

**CONTENTS**

**Fifteenth Series, Vol. XII, Fifth Session, 2010/1932 (Saka)  
No. 26, Tuesday, August 31, 2010/ Bhadra 9, 1932 (Saka)**

<b><u>SUBJECT</u></b>	<b><u>PAGES</u></b>
<b>OBITUARY REFERENCES</b>	2-3
<b>PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE</b>	4-5
<b>MESSAGES FROM RAJYA SABHA AND BILL AS PASSED BY RAJYA SABHA</b>	5
<b>PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE 22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> Reports</b>	7
<b>COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS 9<sup>th</sup> Report</b>	8
<b>COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS 10<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> Reports</b>	8
<b>STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 21<sup>st</sup> to 25<sup>th</sup> Reports</b>	9
<b>STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Reports</b>	10

**STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS**

- (i) (a) Signing of protocol between Republic of India and Swiss Federal Council to amend the existing Agreement for avoidance of double taxation with respect to taxes on income with protocol

Shri Pranab Mukherjee 11-14

- (i) (b) The status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the 78<sup>th</sup> Report of the Standing Committee on Finance on “Flow of Credit to Agriculture Sector”, pertaining to the Department of Financial Services, Ministry of Finance.

Shri Pranab Mukherjee 15

- (ii) “India’s offer of assistance of 25 million US Dollars to Pakistan for flood relief”

16-17

**CALLING ATTENTIONS TO MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE**

- (i) Situation arising out of recent attacks on Indian Fishermen by Srilankan Navy and steps taken by the Government in this regard

18-50

Shri T.R. Baalu

18  
20-29

Shri S.M. Krishna

20-22  
35-38

Dr. M. Thambidurai

30-32

Shri P.R. Natarajan

32-33

Shri A. Ganeshamurthi

33-35

- (ii) Situation arising out of rejection of 40 Lakh tones of rice variety PAU-201 by the Food Safety Standards Authority of India citing provisions of Prevention of Food adulteration Act, 1954 and Food Safety Standards Act, 2006 and steps taken by the Government in regard thereto.

39-50

Shrimati Harsimrat Kaur Badal

39  
42-46

Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad	39-41 46-50
<b>SUBMISSIONS BY MEMBERS</b>	
(i) RE: Caste-based census	55-59
(ii) RE: Supreme Court's observation on free distribution of foodgrains among the poor in the country	84-95
<b>MATTERS UNDER RULE 377</b>	
(i) Need to bring transparency in the interest rates charged by banks on various loans.	62-75
Shri P. T. Thomas	62-63
(ii) Need to take concrete steps for poverty alleviation in the country.	
Shri N.S.V. Chitthan	64
(iii) Need to implement the 'one rank one pension' scheme for retired military personnel.	
Shri Mahabal Mishra	65
(iv) Need to construct the proposed new railway line between Ramganjmandi and Ujjain via Jhalawar	
Shri Sajjan Verma	65
(v) Need to extend the period of exemption of service tax on Sheep Insurance Scheme in Andhra Pradesh upto 31.12.2012	
Dr. Manda Jagannath	66

- (vi) Need to check the menace of wild animals threatening the lives and agricultural produce in Wayanad district, Kerala and provide regular compensation for the recurring losses incurred by farmers.

Shri M. I. Shanavas 67

- (vii) Need to construct a new National Highway from Gudhiatnur village, Adilabad district to Oda Revu Prakasam district in Andhra Pradesh.

Shri Ponnam Prabhakar 68

- (viii) Need to waive loans extended to SCs/STs, minority, backward and landless people in the country under various Central/State Schemes.

Shrimati Santosh Chowdhary 69

- (ix) Need to construct Railway Under Bridges at various level crossings in Bikaner Parliamentary Constituency, Rajasthan.

Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal 70

- (x) Need to bring a stringent law to check the commercialization of education in the country

Shri Ganesh Singh 71

- (xi) Need to accord approval for four-laning of N.H. 59A (Indore-Betul) in Madhya Pradesh.

Shrimati Sumitra Mahajan 72

- (xii) Need to set up Kendriya Vidyalayas, Navodaya Vidyalayas and Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas in Ahmedabad, Patan and Mehasana district of Gujarat.

Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki 72

- (xiii) Need to accord approval to road projects in Fatehpur Parliamentary Constituency, Uttar Pradesh under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana and release adequate funds for the same.

Shri Rakesh Sachan 73

- (xiv) Need to take steps to check the soil erosion caused by river Ganga in rural and urban areas of Allahabad, Uttar Pradesh.

Shri Kapil Muni Karwaria 74

- (xv) Need to construct a culvert bridge between Esalam and Periyathachur villages in Villupuram district, Tamil Nadu, through a Centrally Sponsored Scheme.

