

21st September, 1933

THE  
LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY DEBATES

*relative*  
*(1933)*

Volume VII, 1933

(15th September to 21st September, 1933)

SIXTH SESSION

OF THE

FOURTH LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY,  
1933



NEW DELHI  
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA PRESS  
1934

# Legislative Assembly.

## *President:*

THE HONOURABLE SIR SHANMUKHAM CHETTY, K.C.I.E.

## *Deputy President:*

MR. ABDUL MATIN CHAUDHURY, M.L.A.

## *Panel of Chairmen:*

MR. H. P. MODY, M.L.A. †

MR. K. C. NEOGY, M.L.A.

SIR LESLIE HUDSON, KT., M.L.A.

SIR ABDULLA-AL-MAMUN SUHRAWARDY, KT., M.L.A.

## *Secretary:*

MIAN MUHAMMAD RAFI, BAR.-AT-LAW.

## *Assistant of the Secretary:*

RAI BAHADUR D. DUTT.

## *Marshal:*

CAPTAIN HAJI SARDAR NUR AHMAD KHAN, M.C., I.O.M., I.A.

## *Committee on Public Petitions:*

.. ABDUL MATIN CHAUDHURY, M.L.A., *Chairman.*

SIR LESLIE HUDSON, KT., M.L.A.

MR. B. SITARAMARAJU, M.L.A.

MR. GAYA PRASAD SINGH, M.L.A.

MUNWAR HAJEE ISMAIL ALI KHAN, O.B.E., M.L.A.

## CONTENTS.

VOLUME VII.—15th September to 21st September, 1933.

	PAGES.
<b>FRIDAY, 15TH SEPTEMBER, 1933—</b>	
Member Sworn . . . . .	1589
Cancellation of the Evening Party in honour of the Members of the Central Legislature . . . . .	1589
Questions and Answers . . . . .	1589—1612
Message from the Council of State . . . . .	1612
Statement laid on the Table . . . . .	1612
Statement of Business . . . . .	1613
The Indian Tea Control Bill—Passed as amended . . . . .	1613—27
The Factories Bill—Referred to Select Committee . . . . .	1627—47
The Hedjaz Pilgrims ( <i>Muallims</i> ) Bill—Discussion on the motion to recommit to Select Committee not concluded . . . . .	1647—56
<b>SATURDAY, 16TH SEPTEMBER, 1933—</b>	
Questions and Answers . . . . .	1657—76
Unstarred Questions and Answers . . . . .	1676—90
Short Notice Questions and Answers . . . . .	1690—92
Election of Members to the Salt Industry Committee . . . . .	1692
Ruling as to whether a Member of the Executive Council of the Governor General who is not a Member of the Assembly has the right of raising a Point of Order on the floor of the House . . . . .	1692—93
Statement laid on the Table . . . . .	1693
The Hedjaz Pilgrims ( <i>Muallims</i> ) Bill—Recommended to Select Committee . . . . .	1693—1711
The Negotiable Instruments (Amendment) Bill—Referred to Select Committee . . . . .	1712—14
The Indian Arbitration (Amendment) Bill—Passed . . . . .	1714—15
The Cantonments (House-Accommodation Amendment) Bill—Passed . . . . .	1715—17
The Dangerous Drugs (Amendment) Bill—Passed . . . . .	1717—18
Motion <i>re</i> Future Administration of Aden—Discussion not concluded . . . . .	1718—38
<b>MONDAY, 18TH SEPTEMBER, 1933—</b>	
Questions and Answers . . . . .	1739—53
Short Notice Question and Answer . . . . .	1754
Unstarred Questions and Answers . . . . .	1754—65
Messages from the Council of State . . . . .	1765
Statements laid on the Table . . . . .	1765—71
The Indian Dock Labourers Bill—Introduced . . . . .	1771
The Reserve Bank of India Bill—Nomination of Members of the Legislative Assembly to the Joint Committee . . . . .	1771
The Imperial Bank of India (Amendment) Bill—Nomination of Members of the Legislative Assembly to the Joint Committee . . . . .	1771—72
Motion <i>re</i> Future Administration of Aden—Adopted as amended . . . . .	1772—1820
<b>WEDNESDAY, 20TH SEPTEMBER, 1933—</b>	
Questions and Answers . . . . .	1821—42
Unstarred Questions and Answers . . . . .	1842—60
Messages from the Council of State . . . . .	1860—61
Death of Mr. B. N. Misra . . . . .	1861—65
Motion <i>re</i> Dues in respect of Lighthouses and Buoy in British India—Adopted . . . . .	1865
The Indian Medical Council Bill—Passed as amended . . . . .	1865—85
Resolution <i>re</i> Draft Convention and Recommendation concerning the Age for Admission of Children to Non-Industrial Employment—Adopted . . . . .	1885—96
Resolution <i>re</i> Amendment of Rule relating to the Constitution of the Committee on Public Accounts—Adopted . . . . .	1896—97
Demand for Supplementary Grant . . . . .	1897—1908
Report of the Public Accounts Committee . . . . .	1908—15
<b>THURSDAY, 21ST SEPTEMBER, 1933—</b>	
Message from the Council of State . . . . .	1917
Death of Mrs. Annie Besant . . . . .	1917—20
Report of the Public Accounts Committee . . . . .	1920—27

# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

*Thursday, 21st September, 1933.*

The Assembly met in the Assembly Chamber at Eleven of the Clock, Mr. President (The Honourable Sir Shanmukham Chetty) in the Chair.

## MESSAGE FROM THE COUNCIL OF STATE.

**Secretary of the Assembly :** Sir, the following Message has been received from the Council of State :

“ I am directed to inform you that the Council of State has, at its meeting held on the 20th September, 1933, agreed, without any amendments, to the Bill to amend the Dangerous Drugs Act, 1930, for certain purposes, which was passed by the Legislative Assembly at its meeting held on the 16th September, 1933.”

## DEATH OF MRS. ANNIE BESANT.

**Sir Cowasji Jehangir** (Bombay City : Non-Muhammadan Urban) : Mr. President, the House, I am sure, will hear with the deepest regret of the death of Mrs. Annie Besant, and it is the general desire of the House that we should express our condolence with the Theosophical Society and with her relations.

I think that there is no one in India who has not heard or who has not known of the work of Mrs. Annie Besant. It might truly be said that she was the greatest woman of her generation, not only the greatest Englishwoman, but I make bold to say, the greatest woman in the world of her generation. She was perhaps one of the greatest orators of her time, and I well remember in the days of my youth hearing Annie Besant speak, with awe and admiration, although perhaps when we got home and reflected on all she had said we might not be able to agree with all her theories and all her principles : but that she excelled all men and women as an orator there can be no doubt. I have heard it said in England by Englishmen that Annie Besant excelled all men in oratory, including the great Gladstone. Her knowledge of India and her love for this country was of a character we have never seen in any one person before. We may not be able to agree with all her views, but we cannot doubt her honesty of purpose, her love for this country and its peoples, and we cannot but acknowledge today the deep debt of gratitude that India owes her—an Englishwoman coming to this country from her home six thousand miles away, devoting all her time, her energy and her wealth for the well being of a people, millions of them, who were no connection or relations of hers, but merely for the love of humanity. I am not going to enlarge on Mrs. Annie Besant's political life. But there can be no doubt that she was the first in India to rouse the masses as to their responsibilities to their own country, social and political. I have had the pleasure of meeting her, but there

( 1917 )

[Sir Cowasji Jehangir.]

must be other Honourable Members in this House who have known her better. Of course she chose Madras as her home, and those from Madras will naturally speak with much greater authority on the life and work of Mrs. Annie Besant. Mr. President, I believe it is the general desire of the House that you should convey to the Theosophical Society and to her relations our deep condolences and our firm conviction that India has lost in her one of India's greatest friends from abroad.

