

Monday, 5th September, 1921

THE
COUNCIL OF STATE DEBATES
(Official Report)

VOLUME II

SECOND SESSION

OF THE

COUNCIL OF STATE, 1921



SIMLA
SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT CENTRAL PRESS
1921

CONTENTS

	PAGE
THURSDAY, 1ST SEPTEMBER, 1921	1—4
Oath of Office.	
Motion for adjournment.	
Messages from the Governor General.	
Government Business for 5th, 6th and 19th September.	
SATURDAY, 3RD SEPTEMBER, 1921	5—15
Inauguration of the Second Session of the Council of State and Legislative Assembly.	
MONDAY, 5TH SEPTEMBER, 1921	17—110
Questions and Answers.	
Motion for Adjournment.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Address of Welcome to H. R. H. the Prince of Wales.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Welcome to Lord Reading on his assumption of Office.	
Message from Legislative Assembly.	
State of Affairs in Malabar.	
TUESDAY, 6TH SEPTEMBER, 1921	111—146
Questions and Answers.	
Motion for Adjournment.	
Members to frame Address to H. R. H. the Prince of Wales.	
Statement laid on Table.	
Code of Criminal Procedure (Amendment) Bill.	
Cattle-trespass (Amendment) Bill.	
Indian Factories (Amendment) Bill.	
Indian Electricity (Amendment) Bill.	
Government Business for 19th September, 1921.	
THURSDAY, 15TH SEPTEMBER, 1921	147—210
Questions and Answers.	
President's Address.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Religious and Moral Education.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Removal of Centralized System of Administration.	
Ruling out of order any Reference to Legislative Assembly.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Committee to Inquire into Grievances.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Application to Indian Students of the Cecil Rhodes Scholarships.	
SATURDAY, 17TH SEPTEMBER, 1921	211—238
Questions and Answers.	
Government Business for 19th September, 1921.	
Bills as passed laid on Table.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Cecil Rhodes Scholarships.	
Resolution <i>re</i> : Stoppage of Export of Wheat.	

COUNCIL OF STATE.

Monday, the 5th September, 1921.

The Council met in the Assembly Chamber at Eleven of the Clock. The Honourable the President was in the Chair.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

PERSONNEL OF GREAT INDIAN PENINSULA RAILWAY.

1. The HONOURABLE MR. G. S. KHAPARDE: With reference to the statement made by the Agent of the Great Indian Peninsula Railway before the Railway Committee at one of its sittings at Bombay in February, 1921, and reported in the *Times of India* of the 10th of that month that he had a certain proportion of Europeans, Anglo-Indians and Indians in certain grades, will the Government be pleased to state—

- (a) How many posts there are in the Great Indian Peninsula Railway in the Superior and Upper Subordinate grades in each of its departments?
- (b) What is the proportion of them reserved for Indians in each of the grades?
- (c) How many Indians are there at present employed in each of the grades?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: As regards (a) and (c) of the Question, a statement is placed on the table which gives the desired information. As regards (b), there is no proportion of the posts referred to reserved for Indians.

GREAT INDIAN PENINSULA RAILWAY.

Statement showing the number of posts and Indians employed in the Superior and Upper Subordinate grades in each of the Departments of the Great Indian Peninsula Railway.

Department.	SUPERIOR GRADES.		UPPER SUBORDINATES (RS. 250 AND OVER).	
	Sanctioned number of posts.	Indians.	Sanctioned number of posts.	Indians.
Agency	7	...	9	3
Audit	17	2	44	17
Cash	1	...	2	2

Department.	SUPERIOR GRADES.		UPPER SUBORDINATES (Rs. 250 AND OVER).	
	Sanctioned number of posts.	Indians.	Sanctioned number of posts.	Indians.
General and Ticket Printing	2	2
Medical ...	11	3	21	15
Stores ...	7	...	12	5
Engineering ...	76	4	154	53
Locomotive ...	34	...	537	17
Electrical Branch ...	6	...	25	15
Carriage and Wagon ...	9	...	57	15
Traffic (including Telegraph)...	48	4	281	32
Educational ...	3
Mohpani Colliery ...	3	...	9	1
Karagali Colliery ...	3	...	1	1
Total ...	225	13	1,154	178

HYDERABAD (SIND) CANTONMENT.

2. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (i) the class and number assigned to the Hyderabad (Sind) Cantonment in the All-India Cantonment List with respect to its financial position;
- (ii) the net revenue, expenditure and surplus, if any, of the said Cantonment during the last ten years;
- (iii) whether the Cantonment is self-supporting, or receives annual or periodical or lump-sum grants from the Government or any other source;
- (iv) (a) the amount of the annual or periodical or lump-sum grant, if any; and
(b) the object for which it is paid?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF: (i) Cantonments are not classified or numbered according to their financial position.

(ii) A statement giving the information required, for the period 1911-12 to 1920-21, is laid on the table of the House.

(iii) The Cantonment Fund has been self-supporting in eight out of the ten years.

(iv) (a) The information is contained in the statement which I am laying on the table of the House.

(b) The grants-in-aid were made in order to maintain the Fund in a solvent condition.

Years.	Opening balance.	Income from L.S.*	Grant-in-aid.	Total.	Expenditure.	Closing balance.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1911-12 ...	8,456	30,507	...	38,963	36,048	2,915
1912-13 ...	2,915	35,350	3,625	41,890	31,568	10,322
1913-14 ..	10,322	34,264	...	44,586	32,457	12,129
1914-15 ...	12,130	30,596	...	42,726	33,046	9,680
1915-16 ...	9,679	33,176	...	42,855	35,037	7,818
1916-17 ...	7,814	33,115	...	40,929	32,936	7,993
1917-18 ...	7,995	37,260	...	45,255	37,954	7,301
1918-19 ...	7,301	43,944	...	51,245	46,742	4,503
1919-20 ..	4,503	45,817	...	50,320	46,620	3,700
1920-21 ...	3,700	47,556	5,900	57,156	47,901	9,255

* L. S. = Local Sources.

SCHOOL IN HYDERABAD (SIND).

3. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether there is any primary or Anglo-Vernacular school for the children of the residents in the Hyderabad (Sind) Cantonment maintained entirely from the funds of the Cantonment or with the grant-in-aid of the Government;
- (b) whether any application has been made by the residents of the said Cantonment to the authorities concerned for the opening of such a school;
- (c) whether the application has been disposed of and in what manner;
- (d) if it is a fact that the above representation has been rejected on the ground of no funds?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF: (a) The answer is in the negative.

(b) Yes, but about eight years ago.

(c) and (d) The Cantonment Fund has not been, hitherto, in a position to meet the cost of opening and maintaining a school of the kind referred to. It has been necessary, therefore, to postpone the consideration of the question.

HOUSES AND POPULATION, WATER-SUPPLY, ETC., IN HYDERABAD (SIND).

4. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (i) (a) the number of houses and population in the limits of the Hyderabad (Sind) Cantonment ;
- (b) the arrangements for water-supply ;
- (c) the arrangement of drainage of superfluous water, and cleaning and disinfecting cess-pools ;
- (d) whether it is a fact that, owing to insufficiency of sewage carts and defective system of drainage, superfluous and filthy water is thrown over the streets causing foul smell and nuisance ?
- (ii) (a) whether the residents of the said Cantonment have made applications and personal representations to the authorities concerned for a better drainage arrangement ;
- (b) if so, what steps have been taken in the above matter ;
- (c) whether it is a fact that construction of drains cannot be taken up for want of funds ?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF : (i) (a) The number of houses in the Cantonment of Hyderabad (Sind), excluding Government buildings, is 962 ; the population, according to the census of 1921, was 7,892.

(b) Water is supplied to the Cantonment by the Municipality.

(c) Waste water is collected in cess-pools, the contents of which are removed in carts.

When malaria is prevalent, kerosine oil is poured over these cess-pools.

(d) No. Waste water is not allowed to be thrown on the streets.

(ii) (a) In 1914, the residents of the Cantonment asked for the introduction of a system of drainage, and in 1920 a deputation of the Sadar Bazar waited on the Officer Commanding with the same object.

(b) and (c) The project was dropped, as the estimated cost far exceeded the financial resources of the Cantonment Fund.

TAXES IN HYDERABAD (SIND).

5. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : (i) Are the Government aware that—

- (a) the Hyderabad (Sind) Cantonment imposes a number of taxes on its residents, such as, Water-tax, House-tax, Dog-tax, Vehicle-tax, Conservancy-tax, and other Licence-taxes, which either do not exist or are much less exacting in the Municipal limits alongside the said Cantonment ;
- (b) that the Water-tax is taken at a higher rate than that prevalent in the Municipal limits alongside the said Cantonment ?

(ii) Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (a) the number of residents in the said Cantonment other than the military and the average tax per head;
- (b) the average tax per head in the Municipal limits alongside the said Cantonment;
- (c) the populated area in the said Cantonment;
- (d) the populated area in the Municipal limits alongside it?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF: (i) (a) The Cantonment imposes the following taxes:—House-tax, Conservancy-tax, Licence-tax, Water-tax, and Wheel-tax; the Municipality imposes Terminal-tax, Tax on Animals and Vehicles, Water-tax, and Conservancy-tax.

The incidence of taxation per head of population for the year 1920-21 in the Municipal area is reported to be Rs. 5-11-9, and in the Cantonment area Rs. 4-12-11. The taxes levied in the Cantonment are, therefore, less exacting than those levied by the Municipality.

(b) It is not possible to compare the incidence of the water-rate in the Cantonment with the incidence in the Municipality, as the principle of assessment varies in the two localities. In the Municipality, the tax is based on the income of the residents, whereas in the Cantonment, it is based on the rental of each house.

(ii) (a) According to the census of 1921, the residents in the Cantonment numbered 3,915, and the incidence of taxation per head is, as already stated, Rs. 4-12-11.

(b) Rs. 5-11-9.

(c) and (d) Government have no information on the subject.

HEALTH AND HIGH PRICES IN HYDERABAD (SIND).

6. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (a) the distance of the Cantonment area from the centre of the city in military stations of the class to which Hyderabad (Sind) belongs;
- (b) whether they are aware that the congestion question in Hyderabad (Sind) is an acute problem endangering seriously the health of that city;
- (c) whether Government are aware of the repeated and urgent representations made by the people and the Municipality of that city to Civil and Military authorities that the Cantonment be removed from its position to a distance of not less than three miles from the centre of the city;
- (d) whether Government are aware that the delay in acceding to the wishes of the people in this matter has resulted in inflated high prices of land inflicting serious economic distress among the poor and middle classes of the city;
- (e) whether Government are aware that the Municipality of the city is prepared to make proposals which will not entail any financial sacrifice on the part of the Military Department;

- (f) whether Government will consider the feasibility of arranging a small conference of the Military Department, the representatives of Sind on the Assembly and the Council of State and the Local Municipality with a view to settle reasonable terms of transfer of Cantonment land, and to expedite the early disposal of this question?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF : (a) The distance separating the centres of cities from military cantonments varies in every case.

(b) The Government of India are aware that the city of Hyderabad (Sind) is seriously congested, with consequences that are detrimental to the public health.

(c) Yes—Amongst the various suggestions that have been made for the relief of the congestion is a proposal to remove the Cantonment from its present position.

(d) The Government are aware that the prices of building sites in and near the city have risen to a very high figure, but this is due partly to their natural advantages.

(e) and (f) The Government of India have recently directed that the question of the removal of the Cantonment to another site should be further examined by the local civil and military authorities concerned, and thereafter by the Government of Bombay in communication with the General Officer Commanding-in-Chief, Western Command. The Government of India have not yet had any final report regarding the result of these discussions.

They have, however, received a report from the General Officer Commanding-in-Chief, Western Command, which shows that there is no other site in the vicinity of Hyderabad which can be compared with the present site either in height, in freedom from mosquitoes or in space available for parade grounds.

In view of what has just been stated, the Government consider that the proposed conference would serve no useful purpose.

KHOREAL SHOOTING CASE.

7. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (a) Whether the attention of Government has been drawn to the comments of the *Pioneer* in a leading article in its issue of the 2nd July on what is known as the Khoreal Shooting Case?
- (b) Whether Government contemplate modifying the special legal procedure adopted in cases of the trial of European British subjects?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK : (a) The Government of India have seen the article referred to.

(b) The question is under consideration and a fuller statement as to the intentions of Government will be made later.

COTTON COMMITTEE.

8. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : (a) Will the Government be pleased to state what action, if any, has been or is proposed to be taken in connection with the Report of the Cotton Committee?

(b) With reference to the Government of India Resolution No. 404-22, dated 31st March, 1921, will the Government be pleased to state why no representation is given to any cotton-growing tracts in India on the Indian Central Cotton Committee?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : (a) The attention of the Honourable Member is invited to the reply* given to the Honourable Sardar Jogendra Singh's Question in the Council of State on the 28th February 1921. The reply then given explains the action taken or proposed to be taken by the Government of India on the recommendations contained in the report of the Indian Cotton Committee. The Central Cotton Committee, the formation of which was then under consideration, has since been constituted, and held its first meeting at Bombay on the 20th-22nd July 1921. Recommendations Nos. 10-17 in Chapter XVI of the Indian Cotton Committee's Report regarding the licensing of gins and presses and the restriction of transport of cotton-waste and loose *kaps* to check fraudulent mixing were referred to the Central Cotton Committee for their opinion and advice with a view to the introduction of legislation, if necessary. The views of that Committee have been received and are under consideration. As regards the establishment of cotton markets, the recommendation contained in paragraph 205 of the Cotton Committee's Report has been commended to Local Governments and Administrations who have been asked to give the matter their careful attention and to take necessary steps to give effect to the Committee's proposal, with the aid, where necessary, of local legislation. In connection with the above, the attention of the Local Governments has also been drawn to the Committee's recommendation contained in paragraph 212 of their Report regarding the standardisation of weights, and it has been suggested to them that in any local legislation for the establishment of cotton markets on the Berar system power should be taken to prescribe standard weights for use in those markets.

The question of the improvement of cotton forecasts is under the consideration of the Government of India along with the improvement of crop forecasts generally, and it is hoped that it will be possible to issue orders on the subject shortly. In the Reply to the Honourable Sardar Jogendra Singh it was stated that it had been decided not to impose a cotton cess to provide funds for the Central Cotton Committee and the pay of additional staff. The Central Cotton Committee have urged the reconsideration of this decision and the matter is under consideration.

(b) So far from no representation being given to any cotton-growing tracts the constitution of the Committee has been drawn up so as to give special representation to all the principal areas where cotton is grown.

The HONOURABLE MR. LALUBHAI SAMALDAS : May I ask a Supplementary Question, Sir? How is the representation given?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : The Local Governments have been asked to recommend, in conjunction with the various bodies interested in cotton, and the Government of India have appointed a few, but I think the main recommendations came from the Local Governments, and they have been accepted. Later on, a representation has been made by the Bombay Indian Chamber of Commerce that it would be desirable to represent the Indian mercantile interests in Bombay and their request has been complied with.

* Vide p. 277 of Vol. I of Council of State's Debates.

SALARIES OF IMPERIAL SERVICES IN INDIA.

9. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state whether they propose to sanction further increase in the salaries of the Imperial Services in India?

(b) If so, to what Services, and what will be the total recurring cost per annum, and how are they going to meet this charge?

(c) Do they intend to have recourse to further taxation?

The HONOURABLE MR. E. M. COOK: (a) The Honourable Member has doubtless seen the Resolutions of the Government of India No. D.-449, in the Home Department, dated the 16th July 1921, and No. 1559-E.A., in the Finance Department, dated the 16th August 1921, which contain the decisions of the Secretary of State on the memorials of the Imperial Services as regards their pay. Government have no further proposals for any general increase under consideration.

(b) and (c) Only a very small portion of the cost of the increase sanctioned in the Resolutions referred to will fall on Central revenues, and it will not of course be sufficient to involve taxation.

MR. HAMID ULLAH KHAN, POST MASTER, FERROZPORE (PUNJAB).

10. The HONOURABLE MR. G. S. KHAPARDE: (a) Has the Government received a memorial submitted on 23rd April 1921, under Darva Ganj, Delhi, registered letter No. 627, dated 23rd April 1921, by Mr. Hamid Ullah Khan, late Post Master, Ferozenore (Punjab), addressed to His Excellency the Viceroy and Governor General of India regarding acceptance of his resignation?

(b) If the answer to (a) above be in the affirmative, is the acceptance of the resignation, tendered by Mr. Hamid Ullah Khan as a protest, contrary to paragraph 4 of rule 539 of the Post Office Manual, Volume II?

(c) If so, will the Government be pleased to state what action it proposes to take in the matter, and how the period of unemployment is going to be treated?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA: (a) The memorial referred to has not been received either by His Excellency the Viceroy or by the Government of India. It was submitted by the petitioner through the Postmaster General, Punjab and North-West Frontier. When it reached the Director General of Posts and Telegraphs, that officer decided that the resignation tendered by Mr. Hamid Ullah Khan should be cancelled. Necessary orders are being issued by the Postmaster General, Punjab and North-West Frontier Circle.

(b) The rule quoted by the Honourable Member does not apply to this case. That rule contemplates the case of a man permitted to resign his appointment instead of being otherwise punished.

(c) The period of unemployment will be treated as leave without allowances.

TRANSFER OF ADEN FROM THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

11. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state whether it is under contemplation to transfer the administration of Aden from the Government of India to the Colonial Office?

(b) Have they received any representation from the residents of Aden against this proposal?

(c) If there is any such proposal, what are the reasons on which it is based?

The HONOURABLE MR. DENYS BRAY: (a) and (c) I would refer the Honourable Member to the Answer given by me in the Council of State on the 26th March 1921 to a Question on this subject asked by the Honourable Mr. Bhurgri. The transfer of the administration of the Aden Settlement to the Colonial Office is still under consideration.

(b) Yes.

TRANSFER OF U. P. CAPITAL FROM ALLAHABAD TO LUCKNOW.

12. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA: (a) Is the Government of India aware that the United Provinces Government propose to transfer the Capital from Allahabad to Lucknow?

(b) Is it aware of the public agitation in the Agra Province about this transfer?

(c) Is it possible for any Local Government to transfer its Capital from one place to another without the previous sanction of the Government of India and the Secretary of State?

(d) Does the Government of India propose to ask the United Provinces Government to postpone this proposal and not transfer any portion of the Secretariat to Lucknow till the whole question is properly considered and decided?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: (a) No.

(b) The Government of India are aware that allegations have been made regarding the intentions of the Local Government and that these have given rise to public agitation.

(c) The question has not yet definitely arisen. If it becomes necessary to decide it the orders of the Governor General in Council will be taken under Devolution Rule 4.

(d) The Government of India have called for a report from the Local Government on the subject.

FOREST RESEARCH INSTITUTE, DEHRA DUN.

13. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA: (a) Will the Government be pleased to place on the table a statement showing how temporary vacancies occasioned by the absence on leave or otherwise of Research Officers at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, have been filled during the last five years, stating the qualifications for special research of the temporary incumbents?

(b) Is it a fact that in the past these vacancies have been filled by officers without any regard to the technical qualifications for the special branch of research of which they were placed in charge, e.g., an officer whose duties are more or less clerical being made to officiate as Forest Zoologist, and also officers holding no special qualifications for chemical research being made to officiate as Forest Chemist, in preference to the respective qualified assistants?

(c) Is there any reason why the procedure of allowing assistants to officiate is not followed at the Forest Research Institute?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA: (a) The statement asked for is placed on the table.

(b) The Research Officers at the Forest Research Institute are selected officers with special qualifications in their own subjects, and in most cases it has been impossible to replace them by officers of similar qualifications when they have proceeded on leave. Special research work has therefore had to be suspended during their absence, and all that it has been possible to do has been to keep the administrative work of the branch running as efficiently as possible. In only two cases were the assistants considered capable of carrying on the work.

(c) In the beginning of this year one of the Assistants to the Forest Chemist was allowed to officiate for part of the time during which the head of his branch was on leave, but the period was too short to form a definite conclusion as to his fitness. Whenever an Assistant is considered fit to do so he will be allowed to carry on the duties of the head of his branch in the latter's absence provided a fully qualified officer is not forthcoming.

Statement showing how temporary vacancies occasioned by absence on leave or otherwise of Research Institute Officers have been filled during the last five years.

Serial No.	Name of Research Officer who proceeded on leave.	Name of officer who held charge of the duties of the officer on leave.	Periods.
1	Mr. C. F. C. Beeson, Forest Zoologist.	Mr. N. C. Chatterji, Assistant Forest Zoologist, Officer-in-charge in addition.	5 5 1916 18 5 1916
		Mr. B. B. Osmaston, President, Officer-in-charge in addition.	19 5 1916 2 7 1917
		Mr. J. E. Macpherson, Personal Assistant to President, Forest Research Institute and College, Officer-in-charge in addition.	26 11 1919 6 2 1920
		Mr. F. M. Howlett, Imperial Pathological Entomologist of Pusa, Officer-in-charge in addition.	7 2 1920 8 7 1920
2	Mr. Puran Singh, Chemical Adviser.	Mr. C. E. C. Cox, Assistant Forest Economist, Officer-in-charge in addition.	4 4 1918 1 6 1919
3	Dr. J. L. Simonsen, Forest Chemist.	Mr. A. J. Gibson, Forest Economist, Officer-in-charge in addition.	15 11 1919 7 3 1920
		Mr. C. F. C. Beeson, Forest Zoologist, Officer-in-charge in addition.	19 9 1920 24 1 1921
		Mr. Gopal Rao, Assistant to Forest Chemist, Officiating Forest Chemist.	25 1 1921 20 8 1921

Serial No.	Name of Research Officer who proceeded on leave.	Name of officer who held charge of the duties of the officer on leave.	Periods.
4	Mr. R. S. Pearson, Forest Economist.	Mr. C. E. C. Cox, Assistant Forest Economist.	27 8 1919 6 11 1919
		Mr. A. J. Gibson, D. C. F.	7 11 1919 11 3 1920
		Mr. C. E. C. Cox, Assistant Forest Economist.	12 3 1920 3 7 1920
		Mr. R. C. Milward, President, Officer-in-charge in addition.	4 7 1920 26 8 1920
5	Mr. R. E. Marsden, Sylviculturist.	Mr. R. S. Troup, D. C. F. and previously Sylviculturist.	2 2 1919 5 4 1919
		Mr. W. F. Perree, President, Officer-in-charge in addition.	6 4 1919 20 10 1919
6	Mr. R. S. Hole, Forest Botanist.	Mr. W. F. Perree, President, Officer-in-charge in addition.	5 5 1919 25 6 1919
		Mr. C. F. C. Beeson, Forest Zoologist, Officer-in-charge in addition.	26 6 1919 25 11 1919
		Mr. S. H. Howard, Sylviculturist, Officer-in-charge in addition.	26 11 1919 28 12 1920

INSTRUCTORS AT THE FOREST RESEARCH INSTITUTE AND COLLEGE AT DEHRA DUN.

14. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA : (a) Is it a fact that the duties of Instructors and Assistant Instructors at the Forest Research Institute and College are more or less identical ?

(b) If the answer is in the affirmative, is there any reason why any differentiation should be observed in their designation ?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : (a) and (b) The duties are not identical in so far as the standard of teaching and the responsibilities involved are concerned.

INDIANS AS RESEARCH OFFICERS.

15. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA : (a) Has any attempt been made to find suitable Indians as Research Officers at the Forest Research Institute under the new scheme ?

(b) If the answer is in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state the methods by which publicity has been given ?

(c) If the answer is in the negative, will the Government be pleased to state what steps are proposed to be taken in future for utilising Indian talent for Forest Research ?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : (a), (b) and (c) For those of the posts reserved for members of the Imperial Service Indian and European

officers are equally eligible. As regards the newly conceived lines of investigation the Government of India lay special stress on the appointment at the outset of scientists who have already extensive experience and an established reputation in the particular line of research in which they are to be employed, and consider that no racial discrimination should affect the selection of the best talent for this purpose. Such posts as those of Wood Technologist, Seasoning and Timber Testing Specialist, etc., have been, or are being, filled by recruitment in England and America; these posts have not been advertised in India because the Government of India know of no source in the country from which men of the type, or with the knowledge, required can be obtained. Applications for the post of Organic Chemist, one of the new posts, not yet filled, are being invited through the press in India.

INDIAN FOREST ENGINEER SERVICE.

16. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA: Will the Government be pleased to state in what way recruitment for the newly sanctioned Indian Forest Engineer Service is to be made, and if any publicity has been given with a view to securing suitable recruits from India?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA: No recruitment for the Forest Engineering Service is to be made this year.

EXEMPTION OF DOCUMENTS UNDER STAMP ACT.

17. The HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH: Do Government propose to consider the desirability of issuing a notification, under Section 9 of the Stamp Act, exempting from duty the following documents under the Articles of Schedule 1 mentioned below:—

Article 4.—Affidavit for the sole purpose of enabling any person to receive relief from a public, religious or charitable trust.

Article 5.—Agreement or Memorandum of an agreement to create a public, religious or charitable trust.

Article 7.—Appointment in execution of a power under a public, religious or charitable trust.

Article 58.—A settlement executed for a public, religious or charitable purpose.

Article 62.—Transfers of public, religious or charitable trust property from one trustee to another.

Article 64.—Declaration of a public, religious or charitable trust?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: The income from stamps is a Provincial source of revenue. The Honourable Member will realise that the Government of India are not in a position to take any such action as is suggested in this Question, except at the instance of Local Governments.

PENALTIES UNDER STAMP ACT.

18. The HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGINDRA SINGH: Do Government propose to consider the Question of issuing a rule under Section 75 of the Stamp Act to the effect that no penalty in excess of rupees five shall be levied in the case of insufficiently stamped documents creating or declaring public,

religious or charitable trusts, or agreements or memoranda of agreements to create such trusts ?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: The Honourable Member is referred to the Reply which I have just given to Question No. 17.

EXEMPTIONS FROM OPERATION OF ARMS RULES.

19. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA: Will the Home Member be pleased to state why Magistrates and Members of the Council of State and Assembly have not yet been exempted from the operation of the Arms Rules as recommended in my Resolution passed by a majority in this Council in March 1921, and from what date effect is going to be given to the said Resolution ?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: The undertaking given by the Honourable Home Member that the opinions of the Local Governments on the proposal would be obtained has been carried out. The views of the Local Governments have been invited and will be examined when all the replies have been received. I am therefore not in a position as yet to state whether and from what date effect will be given to this Resolution.

EXPENDITURE UNDER NEW REFORM SCHEME.

20. The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA: Will the Finance Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the total amount of increase in every Province and in the Government of India on account of the New Reform Scheme in all the departments ?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: The attention of the Honourable Member is invited to the statement* laid on the table on 14th February. Further figures are being collected so as to bring the information up to date which will be communicated to the Honourable Member in due course.

CONVICT SETTLEMENT, ANDAMANS.

21. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS: Will the Government kindly state what steps they have taken to abandon the convict settlement in the Andamans as recommended by the Jails Committee ?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: Government have decided to abandon the Andamans as a penal settlement and not to retain it in the modified form suggested by the Jails Committee. Deportation accordingly ceased in March last, and Government will shortly introduce legislation with a view to the abolition of transportation as a form of punishment. Orders have been issued for the return to India of political prisoners, and of those who are diseased or unfit to remain in the Settlement. We are also issuing orders for the repatriation of females (except those who wish to marry and remain in the Settlement) and adolescents. The repatriation of the general body of convicts, however, presents many difficulties and cannot be carried out at one stroke. I have with me a report submitted by an officer of the Government of India who was recently deputed to visit the Andamans and to make recommendations regarding repatriation, temporary reforms and the future of the Settlement. If the Honourable Member wishes I will be glad to show it to him.

