

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE  
OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND  
SCHEDULED TRIBES  
(1988-89)**

**(EIGHTH LOK SABHA)**

**THIRTY-NINTH REPORT**

**MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION**

**Action taken by Government on the Recommendations contained in the Twenty-ninth Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes (Eighth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Civil Aviation—Reservations for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Air India.**



28 NOV 1988

*Presented to Lok Sabha on*

*Laid in Rajya Sabha on*

20 NOV 1988

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

*July, 1988/Sravana, 1910 (Saka)*

**Price : Rs. 18.00**

301.43A

Corrigenda to Thirty-ninth Action Taken Report  
of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled  
Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the Ministry of  
Civil Aviation - Reservations for, and employment  
of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in Air India.

<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>For</u>	<u>Read</u>
1	26	-	1.4.
1	32	1.4	1.5
2	6	-	1.6
2	13	-	1.7
27	5	enterprises	Enterprises
27	19	that	that
27	12	para 1.2	para 1.4
28	12	para 1.4	para 1.7

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE	... (iii)
INTRODUCTION	... (v)
CHAPTER I Report	... 1
CHAPTER II Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government	... 3
CHAPTER III Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies	... 23
CHAPTER IV Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration	... 26
CHAPTER V Recommendations/Observations on which final replies of the Government have not been received	... 29
APPENDIX Analysis of the action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty-Ninth Report of the Committee.	... 35

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED  
CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES  
(1988-89)**

**Shri Arvind Netam—*Chairman***

**MEMBERS**

***Lok Sabha***

2. Shri Dileep Singh Bhuria
3. Shri Bir Bal
4. Shri Sudarshan Das
5. Shri Ganga Ram
6. Shri Manikrao Hodlya Gavit
7. Shri Seth Hembrom
8. Shri Kunwar Ram
9. Shri M. Mahalingam
10. Shri Lakshman Mallick
11. Shri K.N. Pradhan
12. Shri K. Pradhani
13. Dr. P. Vallal Peruman
14. Chaudhary Ram Parkash
15. Shri Ram Singh
16. Shri A.J.V.B. Maheshwara Rao
17. Shri Ajit Kumar Saha
18. Shri Ram Bahadur Singh
19. Shri R.P. Suman
20. Shri Piyus Tiraky

***Rajya Sabha***

21. Shri Anand Prakash Gautam
22. Shri Ramnarayan Goswami
23. Shrimati Kailashpati
24. Prof. N.M. Kamble

25. Shri Dhuleshwar Meena
26. Shri G. Swamy Naik
27. Shri Puttapaga Radhakrishna
28. Shri N. Rajangam
29. Shri V. Ramanathan
30. Shri Jerlie E. Tariang

**SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri N.N. Mehra—*Additional Secretary*
2. Shri D.M. Chanan—*Deputy Secretary*
3. Shri R.K. Chatterjee—*Officer on Special Duty.*

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes having been authorised by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, present this Thirty-ninth Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty-ninth Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Civil Aviation Reservations for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Air India.

2. The Draft Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on the 17 June, 1988.

3. The Report has been divided into the following Chapters :—

I. Report

II. Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government.

III. Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies.

IV. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.

V. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government have not been received

4. An analysis of the action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty-ninth Report of the Committee is given in Annexure. It would be observed therefrom that out of 51

recommendations made in the Report, 38 recommendations i.e. 74.51 percent have been accepted by Government; the Committee do not desire to pursue 4 recommendations i.e. 7.84 percent of their recommendations in view of the Government's replies; 2 recommendations i.e. 3.92 percent, in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee, require reiteration and in respect of 7 recommendations i.e. 13.73 percent, final replies of Government have not been received.

NEW DELHI  
July 21, 1988.

ARVIND NETAM  
Chairman  
*Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled  
Castes and Scheduled Tribes.*

## CHAPTER 1

### REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the 29th Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the Ministry of Civil Aviation—Reservations for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Air India.

1.2 In para 1.6 of their 29th Report the Committee had observed that in the guidelines issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises relating to the appointment of Directors on the Board of Air India, there was no stipulation for appointment of persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee were of the view that with the reservation policy being in force over a number of years, these classes had been denied the opportunity all these years and had expressed the hope that the Government would take action to include at least one person belonging to SCs/STs in the Board of Directors of Air India.

1.3 In their reply dated 4 April, 1988, the Ministry of Civil Aviation after having explained various steps taken to protect and promote the interests and welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, stated that the interests of SCs and STs in the services of Public Sector Undertakings or their economic development in general, could not be ensured by mandatorily including representation of SCs and STs at the Board level, whether on part time or full time basis. In Ministry's view, within the existing policy, the Government can always consider the claims of suitable persons belonging to SCs and STs for part time/full time Directors in the Public Enterprises without taking recourse to formal or informal reservation.

The Committee are not convinced with the plea taken by the Ministry in their reply and will like to reiterate their earlier recommendation that Government "should take action to include at least one person belonging to SCs/STs in the Board of Directors of Air India" as there is no dearth whatsoever of suitable persons amongst SCs/STs for appointment on the Board of Directors of Air India.

1.4 In para 2.11 of their 29th Report, the Committee, having expressed concern at the delay on the part of the Ministry in communi-



cating directives received from the BPE on May 10, 1974 regarding reservations in recruitments and promotions for SCs and STs to Air India which resulted in denial of due promotion to them for more than a year had desired that the Air India should take steps to effect promotion with retrospective effect to remedy the injustice done to SC/ST employees.

In their reply dated 4 April, 1988, the Ministry of Civil Aviation have stated that it would not be feasible to effect promotions with retrospective effect after a lapse of about 13 years. There is already a court case filed by certain employees, against providing reservations in promotions and the matter is *sub-judice*. As the directive has been issued only on 23 July, 1975, it would not be legally possible to provide reservations with retrospective effect.

The Committee are not satisfied with the reply of the Government that it would not be feasible to effect promotion with retrospective effect after a lapse of 13 years. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and desire that Air India should take some positive steps to remedy the injustice done to SC/ST employees. They further recommend that if need be the matter may be taken up with the Law Ministry for their opinion.