**Mr. C. S. Ranga Iyer** (Rohilkund and Kumaon Divisions : Non-Muhammadian Rural) : Sir, the Honourable the Leader of the Opposition has expressed the feelings of this side of the House and the House as a whole and the country outside when he said that in the passing of Mrs. Besant a great friend of India and of humanity has passed away. Mrs. Besant illustrated in her great life, greatly lived, that life is a great calling, not a mean and grovelling thing to be shuffled through as we can. When she broke away from Christianity after seeing the sufferings of her child before its death, when she wondered why God should have inflicted on that innocent thing so much suffering, and took to atheism for a while or agnosticism, she was really embarking upon a severe quest after the truth. Great were the days when she fought the battle of freedom in England with Charles Bradlaugh—days which made the late Mr. Stead truly say that she was the greatest platform speaker of the English speaking world. And then, when she came into contact with Hinduism and studied Hindu philosophy and realised that there was such a thing as transmigration of the soul and that the sins of past life were visited by way of suffering in this life on young and old alike, she plunged into the study of that religion and became its great master and interpreter ; it is from Hinduism that she learnt the great truth of theosophy, for she felt that Hinduism was the mother of religions and that various religions were like various rivers which took their start from various mountains flowing, crooked or straight, going and mingling their waters in the common sea, the *sagara*, the realisation of God himself. Mrs. Besant thought she owed a great debt to her own country when she started the Home Rule for India movement. Before her there have been independence movements in this country, climaxing in violence of an ugly kind. She thought the greatest message that an Englishman or Englishwoman could give to this country was to make the Indian people love India as an Englishman would love England ; and she founded, to educate the youth of this land on right lines, the Central Hindu College, Benares, on which rose the great Hindu University. So long as Hinduism lives, the name of Mrs. Besant will live, and even though she has passed away, she can never pass away, for she has joined

“.....the Chair invisible

Of those immortal dead who live again

In minds made better by their presence.”

**Mr. T. N. Ramakrishna Reddi** (Madras ceded Districts and Chittoor : Non-Muhammadian Rural) : Sir, on behalf of my Party and on behalf of myself, I heartily associate myself with the sentiments so eloquently expressed by the Leaders of the Independent and Nationalist Parties regarding the passing away of Dr. Besant. Sir, we Indians owe

a deep debt of gratitude to Dr. Besant. It was she who started the Home Rule movement for the attainment of self-Government for India and it is a pity that she did not see the fruition of her labours. She helped not only the political movement, but also the educational movement by starting the Central Hindu College at Benares and, subsequently, she transferred her activities to the Madras Presidency and made Adyar as the headquarters for her work. After she became President of the Theosophical Society, she made the society a world-wide movement and established branches all over the world. Sir, Madras Presidency is more grateful to her than other provinces, because she started what is called the Y. M. I. A. Association where young Indians find a place for living and for carrying on other social activities. Coming nearer home, I am deeply grateful to her for having started educational institutions in my own place, Madanapalle, where she started an Arts College and Jijnasa Lodge, and she is also responsible for starting what is called the Rishi Valley Educational Trust and made Madanapalle the Santi Niketan of Southern India in the words of the great Poet Tagore. Sir, I associate myself with all the sentiments that have fallen from the previous speakers.

**Mr. N. N. Anklesaria** (Bombay Northern Division : Non-Muhammadan Rural) : Sir, on behalf of the Central Party, I entirely associate myself with the sentiments expressed by the previous speakers. Sir, among the many English names which have endeared themselves to Indians the name of Annie Besant will be always in the forefront. So far as I know, she acknowledged no ties of blood or race. India was her mother and Indians were her brothers and sisters. Mr. President, I think, therefore, it would be in the fitness of things if our condolence and sympathy were broadcasted throughout the whole country which is now mourning her loss.