* Vide pages 39-41 of Vol. I of the Council of State Debates.

COLONISATION OF ANDAMANS BY INDIANS.

22. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :

(a) Will the Government kindly state whether, after removal of the Convict Settlement from the Andamans, it is the intention of Government to open the islands to colonisation by Indians, and to take steps for the development of economic resources of the islands through Indian agency ?

(b) If so, will the Government kindly state the steps they are taking in this direction ?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK : (a) and (b) An officer was deputed to visit the Andamans during the month of July and to report *inter alia* on the general question of the future of the Settlement when the penal Settlement is abandoned. His report has been received and is now under the consideration of the Government.

GOVERNMENT LOANS.

23. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :

(a) Will the Government kindly state to what extent have the new Government loans been subscribed, both in England as well as in India ?

(b) To what extent have old war bonds been converted into new loans ?

(c) What was the rate of interest payable for such war bonds, and when would they have become payable by Government in ordinary course of time, had they not been now converted into the new loan ?

(d) To what extent have the new loans exceeded the amounts budgeted by Government for the current year, the rupee as well as sterling loan ?

(e) To what extent does the Government intend to utilise the excess in the new rupee loan subscribed, towards—

(i) reduction of floating debt,

(ii) deflation of the currency ?

(f) How will the excess in the new sterling loan be utilised ?

The HONOURABLE MR. E. M. COOK : (a) The total subscriptions to this year's rupee loan up to the 29th August amounted to Rs. 43·82 crores, of which 1·27 crores was received in England and the rest in India.

(b) 2·02 lakhs of 1921 Bonds and 3·19 lakhs of 1922 Bonds.

(c) 5½ per cent ; the 1921 Bonds on the 15th September 1921, and the 1922 Bonds on the 15th August 1922.

(d) 28·82 crores in the case of the rupee loan and £2½ millions in the case of the sterling loan.

(e) As the Honourable Member will remember from what was said by the Finance Member in his budget speech, Government have these two objects very prominently in mind. The extent, however, to which it will be possible to spare money therefore cannot be stated at this stage of the financial year, for it must depend upon the state of the cash balances during the remainder of the year. So far as can be seen at present, it is very unlikely that the revenue surplus anticipated in the budget will be realised, and any revenue deficit in the current year, will have to be financed from the general cash balances.

(f) The increased receipts from the sterling loan will help to keep the Secretary of State in funds to meet expenditure which would otherwise have had to be met by remittances from India. I may mention that, among the Secretary of State's other liabilities, about £14 millions sterling has to be found abroad for railway capital expenditure in the current year.

NOTE CIRCULATION AND METALLIC RESERVE.

24. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :
(a) Will Government kindly state what was the total amount of the note circulation on the 30th of June 1921?

(b) What was the amount of the metallic portion of the currency reserve in India on the same date?

The HONOURABLE MR. E. M. COOK : (a) 171½ crores.
(b) 95½ crores.

REDUCTION OF NOTE CIRCULATION.

25. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS : Will the Government kindly state what steps, if any, they are taking to reduce the present note circulation and to increase the percentage borne by the metallic portion of currency reserve to the total note circulation?

The HONOURABLE MR. E. M. COOK : The Paper Currency Act passed this time last year provides for a gradual reduction of the treasury bills held in the Currency Reserve by the utilisation of the interest on the Currency Reserve investments, and such reduction involves the withdrawal of the currency notes issued against such bills. It is estimated that the interest available for this purpose in the current year will be over 4½ crores, and since April 1st, 1½ crores has already been spent in this way. Further, as announced when the Paper Currency Bill was under discussion in the Imperial Legislative Council last year, it has also been decided that, as soon as the Gold Standard Reserve amounts to £40 millions, the income therefrom will be devoted to the same purpose : the Gold Standard Reserve now amounts to £39½ millions, so funds will also be available from this source in the course of next year, if not earlier.

The Honourable Member's question appears to imply that the present note circulation is excessive and that the present metallic backing is insufficient. It is always a matter of controversy as to when exactly a currency system becomes inflated, but the Government are not prepared to admit that the circulation of currency notes in India is in excess of the actual requirements of the country. It is true that of the total Currency Reserve, against the present circulation of 175 crores 60 crores is represented by Indian treasury bills issued *ad hoc*, and the Government admit that they would like to see most of these either replaced by other securities or discharged as the result of the withdrawal of currency notes. As I have mentioned, this process of discharge has already begun. As regards the present metallic percentage, this is now over 57 and is, the Government consider, very satisfactory; the Honourable Member will find that it compares extremely favourably with similar percentages borne in most other countries. Moreover, this percentage is arrived at by valuing the gold in the reserve at ten rupees to the sovereign, *i.e.*, one rupee for 11·3 grains of fine gold. If the gold were valued at its actual market price, the percentage would work out to about 64.

INDIAN EMIGRANTS FROM OVERSEAS.

26. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :

(a) How many Indian emigrants have returned to India from overseas during last two years ?

(b) Will the Government kindly state the steps, if any, they have taken to help them in securing employment in India ?

(c) How many of such emigrants have secured employment ?

(d) What is the present means of livelihood of such emigrants as have not so far secured employment ?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : (a) 9,812.

(b) The Government of India suggested to the Governments of Bengal, Madras and the United Provinces, to which provinces most of the repatriates belong, that it might be well to form local advisory committees, one of the duties of which is to meet returning emigrant ships and to help the emigrants to find work, acting as a sort of labour bureau.

A Committee composed of officials and non-officials has been formed in Bengal under the Chairmanship of Mr. W. R. Gourlay, C.I.E., I.C.S., with these functions. The authorities at Madras and Bengal have been asked to forward to the Director of Industries, United Provinces, all applications for employment from Indians belonging to those provinces. It is understood also that the Servants of India Society have started a depôt for repatriates at Cawnpore.

(c) The Government of India have no information.

(d) Some of them have drifted down to the depôt at Calcutta in hopes of securing a voyage back to their colonies. They are being maintained there partly by charitable subscriptions, partly out of a subvention granted by the Government of India, and partly by such daily labour on hire as they are able to obtain. There are understood to be about 600 persons in the depôt awaiting a chance of returning to Fiji, as soon as the Committee will permit them to go, and over 100 waiting to go to Surinam and Trinidad, if the Legislative Assembly will vote a grant for their repatriation. One of the reasons for delaying their departure is the desire of certain members of the Committee to give the Indian public a chance of assisting these unfortunates to settle down and find employment in this country.

APPOINTMENT OF INDIAN TRADE COMMISSIONERS.

27. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :

(a) Will the Government kindly state what steps, if any, they are taking to appoint Indian Trade Commissioners in foreign countries with which India has foreign trade ?

(b) In what countries so far have Indian Trade Commissioners been appointed ?

(c) Have Government considered the desirability of appointing Indian Trade Commissioners from among the Indian mercantile communities of this country ?

(d) If so, will the Government kindly state how many of the Trade Commissioners appointed so far are Indians?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: I would refer the Honourable Member to the reply* given in the Legislative Assembly on the 17th February last to a similar Question asked by Mr. Manmohandas Ramji.

FREIGHT CHARGES ON INDIAN RAILWAYS.

28. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS:
(a) Will the Government kindly state whether it is under contemplation to undertake a revision of freight charges on Indian Railways?

(b) If so, is the Government appointing a Committee consisting of officials and non-officials to undertake this revision?

(c) If the answer be in the affirmative, when is such a committee going to be appointed, and what are to be its terms of reference?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) The revision of freight charges on Indian Railways is under contemplation. This revision, it may be explained, is with a view to increasing the rates when the existing freight-tax ceases on the 31st March next. This, it may be pointed out, is considered necessary to meet the enhanced cost of working.

(b) It may be explained for the information of the Honourable Member that a schedule of maxima and minima rates (consisting at present of six classes) is sanctioned by Government, and applies to the traffic of the majority of railways in India. There is then a commodity classification under one or other of these classes; and in deciding on the classification appropriate to a particular commodity, local and other conditions have to be taken into consideration, with the result that the classification of the same commodity may, and indeed does, differ on two or more railways. Railways are permitted to vary their charges within the sanctioned maxima and minima of the class rates and here various factors arise, impossible to detail within the compass of this reply, and which have a bearing on the ultimate fixation of charges. In the circumstances, it is difficult to see how a Committee such as that suggested could usefully deal with a complicated and intricate subject such as the revision of freight rates which have been framed after much experience of what the traffic in each case can bear.

(c) This question does not, under the circumstances, arise.

CLAIMS AND TRAFFIC INSPECTORS, NORTH-WESTERN RAILWAY.

29. The HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS:
(a) Will the Government kindly state what is the number of Claims Inspectors, Traffic Inspectors, and Assistant Traffic Inspectors, on the North-Western Railway, recruited from among—

(i) Hindus, (ii) Muhammadans, (iii) Sikhs, (iv) Parsis, (v) Europeans, and (vi) Anglo-Indians?

(b) How many among each of these communities are graduates?

* Vide page 103 of Part I of Volume I of Legislative Assembly Debates.

(c) What are the future prospects of these graduates in the North-Western Railway? Have any of them been promoted to higher appointments in the department?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) The number of Claims Inspectors and Traffic Inspectors on the North-Western Railway is—

	(i)	(ii)	(iii)	(iv)	(v)	(vi)	Total.
	Hindus.	Muhammadans.	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	
Senior Claims Inspectors.	1	1	2
Junior Claims Inspectors.	6	3	1	10
Traffic Inspectors ...	5	36	8	49

(b) Of the above, four are graduates, two being Muhammadans, one a Sikh and one a Hindu.

(c) The future prospects of these men, as of other graduates employed on the North-Western Railway, directly depend upon the capacity they show in their railway work. If they show themselves to be sufficiently capable, there is no reason why they should not eventually rise to higher appointments in the Traffic Department.

EXPENDITURE ON INDIAN RAILWAYS OUTSIDE INDIA.

30. The HONOURABLE MR. LALUBHAI SAMALDAS: (a) What was the total amount spent on account of the Indian Railways outside India during the financial year 1920-21?

(b) How much of the above amount was disbursed by the Secretary of State or the High Commissioner, and how much by the Companies?

(c) Were any tenders called for any purchases on account of such Railways outside England and, if so, for what part of the total amount spent during the year were such tenders invited?

(d) Will the Government place on the table a statement showing the cases in which tenders have been invited and the prices asked for by each tenderer?

(e) Were there any cases in which orders were placed in England in spite of lower tenders being received from other countries and, if so, what was the total amount of orders so placed in England and what was the total saving that could have been effected in every case?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI : (a) and (b). The total amount spent in England on account of Indian Railways during 1920-21 was £17,582,277 as below :—

(i) Expenditure relating to State Railways worked by State representing direct disbursements by the Secretary of State or the High Commissioner ...	£3,785,431
(ii) Expenditure relating to State Railways worked by Companies, i.e., payments made through Railway Companies	£13,796,846
Total	£17,582,277

(c), (d) and (e). I am unable to give the complete information asked for in parts (c) and (d), but I lay on the table a copy of papers received from the High Commissioner, containing extracts from a minute on the subject of the purchase of stores in England for Indian Railways, extracts from Sir William Meyer's evidence before the Railway Committee, a note on the procedure of the Stores Department, and two statements, showing (1) cases in which British tenders have been accepted although lower satisfactory tenders have been received from foreign firms, for the period from the 1st October 1920 up to the 8th August 1921, and (2) cases during the same period where foreign firms' tenders have been accepted for the whole of a contract, or where orders have been divided between British and foreign firms, where British firms have been given an opportunity to reduce their prices. These statements will give the information required in part (e) of the question.

Extract from a Minute by Sir W. S. Meyer, dated 8th August 1921.

1. The printed note on the procedure of the Stores Department in respect of the purchase of stores for India annexed to this Minute gives a full statement of (a) the manner in which tenders are invited, and (b) the considerations which guide the acceptance of tenders. My evidence before the Railway Committee, which is attached, affords a commentary on certain features of the procedure and policy adopted, and it is only necessary for me to supplement it on points not already made clear or calling for revision.

2. I shall first deal with the question of calling for tenders. Tenders are usually invited by advertisement when large supplies are needed and the amount involved is considerable, e.g., demands for railway materials such as steel rails, etc. Advertisements are inserted in important newspapers and technical journals published in the United Kingdom. Most important foreign manufacturing firms have agents in this country who keep them in touch with business openings, and it has not in the past been found necessary to bring our requirements to the special notice of foreign firms, unless articles of a special nature obtainable only from such firms are required. In other cases recourse is had to "limited" tenders or to individual firms direct. Paragraphs 2—5 of the printed note explain the procedure in calling for tenders.

3. The next point is the policy which has been laid down to control the acceptance of tenders. I may summarise this briefly in a series of propositions explaining later the considerations which led to the adoption of principles which might be considered likely to give rise to criticism—

(i) As a general rule, the lowest satisfactory tender is accepted. The term "satisfactory" covers matters such as quality of article tendered, reliability of tendering firm, date of promised delivery, etc. This rule is, however, subject to the following qualifications :—

(a) In present abnormal circumstances and for the reasons explained in my evidence before the Railway Committee, I am willing to accept a satisfactory British tender in preference to a foreign tender when the gap between the

two is not excessive. As a general starting point, I have laid down that this gap should not exceed 10%. But each case has to come before me personally on its merits, and while sometimes no preference at all may be found necessary, in others there may be valid reasons for going beyond 10%. In the case of the wheels and axles referred to in my evidence, a preference up to about 20% was allowed to a British firm for the special reasons there stated.

- (b) Among British tenderers, preference is given to a firm on the King's roll, i.e., one which has on its staff at least 5 per cent. of disabled ex-service men, over a non-King's roll firm unless the latter tenders materially, lower or undertakes to deliver more expeditiously where time is an essential factor.
- (ii) When a British and a foreign tender are equally satisfactory, the preference is invariably given to the former.
- (iii) When a foreign tender is much below a British tender, the terms of the former are confidentially communicated to the British firm to enable it, if possible, to come down to within a reasonable limit of preference. The use of this lever has often resulted in a material reduction of the original British prices.

4. I have explained in my evidence before the Railway Committee the reasons for the policy I have adopted which, I again reiterate, has been adopted by me as only a temporary measure in view of the present abnormal conditions in the industrial world. When the Stores Department came under me, I reviewed the position most carefully, and came to the conclusion that it would not at present be to the real ultimate advantage of the Indian Government to take into account nothing beyond the prices at the moment. Having regard to the Exchange and existing industrial conditions in Germany, for instance, British firms would in sundry cases not be able to compete on equal terms with German manufacturers, but the placing of all orders in the cheapest market might, by helping to destroy British industries, place us ultimately at the mercy of their foreign competitors. There are other considerations which sometimes militate against the acceptance of foreign tenders, e.g., the difficulty involved in the inspection of foreign materials before they can be passed for shipment, and in any case, inspection abroad is more expensive than it would be in England and occasionally the difficulty of obtaining delivery within the time specified in the indent. It must also be emphasised that, in the case of certain classes of material, e.g., Railway wheels, axles, etc., where reliability is a matter of public concern, it is inexpedient to attach too much importance to cheapness and to overlook the special reliability of a firm that has been in the past tried and found trustworthy, even at some extra cost to public revenues.

5. I enclose two statements, one showing the cases in which since 1st October 1920 a higher British tender has been accepted in preference to a lower foreign tender, and the other showing the foreign tenders accepted during this period.

The 8th August 1921.

W. S. MEYER.

Extracts from Minutes of Evidence given by Sir William Meyer, G.C.I.F., K.C.S.I., before the Railway Committee.

8190. May I first ask you about some matters that you know of in your present position? As I understand it, it is your business to be responsible for the purchase of stores, materials, and so forth, for Government departments generally?—Yes.

8191. And that includes the three State Railways?—Yes.

8192. I understand that the Government are setting up, if they have not already set up, a corresponding Purchase Department in India?—The question of the actual shape in which it is to be set up and its scope is still under consideration, but there was a Committee appointed on the subject on which your Secretary, Mr. Ryan, sat.

8193. But the policy of doing it is settled: is that right?—I think you may take it that that is so.

8194. At present, however, there is not a corresponding department in India with which you can dovetail?—No.

8195. The function of the High Commissioner will be to get things in England that could not be got in India; that will be the theory, I take it?—It is rather like this. The Indian Government and the departments determine what things they require in England.

The present policy is that whenever possible they shall purchase things in India at, of course, a reasonable price compared with England. They make up their minds as to what they can purchase in India, and then they indent for the residue, which is either stuff which is not procurable in India, or could only be procured at prohibitive expense or entirely through the agency of private firms. They do not want to employ middlemen. In all those cases they send me instructions to buy.

8196. Who are they—separate departments or a stores organization?—No, there is as yet no collective stores organization in India. My orders may come from the Army Department of the Government of India as regards particular army stores, or possibly, for the sake of convenience, from the Director General of Ordnance. Similarly, they may come from the Post Office as regards Post Office and Telegraphs, and from the various Public Works Departments as regards ordinary public works matters, and from the Railway Board, usually, as regards railway purchases.

8197. I assume that an urgent order on a small scale might come to you directly by cable from the Agent of the North-Western Railway?—That is so. On many matters there is direct communication between my Director General of Stores and the local people.

8198. You have to buy engines, rolling-stock, and things of that kind?—Yes.

8199. You have a firm of consulting engineers?—Yes.

8200. Do you make much use of them?—Considerable.

8201. They do the inspection for you during construction, I suppose?—In certain highly technical matters the consulting engineers come in, but the Stores Department has also got its own people to refer to.

8202. The Stores Department has its own experts?—Its own inspecting experts, I should say, rather than consulting experts. For a large number of purchases of relatively small things and local stores those experts are quite sufficient. One of the matters in which the consulting engineers are useful is this. One of the questions we have to consider at present is the purchase of stores in Germany, say—if we can get the material at a considerably cheaper price there. Before we consider the *pros* and *cons* of that, we often refer to the consulting engineer as to the status of a particular German firm or company that has tendered, as to the character of the goods they turn out, and as to the likelihood, where time is of the essence, of their being turned out promptly.

8203. Would you trust to your own knowledge as to the status and capacity of a firm in England?—I certainly should not trust to my own individual knowledge, but the Director General of Stores and the Stores Department have, of course, got very large information. They have dealt with firms for many years, but if there was any difficulty we would certainly go to the consulting engineer.

8204. (*Chairman*). I do not know whether you have any views on the question of the purchase of stores. One of the complaints that was made in India, in somewhat general terms as far as I can remember, was that the English companies gave a preference to England, although stuff might be bought cheaper and equally well in America or in Germany, and that thereby the Indian tax-payer has suffered. That is the case as stated. Have you any opinion on that, from your experience?—I cannot say what the companies do, but I can tell you as regards my own department, which includes the purchases of State Railways. One is rather between Scylla and Charybdis in these matters. You have got the Indian opinion demanding, from their point of view quite reasonably, that you should purchase absolutely in the cheapest market. I have a good deal of pressure put on me on various sides in England to deal with British firms and companies; they say it is very hard that they should be penalized by the abnormal advantage obtained by Germany through the rate of exchange and so on; that they have served India well in times past, and that if they have to shut up shop things will be worse for us in the future. I have always taken up the position that it is not the business of the Indian tax-payer to subsidise British industries or British labour, but that within certain limits one might give a bit of a preference especially to people who have formerly dealt with us. The Director General of Stores deals with the mass of contracts, but at present cases in which it is proposed to deal with a foreign firm come up to me. The general principle I have laid down (it is subject to specific and possibly different applications in particular cases) is that if the lowest British tender is within 10 per cent., say, of the German or Belgian tender, I give it to the British firm. Of course, time is sometimes of the essence of the contract. Sometimes the British firm can turn out the goods required within the time that the Government of India or the department that requires the goods, specifies, and the foreigner cannot. I also adopt the principle on occasion that if the lowest German tender, say, is considerably lower than

the lowest British tender, I communicate confidentially the terms of the German tender to the Britisher, and ask him if he will come down. Sometimes he comes down to an extent that justifies me in giving the business to him; sometimes he does not. Of course, as you understand, the Secretary of State is subject to various questions in Parliament about these matters and, although I am subordinate to the Government of India and not to him, I have explained my policy to him, and he so much approved of it that he said he thought of asking the companies to follow it also.

8210. You have raised a point there that I think is worthy of notice. You are an officer of the Government of India?—That is so.

8211. You happen to be temporarily housed, I understand, at the India Office?—I was, but I have got an office of my own now. I am a neighbour of yours: I am at 42 and 44, Grosvenor Gardens.

8212. The only way in which the Secretary of State can deal with you, so to speak, is through the Government of India?—Yes. If I were doing things that he considered objectionable, he might instruct the Government of India to instruct me to abate my actions, but no such case has arisen hitherto.

8213. I think we fully understand your attitude. The giving of a certain preference to England as a country that has supplied material, and to individual firms that have served you well, you regard as a businesslike and proper thing to do?—Exactly.

8214. You do not think it is contrary to the interests of India in the long run if you sacrifice 500*l.* or 5,000*l.* on an individual contract?—I think it is entirely to the interests of India in the long run. Perhaps I might bring to your notice, if it has not been already brought to your notice, one question with reference to the loan of 7½ millions that was floated here a little time ago. There was a guarantee given by the India Office, on behalf of the Government of India, that all the proceeds of that loan would be applied to the purchase of railway material in this country. Of course, it is quite easy to carry out that policy without any infringement of the other line of policy to which I was referring just now, because we shall spend about 14,000,000*l.* this year for the purchase of railway material, and in any case at least 7½ millions—probably very much more—will come from British undertakings.

8215. Thank you very much. I do not think I appreciated before the point of purchase in Great Britain as distinct from purchase in Europe. That is, of course, a distinct difference.

8399. I do not propose to ask you any questions on the technical side at all. I will read out the question in order that the Committee may know what it was. Question No. 3 was: "Are tenders for supplies from foreign countries freely invited and received, and if so, will the Director-General kindly state the number of foreign tenders received during the periods 1912-13, 1913-14 and 1919-20?" The reply is: "The usual method of inviting tenders from foreign countries is by advertising the requirements. This is done whenever it is thought that the requirements are such as to attract foreign competition. Thirty-nine foreign tenders were received during 1919-20. The numbers for 1912-13 and 1913-14 are not available." Who exercises the discretion as to whether "the requirements are such as to attract foreign competition" or not?—The Director General of Stores.

8400. What guides him in his decision?—The past. He would look up to see what foreign companies in the past had offered for like requirements.

8401. Whether stores of that nature can be obtained in foreign countries or not—is that what would guide him?—Either that they cannot be obtained in foreign countries, or that for a series of years, let us say, Canada did not send in any tenders. Then he might reasonably conclude that it was not of any particular use advertising the requirements in Canada. Another point you have to bear in mind is that very often he is asked to get stores urgently, and to advertise in foreign papers necessarily means a little delay.

8402. In reply to No. 5 two examples are given. The answer says: "In a few instances foreign tenders from 30 per cent to 50 per cent. lower than British tenders have been received, and have been dealt with in accordance with the policy indicated in the answer to Question 4. One or two recent examples are given below:—

Rails.—Foreign price, 10*l.* 10*s.*

British price 17*l.*, subsequently reduced to £11 10*s.*

"*Wheels and Axles.*—Foreign price, 45*l.*

British price, 83*l.* 15*s.*, subsequently reduced to 67*l.*"

Is it possible that what happened in those two cases of rails and wheels and axles

may have happened in the case of other materials in regard to which the Director General of Stores exercises his discretion? You see the difference is enormous?—I explained at the outset to the Chairman the policy which I have laid down in respect to foreign tenders. This case of wheels and axles I know about personally. The 45*l.* was a German price. The original British tender was nearly 84*l.* In accordance with the policy I indicated to the Chairman, the German price was communicated to the company which offered it and they were asked whether they could reduce. They said they could reduce to 67*l.* I said that was not enough, but that I was willing, as a special case, to give them the tender at 55*l.*, having regard to the fact that they had done very good work for us in the past, and that they might be supplying us with wagons later on for debentures instead of for cash. They are still thinking over the offer; I gave them time to consider it. The foreign price for the rails was 10 guineas and, in the first instance, the British price was 17*l.* It was subsequently reduced to 11*l.* 10*s.* I imagine that the reduced British price was accepted.

8403. (*Mr. Purshotamdas.*) I should like to put this question arising out of the answer you have just given. If you call for tenders and if, instead of giving the order to the lowest tenderer, you send for the next lowest competitor and tell him you have got a lower tender, does it not discourage the lowest tenderer from tendering again? Will he not say: "Our tender is only called for in order to get the others to reduce their prices?" There is not what is called in ordinary business (I do not at all mean it is so in this case) fair tender facilities available to all. Does it strike you that, by the adoption of this method, the foreign tenderer may absolutely cease to tender at all?—Your criticism would be absolutely just in normal times. One would not think of adopting this system in normal times, but we have to face a very abnormal situation in which the Germans, thanks to the exchange position and to their necessity of having to pay a huge amount of reparations, are putting up what you may call an artificial price. We do not want to see the British firms ruined by German artificial prices; the result would probably be that you might get a German monopoly. On the other hand, as I said to the Chairman, it would not be legitimate to use the Indian tax-payer to any material extent to subsidise British firms, so I have adopted a medium position—a moderate amount of preference to British firms which will only last while the present abnormal economic situation continues.

8404. I take it that this policy did not prevail before the war, and that it will stop in the near future as soon as the other circumstances to which you have referred adjust themselves?—I was not responsible for the administration of the Stores Department before the war; I have become responsible only lately. I understand that before the war they went on the general principle of going to the cheapest market, and hereafter (in normal conditions) they will do the same. Of course, you must take it that in certain cases, as I explained to the Chairman, time is of the essence of the demand, and foreign people may not be able to supply within the requisite time.

Procedure of the Stores Department in the purchase of stores and engagement of freight to India.

1. Action in regard to purchase is only taken on receipt of indents of telegrams from India. Each indent must be accompanied by a certificate showing that funds have been provided to meet the proposed expenditure.

2. "Draft Orders." are prepared in the precise terms of the indent, each order including such items as will have to be obtained from one class of manufacturer. The draft orders are then referred to the Superintendent of the Depot, the Consulting Engineers, or other officer appointed to undertake the inspection of the stores, and are completed by him, with the necessary specifications, departmental pattern numbers, if any, such other information as may be necessary to guide the supply. They then form the basis on which tenders are invited for supply.

3. There are three ways in which tenders are obtained:—

- (1) By advertisement ("open tender").
- (2) By invitation to a limited number of firms ("limited tender").
- (3) By invitation to one firm only "single tender" or ("private purchase").

It is left to the discretion of the Department to decide which of these three ways shall be adopted, as explained in the following extract from a Minute by the Under Secretary of State, dated the 9th December 1918:—

"In 1874, a Committee of the House of Commons (of which Mr. J. Holms was Chairman) sat and reported on the purchasing Departments, War Office, Admiralty,

India Office, etc. They made no special recommendations, with respect to the India Office, but, on the general question, they were of opinion that it would be 'unwise to restrict the purchasing officer to any one of these modes of purchase' (*viz.*, open tender, limited tender, purchase by broker, or private purchase) 'to the exclusion of the others.' 'In all cases,' they say, 'where the circumstances will admit of it, public tender is the best and safest mode of buying, but the Committee are not prepared to recommend any restriction upon the discretion of the heads of the purchasing Departments. To enable them to buy to the fullest advantage, they must, within certain limits, be left untrammelled.'

'The practice of purchasing privately does not prevail to any great extent in any department. The purchasing officers appear to be aware of the danger of indulging in it when it is not necessary; but to prohibit it absolutely, under all circumstances, your Committee would deem to be unwise.' These remarks apply to the present system."