## **CHAPTER II**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT**

#### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 2, Para No. 2.10)**

The Committee regret to note that although the reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in posts were introduced in Air-India with effect from January 1, 1966 yet the principle of carry forward of unfilled reserved vacancies to subsequent recruitment years was introduced after more than two years in 1968 by the Corporation on the plea that in January 1966, it had not found it feasible to adopt the carry forward principle. In the Committee's opinion when a policy has been evolved and laid down after due consideration by the Government, the implementing authorities have no business to delay the implementation. It should have been the earnest endeavour of the Corporation to adopt the carry forward principle also with effect from the same day i.e. 1.1.1966. The Committee desire that proper steps should be taken to ensure that such things do not recur in future and hope that loss of posts for not carrying forward are made good.

#### **Reply of the Government**

According to the instructions contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs O.M. No. 6/1/63-SCT (1) dated March 4, 1964 the reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes were subject to availability of suitable candidates of the respective class, and in case of non-availability of such suitable candidates for any reserved post, such post could be treated as unreserved. It was, as such, not mandatory to carry forward the reserved vacancies not filled by candidates belonging to reserved vacancies not filled by candidates belonging to SC/ST. However, adequate steps have already been taken by the Government by issuing a formal directive to Air-India making it mandatory for Air-India to implement the instructions in regard to reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Corporation has also been making concerted efforts to improve the intake of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and it is as a result of these concerted efforts that the number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe

employees in the Corporation as on 1.1.1987, has reached a very satisfactory level. Out of the total number of 16,164 employees as on 1.1.1987, the number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees is 3993, constituting a percentage of 24.7, which is higher than the prescribed percentage.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 5, Para No. 2.20)**

The Committee are surprised that Liaison Officer in the Ministry of Civil Aviation has not visited the Head Office of Air-India for the last two years. This shows that neither the Ministry nor its Liaison Officer attach the importance and urgency to the implementation of the reservation policy that it deserves more so when the visit of the Under Secretary in-charge of SC/ST Cell to Northern India Regional Office of Air-India brought to light a number of irregularities.

**Reply of the Government**

The representative of the Ministry has since inspected the Head Office and Headquarters of all the departments of Air-India in July 1987.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 6, Para No. 2.21)**

Keeping in view the fact that the Liaison Officer has to monitor the reservations in all the departments of the Ministry and the organisations and undertaking thereunder, the Committee recommend that he should visit the Head Office as well as Regional Offices of Air-India at least once a year if not more to ensure that reservation orders are implemented meticulously in letter and spirit.

**Reply of the Government**

The representative of the Ministry has since inspected the Head Office and Headquarters of all other departments of Air-India in Bombay as well as regional offices—Northern India, Southern India, Western India and Eastern India. Inspections of Head Office, Headquarters Offices of all

Departments at Bombay and regional office of All India as well as other Public Sector Undertakings under the Ministry will be conducted regularly.

Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87, SCT dated 4th April, 1988]

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 7, Para No. 2.22)**

The Committee firmly believe that appointing a Liaison Officer is not enough. What is needed is concerted action on the part of the Liaison Officer to ensure due compliance by the appointing authorities of the orders and instructions pertaining to the reservations in favour of SC/ST and other concessions/relaxations admissible to them.

**Reply of the Government:**

The Ministry has noted the observations of the Committee. The Liaison Officer is not only inspecting the Offices but also issuing reports pointing out the shortcomings and drawbacks, if any. Based on this, general guidelines are issued to all organisations/offices coming under the control of the Ministry.

Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87, SCT dated 4th April, 1988]

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 9, Para No. 3.7)**

The Committee note that while making recruitment at Delhi, Bombay, Calcutta and Madras to Group 'C' and 'D' posts from amongst the candidates belonging to local area or regions, the percentages of reservations for SC/ST fixed for those areas are adhered to yet this is not the case in case of recruitments in these categories made at Jalandhar and Trivandrum. In the Committee's opinion this anomaly might have deprived a number of SC/ST candidates employment at the recruitments at Jalandhar and Trivandrum and is a serious lapse on the part of Air-India.

**Reply of the Government**

The matter has been examined in greater depth and it has been found that there has been very meagre recruitment in local offices in various states during the last 13 years i.e. from October 1973 till 1.1.1987 and all reserved vacancies have been filled up by candidates from reserved communities except one vacancy in Kerala, which was reserved for Scheduled Tribe. It will be ensured that in future recruitments, every effort is made to appoint

one ST candidate to make up this shortfall. It is further clarified that there has been no recruitment at Jalandhar but the recruitment was made in Amritsar in Punjab, where out of 3 appointments made, one was reserved for SC, against which a SC candidate was appointed and thus a general candidate was not appointed against this reserved vacancy.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 10, Para No. 3.8)**

The Committee recommend that Ministry of Civil Aviation should look into the matter in depth and find out whether any injustice had been done to SC/ST candidates. In case it comes to their knowledge that some injustice has been done to SC/ST candidates, they should take steps to redress it in future recruitments.

**Reply of the Government**

The Ministry has conducted a detailed examination of the case and has found that the position as stated by Air-India in reply to para 3.7 is correct and they have issued necessary instructions to the Manager-Trivandrum, to recruit one additional ST as and when the next vacancy in Group 'C' or 'D' post, is available.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 11, Para No. 3.9)**

The Committee further recommend that orders relating to percentages fixed for SC and ST for Group C and D posts to be filled on regional basis are followed meticulously.

**Reply of the Government**

Instructions have been issued to all recruiting authorities to follow meticulously, the orders relating to percentage fixed for SC and ST in Group C and D posts and maintain a statewide list.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 12, Para No. 3.10)**

The Committee regret that the appointing authorities in Air-India do not indicate the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates to the Employment Exchanges to enable them to sponsor right type of candidates in subsequent recruitments even though there are specific instructions to that effect contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs O.M. No. 14/12/67-Estt (D) dated 10 April, 1968.

**Reply of the Government**

Instructions have been issued to all recruiting authorities that instead of general remarks viz, "not suitable", more specific reasons for non-selection of SC/ST candidates should be indicated in the requisition which is returned to the Employment Exchange. The specific reasons should state clearly that the candidate failed in the written test or trade test or failed in the interview. Those candidates who qualify in the written test but fail in the interview, the reason of his/her failure in the interview should be indicated such as "poor performance, poor expression, general knowledge poor, poor turn-out, poor-communication, etc .."

