know public opinion here, and in the other House, as well as that of the wider public of India with whom I mix very freely still, that I know what the reaction is of the people at large in this country and their feelings. This is the position of Indians everywhere, and if I may say so, it hurts the self-respect of anybody, any coloured person. The world statesmen are meeting now to take preliminary steps for the Peace Conference, if they are wise, if they are honest in the proclamations made by them from time to time, they ought to heal this sore of unequal treatment to the coloured people, wherever they are, for all times to come. I do not know whether that will happen but one thing will certainly happen and that is that a large number of white races would be enslaved as a result of this war. They may call me devillish but, situated as I am—feeling these insults and pin-pricks every now and then—I would welcome that also. At least that will remove to a certain extent the inequality from which we suffer. (*Hear, hear.*) These are my sentiments

and I hope I have made the whole position quite clear. Government is not going to oppose this Resolution at all. They will remain neutral as Government generally do.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Will you kindly tell us how the Resolution should be worded so that it would satisfy Government ?

THE HONOURABLE DR. N. B. KHARE : I think that the wording of the Resolution as amended will do.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : That will meet our purposes with the words "as and when expedient" added. That will leave discretion to Government.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Those words will be added.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I have no objection to the amendment of my Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : You can ask for an amendment of it.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Well, Sir, then I suggest that after the words "recall the High Commissioner from South Africa" the words "as and when expedient" may be added.

Sir, I may say that there is just one remark which the Honourable Mr. Banerjee made to which I would like to draw attention. He said that the recall of the High Commissioner would not be in the interests of the Indian people at any time.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : I did not say that. I only said "at this time", particularly at this juncture. Should Government decide on merits, as the Honourable Member pointed out in the other House the other day, that the High Commissioner should be recalled there would be absolutely no difficulty in the way of Mr. Deshmukh being recalled. I may amplify, Sir, that it was on this understanding that Government decided to let the new High Commissioner proceed.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I am very glad that the position has been clarified because I understand that the Indian community has passed a resolution saying that they would welcome the recall of the High Commissioner but I quite appreciate that in view of the speech of Mr. Clarkson, it is undesirable to press the demand for the immediate recall of the High Commissioner. I have explained the position in regard to the question generally in my opening speech and I have got nothing more to say, Sir.

(The Honourable Saiyed Mohamed Padshah Sahib Bahadur rose to speak).

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : No speech is necessary now.

THE HONOURABLE SAIYED MOHAMED PADSHAH SAHIB BAHADUR (Madras Muhammadan) : Sir, I just wish to refer to one thing mentioned by the Honourable Member for Commonwealth Relations. He referred to the fact that an attempt in America to admit Indians has been foiled and that the Immigration Bill has been postponed *sine die* and he also gave us the information that one Mr. Natal who represents Durban in the Dominion Parliament expressed the view that—

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Government are not opposing the Resolution. I do not think any speech is necessary.

THE HONOURABLE SAIYED MOHAMED PADSHAH SAHIB BAHADUR : I am not going to make any long speech. I want to bring it to the notice of the House that this gentleman, Mr. Natal, manifested such disgust for the Indian community there that he said he was prepared to spend as much as £150 million if they could only succeed in sending away all the Indians that are settled there to India. This is the mentality of some of the whites there. We are prepared to give time to the Government. At this stage when things are in such a delicate condition it will be highly inadvisable and suicidal to hurry up things but my only submission to the Government is that we should not wait indefinitely, that we should see that these

[Saiyed Mohamed Padshah Sahib Bahadur]

negotiations are brought to a satisfactory conclusion and if they are not brought to a satisfactory conclusion within a reasonably short period we should take immediate action.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : May I ask one question, Sir ? I do not understand whether the statement that the Government will remain neutral is contingent on this amendment or without the amendment.

THE HONOURABLE DR. N. B. KHARE : In any case whatever.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I would like to oppose the amendment which has been suggested.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : I am very reluctant to intervene at this stage but I think you will agree Sir, that we have had a certain amount of discussion on this point and a certain amount of tacit understanding has already grown up. Would it be fair to Government at this stage to prolong the discussion ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I will give the reasons why I am opposed to the amendment.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I do not think you now represent the views of the House.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I would just like to say that I am prepared to vote for the Resolution without the amendment but that I will not accept the amendment.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Sir, the amendment was moved by me in the belief that the Government would not otherwise support the Resolution and I did not wish this Resolution to be defeated by this House because its defeat may have repercussions on the international world.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : That is understood. There shall be no opposition.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : But now that the Honourable Dr. Khare has made it clear that Government will remain neutral in any case I see no reason—

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : The House is not going to divide. Government is not going to oppose this Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : We oppose the amendment I wish that the original Resolution be put and voted upon. If you want I will explain the reasons why I do not accept the amendment.

THE HONOURABLE MR. THIRUMALA ROW (Madras : Non-Muhammadan) : I think it will strengthen the hands of Government if they accept the Resolution without amendment.

THE HONOURABLE SIR DAVID DEVADOSS (Nominated : Non-Official) : We thought that there was an understanding that if this amendment is moved the Government will accept the Resolution. After that I do not think we can do anything else.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (Leader of the House) : We never said we accepted this Resolution. We will remain neutral.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : I think, Sir, that Mr. Banerjee is under some misconception. It was only a stage of negotiations each side trying to understand the point of view of the other. No tacit understanding was arrived at as such, otherwise my Honourable friend Mr. Hossain Imam would not have got up and said he would oppose the amendment. Some suggestions were made by Mr. Banerjee. They were being noted by Mr. Sapru. They were being discussed by him so that the other members may understand them. When they had understood what was in their minds and what was suggested then only would it have been possible for all of us to see what the understanding is to be. This is not the same as coming to a tacit understanding. Without knowing what he would and allowing him to say that how could we proceed to arrive at a solution. There must be something before us on which there can be any understanding.

THE HONOURABLE MR. V. V. KALIKAR (Central Provinces : General : The Government say that they are not going to accept the Resolution. When the Honourable Mr. Banerjee suggested these words we thought that the Government would accept the Resolution as amended. This is the impression we had.

***THE HONOURABLE SIR GOPALASWAMI AYYANGAR** (Madras : Non-Muhammadan) : I would like to make one appeal to those who represent the Government on this Resolution. After the speech of the Honourable Member in charge of Commonwealth Relations in this House it is perfectly clear that he is in full sympathy with the terms of the Resolution as proposed to be amended. Having said that in public in this House, what is it that prevents him from saying that the Resolution will be accepted by Government ? The only inference that the public will draw from the Government remaining neutral on such a Resolution, amended after consultation with Government, will be that, while the Honourable Member individually is prepared to accept this Resolution, he expects that he will not have the support either of his colleagues or of those from beyond the seas from whom he has to take orders. That is a position which, consistently with the self-respect about which he spoke so much today, he should not take in this House, after that public pronouncement. I ask him to take his courage in both hands and to accept this Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. R. N. BANERJEE : On a point of explanation, Sir. This has been, if I may say so, the usual practice for Government in dealing with matters affecting Indian interests overseas. Government generally remains neutral, if the matter is ever pressed to a division, and leaves the non-official members to record their opinion. I can quote several instances which have occurred during the last few years. To say that Government is not actively voting in favour of it or is not formally accepting it does not mean any lack of sympathy on the part of Government with the object of the Resolution. That has been our usual practice. That is why in the first place I appealed to the Honourable Mover to withdraw the Resolution, and, as the Honourable Member has pointed out, in case the House is desirous of having a division on the Resolution, Government members would remain neutral.

THE HONOURABLE SIR GOPALASWAMI AYYANGAR : Then what was the consideration on the part of the Honourable Member in suggesting that particular amendment ? Was the consideration on the part of the Government that if the amendment was accepted they would not oppose the Resolution and would remain neutral ? Did it require the Honourable Member to suggest an amendment for that purpose to us ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR DAVID DEVADOSS : If you will allow me to say a word, Sir, we all thought, when the Government suggested the amendment, that the Government was going to accept the Resolution. Several of us suggested certain words : the Honourable Mr. Sapru suggested something, and I suggested something, and then we hit upon the word "expedient" which the Honourable Member in charge used. It is his expression. Therefore, under such circumstances it is not proper for the Government to withdraw from the position which they took. They ought to accept the position. Government would not be right in not accepting the amendment.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN : Government never suggested any amendment at all.

THE HONOURABLE SIR DAVID DEVADOSS : Excuse me, I beg to differ from the Honourable the Leader of the House. They did. The word "expedient" was used by the Honourable the Commonwealth Relations Member.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : The Government member asked for withdrawal and I suggested it first. I take the whole responsibility upon myself. I wanted some settlement to be reached. But if Government remain neutral, then I shall put the Resolution as it stands.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I am not prepared to sponsor the amendment if Government is going to remain neutral.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I shall put the original Resolution as it stands. Resolution moved :—

"This Council recommends to the Governor-General in Council that in view of the attitude of the South African Government he may be pleased to apply (a) economic sanction against South Africa and (b) recall the High Commissioner from South Africa."

Question put and Motion adopted.

CASTE DISABILITIES REMOVAL BILL

THE HONOURABLE MR. V. V. KALIKAR (Central Provinces : General) : Sir, I beg leave of the House to introduce :—

"A Bill to amend the Caste Disabilities Removal Act (XXI of 1850)."