4. When "limited tender" is adopted the names of the firms to be invited are, as a rule, determined as follows:—

A register is kept, under the various heads of supply, of firms known to be willing and able to execute contracts. Every effort is made to have full, and, at the same time, efficient lists, and every encouragement is given to firms desirous of being recorded; but, before noting new firms in the register, inquiry is made by reference to other Government Departments, or to large private firms, to ascertain the ability of the applicants to execute contracts satisfactorily. In many instances the firm is also asked to send samples of its work for examination and its works are visited. Firms are also required to give an undertaking that they will comply with the terms of the Fair Wages Resolutions of the House of Commons, dated the 13th February 1891, and 10th March 1909. When thought necessary names are removed from the register.

From this register the names of firms to be invited are selected by the Director General of Stores or the Deputy Director General.

5. Competitive tenders are generally invited, except in the case of—

- (a) Patents and specialities.
- (b) Comparatively small supplies.
- (c) Highly finished work such as surgical and scientific instruments. For these it is not unusual to invite single tenders from thoroughly reliable firms, as it has been found by experience that competition is liable to result in lower prices at a sacrifice of quality.

6. Single tenders are opened as received, and, if considered reasonable and satisfactory, are accepted, subject to the rules as to acceptance shown below.

7. Competitive tenders are appointed to be sent in by a fixed day and hour. They are opened under the supervision of the Director General of Stores, or the Deputy Director General, and of a junior clerk. Each tender received is initialled by both the officers, and a list enumerating the tenders received is kept for record.

8. The quotations having been checked, an abstract of each set of tenders is prepared, and, when necessary, is referred with the tenders to the Inspection Branch for report.

9. Tenders are accepted under the authority of the Director General of Stores, subject to the following limitations:—

- (a) The acceptance of any tender over 50,000*l.* requires the approval of the High Commissioner.
- (b) If the tender proposed to be accepted is not lowest complying with the requirements of the Stores Department and of the indenting Department, the acceptance requires the approval of the High Commissioner, except that when the amount involved does not exceed 5,000*l.* and the acceptance of the tender is justified on such ground as superior quality, superior trustworthiness of the firm tendering greater facility of inspection, quicker delivery, etc., the Director General may authorise the acceptance, a weekly abstract of such cases being submitted to the High Commissioner.

10. The acceptance of foreign tenders is governed by Rule 9, subject to the conditions that—

- (i) When a British and a foreign tender are equally favourable, the British tender is to be preferred.

(b) No German or Austrian tender is to be accepted without the special sanction of the High Commissioner, except that the Director General of Stores may accept a tender from a British firm which includes German goods of a value not exceeding 100*l.* provided that he is satisfied that suitable article cannot be obtained at a reasonable price of British manufacture.

11. The firms whose tenders are not accepted are informed to that effect.

12. Tenders for freight are generally invited by advertisement, and are dealt with in consultation with the Shipping Agents.

The acceptance of freight tenders is subject generally to the same rules as those governing the acceptance of tenders for stores.

13. A weekly list of the contracts entered into for stores and freight is submitted for the information of the High Commissioner.

December, 1920.

G. H. C.

Cases in which British tenders have been accepted although lower satisfactory tenders have been received from foreign firms (for period commencing 1st October 1920).

Name of firm receiving order.	Contract number.	Stores.	Price at which order was placed.	Lower tender from foreign firms.	Difference in price as percentage of lower tender.	REMARKS.
B1	734-6678, dated 16th February 1921.	Axles ..	£ 12,574	F1. (German) £11,666.	73%	The delivery offered by the British firm was quicker than that offered by the German firm, and the former firm was considered to be more reliable. The British firms reduced their price by £1,944 as a result of negotiations.
B2	484-6688, dated 2nd February 1921.	Tyres, steel.	6,600	F1. (German) £6,025. F2. (Swedish) £6,375.	0.5%	The delivery offered by the British firm was 4-7 weeks, that of the German firm 20 weeks. The cost of inspection abroad would be £250 more than in this country. As a result of negotiations the British firm reduced their price by £1,430.
B2	Z4071-8387, dated 16th November 1920.	Do. ..	14,782-15	F1. (German) £10,482-16.	29%	British firm accepted on ground of superior trustworthiness and in view of Consulting Engineers' report that the state of the German works was not known or whether they could obtain the high grade ores necessary (German phosphoric ores not being suitable). The British firm were asked to reduce their price but could not do so.

Name of firm receiving order.	Contract number.	Stores.	Price at which order was placed.	Lower tender from foreign firms.	Difference in price as percentage of lower tender.	REMARKS.
B3	1697-887, dated 21st April 1921.	Spikes, dog.	£ 4,089	F3. (Belgium) £3,680.	11.1%	The extra cost of inspection in Belgium would be 3 per cent. of the cost of the stores. As the result of negotiations the British firm reduced their price by £1,075.
B4	3127-6766, dated 28th July 1921.	Wheels and axles.	44,000	F1. (German) £36,000.	22.2%	The British firm's price was reduced by negotiation from £83.15 per pair to £55 per pair.
B5	1705-265, dated 21st April 1921.	Keys, steel.	7,812.10	F4. (Belgium) £6,908.10.0.	13%	The British tender was accepted on the grounds of superior quality and superior reliability.

Cases where Foreign Firms have been accepted for whole contract or order divided between British and Foreign Firms where British Firms have been given an opportunity to reduce their prices (for period commencing 1st October 1920).

Name of firm receiving order and nationality.	Contract number.	Stores.	Rate per ton or total value of contract.	Reasons for giving the order to firm.
F-3 (Belgian)	Z-4641-4906 of 22nd October 1920.	1,250,000 Dog spikes.	At 1,820 francs per ton <i>f.o.b.</i> Antwerp (at 5) francs to £36.8.0 per ton).	Lowest quotation F-3 delivery six months. A British firm (on behalf of Belgian firm) next lowest but passed over in favour of firm B-3 for portion on score of urgency. B-3 delivery ten weeks. In view of coal strike not possible to place who's order with British firm though British makers promised greater output when strike settled.
B-3 (representing British firm.)	Z-4642-4906 of 22nd October 1920.	1,400,950 Dog spikes.	At £41 per ton, Liverpool.	

Total weight—tons 896 approx.
Divided Order.

Name of firm receiving order and nationality.	Contract number.	Stores.	Rate per ton or total value of contract.	Reasons for giving the order to firm.
F-5 (Belgian)	No. 176-5082 of 18th January 1921.	3,000 Axle boxes.	Total = 510,000 francs (at 56 to £9,107 approx.)	Firm F-5 lowest tender. Firm B-6 lowest British tender, price reduced by negotiation. Delivery of both firms long. Order divided in order to meet, as far as possible, India's requirements in respect of delivery.
B-6 ...	No. 177-5082 of 18th January 1921.	1,200 Axle boxes.	Total £4,905 } Divided Order.	
B-7 (For German made cups).	No. 3085-1423 of 23rd July 1921.	255,000 Insulator cups.	Total £28,490 ...	The lowest tenders for British made goods were received from Firms B-8 and B-9 who quoted equal prices. Both firms reduced price of item 1 from £25 per 1,000 to £24 per 1,000 against £23 per 1,000 for German made insulators. The total cost of British made goods would have been £24,237 or 187 per cent. above the cost of the German. The order was consequently given to the firm B-7 on account of their much lower prices.

PAY OF STAFF ON EASTERN BENGAL RAILWAY.

31. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state—

- (i) What were the scales of pay in force in the year 1914 for each of the following classes of staff on the Eastern Bengal Railway:—
Indian Station Masters, Assistant Station Masters, Guards, Booking Clerks, Goods Clerks, Signallers, Ticket Collectors and Trains and Transhipment Clerks?
- (ii) What are the scales of pay at present in force for each of these classes?
- (iii) What is the average percentage of increase in each case?
- (b) Do the Government propose to take steps to provide that—
 - (i) the Station Masters and Assistant Station Masters are allowed the same percentage of increase as has been given to Signallers, Ticket Collectors, etc.,
 - (ii) the scales of pay of Station Masters and Assistant Station Masters are further modified and improved so as to place these classes on an appreciably better footing than the other classes referred to in (a) (i)?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) (i), (ii) and (iii). Statements marked 'A' and 'B' giving the information asked for are placed on the table.

(b) (i) Government do not propose to give the same percentage of increases to Station Masters as has been given to Signallers. The percentage increases have been based in accordance with the grades of Station Masters, Assistant Station Masters and Signallers. The lower grades getting a large percentage of increases than the higher grades. In granting these increases consideration has been given to duties, responsibilities and market-value of men employed.

(b) (ii) It is not at present considered necessary to further modify the scales of pay for Station Masters and Assistant Station Masters.

Eastern Bengal Railway.

STATEMENT 'A.'

Designation.	Pay in 1914.
	Rs.
Station Masters (Indian)	35—38—41—45.
	50—55—60—65.
	80—86—93—100.
Assistant Station Masters (Indian)	30—32.
	35—36—41—45.
	50—55—60—65.
Signallers	80—86—93—100.
	20—22—26.
	30—33—36—40.
Station Transhipment and Goods Shed Clerks and Ticket Collectors	50—55—60—65.
	15—17—20.
	25—27—30.
Guards	35—37—40—45—50—55.
	60—65—70—80—85—90.
	100—110—120.
	20—25—30—33—37—41—45.
	50—55—60—65—70—75.
	85—95—105—115—125.
	130—140—150.

Eastern Bengal Railway.

STATEMENT 'B.'

Designation.	Pay in 1920.	Percentage increase.
	Rs.	
(1) Station Masters	200—10—250	In 1914 there was no fixed progressive scale of pay as at present and records of 1914 are not available. The percentage of increase cannot accordingly be given.
(Important Stations)	300—10—400	
	420—20—500	
(2) Assistant Station Masters (Important Stations).	280—10—330	
	52—4—80	60 per cent.
(3) Station Masters	85—5—120	39 "
	Special :—	
	130—10—170	New scale.
	40—4—70	61 per cent.
(4) Assistant Station Masters	80—5—95	62 "
	100—5—120	23 "
	30—4—70	72 per cent.
(5) Signallers	75—5—115	60 "
	120—10—170	New scale.
	20—1—28	41 per cent.
	30—2—40	29 "
(6) Station Transhipment and Goods Shcd Clerks.	30—4—70	16 "
	75—5—110	27 "
	115—10—145	18 "
(7) Guards	40—5—100	52 per cent.
	100—10—210	31 "
	32—4—60	29 per cent.
	65—5—90	20 "
(8) Ticket Collectors	95—5—120	23 "
	130—10—160	20 "
	160—10—260	66 "

PAY AND NATIONALITY OF STAFF OF THE EASTERN BENGAL RAILWAY.

32. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: Will the Government be pleased to state—

(a) (i) What is the total number of each of the following classes of staff at present in the service of the Eastern Bengal Railway:—

Transportation Inspectors, Traffic Inspectors, Assistant Traffic Inspectors, Train Controllers, Assistant Train Controllers, Transshipment Inspectors, Ghât Inspectors, Platform Inspectors, Luggage Inspectors, Travelling Ticket Inspectors, Goods Supervisors, Claims Inspectors and Assistant Claims Inspectors?

(ii) What are the existing scales of pay for each class?

(iii) What is the total number of Indians employed in each class?

(b) (i) Whether it is a fact that, in appointing men to the classes of posts referred to in (a) (i), outsiders with little or no railway experience are very often selected, while the claims of Indians, who have put in long service in the Department, are ignored?

(ii) Whether it is a fact that the junior European and Anglo-Indian Guards with little or no experience in station duties are put on to officiate in the higher appointments, *e.g.*, Traffic Inspector, Train Controller, etc., in preference to senior Indian Station Masters?

(iii) Whether it is a fact that, during the years 1919 and 1920, the Eastern Bengal Railway Administration appointed three outsiders as Traffic Inspectors on an initial salary of Rs. 500 each, thereby completely overlooking the claims of senior men working in the department?

(c) Do the Government propose—

(i) to take such steps as will put a stop to the importation of outsiders to fill vacancies in the classes of posts referred to in (a) (i) to the exclusion of Senior Indians in the Department; and

(ii) to issue orders for the employment of a larger proportion of Indians in each of these classes of appointments?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) (i), (ii) and (iii) A statement giving the information asked for is placed on the table.

(b) (i) The reply is in the negative. A few outsiders have been appointed from time to time, but they have usually been men of experience gained on other railways.

As regards Travelling Ticket Inspectors, vacancies are filled from among railway employees when suitable men are available. Preference is given to men of the 49th Bengali Regiment when appointing outsiders.

(ii) The reply is in the negative.

(iii) In the year 1919 two outsiders, one European and the other Indian, were appointed as Traffic Inspectors on an initial salary of Rs. 250 and Rs. 200, respectively. The European was a man of experience gained on other railways. In 1920 no such appointments were made.

(c) (i) Outsiders have only occasionally been imported to fill vacancies in the classes of posts referred to in (a) (i) in the past, but it is not intended to import outsiders in future unless very good and special reasons exist for doing so.

(ii) A larger proportion of Indians is being employed as suitable men become available.

Statement showing the number and scales of pay of Traffic Inspectors, Ghât Inspectors, etc., on the Eastern Bengal Railway.

Designation.	Total No.	Indians.	Scale of pay. *
Transportation Inspectors	5	Nil	} 300—20—500 Rs.
Traffic Inspectors	16	3	
Assistant Traffic Inspectors	Nil	...	Nil.
Train Controllers	3	1 (Offg.)	300—10—350
Assistant Train Controllers	Nil	...	Nil.
Transhipment and Glât Inspectors	9	1 A. B. Special	150—10—200 220—10—300 320—10—350
Platform Inspectors	2	Nil	200—10—300
Luggage Inspectors	2	2	160—10—280 100—10—150
Travelling Ticket Inspectors	37	17	65—5—80 80—7—150 160—10—210 450 (Sub-Officer in charge).
Goods Supervisors... ..	8	5 A. B. C.	150—10—200 300—10—400 420—20—500
Claims Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors	16	7 A. B. C.	150—10—180 200—10—280 300—20—400

SUPERIOR TRAFFIC SERVICE ON INDIAN RAILWAYS.

33. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state the number (i) of European and Anglo-Indian subordinates, and (ii) of Indian subordinates, respectively, promoted to the Superior Traffic Service on each of the following Trunk lines since the year 1905 up to date:—

- (i) North-Western, (ii) Oudh and Rohilkhand, (iii) Eastern Bengal, (iv) East Indian, (v) Bengal-Nagpur, (vi) Great Indian Peninsula, (vii) Bombay, Baroda and Central India, (viii) Madras and Southern Mahratta, and (ix) South Indian Railways?

(b) Are the Government aware that there is a good deal of discontent amongst Indian subordinates on Indian Railways generally on account of the very low percentage of Indians hitherto promoted to the Superior Traffic Service?

(c) Are the Government also aware that there is far greater discontent amongst Indian subordinates on the Eastern Bengal Railway specially on account of the fact that up to date not a single Indian on that Railway, barring one exception of an outsider who was first appointed as a Traffic Inspector, has been promoted to the Superior Traffic Establishment?

(d) Do the Government propose to press for the promotion of a larger number of qualified Indians to the Superior Traffic Establishment on all State Railways, and specially on the Eastern Bengal Railway?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) A statement giving the information asked for is placed on the table.

(b) Government are not aware of any discontent on the grounds mentioned. It may be added that recruitment from the subordinate grades is the exception not the rule, and that no one can claim such promotion as of right.

(c) and (d) No. The number of Indians in the subordinate grades of the Eastern Bengal Railway who have given evidence of their fitness for advancement to the Superior Establishment has been negligible in the past, but this does not mean that no Indians have been appointed to the Superior Traffic Department of the Eastern Bengal Railway. As a matter of fact eight young Indians of good education and some standing have been appointed as Assistant Traffic Superintendents during the last ten years, the seniors of whom are now acting as District Traffic Superintendents.

Statement showing the number of (i) European and Anglo-Indian and (ii) Indian Subordinates promoted to the Superior Traffic Service on the following Railways from 1905.

Railways.	European and Anglo-Indian.	Indian.
North-Western Railway	12	2
Oudh and Rohilkhand Railway	6	3
Eastern Bengal Railway	9	...
East Indian Railway	30	1
Bengal Nagpur Railway	4	5
Great Indian Peninsula Railway	16	2
Bombay, Baroda and Central India Railway	8	7
Madras and Southern Mahratta Railway	7	4
South Indian Railway	6	1

REST-HOUSES AT KURSEONG.

84. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: (i) Is it a fact that the Government have recently sanctioned the purchase of two rest-houses at Kurseong for the use of the convalescent officers and subordinate employees of the Eastern Bengal Railway? If so, what has been the price paid for these rest-houses?

(ii) Is it a fact that, when sanctioning the purchase of these rest-houses, the Railway Board distinctly told the Agent of the Eastern Bengal Railway that one of these should be reserved for the use of gazetted officers and the other for the use of subordinate employees?

(iii) Is it a fact that the Agent of the Eastern Bengal Railway has recently, in reply to an application from an Indian subordinate, said that the subordinates' rest-house at Kurseong is not intended for Indians?

(iv) Did the Agent issue these orders on his own responsibility or under instructions from, or with the approval of, the Government of India? If the latter, will the Government be pleased to state the reasons for issuing such instructions or according such approval? If the former, will the Government be pleased to instruct the Agent to rescind the orders?

(v) If the answer to part (ii) is in the affirmative, what action do Government propose to take against the Agent for placing an embargo on Indian subordinates in contravention of the orders of the Railway Board?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (i) The Answer to first part of the Question is in the affirmative. The cost of purchasing the houses and rendering them habitable was Rs. 46,970.

(ii) The proposal submitted to the Railway Board contemplated one rest-house for officers and another for subordinates, and this proposal was sanctioned.

(iii) In June 1920, the Agent received an application from the Chief Auditor, Eastern Bengal Railway, on behalf of three Indian clerks on duty for being accommodated in the subordinates' rest-house. This was refused because the rest-house was built for purposes of rest and convalescence and not as lodging for men on ordinary duty.

(iv) The Agent issued these orders on his own responsibility. The Government do not propose to ask the Agent to rescind these orders, as the rest-houses are meant for the recruitment of health of the staff who need it, and would not be serving their legitimate purpose, if men on duty were allowed to occupy them as ordinary quarters.

SALARIES OF STATION MASTERS, EASTERN BENGAL RAILWAY.

85. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: (i) Will the Government be pleased to state at what rates the Station Masters of Poradah, Rajbari, Kushtia, Ranaghat and Khulna on the Eastern Bengal Railway were paid their salaries when these posts were filled by European Station Masters, and what are the rates of salaries of Station Masters of those places since Indians are being employed in these posts?

(ii) Are the Government aware of the fact that the important transshipment junctions of Khulna and Serajganjghat on the Eastern Bengal Railway

are in charge of Indian Station Masters and that their management of these stations has been thoroughly efficient and satisfactory?

(iii) Do the Government propose to consider the justice and advisability of appointing a larger proportion of Indians to the higher grades of Station Masters and Assistant Station Masters on the Eastern Bengal Railway?

(iv) Are the Government aware that the guards and drivers on the East Indian, Bengal-Nagpur and Eastern Bengal Railways, who are all employed on monthly wages, are given Sunday and other holiday allowances in addition to their usual mileage allowances when they are made to work on such days? Are Indian Station Masters and Assistant Station Masters, who work on those days given such allowances? If not, why not?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (i) The present scale of pay for the Station Masters of the five stations referred to is as follows:—

	Rs.			
Poradah	130—10—170
Rajbari and Kushtia	85—5—120
Ranaghat	300—10—400
Khulna	200—10—280

It is some years since European Station Masters were posted at Poradah, Kushtia and Khulna and one year since the European Station Master at Rajbari was removed on the station losing a very considerable amount of its importance owing to the transfer of the goods working from Goalundo.

The Station Master, Ranaghat, is a European. Up to April 1913 the pay of European Station Masters was Rs. 200 per mensem and then was raised to Rs. 250. The stations referred to had no salaries fixed for the Station Master appointed thereto; he drew his grade pay. Recently, however, salaries have been fixed for these stations, and the salary is drawn irrespective of whether the holder of the appointment is an Indian or a European.

(ii) The transshipment stations of Khulna and Serajganjghat are in charge of Indian Station Masters who are giving satisfaction in the discharge of their duties.

(iii) There is nothing to prevent a larger number of Indians being appointed to the higher grades of Station Masters if and when considered suitable for advancement. Another Indian has recently been promoted to the higher grade of Station Masters.

(iv) The European and Indian Station Masters and Assistant Station Masters are not given Sunday and holiday allowances as they have only fixed hours of duty, and unlike guards and drivers are not required to be away from their headquarters on those days.

MEDICAL ATTENDANCE FOR EMPLOYEES OF EASTERN BENGAL RAILWAY.

36. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state—

(i) The number of employees of the Eastern Bengal Railway who get the advantage of being treated by the Chief and Deputy Chief Medical Officers?

(ii) The number of Medical Officers, Civil and Military Assistant Surgeons, on the Eastern Bengal Railway?

(iii) The number of beds occupied by the staff during 1919 and 1920 as indoor patients in hospitals excepting the hook-worm patients ?

(iv) The number of nurses maintained ?

(b) Will the Government be pleased to state whether there is any cook attached to the hospitals ? How is the work of cooks and nurses managed when and where the hospitals have not got any ?

(c) Will the Government be pleased to state—

(i) The number of major operations performed in the year 1920 ?

(ii) The number of Sub-Assistant Surgeons on the Eastern Bengal Railway and the number of stations and staff placed under each of them and what additional facilities are provided to them, excepting the trains, to attend urgent cases ?

(d) Will the Government be pleased to state whether patients are given ordinary diet free ? If not, what are the charges ? Is it a fact that an ordinary porter on Rs. 12 is made to pay Re. 0-4-0 to Re. 0-5-0 as his diet charge when he is in hospital without pay ?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) (i) No definite figures can be given. The Chief Medical Officer and Deputy (now District) Medical Officer render superior medical aid in cases of serious illness to all staff whenever requisitioned.

(ii) There are 11 Medical Officers, *i.e.*, six Military and five Civil Assistant Surgeons.

(iii) During 1919—836 beds.

During 1920—854 beds.

(iv) No nurses are maintained.

(b) Cooks are employed. No indoor patients are taken where there is no cook.

(c) (i) The number of Sub-Assistant Surgeons is 34. The number of stations under each Sub-Assistant Surgeon is shown in the statement laid on the table. Information as to the staff under this medical control is not available. Besides the usual Passenger and Goods trains and pilot engines, trollies and bicycles are maintained, according to requirements, to enable the Sub-Assistant Surgeons to attend urgent cases.

(ii) A statement is placed on the table.

(d) Diet is charged for at the following rates :—

Full diet	6 annas.
Half diet	4 "
Milk diet	6 "
Spoon diet	4 "

Diet is supplied free at the hospital only in cases of *bond fide* accident while on duty.

Para. (c) (ii).

Item No.	Sub-Assistant Surgeon.	Head Quarters.	No. of Station under each.
1	Travelling Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Sealdah ...	34
2	Ditto ditto ...	Naihati ...	12
3	Ditto ditto ...	Kanchrapara ...	6
4	Ditto ditto ...	Ranaghat ...	19
5	Ditto ditto ...	Poradah ...	19
6	Ditto ditto ...	Paksey ...	13
7	Ditto ditto ...	Bongong ...	18
8	Ditto ditto ...	Khulna ...	23
9	Ditto ditto ...	Krishnapur ...	19
10	Ditto ditto ...	Sara ...	13
11	Ditto ditto ...	Sirajganj ...	16
12	Resident Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Sirajganjghat ...	1
13	Travelling Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Bogra ...	12
14	Ditto ditto ...	Parbatipur ...	14
15	Ditto ditto ...	Saidpur ...	10
16	Ditto ditto ...	Kaunia ...	15
17	Ditto ditto ...	Lalmanirhat ...	17
18	Ditto ditto ...	Barsoe ...	12
19	Ditto ditto ...	Katihar ...	20
20	Resident Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Godagari ...	2
21	Travelling Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Godagari ...	15
22	Ditto ditto ...	Sorbhog ...	10
23	Ditto ditto ...	Rangiya ...	17
24	Ditto ditto ...	Cooch Behar ...	9
25	Ditto ditto ...	Jainti ...	8
26	Resident Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Santabar ...	1
27	Ditto ditto ...	Naihati ...	1
28	Ditto ditto ...	Lalmanirhat ...	1
29	Ditto ditto ...	Saidpur ...	1
30	Ditto ditto ...	Kanchrapara ...	1
31	Ditto ditto ...	Koilaghat ...	1
32	Ditto ditto ...	Calcutta
33	Rly. Sub-Assistant Surgeon ...	Calcutta
34	Sub-Assistant Surgeon, Emigration Hospital.	Amingaon ...	1

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Before I ask the Honourable Maharaja to proceed with his other questions, I would invite his attention to Standing Order No. 14 (6), and ask him to observe that Standing Order in framing questions in the future.

ACCOMMODATION FOR OFFICERS OF THE EASTERN BENGAL RAILWAY.

37. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state particulars about the nature of the accommodation of the following classes of quarters for the officers on the Eastern Bengal Railway:—

(i) Type B.; (ii) Type Z.; (iii) Special Z.?

(b) What is the average cost of each quarter of the above types?

(c) To which class of officers are generally assigned each of the above types of quarters?

(d) How many Special Z. type quarters are there on the Eastern Bengal Railway ?

(e) Is it a fact that the servants' quarters of a European officer drawing Rs. 350 a month on the Eastern Bengal Railway correspond practically to the accommodation provided for the Indian officers drawing over Rs. 250 a month ?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: A statement giving the information asked for is placed upon the table.

Statement containing the information asked for in Question No. 45 in the Admitted List No. 10-C.

(a) and (b) The particulars of accommodation and average cost of the quarters in question are:—

(i) European Type B. has 2 living rooms, areas 210 and 281½ sq. ft., respectively; 2 bed rooms, area 225 sq. ft. each; 2 bath rooms, 2 godowns and outhouses, viz., 1 kitchen, area 108 sq. ft., 2 servants' quarters area 90 sq. ft., each. Permissible cost is Rs. 15,000.

(ii) Indian Type Z. has one living room, area 110 sq. ft.; 2 bed rooms, areas 165 and 110 sq. ft., respectively; 1 godown, 1 kitchen and 2 latrines. Permissible cost is Rs. 4,550.

(iii) Indian Type Special Z. has 2 living rooms, area 150 sq. ft. each; 2 bed rooms, area 140 sq. ft. each; 1 godown, 1 kitchen, 1 servant's quarter and 2 latrines. Permissible cost is Rs. 6,500.

(c) B. Type is for the European Staff drawing Rs. 350 and over; Special Z. Type is for the Indian staff drawing over Rs. 250; and Z. Type is for the Indian staff drawing Rs. 125 to Rs. 250.

(d) The Special Z. Type was approved by Government only recently, and, so far as is known, only one such quarter has been erected.

(e) No. The area of the servants' quarters of a European Officer on Rs. 350 is much less than that of the living accommodation provided for an Indian Officer drawing over Rs. 250 a month, inasmuch as the area of the former is only 180 sq. ft. as against 580 sq. ft. of the latter.

CLOTH MANUFACTURED BY HAND-LOOMS.

38. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: Have the Government any definite figures for the last two years as to the quantity of cloth manufactured by hand-looms in the country? If so, will the Government be pleased to state them? If no definite figures are available, will the Government state approximate figures of such production for 1918, 1919 and 1920?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: No definite figures are available in regard to the quantity of cloth manufactured by hand-looms in India, nor would it be possible to obtain any reliable statistics on the point. A recent estimate, however, of the total production of cloth by hand-looms in this country, based

upon the quantity of yarn estimated as available for the hand-loom industry, gives the following figures :—

						Crores of yards.
1918-19	118
1919-20	61
1920-21	118

This estimate cannot, however, be regarded as more than approximately correct.