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 13, Para No. 3.11)**

However, the Committee have been assured by the representative of Air-India that in future the concerned authorities will strictly adhere to the aforesaid instructions and invariably convey to Employment Exchanges the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates so as to enable them to sponsor for subsequent vacancies right type of candidates from these communities. The Committee hope that the Air-India authorities will keep their promise.

**Reply of the Government**

It will be ensured by Air-India that instructions issued in this regard will be strictly adhered to, in future, by all appointing authorities.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April. 1978]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 14, Para No. 3.12)**

The Committee further recommend that the Ministry of Civil Aviation issue, if not already done, the necessary instructions to all the Public

Undertakings including Air India under their control, so that whenever the appointing authorities reject the SC/ST candidates they should communicate reasons for rejection of these candidates to the Employment Exchanges so that the latter may sponsor for subsequent vacancies the right type of SC/ST candidates.

### Reply of the Government

Such instructions have been issued to

[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated 4th April, 1988]

### Recommendation (SI. No. 15, Para No. 3.13)

The Committee note that Air India is associating one officer belonging to SC or ST in the Recruitment Boards and Departmental Promotion Committees irrespective of the fact whether they are interviewing Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe or General candidates are so as to ensure that Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are judged with relaxed standards and not with the standards by which the general candidates are judged. The Committee also note that in case Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe Officer of appropriate status is not available with Air-India, they requisition the services of SC/ST Officer of comparable status from some Government Department or some Public Undertaking.

### Reply of the Government

It has been confirmed by Air India that instructions have been issued reiterating that while constituting a Selection Panel, whether for promotion or recruitment, one of the members would invariably belong to SC/ST Community. They have been further advised that while nominating an SC/ST Officer on the Selection Board/Promotion Committee, it may kindly be ensured that the Officer is of appropriate status and background, keeping in view the nature of the post (s) for which recruitment is being made.

[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated 4th April, 1988]

### Recommendation (SI. No. 16, Para No. 3.19)

The Committee trust that they will continue to adhere to this practice in future also to safeguard the interests of SC/ST candidates.

### **Reply of the Government**

It has been confirmed by Air-India that it will continue its practice of nominating SC/ST Officer on Recruitment/Promotion Committees.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 17, Para No. 3.27)**

The Committee regret that the concessions and relaxations available to Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are not notified in the Recruitment Advertisements issued by the Air-India. They recommend that the concessions and relaxations should invariably form part of the advertisements. It should also be made clear in the advertisements that "if adequate number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates who satisfy the minimum standard are not available to fill reserved vacancies, then SC/ST candidates may be selected to the extent of shortfall in vacancies by relaxing minimum standard provided they are not considered unfit to hold the post" as provided in the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension O.M. No. 36011/8/84-Estt (SCT) dated 17th October, 1986. Such an advertisement will enable the candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes who do not strictly fulfil the educational standards to apply and facilitate the filling up of reserved posts.

### **Reply of the Government**

Instructions have been issued by Air-India to all recruiting authorities that the concessions and relaxations, both general as well as specific relaxations available to SC and ST candidates, should invariably be indicated in the advertisements. These recruiting authorities have also been instructed to ensure that the following clause is inserted in all advertisements/Employment Notices, released for recruitment of candidates from outside or within the Organisation for direct recruitment :

"If adequate number of SC/ST candidates who satisfy the minimum standard are not available to fill up the reserved vacancies, then SC/ST candidates may be selected to the extent of shortfall in vacancies by relaxing minimum standard provided they are not considered unfit to hold the post.



It may be stated here that the instructions as contained in O.M. No. 36011/8/84-Estt. (SCT) dated October 17, 1986, issued from the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions, envisage that educational qualifications prescribed for the recruitment, shall uniformly apply to all candidates including SC/ST candidates. As such, it will not be possible to consider those candidates who do not strictly fulfil the educational qualifications.

[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 20, Para No. 3.36)**

The Committee feel perturbed that there is shortfall of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in promotions even in the lower categories of posts like Peon, Head Cleaner, Sweeper, Gardener, besides the shortfall of SC/ST in Clerical posts like Senior Clerk, Office Assistant, Stenographer etc.

**Reply of the Government**

The percentage of SC/ST put together is much above the required percentage in the categories of Peons, Cleaners, Gardeners, Loaders, Sr. Loaders, Sr. Gardeners, Head Chowkidars, Head Guards, etc., as indicated below :—

	Total No. of employees	SC/ST among them	
		No.	%
(1) Peons, Cleaners, Gardeners, etc.	2201	745	33.85
(2) Sr. Peon, Sr. Loader, Sr. Cleaner, etc.	852	387	45.42
(3) Head Cleaner, Head Loader, Head Security Guard, etc.	506	257	50.79

In other categories also, the percentage of SC/ST employees is progressively improving. Air-India has taken necessary steps of applying relaxed standards for SC/ST candidates and has also introduced a scheme of pre-employment training in categories like Stenographers, Typist Clerks, Clerks, etc. The percentage of SC/ST amongst the Typist Clerks, and

Clerks is 22.89. As and when these persons complete the required number of years of service, they will be considered for promotion to the senior grades, subject to availability of vacancies. In the case of Office Assistants also, the existing percentage of SC/ST is 19.40%. With regard to intake of Scheduled Tribes, Air-India is finding it difficult to get adequate number of Scheduled Tribe candidates. In order to locate Scheduled Tribe candidates, Air-India has been sending Selection Teams to tribal areas, and will make efforts to send such teams on regular basis.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 21, Para No. 3.37)**

The Committee recommend that earnest efforts should be made to fill all the vacancies reserved for SC/ST in promotion. In case candidates from the SC community for which the vacancies are reserved are not available, the vacancies may be filled by the candidates from the ST Community after carrying forward the vacancies for three recruitment years and vice-versa.

**Reply of the Government**

Instructions have been issued by Air-India to all appointing authorities that concerted efforts should be made to fill all the vacancies reserved for SC/ST in promotions by candidates from such communities. In respect of the promotions which are effected on the criteria of seniority subject to rejection of unfit, if candidates from SC Community for which the vacancies are reserved, are not available, the vacancies may be filled by candidates from ST Community, after carrying forward the vacancies for 3 recruitment years and vice-versa.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 22, Para No. 3.38)**

The Committee also recommend that if the existing SC/ST Employees are not suitable for promotion to the posts of Stenographers, Senior Clerks, Office Assistants, the in-service training should be arranged for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to make them proficient and fit for promotion to these categories of posts.