Shri M. Anandan 75

**INDIAN MEDICINE CENTRAL COUNCIL  
(AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010**

76-148

Motion to Consider

76

96

Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad

76-77

142-147

Dr. Rajan Sushant

78-83

Shri P.C. Chacko

96-102

Shri Shailendra Kumar

103-104

Shri Vijay Bahadur Singh

105

Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki

106-107

Shri Pratap Singh Bajwa

108-111

Shri Mangani Lal Mandal

112-113

Shri Prem Das Rai

114

Shri P.L. Punia

115

Dr. Ratna De

116-117

Shri S.Semmalai

118-119

Shrimati Jayshreeben Patel	120-121
Dr. Tarun Mandal	122-123
Shri Sanjay Bhoi	124
Shri S.R. Jayadurai	125-127
Shri Chandrakant Khaire	128
Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal	129
Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh	130-131
Shri Amarnath Pradhan	132
Shri Prasanta Kumar Majumdar	133-134
Shri Nilesh Narayan Rane	135
Shri Pulin Bihari Baske	136
Shri B. Mahtab	137-139
Shri Hansraj G. Ahir	140
Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad	141
Clauses 2 to 7 and 1	148
Motion to Pass	148
<b>REPRESENTATION OF THE PEOPLE (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010</b>	149-198
Motion to Consider	149
Shri M. Veerappa Moily	149-150 196-197
Shri Uday Singh	151-153
Shri P.T. Thomas	154-156
Shri Lalu Prasad	157-158
Shri Mulayam Singh Yadav	159
Shri P.L. Punia	160
Dr. Rajan Sushant	161
Dr. Ratna De	162-163
Shri Gorakhnath Pandey	164-165

Shri K.C. Venugopal	166-167
Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal	168
Shri S. Semmalai	169-170
Shri Arjun Roy	171-172
Shri T.K.S. Elangovan	173-174
Shri Naveen Jindal	175-180
Shri P. Karunakaran	181-182
Shri Ratan Singh	183
Shri B. Mahtab	184-186
Shri Anto Antony	187-189
Shri A.T. Nana Patil	190
Shri Mohammed E.T. Basheer	191
Shri Jagdambika Pal	192-193
Shri S.S. Ramasubbu	194
Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh Naik	195
Clauses 2 to 5 and 1	198
Motion to Pass	198
<b>VALEDICTORY REFERENCE</b>	<b>199-203</b>
<b>NATIONAL SONG</b>	<b>203</b>

**OFFICERS OF LOK SABHA**

**THE SPEAKER**

Shrimati Meira Kumar

**THE DEPUTY SPEAKER**

Shri Karia Munda

**PANEL OF CHAIRMEN**

Shri Basu Deb Acharia

Shri P.C. Chacko

Shrimati Sumitra Mahajan

Shri Inder Singh Namdhari

Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha

Shri Arjun Charan Sethi

Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh

Dr. M. Thambidurai

Shri Beni Prasad Verma

Dr. Girija Vyas

**SECRETARY-GENERAL**

Shri P.D.T. Achary



**LOK SABHA DEBATES**

---

---

LOK SABHA

-----

Tuesday, August 31, 2010/ Bhadra 9, 1932 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the Clock

[MADAM SPEAKER in the Chair]

## OBITUARY REFERENCES

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I have to inform the House of the sad demise of two of our former colleagues, Shrimati Usha Choudhary and Shri Kalpanath Sonkar.

Shrimati Usha Choudhary was a member of the Seventh and Eighth Lok Sabhas from 1980 to 1989 representing the Amravati Parliamentary Constituency of Maharashtra.

Shrimati Choudhary was a member of the Committee on Government Assurances and the Committee on Estimates during the Seventh Lok Sabha. She was a member of the Joint Committee on Salaries and Allowances and Pension of Members of Parliament during the Eighth Lok Sabha.

An active social and political worker, Shrimati Choudhary served as the Chairman of the Amravati District Mahila Cooperative Bank. She contributed immensely towards the progress and development of women. She was instrumental in organizing camps for the welfare of women all over the State of Maharashtra and made concerted efforts for the uplift of the downtrodden and backward classes of the society, particularly those belonging to the rural areas. Shrimati Choudhary was awarded the 'Bharat Samaj Unnayan Ratna' by the World Development Parliament Institution, Calcutta in 1984.

A person with a scholarly bent of mind, Shrimati Choudhary was also an accomplished poetess. She has to her credit about a hundred poems published in various magazines and newspapers.

Shrimati Usha Choudhary passed away on 2 August, 2010 at Nagpur, Maharashtra at the age of 68.

Shri Kalpanath Sonkar was a member of the Seventh Lok Sabha from 1980 to 1984 and Ninth Lok Sabha from 1989 to 1991, representing the Basti Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh.

Earlier, Shri Sonkar served as a member of the Uttar Pradesh Legislative Assembly.

Shri Sonkar was a member of the Committee on Absence of Members from the sittings of the House and the Consultative Committee of the Ministry of Railways during the Ninth Lok Sabha.