I have already stated my object in introducing this Bill in this House in my Statement of Objects and Reasons and in the Notes on Clauses.

The Motion was adopted.

THE HONOURABLE MR. V. V. KALIKAR : Sir, I introduce the Bill.

DELHI SIKH GURDWARAS AND RELIGIOUS ENDOWMENTS BILL

THE HONOURABLE SIR SOBHA SINGH (Nominated Non-Official) : Sir, I beg leave of the House to introduce :—

"A Bill to provide for the better administration of the Sikh Gurdwaras in the Delhi Province and their properties wherever situate."

The main objects for which this Bill has been brought are stated in the Statement of Objects and Reasons appended to the Bill. Similar measures have been enacted in the Punjab and the North West Frontier Province. The intention of the Bill is to ensure proper control of income and properties attached to Gurdwaras which are located in Delhi and outside Delhi.

The Motion was adopted.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SOBHA SINGH : Sir, I introduce the Bill.

The House then adjourned for Lunch till a Quarter to Three of the Clock.

RESOLUTION RE DAILY BROADCAST IN HINDI

The Council re-assembled after Lunch at a Quarter to Three of the Clock, the Honourable the Chairman (the Honourable Mr. M. N. Dalal) in the Chair.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL (Bombay : Non-Muhammadan) : Sir, I move :—

"That this Council recommends to the Governor-General in Council that from Delhi, Lucknow, Lahore and Peshawar news as well as other items be daily broadcast in Hindi also which should be allotted due proportion of time at all these stations."

Sir, the radio is playing an important role in the cultural life of the country ; and particularly, a large number of persons living in the cities listen to the radio broadcasts. There are several stations in India. My Resolution deals with the stations of Delhi, Lucknow, Lahore and Peshawar. From Delhi news is broadcast in as many as 24 languages. The station starts with news in the English language, then comes the relay of B.B.C. news from London. There is also news broadcast in Hindustani, Punjabi, Bengali, Tamil, Telegu, Malayalam, Marathi, Gujrati, French, Tonkinese, Cochin-Chinese, Malay, Burmese Kuoyu, Shanghai, Amoy, Cantonese, Thai, Japanese, German, Italian, Pushtu, Persian, Afghan-Persian and Arabic.

This is the list given in the *Indian Listener*. As many as nine Indian languages are used for the broadcast of news from Delhi and 15 foreign languages are also used. I suppose most of these foreign languages are used temporarily for the purpose of the war. Otherwise, people in India are not interested in these languages. Besides news, All-India Radio have also other programmes—music, talks, women's programme, and children's programme. The radio begins from Delhi from 8 A.M., and carries on these activities until 10-15 A.M. The station again opens at 12 Noon and carries

on these activities until 2 P.M. There is an item also, to which my attention has been drawn, namely, school broadcast. Then, from 5 P.M. in the evening, the station resumes its broadcast which lasts till 11 P.M. So, various programmes are broadcast from Delhi and similarly from other stations.

In the year 1913, radio sets in India were about 9,000. Taking the latest figures available of 1944, there have been as many as 1,80,000 and more radio sets in India, as can be seen from the licences issued by the Post Offices. Had the war not intervened, I am sure there would have been a greater development of radio activity and there would have been a larger number of licences and a larger public would have been listening to the programmes. It is not merely the one person who has a licence who hears the radio. To each radio I might say there are at least about 10 persons hearing the programmes. In certain restaurants and hotels, they keep on music and other programmes going to attract clientele. In this way, a large number of people take advantage of the radio broadcasts. In certain cities—I know of my City of Bombay where I come from—the Municipality has also fixed receiver sets at different places where the public congregates and there also, news and other items are received and the public enjoys them. As I said, Sir, in 24 languages from Delhi station, the news is broadcast. Delhi is the centre in the sense that it is the seat of the Government of India, and there are other stations besides Delhi from which various programmes are broadcast in different languages. For instance, Calcutta broadcasts in Bengali, Bombay in Gujarati and Marathi, and South India in the languages that are spoken there. Delhi is an important place from the point of view of the Hindi-speaking population of India as well as those other places which I have mentioned. There is widespread dissatisfaction with the present policy of the Government of India, in regard to the radio broadcast. As could be seen from the various complaints received by the Government and the questions put in the Assembly as well as in this House, everywhere the complaint is that All-India Radio is not giving its programme in the Hindi language. My Resolution therefore suggests that there should be a set of broadcasts in the Hindi language also. And the implication of it is clear, I do not object to an Urdu broadcast. At present this so-called Hindustani programme is causing dissatisfaction and whenever I heard the news and other items from Delhi I always got the impression that it was an Urdu programme. It is only after giving notice of this Resolution I looked up the *Indian Listener* in order to draw some material from it for this occasion and then I noticed and discovered that it is called Hindustani. I am not suggesting that this Urdu programme should be dropped. What I desire is that there should be side by side programmes in two languages, one in Urdu and the other in Hindi also. I know a bit of Urdu. (*Interruption.*) I should not be presumptuous as to say that I know it so well, but if Urdu was dropped I would certainly miss it. Other people also will miss it. But as Hindi is not there a very large majority of the people who understand that language miss it. Certain words used are such that even those who live among what we call the Hindustani-speaking people cannot follow those words. For instance, Sir, I will just refer to one or two words. One day in my home we were hearing the radio, all of us, and my daughter asked what is this “moghrīb” is that some *maugar* of the river?

THE HONOURABLE SIB SULTAN AHMED : When was that?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : I could not tell you precisely when.

THE HONOURABLE SIB SULTAN AHMED : How long ago was it?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : I think it was a year ago.

THE HONOURABLE SIB SULTAN AHMED : The world has passed to a different stage.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : If you have passed on to a different stage I am happy. But so many words even now are used which are displacing the common words, the simple words which are used in the Hindustani language. It is very difficult to decide the controversy as to what the Hindustani language is, I may say that it contains many words which are of Sanskrit origin. The simple Urdu which you call Hindustani is also derived from Sanskritic stock; it contains 80 per cent. of words derived from Sanskrit, if not more. But these words of day-to-day use can only be few. They will suffice only for ordinary daily life, but they

[Mr. G. S. Motilal]

will not suffice for purposes of the Council or the Legislatures or other literary purposes where a larger stock of words is necessary. Take for instance the word "bain-ul-aqwam". How many of my friends here, except a few of us who know Urdu, will understand this word "bain-ul-aqwam", "antar-rashtriya-(international), etc. You can pronounce it any way you like. You never know what the correct pronunciation is in English. Most of the languages of India (I will only refer to the important languages) Bengali, Punjabi, Marathi, Gujarati, are of the Sanskritic stock, and according to the census figures as many as 20 crores of people speak the languages of the Sanskrit family.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : What is the language of the other 20 crores ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Then the Dravidian stock comes in. If my Muslim friends who are 9 crores say that they have a different language of their own—

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR ROY CHOWDHURY : The Muslims of Bengal speak Bengali.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : I had talks with some Muslims from Bengal, some very eminent persons. They feel much more at home with the Bengali language than with Urdu. Hindus living in the northern parts of India are more familiar with Urdu words than the Hindus living in Southern and Central India. Similarly the Mussalmans living in Bengal and other parts of India, even Bombay, and other southern parts of India, are less familiar with Urdu than even the Hindus of Northern India. Thus it is very difficult to say exactly where the line comes, where you can have a demarcation line ; but the fact remains that there is a very large portion of the people whose culture is derived from Sanskrit. They speak and they use, if they have got to use, words which are outside the small vocabulary which the people in day-to-day conversation use, the words taken from Sanskrit or some other language.

I took up a copy of the Press Communiqué, which was placed on the table a few days ago in answer to a question of Raja Yuveraj Dutta Singh in this House. In that Communiqué this is how All-India Radio policy has been described. They say :—

"There should not be separate Urdu and Hindi broadcasts of news, news commentaries and announcements, the language used being of the simplest variety, which is understood by the vast majority of the listeners in Hindustani-speaking areas".

I think, Sir, this policy requires modification and revision if the Government's object is to give satisfaction to all people. Those who love Hindi, as also those who love Urdu, should not have reason to say that there is no broadcast in Hindi and Urdu, respectively. What is the result of this policy? The result is misunderstanding. It is dissatisfaction. Government ought to remove this dissatisfaction and accept a policy which will give satisfaction to both sections who want broadcasts in Hindi as well as in Urdu.

The second item in the Government policy is that :—

"Where there is no appropriate Hindustani word and a foreign word has to be imported, the basis of selection from an indigenous language, Persian, Arabic or English should be the widest intelligibility of that word in Hindustani speaking areas".

I do not really understand and I should like to inquire from my Honourable friend whether Sanskrit is included in it or it is not included because it is open to two interpretations. One is that the words may be taken from, Sanskrit the other is that words are not to be taken from Sanskrit for the policy is that—

"The basis of selection from an indigenous language Persian, Arabic or English".