### **Reply of the Government**

Air-India has advised all Departments to give their personal attention to the development of SC/ST employees by providing in-house/in-service/outside training to all SC/ST employees so as to improve their capabilities for shouldering higher responsibilities. Air-India has also instituted a system of monitoring the training of SC/ST employees through a half-yearly report.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 23, Para No. 3.44)**

The Committee note that a number of irregularities in the maintenance of Rosters have been pointed out by the Liaison Officer of the Ministry during his inspections of Rosters in 1983, 1984 and 1985. This only shows that proper care is not taken by the authorities in the maintenance of Rosters.

### **Reply of the Government**

Air-India has issued instructions to all Departments to ensure that rosters in respect of appointments, both by direct recruitment as well as by promotion, are maintained meticulously as per instructions contained in the Brochure on Reservation for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. It has also been pointed out that irregularity, if any, found in the rosters will be viewed seriously.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Comments of the Committee**

Air India has issued instructions to all their Department to ensure that rosters in respect of appointments, both by direct recruitment as well as by promotion, are maintained meticulously as per instructions contained in the Brochure on Reservation for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. It has also been pointed out that irregularity, if any, found in the rosters will be viewed seriously.

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 24, Para No. 3.45)**

The Committee need hardly emphasis that the Roster is an important mechanism to keep a legitimate watch on the proper and adequate intake of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe persons in services and that it would cease to have any significance, whatsoever, if it is not maintained properly in the light of existing rules, regulations and instructions.

#### **Reply of the Government**

The point brought out in this recommendation has already been covered in the reply furnished to Recommendation at Sr. No. 23 (Para No. 3.44).

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

#### **Comments of the Committee**

Air India has issued instructions to all their Departments to ensure that rosters in respect of appointments, both by direct recruitment as well as by promotion, are maintained meticulously as per instructions contained in the Brochure on Reservation for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. It has also been pointed out that irregularity, if any, found in the rosters will be viewed seriously.

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 25, Para No. 3.46)**

The Committee recommend that henceforth earnest efforts be made both by the appointing authorities and the Liaison Officer in the Ministry to see that the Government Orders on the maintenance of rosters are meticulously followed so that no injustice is done to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe persons in the matter of recruitment and promotion.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Air-India has issued necessary instructions to all Departments to ensure that rosters in respect of appointments, both by Direct Recruitment as well as by Promotion, are maintained meticulously as per the instructions contained in the Brochure on Reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. It has been also pointed out that irregularity, if any, found in the roster will be viewed seriously. Periodic inspection will also be carried out by the Liaison Officer of Air-India to ensure that the Departments maintain rosters in accordance with the laid down instructions of the Government.

Periodic inspections will also be carried out by the Liaison Officer of the Ministry to ensure that rosters are maintained by the Recruiting Authorities, strictly as per the instructions of the Government.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 27, Para No. 3.48)**

The Committee also recommend that the Liaison Officer should invariably submit his inspection report to the managing Director, Air-India for his information and necessary corrective action so that the deficiencies detected are brought to notice of all concerned and prompt action is taken to remedy the situation.

**Reply of the Government**

The recommendations of the Committee have been taken note of and it will be ensured that the Inspection Report of the Liaison Officer is submitted to the Managing Director of Air-India, for information and necessary corrective action.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M.No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 28, Para No. 3.49)**

The Committee note that Air-India maintains 40 point roster for direct recruitment made on all-India basis and 100 point Roster for direct recruitment made on Regional basis. For promotions made by selection, a 40-point Roster is maintained as per Government order on the subject.

**Reply of the Government**

Air-India maintains a 40 Point Roster for direct recruitment made on All India basis and for all promotions, and 100 Point Roster for direct recruitment made on regional basis.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M.No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 29, Para No. 3.50)**

The Committee have however, been informed that for posts filled on head-office basis, rosters maintained on head office basis, for posts filled

on regional basis the position is region-wise. However, this has not been done in all cases.

### **Reply of the Government**

Air-India is maintaining rosters on the head office basis for the posts filled up at the head office, and on the regional basis for the posts filled at the regional offices. Instructions have been issued by Air-India reiterating that statewise 100 Point Roster is required to be maintained for each state separately, for all appointments made by Direct Recruitment for Group 'C' and 'D' posts by attracting candidates from the locality and/or the region.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M.No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 30, Para No. 3.51)**

The Committee urge that the instructions regarding the maintenance of Rosters for posts filled on regional basis should be followed strictly in each case.

### **Reply of the Government**

Instructions have since been issued by Air-India to all the Departments to maintain strictly 100 Point Rosters for all recruitment made on local and regional basis for Group 'C' and 'D' posts, with effect from 1.1.1987.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 31, Para No. 3.58)**

The Committee regret to note that a large number of vacancies in 1983, 1984, 1985 and 1986 both in direct recruitment and promotions reserved for SC/ST candidates have been dereserved and a number of reserved vacancies have been allowed to lapse by Air-India.

### **Reply of the Government**

The de-reservation of vacancies had to be resorted to because of non-availability of suitable SC/ST candidates inspite of making all possible efforts, viz. wide publicity of vacancies, applying relaxed standards of

suitability, and granting of other concessions as admissible under the orders issued by the Government in this regard. In certain categories like Co-Pilots, Chartered Accountants, Stenographers, there is acute shortage of SC/ST candidates.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M.No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 32, Para No. 3.59)**

The Committee are not satisfied with the reasons given by Air-India that sufficient number of SC/ST candidates with requisite qualifications and experience have not been forthcoming in some of the categories even after applying relaxed standards of suitability. The Committee feel that now there is no dearth of educated SC/ST candidates. What is lacking is sincere and concerted efforts on the part of recruitment authorities to find out suitable SC/ST candidates before the expiry of three recruitment years. The Committee, therefore, recommend that dereservation of reserved vacancies should be resorted to only when it becomes inescapable after all possible efforts, including special recruitments, to locate and recruit adequate number of SC/ST candidates have failed.