Shri Sonkar played a proactive role in the uplift of the backward and deprived sections of the society.

Shri Kalpanath Sonkar passed away on 23 August, 2010 at Basti, Uttar Pradesh at the age of 59.

We deeply mourn the loss of these friends and I am sure the House would join me in conveying our condolences to the bereaved families.

The House may now stand in silence for a short while as a mark of respect to the memory of the departed.

**11.02 hrs.**

*The Members then stood in silence for a short while.*

---

**11.03 hrs.**

**PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE**

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, Papers to be Laid on the Table—Shri V. Narayanasamy.

... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): On behalf of Prof. K.V. Thomas, I beg to lay on the Table:--

- (1) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Indian Society of Agricultural Statistics, New Delhi, for the year 2009-2010, alongwith Audited Accounts.
- (ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government of the working of the Indian Society of Agricultural Statistics, New Delhi, for the year 2009-2010.

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3099/15/10)

- (2) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Indian Society of Agricultural Economics, Mumbai, for the year 2009-2010, alongwith Audited Accounts.
- (ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government of the working of the Indian Society of Agricultural Economics, Mumbai, for the year 2009-2010.

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3100/15/10)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI): I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Statement (Hindi and English versions) explaining reasons for not laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Indian Red Cross Society for the years 2004-2005 to 2008-2009; Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education & Research for the year 2008-09 and Regional Institute of Medical Sciences for the year 2008-09 within the stipulated period of nine months after the close of the respective accounting years.

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3101/15/10)

... (*Interruptions*)

---

**11.04 hrs.**

**MESSAGES FROM RAJYA SABHA  
AND  
BILL AS PASSED BY RAJYA SABHA\***

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Madam Speaker, I have to report the following messages received from the Secretary-General of Rajya Sabha:-

- (i) “In accordance with the provisions of rule 127 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to inform the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 27<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 agreed without any amendment to the Essential Commodities (Amendment) Bill, 2010 which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 17<sup>th</sup> August, 2010.”
- (ii) “In accordance with the provisions of rule 127 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to inform the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 agreed without any amendment to the Civil Liability for Nuclear Damage Bill, 2010 which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 25<sup>th</sup> August, 2010.”
- (iii) “In accordance with the provisions of rule 111 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to enclose a copy of the Representation of the People (Amendment) Bill, 2010 which has been passed by the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2010.”

I also lay on the Table the Representation of the People (Amendment) Bill, 2010 as passed by Rajya Sabha on the 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2010.

---

\* Laid on the Table

डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी (वाराणसी): अध्यक्ष महोदया, मुझे कहना है कि...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइये. पेपर्स ले करने दीजिये।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप लौग बैठ जाइये। पेपर्स ले करने दीजिये. अखबार नीचे रखिये।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप अखबार नीचे रखिये।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप जानते हैं कि यह संसदीय शिष्टाचार के विरुद्ध है।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : योगी जी, आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Reports to be presented. Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi. Nothing else will go on record.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी : महोदया, इस सदन में...

MADAM SPEAKER: No, you have to give the Reports of the Public Accounts Committee.

डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी : महोदया, रिपोर्ट तो मैं रखूंगा।...(व्यवधान)

**11.05 hrs.**

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE  
22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> Reports**

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (VARANASI): I beg to present the following Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Public Accounts Committee (2010-11):-

(1) Twenty-second Report on “Excesses Over Voted Grants and Charged Appropriations (2008-09)” relating to the Ministries of Defence, Finance, Home Affairs and Railways.

(2) Twenty-third Report on “Assistance to States for Developing Export Infrastructure and Allied Activities (ASIDE) Scheme” relating to the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Commerce).

अध्यक्ष महोदया : योगी जी, आप बैठ जाइये।

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप लोग बैठ जाइये।

... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Shailendra Kumar is saying.

*(Interruptions) ...\**

---

\* Not recorded



**11.05½ hrs.**

**COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS  
9<sup>th</sup> Report**

श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशाम्बी): महोदया, मैं भारत के नियंत्रक-महालेखापरीक्षक का प्रतिवेदन-संघ सरकार (वाणिज्यिक) (2008 का संख्यांक 11 सीए) के पैरा 14.7.1 के आधार पर ऑयल एण्ड नेचुरल गैस कॉरपोरेशन लिमिटेड-मानदण्डों से अधिक बेसिक सेडिमेन्ट और वाटर कंटेन्ट वाले कूड की बिक्री के कारण हानि के बारे में 32वें प्रतिवेदन (चौदहवीं लोक सभा) में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों पर सरकार द्वारा की-गई-कार्यवाही के बारे में सार्वजनिक उपक्रमों संबंधी समिति (2010-11) का नौवां प्रतिवेदन (हिन्दी तथा अंग्रेजी संस्करण) प्रस्तुत करता हूँ।

**11.06 hrs.**

**COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS  
10<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> Reports**