We know there is a movement, Sir, in Persia as well as in Turkey for eliminating Arabic words from their languages. Our Muslim friends here stick to the words from Arabic and Persian languages. It is quite natural to a nationalist sentiment that they should have words from their own languages rather than have words of foreign languages. Nationalist Persia and nationalist Turkey are going in that direction. Our Muslim of India in time to come shed their

aversion to importing words from Sanskrit language. It is their heritage and their treasure as much as it is ours. (*Hear, hear.*) But Sir, we have to take into account that the religious literature of the Musalmans particularly the *Quaran Sharif*, is in the Arabic language and there will naturally be a desire among those who have the time and opportunity to read more languages than one to read the Arabic language also. Such a desire would not be confined to my Muslim friends alone. Others also who like to make a comparative study of religions would learn Arabic language for this purpose, but we desire satisfaction from All-India Radio for all the people of India and therefore what we want is that the words which are taken in this language should be mostly of Sanskrit origin. If you take words from Sanskrit then there will hardly be any necessity for taking words from Persian, or Arabic or English. There are certain words from foreign languages which have become current words and which are now recognised as the words of this language. We have no objection to the retention of those words. The broadcast which is given now in Hindi is in a peculiar kind of Hindustani. The Hindi words are mispronounced. The reason apparently is that those who broadcast the news or its various items do not know the Hindi language. So those who broadcast these programmes should know not only Hindi but very good Hindi. This sort of mongrel, disfigured, mutilated Hindi will not give satisfaction and will not do credit to the Government of India who is controlling this Department. Let it be pure Hindi and pure Urdu so that people can enjoy both. There must be simpler words as far as possible. With that proposition I agree.

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : Pure spoken Hindi and pure spoken Urdu are so common that you cannot find any difference between the two.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : They are not distinguishable. It is the Sanskritized version that makes the trouble.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : But how many words are there of this kind ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : May I ask the Honourable the Mover to recite from any song in Hindi ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Well, I would require the services of a musician, Sir, but the fact is this, that there are such words but they are very few and what are required are—

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH : Common words.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : I am not saying that they should be eliminated. I have said that they should be retained because they are common words. The point that I was making is that even the words taken from the Sanskrit language should be simple words because the Sanskrit language is so rich that you can take a very simple word and also a very bombastic word, a word which can be written in ten lines.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Ten lines.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Yes, there are compound words grammatically running into ten lines. If you take such words they will naturally drop out. It is the simpler words that the people will take up and follow. In literature, of course, there will be some such words and people will appreciate them, but such words ought not to be used by All-India Radio.

My Honourable friend Rai Bahadur Mahtha, who comes from Bihar, said 3-15 P.M. about two years ago in this House :—

“ I have on some occasions noticed that Hindustani talks from Lahore and Delhi are 90 to 97 per cent. talks in Urdu. I have figures of plays broadcast in 1939, and they are as follows : Total number of plays broadcast, 369—Urdu 350 ; Hindi 19 ”.

My Honourable friend may say that this was the old policy. Well, I do not know how far the new policy has changed.

[Mr. G. S. Motilal]

In regard to the Communiqué issued by Government, I have one or two more observations to make as regards pronunciation. The Communiqué says :

"The more current form of pronunciation should be preferred to the purist literary and etymological form".

I say this is not the right thing to do. You need not follow the mispronunciations. When you are using a language, you should use the correct pronunciation of the language. You are advancing the cultural cause of India. That is your policy. It is not for you to use words of a Garodi who keeps on talking in a language of his own and to whom culture is unknown. I at any rate think, Sir, that pure words both of Urdu and of Hindi should be used.

Another point is this. The Communiqué says that the name of the person should as far as possible be pronounced as he pronounces it himself. I really wonder whether the radio has any means of ascertaining from the various people how they pronounce their names. Sometimes I have heard my own name pronounced on the radio in connection with Resolutions of which I had given notice in the Council of State.

THE HONOURABLE SIB JOGENDRA SINGH : "Motilal" is a very simple name; it is both Urdu and Hindi. No one can mispronounce it.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Yes. But there are other names. Now, take "Kunwar Jagdish Prasad". Is the radio announcer to go and ascertain from him how he pronounces his name ?

THE HONOURABLE SIB GOPALASWAMI AYYANGAR : Is it "Pershad" or "Prasad" ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : He writes as "Prasad", and the Honourable Sir Gopalaswami Ayyangar knows that it is "Prasad". But very often we hear it pronounced as "Pershad". A man who does not know the Hindi language may pronounce it like that. He himself would be ashamed of using such a pronunciation. If he reads it as "Prasad", he will say he is correctly pronouncing it.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : How does he spell it ? How does he write his own name ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : You can see for yourself how he writes it.

The great advantage of the Sanskrit character is that you read as you write and you write as you read. If for no other considerations, for purely scientific considerations, if any character is to be chosen, a character or alphabet which helps you to read and write correctly should be chosen ; that should certainly get preference over others. But I am not at the present time concerned with that. I am only concerned with the policy as laid down in paragraph 4(b), and I say it is not a question how one pronounces his own name, because if you undertake the task of knowing how every man pronounces his own name, the radio will have to arrange for its people to travel hundreds and thousands of miles, and I am sure Sir Sultan Ahmed will refuse to pay the expenses for such a mission.

Sir, I was referring to the speech of my Honourable friend Rai Bahadur Mahtha, who represents the Bihar constituency in this House. (*Interruption.*) (*An Honourable Member* : You are mispronouncing the name.) I am afraid the English characters do not allow us to pronounce correctly ; they vitiate correct pronunciation. He said :—

"A listener who does not know Persian cannot follow 60 per cent. of the news broadcast from Delhi".

Now, Delhi is a Province which has a majority of Hindus over Muhammadans. But if you take Bihar, the United Provinces, the Central Provinces, parts of Bombay, parts of Madras, Bengal,—in all these places you have a majority of Hindi-speaking people, and it is they for whom you are broadcasting the news. If you have any doubt on the question, please consult them. — Ask them, as you did some time ago—whether they would prefer only Hindustani, or whether they want their own vernaculars—Bengali, Marathi, Gujarati, and so on. Ask them whether they would like

to have these two broadcasts—one in Hindi and one in Urdu. If a majority of them say that they want two broadcasts, then have these broadcasts in two languages.

The second part of my Resolution suggests that due proportion of time should be allotted to Hindi at all the stations mentioned in the Resolution. Delhi is a station of all-India character take the population of the Hindus and Muslims served by it and allot time accordingly. Similarly from Lucknow and other stations if Government will follow this suggestion which I have made, they will render a service to themselves, and they will remove the dissatisfaction that prevails, and there will be satisfaction felt by all sections.

THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR SRI NARAIN MAHTHA (Bihar: Non-Mahammadan) : Mr. Chairman, this Resolution, as has been explained, demands that news as well as other items be broadcast daily, in addition to other languages in Hindi as well, from Delhi, Lucknow, Lahore, and Peshawar stations. The present broadcasts, as we all know, are done in a language which is given the name of Hindustani. It would be interesting to examine what is Hindustani. Vaguely speaking, this language is supposed to include Hindi and Urdu in their best intelligible and most commonly used form. Hindustani makes an endeavour to strike a golden mean between Hindi and Urdu. The idea is excellent and deserves the fullest support. Mahatma Gandhi is the staunchest exponent of the idea and the idea has now had for a considerable time the support of large ranks of people particularly Hindus. No one should have any objection to the use of Hindustani by All-India Radio or by any Government Department for any purpose. But the contention is that the language used by the All-India Radio is not Hindustani, it is high-flown Persianised Urdu. The Hindi Sahitya Sammelan, which is the only authoritative body competent to speak on behalf of Hindi and which has never had any objection to the simplification of Hindi and to the adoption of commonly used words and phrases of Indian origin into this language, contends that the language employed by the All-India Radio is absolutely understandable without a good knowledge of Arabic and Persian. The Secretary of the Hindustani Prachar Sangh with the authority of Mahatma Gandhi himself has recently said that the language of All-India Radio is not Hindustani, it is a highly Persianised form of Urdu, difficult even for an ordinary Urdu knowing person to understand. The country has watched with dismay the failure of All-India Radio to be just in the matter and the result is that today we find an outcry in the country for separate broadcasts in Hindi from the greatest exponents of Hindustani. This outcry is an evidence of despair. It is an evidence of the failure of the All-India Radio to canalise both Hindi and Urdu as complementary languages. This could be done by adopting the best understood words and phrases and drawing upon indigenous and local sources for the supply of more words if necessary. Only when these sources fail foreign sources may be drawn upon. The process adopted by All-India Radio has, however, been just the reverse and the result is that Hindi has no place at all, and Urdu, laden with Persian and Arabic words, masquerades under the name of Hindustani. This is a highly unsatisfactory state of affairs and there is real discontent in the country on this question. A discontent of this kind has always a bad tendency. It has the tendency of being dragged down to lower levels and rousing the passions of the people, as many of the champions who enter the field of battle have little to do with the love of a language for its own sake. I, however, welcome a discussion of this kind in this House. I welcome it all the more because the Resolution has been moved by a member of the Congress Party, in fact by the Leader of the Party. I made an effort to find out a Congress Resolution on the question of languages. The only one in which there is a brief reference to this question is the Congress resolution on Fundamental Rights. The reference is brief, but it is clear and definite. It says that the culture, language, and script of the minorities of the different areas shall be protected. This Resolution too which is before us for discussion just now does not assail the minorities on any of these points. It merely seeks to do for the majority as well what is sacred for the minorities.