OPIMUM TRADE WITH CHINA.

39. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR : What has been the annual net loss of revenue to the Government of India by the stoppage of our opium trade with China, and is it open to the Government to re-open the question now ?

The HONOURABLE MR. E. M. COOK : It has been estimated that the annual net loss of revenue to India has been over £4 million sterling. The matter is one of treaty obligations and cannot now be re-opened.

TRAINING SHIP FOR INDIA.

40. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : With reference to Question* No. 52 and the Answer given to it by the Government in this Council on the 14th February last, will the Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether they have received any communication from the Secretary of State for India about a ship suitable for use as a Royal Indian Marine Training Ship for Indian ratings, including engineers, artificers, on which facilities can also be provided for the training of cadet and special ratings, such as wireless operators ;

(b) when the ship will be available for the above purposes in India ?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF : (a) The answer is in the affirmative.

(b) About the beginning of the cold weather of this year.

APPOINTMENT OF INDIANS TO THE POSTS OF SECRETARIES, DEPUTY SECRETARIES, ETC.

41. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : (a) Will the Government be pleased to state how many Indians have been appointed to the posts of (i) Secretaries, (ii) Under Secretaries, (iii) Deputy Secretaries, in the Government of India Secretariat during the last ten years ?

(b) How many Indians hold such appointments now ?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK : A statement is laid on the table giving the information.

*Vide page 39 of Volume I of Council of State Debates.

The information is given in the table below :—

Department.	INDIANS APPOINTED DURING LAST 10 YEARS AS			INDIANS AT PRESENT HOLDING POSTS OF		
	Secy.	Depty. Secy.	Under Secy.	Secy.	Depty. Secy.	Under Secy.
Home
Foreign and Political
Finance
Legislative	...	1	1	...
Revenue and Agriculture
Commerce
Industries	...	1	...	1
Public Works
Education and Health	...	1	1	...
Army
Financial Adviser, Military Finance	..	1

The following remarks are called for :—

Finance.—Indians have officiated for short periods as Deputy Secretary. The post of Under Secretary is in abeyance.

Industries.—There are no posts of Under Secretary in this Department.

Education and Health.—There are no posts of Under Secretary but Indians have officiated for short periods as Secretary and Joint Secretary.

Financial Adviser, Military Finance.—There are no actual posts bearing the designations in question, though the Financial Adviser and Deputy Financial Adviser correspond to Secretary and Deputy Secretary, respectively.

PROBATIONERS FOR THE IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

42. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : (a) How many probationerships for the Imperial Forest Service were advertised for recruitment in India last year ?

(b) How many candidates were finally selected ?

(c) How were the remaining posts filled in ?

(d) How many probationerships were advertised this year and how many candidates were finally selected ?

(e) How many of these latter were Indians?

(f) Is it a fact that persons with requisite qualifications, who joined the Provincial Service of the department before the scheme of recruitment in India came into existence, were debarred from applying?

(g) Is it a fact that, in spite of the extension of the date for sending in applications, the number of applications from candidates with requisite qualifications was comparatively small?

(h) Is it a fact that there are a number of officials in the Provincial Service of the department who possess such qualifications as would make them eligible for selection in the Imperial Forest Service and in addition are trained at the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun?

(i) Does Government propose to consider the desirability of removing technical restrictions upon such officials so as to enable them to apply for probationerships in the Imperial Forest Service or of sending them for a practical course to Europe after selection, if necessary?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : (a) 15 in India and 3 in Burma.

(b) Four.

(c) They were not filled up.

(d) No number was specified because at the time the Regulations were issued the total number of all classes to be recruited had not been decided upon. Actually, however, the number aimed at was 22 in India and four in Burma.

(e) Twenty Indians were selected.

(f) Officers already in the public service are not eligible.

(g) The number of applications received from qualified candidates by the Government of India was 41. It is impossible to say that no other qualified candidates applied to Local Governments.

(h) Officers of the Provincial Service are eligible for promotion to the Imperial Service in posts specially reserved for them, namely, 12½ per cent. of the charges to be filled by members of the Imperial Service. These promotions are made by Local Governments. The Government of India have no knowledge of the qualifications or suitability of particular members of the various Provincial Services.

(i) No.

SUKKUR BARRAGE SCHEME.

43. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : With reference to Question No. 89* and the Answer given to it by Government in this Council on 16th February last, will Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether the sanction of the Secretary of State for India to the Sukkur Barrage and Canals Project has been received by the Government;

(b) how is it proposed to finance the scheme?

* Vide page 85 of Volume I of Council of State Debates.

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA : (a) The Secretary of State has approved the Sukkur Barrage and Canals Project, but final sanction has been withheld pending receipt of the detailed proposals of the Government of Bombay as to how the scheme will be financed.

(b) The financing of the scheme is a matter which rests entirely with the Government of Bombay.

AMOUNT INCURRED IN RESPECT OF EXCHANGE.

44. The HONOURABLE SIR DINSHAW WACHA : Will the Government be pleased to inform the Council of the amount that has been annually incurred in respect of exchange, under each of the following heads, commencing from 1910-11 to 1919-20 :—

- (1) Army services, effective and non-effective, and army requirements of all kinds, including ordnance.
- (2) Civil Departments, Miscellaneous Civil Charges and Civil Public Works.
- (3) Railways.
- (4) Other heads, if any ?

The HONOURABLE MR. E. M. COOK : During the period referred to in the Question, the par rate of exchange was fifteen rupees to the pound. Compared with this rate, there was no loss but a gain. A statement, showing the amount of the gain accrued during each of the ten years referred to, under the several heads, is being sent to the Honourable Member.

COMMISSION GRANTED TO SERGEANT-MAJOR FAHEY, HYDERABAD.

45. The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : (a) Are the Government aware that Sergeant-Major Fahey was awarded a Commission and created the Cantonment Magistrate and Secretary of the Hyderabad (Sind) Cantonment ?

(b) Is it a fact that, although Mr. Fahey on the expiry of his term retired from the military service in October 1920, he continued to retain and exercise the powers of Cantonment Magistrate till December 1920 ?

(c) If not, will the Government be pleased to state who was doing the work of Cantonment Magistrate and Secretary between the dates of Mr. Fahey's retirement in October and Captain Gearing's appointment in December ?

(d) Is it a fact that, on the appointment of Captain Gearing as Cantonment Magistrate and Secretary, a new post of Cantonment "Overseer" was created with a salary of Rs. 6,000 *per annum* chargeable to the Cantonment Funds, and the said Mr. Fahey was appointed to the newly created post ?

(e) Are the Government aware that there is no such post as that of "Overseer" in other Cantonments in India, nor does any subordinate Cantonment Officer draw such a salary as is assigned to the new post created in the said Cantonment ?

(f) Are the Government aware that all the work of the Secretary, of supervising the office, attesting signatures to papers, granting land for building

construction, approving tenders for various contracts and of working on the Cantonment Committee is being done by the "Overseer" and not the Cantonment Magistrate ?

(g) Are the Government aware—

(i) that Mr. Fahey has been granted powers of a first class Magistrate, and

(ii) that Mr. Fahey does not possess any University or law degree ?

(A) Is it a fact that even after the appointment of Captain Gearing and investment of the powers of Cantonment Magistrate in him, Mr. Fahey was trying all cases although he had no power to do so ?

(i) Are the Government aware that Mr. Fahey still is virtually the Cantonment Magistrate and that popular belief in the station is that Mr. Fahey is really the Cantonment Magistrate and not Captain Gearing ?

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF : (a) Yes. Sergeant-Major Fahey was promoted 2nd-Lieutenant on the 31st December 1915. The object of granting him the commission was not, as the Question implies, to appoint him Cantonment Magistrate. He was appointed to this post, in addition to his other duties, in April 1916.

(b) The answer is in the affirmative.

(c) This question does not now arise.

(d) Yes. Lieutenant Fahey was appointed Cantonment Superintendent on Rs. 500 a month in place of the then Superintendent whose pay was Rs. 150 a month. This appointment was made on public grounds, as Lieutenant Fahey, while Cantonment Magistrate, had succeeded in largely increasing the revenue of the Cantonment and had been instrumental in bringing to light certain alleged frauds which are now under judicial inquiry. Also he had important schemes in hand for improving the financial position of the Cantonment.

(e) There are posts of Overseer and Superintendent in several other Cantonments in India. Lieutenant Fahey's salary is not considered excessive in view of the benefits derived by the Cantonment Fund and the responsible nature of his duties.

(f) It is not a fact that all the duties referred to are performed by Lieutenant Fahey. He only performs such duties as are allotted to him by the Cantonment Magistrate, whose responsibility remains unimpaired.

(g) (i) Lieutenant Fahey has been invested by the Local Government with the powers of a Magistrate of the first class.

(ii) The answer is in the affirmative.

(h) No. Lieutenant Fahey tries cases in the exercise of his first class Magisterial powers.

(i) Whatever the popular belief may be, it is not a fact that Lieutenant Fahey is virtually the Cantonment Magistrate at Hyderabad, Sind.

DIVORCE AND MARRIAGE OF HINDU WOMEN.

46. The HONOURABLE MAHAMAHOPADHYAYA DR. GANGANATH JHA : Will the Government be pleased to state—

(a) among what Hindu castes, if any, divorce and marriage of divorced women are prevalent ; and

(b) what is the number of persons belonging to those castes ?

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK : Government have no information beyond that which is available to the Honourable Member in general reference books on Hindu Law and Usage and in the Census Reports.

UP-KEEP OF SCHOOLS BY THE EASTERN BENGAL RAILWAY.

47. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR : (a) Will the Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Eastern Bengal Railway Administration pays a monthly subscription towards the up-keep of schools attended by children of European and Anglo-Indian employees, and Re. 0-8-0 only per child in the case of schools attended by children of Indian employees ?

(b) If so, will the Government be pleased to state the reasons for treating the Indian schools differentially ?

(c) Will the Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Eastern Bengal Railway Administration grants regular monthly assistance to European and Anglo-Indian employees for the education of their children in hill schools ?

(d) Will the Government be pleased to state the amount of assistance given by the Railway for each child receiving education in a hill school and quote the rules and conditions under which such assistance is given ?

(e) Will the Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the assistance referred to in (c) and (d), which was hitherto only restricted to hill schools, has now been extended to plains schools in the case of European and Anglo-Indian employees only ?

(f) Will the Government be pleased to state the number of European and Anglo-Indian employees at the end of the year 1920, who received the assistance referred to in (c) and (d) but whose children received education in plains schools ?

(g) Will the Government be pleased to state the amount of expenditure incurred out of the revenues of the Eastern Bengal Railway on account, respectively, of (i) contributions granted to Indian schools, (ii) contributions granted to European schools, and (iii) schools assistance granted to European and Anglo-Indian employees during each of the following years :—1915-16, 1916-17, 1917-18, 1918-19, and 1919-20.

(h) Will the Government be pleased to state the reasons why Indian employees are treated differentially in this respect ?

(i) Are the Government aware that considerable discontent is prevalent amongst the Indian staff on account of these distinctions ?

(j) Will the Government be pleased to have the existing distinctions removed ?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI : (a) and (b) The Eastern Bengal Railway grants pecuniary assistance for educational purposes to all classes of

its subordinate employees. As regards day schools, the assistance takes the form of a lump-sum monthly grant or a capitation grant, usually the latter. The fees of European schools are higher than those of Indian schools and in consequence the capitation grant is higher in their case. The grant for Europeans is generally Rs. 2 per child per month, and for Indians annas eight per child per month which it is believed, in proportion to the expense of running, the different schools constitutes greater relative assistance than in the case of European schools.

(c) and (d) The Eastern Bengal Railway, like other railway administrations, encourages its employees to send their children to boarding schools in the hills. There are practically no schools of this class for Indian children, and the Indian subordinates ordinarily prefer to keep their children in the plains and let them attend a day school. The case of hill schools is, therefore, special. The amount of assistance given is detailed in the copy of the rules placed on the table. The rate varies with the rates of school fees paid.

(e) Where owing to medical reasons or exceptional circumstances, an employee sends a child to an approved boarding school in the plains instead of in the hills, assistance on the scale referred to may be allowed at the discretion of the Agent of the Railway.

(f) and (g) The information has been called for from the Eastern Bengal Railway but is not ready yet. It will be furnished to the Honourable Member when received.

(h) This is explained in the reply to (a) and (b).

(i) and (j) Government are not aware that any discontent prevails. No representation has been received from the Eastern Bengal Railway, or from either of the other State Railways as to the inadequacy of the assistance granted to Indians in the matter of the education of their children. Railway administrations are fully alive to the advantage of assisting in the education of their employees' children, in accordance with the requirements of the various classes, who, as they grow up, form a large proportion of their recruits, and Government do not consider it desirable to interfere.

Extract from the "Weekly Gazette", No. 47, dated 23rd November, 1919.

Improved Assistance for Education at Hill Schools.

The fees at Hill schools vary from about Rs. 30 to 60 per month, and the shares of fees to be borne by parents is required to vary accordingly, being less for the cheaper schools and more for the more expensive schools.

2. The following items are assistable :—

- Board and tuition.
- Use of books—stationery.
- Games—library—use of gymnasium.
- Medical attendance and medicines.
- Washing.

All other items, such as, repairs to boots and clothes and special subjects like dancing and music, are not assistable, and the fees for these must be borne entirely by the parents.

3. The parent's share of the fees for assistable items shall be the actual fees subject to the following items :—

Board and Tuition Fees.

	Class A. (Rs. 39 and below.)	Class B. (Rs. 40 to Rs. 49.)	Class C. (Rs. 50 and over.)
One child	7½ per cent. of salary.	7½ per cent. plus Rs. 5.	7½ per cent. plus Rs. 10.
Two children	12½ per cent. of salary.	12½ per cent. plus Rs. 9.	12½ per cent. plus Rs. 18.
Three children or more	15 per cent. of salary.	15 per cent. plus Rs. 12.	15 per cent. plus Rs. 24.

Note.—Salary for the purposes of this ruling does not include "allowances" of any description.

So far as is known to this office, the above-mentioned schools belong to the various classes as follows :—

- Class A.—Victoria, Dow Hill, Goethal's Memorial, St. Helen's Convent, Pine Mount.
- Class B. - Diocesan High School, St. Joseph's, St. Edmund's, Loreto Convents, Shillong and Darjeeling.
- Class C.—St. Paul's.

4. In the case of parents having children at several High Schools :—

- (i) The percentage of salary will be based solely on the total number of children at school and will be independent of the number of schools attended.
- (ii) The amount of surcharge will depend on the number of children at each class of school, independent of the number of schools attended, the more expensive schools being taken first. The following examples will make this clear :—
 - (a) One boy and one girl at separate 'B' class school. Total surcharge Rs. 9.
 - (b) One boy at 'C' class and girl at 'B' class school Surcharge for first is Rs. 10 and for second is Rs. 4 (Rs. 9 minus Rs. 5) Total Rs. 14.
 - (c) Two boys at 'C' class and two girls at 'B' class schools Surcharge for two boys is Rs. 18 and for two girls is Rs. 3 (Rs. 12 minus Rs. 9)—Total Rs. 21.

5. These revised rules take effect from 1st January 1920. The scheme is only applicable to subordinates.

Extract from "Weekly Gazette" No. 3, dated 18th January, 1920.

In continuation of Notification No. 1351 of *Weekly Gazette* No. 47 of 23rd November 1919, the staff are informed that assistance will be afforded in the case of other Hill schools only when the accommodation in the approved Hill schools is not available, or under special circumstances. In such cases separate applications must be submitted through District Officers and Heads of Departments to the Agent with full reasons as to the necessity for sending children to other Hill schools.

No assistance will be given for education in European schools in the plains except in cases where it is shown there is no accommodation available in Hill schools or when there are

medical reasons or exceptional circumstances preventing the applicant from sending a child to the hills. In these cases applications for assistance with full particulars must be submitted through District Officers and Heads of Departments to the Agent. Assistance will be given in very special cases and only when children are sent as Boarders away from the stations at which their parents are employed.

For purposes of this rule, the staff at Chitpore, Narculdanga and Seallah will be considered as being employed in Calcutta.

Employees who wish to send their children to the schools listed in Notification No. 1351 above referred to may do so without any further sanction from the Agent. They must, however, advise the Chief Auditor through their District Officers at the beginning of each year of the names and relationship of such children. The Chief Auditor will prepare bills in accordance with paragraph 6 of Notification No. 1351 of *Weekly Gazette* No. 47 of 23rd November, 1919.

In the case of other schools, application for sanction must be made to the Agent through District Officers and Heads of Departments annually at the beginning of each year.

An advance of one month's pay recoverable in ten equal monthly instalments will also be made by the Chief Auditor on application to him at the beginning of each year towards the purchasing of outfit for children attending the schools listed in Notification No. 1351. In all other cases application must be made to the Agent through the District Officers and Heads of Departments.

PRODUCTION, IMPORT AND EXPORT OF COTTON.

48. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY, OF KASIMBAZAR: Will the Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement for each year from 1917 to 1920, showing:—

- (a) the total quantity of raw cotton produced in India;
- (b) the total quantity of raw cotton imported into India;
- (c) the total quantity of raw cotton exported from India;
- (d) the total quantity of twist and yarn manufactured in the various Indian mills of the following description of counts:—
 - (1) Nos. 1—25,
 - (2) Nos. 25—40,
 - (3) Nos. from 40—upwards;
- (e) the total quantity of twist and yarn of each variety imported into India;
- (f) the total quantity of each variety exported from India;
- (g) the total quantity of grey and bleached piece-goods manufactured in Indian mills—
 - (1) up to 40 counts,
 - (2) from 40 counts upwards;
- (h) the total quantity of each variety imported into India;
- (i) the total quantity of each variety exported from India?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: The Honourable Member will find information regarding imports and exports of the commodities he mentions in

the "Annual Statement of the Seaborne Trade of British India with the British Empire and Foreign countries" by the Department of Statistics. Statistics of the production of cotton in India and of manufactured cotton goods in the various Indian Mills are published in the "Estimates of Area and Yield of Principal Crops in India" and the monthly statistics of "Cotton Spinning and Weaving in Indian Mills", respectively. These publications are available in the Library.

RAILWAY TRUCKS, ETC., SENT TO MESOPOTAMIA, EGYPT, ETC.

49. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA BAHADUR KESHAVA PRASAD SINGH, OF DUMRAON: (a) Is it a fact that the Government of India in war time sent Railway trucks, rolling-stock and plant to Mesopotamia, Egypt, East Africa, Aden and the Persian Gulf?

(b) What has happened to them after the war?

(c) Has the Government of India got them back to India?

The HONOURABLE MR. SHAFI: (a) Rolling-stock and other railway material were supplied to Mesopotamia and other theatres of war. Particulars of the rolling-stock and rails supplied were given in the answer to Question No.* 119 put by the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj on the 16th February 1921.

(b) and (c) 45 engines and 93 wagons have been returned to India. The balance is understood to be unfit for return and has, or will be, paid for as a charge against the war.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF IRRIGATION COMMISSION OF 1901.

50. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA BAHADUR KESHAVA PRASAD SINGH, OF DUMRAON: (a) Is it a fact that the Irrigation Commission of 1901 recommended a total expenditure of 44 crores of rupees for irrigation in twenty years beginning from April 1905?

(b) Will the Government be pleased to state the total amount of actual expenditure on construction of irrigation work, province by province, since April 1905?

(c) How much of this has been allotted to Bihar and Orissa irrigation works, and what proportion does it bear to the amount allotted to the other Provinces?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA: (a) The reply is in the affirmative, as far as capital expenditure is concerned, and a matter of Rs. 30 crores odd have been so expended during the 15 years—1905-06 to 1919-20.

(b) and (c) A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the Reply to the Question in the Council of State, by the Honourable Maharaja Bahadur Keshava Prasad Singh of Dumraon regarding expenditure incurred on irrigation works since 1906.

Statement showing the total direct capital expenditure on construction of irrigation works in India from 1905-06 to 1919-20.

Year.	Madras.		Bombay.		Bengal.		United Provinces		Punjab.		Burma.		Bihar and Orissa.		Central Provinces.		North-West Frontier Province.		Rajputana.		Baluchistan.		Total.	
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1905-06	...	18,68,596	7,75,029	11,05,344	30,61,057	45,46,918	13,07,633	5,50,436	4,93,211	74,894	10,828	1,87,66,785										
1906-07	...	24,69,512	7,95,966	11,88,157	36,43,843	72,88,678	12,76,074	7,55,096	4,78,373	89,735	59,019	1,79,01,577										
1907-08	...	16,05,131	15,37,815	12,50,380	38,94,952	89,64,531	11,75,858	10,79,161	6,20,333	59,033	28,991	1,93,76,630										
1908-09	...	13,83,871	21,76,437	12,46,284	24,75,721	1,02,37,971	16,16,944	14,34,997	18,13,980	7,289	2,34,163	2,51,49,196										
1909-10	...	11,87,545	28,44,404	18,48,301	19,84,273	1,10,56,057	12,24,280	14,18,129	16,81,198	6,031	2,44,874	2,34,95,692										
1910-11	...	9,85,308	25,24,237	12,25,116	21,21,137	1,26,63,781	12,15,875	10,06,824	21,45,656	25,418	3,26,315	2,43,19,217										
1911-12	...	5,85,667	27,82,348	11,17,102	20,61,315	1,60,44,267	20,01,044	18,62,690	30,38,142	841	2,44,621	2,97,39,437										
1912-13	...	7,66,827	29,22,328	1,02,158	22,17,210	1,22,26,643	26,54,375	7,61,071	26,62,237	30,58,256	7,909	2,63,950	2,62,83,014											
1913-14	...	9,33,661	44,85,950	2,07,418	28,78,936	99,17,267	19,35,321	7,90,236	44,54,283	34,63,326	-7,163	3,20,108	2,63,69,373											
1914-15	...	14,21,593	50,26,456	7,10,613	28,30,626	75,55,469	17,60,954	3,28,527	51,15,374	26,35,097	5,343	1,85,863	2,73,75,914											
1915-16	...	14,45,700	42,79,714	3,20,770	26,61,032	46,64,241	28,56,814	85,705	46,77,611	13,96,430	178	1,74,865	2,27,62,530											
1916-17	...	10,94,996	27,71,936	7,11,709	16,50,263	34,55,730	5,62,949	1,26,142	25,73,707	9,32,138	798	2,11,908	1,40,92,263											
1917-18	...	10,89,789	27,47,218	8,41,762	13,38,378	26,09,605	-23,746	1,15,790	30,16,673	6,32,773	1,101	91,008	1,19,76,351											
1918-19	...	12,23,511	25,23,530	3,97,345	11,00,009	11,59,967	6,02,078	1,45,286	26,35,854	8,695	12,430	1,27,133	99,41,868											
1919-20	...	10,40,335	37,92,710	7,04,969	10,06,216	-1,19,783	4,09,633	1,48,041	23,95,378	3,73,244	16,727	94,718	98,68,638											

GRAND TRUNK ROAD.

51. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA BAHADUR KESHAVA PRASAD SINGH, OF DUMRAON: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state if any terms or conditions have been laid down for the maintenance of the Grand Trunk Road?

(b) As a result of the constitutional reforms, have the Local Governments concerned been relieved of the responsibility to maintain this road in a condition suitable for heavy transport?

(c) Are the Government aware that near Barli (in Hazaribagh District) on the Grand Trunk Road there is a bridge which will only allow a vehicle weighing not more than three tons and that this is causing great inconvenience to traffic and transport?

(d) Will the Government be pleased to order an inquiry as to the weight-carrying capacity of bridges on the road in view of probable developments of motor transport?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA: (a) The Grand Trunk Road, except in Delhi and the North-West Frontier Province, is under the control of the respective Provincial Governments in the provinces through which the road passes, and no terms or condition have been laid down by the Government of India in respect to its maintenance.

(b) The position is that, subject to such conditions as regards control over construction and maintenance of means of communication declared by the Governor General in Council to be of military importance, Provincial Governments now have full discretion regarding the standard of maintenance for the Grand Trunk Road and all roads under their control.

(c) The Government of India have no information on the subject. The question is one of provincial concern.

(d) The Government of India consider that the importance of the Grand Trunk Road in respect to provincial and inter-provincial communications and the improvements necessary for the development of motor transport are matters for the consideration of the Provincial Governments concerned in consultation with the military authorities, and do not therefore propose to order an inquiry as suggested by the Honourable Member.

EMIGRANTS ABROAD.

52. The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA BAHADUR KESHAVA PRASAD SINGH, OF DUMRAON: (a) Will the Government be pleased to state the present total number of emigrants abroad, province by province?

(b) Will the Government be pleased to state the total number of emigrants, province by province and year by year, for the last twenty years?

The HONOURABLE MR. B. N. SARMA: (a) A statement showing, as far as possible, the number of Indians resident in British Colonies and Dominions is placed on the table. Figures are not available to show from what Indian provinces they originated, or what percentage of them are emigrants under the Emigration Act.

(b) I would refer the Honourable Member to Volume IV of the Statistics of British India (Table 55) which contains the information which he requires. A statement summarising the information for the Honourable Member's convenience is placed on the table.

Statement showing the number of Indians resident in British Colonies and Dominions.

Colony.	Indian population.	Date.
Ceylon	440,000 (approx- imately).	Present day.
Straits Settlements	80,430	1911 Census.
Malay States	185,958	1911 Census.
Hong Kong	2,555	1911 Census.
Mauritius	238,251	1911 Cen sus.
Seychelles	332	1911 Census.
Wehaiwei	3	1911 Census.
Gibraltar	50 (approxi- mately).	Present day.
Nigeria	100 „	Present day.
Kenya	12,613	1916.
Uganda	3,518	1918.
Zanzibar	10,000	1919.
Nyasaland	407	1918.
Tanganyika Territory	10,500 (approxi- mately).	Present day.
Jamaica	19,104	1920.
Trinidad	129,756	1919
British Guiana	134,785	1918.
Fiji	62,640	1919.
Basutoland	179	1911 Census.
Swaziland	7	1911 Census.
N. Rhodesia	39	1911 Census.
S. Rhodesia	701	1911 Census.
Surinam	2,413	1918.
Canada	5,000 (approxi- mately).	1918.
Australia	4,103 (including Cingalese).	1911.
New Zealand	509 (approxi- mately).	1918.
Natal	135,515	1919.
Transvaal	10,072	1911 Census.
Cape Colony	6,924	1911 Census.

Statement showing the number of emigrants, and the districts from which they were drawn.

Years.			Bengal and Bihar and Orissa.	United Provinces.	Madras.	Bombay.	Sind.	Punjab.	Other Provinces.	Native States.
1900-01	634	8,675	6,919	220	43	7,233	1,224	1,560
1901-02	1,472	7,828	10,113	2	..	2	2,289	792
1902-03	1,060	5,813	4,962	27	6	163	2,127	1,255
1903-04	568	5,552	4,235	..	2	18	2,162	1,128
1904-05	500	4,950	8,788	8	59	68	843	723
1905-06	600	8,326	9,300	41	24	428	831	1,576
1906-07	836	9,344	7,725	13	11	808	654	1,612
1907-08	379	7,998	5,754	49	82	352	148	355
1908-09	515	8,777	1,911	28	18	64	150	381
1909-10	714	7,286	2,847	34	78	39	154	492
1910-11	559	7,181	6,211	63	195	183	461	586
1911-12	575	6,951	4,486	39	314	422	630	775
1912-13	644	6,405	3,149	106	92	337	1,077	848
1913-14	477	4,601	1,096	135	109	294	397	624
1914-15	81	1,740	655	111	192	256	48	202
1915-16	241	3,455	2,608	441	216	178	162	329
1916-17	306	2,445	1,848	1,748	423	524	206	182

NOTE.—Emigration was stopped in March 1917 under rule 16-B of the Defence of India (Consolidation) Rules, 1915.

