

**SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICES IN
INDIAN RAILWAYS**

[Action taken by the Government on the Observations/
Recommendations of the Committee contained in
their Sixty-Ninth Report (16th Lok Sabha)]

**MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS
(Railway Board)**

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2017-18)**

NINETY-NINTH REPORT

SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

NINETY NINTH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2017-18)

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICE IN INDIAN RAILWAYS

[Action taken by the Government on the Observations/
Recommendations of the Committee contained in
their Sixty-Ninth Report (16th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS
(Railway Board)



Presented to Lok Sabha on:

28/03/2018

Laid in Rajya Sabha on:

28/03/2018

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

March, 2018/ Chaitra, 1940 (Saka)

CONTENTS

		PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2017-18)		(iii)
COMPOSITION OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE-II OF PAC(2017-18)		(iv)
INTRODUCTION		(v)
CHAPTER I	Report	1
CHAPTER II*	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government	
CHAPTER III*	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government	
CHAPTER IV*	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration	
CHAPTER V*	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies	
APPENDICES*		
I	Minutes of the Seventh Sitting of Sub-Committee II of the Public Accounts Committee (2017-18) held on 20 March, 2018.	
II	Minutes of the 22nd Sitting of Public Accounts Committee (2017-18) held on 23 rd March, 2018.	
III	Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Sixty Ninth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha)	

* Not appended to the cyclostyled copy of the Report

COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2017-18)

Shri Mallikarjun Kharge - Chairperson	
	<u>MEMBERS</u>
	<u>LOK SABHA</u>
2.	Shri Sudip Bandyopadhyay
3.	Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
4.	Shri Prem Singh Chandumajra
5.	Shri Nishikant Dubey
6.	Shri Gajanan Chandrakant Kirtikar
7.	Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
8.	Smt. Riti Pathak
9.	Shri Neiphiu Rih [*]
10.	Shri Abhishek Singh
11.	Prof. Ram Shanker
12.	Dr. Kirit Somaiya
13.	Shri Anurag Singh Thakur
14.	Shri Shivkumar C. Udasi
15.	Dr. P. Venugopal
	<u>RAJYA SABHA</u>
16.	Shri Naresh Agrawal
17.	Shri Satyavrat Chaturvedi
18.	Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
19.	Shri Mohd. Ali Khan [†]
20.	Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy [‡]
21.	Shri Ajay Sancheti
22.	Shri Bhupender Yadav
	<u>SECRETARIAT</u>
1.	Shri A.K. Singh - Additional Secretary
2.	Shri T. JayaKumar - Director
3.	Shri A.K. Yadav - Deputy Secretary

* Ceased to be a Member of Committee consequent upon acceptance of his resignation from Lok Sabha w.e.f. 22 February, 2018.

† Elected w.e.f. 29 December, 2017 in lieu of vacancy caused due to retirement of Shri Shantaram Naik.

‡ ceased to be a Member of Committee consequent upon his retirement from Rajya Sabha on 18 August, 2017 and re-elected w.e.f. 29 December, 2017.

**COMPOSITION OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE – II (Railways) OF THE PUBLIC
ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2017-18)**

Convenor	:	1.	Dr. Kirit Somaiya
Alternate Convenor	:	2.	Shri Naresh Agrawal
Members	:	3.	Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
		4.	Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
		5.	Shri Anurag Singh Thakur
		6.	Prof. Ram Shanker

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee (2017-18) having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Ninety-Ninth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Sixty-Ninth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on **Suburban Train Service in Indian Railways**'.

2. The Sixty-Ninth Report was presented to Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 11 April, 2017. Replies of the Government to the Observations/ Recommendations contained in the Report were received on 19 February, 2018. The Sub-Committee-II of PAC (2017-18) considered and adopted the Report at their sitting held on 20 March, 2018. The Report was considered by the Public Accounts Committee (2017-18) during their sitting held on 23 March, 2018. The Minutes of the Sittings form Appendices to the Report.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Office of the C&AG of India.

5. An analysis of the action taken by the Government on the Observations/ Recommendations contained in the Sixty-Ninth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) is given at *Appendix-III*.

NEW DELHI;
27 March, 2018
06 Chaitra, 1940 (*Saka*)

MALLIKARJUN KHARGE
Chairperson
Public Accounts Committee

REPORT

CHAPTER – I

This Report of the Public Accounts Committee deals with the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Sixty-Ninth Report (16th Lok Sabha) on '**Suburban Train Service in Indian Railways**' relating to the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board).