**Reply of the Government**

Instructions have been issued by Air-India to all Departments to ensure that de-reservation of reserved vacancies is resorted to only when all possible efforts to recruit SC/ST candidates have failed.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M.No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 33, Para No. 4.10)**

The Committee note that total number of Scheduled Caste Schedule Tribe employees in Air-India which was 1238 (13.61%) and 101 (1.98%) respectively out of total employees in January 1975 has increased to 3184 Scheduled Castes (19.70%) and 809 Scheduled Tribes (5.00%) as on 1st January 1987. The Committee are, however, surprised to note that the percentage of Scheduled Caste employees in Class III has come down from 36.92% to 29.94% and in Class IV from 90.36% to 76.15%.

**Reply of the Government**

In Group D posts (Sweepers), the percentage has dropped from 90.36 to 76.15 because of the increase in the number of non-SC/ST sweepers from

8 as on 1.1.1975 to 29 as on 1.1.1987 in the total strength of 83 and 151 respectively.

In regard to Group C and D posts, the percentage has come down marginally because of the promotions of employees from Class III categories to Class II (Group B categories of posts).

However, the overall percentage of SC/ST in Group C and D posts is still much higher than the prescribed percentage.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

#### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 34. Para No. 4.11)**

The Committee are also unhappy to note that the percentage of Scheduled Tribes in all categories i.e. Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' is below the prescribed quota of reservations.

#### **Reply of the Government**

The percentage of SC and ST candidates as on 1.1.1987 in categories of Group B, C and D posts and the lowest rung of Group A posts, is given hereunder :

Group	Total	SC	SC%	ST	ST%	Total Percent of SC & ST
Group 'A' (Lowest Rung)	1582	244	15.42	78	4.93	20.35
Group 'B'	7602	1294	17.02	421	5.54	22.56
Group 'C'	1153	212	18.39	89	7.72	26.11
Group 'D' (Excluding Sweepers)	3559	1199	33.69	190	5.34	39.03
Group 'D' (Sweepers)	151	115	76.16	7	4.64	80.80

It will be seen from the above that the percentage of SC and ST put together is well within the prescribed percentage in Group B, C and D



posts. Even in the lowest rung of Group A posts, the percentage is about 20.35%, which is a little less than the prescribed percentage. This little shortfall is on account of non-availability of ST candidates, even on the basis of relaxed standards. While in Group 'C' posts, the number of ST employees is 7.72%, as against the reservation of 7.5%. In other groups, it is less only by 2 to 2.5%. In Group 'B' and 'D' posts, the shortfall in the number of ST candidates has been made up by higher intake of SC candidates, which is permissible under the Government instructions, as the backlog is carried forward only for three recruitment years and in the third recruitment year of the carry forward, in case the ST candidate is not available, it is required to be exchanged by an SC candidate. Accordingly, therefore, the percentage of SC and ST may kindly be seen together, for the purpose of judging the performance of the Corporation in this regard, and it will be found that the required percentage has been attained by the Corporation.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 35, Para No. 4. 12)**

The Committee recommend that a time-bound programme should be chalked out to wipe out the shortfalls in all categories of posts, at least upto the lowest rung of class I, by resorting to special recruitments exclusively for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes and giving them liberal concessions/relaxations while considering them for appointment.

**Reply of the Government**

Necessary instructions have been issued by the Ministry to Air-India to chalk out a time-bound programme to wipe out the shortfalls in all categories of posts, at least upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' by resorting to special recruitments, exclusively for SC/ST and giving them other liberal concessions/relaxations while considering them for appointment.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 36, Para No. 4.13)**

The Committee note that Air India has been sending teams of their officers to Tribal Areas and have met with some success in getting tribal candidates for lower posts from Himachal Pradesh. However from the

Northern-Eastern States they have been able to select 27 Scheduled Tribe candidates for Traffic Assistant cadre and 5 Scheduled Tribes for post of Telex Operators.

### **Reply of the Government**

Air-India has been sending teams of their officers to tribal areas to select ST candidates to fill the reserved vacancies. Air-India will continue to send such teams in future, also.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 37, Para No. 4. 14)**

The Committee feel that if more teams are sent at regular intervals to areas of tribal concentration especially to North Eastern States for recruitment of Scheduled Tribe candidates, the backlog of Scheduled Tribes can be wiped out to a great extent at an early date. The Committee will like to be kept apprised of the outcome of steps taken by Air India as suggested by them.

### **Reply of the Government**

The recommendations of the Committees of sending Selection Teams of Officers at regular intervals to areas of tribal concentration have been taken note of and will be complied with by Air-India. The Committee will also be kept apprised every year of the outcome of steps taken by Air-India, on the selection of ST candidates, by sending teams of officers at regular intervals to areas of tribal concentration.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 40, Para No. 5.4)**

The Committee note that a Special Cell has been set up in Air-India to look after the interests of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees. The Cell maintains Grievances Register.

### **Reply of the Government**

It is confirmed that a Special Cell has been set up in Air-India to look after the interests of the SC/ST employees and the Cell maintains a Grievance Register.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 41, Para No. 5.5)**

The Committee feel that more publicity among the SC/ST employees of Air-India may be given about the existence of the arrangements for redressal of their grievances so that they have no difficulty in approaching the right person at the right time for redressal of the grievances, if any.

**Reply of the Government**

As desired by the Committee, a Staff Notice has been issued by Air-India.. drawing the attention of all SC/ST employees about the existence of the Cell, its location and the concerned officers whom they may contact for any assistance, guidance, clarification/redressal of their grievances, if any.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 42, Para No. 5.6)**

The Committee recommend that prompt action should be taken on the representations and grievances of the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees whatever be the nature of the grievance to inculcate confidence and sense of security and well being among them.

**Reply of the Government**

Suitable instructions have been issued by Air-India to all departments to ensure speedy redressal of grievances of SC/ST employees.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 43, Para No. 5.10)**

The Committee have been informed that instructions were issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises for providing reservation in residential accommodation for SC/ST in June, 1974 and subsequently in April, 1981 and October, 1983. However, the reservations in residential accommodation was introduced by Air-India in 1985. The Committee are not convinced by the argument advanced by the Air-India authorities that the list for allotment in Bombay had been completed in 1958 and 1971 and for Delhi in 1973 in consultation with the representatives of the Management and Members of the Labour Relations Committee.