MOTION FOR ADJOURNMENT.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Before we proceed to the business of the day, I will remind Honourable Members that I have already read to the Council an application for leave to move the adjournment of the House standing in the name of the Honourable Mr. Khaparde. The Honourable Mr. Khaparde has seen me informally before the meeting, and I understand he desires to make a statement with reference to that application.

The HONOURABLE MR. G. S. KHAPARDE: Sir, in view of the observations made in the speech from the Throne and the circumstance that Sir Thomas Holland is not in the House, I do not wish to press the motion.

[The President.]

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The application by the Honourable Member for leave to make a motion for the adjournment is withdrawn.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: I have an application from another Honourable Member for leave to move the adjournment on another matter. It is from the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj. The notice runs as follows:—

'I beg to inform you that when the Council of State meets on the 5th instant, I propose, with reference to the Standing Order No. 21 to ask the leave of the President to make a motion for the adjournment of the business of the Council for the purpose of discussing a definite matter of urgent public importance, namely, the state of affairs in Malabar and the details of the Moplah outbreak.'

That application is in order, but before we proceed on it I should also like to say that I have also received another notice much in the same terms from the Honourable Mr. Annamalai Chettiyar. The Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj's notice was received by me first, and, therefore, he has the right to priority. The motion being in order, it remains for me to ascertain if the Honourable Member has the necessary support. I would invite those Members who support the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj's application for leave to move the adjournment of the House to rise in their places.

Several Honourable Members rose in their places.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The Honourable Member has the necessary support. Honourable Members will kindly resume their seats.

Under the Standing Order such motions are normally to be taken at 4 o'clock. I am unaware whether Government have any application to make on that matter.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: I venture to ask if it would not be to the convenience of the Council if, with your permission, Sir, a slight departure could be made from the Standing Order and the motion taken at 3 o'clock instead of at 4. That would enable the Honourable Government Member, who would ordinarily reply, to be present. He will be elsewhere at 4 o'clock.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The object of the rule requiring the postponement of a debate till 4 o'clock is to secure some notice to the Government. Since the Government are prepared to dispense with the full notice, I see no reason why, if the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj has no objection and the Council generally has no objection, the application should not be granted.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOJ: I am agreeable to the suggestion.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: I think that is the general sense of the Council. The debate will, therefore, take place at 3 o'clock and will terminate, if it runs its full length, at 5 o'clock instead of at 6 o'clock. I trust that meets with the wishes of Honourable Members.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: We will now pass on to the business of the day which consists of Resolutions. I call upon the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj to move the Resolution which stands in his name.

RESOLUTION *RE* ADDRESS OF WELCOME TO HIS ROYAL HIGHNESS THE PRINCE OF WALES.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOJ: Sir, before I move my Resolution I ask your leave to make a slight verbal alteration in my Resolution.

I propose to insert the words "and invites the co-operation of the Legislative Assembly in constituting a committee of the Indian Legislature to draft a suitable address for the purpose" in substitution of the original phraseology. It is merely a verbal alteration. Have I your leave?

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: I understand that the alteration is purely verbal, but I would ask the Honourable Member to read the Resolution as amended to the Council when moving it.

The HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY: Mr. President, I beg to propose the following Resolution:—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that he may be pleased to convey to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales its humble request that he may be graciously pleased to accept a loyal and dutiful address of welcome from the Indian Legislature, and invites the co-operation of the Legislative Assembly in constituting a committee of the Indian Legislature to draft a suitable address for the purpose.'

Mr. President, if there be one Resolution which this Council will accept readily, with enthusiasm and with the united voice of all the members, it is the one which I have just read. No lengthened observations or persuasion from me are necessary to commend this Resolution to the acceptance of Honourable Members. My task to-day is greatly simplified by the observations made by His Excellency the Viceroy in this connection on Saturday last. The weighty and eloquent sentiments to which His Excellency then gave expression in this connection are still ringing in our ears, and I have no doubt that they will be received with approbation and satisfaction throughout the length and breadth of India. I do not propose to go over the same ground which His Excellency covered with such consummate dexterity. In requesting His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales to accept a loyal and dutiful address of welcome from the Indian Legislature, they are not only honouring themselves, but primarily discharging a duty which all the members owe to themselves and to the great Indian Empire whose representatives they are. His Royal Highness comes out to India as the representative of our Sovereign who rules over a great and mighty Empire,—mighty not only in the sense of its area and population over which it wields its sceptre, but mighty in the traditions on which it is founded, the principles of liberty, justice, equality and truth. It is a matter of common knowledge that His Imperial Majesty is sending out the Prince to India early in life to make a personal acquaintance with the people and to acquire an intimate knowledge of the country and of the many important problems affecting the welfare of the people. His Imperial Majesty has thus given one further proof of his deep attachment and abiding interest in the welfare of our country, and therefore, as loyal citizens, we are bound to accord to the Prince a most enthusiastic, splendid and glorious welcome. There is another aspect of the case. Indians are by sentiment, tradition and religion devoted to the monarchical form of government. From the very beginning of our history we have been taught to respect the King and his family, and to look upon him as the fountain-head of justice. We are taught to take all our troubles to the King and expect redress from him. The inauguration of the constitutional régime in India during the present reign adds another claim to the homage and affection that we all owe to the King-Emperor. Constitutionalism in India has come to us in a different form, but after all it is not a new institution. Therefore, to the son and heir of our Sovereign Lord the King we shall extend a most loyal welcome. Indians of all

[Sir Maneckji Dadabhoy.]

raees and creeds will unite in according him a most loyal homage. In proposing this Resolution I am not unmindful of the opposition raised in certain quarters against our welcoming and entertaining the Prince. I have seen it to my regret opinions expressed by some leaders of a certain school of thought that the Prince is coming out to India to represent a system of bureaucracy with which the people are not in sympathy, and that therefore no welcome should be given to him. I make myself bold to say that the Prince or the King represents no system of government, Our King is a Constitutional Monarch, and the Prince will follow in the footsteps of his great line of ancestors. I quite concede that we have our differences with Government, that we have our quarrels with the bureaucracy; we shall settle our quarrels and differences in the forum of the Council, but we shall not permit these differences to interfere with the demonstration of our loyalty and in the expression of our gratitude to our future Sovereign. I now have the honour of moving this Resolution, and I have not the slightest doubt that this Council will unanimously accept it. There is a similar Resolution being proposed in the other Assembly to-day, and therefore I shall not mention to-day the names of members who are to serve on this Committee. I shall await the result of the motion in that House, and later on request the President to give me permission to propose the names of members whom I propose to appoint on the committee. With these words, Mr. President, I beg to move my Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE RAJA SIR HARNAM SINGH: Sir, I have great pleasure in giving my support to the Resolution moved by my Honourable friend Sir Maneckji Dadabhoy. His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales has recently made a very successful tour through many parts of His Majesty's Dominions, and it is in the fitness of things that he should visit the largest and most important of the King-Emperor's Possessions beyond the seas. I trust that the traditional hospitality of the people of India will make the Prince's visit to this country one of interest and pleasure to him. His Royal Highness will have ample opportunity not only of seeing representative Indians and places of historic interest, but will be able to study the currents of new thoughts and ideas which have affected India in recent years. I may remind the Council that it was the famous speech of His Majesty the present King-Emperor at the Guildhall with its message of sympathy and hope after his visit to this country as Prince of Wales that assisted in the introduction of the Morley-Minto Reforms. I hope and believe that His Royal Highness' coming visit will also bring about a closer understanding between England and this country, and that before long India will have made another advance in the direction of full responsible government.

In support of the Resolution I wish to associate the Indian Christian Community which I have the honour to represent in this Council, and to offer His Royal Highness on behalf of this Community a hearty and respectful welcome to this land.

THE HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA NANDY: Sir, I have much pleasure in supporting the Resolution which has been moved by my Honourable friend, Sir Maneckji Dadabhoy, to give an address of welcome to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales. The Indians are a loyal people, and it is desirable that, when His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales visits India, we should present an address to him, if only to express

how deeply attached we are to the British Throne. His Royal Highness is our future Sovereign, and when he does come, and visits all parts of India, he will know the conditions under which we live. Seeing our condition now—the condition of his Indian subjects—he will remember it when he comes to the Throne and make a very successful Sovereign. With these few remarks, I heartily support the Resolution.

The HONOURABLE COLONEL SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN : Sir, this is a Resolution upon which we all agree, no sane man would think differently. There may be certain lunatics in the country who have no patriotism and who will not welcome His Royal Highness to this country, but every one of us agrees that it is our duty to accord to His Royal Highness such a welcome as is befitting to him. It is only our gracious Sovereign who has kept together all the parts of the Empire to which we have the honour to belong, and who has pulled us through the greatest war ever known in the history of the world.

His Royal Highness is coming here after seeing many other countries where he has been splendidly received, and if India does not fulfil her grand traditions, it will not be right and proper because it will be our duty to present him with an address when he visits the country and sees our Legislatures.

It is the Sovereign who has kept all the various castes and creeds together in this country. We have had an Utopian idea of being a nation, but that idea has never been realised. There is a chance that under the British Crown we may realise it, and it is for this reason that we should strengthen the string which is keeping us together like a string of beads, because if we do not, we shall break the string and be thrown all over the place so as never to get together. With these few observations, Sir, I lend my cordial support to the Resolution.

The HONOURABLE SIR B. C. MITTER : Mr. President, I have much pleasure in supporting the Resolution which has been moved. Originally I intended to lend my silent support, but example is catching and I rise to say a few words.

Sir I feel confident that by instinct, by tradition, by our religious teachings, and by the great love and affection which we feel towards our beloved Sovereign, we are all anxious to accord to his Royal Highness a most cordial and rousing welcome. If that is so, and I do not doubt that it is so, which is the body which ought to approach first? surely the Indian Legislature consisting of this House and the Assembly, because they represent the Indian nation and are its accredited agents to voice its sentiments. Therefore, I congratulate the Mover in bringing his Resolution before this House.

With these few words on behalf of the Constituency which I have the honour to represent, I give this Resolution my most cordial support.

The HONOURABLE MR. ANNAMALAI CHETTIYAR : Sir, I beg to associate myself with all that has been said by my Honourable friend Sir Maneckji Dadabhoy and by other Honourable Members. The House needs no persuasion from me for the acceptance of this Resolution. No more loyal people can be found than we, the people of India, and therefore it is right and proper that we should offer a most hearty and spontaneous welcome to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales. With these few words I heartily support the Resolution.

[Sir Alexander Murray.]

The HONOURABLE SIR ALEXANDER MURRAY: Sir, I rise with much pleasure to endorse the sentiments so eloquently expressed by the Honourable Mover of this Resolution.

I need not enlarge on the many qualities that go to make the Prince of Wales such a favourite. Previous speakers have referred to the fact that the Prince has been visiting other parts of the Empire. And having had the honour of meeting His Royal Highness during one of these Empire tours, I would like to tell the House something of the manner in which the Prince was received in another part of the world.

As one of India's delegates at the International Labour Conference held in America nearly two years ago, I was present in the Capital of the United States when the Prince of Wales paid a visit to that City. The representatives of Canada at the conference had just previously met His Royal Highness during his Canadian tour. Amongst them were representatives of Capital and of Labour, Conservatives and Liberals, whose points of view on matters industrial, commercial and political were very wide apart. Yet where the young Prince was concerned they were all of one mind. Over and over again did I hear them give expression to the feelings of regard and affection which they entertained for the Prince as the result of their personal contact with him.

Representatives, too, of other countries outside the British Empire did not hesitate to voice their opinions of the invaluable asset which they consider the Empire possesses in the person of the heir to the throne. These opinions were expressed not only by the democrats and the republicans of the great country which the Prince was then visiting, but also by representatives of South American, Continental and Eastern Countries holding all shades of opinions on matters political and otherwise.

I feel certain, Sir, that where a welcome to the Prince of Wales is concerned, we shall forget all differences of opinion and with one voice, as members of the newest Legislature in the great Empire to which it is our privilege to belong, we shall extend to His Royal Highness a hearty and enthusiastic welcome.

The HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH: Sir, it is right that we should welcome the Prince to our hearts for his own sake and as the son of the Monarch who of all others has endeavoured to communicate his love of India in all parts of the Empire. The power of bringing diverse people into sympathy is surely the most king-like of all qualities.

It is right that we should come forward representing the millions of India and in their name assure His Royal Highness of our loyal support and affection, in which we and the people we represent hold the Royal House of England. The great grandson of the Empress Victoria who is enthroned in the hearts of the people surely deserves a warm welcome from his people. At a time like the present when the world of thought is as much disturbed as the world of action, which but reflects the absence of a common dominating ideal, our choice certainly lies in our devotion to the Crown or Chaos. In the East the ideal King is he, who is most God-like in his relation with his people, and even to day the King is the symbol and the sign of Imperial unity, and his greatness has ensued from service and sacrifice. Indeed the proof of our professions, that we wish to grow into equal partnership in the Empire, is our

unbroken devotion to the Emperor in whose person Imperial unity is realised. He is the sign and symbol of the Empire over and above hereditary princes, and modern democracies, linking them into a growing brotherhood to carry out great and common interests. He brings with him the greatest of all qualities, the quality of understanding and true sympathy, and love of the Empire, to which his father when he visited India gave such an expression. I remember in Delhi, when the Great Darbar was held, how on the first day the King marched in procession unnoticed by the crowd that hungered for his sight, and the next day he walked into the Polo ground and the crowd surrounded him. Indeed he had won perfect confidence, and he trusted his people and showed himself as their King-Emperor. That was the day of days. How can we turn away our faces and refuse to welcome His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales? This perhaps is the greatest political blunder made by Mr. Gandhi, and perhaps it is a blunder which he will admit at no remote date. We may look forward to find in his person a Prince who loves his people, and the same charm of manner, the same understanding, the same desire to promote commonweal and a sense of comradeship between his people of various races and creeds which animates our Emperor, and which in his turn he inherited from King Edward and the great Queen Empress whose memory is cherished in every remote village.

THE HONOURABLE MR. A. H. FROMM : Sir, it is already self-evident that this Resolution, which has been so ably moved by the Honourable Sir Maneekji Dadabhoj, will commend itself to this Council and be received with unbounded approval. I find it somewhat difficult to say anything further without repeating what has already been said by the other Honourable Members of this Council, but I feel that I should be failing in my duty to those in Bombay who sent me here if I did not add on their behalf an expression of entire approval of this Resolution. Bombay is fortunately situated inasmuch as she will be the first to extend to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales the warm hand of welcome to India, and I can assure the Honourable Members of this Council that the rejoicings of Bombay will be unbounded and will not be exceeded in any other City or Presidency in this Empire.

There is one point, Sir, which has already been referred to by the Honourable Mover, and that is, I should like to draw the attention of the Members of this Council to the remarks uttered by His Excellency the Viceroy when addressing us together with the Members of the Legislative Assembly the other day, remarks which, I think, we should carry prominently before us and should repeat to the people who have elected us to this Council. I refer to what His Excellency said as to the visit of His Royal Highness to this country being in no way associated with politics. How glad we shall all be to drop politics on the great occasion. His Royal Highness is coming to India to make himself known to the Ruling Princes and the people of this country, and the welcome of the Indian Legislature to one, who has already so endeared himself to the peoples of the other parts of the Empire, will, I feel sure, be wholeheartedly sincere, unstinted, and unboundedly enthusiastic. With these words, Sir, I heartily support the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE SIR DINSHAW WACHA : Sir, I also, as representing Bombay, beg cordially to support the Resolution proposed by the Honourable Mover. I think it is our bounden duty as the Indian Legislature that we should give a hearty welcome to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales

[Sir Dinshaw Wacha.]

when he arrives here. Bombay, as the Honourable Mr. Froom has already said, is, by its geographical position, the very first City in India on which the Royal foot is always planted. Three Princes of Wales during the last 46 years have arrived in the first place in Bombay. King Edward came as Prince of Wales in 1875. Then came King George as Prince of Wales in 1904, and now we shall have the greatest pleasure of receiving the present beloved Prince of Wales. In 1889, the son of King Edward (who, of course, was then the Heir Apparent as the Prince of Wales), the late Duke of Clarence, came. Bombay, Sir, in all its respective welcome to these Princes and at all periods, has surpassed with loyal pride, if I may say so, all the other Cities of the Empire which each visited. I vividly remember, Sir, how the Prince of Wales, the first future ruler to be of the Royal House of Victoria, was received at Bombay and the unbounded enthusiasm that prevailed. Thousands and thousands of people, men, women and children, came to see the son of the Great Queen, and at the same time they thronged together to see his bright, genial and Kingly face. The Princes of Wales, whenever they have come, have received in Bombay a very warm welcome and a very grand reception. As a member of the present Executive Committee of Bombay to welcome Prince Edward, I may say, from my own personal knowledge, that the Committee are doing all that they can and are making every effort to see how they can give the warmest reception to the Prince. Of course, Sir, all the other Cities of the Empire which His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales will visit will be equally enthusiastic and hearty in their reception, and I believe, Sir, also that, whatever other people may say, there will be unanimity in all India without distinction of religion, race or creed, in giving a warm reception to His Royal Highness, who will no doubt win their heart and affection.

The HONOURABLE LALA SUKHBIR SINHA : Sir, with great pleasure I rise to give my support to this Resolution. It is the sacred duty of all the Indians and especially of the Hindus, to give a hearty welcome to the Prince of Wales, because in our sacred books it is laid down that we cannot live in this world without a King or without a Ruler. When *Brahma* created the world the saints asked him under whose control they would be, and He said that He would create a Raja or Ruler, and He created a Ruler. Therefore, according to our sacred books, we are bound to give our whole-hearted welcome to our King and all the members of the Royal Family. There may be some difference of opinion about the political rights and privileges of the people, but I think they should not stand in the way of our giving a befitting welcome to the Prince of Wales. With these few words, Sir, I support this Resolution on behalf of the Constituency that I have the honour to represent in this Council.

The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : Sir, coming from that great community, the Mussulmans of India, whose loyalty I may say has at the present juncture been tried sorely owing to a certain policy, I feel, that at this moment I would not be doing my duty if I fail to support this proposition. Though, Sir, as I said, the Mussulman community has been sorely tried on account of certain reasons which I will not now go into, we, Mussulmans of India, are yet loyal to the Throne, which we consider is above all controversy. Whatever differences we may have with the Government of this country or with the Government in England, this proposition is above all controversies. I believe my community and the vast majority of my countrymen certainly

realised and certainly endorse that view. That is why I do not like to give a silent vote. I, therefore, heartily support the Resolution on behalf of the Mussulmans.

The HONOURABLE LALA RAM SARAN DAS : Sir, I heartily associate myself with the Resolution moved by my friend the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj. Devotion to the Crown and loyalty to the Throne have always been traditional characteristics of the people in this country. In India the people have never been known to have failed in showing proper respect and devotion to the Royal Family. Hence as an august representative of His Imperial Majesty the King-Emperor, His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales is sure to receive a hearty and cordial welcome at the hands of all Indians. The Royal Family, as is well known, is above politics, and all classes of people in this country whatever political views they may hold, will certainly accord a right royal and enthusiastic welcome to the Prince. The Prince of Wales, the messenger of peace and good-will as he should rightly be called, has been successful in strengthening the bonds of affection and true comradeship between England and the self-governing dominions. Shall not the relations between India and the other members of this great British commonwealth be also put on the same happy footing? The British Empire is in itself, on a smaller scale, a League of Free Nations. The equal status of India in this league has just been recognised by the Imperial Conference that held its sittings in London recently. The Royal House of Windsor should bind, in affectionate brotherhood, all the members of this great League of the Nations. The Royal Family is, therefore, a symbol of unity, equality, and brotherhood among all the units of this Empire. The Prince of Wales has been touring all over the Empire to strengthen these ties. It is desirable that we should help him to build and strengthen those ties here in this country as well, for surely his visit will enable India to occupy a proud and honourable position in the British commonwealth of free nations.

The HONOURABLE SIR ZULFIQAR ALI KHAN : Sir, I wish to associate myself whole-heartedly with the remarks which have already fallen from the various speakers who have expressed their sentiments before me. If we were to judge, Sir, from the sentiments or ideas expressed by a section of the Indian population who are very vocal, one would judge that, perhaps His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales would not be welcome if he visited India. But there are people, and an overwhelming majority of people in India, who think otherwise and who hold the Royal Family in the greatest affection and whose devotion to the Royal Family has always been strongly expressed. Sir, I am glad that the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj has given us this opportunity of expressing our ideas about this visit, and I have no doubt that, when this Resolution has started from the Council of State, it will travel all over India and encourage those who feel perhaps abashed or diffident on account of the too vocal energies of the minority who are trying to impress not only India but the world that His Royal Highness would not be welcome to the Indians, and this Resolution will, I hope, express the true feeling of the masses. Sir, if Mr. Gandhi and his party could only see the situation in its true perspective, they would realise that India cannot stand without the support which England alone could give it. History shows that not only do we need the support of England, but also the support of the mighty armament which England possesses in the shape of the Navy and the Army. India is exposed on three sides by sea and the north is exposed to the invaders by land. Can any one expect that

[Sir Zulfiqar Ali Khan.]

India can defend herself without the support of England? If the British power were to withdraw its support to-day from India, I do not know what calamities and what bloodshed would befall this country, and how we should be able to carry on the administration for even a month. Sir, India requires that we should not create a sentiment of disloyalty to the British Crown, because whatever we possess and to whatever stage of progress we have reached we owe it to the British Crown, and whatever we possess has been given to us under the auspices of the Royal Family. Sir, with these few words I whole-heartedly support the Resolution now before the House.

The HONOURABLE SAYYID RAZA ALI: Sir, in spite of the grave provocation that has been given to me by an honourable and gallant member of this Council to play the role of a lunatic, I rise to give my support to this Resolution. Sir, as is known to students of Medical science, lunacy displays itself in more forms than one, but I have no inclination this afternoon to dilate on the subject any further.

Sir, the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhojy deserves to be congratulated on the terms of his Resolution and the careful manner in which he has avoided all controversial subjects. Under any circumstances I take it, Sir, that it would have been a graceful act on the part of this Council to accord a hearty welcome to the Heir to the Throne on his visit to this country, but I feel that much more should we do so now when the voice of dissent and controversy has been raised in certain quarters. I for one, Sir, must say that I am not prepared to deny the right of holding their views to the non-co-operators. But, at the same time, I ask them in their turn to extend the same right to us. Further than that I am not prepared to go, and, after all, I do not think that this is a subject on which we need go into the whole history of the causes of, and remedies for, non-co-operation. Let them do their duty; on the other hand, we should not be slack in doing ours.

Sir, while giving my support to this Resolution, I, with the permission of the Council, feel it my duty to say that the way in which His Royal Highness' visit has been announced does not commend itself to me. As a matter of fact, it was announced by a Royal Proclamation in December 1919 that the Heir to the Throne would be coming out to this country and would perform the opening ceremony of the Chamber of Princes and of the Indian Legislature. I need hardly say that expectations ran high in this country to accord a welcome to His Royal Highness which was worthy of him and worthy of this country.

Unfortunately, it was announced last year that, after all, His Royal Highness could not come to this country and the uncle of the King-Emperor was chosen to visit this country and perform those ceremonies. Now, Sir, my grievance, and it is a friendly grievance, is that the Government did not take the two Chambers of the Indian Legislature into confidence. I have not the slightest doubt, Sir, that, if we had been consulted in this matter, whether the visit has been proposed by His Majesty's Government in England or by the Government of India, I know what response would have been made to this proposal. As it is, it is rather unfortunate that we were not consulted in this matter, which would to a certain extent show want of confidence in us by the Government of India. I do hope, Sir, that in future, when momentous decisions of this character are taken—and I do hold that the visit of His Royal

His Highness is a very momentous affair—the Government of India will place greater confidence in us and will make it a point to consult us on questions of this character.

One word more, Sir, and I have done. While we, on our part, are prepared to accord a welcome to His Royal Highness which we can under the circumstances, my respectful plea to the Government of India is that, looking to the conditions obtaining in the country, and by “the conditions obtaining in the country” I mean more the economic distress with which we are faced to-day than anything else, those who are in charge of the arrangements in connection with His Royal Highness’ visit will see to it that, while the reception prepared for His Royal Highness is suitable and is worthy of India, no unnecessary money is spent on mere show and *tamashas*. We have already had the privilege of having amongst us His Royal Highness the Duke of Connaught. I need hardly mention what reception we accorded to His Royal Highness. It, at the same time, as my Hon’ble friends will remember, has entailed a considerable financial burden on us. This time too, since the Prince has a higher position in the Royal Family than the Duke of Connaught, what I fear, Sir, is that, after all, His Royal Highness’ visit may not involve a financial burden on us which might accelerate the discontent that is obtaining in the country.

With these few words I welcome the Resolution that has been so guardedly and so cautiously moved by the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj.

THE HONOURABLE MR. ALTAF ALI : Sir, I beg to associate myself with this Resolution. It has been so ably put by my friend the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj and has been so amply supported, that I hardly think it is necessary to add to what has already been said.

Sir, I have great pleasure in supporting the Resolution on behalf of myself and of the Mulan madans of Eastern Bengal whom I have the honour to represent in this House.

At this stage the Honourable Sardar Jogendra Singh rose in his place.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : The Hon’ble Member has already spoken.

THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH : I wanted your permission to make an explanation regarding the remarks which the Honourable Saiyid Raza Ali made.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Is it a personal explanation ?

THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH : On behalf of the Reception Committee.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I think the matter does not arise.

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF : In accepting this Resolution now before the Council, on behalf of the Government, it is perhaps desirable that I should emphasise what His Excellency the Viceroy has already laid stress on in regard to the coming visit of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales. He visits India as the Heir to the Throne, as the representative of our Royal House, and as the living emblem of that strongest of all bonds which holds together the sister nations of this great Empire.

[H. B. the Commander-in-Chief.]

Following the foot steps of his Royal father and of his grand-father, he comes in order to learn and to realise what India is, for no one, until he has seen and felt India, can have even a remote conception of what the Indian Empire really means. In his visit there is no breath of politics. In his wonderful tours of Canada, Australia and New Zealand, which have been one unbroken triumph, all parties, sections and religions have sunk their differences in order to join hands and accord him a more than enthusiastic welcome. To those of you who have not yet come under the magnetic influence of his personality or who have not heard him deliver an address, I can tell you that there is a pleasure in store, and I think probably a surprise also. Notwithstanding that, in India to-day, there are certain shortsighted sections of the people who desire to refrain from according that welcome to which for every reason he is entitled, the Resolution now before the Council is clear evidence of the true feeling of the overwhelming majority of the Indian people. It is therefore with sincere pleasure that the Government of India accept this Resolution and will convey it to His Royal Highness through the proper channels. Steps will likewise be taken, in accordance with the terms of the last part of the Resolution, to appoint a Committee in conjunction with the Legislative Assembly to draft a suitable address of welcome for presentation to His Royal Highness on his arrival in India.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : The question is that the following Resolution be adopted :—

‘ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that he may be pleased to convey to H. R. H. the Prince of Wales its humble request that he may be graciously pleased to accept a loyal and dutiful address of welcome from the Indian Legislature, and invites the co-operation of the Legislative Assembly in constituting a Committee of the Indian Legislature to draft a suitable address for the purpose.’

I think it would be in accordance with the wish of the Council that we should pass this Resolution standing.

The Motion was adopted unanimously, the Council standing.

RESOLUTION *RE* : WELCOME TO LORD READING ON HIS ASSUMPTION OF OFFICE.