2. The Sixty-Ninth Report (16th Lok Sabha), which was presented to Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 11th April, 2017, contained 13 Observations and Recommendations. Action Taken Notes in respect of all the Observations and Recommendations have been received from the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) and are broadly categorized as under :

- | | | |
|-------|---|----------------------|
| (i) | Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government: | |
| | Para Nos. 1-6, and 8-13 | Total: 12 |
| | | Chapter - II |
| (ii) | Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government: | |
| | Para Nos. 7 | Total: 1 |
| | | Chapter - III |
| (iii) | Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration: | |
| | Para Nos. Nil | Total: Nil |
| | | Chapter - IV |
| (iv) | Observations/Recommendations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies: | |
| | Para Nos. Nil | Total: Nil |
| | | Chapter – V |

3. The detailed examination of the subject by the Committee had revealed lack of punctuality of trains and loss of lives of passengers under suburban train services. Further, the Committee had observed deficiency in infrastructure and improper medical

facilities for accidents victims, of suburban trains. It has also found inadequate compensation to accident victims, pendency of accident cases at Railway Claims Tribunal due to staff crunch. The Committee had adversely commented on lack of adequate security of passengers, deficient financial performance and lack of ideas to commercially exploit the suburban train services.

4. The Action Taken Notes furnished by the Ministry of Railways in respect of all the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee have been reproduced in the relevant chapters of this Report. The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their Observations/Recommendations made in their Sixty-Ninth Report, which need reiteration or merit comments.

LOSS OF LIVES OF PASSENGERS IN SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICES
(Recommendation No.4)

5. The Committee were aghast to find the unfortunate figure of large number of loss of precious lives of passengers on Suburban Train services which was going upto 15000 deaths, every year. More so, when major portion of problem is located in a particular region, i.e. the Mumbai suburban system. Out of total deaths of 15000 per year, 6000 take place in Mumbai region alone. The cross examination of representatives of the Ministry of Railways had revealed that in three quarters of the year 2016 (Jan-Sep) alone 783 deaths were occurred on the Western Railway, while 1414 deaths were recorded on the Central Railway. The figures of those injured is equally alarming. Among the prominent reasons stated by the Ministry were line crossings/trespassing accounting for more than 50% of deaths due to falling from running trains. As per evidence tendered before the Committee, the Central Railway have got a study done by a consultancy firm on critical trespassing locations at Mumbai Division and prepared a proposal of work at an estimated cost of Rs.550 crore which is awaiting approval of the Ministry. However, the Committee had observed that given the alarming number of loss of precious human lives every year the work of trespassing control should be undertaken on war footing. Ministry of Railways should commence works in right earnest and accord immediate priority for construction of fencing between railway lines, Foot Over Bridges, Escalators and Elevators etc. In their own admission, the Ministry of Railways had stated that just by construction of Foot Over Bridges in

Mumbai division the situation of trespassing had been resolved to a great extent. The Committee had, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Railways take urgent necessary action to complete the construction of FOBs, escalators and elevators at all the stations on the Suburban sections of Indian Railways within next four months and present the status report to the Committee. The development work of Mumbai division of suburban railways which accounts for 52 % of total deaths due to trespassing is being managed by Mumbai Rail Vikas Corporation (MRVC). The Railways had submitted detailed action plan of MRVC for controlling trespassing in Mumbai Division. The Committee sought the status of work done on the said action plan within the next six months of presentation of the Report.

6. The Ministry of Railway in their reply furnished as under:

"A work was sanctioned by Railway Board in 2012-13 for 221 escalators & 400 lifts and in 2013-14 for 179 escalators, which included 12 no. of C category stations for lifts & escalators. Further, Railways have also been getting the works sanctioned under GM's power for lifts & escalators at Railway Stations. Funds have also been made available under CSR for some organisations in some of the Railways. Accordingly, 73 lifts at 30 stations and 130 escalators at 47 stations have been installed at C category (sub-urban) stations on IR. In addition, works are in progress for 89 lifts at 37 stations and 115 escalators at 52 stations in Sub-urban sections of IR. Details for the same are as under:

Details of Escalators & Lifts Installed & planned in Sub Urban Area					
ESCALATORS					
SN	Railway	Escalator Installed		Escalators planned	
		Nos.	No. of Stations	Nos.	No. of Stations
1	CR	19	13	85	38
2	WR	32	9	18	8
3	SR	37	15	2	1
4	NR	28	4	6	2
5	ER	7	4	4	3
6	SER	2	1	-	-
7	SWR	5	1	-	-
8	SCR	-	-	-	-
	Total	130	47	115	52
LIFTS					
SN	Railway	Lifts Installed		Lifts planned	
		Nos.	No. of Stations	Nos.	No. of Stations
1	CR	8	3	57	23
2	WR	3	2	16	7
3	SR	31	16	-	-
4	NR	17	4	7	4
5	ER	4	3	8	2

6	SER	4	1	1	1
7	SWR	6	1	-	-
8	SCR	-	-	-	-
	Total	73	30	89	37

A proposal has already been moved for sanction in line with the Budget announcement 2017-18 for providing lifts and escalators at 500 stations. With this, 286 nos. of suburban stations shall be provided with escalators/elevators out of 361 balance stations on Indian Railways and the balance stations shall be taken up in due course of time subject to techno-commercial feasibility and availability of fund. Provision of lifts and escalators at stations is a continuous process and is done as per need, priority of work.