Fortunately for us India is not a babble of tongues with hundreds and hundreds of languages. India has singularly few languages considering its vast size and many of them are intimately allied to each other. And yet the problem of languages

[Rai Bahadur Sri Nara'n Mahtha.]

remains to be faced. This Resolution does not concern itself with different provincial languages but with Hindi and Urdu which are not strictly speaking provincial languages but have very largely an all-India character. I also agree that these two languages have the same basis the same grammar and quite a good number of common words to draw upon. Hindi and Urdu of ordinary house-hold speech do not differ much from each other. And to consider Hindi as the language of Hindus and Urdu as the language of Musalmans would also be absurd. But, the present differences between the two languages, as they have developed during the last fifty years. Particularly in the higher spheres of literary thought and production are considerable. Hindi has drawn its inspiration mainly from Sanskrit and Urdu from, persian. In written literary works the difference is thus formidable. The problem of bringing Urdu and Hindi together is thus to my mind a much vaster problem than it is generally conceived to be. It is at any rate not a problem for any Government Department to settle. Particularly when the Government is neither a responsible Government nor a National Government.

There are about seven to eight hundred words which are common to both Hindi and Urdu and these may be found to be sufficient for explaining ordinary subjects. But as soon as we emerge out of ordinary subjects and enter the more abstract regions of politics or science the divergences of expressions must grow. The immediate result of this is and must be the widening of the gulf between Hindi and Urdu so long as they continue to draw on the resources of Sanskrit and Persian separately and respectively. We have to admit that Hindi and Urdu are both at present inadequate for proper expression of modern ideas—scientific, political, economic, commercial and sometimes even cultural and they are both trying hard and with success to enrich themselves so as to meet the needs of modern community. Why should either be jealous of the other. We want our languages to be as rich as possible. We want their fusion also but the process of fusion or welding them together must be natural, suited to the genius of the people. If a new word or expression is needed, and commonly spoken Hindi and Urdu cannot provide it, we should go to tap the resources of Bengali, Marathi and Gujrati, all whom are highly developed Indian languages. When these sources fail, Sanskrit which is the common mother of all Indian languages, except Urdu in the form it is patronized today, must be tapped. When all these indigenous resources fail we may make an excursion outside India. So long as this is not going to be the confirmed practice, not only the profession of All-India Radio it becomes necessary to have separate broadcasts in Hindi for all items except music. When some one writes or speaks he certainly has to have consciously or subconsciously an audience in his mind whom he is seeking to influence or enlighten. There are a vast number of Hindi newspapers being published in this country and they are widely read. There are a vast number of books being published in Hindi and are widely read. Their number and circulation are increasing every day. There are a vast number of people who understand only the language that is used in these newspapers and books. What is All-India Radio doing for those people? How does All-India Radio approach them today with its news and propaganda broadcasts? How does it feel satisfied that vast section of the people is served properly? I have heard from quite a large number of people that they have given up listening in to All-India Radio broadcasts except for music. Why should this be allowed to happen?: The All-India Radio broadcasts in about two dozen languages. Why can it not broadcast in Hindi also? Hindi has no desire to make itself terse and difficult. All that it wants is that the language must be fully expressive and conform to Indian forms and have words and expressions which have the largest circulation in India. That is the Hindi that this Resolution claims. That is the Hindi which in course of time will come to mean Hindustani. The Hindustani of All India Radio is neither the Hindustani of to day nor the Hindustani of tomorrow. In order to implement this Resolution Government will have to broadcast news and commentaries in Hindi separately. For cultural programmes like dramas, talks, children's and women's programmes and poetic symposiums, etc. time will have to be allotted in proportion to the population served.

*THE HONOURABLE E. HOSSAIN IMAM (Bihar and Orissa : Muhammadan):
Mr. President, I was very much pleased to find this Resolution being moved by the

Leader of the Congress Party, because it confirms fully the two-nation theory of Mr. Jinnah. As he developed his speech, he indicated quite clearly that in India there are two nations, a Muslim nation which looks to the West, where it has its homeland and gets its inspiration from and the Hindustani-speaking Indians who regard this as their homeland and look to the old records of Prakrit and Sanskrit for their inspiration. But it pained me to find that of all persons Raja Govindlal should move this Resolution. He is himself a good scholar of Urdu who appreciates both and he can talk the best Urdu that we would ever like to hear. After all is said and done, I should like my friends to decide in their own mind where Hindustani ends and the other languages begins. He conveniently left out recounting the other main languages of India which if you reckon will never total to 39 crores of people. The claim that Hindi is spoken by 20 crores of people is subject to a great deal of correction—Hindi in the sense that it includes Urdu also. You will never find Urdu stated in the census figures. There is a bifurcation of this Hindi into Eastern Hindi and other kinds Magadhi and Mithili. But as far as real Hindi is concerned, it is not the spoken language of any place. What the Honourable Member means is the Sanskritised version as is being taught in the schools. I do not deny your right to propagate your language. You have every right as a nation just as I want mine propagated. The Hindi language in which you have Desha and Dakshin is not anywhere spoken by the illiterate masses of India. It is being newly introduced in the schools. You will not have gaon, but gram as Mahatma Gandhi has called Sevagram—

THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR SRI NARAIN MAHTHA : How many Mussalmans know Maghrabi and Shimali ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Maghrabi and Shimali have been dropped in order to accommodate the lovers of Hindi. They are surrendering too much. They have already given up much and they are giving in everywhere. I should not like to mention all that transpired at the meeting with the members of the Hindi Sahitya Sammelan and the Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu, but I should be excused for just mentioning one fact. A member of that delegation recounted to us the tragedy that his young daughter had picked up the word "Jumarat". He recounted it as a great tragedy. Jumarat is Thursday. In high Urdu we call it Punj-shamba and you Sanskritise it and call it Brihaspath. It was according to him that living in this country a girl of eight years should have picked up a word which was well understood in the whole of Northern India. Even Englishmen in India who are birds of passage learn some language in order to talk to their men. Even they may know these words, but it was a tragic circumstance worth recounting in a meeting that the girl picked up this one word.

Mr. Chairman, I do not wish to take a brief for the Department. The Honourable Member is quite competent to take care of it. I simply wish to state certain facts. Let us examine what is happening in the commercial world. The language used in the cinemas is the language which is understood commonly. They are a commercial concern and a majority of the cinemas pictures are made by Hindus and not by the Muslims. So you cannot accuse and say that the language used there is subsidised or biased. Their only criterion is understandability. You will find that with the exception of Dharmic pictures all the rest use 95 per cent. of the same language and a better language, more Persianised and Arabicised language than that used by All-India Radio. Look at the broadcast from the B.F.C. That broadcast is more Arabicised Hindustani than the language used by the Honourable Member for Information and Broadcasting. We used to hear German broadcasts and broadcasts from Rome. Everywhere the language was more Arabicised than Hindustani which is used by All-India Radio. Only Japan used to have broadcasts in Hindi as well. I have told you, Sir, the language which is used by foreign agencies to reach the masses of India and not a small section only. My Honourable friend has stated that the Muslims of Bengal speak only Bengali. All these nations have been addressing not only a small section of Muslims in the United Provinces and parts of Bihar, for the language of all other places happens to be either Punjabi, Bengali, Maharathi—all the other one hundred and one languages from Baluchi right to Kanarese. Now, Sir, do you think that all these nations were so foolish

[Mr. Hossain Imam.]

when they were addressing India that they would address only a small part of it. Really what the Honourable Member wants is purity—and by purity was not meant the purity which the Honourable Sir Jogendra Singh stated. Sir Jogendra Singh meant the purity of the natural language as is spoken by the illiterate person, who forms 90 per cent. of the population of India, whom you want to leave for the sake of the 10 per cent. Your desire is to make the language and the news unintelligible to the general public and it comes strangely from the Congress benches. Sir Jogendra Singh is a good scholar of Persian as well as Urdu, just as we have got in the Honourable Sir Aziz-ul-Haque a man who knows a good deal of Sanskrit. Therefore, Sir, the fact that some of us may know either Sanskrit or Persian is no reason why we should deprive the 90 per cent. of their privilege of listening to the news.

Then it is not realised what a small portion of the 24 hours are devoted to this Hindustani news which is broadcast from Delhi. I have before me a book which the Honourable Member was reading and on the page which he was reading, that is 45, I find that in the whole of the day the news bulletin broadcast from Delhi occupies only 45 minutes, that is 15 minutes in the morning, five minutes in the noon, five minutes in the evening and 20 minutes late in the evening. There are 45-minutes broadcasts from Delhi I and Delhi II.

I will just read from this page which the Leader of the Congress Party was reading. Here are some of the items :

Kahan gayae khiyal

Balwant

Balmir

Chitrang

Rās

Rangat

Ab kahan se laoon aghaz-e-muhabbat ke mazae

Mare re nainan bandh

Ab too kahe-jatan karegae.

How many items are of Hindi origin either in music or of other languages ? People do not realise what short space of time is available for talks. I do not think that the talks occupy more than two hours in a week. At least in the Delhi I Station, which is the main station with which we are concerned our complaint is—

MR. CHAIRMAN (the Honourable Sir David Devadoss) : Please bring your remarks to a close.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I have not much to say, Sir. I have no idea of opposing the propagation of Hindi if my Honourable friends so desire, provided they on their part are content with the same treatment being accorded to other languages. If they wish to have a station of their own I, Sir, for one would have no objection. There should be a Hindi station and in the same manner there should be an Urdu station, but Delhi must remain a central Hindustani station for all to serve.