### **Reply of the Government**

It is a fact that Air-India implemented the orders regarding reservation in residential accommodation for SC/ST employees in 1985. It is regretted that the earlier instructions could not be implemented by Air-India for the reasons that the lists for allotment of residential accommodation had already been prepared and wait listed in 1958 and 1971 in Bombay, and in 1973 in Delhi. However, Air-India has since allotted residential accommodation to SC/ST employees and has fully made up the shortfall in this regard. In fact, as on date, the residential accommodation allotted to SC/ST employees is more than their reserved quota.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 44, Para No. 5.11)**

The Committee are of the firm view that when the instructions were issued in 1974 by the BPE, it was incumbent on the Air-India Authorities to revise their wait lists according to those instructions. It is really regrettable that the reservations was introduced in 1985 i.e. after a lapse of about 11 years. This the Committee cannot condone it. They expect that such lapses should not recur and if there is a backlog because of the delayed implementation of the BPE instructions, Air-India should make concerted efforts to clear it.

### **Reply of the Government**

As stated in reply to recommendation at Sr. No. 43 (Para No. 5.10), the reserved quota prescribed by the Government for allotment of residential accommodation has been fully met by Air-India and there is no shortfall in this regard.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 49, Para No. 5.28)**

The Committee are of the view that dismissal/termination in such cases may not meet the ends of justice in full. In their opinion, where it is proved that a person had given a false caste certificate, criminal proceedings should also be invariably launched against the culprit which will act a deterrent for the commission of such offences.

### **Reply of the Government**

Wherever the circumstances of the case justify, as per legal advice, criminal proceedings will be launched by Air-India, against an employee.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 50, Para No. 5.35)**

The Committee are surprised to note that out of 332 employees posted abroad by Air-India, only 17 belonged to Scheduled Castes. The Committee agree that in certain categories of posts, Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are not available for posting abroad, but they find from the information furnished that in categories like Flight Engineer, Accountant etc. where Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees are available, they have not been considered for posting abroad.

### **Reply of the Government**

The selection of Officers for foreign postings is made on the basis of seniority-cum-suitability. Therefore, the cases of only those SC/ST Officers can be considered for posting, who are senior enough, so as to come within the number of vacancies falling vacant at foreign stations in a particular cadre.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 51, Para No. 5.36)**

The Committee recommend that the claims of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees should be considered favourably at the time of making postings in foreign countries to give them a fair share in such postings and also to enable them to familiarise with the work culture of other countries. The Committee feel that a stay in a foreign country, however short, will by itself, be a very purposeful experience for the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees and will help them a lot in broadening their outlook and to enhance their efficiency which in the final analysis will be to the benefit of Air-India.

### **Reply of the Government**

Air-India has issued instructions all departments to apply the criteria of suitability sympathetically, to SC/ST employees, who by virtue of their seniority come within the list of eligible employees for foreign postings.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

## **CHAPTER III**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE GOVERNMENT REPLIES**

#### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 18, Para No. 3.34)**

The Committee are surprised to note that the Air-India introduced reservation in promotion for unskilled categories viz. Peons, Cleaners, Sweepers, Gardeners, Loaders etc. from April 1978, although in their earlier reply it has been stated that reservation in posts filled by promotion upto the lowest rung of Class I was introduced with effect from 23rd July 1975. The Committee regret the delay of about three years in introduction of reservation in promotions for unskilled categories. They strongly feel that as a result of delay of three years in enforcement of these orders the SC/ST employees have been deprived of the opportunity for three years to get promotional quota under these orders without any fault on their part.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Reservations in promotions up to the lowest rung of Group A i.e. including unskilled categories were introduced with effect from July 23, 1975, as per instructions contained in the Presidential Directive. However, there were hardly any promotional avenues available for unskilled categories. As mentioned in para 3.32 of the report of Committee, a promotion scheme for unskilled categories was introduced with effect from 1.4. 1978, in terms of an Understanding reached with the Air Corporations Employees Union. This scheme envisaged that there would be a senior category to the extent of 25% and a head category, to the extent of 10% in the unskilled group of employees and these promotions were effective from 1.4. 1978. Since the appointments under the scheme were effected only from 1.4.1978, the reservation which were already obtaining in the Corporation, from 23.7.1975, were made applicable to these appointments also. As such, there was no delay of 3 years in enforcing Reservation Orders in these promotions. The Reservation Orders as stated above, were applied as and when the appointments under this scheme for senior and head categories were made.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M.No.A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 3.35)**

The Committee desire that the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation look into the matter and fix responsibility for the serious lapse in applying these orders so late in Air-India. The Committee also urge the Ministry to devise ways and means to compensate the SC/ST employees who have suffered on account of the delayed implementation of reservation orders.

**Reply of the Government**

In view of the explanation given in reply to Recommendation at Sr. No. 18 (Para 3.34), it would not be possible to implement this suggestion.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 38, Para No. 4.19)**

The Committee are surprised to note that Air-India treat the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates as apprentices who are taken with relaxed standards and select them for employment only when they come up to the required standard.

**Reply of the Government**

As stated during the evidence, Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are assessed on the basis of relaxed standards of suitability and all those, who come up to the relaxed standards of suitability are appointed on regular basis, on probation, in the same manner as general candidates, who are selected on the basis of normal standards. However, in situations when adequate number of SC/ST candidates are not available even on the basis of relaxed standards, with a view to fill up the reserved vacancies to the maximum extent possible, we also select such of the candidates who have some potential and can be brought up at least to the level of relaxed standards of suitability, by giving them training in the areas of deficiency. In the normal course, had we not introduced this scheme, such of those candidates, who do not meet even the minimum relaxed standard, would have been rejected as unsuitable even on the basis of relaxed standards. It is in this context that the illustration was given that in the case of Typist/Clerks, the normal standards of suitability is 40 words per minute, whereas for SC/ST candidates, it is relaxed to 35 w.p.m. All those SC/ST candidates who come up to the relaxed standard of 35 w.p.m. are appointed on probation in the same manner as general candidates (who attain the

speed of 40 w.p.m.). However, if some reserved vacancies still remain unfilled and there are some SC/ST candidates who attain the speed between 30-35 w.p.m., they are selected for imparting training in typewriting and at the end of the training, are again subject to the proficiency test, in which if they come up to the relaxed standard of suitability they are selected for regular appointment on probation. The training period is initially for 3 months, but it is extended if the candidates still do not come up to the mark within the first three months and in some cases, has been extended upto 9 months. Incidentally, it may be mentioned that such candidates are also given a stipend during the training period.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 39, Para No. 4.20)**

In this connection the Committee draw the attention of the Air-India authorities to the provisions in Chapter VI of Brochure on Reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in posts/services under the Public Enterprises issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises, which read as follows :—

“SC/ST candidates promoted or initially appointed on the basis of recruitment through competitive examinations or otherwise by relaxed standards should be given extra training to enable them to come up to the standards of other candidates. In-service training should be provided by the appointing authorities within their own offices. Such candidates should on their appointment be placed on probation, and the rules/orders of the enterprise regarding probation will apply to them.”