SHRI JAGDAMBIKA PAL (DOMARIYAGANJ): I beg to present the following Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on Petitions:-

- (1) Tenth Report regarding ill effect of Water and Air pollution caused due to slaughter of animals in slaughter house (Kamela) run by Meerut Nagar Nigam and related issues.
- (2) Eleventh Report on the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Thirty-ninth and Forty-fifth Reports (14th Lok Sabha) on the representations regarding pilferage of huge quantity of coal worth thousand crores of rupees in Gevra/Dipika areas of South Eastern Coalfields Limited and neglecting the youths belonging to weaker and middle class sections in the guidelines which regulate commissioning of LPG distributorship.
- (3) Twelfth Report on representations regarding non payment of dues to the employees of HFCL, Haldia and delay in construction of bridge over River Rupnarayan on NH-6 in West Bengal.

**11.06½ hrs.**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE  
21<sup>st</sup> to 25<sup>th</sup> Reports**

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (HAZARIBAGH): I beg to present the following Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Standing Committee on Finance (2009–10):-

- (1) Twenty-first Report on the Companies Bill, 2009.
- (2) Twenty-second Report on the Coinage Bill, 2009.
- (3) Twenty-third Report on the Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010.
- (4) Twenty-fourth Report on the Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010.
- (5) Twenty-fifth Report on the Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010.

---

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Vilas Muttemwar is saying.

... (*Interruptions*)...\*

---

\* Not recorded

**11.07 hrs.**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS  
AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION**

**9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Reports**

SHRI VILAS MUTTEMWAR (NAGPUR): I beg to present the following Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution (2009-10):-

- (1) Ninth Report on the subject 'Bureau of Indian Standards (BIS)– Hallmarking of Jewellery' pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs).
  - (2) Tenth Report on the subject 'Production, Consumption and Pricing of Sugar' pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution).
-

**11.08 hrs.**

**STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS**

**(i) (a) Signing of protocol between Republic of India and Swiss Federal Council to amend the existing Agreement for avoidance of double taxation with respect to taxes on income with protocol.**

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Madam Speaker, with your permission, I beg to make a short Statement on an important issue of signing the amendment to the existing Agreement for avoidance of double taxation between India and Switzerland, which the hon. Members on the floor of this House have mentioned on several occasions.

Yesterday the Republic of India and the Swiss Federal Council have signed a Protocol which will amend the existing Double Taxation Avoidance Agreement between the two countries (DTAA). The amended DTAA shall come into operation after it enters into force on completion of internal process by Switzerland side.

Salient features of this Protocol are:

1. Article on Exchange of Information has been amended to bring it in line with international standards

- Under the current DTAA between India and Switzerland, India has not been able to obtain banking information from Switzerland. The protocol now seeks to amend the Article concerning Exchange of Information to enable exchange of such information.
- Information which is foreseeable relevant for carrying out the provisions of this agreement or to the administration or enforcement of the domestic laws concerning taxes can be exchanged under the DTAA, whereas earlier information which was relevant only for carrying out the provisions of DTAA could be exchanged.
- Information exchanged is to be used for tax purpose only. However, the new Article also provides for use of information by such other purposes which are

- allowed under the laws of both States and the competent authority of the supplying State authorizes such use.
- There is a specific provision to ensure that information will be exchanged even if there is no domestic interest.
  - There is a specific provision for providing banking and ownership information.
  - The new provision will be applicable only for prospective information and not for past information.
2. At present the income from international shipping are not covered under the DTAA. This is now sought to be included in the DTAA by providing for residence based taxation for shipping income from international traffic.
3. Our earlier treaties used to cover tax sparing provisions where if the income is exempt in one country, the other country used to provide corresponding relief even if such taxes are not paid due to exemption. However, India no longer supports this method and is moving away from profit based exemption. Tax sparing (to the extent of 10% of interest income) is currently there in the existing DTAA. Therefore, it is sought to be deleted in the Article concerning elimination of double taxation,
4. Article on Non-discrimination is sought to be amended to provide that difference in tax rate of resident taxpayer and Permanent Establishment of non-resident tax payer should not be more than 10%.
5. Recognised pension fund or scheme is included in the definition of resident to enable them to get benefit of the DTAA.
6. A provision for Limitation of Benefit is sought to be introduced to prevent misuse of treaty benefits on dividend, interest, royalty, fee for technical services and other income.

**श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी (गांधीनगर):** अध्यक्ष जी, आज अंतिम दिन है अन्यथा मैं इस प्रोटोकॉल के बारे में आपसे आग्रह करता कि हम चर्चा करें। लेकिन ब्रीफली अगर वित्त मंत्री बता सकें कि इस नये प्रोटोकॉल के अनुसार जिन भारतीयों ने अपनी संपत्ति स्विस् बैंक्स में जमा करवाई है, उनके बारे में हमें जानकारी मिलेगी या नहीं मिलेगी? मिलेगी तो किस सूरत में मिलेगी और कब तक नहीं मिलेगी, इसके क्या पहलू हैं, क्या संक्षेप में बता सकते हैं?

**SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (GHATAL):** I also say the same thing. I would like to know why it is prospective and not retrospective. There is always a clamour to bring back the large funds that are there. I urge upon the Government to ensure that the black money is recovered and it is invested for the development of the country.... *(Interruptions)*

**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (मैनपुरी):** यह अत्यंत महत्वपूर्ण सवाल है और सरकार की तरफ से यह जानकारी आनी चाहिए कि उसमें किन-किन के नाम हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Now please do not start a discussion. The Leader of the House is on his legs.

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE:** First of all I would like to make it quite clear.... *(Interruptions)*

If we want to have a discussion, then there is no end to it. But, on a limited point I can say that so far as the Swiss laws are concerned, they do not give any information in respect of their banking transactions. Swiss Bank transactions are so strictly enforced that only once in 1945 the assets of the Nazi leaders who were subjected to Nuremberg Trials were revealed by the Swiss Bank. Before and after that they have not revealed any such information. This will provide us an opportunity to have the relevant Bank information for taxation purposes.

Secondly, with many other countries we are having taxation agreements. For instance, as per the German laws we got some information that we can raise the demand for taxes. But we cannot disclose this information to any authorities including Parliament. Hon. Members are aware of that particular case; we could not reveal it.

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3102/15/10)

... *(Interruptions)*



**11.10 hrs.**

- (i) (b) Status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the 78<sup>th</sup> Report of the Standing Committee on Finance on “Flaw of credit to Agriculture Sector” pertaining to the Department of Financial Services, Minister of Finance \***

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): I beg to lay the following statement regarding :—

- (1) the status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the 78<sup>th</sup> Report of the Standing Committee on Finance on “Flow of Credit to Agriculture Sector”, pertaining to the Department of Financial Services, Ministry of Finance.

Here, with this amending protocol, we shall be able to share the information, which we will get, with the Parliament. Also, in other earlier agreements with the other countries, not with the Swiss Government because they were always saying ‘no’ in respect of banking information, the provision was that it will be given only to the Income Tax Department and the Income Tax Department can use it only for its own purposes of making assessment of income tax and wealth tax, but they cannot transfer it to other authorities. For instance, even they cannot give it to the Enforcement Directorate, if there is a case of money laundering. That provision will also be made available.

If the hon. Members are interested – surely this is an important issue – we will have the opportunity of discussing it in the next Session because this question will come up repeatedly. Therefore, there is no need of it now.

In respect of questions of Shri Gurudas Dasgupta, please remember that this is an agreement between two sovereign countries. They are not subordinate to us. Therefore, we shall have to agree to whatever concessions we get.

---

\* Laid on the Table and also placed in the Library, See No. LT 3103/15/10

**11.12 hrs.****(ii) India's offer of assistance of 25 million US dollars to Pakistan for flood relief**

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI S.M. KRISHNA): Madam Speaker, Pakistan has been severely affected by the massive floods that have caused widespread damage to life and property. The recent floods are being described as the worst in that part of the world in the last 80 years. According to the latest figures given by the UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, 17.2 million people have been adversely affected by these floods. Death toll has reached over 1,600. More than 1.2 million houses have been damaged or destroyed besides widespread damage to infrastructure, crops and livestock. All four provinces of Pakistan and Pakistan-occupied Kashmir have suffered the consequences. Latest reports indicate that the flood situation in Sindh continues to deteriorate, even as flood waters recede in Punjab.

We cannot remain unconcerned with this grave humanitarian crisis of enormous magnitude in our immediate neighbourhood. I had telephoned the Foreign Minister of Pakistan on August 13, 2010, and conveyed the deepest sympathies and condolences to the people and Government of Pakistan, on this natural disaster, on behalf of the people and Government of India. As a gesture of solidarity with the people of Pakistan in their hour of need, I had also conveyed Government's offer of assistance of US \$ 5 million for provision of relief material from India for the flood victims in Pakistan.

Prime Minister called Prime Minister of Pakistan Yusuf Raza Gilani on August 19, 2010, to express his sorrow and to condole the deaths resulting from the huge floods in Pakistan. Prime Minister conveyed that the Government of India had already made an offer of assistance and was ready to do more to assist in the relief effort.

Pakistan has conveyed its deep appreciation of India's offer of assistance. While mentioning that the United Nations has launched a flash appeal soliciting contributions from the international community to assist the people affected by the floods, Pakistan requested on 27<sup>th</sup> August that India may channel its contribution to the flood victims through the United Nations.



As a more concrete assessment of the damage inflicted by this natural disaster and the urgent needs of the people of Pakistan emerges, Government has decided to increase its assistance to Pakistan from 5 million US Dollars, announced earlier, to 25 million US Dollars. Out of this amount, 20 million US Dollars would be contributed to the 'Pakistan Initial Floods Emergency Response Plan' launched by the United Nations' Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs. The balance of 5 million US Dollars would be contributed to the World Food Programme for its relief efforts in Pakistan.