THE HONOURABLE SIE JOGENDRA SINGH : Lucknow too.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I, for one, Sir, am prepared to have this compromise. If Government can find money and time for these things let us have an Urdu station as well as a Hindi station. I for one would have no objection.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU (United Provinces Southern : Non-Muhamadan) : Mr. Chairman, the Honourable Mr. Hossain Imam said that Raja Govindlal Motilal had demonstrated the correctness of the two nations' theory. Supposing Raja Motilal had not moved this Resolution, would the Honourable Mr.

Hossain Imam have said that he had by a self-denying ordinance that he had imposed upon himself demonstrated the utter futility of the two nations' theory.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : I have received additional support, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I do not think it is necessary for us to import communal hate in discussing a question of this nature. It must be said in fairness to Raja Govindlal Motilal that he made a speech which was singularly free from any communal bias. The question to my mind is a very simple one. No one has any dislike for the Urdu language. Speaking for myself, I have a great admiration for the contribution that Urdu writers have made to the culture and thought of this country. I should like to pay a tribute to them for all that they have done to promote the cultural life of this country, but if Urdu has got a right to exist so has Hindi, which has a longer existence in this country than, Urdu which, after all, was derived from Hindi from *khari boli*. Unfortunately, what has happened in this country is that when Urdu writers begin to write Urdu they begin to use highly Persianized words. When Hindi writers begin to write Hindi they start using highly Sanskritized words and they think that good language, means ornate language, means difficult language. The more difficult the language the greater is the praise, the admiration, that the writer feels for his own writing. Well, the ideal should be simple language ; simple direct language. Take, for example, any leader in a British newspaper today. Take leaders in the *Daily Herald* or the *News Chronicle*. They are written in very simple language. One sentence constitutes one paragraph. The working man can read that leader in about two minutes when he is having his breakfast and he knows the news of the world. He knows everything that is worth knowing. Well, that should be the direction in which our Hindi and Urdu writers should emulate. Unfortunately, they have not been doing so and I am not going to allocate the blame between Urdu and Hindi writers. I refuse to undertake that task. The relevant question to my mind, however, is this : Should Government, constituted as it is in this country, give a lead in this matter ? Unfortunately, this Urdu-Hindi question—this question of language—has become a controversial matter. It has got connected with communal politics. I accept fully the goal of a Hindustani which will employ both Persian and Sanskrit words where necessary ; I mean, which will not eschew Persian words because they happen to be Persian words but which will not eschew Sanskrit words because they happen to be Sanskrit words but this language question has got mixed up with controversial politics. It has got mixed up with communal politics and I regret to say that the policy which the All-India Radio has adopted has to a certain extent intensified this controversy.

Now I come to certain words which one finds used in the Hindustani broadcasts. I think simpler words could be used in their place. Words which are commonly used could be used. Take, for example, "iqtsad"—the word used to mean "economics".

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : Again the Honourable Member is not fair to the Department. He is taking a word from a book which was published long ago. The word "iqstad" is being used with "arthak" whenever necessary. That is, "economics". I request the Honourable Member not to rely upon that book which was published long ago and which was the cause of all this trouble. We have revised the whole thing, and if the Honourable Member is relying upon that book, I think he is not being fair to himself or to the Department.

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : I will not refer to those words. I am glad to hear that they have been given up. I thought some of those words were unnecessarily difficult to understand.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : As a matter of fact, both the words are difficult—"iqtsad" and "arthak".

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : Unfortunately, Sir, this question has assumed a communal colour. It has got mixed up with communal politics, and Hindi writers have got a feeling that justice is not being done to them and to their language. Now, the British Government in this country has followed a policy of religious neutrality since it assumed responsibility for the government of this country. Is it not

[Mr. P. N. Saprū.]

possible for Government, when a controversy of this character arises, to follow a similar policy of neutrality in regard to the language question? What the Department of Broadcasting has, possibly with good intentions, been doing is to evolve a Hindustani language (*Interruption*) or to give encouragement to the Hindustani language. Unfortunately, one section of the Indian people thinks that in this attempt to give encouragement to Hindustani one particular language is being favoured at the expense of the other. That being the state of affairs, there is much that can be said in favour of the solution which has been suggested by Raja Govindlal. Let there be two broadcasts. Let there be a Hindi broadcast and an Urdu broadcast. Let the broadcast in Hindi and the broadcast in Urdu be as simple as possible. Let the effort of those who are broadcasting in Hindi be to use simple Hindi words, and let the effort of those who are broadcasting in Urdu be to use simple Urdu words. Let this experiment be tried for a few years, and then let us see whether at the end of these few years the two languages will not be nearer to each other than they appear to be at the moment. The suggestion which my Honourable friend Raja Govindlal has made is not that there should be no Urdu broadcasts; his suggestion is that there should be Hindi broadcasts in addition. It will mean the giving up of Hindustani broadcasts. Personally I should regret if the Hindustani broadcasts were given up. I think the experiment of Hindustani was worth trying. Unfortunately it has been tried and it has led to communal friction. Well, let us face the fact. Let us give up the experiment. Let us try a new experiment. Let us recognise that there is a Hindi language and that there is an Urdu language, and let us recognise that both languages have an equal right to live in this vast land of ours. Let us recognise frankly, boldly, that both the cultures have got a contribution to make to the sum total of Indian culture, of Indian civilisation and let us make our broadcasting arrangements accordingly.

This is a solution which I confess I do not consider ideal. But ideal solutions are not always possible in life. In life we have often to do with the second best and it may well be that if we take this line it may be possible to generate, in years, to come, better feelings between both Urdu and Hindi writers.

Sir, there is much that can be said for the claims of Hindi to be recognised as one at least of the languages entitled to a broadcast position in All-India Radio. For Hindus it is a sacred language. The Honourable the Information Member, who is a very distinguished lawyer and who knows Hindu civilisation as well as we do, knows that some of the most sacred books of the Hindus are to be found in the Hindi language. For the Hindus, it is the language of Tulsidas, and naturally there is a feeling that it deserves to be preserved and encouraged. In fact, there has been a great deal of development so far as Hindi is concerned. I happen to be a voracious reader of Hindi fiction and of Hindi literature. Whenever I am in a railway train, I make it a point to spend my time in reading Hindi magazines, and I know the developments that are taking place in this language. I think similar developments are taking place in the Urdu language also.

This country is vast enough, is big enough, to find a place for both Hindi and Urdu and there need be no quarrel between the two. Of course, you cannot convert a majority into a minority. But if 80 million people look upon Urdu as their language, they should be strong enough and able enough to develop their own culture. Similarly, if we confine ourselves to Northern India where Hindi is spoken by about 120 or 130 million people, they should be able to develop a culture of their own. (*An Honourable Member*: "Where will Bengali and Punjabi go?") Let them remain as they are. What I am saying is that it is not correct that all Hindus speak Hindi and all Muslims speak Urdu. I will give you an example. I have a Muslim bearer, who has been with me for the last 25 years. He is a devoted servant of mine. Three years back the Honourable Rai Bahadur Mahtha will be able to bear me out we had the census here in 1941, I think. The census fellow came, and he asked him his name. He gave his name—Bakridi. So, he knew he was a Muslim, and he asked him what his language was. My servant said, "Hindi." But the man put it down as Urdu. I did not bother about it; I was not interested in the controversy at all. Then he went up to him and said, "No, no; this is wrong; my language is Hindi because in my village nobody understands Urdu".

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: From which Province was that?

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU : United Provinces—Pratabgarh. The Honourable Sri Narain Mahtha will be able to swear that what I am stating is absolutely a fact. The other day I was talking to a chowkidar. I got up at about 2 A.M. I shouted for him and I asked him "*Kyawaqat hai*". The fellow did not understand me. I went on repeating the sentence half a dozen times and he could not and would not understand me. Then it suddenly occurred to me that the word "*waqat*" was not understood by him. Then I asked, "*Kya samaya hai*" and he said it was about 2 A.M. In the villages, these simple words like "*samaya*" and "*sandhya*" are much more understood than we who have been brought up in a certain culture imagine they are understood by the villagers. We have got to face facts as they are and I think the Honourable Raja Govindlal's Resolution faces facts. I therefore give my whole-hearted support to the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE SIR JOGENDRA SINGH (Education, Health and Lands Member) : Sir, yesterday my friends of the Muslim League and the Congress were on the international stage claiming the sanction of unity. They had ascended attitudes which are more becoming to them than the cockpit of communal conflict to which they have descended to day. What I said about Hindi and Urdu was, there is the Hindi of Kabir and Mira Bai and there is the Urdu of Muhammad Hussain Azad, Anis and Amir. They will find that these writers wrote a common language. Any one who can understand the Hindi of Kabir or Mira Bai can as easily follow the writings of Muhammad Hussain Azad or Anis Mohammad Hussain Azad was a great scholar of Urdu. Some of you perhaps know that he wrote book called *Durbar-i-Akbari*, one of the most interesting histories of Akbar's time. He also produced a book called "*Sukhan Dan Paris*" and traced a common source both of Persian and Sanskrit. It would be interesting to those who want to seek a common source for the languages to read this book of Muhammad Hussain Azad who was a Professor in the Government College, Lahore, and one of the great writers of Urdu. Finally, I would say, in the words of a Hindu poet :—

" Lakri jal Koela Bhai
Koela Jal Bhai Rakh. ,,

The wood has burned and turned into charcoal and charcoal into ashes. You and I, Mussalmans and Hindus are burning away our energies in vain dispute. Where are we today. Are we going to waste our opportunity in pursuit of separation or stand on a common platform? The National Congress should stand for nationality in language, in aspirations, and bring about unity and cease to pursue the path of separation in language, community or other things. Some members of this Council in any case should discard these things and stand for that for which their hearts yearn, we must work for unity, ascend the national platforms, represent India, and not represent the one or the other community, holding not to the one or the other language but holding to that which is common to us all.