The Committee recommend that as per aforesaid Government instructions the Air-India should appoint the SC/ST candidates who are selected with relaxed standards as probationers and not apprentices.

### **Reply of the Government**

As stated, in reply to the recommendation at Sr. No. 38. (Para No. 4.19), the SC/ST candidates who are selected on the basis of relaxed standards of suitability, are appointed on probation, and not as Apprentices. Thus Air-India has been complying with the requirements given in the Brochure.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*



## **CHAPTER IV**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION**

#### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 1, Para No. 1.6)**

The Committee regret to note that in the guidelines issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises relating to the appointment of Directors on the Board of Air-India, there is no stipulation for appointment of persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee are of the view that with the reservation policy being in force over a number of years, these classes have been denied the opportunity all these years and hope that the Government will take action to include at least one person belonging to SC/ST in the Board of Directors of Air-India.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Government have taken several steps to protect and promote the interests and welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Several High Powered Committees and Bodies such as the Committee headed by the Prime Minister, the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of SCs/STs, the Commissioner for Scheduled Castes & Scheduled Tribes, the National Commission for SCs & STs, the Department of Personnel as also the concerned Administrative Ministries oversee the implementation of Government Directives in regard to the provision for employment and promotional opportunities to the SCs & STs and promotion of their interests in various sectors of the Government including Central Public Enterprises. These Bodies, operating at the macro level, have greater powers as compared to the Board of Directors of an undertaking and can effectively take into account the requirements of sectorial imbalances and formulate appropriate policies for their corrections. The interests of SCs and STs in the services of Public Sector Undertakings or their economic development in general, can not be ensured by mandatorily including representation of SCs or STs at the Board level, whether on part time or

full time basis. The Policy of the Government, regarding the Board of Directors is to consider persons with proven record from Industry, Commerce, Admn., etc. so as to make the Board of Directors of Public Sector Undertakings managerially and professionally competent to guide the activities of the public enterprises. Within the existing policy, the Govt. can always consider the claims of suitable persons belonging to SCs and STs for part time/full time Directors in the Public Enterprises without taking recourse to formal or informal reservation.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

### **Comments of the Committee**

Please see Chapter I para 1.2

### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 2.11)**

The Committee cannot but express their anguish that the formal directives regarding reservations in recruitment and promotions for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in services received from the Bureau of Public Enterprises on May 10, 1974, were communicated to the Corporation by the Ministry on July 23, 1975 after a lapse of 14 months with the result that the employees belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes were denied their due promotions for more than a year. Had the Ministry been prompt in conveying the directives to the Corporation promptly, such injustice to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees could have been averted. The Committee expect the Ministry to be more careful in such matters in future and also expect the Corporation to effect promotion with retrospective effect to remedy the injustice.

### **Reply of the Government**

Bureau of Public Enterprises directives dated 10.5.1974 were received in this Ministry on 17.5.1974 and issued to Air-India on 4.6.1974. Air-India and Indian Airlines expressed their difficulties in implementing the policy regarding reservations particularly with reference to promotion vacancies. To sort out this problem a meeting with the BPE was held on 11.11.1974. For issue of formal directive to these two Corporations, the matter was referred to Ministry of Law on 4.1.1975 and after obtaining their view on 6.2.1975 a meeting was held with the Minister on 4.3.1975.

On the basis on the meeting held on 4.3.1975, Air-India and Indian Airlines had submitted their proposal in June 1975 and finally the formal Presidential Directives for reservation for SCs & STs in appointment in

Public Enterprises were issued to Air-India and Indian Airlines under article 34(1) of the Air Corporation Act, 1953 (27 of 1953) on 23.7.1975.

It would not be feasible to effect promotions with retrospective effect after a lapse of about 13 years. There is already a Court case filed by certain employees, against providing reservations in promotions and the matter is subjudice. Since the directive has been issued only from 23.7.1975, it would not be legally possible to provide reservations with retrospective effect.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

#### **Comments of the Committee**

**Please see Chapter 1, para 1.4**

## **CHAPTER V**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS ON WHICH FINAL REPLIES OF GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN RECEIVED**

#### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 4, Para No. 2.12)**

In regard to the monitoring of the implementation of the Directives regarding reservations, the Committee are not convinced by the argument of the Civil Aviation Secretary that "It is the management of the organisation which should ensure that the Directive is implemented", In the opinion of the Committee this amounts to the Ministry washing of their hands of all responsibility about implementation of the Government Directive to the Corporation. The Committee feel that primarily it is the duty of the nodal Ministry to ensure that any such directives are implemented in letter and spirit and for that purpose they should get the necessary feed back or returns from organisations or bodies under their control. The Committee recommend that the Ministry should strengthen its machinery to monitor the implementation of the reservation directives so that the desired benefit goes to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe persons in matters of recruitment and promotions in the Corporation.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Periodical Reports on implementation of reservation orders are already being called for from organisations and bodies under the control of this Ministry. Through the media of these periodical reports as well as by conducting on-the-spot inspections, the quality of check on the implementation of reservation orders will improve. As regards augmentation of the staff strength of the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe Cell in the Ministry, the same is separately under consideration.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

#### **Comments of the Committee**

The Committee may be intimated about the augmentation of the staff strength of the SC & ST Cell in the Ministry.

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 8, Para No. 2.23)**

The Committee have been informed by the Civil Aviation Secretary that the SC/ST Cell attached to Liaison Officer at present is manned by an Under Secretary, one Desk Officer and one Assistant. Further that this Cell has been entrusted with the responsibility of overseeing the implementation of reservations in all the Departments and offices and Undertakings under the Ministry. Seeing the enormity of the work, the Committee recommend that the staff strength of the Cell should be suitably augmented by appointing more staff who are well conversant with the orders/instructions relating to reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes so that the interests of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are properly looked after.