**Sir Leslie Hudson** (Bombay : European) : Mr. President, in the passing away of Dr. Annie Besant, a remarkable personality has been lost to India. She identified herself in her later years with the Home Rule movement in India and she gave that movement life and purpose in politics, in religion and in philosophy. She has made her influence felt throughout the world, and more particularly throughout India, and there are many, apart from those who have listened to her silver tongued oratory, who will mourn her loss. I wish to associate my Group, Sir, with the tributes paid to her memory by previous speakers.

**Nawab Major Malik Talib Mehdi Khan** (North Punjab : Muhammadan) : Sir, I wish to associate myself and my Party with what has been said by previous speakers about the loss that India has sustained on account of the passing away of Dr. Annie Besant. She was one of those Englishwomen who tried to bring the East and West together. She gave a very great part of her life to the service of India. She was quite unselfish and had no thought for any kind of reward for the work she did for this country. Sir, her death removes a link which aimed at uniting India and England together, and we mourn her loss, because we have lost a true friend.

**The Honourable Sir Joseph Bore** (Leader of the House) : Sir, I would like to associate myself with the tributes that have been paid to a truly remarkable personality. Mrs. Besant spent the best years of a very long life in what she passionately believed to be the best service of this

[Sir Joseph Bhoré.]

country. I am sure that there will be a widespread feeling of regret throughout the country at the loss of a great personality who was a citizen of the world, as much as he was a citizen of India.

**Mr. President** (The Honourable Sir Shanmukham Chetty) : I would like to add my own tribute to the memory of one of the greatest personalities that the world has ever seen. In the passing away of Mrs. Annie Besant, the world has lost a remarkable personality. It has been my privilege to enjoy the friendship of Annie Besant, and it was my privilege also to work with her in the public cause for some time. When the future historian of India writes about the progress of the national movement in this country, he would undoubtedly give a place of honour to Annie Besant. To my mind, the greatest service that Annie Besant rendered to this country and to England lies in the fact that she, more than any other person, has been responsible for bringing about better understanding between Englishmen and Indians. She was eminently fitted for this task, because she, more than any other person, understood Indian ideals and aspirations. Her knowledge of Indian culture and Indian philosophy was unique. That foundation enabled her to bring about a better understanding between Englishmen and Indians. I well remember the year 1924 when I proceeded to England as one of the members of the Home Rule Deputation and addressed various public meetings along with her, and I can recall to my mind the enthusiasm which Annie Besant stirred up in the minds of Englishmen and women about the Indian Empire. Both Englishmen and Indians will for many generations to come revere the memory of one who strove so hard to bring about a better understanding between these two countries. Probably those outside her own intimate circle may not realise that, apart from her public services, in her private life she was the very embodiment of charity and philanthropy. I know myself of hundreds of Indian students who owe their educational career and their career in later life to the generosity of Annie Besant. It shall be my duty to convey to the members of the Theosophical Society and to the relations of Annie Besant the deep sorrow that this House feels with the world as a whole in the loss of a great personality, and the greatest friend that India had.

---

#### REPORT OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE—concl'd.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad** (United Provinces Southern Divisions : Muhammadan Rural) : The Public Accounts Committee is one of the most important statutory Committees of this House, or, I can say, perhaps the most important one. Its report is always of a technical nature, and the object of discussing it in the House is that the Members of the Assembly, who have not been members of the Public Accounts Committee, should know something about the administration of the various Departments of the Government, and hear something about the efficiency or otherwise of those Departments. The object is not simply to pass the Report in a formal manner ; the intention is that we should know something about it. So, it was unreasonable on the part of Government to have a Report of this kind fifteen minutes before the time

scheduled for the termination of the proceedings of this Assembly, and when a suggestion was made by the Opposition that the subject should be taken up in the Delhi Session, the reply of the Government was still more unreasonable, and the Opposition had no other alternative but to exercise its prerogative.

I frankly admit that I did not even know till yesterday afternoon that the Railway Department also came within the purview of the Public Accounts Committee till the Deputy Secretary passed on the second volume of the Report to me. Many Members on this side of the House are absent and I should not like to detain the House very long. I shall take the advice of my Honourable friend, the Finance Member, and confine my attention to those particular portions which are mentioned in the Report and leave the consideration of all points from A to Z.