Prime Minister has rightly said that in such times of natural disasters, all of South Asia should rise to the occasion and extend every possible help to the affected people. We remain committed to assisting the people of Pakistan in all possible ways in this difficult hour.

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3104/15/10

)



**11.20 hrs.****CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE****(i) Situation arising out of recent attacks on Indian Fishermen by Srilankan Navy and steps taken by the Government in this regard**

MADAM SPEAKER: The House shall now take up Item No. 12, Calling Attention. Shri T. R. Baalu.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI T.R. BAALU (SRIPERUMBUDUR): Madam, I call the attention of the Minister of External Affairs to the following matter of urgent public importance and request that he may make a statement thereon:

“The situation arising out of recent attacks on Indian Fishermen by Sri Lankan Navy and steps taken by the Government in this regard.”

... (*Interruptions*)

डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी (वाराणसी): अध्यक्ष महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

MADAM SPEAKER: What rule is it?

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please tell us the rule.

... (*Interruptions*)

डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी : अध्यक्ष महोदया, सदन में कश्मीर के बारे में हुई चर्चा के संबंध में यहां जवाब आना चाहिए, आज तक उसका जवाब नहीं आया। आज सदन का अंतिम दिन है। यह सदन की कार्यसूची में रखा गया था, फिर निकाल दिया गया। हम जानना चाहेंगे कि सदन के नेता और पार्लियामेंट्री मिनिस्टर यहां उपस्थित हैं, क्या काश्मीर के बारे में जवाब नहीं मिलेगा? क्या सरकार की नीति यह है कि अगले सत्र तक बीच में ... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Thank you so much.

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, the hon. Minister.

... (*Interruptions*)

डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी : मंत्री जी, इसका जवाब दें। ... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, the hon. Minister, please. This is on the Calling Attention.

... (*Interruptions*)

**डॉ. मुरली मनोहर जोशी :** इसका जवाब तो गृह मंत्री जी ने देना है।... (व्यवधान)

**श्री सैयद शाहनवाज़ हुसैन (भागलपुर):** इसका गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से जवाब आना चाहिए।... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** अभी कॉलिंग अटेंशन हो जाने दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्री और जल संसाधन मंत्री (श्री पवन कुमार बंसल):** अध्यक्ष महोदया, सरकार ने माना था, तभी इस पर डिसकशन हुआ था।... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** मंत्री महोदय बोल रहे हैं, उनकी बात सुन लीजिए। अब आप बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

**श्री पवन कुमार बंसल:** अध्यक्ष महोदया, जब विपक्ष की तरफ से चार मुद्दों पर चर्चा मांगी थी, तब सरकार ने एक मुद्दे पर माना था, क्योंकि हमने कहा था कि आप किसी भी चीज पर चर्चा चाहते हैं, हम मानने को तैयार हैं। इसी हिसाब से जे एंड के पर भी माना गया था। हाउस में चर्चा हुई, समय ज्यादा लगा, जितना समय तय हुआ था, उससे ज्यादा समय उस चीज पर लगा। बाद में यही बात हुई थी कि इसका जवाब बाद में दे दिया जाएगा।

अध्यक्ष महोदया, आप जानते हैं, पूरा सदन जानता है कि हमारा समय काफी चीजों पर वेस्ट हो गया और इस कारण से सिर्फ यह नहीं लग पाया।... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA):** Today, is the last day of the current Session. ... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL :** This work is the Legislative Business of the House. ... (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** अब आप बैठ जाइए। कॉलिंग अटेंशन चलने दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Now, the hon. Minister on the Calling Attention.

... (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** अब आप बैठ जाइए, कॉलिंग अटेंशन चलने दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI HARIN PATHAK (AHMEDABAD EAST):** Madam, we are ready to sit late for this discussion. ... (*Interruptions*)

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

MADAM SPEAKER: Mr. Baalu, have you read the statement of the hon. Minister?

*... (Interruptions)*

SHRI T.R. BAALU (SRIPERUMBUDUR): Yes, Madam, I have read it. ...  
*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Okay. Hon. Minister, kindly lay the statement on the Table of the House.

*... (Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI S.M. KRISHNA): Madam, I lay the statement on this issue on the Table of the House. ... *(Interruptions)*

\*\* I respond to the House on the Calling Attention Notices regarding the killing of Indian fishermen and continuous attacks on them by Sri Lankan Navy.

I would like to reiterate at the outset to this august House that the welfare, safety and security of our fishermen have always received the highest priority by Government. Government of India and the High Commission of India in Sri Lanka have consistently taken up issues relating to incidents of firing on or apprehension of our fishermen with the Government of Sri Lanka to ensure that the Sri Lankan Navy act with restraint and our fishermen are treated in a humane manner.