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR RAY CHOWDHURY (West Bengal : Non-Muhammadan) : Sir, coming from Bengal, I support the Resolution moved by my leader, the Honourable Mr. Motilal. In Calcutta, which is a cosmopolitan city, there is a large population, specially Marwaris and people from Bihar, who understand only the ordinary Hindi and no other language.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : Why not leave Bihar to us ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR RAY CHOWDHURY : No, Sir, I am speaking of those Biharis who live in Calcutta. There are Marwaris and people from Bihar who understand only the ordinary Hindi and no other language. If programmes in Hindi are broadcast from the stations mentioned by my Honourable friend, Mr. Motilal, these people in Calcutta, who understand only Hindi, may switch their radios to the Delhi short wave and listen to the programmes.

As regards the claim that all Mussalmans speak and understand the Urdu language, this is not correct. I can say from my personal experience, Sir, that the Mussalmans of Bengal generally do not understand or speak the Urdu language. I can cite one instance. I was once in the Court of the Honourable Mr. Justice C. C. Ghosh, now deceased. When he was presiding in the Court, there was a letter written in Urdu. He could not understand it. He spotted out one of the

[Mr. Sasil Kumar Roy Chowdhury.]

Mussalman Solicitors in the Court room and asked him whether he could translate that letter. This Solicitor, Mr. Huq, looked at that letter and said, "My Lord, I do not understand this Urdu. We know only an calcatian Urdu. I do not understand this Urdu which is written or spoken in Northern India".

With these words, Sir, I support the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM: In the villages is Hindi understood?

THE HONOURABLE MR. SUSIL KUMAR ROY CHOWDHURY: No, Sir, Urdu is not understood either. I said that in Calcutta, which is a cosmopolitan city, Marwaris and people from Bihar and other provinces understand only the ordinary Hindi and no other language. For their benefit I say that Hindi should be broadcast from the Delhi station so that these people may switch their radios to Delhi short wave and listen to these Hindi broadcasts.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED (Information and Broadcasting Member): Mr. Chairman, the Resolution before the House runs as follows:—

"This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that from Delhi, Lucknow Lahore and Peshawar news as well as other items be daily broadcast in Hindi also which should be allotted due proportion of time at all these stations."

I am taking the Resolution as it stands and dealing with it, and then, later I will discuss the general question. If it is suggested that Hindi should be broadcast not only from Delhi and Lucknow but also from Lahore and Peshawar, I would like to put in a caveat. There has been no suggestion made as to the proportion of Hindi-knowing public or listeners in the North West Frontier Province and it has not been suggested even in the most biased quarters that the majority of the listeners in Peshawar would understand Hindi in preference to Pushtu or Urdu. As regards Lahore again, the position is unintelligible to me. I am sure all those friends of ours who come from the Punjab will bear me out that the claim is unjustified. As regards Delhi and Lucknow, the main trouble has arisen here. It is suggested that in Delhi and Lucknow there are more Hindi listeners than Urdu listeners. I will deal with that point a little later. But at present I do feel that the simple question is whether there should be two languages in which there should be broadcast from these four stations.

Sir, the controversy about the language to be used in All-India Radio is as old as All-India Radio itself. When the central station was started trouble arose whether the language that we were using was the language which was intelligible to the people and the objection came from the Urdu writers in the Punjab, Delhi and the United Provinces. We were abused from all quarters which were anxious to see that the purity of Urdu was not in any way spoiled. That went on for a long time. But as usual in such cases, merits are not considered but sentiments are allowed to prevail. Recently, objections have come from the other quarter. Not only have we been accustomed to hear abuses in the House but abuses came from the other quarter which are as good or as bad as the criticisms and objections which were levelled against us at the inception of this All-India Radio. Complaints were received by me both from the protagonists of the Hindi and Urdu languages and ultimately I decided that I should have an *ad hoc* committee to consider this question consisting of three representatives of the Hind Sammelan and three representatives of Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu. I also requisitioned the help and co-operation of the Standing Committee of the Information and Broadcasting Department. I am sure my Honourable friend Mr. Sapru will concede to me at least that in doing so I was not showing a communal bias about which he has complained. Nothing hurt me more this afternoon than to hear from him that the Department of which—

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU: 'On a point of personal explanation. I did not in the slightest degree impute any communal bias to my esteemed friend, the Honourable Sir Sultan Ahmed. This is the impression so far as the Department is concerned. I had not him in mind at all.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: I am deeply grateful to my Honourable friend. Now, a more representative *ad hoc* committee I could not conceive

and I am very grateful to all those gentlemen who responded to my invitation ; and if I have got any grievance I have it against some of the members of my own Standing Committee. Only one representative of that Committee could attend. I will leave out Mr. Sri Narain Mahtha, because he was unfortunately ill in Bombay and he wrote to me he could not attend. I had the best possible representative committee to consider this question and if the Honourable Mover wants that there should be two broadcasts in two languages, Hindi and Urdu, I am afraid the decision of that Committee unanimously was against it. The first decision that they suggested to me was this :—

“ There should not be separate Urdu and Hindi broadcasts of news, news commentaries and announcements, the language used being of the simplest variety, which is understood by the vast majority of the listeners in Hindustani-speaking areas.”

If I had to demolish this Resolution, I could simply rely on this. My Honourable friend the Mover will have to go very far to get a supporter. Immediately after the decision was taken by the Government of India Mahatma Gandhi issued a statement saying that there would be no justification at all for having two separate languages like Hindi and Urdu. He insists that there should be no separate languages like Hindi and Urdu for this purpose. Therefore, Sir, whatever the view of the Honourable Mover may be, I am afraid the Government of India cannot possibly accept the Motion of my Honourable friend, and I hope it will not be accepted by the House. I am in very good company. I have got the support of the Hindi Sammelan ; I have got the support of the Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu ; I have got the support of the Standing Committee of my Department. I have got the support of Mahatma Gandhi.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Will you read out his whole statement ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : The only question at present is whether there should be two broadcasts or not. I am demolishing that.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Will you please read whatever he has said on the broadcasts also ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : I will come to that. That meant that the language should be something different from what it has been. You want two languages. The point is whether you should have two languages. If this Resolution is modified or amended, that is another matter. If my Honourable friend would say, “ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that from Delhi, Lucknow, Lahore and Peshawar news as well as other items be daily broadcast in some simple language which may be understood by the people ” I will accept it and sit down, because that is the decision of the Government of India. But when he wants that broadcasts should be in two languages, Hindi and Urdu, then the difficulty comes in. There I say even Mahatma Gandhi does not support him and in fact no responsible man can support him. In the committee Pandit Sampuranand who is a great Hindi scholar and a first class Urdu speaker—that is the language of Lucknow—suggested to me—that there should be one language for the news, commentaries, broadcasts and announcements and broadcasts of announcements and news in Urdu and Hindi separately should not be undertaken. In the face of that recommendation by him, does my Honourable friend expect me to go against it supported as it was by people outside, and introduce broadcasts in two different languages ? I submit, Sir, it would be wrong on my part to do it. It would be thorough irresponsibility on the part of the Government of India to ignore what *prima facie* is correct and is supported unanimously by the Committee as well as by people outside. So far as the Resolution itself is concerned, I submit that I am absolutely on safe grounds.

THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR SRI NARAIN MAHTHA : Permit me to ask a question. Is the Honourable Member prepared to send a copy of any of the broadcasts from here to Mahatma Gandhi and to Pandit Sampuranand to get their approval whether that is proper Hindustani or not ?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : What I did I will tell my Honourable friend. Before the Committee started its work, I sent a news bulletin in English

[Sir Sultan Ahmed.]

of a particular date to both the Hindi Sammelan and the Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu and asked them to translate that bulletin in the language in which it should be broadcast, either Hindi or Hindustani or Urdu. I received a translation from the Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu; I did not receive any translation from the Hindi Sammelan. But when we met I suggested to the representatives of the Hindi Sammelan to translate some of the items in that bulletin and I could see clearly that there was not much difference between Pandit Sampuranand and the Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu and also the Honourable Mr. Hossain Imam.

Undoubtedly, there was a lot of difference between the representative of the Sammelan and the rest. Now I give you one instance:—

“Angrezi faujone nain Tabruk per pura qabza ker liya,”

This was the translation given to me by the Anjuman-i-Taraqqi-e-Urdu. Is there any Honourable Member in this House who can get up and say that he cannot understand this sentence? If there is none, then this is the language of the All-India Radio.

THE HONOURABLE SIR DAVID DEVADOSS: What is the meaning? We do not understand.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: When I say any member I mean those who come from the north, for whom this is done. Of course, your position is different. You come from Madras side but any one who comes from this side of northern India will understand it. The Hindi people wanted to translate “faujone” into something else. “Qabza” they said they did not understand at all. Now, is it fair? Can Mr. Sapru give me another word for it which they will understand?