**Reply of the Government**

Augmentation of the staff strength in the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe Cell of the Ministry is separately under consideration.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

**Comments of the Committee**

The Committee would like to be apprised of the final decision taken to augment the staff strength of the SC/ST Cell.

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 26, Para No. 3.47)**

The Committee regret that as pointed out by the Liaison Officer in his inspection report, certain posts were de-reserved without proper authorisation. They take strong exception to this and expect that in future no post be dereserved in contravention of the directions issued in this regard. Meanwhile responsibility should be fixed in earlier cases of dereservation without prior authorisation.

**Reply of the Government**

All cases of dereservation of vacancies have since been regularised by obtaining post-facto approval from the Managing Director and have been duly ratified by the Air-India Board, except two cases of dereservation which are under process. Instructions have since been issued by Air-India to all

the Departments to ensure that prior approval of the Competant Authority is invariably obtained for de-reservation of vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes before a general candidate is appointed against such vacancies.

The matter regarding fixing of responsibility in earlier cases of appointment of general candidates against reserved vacancies without prior authorisation is under process.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT  
dated 4th April, 1988]*

#### **Comments of the Committee**

The Committee would like to be apprised of the final action taken in the matter.

#### **Recommendation (Sl. No. 45, Para No. 5.24)**

Out of 24 cases of alleged false certificates, the Committee have been informed that in 6 cases only the caste certificates have been found to be correct. In 3 cases investigations are under progress. Out of the remaining 15 cases, services of 6 employees have either been terminated or they themselves resigned or left the service during investigation. Of the remaining 9, it has been proved in six cases that bogus certificates were produced and departmental proceedings were underway; one person has been reverted to his substantive post as he had been recruited as general candidate but had got the promotion on the basis of a false caste certificate and in 2 cases it was found that the employees were not belonging to SC/ST community and they were awarded punishment as per rules and since they were selected and appointed on standards applicable to general categories they have been placed in that category.

#### **Reply of the Government**

The factual position, as stated in the above recommendation is confirmed.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]*

#### **Comments of the Committee**

The Committee will await the changes made in the Air India Employees' Service Regulations.

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 46, Para No. 5.25)**

The Committee are of the view that procedure for investigating the veracity or otherwise of alleged cases of false certificate is too cumbersome and involves inordinate delays. They expect Air India Authorities to streamline the procedure so the such cases are investigated promptly and the delays curtailed.

**Reply of the Government**

In cases, where, after submitting a caste-status certificate from the prescribed authority, a complaint is received or a doubt arises, regarding its veracity, verification is carried out through the Government Authorities, about the correctness of the Certificate submitted by the employees. The Government authorities take quite a long time to carry out the investigations and to send to Air India, their findings. As far as Air India is concerned, it continues to follow up the cases vigorously and even go to the extent of sending its Officers, to personally approach the concerned authorities, for expediting their investigations. On receiving the findings from the Government Authorities, in cases of false certificates, it initiates disciplinary action in terms of Air India Employees' Service Regulations and after giving the employee a personal hearing and based on the Enquiry Committee's findings, disciplinary action is taken. Air India will ensure that the enquiry proceedings are completed expeditiously and the services of those who submit false certificates are dispensed with. Air India has decided to amend the Air India Employees' Service Regulations with a view to enable the appropriate Disciplinary Authorities to dismiss, without holding departmental enquiry, an employee who is appointed against the reserved vacancy on the basis of a certificate of caste/status, which is found to be false. The amendment to Air India Employees, Service Regulations is under process by Air India. Such a step would result in expeditious disposal of the cases.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]*

**Comments of the Committee**

The Committee will await the changes made in the Air India Employees, Service Regulations.

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 47, Para No. 5.26)**

During the evidence before the Committee, the representatives of the Air India has categorically assured them that once it is proved on the basis of investigations that a person has given a false caste certificate he shall be dismissed forthright. The Committee hope that this procedure will be adopted in the six cases where departmental enquiry has been instituted after the investigations revealed that the Community Certificates submitted by the persons concerned were false.

**Reply of the Government**

The present position of the 6 cases where investigations revealed that Community Certificate submitted by them was false, is as under :

Employee removed from the services of the Corporation 1

Employee on completion of the enquiry proceedings, submitted his resignation, which was accepted. 1

Departmental enquiry completed. Removal Orders were passed by the Competent Authority. However, before the notice could be served, the employee filed a Writ Petition in the court and the matter is sub-judice. 1

Enquiry completed, but the Government Authorities are reviewing the case, and accordingly, the matter has been referred back to the Government Authorities, for their final decision about the veracity of the certificate submitted by the employee. 1

Enquiry completed. However, in the meanwhile, the employee produced a High Court Judgement, where the caste of Halba Koshti is considered as Halba. The Government of Maharashtra has informed AI that the matter is pending for final decision in the Supreme Court. 1

Before any action could be taken, Writ Petition against Air India, in the Madras High Court has been filed, and the matter is sub-judice. 1

[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]



**Comments of the Committee**

"The Committee may be apprised of the final decision taken on the cases at S. No. (3 to 6)."

**Recommendation (Sl. No. 48, Para No. 5.27)**

In regard to Shri Nagarajan's case the Committee will like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.

**Reply of the Government**

Mr. Nagarajan's case was re-examined by Air India and a fresh charge-sheet was issued and the enquiry proceedings were underway. In the meantime, he filed a writ Petition to the High Court of Bombay, and has obtained a stay order to stall the enquiry proceedings. The matter is now sub-judice and after the final judgement from the Bombay High Court, appropriate action will be taken.

*[Ministry of Civil Aviation O.M. No. A. 14016/11/87-SCT dated  
4th April, 1988]*

**Comments of the Committee**

The Committee would like to be apprised of the final action taken in the matter.

## APPENDIX

(Vide Para 4 of the Introduction)

*Analysis of the Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations contained in the Twenty-ninth Report of the Committee.*

1. Total number of Recommendations	51
2. Recommendations which have* been accepted by Government (Vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 2, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 49, 50 and 51).	
Number	38
Percentage of Total	74.51%
3. Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's reply (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 18, 19, 38 and 39).	
Number	4
Percentage of Total	7.84%
4. Recommendations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 1 and 3)	
Number	2
Percentage of Total	3.92%
5. Recommendations in respect of which replies of Government have not been received (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 4, 8, 26, 45, 46, 47 and 48).	
Number	7
Percentage of Total	13.73%