Taking up Appendices IV and V of this Report, they deal with a matter in which I had been taking great interest, that is the question of Moody-Ward report and the treatment meted out to travelling ticket inspectors. I daresay, much water has flown since those pages had been written and the position today is much better. There are, however, one or two points to which I would like to draw attention. It is asserted that this was the most feasible scheme that could be devised. If it is supposed to be very efficient, may I suggest that the crew system which has been so much condemned in this Report should now be abolished even on the Great Indian Peninsula Railway where, I understand, it does exist from Khandwa to Manmad. The other thing is that they have sketched out very nicely the defects of the Moody-Ward system. They say that, under the crew system, 30 per cent. of the tickets were missing, as against nine per cent. missing under the Moody-Ward system. The only relic of the crew system that has now been left is the Hayman-Mohindra punch. I respectfully submit to the Honourable the Financial Commissioner for Railways that all these punches should be sold out now like waste iron and the whole thing written off as a dead loss to the Indian railways in memory of those who have gone away.

I take this opportunity to repeat four points to which attention has already been drawn. In this connection I should like to take this opportunity to thank my friend, the Financial Commissioner, who is taking a personal interest in the matter, and on account of his personal sympathy to a just cause this vexed question has been partially, or, I may say, to a large extent, solved. Those points still left are (1) that the consolidated travelling allowance should be fixed in proportion to the salary and not fixed for each grade, (2) if the vacancies may be in a higher grade, then.....

**The Honourable Sir Joseph Bhore** (Member for Commerce and Railways) : Would my Honourable friend kindly refer me to the part of the Report with which he is dealing ?

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad** : It is connected with the Moody-Ward Report which is referred to in Annexure A to Appendix IV. I need not waste the time of the House, but I would like to read only one sentence from this Appendix :

“ The Auditor General concurred in this opinion and added that the function of the Accounts Department was, through the accounts, to check whether the Traffic Department was doing its work properly.”



[Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad.]

And, I think, some machinery ought to be provided to give effect to this suggestion. Some machinery should be provided to check the work of the Transport department.

Now, I come to the next Appendix, namely, V, dealing with publicity. Here, I understand, that a large sum of money had been given to one press in India, both in advance and also recurring. It would probably have been better if the money had been spent in improving the Railway Printing Works, instead of giving it to one press. Another complaint is, the advertisements of the Railway publicity office are invariably given to the English Press and omit altogether the Indian papers. As regards Appendix VI, I have got nothing to say.

Now, I come to the very important Appendix, namely, VII, which deals with construction. Here our Public Accounts Committee go into very great detail and lay down certain conditions so that the old mistakes, I think I am entitled to use a stronger word, follies may not be repeated. I must draw attention once more to the Kangra Valley Railway, the original estimate of which was four crores of rupees and we have already spent Rs. 14 crores over it.

**Mr. P. R. Rau** (Financial Commissioner, Railways) : Certainly not. The original estimate was between 130 to 140 lakhs, and we have spent on the whole less than Rs. 3 crores I think. I do not know where my Honourable friend got the figure of Rs. 14 crores.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad** : The important thing is not the actual figures, but that the actual expenditure was three times the original estimate, this my friend cannot deny. Is it or is it not a fact that certain office records were all destroyed ?

**Mr. P. R. Rau** : I understand that there was a fire and the records were destroyed.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad** : If they were destroyed, it is believed that they were destroyed intentionally and the person, who was responsible, I do not like to mention his name, immediately left, and no explanation was called for. Is it not a fact ?

**Mr. P. R. Rau** : This is news to me.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad** : My friend will have more news. I can give you proof of what I am saying now, but I do not like to mention it on the floor of the House. In this particular case, the Railway Department has mismanaged the affairs. My Honourable friend's predecessors, who were responsible for this, took the matter lightly, and no enquiry has been made and no report of a satisfactory nature has been laid before the House.