THE HONOURABLE MR. P. N. SAPRU: I am always for simple language.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: Now, Sir, I will read the decision of the Government of India:—

“There should not be separate Urdu and Hindi broadcasts of news, news commentaries and announcements, the language used being of the simplest variety, which is understood by the vast majority of the listeners in Hindustani-speaking areas.”

Can there be any reasonable objection to this?

The next is:—

“Where there is no appropriate Hindustani word, and a foreign word has to be imported the basis of selection from an indigenous language, Persian, Arabic or English should be the widest intelligibility of that word in Hindustani-speaking areas.”

Can there be any objection to this?

“Whenever foreign words are used, their deflections should conform to the grammar, not of the language from which they are taken, but of the grammar of Hindustani (e.g., if the word ‘station’ were taken from English and adopted by Hindustani, the plural form should be ‘stationon’ and not ‘stations’; similarly, ‘qaida’ and ‘qaide’ and not ‘qaida’ and ‘qawaid’).”

These I have taken bodily from the recommendations of Pandit Sampuranand. He said:—

“No word should be deliberately rejected merely on the ground that there is another word which expresses the same meaning. This should, however, be subject to the general principles that the more widely understood words are to be preferred.”

As regards pronouncement (about which something has been said)

“(a) the more current form of pronouncement should be preferred to the purist literary and etymological form;

(b) the name of a person should, as far as possible, be pronounced as he pronounces it himself.”

A name was given to us, I think by the Honourable the Mover of the Resolution, that of Sir Jagdish Prasad. He wanted us to pronounce his name as “Prasad”. I refuse to do so. The correct pronunciation is *Pershad* and it would be wrong on my part to change and twist it so that it will become something which he himself does not know.

“(c) for names of places, rivers, etc., the most widely current form should be preferred.”

It is difficult for me to understand the criticism or objection to these. If it is suggested that these will not be in practice adopted by All-India Radio I can understand the objection and it is up to me to see that the decision of the Government of India is implemented by the Department ; but it will take a little time before you can come and tell me that the decision that I had arrived at was not implemented by the Government of India. But to say that the principle is wrong, I submit, is not fair. After all, I am not creating a language. It is not my job to do it. It is not the job of any Department of the Government of India to be a partisan but it is the job of All-India Radio to see that the Listeners understand and follow the bulletins, news talks, commentaries which are issued from there. That is their job. It certainly is entrusted to me and I must see that the vast majority follow the programme. If I had reintroduce the two languages separately the result would be this. Whatever may be said by the Honourable the Mover or by the Honourable Mr. Sapru once this partition takes place it will be a real partition. Neither Hindi would be understood by us nor would Urdu be understood by us.

Sir, some time back I had to read a leading article in an Urdu newspaper and the heading was " Sir Sultan Ahmed ". I read it through and through and really I could not follow whether it was complimentary to me or otherwise because it was couched in a language which was very literary, very, very literary perhaps. New words had been used and more new words had been added which I could not understand, and I claim that if there is any Province in the whole of India where the language used is the popular language understood by the general masses of the people in this country it is Bihar. I do not use either high-flown Sanskritized Hindi or highly Arabicized, Persianized Urdu. In fact, I am sometimes laughed at by my friends in Lucknow and Delhi but my claim is that I speak the language which is generally understood by the people of this country. Now one can understand your objection as regards " janub ", " shimal ", " mashriq " and " maghrib ". When I started looking into this question I felt that there was a vast majority of the listeners who could not follow these words and therefore I ordered that the simple words " dakkhan ", " uttar ", " poorab " and " pachham " should be used. I was taken to task for this by some of my Muslim friends and editors of certain papers. They said that the word " dakkhan " is not understood by the people of the Punjab or the people of Delhi. Fortunately I know something about my own language and I told them that I did not agree, as I knew that people in this country, a vast majority of them, understood these words, that is those people who live in these areas and I could quote from the biggest poet of Delhi that the people in the East were called " Poorabi " and then the question was finished.

Now, Sir, it cannot be said that I have not tried to simplify the language. I want the language to be one which will be understood not by the masses in the sense of weavers or servants but by the man in the street, that is that it should not be necessary for any one of us to consult a dictionary to understand the language of All-India Radio. I therefore submit to you both on the ground which may be called national ground that there should be as far as possible one common language for the whole of the country and also mainly because I want that the majority of my listeners should understand the language which is broadcast from Delhi and I suggest that it would be a tragedy if All-India Radio tried to encourage the bifurcation which was suggested in the Motion. I must, as the head of the Department, tell the House that if this recommendation is accepted by the House they must be prepared for two factors. One is this. The time for the news broadcast is 20 minutes. So far as the Hindustani broadcast is concerned if you want to divide it into half and half either you have to give 40 minutes for broadcasts or you must reduce other items. The second necessary result would be that you will have to augment the staff which will, according to our calculations, cost us about a lakh of rupees recurring and non-recurring but this question of cost is a very minor consideration if it is in the interest of India that the bifurcation should be done. We are already spending quite a lot as it is our aim that this Department may be considered as one of the biggest organisations in the world.

Sir, I appeal to my Honourable friend the Mover of the Resolution that the suggestion that is implied in this Resolution is one which should not be pressed.

[Sir Sultan Ahmed.]

Let us rise superior to the occasion. You ask us to rise superior to the occasion. Please do it yourselves.

Sir, the other day I had a very important visitor to the All-India Radio—Lord Reith, who was the Chairman of the B. B. C. in London and who is one of the biggest men in the radio world. He went to All-India Radio without notice to me or to the Secretary, and he came while I was in the Assembly and called on me. I came over, and he told me: "After having had three hours' experience in your All-India Radio, let me tell you that I congratulate you upon the results that you have achieved. It is the finest broadcasting station in the world". And this was after putting questions to all the different executive officers of All-India Radio. It may be also of some interest to the House to know that at the Radio Conference which has just been held in London and which finished its work perhaps yesterday, the delegates from all over the world selected as their Chairman of the morning plenary session of the Conference the Chairman of the B. B. C. and for the afternoon session every day they selected the Director General of All-India Radio, Mr. Bokhari. This is an institution of which I am proud. This is an institution of which you should be proud, and I do not want this to be a ball to be kicked about by political parties either this side or that side. It is a national institution. It will add glory to all that India has been doing during the last few years. I submit, Sir, that if such petty considerations were allowed to come into play so far as the activities of All-India Radio are concerned, I am afraid the place which All-India Radio finds at present in the radio world will go down, and it will be all to the discredit of India. I do appeal to my Honourable friend not to press this Resolution.

*THE HONOURABLE SAYYED MOHAMED PADSHAH SAHIB BAHADUR (Madras: Muhammadan): I did not intend to intervene in the debate, but if I do so at all at this stage, it is only for the purpose of requesting the Honourable Sir Sultan Ahmed not to yield easily to agitation. My complaint has been, and to that complaint I gave utterance in my speech on the occasion of the debate on the General budget, that the compromise which Sir Sultan Ahmed was able to achieve was achieved at very great cost to and very serious disadvantage of Urdu. He has, in my opinion, conceded too much to the protagonists of Hindi. That is the feeling among all the Urdu-speaking people in the country. Sir Sultan Ahmed, who is himself a very eminent scholar of Urdu and who has vast knowledge of the conditions in the whole of India, knows that if there is any language which is entitled to be regarded as the common language of India it is Urdu. And he knows also that outside India, in foreign countries, in England, in France, in Egypt, everywhere else, if people try to display their knowledge of an Indian language, they simply reproduce words from Urdu as it is spoken in India.

Sir, this controversy about two languages began only when the differences between the various sections in the country as regards their political rights became more pronounced. But, Sir, I would take the House back to those days when these political differences had not become so pronounced and language had not been pitched upon as one of the instruments by which to assert the respective rights of the various sections. *The Encyclopaedia Britannica* contains a note on the status of Urdu. On page 576 of Volume 11, you find the following passage:—

"Although Urdu chiefly represents Muslim culture, its use is by no means confined to Muslims. Not only is the most popular Urdu novelist a Hindu, but the statistics of the vernacular press show that this form of the language is widely used by Hindus".

MR. CHAIRMAN (the Honourable Mr. M.N. Dala): Is it necessary to go into such great detail at this stage of the debate? The Honourable Member should confine himself to general remarks.

THE HONOURABLE SAYYED MOHAMED PADSHAH SAHIB BAHADUR: I will read only a short extract. I am just pointing out that Urdu as spoken in the country is a language common to all sections of the people, barring those who speak the vernaculars prevalent in the different areas. As a matter of fact in the Province from which I come Urdu is not the common language. They have

a legion of languages there : there is Malayalam, Kanarese, Telngu and Tamil. When an attempt was made to impose Hindustani as the compulsory language while the Congress was in power in my Province, there was a huge agitation. There used to be public meetings at the beach and thousands of people used to gather there and voice their protest against the introduction of Hindustani as the common language for the whole Province. Scholars and people of great reputation and great leaders opposed the move. So, my submission is this. I will read a little extract from this book and close this part of my argument :—

“ High Hindi has scarcely adapted itself to modern requirements with the thoroughness displayed by Urdu. It is taught in the schools where the population is mainly Hindu, and books of science have been written in it with a terminology borrowed from Sanskrit. But Sanskrit is far removed from the daily life of the people, and most works in this style are read only by Pandits, the great bulk of them dealing with religion, philology and the ancient literature. There are a fair number of Hindi and Hindi-Urdu journals ; but many of them are exclusively religious in character, and several, though written in Devanagari, employ a language akin to Urdu.”