The HONOURABLE MAHARAJADHIRAJA SIR RAMESHWARA SINGH OF DARBHANGA : Sir, I beg to move the following Resolution :—

‘ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council to convey to His Excellency Lord Reading a cordial welcome on his assumption of his high office, together with an assurance of the loyal and whole-hearted support of the Council in the discharge of his onerous and difficult duties.’

I feel confident I voice forth the unanimous opinion of the Council in moving the Resolution that stands against my name. His Excellency Lord Reading has come out to govern India with a reputation for able statesmanship, amply borne out by the brilliant record of his magnificent services to the Empire, which marked him out as the one Statesman to whose hands the destiny of India could be safely entrusted by his Sovereign. As Lord Chief Justice of England, he made a name for himself by his broadminded view of

justice and his keen solicitude to administer equity. As the British Ambassador to the United States during the Empire's dark hour, His Lordship displayed an instinct for doing the most effective thing, which was the high watermark of statesmanship. As the Viceroy of India, the popularity of His Excellency has already been secured by his sincerity, good faith and zeal for the welfare of the people, and it needs no special gift to prophesy that the next five years will mark him out as one of the most successful administrators who has presided over the destinies of India. Ever since he assumed charge of his high office, it has been his sincere endeavour to maintain the glorious traditions of British justice in all affairs of State, and to bring about harmony and goodwill between the people and the Government. We are particularly fortunate that His Excellency is here in India to guide us at a time when a constitutional régime is beginning, which opens a broad path in which the Indian people, with their ancient culture, could march hand in hand with the British nation towards a common goal. It is, therefore, in the fitness of things, that the Honourable Members of this Council should extend a most hearty welcome to His Excellency and do all they can to co-operate whole-heartedly with His Excellency in all measures tending to maintain law and order and the security, contentment and prosperity of the millions whom he has been called upon to rule.

The HONOURABLE RAJA SIR HARNAM SINGH: Sir, I beg to support the Resolution moved by my Honourable friend, the Maharaja of Darbhanga. India is very fortunate in having Lord Reading as her Viceroy. His Excellency has had a highly distinguished and successful career, and, though the times are difficult, we have reason to hope and believe that His Excellency's wide experience and full knowledge of men and affairs will enable him to pilot the ship of State through troubled waters to a peaceful haven. It is necessary, however, on our part to give His Excellency adequate time to study the needs of this country and to support him in every endeavour to promote the political, economic and social progress of India.

The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: Sir, I rise to associate myself whole-heartedly with the object of the Resolution of my honoured Colleague, and to accord a most cordial welcome to Their Excellencies, Lord and Lady Reading.

Sir, I do this not out of sheer formality or flattery. I do it because we Indians have special reasons to hail His Excellency's appointment as Viceroy and Governor General of India at the present juncture. His Excellency comes to preside over the destinies of this great country at the time, not only of the inauguration of a New Era of Constitutional Reforms, but also when, owing to reasons too well known to require reiteration here, large black clouds threaten the very horizon which it was intended to make brighter and broader by the new dispensation or order of things. To make the Reforms a reality, and to avert a calamity brought about by the mistakes and misdeeds of the past, India wanted a Statesman of broader outlook, sympathy and foresight than any she has had before, to captain, guide and steer the great ship of the State, which, while the prospects of the Promised Land lie before her, has been overtaken by a heavy storm of violent and harmful propaganda in the midst of angry surges of unrest and discontent, threatening her quiet, placid and steady march towards the goal.

In such an hour of trial and tribulation, in spite of the wrongs and mistakes we did not lose faith. But in the interest and welfare of mother India,

[Mr. G. M. Bhurghri.]

in the Empire's own welfare, prayed and asked for an administrator, a doctor, who would not aggravate the malady, but with the salve of sympathy, goodwill and broadminded statesmanship heal the wounds and right the wrongs, taking the country onward on her steady march of progress and self-realization!

We cannot say, Sir, whether it was in response to our prayers and requests that he was sent here. For what better choice could there be than that of a man steeped in the most liberal traditions of Great Britain, a man universally respected for his high attainments and acumen as Judge, Financier and Administrator? India has never so sorely needed one who combined in him the three great gifts, and used these gifts in promoting for happiness and welfare. We, the members of the House, and if I may be allowed to speak for those who are outside this House and who share my sentiments, we have every confidence that His Excellency will fulfil this hope. His Excellency has already justified our hopes by his wise and sympathetic administration for the last few months he has been here, and more specially by his speech before the Legislature the other day. The speech makes one thing quite clear. That, in spite of the troubled times, His Excellency is earnest and means to do his very best by India and by Indians. His Excellency gave expression to the sentiment that he looked up to the Legislature to assist him in the discharge of his heavy responsibilities. I, as one of His Excellency's humble legislators, want to assure him that that is a duty, a most sacred duty, which every one in this House, I feel confident to say, feels his first obligation to perform.

In his speech, His Excellency has exhorted us, the members of the Legislature, and rightly, not to content ourselves with doing our duty inside the House, but also to go forth *outside* among the people. May I assure His Excellency that in very many matters most of us who are co-operating with the Government have to bear the brunt of many an unpleasant thing outside this House. For the sake of our country, for the sake of that connection which we feel as essential for the welfare and development of the Empire as for India, we have been doing our very best, not without risking many things dear and near to us, in the shaping of affairs outside this House, quietly and persistently. If, Sir, our efforts have borne little fruit, if we have not appreciably succeeded in rendering effective assistance in the discharge of His Excellency's heavy responsibilities, it is, I assure His Excellency, for no fault of ours. I am not here to find fault with, or pass a verdict upon, individuals, or even policies. But from personal experience, dispassionate study and observation of the events of the past few years, having given my most anxious time and thoughts to them, I confess, Sir, I am again and again driven to the inevitable conclusion, namely, that the remedy lies in other hands than our own.

There are, as His Excellency himself has said in his address, some grievances, legitimate grievances, which require to be remedied. I submit, Sir, it is not possible to *redress* these grievances, without removing the deep-rooted causes of the present discontent, before it gets altogether out of control. So far, even at the risk of public opprobrium, we, on our part, have been rendering every possible assistance to the Government inside this House, and using our best influence and effort outside, to suppress disorder, and prevent chaos and catastrophe. But, Sir, we are becoming day by day more and more conscious of our helplessness and the futility of our efforts, without that remedy

being instantaneously applied which, as I have said above, lies in other hands than our own, and which to us appears to be the only panacea for the present situation, the only redress for the root-cause of the present unrest and agitation.

That remedy, Sir, is in a word, "a policy of steady and courageous conciliation." We have the lesson of our past experience,—say, for instance, the agitation against the partition of Bengal, when that agitation was at its highest. My revered leader, the late Mr. Gopal Krishna Gokhale, then ventured to tender the following advice to the Government. Addressing the Honourable the then Home Member of the Government of India, in the course of the debate on the Seditious Meetings Act, he said :—

'Let me say this to the Honourable Member, whether the 'Moderates' remain silent or denounce the 'Extremists,' it will make very little difference in the hold which the Extremists are acquiring on certain minds of India. There is only one way in which the wings of disaffection can be clipped, and that is by the Government pursuing a policy of steady and courageous conciliation.'

The annulment of the Partition, many years later, proved the correctness of these views. They are as correct and sound now as they were then, and I take this opportunity while according a hearty welcome to His Excellency humbly to press them on his attention.....

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Order, order. I have already allowed the Honourable Member considerable latitude, but I think he is going too far and he must adhere to the terms of the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: His Excellency has pointed out to us the results of the labours of the Reformed Legislature during the short period of its first Session, and the good harvest gathered thereat. At the same time he has uttered a word of warning. He asks us not to expect at every Session to garner so rich a harvest. May I once again, in performing that very pleasant duty which prompts me to speak on this Resolution, beg you, Sir, to convey to His Excellency the humble message that the country expects a richer harvest still during the present and subsequent Sessions in the immediate future. I am.....

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Order, order. Does the Honourable Member desire to move an Amendment to this Resolution? The Honourable Member must be aware that it is impossible for me to convey a message to His Excellency unless it is through the Council. Therefore, if the Honourable Member wants to move an Amendment to the Resolution, he must be prepared to do so, but as it is he is going too far outside the terms of the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: If you will allow me to move an Amendment I am prepared to do so.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: If the Honourable Member wishes to do so, I have no objection.

THE HONOURABLE SIR ALEXANDER MURRAY: Sir, I wish to associate myself with the remarks that have fallen from the Honourable Mover of this Resolution.

I leave it to other speakers to refer to the benefits that India may expect to reap from having at the head of Government one so well versed in politics and law as Lord Reading.

[Sir Alexander Murray.]

As the representative here of a Constituency whose members are largely interested in India's Commerce and Trade, I have no hesitation in saying we welcome His Excellency as Viceroy. We cannot forget the great services rendered by Lord Reading to the Empire in the world of Finance on the outbreak of war, and we remember with gratitude the assistance rendered by him to India when, as Ambassador to the United States of America, he persuaded the Government of that country to place at India's disposal all the silver necessary to prevent a currency crisis here.

At that time India's problem was how best to replenish exhausted reserves with silver rupees and to prevent exchange from rising. The problem now is how best to dispose of overflowing hoards of silver and to prevent exchange from falling.

We feel that Lord Reading's wide knowledge and experience will be of the greatest assistance to his Government when matters of this description are under consideration. And I can assure His Excellency that he may rely on the loyal and whole-hearted support of the community I represent, in all matters that tend towards the peace and good government of this great country, and that will enable it to take its rightful place as one of the leading countries in the world of Industry, Commerce and Trade.

The HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY : Sir, this Resolution marks a new departure in the history of the Council, and under ordinary circumstances I should not have supported it, because it is clear to me that an address of this kind should be given to a Viceroy at the termination of his office and not at the commencement. But, in the case of Lord Reading, we must make an exception. His high sense of patriotism and a strong feeling of duty have brought him out to India. He has exchanged an exalted office in England for the anxious cares and burdens of the Indian Viceroyalty, particularly in face of the fact that the Viceroyalty of India at the present juncture is not, I may venture to say, a bed of roses. I, therefore, have pleasure in giving my support to this Resolution.

The HONOURABLE MR. A. H. FROMM : Sir, I have much pleasure in supporting this Resolution. I have listened with great interest to the remarks which have fallen from the lips of my Honourable friend Sir Alexander Murray in recalling to the memory of the Members of this House the great services rendered to India by His Excellency when Ambassador at Washington. I have listened to those remarks with interest because a similar expression of gratitude was embodied in the address which I, when Chairman of the Bombay Chamber of Commerce, had the honour of presenting to His Excellency on his arrival in this country. I cannot help thinking that the recognition that Bengal also has not forgotten those services must be a source of gratification to His Excellency. I do not desire to detain the Council any longer with a speech on this subject, but I feel sure that all the Members of this Council will accord their hearty support to this Resolution.

The HONOURABLE MR. ANNAMALAI CHETTIYAR : Sir, it is a great pleasure to me to rise in support of this Resolution. As the representative of the Sovereign, it is our duty to accord a cordial welcome to His Excellency. But the duty becomes a pleasure when we remember that His Excellency has as his watchword "justice." Now, Sir, India is passing through a very critical

time, everywhere there is unrest seeking to find a new outlet for the new aspirations born of the war. The realization of these aspirations can be had either through the path of peace and progress, the opposite leading to bloodshed. But we have deliberately chosen the former, the path of peace and progress, and therefore it behoves us all to support His Excellency who stands for ordered progress and justice. We may confidently hope that during the time of His Excellency, Indian aspirations will be substantially realised. With these few words, Sir, I support the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE COLONEL SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN : Sir, in rising to support this Resolution, I should like to say that this welcome is not an ordinary welcome such as we extend to other Viceroys. This welcome is a particular welcome to a particular man. Lord Reading is considered to be not only one of the ablest Viceroys, but he is known to be one of the ablest men in England, and we should all be very grateful to His Majesty the King to have sent him out at a time when India was in need of such a man. We are glad he has come out here at a time when we most needed him and when we wanted peace in the country. We all want peace but we are unhappily being disturbed by a clique who are bent on doing mischief, and they do not stop even at causing bloodshed. I sincerely trust that my remarks do not fit anyone in this House—I am sure they do not. With these few words, Sir, I heartily support the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH : Sir, there is something peculiar in the wording of the Resolution. It asks the Governor General to convey the thanks of this Council to the Governor General. I wonder if it would be possible

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : The Resolution runs "that this Council recommends to the Governor General in Council to convey to His Excellency, etc." The Governor General in Council is an entirely different person from the Governor General.

THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH : I see the distinction, Sir. But what I was going to say, was that possibly a direct Resolution from this Council conveyed by the Honourable the President would be more straight forward. We welcome the Viceroy for many reasons. One of the strongest is, that we expect him to give us a new programme and a policy. I associate myself with the short and sweet speech made by the Honourable Raja Sir Harnam Singh, hoping that the new Viceroyalty will be marked by industrial and economic development of the country. As the Honourable Sir Alexander Murray pointed out a little while ago, what India needs is a stable exchange and industrial development, and in the field of politics, we want more than ever a consistent policy. For the last few years we have had too many shifts and expedients guiding the policy of the Government of India, and we hope that the new Viceroy will give us a new programme and a constructive policy which would bring peace and tranquillity to India. I associate myself with the Honourable the Mover of this Resolution in welcoming the new Viceroy to the difficult task which is before him.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. KHAPARDE : Sir, I originally did not intend to speak on this Resolution, but I do so to support it because I see in it the beginnings of a constitutional practice which, I hope, will become general. There is always an inaugural speech when a Session begins. In

[Mr. G. S. Khaparde.]

England, there is a speech from the Throne and then both the Houses have a debate or something like a debate, called Address on the Speech. That is to say, they move certain propositions by way of saying that it is an Address to be presented to the King, and there are a few grievances also added to it. I am glad to see that this practice has begun, and it has begun very well, because it has come from one of the oldest Members in this House, the Honourable Raja Sir Harnam Singh, and my friend the Honourable Sardar Jogendra Singh sitting behind him has also mentioned that economic problems and all such things should be included. I, therefore, welcome this Resolution immensely both for the personal greatness of the Viceroy and for his attainments, for all that he has done and also for all that we expect will be done. Along with that we should like to help him by telling him something of the most important problems on which we would like him to concentrate his attention. In this spirit, therefore, that hereafter, after every speech from the Throne there will be an Address voted in this House and the other House also. I heartily support this Resolution.

The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : Sir, I want these words to be added at the end of the Resolution :

'And this House hopes that His Excellency will pursue a policy of conciliation at this juncture and thereby secure peace and tranquillity which this country so sorely needs.'

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : To the Resolution which has been moved by the Honourable Maharajadhiraja Sir Rameshwara Singh, an Amendment has been proposed by the Honourable Mr. Bhurgri, *viz.*, that at the end of the Resolution the following words be added :

'And this House hopes that His Excellency will pursue a policy of conciliation at this juncture and thereby secure peace and tranquillity which this country so sorely needs.'

The HONOURABLE LALA RAM SARAN DASS : Sir, I cordially support this Resolution

The HONOURABLE MR. LALUBHAI SAMALDAS : May I rise to a point of order, Sir ? Is the Resolution or the Amendment now before the Council ?

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : We are discussing both the Amendment and the Resolution.

The HONOURABLE MR. PHIROZE C. SETHNA : May I ask if the Amendment has been seconded ?

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Under our rules it is not necessary to second an Amendment.

The HONOURABLE LALA RAM SARAN DASS : Sir, I cordially support the Resolution so ably moved by my esteemed friend the Honourable Maharaja of Darbhanga. There is more than one reason why India wants to extend a hearty welcome to His Excellency Lord Reading. In the first place, as His Excellency reminded us only the other day, he is steeped in the Liberal traditions of England. The reforms that have recently been introduced in the Indian constitution can only be worked and developed successfully by a Liberal Viceroy. Secondly, the one thing that India requires above all at this day is justice. The appointment of Lord Chief Justice of England as Viceroy of India is, therefore, greatly appreciated by the people. The new Viceroy comes with a past record which will eminently fit him to solve

the many difficult problems with which India is at present confronted. India with the rest of the world is at present passing through a great crisis, and we are sure that through the skilful guidance of the Viceroy the country would be led to the haven of peace, prosperity and internal tranquillity. Let me assure His Excellency that all moderate and sober public opinion in the country will be with his Government in the heavy and difficult task of reconstruction that lies before it. We pray that before His Excellency lays down his high office, India will occupy a proud and honourable position in that fraternity of free and equal nations called by the name of British Empire.

The HONOURABLE COLONEL SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN then rose to speak.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I think the Honourable Member has spoken before.

The HONOURABLE COLONEL SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN : Not on the Amendment, Sir. I strongly oppose the Amendment. I oppose the Amendment which has been put forward by the Honourable Mr. Bhurgri because, if we incorporate it in the Resolution, we will be dictating a policy to the Viceroy and I think that is not right.

The HONOURABLE MR. G. S. KHAPARDE : I wish to speak in support of the Amendment, Sir. I do so because, as I said, a constitutional practice of voting on the Address as it is technically called in England may be introduced here, and when a speech from the Throne indicates the points which Government wish to bring out in the Session, we in voting on the Address will bring out what few points we want to urge, and that is my reason for supporting the Amendment suggested by my Honourable friend Mr. Bhurgri.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I will ask the Council to bear with me one second while I endeavour to explain this matter. The Resolution now before the House accords a welcome to His Excellency on his assumption of high office. There can be no parallel,—I think it is quite evident to the Council—there can be no parallel between an Address of welcome at the commencement of a five years' term of office by His Excellency the Viceroy and the discussion which takes place every year at the opening of Parliament on the King's speech. It may be, and possibly will be, a constitutional development in this country that in the future, after the opening speech by His Excellency the Viceroy at the commencement of our Session, something analogous to the debate on the King's speech will grow up, but such a debate can clearly not be founded on the present Resolution.

The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : My object really was to set up some sort of precedence for a debate on the Address. And as I knew I would not have any other opportunity of doing so, I have brought in the Amendment.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : I feel that in this matter this Council desires to be unanimous. I understand that the Honourable Mr. Bhurgri wishes to set up a constitutional practice, a matter which does not really arise on this Resolution. In order that we may have unanimity in this matter, I therefore appeal to the Honourable Mr. Bhurgri to withdraw his Amendment, which has sufficiently served his purpose.

[Mr. G. M. Bhurgri.]

The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: In deference to your wishes, Sir, I withdraw the Amendment.

The Amendment was, by leave of the Council withdrawn.

HIS EXCELLENCY THE COMMANDER-IN-CHIEF: On behalf of His Excellency the Viceroy, I am anxious to express his appreciation both of the Resolution itself and the way in which it has been received by this Council. We have listened with rapt attention and I would add with feelings of confidence and respectful admiration to the words which His Excellency has addressed to us on Saturday in another place. It is abundantly clear that the task which lies before him is one of unusual delicacy and exceptional complexity, but he approaches it with a sympathy and a good-will coupled with a complete knowledge of affairs, which claims our implicit confidence. Whatever action it may be deemed necessary or desirable to take in order to preserve the peace and good government of India will, I am sure, receive the whole-hearted support of the members of this Chamber, (Hear, hear), and it is for this reason that His Excellency welcomes the Resolution now before the Council, a Resolution which the Government of India will take steps to respectfully convey to His Excellency in the usual manner.

The HONOURABLE MAHARAJA SIR RAMESHWARA SINGH OF DARBHANGA: I have nothing more to say. I do not think there can be any two opinions on the matter and I have no more observations to make.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Before I put the Resolution, there is one matter that I should mention. It is quite clear that the discussion on Mr. Bhurgri's Amendment has shown a desire on the part of the Council generally to find, if possible, some procedure for raising a debate on matters dealt with in the speech of His Excellency the Viceroy at the opening of the Session. This will involve a consideration of the constitutional position which it must always be remembered is not identical with that of the English constitution. I hope, however, in consultation with my Colleague who presides in the other Assembly to be able to submit later on to the Council some suggestions on that point. (Hear, hear.)

The question is that the following Resolution be adopted:—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council to convey to His Excellency Lord Reading a cordial welcome on his assumption of his high office, together with an assurance of the loyal and whole-hearted support of the Council in the discharge of his onerous and difficult duties.'

The motion was adopted unanimously.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The Council will now adjourn till 3 P.M.

The Council re-assembled after lunch at Three of the Clock. The Honourable the President was in the Chair.

MESSAGE FROM LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

The SECRETARY OF THE COUNCIL: A Message has been received from the Legislative Assembly.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Let the Message be read.

The following Message was then read out by the Secretary of the Council :—

' Sir,

I am directed to inform you that the following Resolution was passed in the Legislative Assembly at their meeting of the 5th September :—

' This Assembly recommends to the Governor General in Council that he may be pleased to convey to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales its humble request that he may be pleased to accept a loyal and dutiful address of welcome from the Indian Legislature; and further recommends that the co-operation of the Council of State be invited therefor and that a Committee of both Chambers to which the following members of this Assembly shall be nominated be appointed to draft the address :—

- (1) Sir P. S. Sivaswamy Aiyer,
- (2) Mr. T. V. Seshagiri Ayyar,
- (3) Prof. S. C. Shahani,
- (4) Mr. Harchandrai Vishindas,
- (5) Chaudhuri Shahab-ud-Din,
- (6) Lala Girdharilal Agarwala,
- (7) Mr. J. Chaudhuri,
- (8) Mr. C. W. Rhodes,
- (9) Rai Bahadur Debi Charan Barua,
- (10) Mr. J. P. Cotelingam,
- (11) Syed Rajan Baksh Shah,
- (12) Mr. Jannadas Dwarkadas,
- (13) Lieutenant-Colonel H. A. J. Gidney, and
- (14) Dr. H. S. Gour.'

2. The Legislative Assembly desire the concurrence of the Council of State in the Resolution.'

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: With reference to the message which has just been received by this Chamber, a motion will be made to-morrow. In the meantime this Chamber has now met to consider the motion for the adjournment which stands in the name of the Honourable Sir Maneckji Dadabhoy.

An Honourable Member asked me as I was leaving the Chamber what object was served by a motion for an adjournment of the business of the Council for the purpose of discussing a definite matter of urgent public importance. It is, of course, to give the Council an opportunity of hearing the Government views on a matter of public importance. If the adjournment is carried against the Government, that is a disapproval by this Council of the explanation of Government. If the motion is withdrawn with the consent of the Council that is construed as approval of the Government action. I am sorry to have troubled Members with this explanation, but, as one member at least was in some doubt, I thought it right to do so.

The HONOURABLE SAIYID RAZA ALI: I hope Members will be given an opportunity to discuss the speech made by the Honourable Member in charge of this matter on behalf of the Government.

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The rules are perfectly clear. An Honourable Member moves; a Member of the Government will presumably speak at some stage of the debate. Other Members of course are at liberty to discuss any matters that arise out of the Government Member's speech. Otherwise the motion would be entirely fruitless.

STATE OF AFFAIRS IN MALABAR.

THE HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY : Mr. President, I now move that the House be adjourned. My object in moving this adjournment of the House is to give this Council an opportunity of discussing a definite matter of urgent public importance, namely, the state of affairs in Malabar and the full of details of the Moplah outbreak. In moving the adjournment I may at once say that my object is not to embarrass the Government in any manner in the arduous task which it has before it now, nor do I wish to make any remarks or criticisms that will in any way make matters difficult for the Government of India or the Government of Madras. I shall in no way anticipate or prejudice any action that may be taken in connection with the atrocities which have been committed. I shall, therefore, endeavour not only to be brief, but at the same time to make my remarks as innocuous as possible. But the importance of the subject needs not only a brief *résumé* from me of important events but a full, explicit and exhaustive statement from the Home Member on behalf of Government. I shall be particularly brief and precise, as I understand my Honourable friend Rai Bahadur Annamalai Chettiyar, who has given notice of a similar motion and who is more intimately acquainted with the state of affairs in the Madras Presidency than I am, intends to follow me.

Sir, we have all read in the newspapers the accounts of the terrible atrocities which are now going on in Malabar with poignant grief. I am representing the sentiments of the Indian nation when I say that the catastrophe which has taken place in Malabar is now pre-eminently occupying the attention of the general public and every news in connection therewith is waited by the general public with great interest and anxiety. It is unfortunate that the Government of the Madras Presidency is having a very anxious time. We have all read the harrowing accounts; we have also seen the fragmentary official and unofficial news and notices; we have read the Madras Government's Communiqué on the subject; but the Council will agree with me when I say that the whole history of the outbreak has not been presented by the Madras Government in a connected narrative form, and we therefore, await to-day a most exhaustive statement from the Government of India on the subject. We have read the Chapter of crimes committed in Malabar, of the destruction of public and private property, the looting of Government Treasuries and Sub-Treasuries, the defiling of Hindu temples and also of the forcible conversion of Hindus to Islam, with great horror and real grief. We want to know who is responsible for these acts and atrocities, and was it not within the power of Government to have avoided this catastrophe or minimised the severity of this catastrophe to a certain extent? It is true that the state of affairs in Malabar has been bad for the last six months. It is well known that the preachings of seditionists, that the poisonous doctrines which these seditionists and anarchists were daily pouring into that highly fanatical soil of Malabar was gaining ground. Government was aware of it. Government knew of the danger that was coming. And in this connection I will draw the attention of the House to a statement made by my friend the Honourable Sir William Vincent in February last in the Legislative Assembly. He said :

'We are now faced in this country with the frequent prospects of disorders here and there. I myself think that we shall be very fortunate if we escape in the next six months without serious outbreaks of sporadic disorder in different places.'

I have made it perfectly clear that the Government anticipated danger, and I cannot therefore understand why Government did not take precautionary

measures for the suppression of these atrocities in Malabar. As Government knew that the people of Malabar were collecting swords, spears, fire-arms and other instruments, it is difficult to understand why stringent measures of a precautionary character were not adopted in the right time. It might have averted a great deal of bloodshed, it might have averted the sanguinary battles that have taken place there and the loss of innocent lives that has unfortunately occurred. I, therefore, think that in this connection an explanation is due to the country from the Government, which cannot be altogether exonerated from a certain measure of responsibility in this matter. Further, Sir, it is perfectly clear that the Moplahs were prepared for the occasion and that there was a wide-spread organisation behind them; all these pitched battles with three and four thousand people which recently took place clearly demonstrate the existence of a well-conducted and nefarious organisation behind the back of these revolts. It is therefore necessary that the Government should make a complete statement on the point and place before the country any information that may exist on the subject, as I consider the time has now arrived when there is no longer any necessity for keeping the matter secret. I make bold to say in this connection, and I feel I echo the sentiments of all of us here, official and non-official Members, whether they be Europeans or Indians, that in any measures which Government may decide to adopt for the suppression of these revolts, for the promotion of order and the maintenance of peace, this Council will whole-heartedly give its support. Things are going from bad to worse; innocent lives are being lost; the country is almost in a state of consternation; riots are taking place not only in Malabar, but in all parts of India; everywhere there are seen forces of disruption and disorganisation; law-abiding citizens are not in a position to do their ordinary work; there is a state of havoc and intense anxiety. I think the time has arrived when the Government should adopt strict measures for the suppression of these riots and for the maintenance of peace and order. I would also like the Honourable the Home Member to enlighten the Council, as fully as possible, as to the origin and cause of these disturbances; a history of the genesis of these disturbances will be extremely valuable. I would also like the Honourable the Home Member to distinctly state the total number of casualties, both European and Indian. I would also like the Honourable the Home Member to assure this Council that Government have now taken precautionary measures immediately in the troubled parts of Madras, and within what period he expects peace and order to be fully restored in that troubled country. Government have promulgated the Martial Law Ordinance; a Martial Law Ordinance is always distasteful and unpalatable to the people. It can only be justified in case of absolute necessity, and I have no doubt that the Government was satisfied before the promulgation of the Ordinance in substituting martial law for the common law of the country. In this connection we have heard with great satisfaction the sentiments to which His Excellency Lord Reading gave expression to on Saturday last, and, if I remember his words aright, they were that nurtured as he was in the traditions of the Inns of Court he had satisfied himself as to the absolute necessity of the promulgation of martial law before issuing orders for the same. I think that statement is quite satisfactory; it will settle the controversy in the country. I have seen in various newspapers and in various journals a lot of adverse reference about the introduction of martial law; but I think the explanation which His Excellency has given puts the matter out of controversy, and I have no doubt that nurtured as His Excellency is in the free atmosphere of the English bar and in the traditions of English justice I

[Sir Maneckji Dadabhoj.]

shall accept his statement fully and implicitly, and I have not the slightest doubt that the country at large will similarly accept it. Further, I am very pleased, and the country has noticed with great satisfaction, that in the preparation of this Martial Law Ordinance the blunders that were committed at the time of the Punjab affair have been studiously avoided. The power and authority of the civil law has been to a certain extent maintained. Consultations by the military officers with the Civil Department have been rendered obligatory, and prior to the issue of notices and regulations, and the rules for summary trial of cases the necessity of following the provisions of the Code of Criminal Procedure has been indicated and enforced. So far it is satisfactory. I say on behalf of the country that martial law being the negation of the ordinary law, it will only be enforced and kept in operation for the period for which it is actually required and absolutely justified. It will, I trust, be removed, as early as possible, and every measure will be taken to restore the peace of the country and the authority of the ordinary common law of the Realm.....

The HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI: May I know, Sir, if the Honourable Member is speaking on behalf of the Government or on behalf of himself? He says 'It will be removed and every measure will be taken, etc.'

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: I would remind the Honourable Member that under the Standing Orders a speech on a motion for adjournment is limited to fifteen minutes.

The HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY: I am coming to an end, Sir. I will not take more than the prescribed fifteen minutes.....

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The Honourable Member must conclude his speech as rapidly as possible. He has already spoken for fourteen minutes.

The HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY: I would also request Government to state whether they have issued instructions to the authorities administering martial law to carry out the injunctions embodied in the Secretary of State's despatch No. 108 of the 26th May 1920, in connection with the Hunter Committee's report. There certain canons of procedure and "standards of conduct" were laid down for the instruction of military authorities, and I hope those canons will be religiously and strictly observed.

In conclusion, I shall ask the Government to take the House into confidence and to place before it every important matter which is worthy of information. The country is very much distressed over this affair, and a full and complete answer is required as regards the state of things prevailing at the present juncture. With these few words I move the motion.

The HONOURABLE SIR WILLIAM VINCENT: Sir, I wish I could have heard what the Honourable Member opposite has to say on the subject before rising to reply to the motion. But unfortunately I have to attend in another place at 4 o'clock this afternoon to answer a similar motion there, and

I hope the Council will, therefore, excuse me for speaking now: I hope also that the Honourable Member opposite will accept my apology for not waiting to hear him before I rose.

The Honourable the Mover of this Motion for Adjournment with his usual courtesy gave me previous notice of the points to which he was going to draw attention, and this has facilitated my task to a great extent in answering the motion before the House.

It would perhaps interest Honourable Members if I were to preface my remarks with a brief reference as to the origin and cause of this rising in Malabar. The fact is that these Moplahs are an ignorant people, many of them poor and nearly all of them fanatical and entirely under the influence—as I learn from the information before me—of a bigoted priesthood. As I think all Honourable Members know they are descendants of Arab traders and soldiers who first came to the Malabar coast some time, I think, about 800 A. D., and we are told that they later established themselves by intermarriage and conversion, or perversion, whichever term appeals to different Honourable Members of this Council, of the local residents to Muhammadanism. There have been many outbreaks of these people who now number about a million in the past, indeed during a period of about 20 years—between 1836 and 1853, there were 22 outbreaks, but the biggest one about which I have any information occurred in 1885 after which 20,000 arms including 9,000 guns were collected from the insurgents.

The present rising in itself appears to be purely religious, though, no doubt, it has been accentuated by economic distress. In the past agrarian trouble has frequently been at the bottom of risings, but I have no information before me which leads me to think that Hindu landlords are responsible for the present outbreak. It is, however, known that certain Extremist Muhammadan agitators—I do not wish to use any word that will cause resentment, because many gentlemen feel very strongly about the Khilafat who are not really Extremists in the sense I mean—have been at work for two years in this locality working up the people over the Khilafat. There is on the information before us no sympathy for the non-co-operation movement as such, and indeed there is little regard for Mr. Gandhi's personality. There is certainly no sympathy for a movement of purely non-violent, non-co-operation as the results show. At the beginning of this year, Honourable Members will remember certain inflammatory speeches were delivered at Erode, Mangalore and in Madras, and there is no doubt according to the reports we have had that those speeches had considerable effect on this fanatical population of Malabar which is singularly prone to violence; the situation in April and May was in consequence somewhat dangerous. It subsequently, as we thought, or as the Local Government thought, improved, and we were told that the Ramzan had been the quietest known for years in the Malabar District. In June, there were reports that volunteer associations were being formed, but later again we were told that these associations had ceased as the leaders had realised the danger of continuing them. That information, I am afraid, was incorrect, and these associations were being secretly organised all the time. The Government and local authorities were apparently misled in this matter, but there was nothing to show this till the end of July when the situation suddenly deteriorated largely as the result, as has been reported to us, of the Karachi Conference. Now I should like to cite

[Sir William Vincent.]

here a passage from the Madras letter on this point. I have the leave of the Madras Government to cite it. This is what it says :—

'It is difficult to arrive at an exact appreciation of the situation at present, but there seems to be no doubt that continual provocative speeches on the Khilafat question, combined with the resolutions of the recent All-India Khilafat Conference at Karachi, have produced an impression on the mind of the Mappilla that the end of the British Raj is at hand. It is certainly true that, as the result of Khilafat propaganda, the Mappillas are better organised than they used to be and also better informed as to the strength of their own position and the difficulty of taking military action against them.'

The first actual signs of lawlessness occurred on the 31st July when some Police-officers went to arrest a man who was accused in a criminal case. I think there had been a case of housebreaking in the residence of a Nambudri Brahmin. Armed Moplahs collected in large numbers to prevent the arrest, and there was grave danger of a serious riot. That was happily averted, and the police apparently, though this is not clear from the reports before me, went home without arresting any one. In any case, the police were powerless to face the mob, and the incident was significant because it was regarded by the Moplahs as a victory and a defeat for the Government. The District Magistrate then applied for extra troops to be sent to Calicut, and they were sent. Finally, on the 20th, the District Magistrate determined to arrest certain persons who were in the possession of arms, under the Moplah Outrages Act, at Tirurangadu, with the aid of a military force. Three men were arrested without any trouble, and a party of police were left behind to search for others. In the course of this search a mosque was entered by the Moplah Police-officers who, however, removed their shoes before entering. I may say that in times past rebellious Moplahs have frequently taken refuge in mosques. While these occurrences were taking place, news had quickly spread round as to what was happening and a large mob of Moplahs collected, some coming by train and some on foot. This mob first attacked the party of police and later on in the day attacked the military forces to which I have referred. The attack was beaten off, but I regret to say with the loss of two British Officers, one being Lieutenant Johnstone of the Leinster Regiment and the other a Police-officer named Rowley. By this time railway communications had been cut and the telegraph wires destroyed, and the troops had to remain where they were. Subsequently the outbreak of violence in this single area of Tirurangadu developed into a general rising throughout a large part of the Malabar District of a definitely anti-Government character: *Swaraj* was proclaimed and a green flag hoisted.

I have here rather an interesting account of the reasons for this outbreak from an officer who has had considerable experience of this locality. He has given me leave to use it. This is an extract of a letter received by him :—

'The Moplah believes that the Sirkar is nearing its end, and the day is looming when he will not have to pay either taxes to the Government or rent to the Hindu landholders. Economic distress is another factor not to be left out of account.' Then he goes on to speak of the failure of the monsoon.

This is not an official account. Here is another extract :

'At first all the violence shown was anti-official and anti-European, but now the mobs of five thousand and ten thousand are seen to be disintegrating into small gangs who having no telegraph lines to cut or culverts to destroy are devoting their scheme to harrying the Hindus, especially the high caste Hindus - Nambudris and Nayars whom they looted of their grain and riches and occasionally murder.'

I think I have now told the Council all I can in the time available as to how this rising originated.

As to the casualties our information is that up to the present one British Officer and three British of other ranks have been killed, one British Officer and a number of other ranks have been wounded ; two Assistant Superintendents of Police, one Inspector and two Head-Constables have been killed, a planter has been murdered, and others have narrowly escaped. We cannot be sure now that this death roll is complete. Many Hindus have been murdered. Numbers are missing, but we hope that some of them may escape and turn up later on. Some have been forcibly converted, as I understand, and r threat of death. I dare say Honourable Members have read the account of the maltreatment by the Moplahs of an old lady of over 84 at Calicut, the mother of a Mr. Menon, who is a member of the local municipality. They have also probably heard of the murder of a retired Indian Inspector of Police whose head was cut off and carried about on the top of a spear. There has also been very great damage to property of all kinds. Temples, I regret to say, have been desecrated and numerous acts of arson and pillage committed. As regards Moplah casualties, I can give no figures except that I am informed that in an engagement 400 men were killed. The press reports indicate about a thousand deaths, but this is purely a matter of surmise, though I expect it is by no means an excessive estimate. We know that at Pudokottur these Moplahs who are exceedingly courageous and fearless of death, fought desperately for many hours. In fact their attacks on the troops were only repelled after five hours of heavy fighting. They were armed with carbines looted from the police, sporting rifles taken from various places and with swords and knives. This is all the information I can give on the second portion of the Honourable Member's motion.

I have explained that it is doubtful how far this movement or rising can be ascribed clearly to non-co-operation—non-violent non-co-operation—i.e., Mr. Gandhi's movement, but it certainly seems on the information before us to be connected very definitely with the Khilafat. The policy of Government towards the non-co-operation movement has been very fully explained to this Council on previous occasions, but the Honourable Member now attacks me and says, "why did not Government do more? Why did you not take more vigorous action and prosecute these people, and arrest them." Now what I want to put to Honourable Members is that this Council cannot have it both ways. Last Session, when I stood up in this Council, and stood up in the Legislative Assembly, was there a single man here—except perhaps one or two—who asked Government to take any more strenuous measures than they were taking? I do not remember the Honourable Sir M. Dadasaheb standing up then and saying: "You must take more drastic action; you must strengthen your military force, prosecute here, and prosecute there," and I think it is rather hard on us that we should be challenged therefore in this Council on that account. On the merits I would put it in this way. The question when to undertake and when to forbear from general repressive measures against a movement of this character is always one of difficulty for any Government to decide, and very much more difficult in present political circumstances in India. I think every one will admit that. The Government have been very much exercised over this situation, but we had no reason to believe that it was going to develop in such a speedy manner in this area.

There is also another aspect of this question. You cannot say because there has been a rising in Malabar among a notoriously turbulent people that the Government of India should embark upon a general campaign of repression throughout India.....

The HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY: May I say a word of personal explanation, Sir? I never said "campaign of repression" at all. I said "what precautionary measures were adopted by Government in anticipating these disturbances and suppressing them."

The HONOURABLE SIR WILLIAM VINCENT: Then I gather that the Honourable Member does not attack us on that ground, and I will at once leave the point. I have explained the precautionary measures taken immediately before the rising. There are however two facts which I omitted to mention. The first is that there were in July certain very violent speeches made in Malabar, and the Government of Madras were considering the question of prosecuting the speakers when these outrages occurred. The second is one to which I ought in justice to the Madras Government to refer. In May the Local Government were about to prosecute Mahomed Ali for speeches delivered down in Madras and Erode. Council are aware that after that there were meetings between His Excellency the Viceroy and Mr. Gandhi, and rightly or wrongly, the Government of India thought that it was only fair to give this gentleman Mahomed Ali a *locus poenitentiae* after his apology in the hope that he would abstain from preaching violence in future.

As to precautionary measures, troops were sent down to Calicut immediately the demand was made by the local authorities. That, I think, was between the 11th and the 15th. The numbers were not large. But unless the Members of the Legislative Assembly are prepared to vote considerably larger sums of money than they do at present for internal defence and other military expenditure, we must take certain risks of being able to check disturbances of this kind with small forces.

As to the situation, at present, I can only say that all possible measures to suppress the rising have been taken, but the situation is far from satisfactory. An appreciation of the present situation from Madras runs as follows:—

'Your telegram, Political, dated 28th August 1921. Appreciation general situation. Malabar Railway to Calicut has been temporarily restored for running by day and is being held by troops. Garrison Malappuram having been brought back to Calicut the whole interior of South Malabar except Palghat Taluk is in the hands of the rebels. Probable that the troops will again have to meet and overcome determined resistance by the rebels in force. Subsequent operations will take the form of locating and dealing with numerous small and mobile parties of Moplahs in extremely difficult country. Active assistance by local inhabitants cannot be counted on. Situation from point of view of civil administration is that local machinery of Government has broken down. Throughout the affected area Government officers have been wrecked and looted and records destroyed. Communications have been obstructed. Those officials who have not escaped are, so far as known, either captive or in hiding. All Government officers and Courts have ceased to function and ordinary business is at a stand-still. Famine conditions imminent in portions of affected area. Europeans and numerous Hindu refugees of all classes now concentrated at Calicut.'

I do not propose to tell the Council, and I think they will not expect me to tell them, the exact military force available, because any information that is published will undoubtedly get to the Moplahs themselves and indeed to others who perhaps are hostile to Government. I may say, however, that the Madras Government asked for further reinforcements recently, but the last I have heard is that they are satisfied with the number of troops they have now in Malabar. The situation is now in hand. We shall, however, probably hear of at least one more serious attack by these Moplahs, and then I hope that the thing may dwindle down to more or less desultory disorders. As

an indication of the prevalence of crime, I may say that in one police-station there are said to have been reported 45 dacoities. I do not think after what His Excellency said the other day and the facts that I have given to this Council in the short time available, that it can be suggested that in the circumstances martial law was not necessary. I may say, however, that we have issued a manual of Martial Law Instructions, which will, I think, ensure that all possible care is taken to avoid the use of unnecessary force, anything that is humiliating to Indians or any racial distinctions which are unfair and unreasonable. If I had time I should have liked to read to the Council many extracts of these Instructions. Among them these citations may, however, interest the Council :

‘ Everything which is likely to cause bitterness or permanent hostility should, as far as possible, be avoided. Even if the population or a part of it is in rebellion, it must be remembered that the inhabitants are our fellow-subjects whose loyalty and affection it is desirable to recover and retain.

‘ There should be no greater interference with liberty or property than the situation renders necessary. The suspension of the ordinary law does not mean that justice ceases to be administered. On the contrary the suspension makes it doubly imperative that all concerned should see that justice and not irresponsible violence is done. There should be no punishment without a trial. Offenders should be brought to trial with the least possible delay. If sufficient evidence is not forthcoming within a reasonable time, they should be released. The punishment of whipping should not ordinarily be awarded except for an offence of violence or an offence for which whipping may be awarded under the ordinary law. Interference with liberty and property and public convenience must be limited to what is necessary. Orders likely to humiliate individuals or classes or likely to offend religious sentiment, should be avoided.’

And so on.

No one can however altogether avoid action which may affect religious sentiments if a number of armed Moplahs collect in mosques in furtherance of their criminal purpose.

I think I have now given the Council all the information I have, but I should like to convey to the people, in Malabar, some expression of sympathy, some expression of regret from the Government of India and from this Council for the lives lost, temples desecrated, injuries caused, and property destroyed, and I am sure I am voicing the sentiments of everybody in this Council in this matter. I should like also to convey to the Royal, Military and Auxiliary Forces, and indeed to all servants of the Crown in Malabar, our gratitude for their services. I should like also, if I may, to express our sympathy with the Madras Government and to convey to them an expression of our recognition of the manner in which all concerned have performed duties, both arduous and distasteful.

The HONOURABLE MR. ANNAMALAI CHETTIYAR : Sir, after hearing the speech of His Excellency the Viceroy the other day and the speeches made by the Honourable Mover and by the Honourable the Home Member, I do not think I shall be justified in inflicting upon you a repetition of the details. But I do hope you will bear with me if some of the incidents are touched upon.

In the first place, Sir, I should like to inform the Honourable Members of this Council that I do not intend to enter into the cause of the Moplah outbreak, I am rather concerned with its disastrous effects.

[Mr. Annamalai Chettiyar.]

These Moplahs are a set of fanatics full of zeal and ardour for the propagation of their religion by any means. Having secured the isolation of Malabar by cutting off all communications in an organised manner, and having paralysed the authorities by raiding police-stations and killing some of the officials, the rebels began their work of destruction and plunder. They flung themselves on the unoffending inhabitants, carrying desolation and destruction wherever they went. Nothing could stop their fanatical fury. With Koran in one hand and the sword in the other these lawless bands marched through rich villages forcing conversion or death on the unwilling Hindu population of the locality. The houses of these Hindus and other non-Muslims have been broken into and properties, valued at several lakhs of rupees, have been looted and carried away. Inmates of houses were tortured. Men, women and children were murdered in cold blood. Age and sex mattered not to them. Hindu temples were destroyed; the images were broken; the temple jewels were carried away. The landed aristocracy of the place were subjected to a most cruel treatment. People in large numbers have been forced to leave off their belongings and flee for life to the town of Calicut where they have now taken refuge. The European community also have suffered much at the hands of the rioters, and it is miraculous that some of them have been able to make good their escape across the troubled area into Calicut. Such is the nature of the tragedy enacted in Malabar.

Mr. Yakub Hasan, the President of the Madras Provincial Conference, who says that he knows these Moplahs rather intimately has some fine things to say of them. In his Presidential address at Tanjore, he says, "Once the blood of the Moplah is up, there is no knowing what it will lead to. Leaders of the community who have influence with the Moplahs, alone can pacify them." The blood of the Moplah is up, Sir, and we know to our cost what it has led to.

While events are thus moving so rapidly in Malabar, it is a matter for very great regret that responsible Muslim leaders in different parts of the country have not yet come forward with their condemnation of this dastardly rising. It may be suggested that an immediate expression of their opinion will not carry weight with the Moplahs now that they are in the full swing of their fury. It is my humble opinion, however, that such an expression of their opinion will go far to pacify the rioters, to allay public feeling and restore peace which we all so much desire.

It may not be out of place here to refer to the attempts made in recent years by the leaders of the two great communities, the Hindu and the Muhammadan, for the promotion of good feeling and for the establishment of a Hindu-Moslem unity. That, Sir, is a consummation devoutly to be wished. I for one am a firm believer in the growth of such a feeling. But, for the unity to be harmonious, it must be spontaneous and when such a unity does establish itself, we shall have no more of these regrettable occurrences. I appeal to you, Sir, whether actions of this kind, such as the wholesale destruction of life, the looting of property, the desecration of sacred temples, the cold-blooded murders of men, women and children and the trampling under foot of the cherished sentiments of the Hindus, whether these are calculated to secure that unity which we have so much at heart. I am sure a decided 'no' will be the answer

from the responsible leaders of the Muhammadan community. Having regard to the present outbreak it is imperative therefore that responsible Muslim leaders should come forward boldly to denounce and condemn the action of these unruly Moplahs, take the initiative in the matter of giving relief to the sufferers and thus pave the way for a real unity among the two great communities.

If the outbreak has been nipped in the bud, all the later serious developments would not have taken place. I think the Government in the beginning was little slow to move. Probably the outbreak was so sudden that it was some time before they found out where they were. Having moved, they have done everything with commendable promptitude. It is a matter for gratification that no excesses have been committed by the military.

To restore confidence in the public mind and to prevent similar risings from springing up all over the country with the inevitable effect of plunging the whole country into a state of anarchy and chaos, the Government should take immediate steps to mete out adequate punishment to the guilty.

Confining myself, as I do, to the disastrous effects of this rising, I shall be failing in my duty if I do not point out that there is an urgent necessity to grant adequate relief to the sufferers and make them feel that there will be no repetition of such outbreaks in future. Unless safety of life and property be guaranteed, most of the people will be reluctant to return to their desolated homes to begin, what is for all practical purposes, a new life. The Government of Madras have issued a Communiqué stating that there is likely to be a famine in Malabar owing to the looting and the blocking up of the main roads. I believe that, should such be the case, the Government will take immediate steps to ascertain the extent of relief required and to send in adequate supplies of food-grains for the consumption of the people in the affected area.

I am sure that the Government will spare no pains to ascertain the extent of the loss sustained by the unfortunate sufferers and compensate them fully by recovering from the Moplah rebels the full amount of their loss. I am also sure that in this, its laudable desire, the whole country will rally round the Government and the Muhammadan community especially will certainly support any action that the Government may take with a view to alleviate the terrible suffering caused by the wanton destruction of a fanatical mob.

In conclusion, I appeal to the Honourable Members of this Council, more especially to the Muhammadan Members, to support in unambiguous and unequivocal terms any action seeking to give the innocent victims adequate relief for all the losses they have sustained through no fault of their own, irrespective of any consideration other than the extent of their losses and the demands of justice.

THE HONOURABLE COLONEL SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN: We have heard with great concern all that has been said by the Mover and by the local Member, as well as by the Honourable the Home Member. Of course a great deal is said about the Moplahs, but what I personally think of this is, that it is not a big affair, because there is nobody to help the Moplahs. They are only a small class; they have got the sea on the other side of them, and it was quite natural that they must be defeated very soon. I am very glad that martial law has been proclaimed. But when martial law was first

[Colonel Sir Umar Hayat Khan.]

proclaimed, in the Punjab, this Council was against it. The Viceroy was then accused and so were the local authorities. What has happened now? Exactly the same thing. History has repeated itself and it will repeat itself

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. M. BHURGRI : The Honourable Member is quite wrong. He says we accused the Viceroy and the Government. That is not the case.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Order, Order, unless the Honourable Member proposes to intervene with a personal explanation, I must desire him to reserve his remarks.

THE HONOURABLE COLONEL SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN : There is one thing, Sir, that I want particularly to put before the Council, and that is the cause and effect. There has always been one thing. The agitators have spoken and made violent speeches to the mobs, be they Moplahs, Punjabis, or working classes. And what has happened? These mobs have got together and have rioted and killed people, with the result that they have had to be fired upon. Why does this happen? I think it is absolutely because when such a thing was done in the Punjab, weakness was shown. I can positively assert that the Punjab disturbances were far ahead of these Moplah disturbances. The Moplahs could not be helped by any one. The Punjabis could be helped by a foreign invasion and lots of fanatics on the other side of the Indus would have joined them, and the thing would have been most serious. That was a far bigger affair, but the Council then was a critic of the Government. Whatever Government did they made out was wrong, and, of course the Government was criticised. Now, I am very glad that the Council knows that they are also part and parcel of the Government, and that, when these things happen, they must also bear the consequences. That is why some of my friends are now saying "Oh, stop this, oh it is very bad!" and this and that. Before that, was it not a weakness shown to those who had done mischief that resulted in all that happened afterwards? Take Ahmedabad and all these troubles with the mill-owners, everything in fact; which has all resulted from the same cause. There is a Persian saying which translated means "If you want to test a big granary, you only take one handful out of it."

Sir, again, sometimes when you do not want to make a thing public, the best thing is to whisper it into a man's ears as a secret and tell him "Please do not say anything about it." When you do so, it at once spreads. When you do not want violence, say "This Satanic Government wants to kill you all; you are going to be nowhere in India if this Government remains." Then quietly say "Don't you touch them." Look at Adam, Sir, when he was told not to touch a fruit. What did he do? He touched it. It is human nature. You tell them that such and such people are your greatest enemies and they are doing their very best against you. But you are not to do anything. How can human nature act like that, or that it will be good to its enemies? They are not all saints, and one of the causes, I think, is that directly you say "be non-violent," people get violent at once.

At the end I would only emphasise this fact that now, when we Indians have got a hand in the Government, we should work up to the mark and take

our responsibilities and stop all these happenings. That can only be done by co-operation with the Government, and I think this Moplah trouble ought to be the last. If we again act in the same way, let out all the Moplahs who have done anything, say that martial law was introduced wrongly, firing was resorted to wrongly, and all that sort of thing, then the same things will be repeated again. I only hope now that such a step or steps will be taken as to finish this rotten state of affairs for ever and relieve poor India from the clutches of what I may describe, if I am not interrupted, as that little class who are bent on mischief and who want to bring revolution into the country.

The HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH: Sir, I had no desire to join in the discussion; moreover unfortunately, I was not present when the Honourable Sir Manockji Dadabhoy introduced his motion; but my friend the Honourable Sir Umar Hayat Khan has given expression to views which are peculiarly his own and which he has professed for many many years. I think it is too late for him now to change his views or to think that there is such a thing as human happiness or human freedom.

It does not matter to him whether individual freedom is safe; he is not concerned about it at all. What matters to him is to uphold authority an abstract idea which obsesses his mind; he does not realise that authority primarily is used for the well-being of the people, to safeguard their freedom and to protect their rights. Civil law cannot be abrogated merely because a disturbance has taken place. He said a little while ago that matters in the Punjab were far worse than matters in Madras are to-day. Well, here again, I think it is a matter of opinion. His Royal Highness the Duke of Connaught, and the Government of India have pronounced their judgment. It is impossible to credit the views of the Honourable Member as to the fact, that matters in the Punjab were much worse than matters in Madras are to-day. The Honourable Sir William Vincent a little while ago recounted what has happened there; we never heard of anything of that kind in the Punjab. This, however, is a digression. One thing, however, I want to put to the Council, and that is the strange change in the attitude of the Council, the Honourable Sir William Vincent stood out and upheld that repression was not wanted, while Honourable Members of the Council here counselled that stronger measures were necessary. To me it seemed like giving counsel to a horseman who was riding a spirited horse and knew how to control it, telling him to lash the horse as the best means of control. I think you had better leave the horseman alone, he knows how to manage the beast.

I wish to associate myself with the Honourable Sir William Vincent in regretting the loss of lives, both European and Indian, which has taken place. But, at the same time, I deprecate strongly any strong pronouncement of opinion till we have all the facts before us, and can form a correct judgment. We need not fear that these events will jeopardise Hindu-Muslim unity; it is a lover's quarrel. I think, perhaps, as a Sikh myself I can appreciate how the blood of a Moplah can be up, for I know how the blood of the Sikhs in the Punjab can be up, but we are quick to fight and as quick to make it up. Things, I hope, will soon settle down, and I think we shall soon have peace in Madras. The Honourable Mr. Chettiyar referred to another point. He said that we should charge these Moplahs with all the loss that has been incurred. To my mind this is no way of making a real peace.

[Saiyid Raza Ali.]

Real peace is made by forgetting and forgiving and by establishing a strong and permanent control. Events in India are moving very rapidly and I strongly feel that we must strengthen the forces of law and order; but we can only do so by recognising our responsibilities here and our responsibilities to the people outside. Members of this Council cannot divorce themselves from the feelings of their constituencies outside; what they can do is to educate public opinion and at the same time educate Government into newer ways of appreciating the needs and the wishes of the people.