I should like to have some explanation also about the Salem-Mettur Dam, as to why the total expenditure is about ten times the original estimate. This is another instance in which they have been guilty of mismanagement, the expenditure was much greater than the original estimate. I pause for a reply.

**Mr. P. R. Rau** : I do not think it is correct that the expenditure was ten times the estimate.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** If my friend denies it, I leave the matter here. I now turn to Appendices VIII and IX. There you have a list of number of persons who are shown in one particular place, but who are employed in another place. We know that the audit is restricted to 10 per cent. cases. To find out the real number, you have to multiply it by ten. I do not like to read the whole list, but anybody who reads pages 73—77 of this report will see how the railways have been mis-managed. Cases have been given here in very great details. I may remind the House that in a particular farm in the Ambala district, a large number of coolies and railway servants were employed. I do not like to go into details, but I would refer Honourable Members to the pages of this report.

Then I come to the case of the Bengal Nagpur Railway. You find here that the expenditure, which ought to have been debited under reserve or depreciation, was really debited under capital, and the capital was increased enormously. This is mentioned on page 79, and the result would be that, in 1935, when the State would acquire the Bengal Nagpur Railway, we would have to pay the increased capital. I hope that the Committee would look into the matter and would adjust the accounts.

Then I turn to the purchase of certain things in Appendix XV. This is the electric scheme. It is a big thing, and I do not like to speak about it now. I would deal with this later on. In this connection, a beautiful pamphlet has been written by a railway expert. I hope this pamphlet would be laid before the Public Accounts Committee on some future date.

**Mr. P. R. Rau :** May I know what is the pamphlet the Honourable Member is referring to ?

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** It has been written by some railway officer.

**Mr. P. R. Rau :** Is it by the Director of Railway Audit ? That is the pamphlet which the Public Accounts Committee was considering.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** I have not seen the report myself ; but the author promised to send it to me.

The next thing I will refer to is the stores purchased in England. We know that we pay large sums for the inspection and, then, we find that about 20 or 25 per cent. are incorrectly sent.

**Mr. P. R. Rau :** I do not think it is 10 per cent. It is much nearer one or two per cent.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** I think they order one thing and get something else, and this is a thing which requires to be looked into. Your inspection should be more thorough and you should see that, whatever things are actually ordered are actually received.

The next thing is about the despatch of coal from Calcutta to Rangoon.

**Mr. P. R. Rau :** To what particular paragraph of the report is my Honourable friend referring ?

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** I will give it later, but first let me mention the facts. May I ask, if it is not a fact that we have been paying Rs. 4-14-0, while the actual rate has been Rs. 4-4-0 or Rs. 4-0-0, and we are paying about eight annas per ton extra. A protest has already been made by the Burma Railways about this excess freight from Calcutta to Rangoon.

**Mr. P. R. Rau :** I cannot find any reference to this in this Report. Will my Honourable friend give me the reference ?

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** First consider the facts. Do you admit the facts ? Don't change the issue.

**Mr. P. R. Rau :** We must consider relevancy before we come to test.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** I understand that the Burma Railway Administration has already protested against this practice and gave chapter and verse in proof of that statement. I do not like to waste the time of the House on this occasion and probably we will have a full dress debate on this subject when the discussion on the budget of the Indian Railways comes up before the Assembly.

I will also mention here one thing about the purchase of the finished articles by the Madras and Southern Mahratta Railway. They always purchase the articles in a finished form and, afterwards, when they are not used, they are disposed of at 15 per cent. of the original price.

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster (Finance Member) :** On a point of order. I am sure that every one in this Assembly is interested in making this debate on the report of the Public Accounts Committee a useful one, but what my Honourable friend is really trying to do is to carry out on the floor of the House a sort of examination which the Public Accounts Committee itself has to conduct and I understood that you, Sir, agreed yesterday that this debate should confine itself to points which have actually been brought to notice by the Public Accounts Committee. I think my Honourable friend is going beyond that although no doubt he would be doing a valuable service if he called attention to points which had escaped the notice of the Public Accounts Committee.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** Now, about the stores it is discussed in the committees' report.....