Therefore, Sir, I say that the common medium of social intercourse in this country is Urdu. The job of broadcasting that All-India Radio is doing is not to carry on propaganda for the one or the other. All that the radio has got to do when it purveys news is to convey the news in the language which is intelligible to the majority of the people in the country. My Honourable friend the Mover of the Resolution is welcome to try and encourage Hindi if that is the sacred language of the Hindus, and Muslims will be perfectly justified in encouraging Arabic which is their own sacred language. But in my opinion nobody has any right to force their own language upon All-India Radio whose job it is only to purvey news in the language which is understood by most of the people in the country.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Sir, I have listened carefully to the speeches delivered for and against my Resolution and I shall deal with them in the order in which they were delivered. My Honourable friend Rai Bahadur Shri Narain Mahtha was the first speaker. (An Honourable Member : “ Sri Narain ”.) He has never pronounced his own name and therefore I can only say “ Shri Narain ”. I am not going to follow the bad example of All-India Radio in pronouncing his name incorrectly. I think he does it correctly but even if he did it incorrectly, I shall not follow the bad example of All-India Radio. What he said must be taken to heart. It is no use evading the issue lightly as Government have tried to do. The next speaker was my Honourable friend Mr. Hossain Imam. He was happy that I moved the Resolution. He was also unhappy that I moved it. He said, “ It will confirm that there are two nations if there are two languages ”. The “ nations ” do not depend necessarily upon languages. Do we not know the solidarity of a nation like Switzerland where there are three distinct languages, German, Italian and French ? And yet they are a solid nation. If different languages were any criterion of nationhood, then India must be divided at least into ten nations. I hope even Government would not push their argument to that extent. However, that argument was not used by my Honourable friend Sir Sultan Ahmed and I shall not say that it was his idea or that Government would go to that length. Another argument used by my Honourable friend Mr. Hossain Imam was that the cinemas are using Urdu. Has he not experience of cinemas? I know that some cinema producers are using the Urdu language, and some are using the Hindi language and if the Government of India were producing cinema pictures then it would be possible for them—

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : They do also produce some Information Films of India.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED : Not cinemas ; films.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL : Government are not producing pictures. These informations films are a very minor matter. If they were producing pictures they would have to adopt a policy different from that of All-India Radio. They will only produce such as will appeal to all sections of the people. In Bombay, I know that when an Urdu picture comes, those who like to go to a good

[Mr. G. S. Moti Lal.]

Urdu picture like the one that came some time back—I forget its name—would like to go and see it. Those who do not understand Urdu would not go to that picture. There is therefore this to be remembered. I know what is in the mind of my Honourable friend Mr. Hossain Imam.

Another thing which he said is that 90 per cent. of the people do not understand Urdu or Hindi. I know that in rural parts of the north, they do not know Urdu or Hindi. That is a fact. The language which they speak—I think Sir Sultan Ahmed will bear me out—is not Urdu. It is not also the Hindustani of All-India Radio. It is only for a small section that All-India Radio caters. When we are dissatisfied, Government have no justification for saying that it is the language of 90 per cent. of the people.

My Honourable friend Sir Jogendra Singh said that yesterday we were making a percent of unity and today we are talking in a different language. Sir Government Benches usually tend to exaggerate our differences. Where there is unity they seek differences.

My Honourable friend sitting on my left started, went round and round, and in the end came to the same proposition that I advanced. He said, "I have no objection to Hindi being one of the languages. Let there be Hindi broadcasts if the Hindus want them. Let there be Urdu broadcasts if the Mussalmans want them". If you deny Hindi, then you have to deny also Urdu to those who want broadcasts in these languages. Do not deny them. Do not take that position. There is a great deal of unity.—

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM: May I just say a word? I suggested different stations for these, not that we be robbed of Hindustani.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: He suggested different stations. What other stations? These are the stations. Delhi being the capital of the Government of India, all the news is controlled from Delhi being a central place, it should have a Hindi programme. There should be Hindi programmes from other stations as well. After the war, there will be more development, and you may have other Hindi stations. The difference between the Honourable Mr. Hossain Imam and myself is now very small. I hope my Honourable friend Sir Jogendra Singh will not be unhappy about it.

Then, Sir, Honourable Sir Sultan Ahmed raised certain points about Peshawar. I say, Sir, there are a large number of Hindus served by the Peshawar station.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: Hindi is not the language of the Hindu.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: Hindi is the language of the Hindu now.

Then we come to Lahore. I say, Sir, that in the Punjab there is a very large number of people whose language is Hindi. At one time it was not. It was Urdu. This book deals with it.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: When was it published?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: Before the controversy.

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: How many years ago?

AN HONOURABLE MEMBER: 50 years ago.

THE HONOURABLE G. S. MOTILAL: All languages change. Language is not static. Languages change with time.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN: Like politics.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: Yes, like politics and like our friends there. Language is not a static thing. Like politics, it also advances and will advance.

Then, what about the proportion? I have said "due proportion". That will require Government to sit down and consider what is due proportion, and consult the people who are listeners and who have got radios. These are the persons to help you and give you a correct idea. Sir Sultan Ahmed said he called in a number

of people—he had a committee of some very important people—who discussed this question. The question was about the radio language. I am not at all denying Urdu its place. Let us not take shelter behind this committee or that committee. Was the Committee agreed? Were there no differences in the Committee? Was the Committee quite satisfied? These questions must be answered. I am glad that he called an *ad hoc* committee. Did it consider this suggestion that there should be two broadcasts?

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: It should not be.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: He then referred to Mahatma Gandhi's statement. I think some lawyers are used to refer only to portions of a statement. I have seen them doing that. I am not in that habit. I have got a cutting from that statement and there Mahatma Gandhi has said this:—

“We wish that Hindi and Urdu may continue to flow like the Ganges and the Jumna”.

The two languages have to flow and when these two languages—

THE HONOURABLE SIR SULTAN AHMED: When they meet they become Hindustani.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. MOTILAL: It is not for the Government or any institution to provide a language of their own. They have not yet come to that stage. By all means have a common language. Even when you have a common language, Hindi and Urdu will be there. It is no use ignoring the realities of the situation, because those who like Hindi will like to take words from the Hindi literature. (*An Honourable Member*: “In what language is instruction given?”) At one time the position was that in Northern India a lot more people spoke Urdu and knew Urdu than they do now. Some statistics were collected. In 1891 there were as many as 67 per cent. subscribers of journals published in the Urdu language and 31 per cent. only in Hindi. In 1936 the position was reversed. Urdu had only 36 per cent. subscribers and Hindi 64 per cent. Then, Sir, according to the figures collected by Mr. V. N. Tiwari of the Servants of India Society (*An Honourable Member*: “He has resigned”). The number of books published also similarly in Urdu between 1880 and 1890 was 61 per cent. and that of Hindi books was then 38 per cent. In 1935-36 the proportion was 10 per cent. Urdu and 81 per cent. Hindi. The number of vernacular examinations is not irrelevant but I shall not here refer to those figures. You cater for a certain section of the people and you have got to give them satisfaction. The policy, even if it had the approval of that committee, requires revision and modification.

Sir Sultan Ahmed first put this problem at a high pitch and then he himself came down to the use of the words “petty considerations”. I protest against this sort of expression. It is not petty consideration; it is a matter of high consideration and I thought he would rise to appreciate it, because I want Urdu as well as Hindi. You cannot force a language upon any body, not even All-India Radio. What All-India Radio is now doing is to force Urdu, and mutilated Hindi down into the ears of the listeners and that will have to be discontinued. The most satisfactory manner of discontinuing it is by adopting the resolution which I have proposed.

MR. CHAIRMAN (the Honourable Mr. M. N. Dalal): Resolution moved—

“This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that from Delhi, Lucknow, Lahore and Peshawar news as well as other items be daily broadcast in Hindi also—which should be allotted due proportion of time at all these stations.”

Question put and Motion negatived.

CODE OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE (AMENDMENT) BILL.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM (Bihar and Orissa: Muhammadan): Chairman, Government has agreed to permit me to move my Resolution on the next official day.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MAHOMED USMAN (Leader of the House): Government have no objection.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM: Therefore I am only moving the Bill. Sir, I move:—

“That the Bill further to amend the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1898, for certain purposes

[Mr. Hossain Imam.]

This is a very simple Bill and I do not think I will be justified in inflicting a speech on the House at this time. This Bill is self-evident from the Statement of Objects and Reasons and requires no speech. I hope the House will pass it.

The Motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN (the Honourable Mr. M. N. Dalal) : The question is : That clause 2 stand part of the bill.

THE HONOURABLE SIR DAVID DEVADOSS (Nominated Non-official) : Sir, there seems to be an omission. The second amendment referred to in the third paragraph of the Statement of Objects and Reasons is omitted in the Bill—presumably by the Select Committee for some reason or other. The Statement of Objects and Reasons mentions it but not the Bill.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : That has been deleted.

Clause 2 was added to the Bill.

Clause 3 was added to the Bill.

Clause 1 was added to the Bill.

The Title and Preamble were added to the Bill.

THE HONOURABLE MR. HOSSAIN IMAM : Sir, I move :—

“That the Bill further to amend the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1898, for certain purposes as passed by the Legislative Assembly, be passed.”

The Motion was adopted.

The Council then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Tuesday, the 27th March, 1945.