FOBs

Zonal Railways have been advised to expedite completion of FOBs in suburban sections. In the last four months, 2 FOBs, 22 Escalators and 22 Lifts have been provided in suburban sections of Indian Railways. Status of work done on the action plan of MRVC for controlling trespassing in Mumbai Division is enclosed as Annexure A,B & C."

7. The Committee reiterate their concern about huge loss of lives and grievous injuries being suffered in suburban train services. Keeping that in view, the Committee had recommended that the Ministry of Railways take urgent necessary action to provide FOBs, escalators and elevators at all the stations on the Suburban sections of Indian Railways within next four months and present the status report to the Committee. The Ministry in their reply has *inter- alia* furnished that 130 escalators at 47 stations and 73 lifts at 30 stations in various Zones have been installed. 115 escalators at 52 stations and 89 lifts at 37 stations have been planned to be installed in Sub Urban areas where the works are in progress. A proposal has been moved for sanction in pursuance with the Budget 2017-18 for providing lifts and escalators at 500 stations. With this, 286 nos. of suburban stations shall be provided with escalators/elevators out of 361 balance stations on Indian Railways and the balance stations shall be taken up in due course of time subject to techno-commercial feasibility and availability of fund. The Committee are not satisfied with the reply of the Ministry in view of the grave situation of loss of large number of lives and maimed cases in suburban railways. They had recommended to provide lifts and escalators at all the suburban stations which is still far from reality. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the work of providing escalators and lifts on suburban railways

stations is completed on priority basis within a time frame. They also desire Ministry of Railways to ensure timely completion of works of construction of boundary walls, FOBs and Subway in suburban railway stations. An apex level monitoring mechanism be created to ensure timely completion of these life saving infrastructure.

PENDENCY OF CASES AT RAILWAY CLAIM TRIBUNALS
(Recommendation No.10)

8. The Committee had observed that keeping in view the large number of deaths and maimed cases in suburban railway, it is of utmost importance that the Railways have a prompt and efficient system of claim settlement in place. The pendency of accident and untoward incident claim cases as on 31.07.2016, as reported to the Committee stands at a staggering number of 37699, with highest pendency at Lucknow and Mumbai Benches of Railway Claims Tribunal (RCT) of 9359 and 6055 cases, respectively. Such Tribunals make suitable awards after considering the claims of passenger in this regard. Compensation in case of death or permanent disability is Rs.4 lakh and in case of injuries, the minimum compensation is Rs.32,000/- and the maximum is Rs.3,60,000/- depending upon the gravity of the injury. The Committee were deeply concerned to note such a huge number of pending cases of unsettled compensation claims with Railway Claim Tribunals. The acute shortage of Claim Tribunals and vacancies in existing Tribunals have made the situation worse. In their own admission by the Railways, Circuit Benches have to be held in view of high pendency and vacancies. The cases of regular deaths/injuries in the premises of the Railways in itself is highly deplorable and the inordinate delay in awarding compensation to the aggrieved passengers/dependants makes the issue more painful. The Committee had, therefore, recommended that the Railways come out with a concrete action plan to eliminate pendency with Claim Tribunals on an urgent basis especially in Lucknow and Mumbai benches of Railway Claims Tribunal and intimate the Committee of the action plan within a period of six months. The Committee had exhorted the Railways to increase the number of permanent benches of Claim Tribunals in view of alarming pendency of cases. Further, the Committee felt that the Ministry of Railways consider the feasibility of revision of amount of compensation keeping in view

of irreparable financial and emotional losses suffered by the kin of deceased/disabled victims as its repercussions extend beyond lifetime of a single individual.

9. The Ministry of Railway (Railway Board) furnished reply as under:

"(a) Multi-pronged actions have been initiated by Ministry of Railways to bring down the number of pending claims cases (accident & untoward incident cases). During the financial year 2016-17, with respect to accident & untoward incident claims cases, total opening balance was 38597 cases, total number of receipt was 7624 cases and total number of disposal was 11711 cases. It may be appreciated that the total pendency of accident & untoward incident cases as on 31.03.2017 has been brought down to 34510 cases.