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster :** What paragraph is my Honourable friend referring to ?

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** One thing which should be looked into is whether the store balances of a particular railway are not much greater than they are in the case of other railways.

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster :** May I perhaps assist my Honourable friend. I think possibly he has in mind paragraph 21 of Part I of Volume I of the Report.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** I have Part II in my mind. I again lay stress on the fact that in one particular railway the store balances are much larger than they are under normal conditions which is due to the fact that they purchased a large quantity of stocks which were afterwards sold at 15 per cent. of the cost price.

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster :** I suggest that my Honourable friend is again quoting from his memory, and what we have to deal with is not my Honourable friend's memory, but this printed Report.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad :** I am talking about the store balances mentioned at page 102, Chapter XIX.

Now, the next thing that I wish to say is about the Vizagapatam Harbour which is a big problem by itself. But the less we say about it, the

better it is ; the Railway Department alone is not responsible for its mismanagement.

There is one thing more to which I should like to draw the attention of the House and that is the last point which I wish to make. It has been pointed out that there has been a great irregularity about locating the exact persons who have been responsible for irregularities. Very often the irregularity is attributed to a person who has left the service. Now, on this point, special stress has been laid in the Report and I hope we will have better accounts next year. I think the best course would be not to allow the person who is supposed to be responsible for some irregularities to go on leave and receive all the bonus to which he is entitled unless and until he has explained all those irregularities. In conclusion, I protest once more that this Report ought to have been brought before the House when it was full and when we could have a better opportunity of hearing the criticisms on the report of the Public Accounts Committee from members responsible for this Report.

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster :** Sir, it is always a very difficult task to reply in a debate of this kind and I would like at the outset to make one suggestion to the Honourable Members who are interested in this subject which, if this debate is to be taken seriously in the future, might be of great advantage. If it were possible for Honourable Members, who intend to take part in a discussion on the Public Accounts Committee's Report, to let us on the Government side have notice of the points which they intend to raise, I think it would be possible to have a very much more satisfactory debate. It is, of course, possible to raise points in connection with every department of the Government arising out of the Public Accounts Committee's Report, but I am sure, Honourable Members opposite will appreciate that it is impossible for us on this side to come prepared to deal with every possible point that may be raised. Therefore, if this discussion is to become a useful feature in our proceedings, I think the suggestion which I have made is worth considering. As, however, we have not had notice of the points which have been raised and as it is very difficult for me to speak on behalf of every department on every detail which has been mentioned, I hope the House will excuse me if I do not reply fully on the present occasion. All that I can do is to say that we in the Finance Department will see that copies of the relevant portions of Honourable Members' speeches are forwarded to the departments which they concern and that due notice is taken of the suggestions made. There is, however, one point of general financial significance which was referred to in the speech of my Honourable friend, the Deputy President. He there complained that Government had not followed the recommendation of the Committee that was set up on the Posts and Telegraphs Accounts as regards creating a capital account and as regards allowing interest on the Department's balances. That is rather a complicated question and I only want to point out to my Honourable friend one practical aspect of that recommendation which recent developments have brought to light. Very briefly, the suggestion was that a fictitious balance should be created and credited to the Posts and Telegraphs Department covering the imaginary accumulations of depreciation fund over a long period of years before commercialised accounts were started and that as against that the Department should be treated as having borrowed money to cover the whole of its capital expenditure at an average rate of about 3½ per cent. The Department would then have been in the position

[Sir George Schuster.]

of being liable for interest at  $3\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. on about  $8\frac{1}{2}$  crores. As against this the Department would have had a book balance standing to the credit of the depreciation fund of the same amount on which it would have earned interest at the current rate. As the rate at the time when the recommendation was made was something like 5.7 per cent., the Department would have benefited to the extent of about  $2\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. on the sum of  $8\frac{1}{2}$  crores, that is to say, the department would have been benefited to the extent of about 18 lakhs per annum. That was suggested as one way to make the department a paying proposition. Well, Sir, in the first place I had to object on behalf of the Finance Department to such an arrangement as it was a purely fictitious reconstruction of the past which would have put the Posts and Telegraphs Department in an extremely favourable position. It was to have been treated as having borrowed money at  $3\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. and as having that money to its credit and being able to earn 5.7 per cent. on it.