Hon. Members would recall that to avoid recurrence of incidents involving our fishermen, and keeping in mind the humanitarian and livelihood dimensions of

---

\* Not recorded

\*\* Speech was laid on the Table.

the issue, on 26th October 2008, India and Sri Lanka reached an Understanding on Fishing Arrangements under which both of us agreed to put in place practical arrangements to deal with *bonafide* fishermen crossing the International Maritime Boundary Line from either country. As part of these practical arrangements, it was agreed that there will be no firing on Indian fishing vessels and that Indian fishing vessels will not enter into sensitive areas designated by Government of Sri Lanka along its coastline.

I would like to inform this august house that after the October 2008 Understanding, incidents of apprehension and firing on Indian fishermen in the waters between India and Sri Lanka have come down significantly. In 2008, 1456 Indian fishermen were apprehended by the Sri Lankan Navy. In 2009, those apprehended came down to 127 fishermen only. In 2010, till end of July this year, 26 fishermen were apprehended. In 2008, the number of fishermen reported killed was 5 with 1 missing. In 2009, there were no fishermen killed or missing. Recently we have had an incident in which one fisherman was reportedly killed. However, there has been a significant decrease in the incidents of apprehension of Indian fishermen after 2008. It is, therefore, evident that the October 2008 Understanding has had a salutary effect on the situation.

I would also like to reiterate that whenever incidents of firing or apprehension or ill-treatment of our fishermen come to our attention, we have immediately taken them up with the Government of Sri Lanka. Government of Sri Lanka have in most cases responded to our request and have released these fishermen. We have time and again emphasized to the Government of Sri Lanka to scrupulously adhere to the understanding we have reached and they have assured us of their commitment to adhere to this understanding. However, they have also consistently denied that their Navy has had any responsibility in such incidents of firing on our fishermen. They have also stated that their Navy does not enter Indian territorial waters.

I would like to inform the hon. Members that most such incidents have taken place in Sri Lankan waters where our fishermen stray across the International Maritime Boundary Line. It is, therefore, important that we sensitize our fishermen to respect the International Maritime Boundary Line and not stray into Sri Lankan waters for their own

safety and security, especially in those areas designated as sensitive by the Government of Sri Lanka. We have also conveyed a similar request to the Government of Sri Lanka vis-à-vis their fishermen who cross the International Maritime Boundary Line and enter our waters.

India and Sri Lanka are also in discussion in the Joint Working Group constituted to deal with issues related to fishermen and to work out bilateral institutional arrangements for ensuring the safety and security of the fishermen of both countries and addressing such issues in a humane and practical way.

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, Shri T. R. Baalu.

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Only Shri T. R. Baalu's statement will go on record.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

SHRI T.R. BAALU : Madam Speaker, the issue of safety and security of the Indian fishermen has been discussed and deliberated in this august House time and again. ... (*Interruptions*) The Upper House has discussed this most important issue pertaining to the Indian fishermen, especially, the fishermen of Tamil Nadu. This issue has been discussed to draw the attention of the Government of India. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Madam, about 50 hours of the House have been wasted. ... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया: कॉलिंग अटेंशन हो जाने दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

---

\* Not recorded

SHRI T.R. BAALU : I would also remind the House that the hon. Member, Shri A.K.S. Vijayan, who is also the Deputy Leader of our Parliamentary Party, had raised the same issue many times.... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : कार्लिंग अटेंशन हो जाने दीजिए।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI T.R. BAALU : He had raised this issue pertaining to the sad plight of fishermen of Nagapattinam many a time in this very House. Also, the new Member, Shri Ritheesh, who hails from Rameshwaram, has raised the same issue, the plight of Rameshwaram fishermen, in this House many times. ... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (CHENNAI NORTH): Please show some concern for the poor fishermen. ... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing is going on record, except what Shri Baalu is saying.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

SHRI T.R. BAALU : In this House, the Members of Parliament are very much sensitive, as far as this issue is concerned, and the entire country is seized of this matter. The people want us to address this problem. ... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आडवाणी जी, आप बोलिये।

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी (गांधीनगर): अध्यक्ष जी, यह जो विषय है, इस विषय में तो मैं यह अपेक्षा करूंगा, आपसे निवेदन करूंगा कि आप सरकार को कहें कि यह महत्वपूर्ण विषय है, जिस पर चर्चा हुई है और चर्चा के बाद उसका उत्तर नहीं आया है और कोई कारण नहीं है कि गृह मंत्री आकर कश्मीर के बारे में जो चर्चा हुई है, उसका उत्तर न दें। हमारे पास दिन भर है और मुझे यह लगता है कि सदन शायद शाम को...(व्यवधान)