The HONOURABLE SAIYID RAZA ALI: Sir, it is with a very heavy heart indeed that I rise to take part in this discussion. The occasion to me is too solemn and serious to allow me to indulge in any language which would betray on my part a sense that I want to treat the matter lightly. In fact, Sir, it is with the deepest grief and sorrow that I listened to the speeches of the Honourable the Home Member, on the one hand, and my friend, the Honourable Mr. Chettiyar, on the other. Our difficulty at present, so far as I can see, is that sufficient material has not been placed before us to enable us to form our judgment in a very definite matter on this question. What has, I must say, appeared in the form of Communiqués or fragmentary news issued by the District Magistrate of Malabar, on the one hand, and in certain nationalist newspapers, on the other, tells us that the situation in Malabar is very serious and grave indeed. Nobody perhaps deplores the loss of life both European and Indian more than I as an Indian belonging to the humblest ranks of public workers do. My friend, the Honourable Mr. Chettiyar has addressed a very strong appeal to the Muslim Members to make an expression of opinion on this matter. Now, Sir, I am quite prepared to say that, so far as I know, there is not one Mussalman whom I have met who is prepared either to condone the excesses committed by the Moplahs, or to have any sympathy with them. On the other hand, it is impossible not to condemn the campaign of destruction on which these ignorant men have been out for some time past, or not to support the Government in all reasonable measures that it has taken or it may propose to take in future to restore law and order in that unfortunate district. As I said a minute ago, the occasion is very solemn and very serious, and I feel the difficulty of giving expression to my views in the absence of all those materials which would enable us to trace the cause and effect and to see how the Moplah mind was working, if it is possible to see that, in the course of this rioting. Now, we are very sorry indeed that excesses have been committed by the Moplahs who belong to the religion to which I have the honour to belong, and that they have acted in a manner which cannot be said to be anything but mad and insane. All the same since the discussion has come up before this Council, I would just, with the permission of my Honourable Colleagues, make a few suggestions which, I hope, would be helpful to Government, on the one hand, and my Hindu friends on the other. As a matter of fact there is no Hindu-Muhammadan question involved in the unfortunate disturbances, with this exception that the Moplahs happen to be Mussalmans. Well, excesses have not been unknown in the past, though I would not like to refer to them, in which perhaps the boot has been on the other leg; but I feel convinced that whether in the past in some places excesses have been committed by the Hindus or at present excesses on a larger scale, a much larger scale, are being committed by the Moplahs who are Mussalmans, that will not and that cannot affect the question of Indian nationality in any way. That is

how I feel. No doubt these disturbances will give a set-back to the movement for the time being, but there is not the least doubt that in course of time we will be able to see these disturbances in their true perspective, and after that there will be an inclination on the part of my Hindu friends to forgive these ignorant and highly excitable Moplahs who have enacted, and are enacting, a very sad Chapter in the history of India.

Now, Sir, I come to my suggestions. It seems to me that two sides of the question have been placed before the public. One, as I have already suggested, was given in the Government Communiqués and in the Notifications that were issued by the District Magistrate of Malabar. On the other hand, we find that Mr. Yakub Hussan, a prominent member of the Muhammadan community who recently presided at the Provincial Conference at Tanjore, has given a version which on certain points is absolutely irreconcilable with the other version. It is not possible for me to say which of these two versions is correct.

I think I would rather wait and see what shape matters take and what inquiries are held and what opinions are pronounced by the Courts of Law, but it does seem to me rather strange that all of a sudden the Moplahs should have started on a wholesale campaign of destruction of life and property, and should they have gone insane and mad, I can say no word in justification of their conduct, but as was pointed out in a nationalist paper the other day, the gunpowder was there but who lighted the match? This is a question which I would ask my Honourable Colleagues to consider carefully. The Honourable the Home Member referred to the events which took place on the 31st July and subsequently he went on to say that an attempt was made towards the end of the third week of August to arrest certain persons, and certain members of the police entered the mosque after taking off their shoes. In the statement that has been officially issued by the Madras Government, I notice that that has been stated to be the main cause of the trouble, and, if that is so, are we not entitled to ask ourselves and ask the Government to hold an inquiry into the whole question as to how it is that knowing, as the District Magistrate did, the excitable nature of the Moplahs and the religious fanaticism with which they have always been fired, whether it was discreet, whether it was right and proper, whether it was expedient to order a Moplah police force to enter the mosque? I do not say that this action was a sufficient justification, or any justification at all, for the Moplahs starting on their murderous campaign. I do not say that at all, but the incident is not unconnected with the subsequent events, and, if so, is not the District Magistrate responsible for that order? It seems to me that, while we condemn the men and ask the Government to take all reasonable steps, and that as expeditiously as possible, to restore law and order, it is the bounden duty of this House to approach the Government with the request that they do appoint a Committee to go into the whole question.

The Honourable the Home Member referred to the economic distress and I have seen it stated in the Press that to a certain extent the present rioting is not unconnected with the treatment of the Zemindars most of whom are Hindus. I do not for one moment say that that allegation is correct, but all the same it is high time that an inquiry should be made into the relations between the Moplah peasants, on the one hand, and the Zemindars, on the other. That is another important question which has got to be gone into.

[Saiyid Raza Ali.]

It is stated in official documents that the Moplahs had proclaimed "swaraj" and it is also stated that they were forcibly converting Hindus to Islam. I am not prepared to say whether this is correct or not. But if I know the word correctly and if I know its proper meaning, it means not only the rule of the Muslim, not only the rule of the Hindu, nor of the Christian, of the Jew, of the Sikh, and of the Parsi, but the rule of all those nationalities and creeds united together. If the Moplahs are such great patriots as to declare "swaraj" then I entirely fail to see how they can possibly convert by force Hindus to Islam. That is another question which has got to be inquired into. Whichever way we may look at it, we come to the conclusion that the disturbances which have occurred in the Malabar District are of sufficient importance to justify us in asking the Government to appoint a small Committee to inquire into these questions at an early date and to submit its report, which in the fulness of time, I have no doubt will be laid on the table of this Council.

Then there is one more matter

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The Honourable Member has exceeded his time.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. S. KHAPARDE: Sir, I rise in my seat to see whether it is not possible for me to put a different interpretation on to the discussion which has taken place up to the present. It appears to me that endeavour has been made to determine a question of fact, and it has been suggested by the Honourable Member who has just sat down that he is not able to decide whether they are questions of fact. But in my opinion I think we should take the facts as expressed by the Honourable the Home Member, and we should take those facts and apply them to the lessons which we learnt from the disturbances which took place in the Punjab. To my mind, it is no use saying, "Look here, you condemned the application of Martial Law in the Punjab and therefore you must never on any occasion proclaim Martial Law anywhere else." What are the lessons which I learnt from the regrettable disturbances in the Punjab? First of all I learnt that civilian officers were not sufficiently associated with the military officers who were called upon to restore law and order. It was found, and I think subsequently admitted, that the action which was taken was taken in too much of a hurry. It must always be remembered that military officers are trained to act at once and act as effectively as they possibly can. Hereafter, if it ever fell to my lot to speak on a matter of that description, I should say that if you put a military officer in a disturbed area to restore law and order, you should also place a civilian officer who would work in conjunction with him. Then the people would know what to do and how they should proceed. Then, if matters did not improve and it was found impossible to persuade the people to remain peaceful and quiet, the civilian officer would make the control of affairs over to the military officer. But before doing so, it would of course be necessary to ascertain that everything possible had been done to pacify the people and, if possible, bring the two parties together. All these things should be tried before resorting to martial law. That is the first thing.

Another lesson which I learnt as the result of the Punjab disturbances was, that after placing the military authorities in power, you should retain the

power of pacifying the people yourself from time to time, as was determined in the case of the disorders in the Punjab.

The District Magistrate was there. He did nothing. He left it to the military and he sat quiet and all these things took place. It is naturally asked, what was the District Magistrate doing when these things were taking place? If he took the military people there, why did he not tell the military people to do this way and that? That is how we have felt. The military law is to be resorted to ultimately. It is to be the last resource of maintaining peace, order, and everything else. I admit that. But as the law of last resource, it should be tried the last. You should not begin with military law. It should be tried the last.

Another point which I wish to enforce so far as it lies in me to do so is this. It has been stated, and by the Honourable Mover also, that martial law means a negation of all law. I humbly submit it is not so, though I know that in text-books it has been so mentioned and the aphorism goes about that martial law is a negation of all law. I humbly submit it is not so. We are in the twentieth century, and working as we do in a complex society such as is in India, martial law should be something like the amalgam of the judicial system of finding out a man to be guilty and the military system of executing him at once. It is to be the speedy carrying out of orders but careful in arriving at those orders, how the orders are to be given and when they are to be given. Later on, I suppose, legislation is coming as to what warnings are to be given before fire-arms are used and so on. So martial law hereafter is not the negation of all law, but the application of the best portion of the judicial system of finding a man guilty and the best portion of the military system of executing him or releasing him at once. Speedy action and judicial assistance have to be combined, of course not by rules, not by arguing at the bar, but by entrusting the administration to the highest military officer and the highest civil officer, if possible the civil officer being assisted by a small Committee of respectable local people. That would be the right way of dealing with these things hereafter, as I conceive it. I therefore ventured to take up the time of this Honourable Council on this question, though I hope that these matters will be considered, evidence will be collected and looked into, and guilt will be adjudged when the time arrives. At present we are concerned only with tendering what advice we can to the executive officers as to how peace is to be restored, and as far as possible without undue, if I may say, severity being displayed, because severity after all leaves bitterness behind, and it is better to be civil a little and secure friendship rather than carry out the idea of revenge to its utmost. Whether they are Hindus or Muhammadans it does not matter to me. I am something like a cosmopolitan. I partake of the nature of both or I disclaim both if you like to say so. It may be the fault of the Hindu landlords or it may be the fault of these Moplahs who are poor and ignorant and therefore revolutionary in their character and very excitable and fanatical and so on. That has nothing to do with us at present. At present our endeavour is to find out how we shall pacify the Malabar Coast, how we shall allow the military to retire from the scene, and how we shall restore civil administration and our judicial methods. I think, Sir, I have at least said what little occurred to me.

THE HONOURABLE MR. K. V. RANGASWAMY AYYANGAR: Sir, as soon as I heard of the distressing news from Malabar, I wanted to ascertain the cause of the trouble as well as what was going on there, but the postal authorities and the telegraph authorities refused to despatch my wires, and I

[MR. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar.]

could get no information as to who was responsible for the trouble and also as to what was going on there. In the absence of any information I am not disposed to blame any party for the troubles. It is most unfortunate. Not only is there an absence of information, but the facts are contradictory. One locates the trouble to an agrarian dispute, another to the Khilafat movement, another to the non-co-operation movement, another to the provocation caused by entering a mosque forcibly, and so on. With such scanty information how can we blame any party? The whole matter will go before a judicial tribunal, and we should not anticipate the judgment and blame one party for the whole trouble. I have also to contradict the fact that the Moplahs were responsible for the destruction of Hindu temples, of Hindu household, and for the wholesale looting. Here is a telegram from an authentic source. The source is no less than that of a District Magistrate of the Presidency of Madras who has been deputed to the Cochin State, as Dewan—Mr. T. Vijayaragava Chariar. He had been to visit the borders of the Cochin State where the trouble was intense, that is, the Ponnani Taluk. He says that he visited the border with certain European officers and the Commissioner of Police, and I quote his statement: "Looting, plunder, etc., are reported to be prevailing by small gangs of K. D.'s, *not of the Moplah fanatic gang*, in the British amsons there." He says clearly that some of the K. D.'s have taken advantage of the disturbances that there is wholesale looting going on and that the destruction of the Hindu temples is not by the Moplahs but by these K. D.'s.

The HONOURABLE SIR ALEXANDER MURRAY: May I ask who K. D.'s are, Sir?

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Will the Honourable Member kindly inform the Council what a K. D. is?

The HONOURABLE MR. K. V. AYYANGAR: K. D.'s are *badmashes* who were convicted before.

The HONOURABLE SIR ALEXANDER MURRAY: May I ask if they are Hindus or Muhammadans?

The HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Are the gentlemen in question Hindus or Muhammadans?

The HONOURABLE MR. K. V. AYYANGAR: I do not know whether they are Muhammadans or Hindus or Christians.

Mr. Vijayaragava Chariar says that looting, plunder, etc., are reported to be by small gangs of K. D.'s *and not by the Moplah fanatic gang*. He says that the wholesale looting of the Hindu temples is not by these people (Moplahs). There is a long extract from a correspondent of the *Hindu* to prove the same point, but I am not going to read that to the Council at this late hour. In the absence of information and in the face of conflicting rumours I am not disposed to blame the Moplahs for these outrages. This Council may be aware that there is on the Statute what is called the Moplah Outrages Act. This Act was passed long before the Khilafat movement or the Home-rule movement came into existence. It has been in existence for the last so many years. I do not exactly know the number of years, but I know definitely that it has been in existence on the Statute-book long before the Khilafat movement.

The mere fact that the Moplah Outrages Act exists there shows the temperament of the Moplahs, and how they are susceptible to these fanatical outrages at the mere incitement. By the existence of this Act we know the volatile and inflammatory nature of the element of which the Moplahs are composed. My friend the Honourable Mr. Chettiyar and others have also stated that the Moplahs are by nature volatile and excitable, and knowing them to be such, we should not blame any movement for this revolt or rebellion.

I may say that even such inflammatory people have kept quiet until now even when most provocative action was taken when Mr. Yakub Hassan and others were arrested. I should attribute it to the non-violent nature of the preaching of Mr. Gandhi. They have been keeping quiet only on account of this preaching, and the Khilafat Secretary wires that in those places where there was preaching of non-violence, the rebellion was not so serious and that in those places where there was no preaching of the doctrines of non-co-operation the Moplah outbreak was intense. That also shows that the cause of the trouble is not the Khilafat or the non-co-operation movement. I do not belong to the non-co-operation movement, but I should say that the facts are such as I have described. I may say one more thing. I should emphatically disapprove of the action of His Excellency Lord Willingdon in not having allowed the leaders of the non-co-operation movement to go to the spot as soon as they offered to go to the area and allay the unrest. I am not here to defend the Moplahs or the Khilafat movement, but to state that, in the absence of information, we should not locate the trouble to a particular cause and we should not blame a certain party for the whole trouble.

The HONOURABLE MR. V. G. KALE : Sir, I find it rather difficult to follow my honourable friend in what he has stated just now with regard to the causes and the origin of the trouble in Malabar. I am quite prepared to suspend my judgment as to the share of responsibility which has to be thrown upon the various parties concerned in this affair, but I think the Honourable Mr. Rangaswamy Ayyangar has gone rather too far in trying to exonerate the Moplahs of almost all responsibility for the excesses that have been committed in that district. He has been telling us on the authority of a certain telegram, while against that I think there are hundreds of other telegrams which have been received by the Government and the people,—he has been pitting a certain message against a hundred telegrams and trying to convince us that the Moplahs have not been responsible for plunder and desecration of temples, but some other people whom we do not know. Whatever we may think about the real origin of the trouble, I do not think that the Moplahs, however, unfortunate and ignorant they may be, can be exonerated of all responsibility in this matter. Then, again, he has gone to the length of saying that this trouble has occurred not on account of certain agitation that has been carried on in the district, but is due to some other causes. If we are really to suspend our judgment, we ought not to be positive on that score also. How can the Honourable Mr. Rangaswami Ayyangar tell us that because non-co-operation is non-violent or supposed to be non-violent, therefore it must have nothing to do with the Moplah trouble. This is just like the dilemma which my honourable friend Mr. Saiyid Raza Ali has put before us. He says, "How could the Moplahs have declared Swaraj and at the same time have tried to convert Hindus to Islam?" According to him, these two things are absolutely inconsistent, but I do not see any incompatibility between the two. The Moplahs may have declared Swaraj and independence, but we know they are

[Mr. V. G. Kale.]

ignorant. They are fanatical and they do not know what real 'Swaraj' is. If they had understood what Swaraj means, namely, equality and liberty, certainly they would not have committed the fanatical excesses imputed to them; but Swaraj is a slogan, the true significance of which is hardly understood by even one per cent. of the population of the country. As they do not know what Swaraj means, what liberty is and what democracy is, there is no inconsistency whatever between the declaration of independence on the part of the Moplahs and their attempts to convert Hindus to Islam. Similarly, in the case of the dilemma on the horns of which our friend Mr. Rangaswami has attempted to throw us, namely, that as non-co-operation is non-violent, it is not likely that the Moplahs could have been actuated by any motives which had any relation to the non-co-operation movement. We do not know how the Moplahs have really been influenced, and to what extent they have been influenced, by the non-co-operation movement. But we know that in several parts of the country in spite of the attempts that have been made by the leaders to keep the movement non-violent, violence has been resorted to. The violence may not have been so serious and dangerous, but violence of a sort there has been. Even in such a simple matter as the boycott of cloth, has there not been some violence? Has there not been use of force? There has been. It may be the ideal of the leaders to keep the movement as non-violent as possible, but those leaders, according to their own showing and on their own admission, have not succeeded everywhere in keeping the movement non-violent, so that there may be some relation between the agitation that has been carried on in the district and the fanatical outbreak which has taken place in Malabar. Therefore I am prepared to suspend my judgment with regard to the share of responsibility that must fall to the lot of different parties, but I do not want that we should go to the other extreme and absolve the Moplahs of all responsibility for the excesses which have been committed. Let us ask Government to probe into the whole matter, to make an inquiry and publish a report as to the origin and the causes of this rising, and it will be the duty of every one in this Council to support Government in whatever steps it deems necessary for the restoration of order as speedily as possible.

The HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: Sir, I think Government may take courage as a result of this debate, which seems to me to have shown clearly that the Council as a whole supports Government in the action that has been taken. Not a single speaker has suggested that the imposition of martial law has been unjustified or hasty, or that any action taken by Government has been in excess of the necessities of the situation.

There are, however, one or two points made by speakers during the course of the debate to which I would like to make a very brief reply. The Honourable Mr. Chettiyar spoke of compensation to the sufferers and the necessity of checking the evil results of famine. Compensation can be awarded, I believe, under the Police Act, and, I think, there is also a special provision in the Moplah Outrages Act. That, however, is a matter for the Madras Government, and surely at the present moment when the rebellion is still in active progress, it is rather premature to think of compensation. But I can assure the Honourable Member that neither that point nor the necessity of providing food where communications have been interrupted or food-stocks depleted will be lost sight of.

One or two members, notably the Honourable Saiyid Raza Ali, have spoken of there being insufficient material before the Council for it to form a judgment. Well, I agree that our information is in some respects defective and fragmentary. That, again, is largely due to the interruption of communications between Malabar and Madras, but I can assure the Honourable Member and I can assure the Council, as a whole, that there is not the slightest desire on the part of Government to conceal any information which it has received. We have published, I think, every single telegram that we have received from the Madras Government with a single exception, which the Honourable Sir William Vincent read to the House just now. We have not, to the best of my recollection, kept back a single telegram dealing with the facts. The military telegrams, as the Honourable the Home Member explained, cannot be made public, nor have we made public all expressions of opinion, which obviously must be treated as confidential. If the Honourable Member meant to suggest that we have not put forward all that we know of the actual events, then I can assure him that he is mistaken.

The same Honourable Member, Mr. Saiyid Raza Ali, spoke of there being some contradiction between Government Communiqués or the Communiqués issued by the District Magistrate and the statements made by Mr. Yakub Hassan. Well, I leave the Council to judge whether Mr. Yakub Hassan can be accepted as an altogether impartial authority. There is possibly no single person who has done more to excite the feelings of the Moplahs than Mr. Yakub Hassan, and, early in this year, only a few months ago, he was arrested for his attempts to stir up sedition in the very district which is now in the throes of rebellion. He was even then treated with extraordinary consideration and an offer was made to him, if I recollect aright, to furnish security or to obey an order forbidding him to address public meetings in that district. But he refused to accept the offer and was sent to jail. There he remained till the other day; when cholera broke out in the jail, he begged for his release. That is the gentleman whose testimony you are asked to accept in preference to that of the District Magistrate, to that of the Local Government, and to that of the Government of India. As I say, I leave the House to judge.

We were asked also if it was not desirable to appoint a Committee of Inquiry into the incident, when, on the orders of the District Magistrate, the police entered a mosque, with all due precautions not to offend the religious susceptibilities of the people who worshipped at the mosque, in order to search for arms. Here, again, I am perfectly content to leave it to the House to decide as to whether this is the moment to appoint a Committee of Inquiry into that incident. That was done in exercise of the ordinary authority conferred by the law on the Magistrate and on the police, and, until order has been restored, and until the guilty have been brought to justice, I can see no reason whatever for having any special inquiry into that incident. There will no doubt in due course be a general inquiry into the whole history of this rebellion, but why that particular incident should be magnified into one of such importance that it requires a special inquiry, I fail altogether to see.

The Honourable Mr. Saiyid Raza Ali also suggested that the present agitation, which led to this outbreak of violence, arose from bad relations between the Muhammadan peasantry and the Hindu landlords. Well, he may have sources of information which are not in my possession, but I wish to repeat what the Honourable the Home Member said in the course of his speech that

[Mr. H. D. Craik.]

we have no evidence whatever to point to the fact that agrarian unrest of any kind is at the bottom of this trouble. The trouble may be described as religious, it may be described as political, but it is certainly not, so far as any information we have is concerned, agrarian.

The Honourable Mr. Khaparde made a point which I accept without hesitation as a most reasonable point, that some of the mistakes made during the administration of martial law in the Punjab two years ago were due to the fact that there was not sufficiently close association between the civil and military officers. I wish to re-assure the Honourable Member on this point. We recognised that this was a defect in the Punjab, and special precautions have been taken this time to ensure that that mistake shall not be repeated. The Government of India in a recent telegram to the Government of Madras asked, or rather directed, that special orders should be promulgated for the military to consult and keep in the closest touch with the civil authorities. They went on to say—“The Government of India presume that all officers, civil and military, will observe the instructions relating to martial law recently issued.” Those are the instructions from which the Honourable the Home Member read out a few extracts. The cardinal principle of those instructions is that there should be the closest possible association between the military commander and the civil officials. The military commander is bound on every important question to consult the civil officer and, though he is not bound to take his advice, and ultimately the responsibility rests with the military commander, yet he disregards the advice of his civil colleague at his peril, and he would have to justify his doing so afterwards. I may add that similar orders have been issued by His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief direct to his military subordinates. In addition, Mr. Evans, who, I believe, is a senior civilian in Madras, with a particularly intimate acquaintance with the Malabar district, has been placed on special duty in that district to co-operate with the military commander.

One last word I would like to say in reply to what fell from the Honourable Mr. Aiyangar. Mr. Aiyangar says that he is not disposed to blame the Moplahs. Well I think he must, at any rate in this Council, be alone in holding that opinion. He puts the blame on a caste I have never heard of called the K. D's. Well, if these are what we know in Northern India as *Khidis*, there may be something in it, but I really do not think the word K. D. occurs in any of the information we have received from the Government of Madras. To say that the Moplahs have not been guilty of the desecration of Hindu temples, the looting of Hindu houses, or even of the forcible conversion of Hindus is to ignore what are palpable facts admitted by everybody else. They have been guilty of these things; there is not the slightest doubt about it. It is not as if this was the first occurrence of its kind. Whenever a Moplah breaks out in this way, he is guilty of these particular forms of excess. It may interest the House if I read a very short extract from a Gazetteer written some years ago describing what happened on the occasion of the last Moplah outbreak. The publication says:—

‘The saddest part of the whole affair was its want of reason. The few survivors could point to no single grievance that would bear examination; but it is plain that a plot had already been hatched, when on February 1898, (that is 25 years ago) the arrest of four of the ringleaders precipitated the outbreak before the plans of the fanatics had been fully matured. The same evening a gang of 20 Mappilas went out on the warpath from

Chembrosseri *ansam*, and for five days in ever-increasing numbers they terrorised the country side. Hindus were murdered, or their *kudumis* were cut off, and they were summarily converted to Islam.

Temples were desecrated and burnt; houses were looted in search of food, money and arms. Finally, on March 1st, hard-pressed by the pursuit of the troops the fanatics entered the Manjeri temple determined to make their last stand on a spot hallowed in their eyes as the scene of the first triumphant act of the tragedy of 1849. Twenty soldiers were guarding the treasury on the hill opposite the temple, and with them shots were exchanged. At 9 A.M. when the main body of the troops came up in great anxiety for the safety of the treasury guard and occupied the hill overlooking the temple, from a distance of some 750 yards across a deep valley covered with trees and bushes.....

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Order, order. I do not think we need have any more of this lengthy extract read in Council.

THE HONOURABLE MR. H. D. CRAIK: There is only one point more, Sir. The survivors of these Moplahs who took part in this rising, 92 in all, were not taken alive, not a single one of them; those who were not killed by the troops were murdered by their own comrades as it was apparently a point of honour that none of them should be taken alive by the troops.

Sir, I think I have replied to all the points made during the course of the debate which seemed to me to require some statement or assurance on the part of Government. I can only repeat what I stated in the beginning, that I think Government have every reason to be grateful to the Council for the line it has taken and to thank the Honourable Member who brought forward this motion for having done us a service. As I said before, the hands of Government have been greatly strengthened by the proceedings in this House to-day, as there has been an unmistakable expression, I take it, of approval of the action taken and of determination to support Government in any future action they may take.

THE HONOURABLE MR. E. L. L. HAMMOND: Sir, there is one point, a very small point, which I think has escaped the notice of previous speakers in connection with the speech of the Honourable Saiyid Raza Ali. I am anxious not to misquote the Honourable Member; doubtless he will correct me if I am wrong; but I think he said that an inquiry, the usual inevitable inquiry, must be made because when there had been a lot of gun-powder spread he wanted an inquiry as to whose hand it was that lit the match. I venture to suggest that that is ridiculous. If you are going to have people spreading gun-powder about, without making any inquiry as to who brought in the inflammable material, it is no use suggesting, as the Honourable Member did, that it may be the tactlessness of the police which lighted the match.

THE HONOURABLE SIR ZULFIKAR ALI KHAN: Sir, I am very reluctant to detain the Council after so many speeches have been delivered on this subject, but I think that my silence on this occasion, when affairs of such gravity are being discussed here, would carry the impression that I took no interest in affairs which vitally concern the community to which I have the honour to belong. Sir, nobody deploras and regrets the excesses committed by the Moplahs in the Malabar district more sincerely than myself; a few Europeans have been murdered; innocent Europeans and Hindus, as we learn from the reports, have been murdered, and their temples have been desecrated, and it is also said that they have forcibly converted some Hindus to Islam. All these matters are very painful to those who wish that peace and order may reign in India. But these people who have committed these outrages have

[Sir Zulfikar Ali Khan.]

suffered the penalty of their criminal and fatuous behaviour and have got their deserts. Hundreds of them have been killed, and it is a matter of reflection that when so many people have been killed by the military nobody condemns the action of Government in this matter. I think therein consists the strength of Government and the wise action of Government on this occasion. The only thing that we all feel is this, that after some time when the situation is less obscure Government would adopt a policy which tends towards leniency and sympathy, as some of my Hindu colleagues even have advocated. The strength of Government will further be reinforced by showing merciful and sympathetic treatment than by adopting a vindictive policy as some members have suggested. The difference between the present attitude of Government and the attitude adopted by the same Government in the Punjab is this, that whereas in the Punjab there was such bitter feeling about the application of martial law, on this occasion there is nobody even criticising the Government, much less condemning it. Therefore, Sir, I think that on this occasion when the situation is not very clear, it is not possible for any member to advise Government as to the course which they should adopt, because they will let the law run its course ; but I hope, as I said before, that Government will not show to the people that they are unnecessarily severe or vindictive in the measures which they may adopt against these Moplahs.

The HONOURABLE SIR MANECKJI DADABHOY : Sir, I am perfectly satisfied with the explanations which have been given by the Honourable the Home Member and the Honourable Mr. Craik, and I now ask your leave to withdraw my motion for adjournment.

The motion was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

The Council adjourned till 11 o'clock on Tuesday, the 6th September, 1921, in the Council Chamber.