**Sir Cowasji Jehangir** (Bombay City : Non-Muhammadan Urban) : May I ask if the existing conditions were not most unfavourable to the Posts and Telegraphs Department ? If the suggestion is that the new arrangement was going to put the Posts and Telegraphs Department in a favourable position, were not the existing conditions most unfavourable to the Posts and Telegraphs Department ?

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster** : No, Sir : I do not think I can admit that at all. According to our arrangements we were allowing a very substantial rate of interest on all the balances standing at their credit. The point I want to make is this and I do not wish to enter now into the argument as to the merits or demerits of our decision. But the value of that arrangement to the Posts and Telegraphs Department depended entirely on the fact that the rate of interest which would have been allowed on the balances was much greater than the rate of interest at which it was to be assumed that the capital had been raised. Under present conditions instead of the balances being able to earn 5.7 per cent. interest we could not possibly treat them as earning more than about 4 per cent. interest. Therefore, the benefit which the Posts and Telegraphs Department would have received is reduced to a very few lakhs instead of 18 lakhs. It would have been reduced to about 4 or 5 lakhs. The point is that it is purely an accidental circumstance that it was possible to regard the money which had been spent in the past as having been borrowed at a very low rate and being able to earn a very high rate of interest today. If the charges which are to be levied by the Posts and Telegraphs Department from the public and if the attempts to reduce expenditure on the other side are to be regulated by purely accidental conditions of that kind, then I submit we should not get to the results that we are all aiming at, namely, making the Posts and Telegraphs Department really self-supporting. If it had been possible to accept that arrangement, it would have been an accident that it happened to be a beneficial arrangement, and moreover it would be a benefit, the permanence of which could not have been foretold. In fact if the rates of interest happen to go down still further, as they very well may, that arrangement might actually in the future have been found to be costing the Posts and Telegraphs Department money and to be producing a debit balance, which would, of course, entirely upset the purpose of the recommendation. That is an important

financial point and I am glad to have had this opportunity of dealing with it. Otherwise, I do not think that there are any points on which I can be expected to give an immediate reply. I think we may say that this discussion has had one definite advantage and that is that it has forced my Honourable friend from 'A' to 'Z' to forgo his dinner and to read the Public Accounts Committee report. (Laughter.) That, Sir, is a result on which I submit this Assembly can congratulate itself.

**Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad** : When I mentioned the fact that I had to forgo my dinner for the purpose of reading this Report, I thought that the Honourable Member would say that he would in future lay a Report of the Public Accounts Committee in good time for discussion and at a time when the House is full, and I am rather sorry that only the humorous side had appealed to him and the serious part did not appeal to him.

**The Honourable Sir George Schuster** : I am quite ready to accept my Honourable friend's suggestion and I can give him the assurance that we will do our best to give due notice of the business in future and provide proper time for its discussion. But if we accept that suggestion, then, I think, we are entitled to claim on the other side that Honourable Members who ask for time to discuss this Report should take the matter seriously and should, as far as possible, help us to deal with the points which they have raised.

**Mr. President** (The Honourable Sir Shanmukham Chetty) : The question is :

“ That the Assembly do approve the expenditure of Rs. 25,388 incurred in 1930-31 representing the share of the Government of India on behalf of the Centrally Administered Areas of the cost of materials purchased for locust operations in that year.”

The motion was adopted.

The Assembly then adjourned till eleven of the Clock on Monday, the 13th November, 1933, at New Delhi.