(b) Pendency of accident & untoward incident cases is more in Lucknow and Mumbai Benches compared to other Benches of RCT as these two Benches have more extensive territorial jurisdiction with high population density. Out of the existing two Benches in Delhi, one bench has, therefore, been shifted to Lucknow to tackle the high pendency in Lucknow Bench which has now two Benches.

(c) Special drive by conducting Circuit Benches are being initiated on the direction of Hon'ble Chairman/RCT for increasing the rate of disposal at Benches where the posts of Members are vacant and pendency is comparatively higher. Benches having high case pendency have been directed to segregate cases into categories so that similar/same type of cases can be taken up together for hearing and disposal.

(d) Most of the vacancies of Technical Members in various Benches of RCT have been filled up. Action has also been initiated to fill up the vacancies of Member (Judicial). General Managers of Zonal Railways have been directed to fill up the vacancies of supporting staff in various Benches of RCT on priority basis. RCT Benches have been authorized to engage outsourced Stenographers who play crucial role in disposal of cases, through walk-in-interview which will mitigate the acute shortage of Stenographers in RCT.

(e) With effect from 01.01.2017, the rate of compensation in train accident and untoward incident has been doubled from Rs.4,00,000/- to Rs.8,00,000/- in the case of death and in case of injuries, the enhanced compensation is Rs 64,000/- to Rs. 8,00,000/- depending upon the gravity of the injury.

The sanctioned strength of Members vis-à-vis the man-in-position in 21 Benches of Railway Claims Tribunal is enclosed at Annexure – 'A'."

10. The Committee note that multi-pronged actions have been initiated by Ministry of Railways to bring down the number of pending claims cases (accident & untoward incident cases). During the financial year 2016-17, with respect to accident & untoward incident claims, total opening balance was 38597 cases,

total number of receipt was 7624 cases and total number of disposal was 11711 cases. Hence total pendency of accident & untoward incident cases as on 31.03.2017 has been brought down to 34510 cases. Further, pendency of accident & untoward incident cases is more in Lucknow and Mumbai Benches compared to other Benches of RCT as these two Benches have more extensive territorial jurisdiction with high population density. Out of the existing two Benches in Delhi, one bench has, therefore, been shifted to Lucknow to tackle the high pendency in Lucknow Bench which has now two Benches. The Benches having high case pendency have been directed to segregate cases into categories so that similar/same type of cases can be taken up together for hearing and disposal. Keeping in view the largest pendency of cases before RCT, the Committee desire that as assured by the representatives of Railway Board during the course of evidence, another Bench of RCT in Mumbai be set up immediately. The Committee also desire that considering the agony and long sufferings of claimants, the Ministry of Railway should set up a mechanism for speedy and transparent settlement of claim cases in a time bound manner.

11. Most of the vacancies of Technical Members in various Benches of RCT have been filled up. Action has also been initiated to fill up the vacancies of Member (Judicial). General Managers of Zonal Railways have been directed by the Ministry of Railways to fill up the vacancies of supporting staff in various Benches of RCT on priority basis. However, the Committee observe that out of the sanctioned strength of 42 in 21 benches of RCT the actual strength is 32 Members and hence has vacancy of almost 25 per cent at the level of Member (Judicial and Technical). The Committee, therefore, exhort the Ministry of Railways to fill up the vacancies at the level of Member (Judicial) as well as Member (Tech.) at the earliest along with the vacancies at the lower cadres so that the pace of disposal of pending cases can be accelerated.

SANCTIONED STRENGTH AND MAN-IN-POSITION OF VARIOUS BENCHES OF RCT AS ON 05.06.2017				
S.No.	Bench	Post	Sanctioned strength	Working
1	Delhi	Chairman	1	1
		Member (Tech)	1	1
2	Chandigarh	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
3	Lucknow	Vice-Chairman (Tech.)	1	0
		Member (Judl.)	1	0
		Member (Judl.)2	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
4	Gorakhpur	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	0
5	Ghaziabad	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
6	Kolkata	Vice-Chairman (Tech.)	1	0
		Member (Judl.)	1	0
7	Bhubaneswar	Member (Judl.)	1	0
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
8	Guwahati	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
		Member(Judl.)2	1	0
		Member(Tech.)2	1	1
9	Patna	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
10	Ranchi	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
11	Mumbai	Vice-Chairman (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
12	Ahmedabad	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
13	Bhopal	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
14	Jaipur	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
15	Nagpur	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
16	Chennai	Vice-Chairman (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
17	Bengaluru	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	0
18	Secunderabad	Member (Judl.)	1	1
		Member (Tech.)	1	1
19	Ernakulam	Member (Judl.)	1	0
		Member (Tech.)	1	0
Total			42	32