SHRI T.R. BAALU : Madam Speaker, you have already taken up the Calling Attention Notice. It is the most important issue which was postponed twice. Today you have called my name and I have drawn the attention of the Minister to this issue. I am not yielding. How can they speak like this? ... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी :** अध्यक्ष जी, मेरा आपसे निवेदन है, मेरा सरकार से अनुरोध नहीं है कि आप शासन को कहिये कि उत्तर आज ही देना चाहिए, जवाब देना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री पवन कुमार बंसल :** मैडम, मैंने पहले भी वही कहा था और मैं वही बात दोहराना चाहता हूँ। जब हम किसी विषय को मानते हैं तो यह नहीं मानते कि उस पर जवाब नहीं दिया जाता है। यह कभी नहीं हुआ। जवाब दिया जाता है, लेकिन आप सब जानते हैं कि इस सदन में 50 घंटे हमारे व्यर्थ गये थे, इसका मतलब मैं यह नहीं कह रहा कि हम जवाब नहीं देंगे। ...(व्यवधान) आप मेरी बात नहीं सुनेंगे? मेरी बात तो सुनेंगे। आपने अपनी बात कह दी, मेरी बात नहीं सुनेंगे?...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप शान्त हो जाइये। उनकी बात सुन तो लीजिए। उनकी बात सुन लीजिए।

... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): They want a discussion, but they do not allow the proceedings. They are following double standards. They do not want the House to run. ... (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** सुन तो लीजिए कि मिनिस्टर साहब क्या कह रहे हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री पवन कुमार बंसल:** मेरी बात नहीं सुनी और अपनी बात कहना चाहते हैं। अगर शोर रखना चाहते हैं तो मेरी बात नहीं कही जा सकती। अगर बात कहने देंगे, फिर तो बात है।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप बैठ जाइये। आप भी बैठ जाइये।

**श्री पवन कुमार बंसल:** क्या पूरा देश यह नहीं देख रहा कि हम क्या कर रहे हैं। मैडम, मैं आज यह कहने जा रहा था कि बेशक लिस्ट में नहीं लगा हुआ है, मैं फिर भी गृह मंत्री से जाकर बात कर लूंगा कि उनका आज का क्या प्रोग्राम है, क्या चीजें हैं और अगर आज सम्भव हुआ तो हमें इस बात से गुरेज नहीं होगा...(व्यवधान) बात को सुनेंगे



नहीं क्या? मैडम, मैं आगे भी कह रहा हूँ, इसके आगे भी कह रहा हूँ कि अगर आज सम्भव नहीं हुआ तो आप कृपा करके इसको नैक्स्ट सेशन में भी बेशक लगा दीजिए, हमें एतराज नहीं होगा।... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया** : अब बात हो गई। बसुदेव आचार्य जी, आप बैठ जाइये।

... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA** : The reply from the Home Minister should come today itself. ... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री पवन कुमार बंसल**: यह कहना कि सरकार जवाब नहीं देना चाहती, यह बात गलत है।... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया** : बसुदेव आचार्य जी, करुणाकरन जी, आप बैठ जाइये।

... (व्यवधान)


**MADAM SPEAKER**: Please take your seat. Nothing is going on record.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

**SHRI T.R. BAALU** : I was stating that Parliament is seized of this matter and Parliament is very much sensitive to this issue. But at the same time, I would not say that the Government is insensitive. The Government of Tamil Nadu headed by my leader and the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, Dr. Kalaignar Karunanidhi, brought this to the notice of the Government of India many a time on many a occasion. It has become a vexatious issue.

Madam, Tamil Nadu has got 1,076 kilometres of coastal line, and about 57, 897 fishing trawlers are in operation in those waters of the Bay of Bengal.

In Bay of Bengal, it is only in the area of Palk Bay that fishery potential is high. It is in this Palk Bay that the Kachativu Island exists where the fisherman want to go and fish day in and day out. Fishermen usually go after catches only. It is because of this community of fishermen that the Government of India is getting 13 per cent of its exports in fishery goods. Such a great export potential exists there.

My intention behind drawing this to the attention of the  House and of the Government of India is specific. How many instances, Madam? Not one or two. From 2000 to 2010, there have been about 206 incidents wherein 17 people have died because

---

\* Not recorded

of shooting by the Sri Lankan Navy; and about 2191 fishermen have been injured. A close analysis of these incidents reveals that all the incidents have taken place in and around the Kachativu island. In all these incidents, the fish catches were snatched, communication equipment was thrown into the sea, clothing of the fishermen was removed, fishermen were stripped in sensitive parts.

Do these not amount to heinous crimes, Madam? Sri Lankan Navy personnel are committing all these heinous crimes. Will it be tolerated, Madam? Just now we heard from the hon. External Affairs Minister that India has extended its helping hand to the flood-affected people of Pakistan. We are also extending our help to the IDPs in Sri Lanka. Of course, Sri Lanka is not our country, it is a foreign country. At the same time we are extending our help to many nations. We consider Pakistan as well as Sri Lanka our friends, our own kith and kin. But there is no reciprocity from the other side, especially from Sri Lanka in this House.

I would take two minutes and remind you of the history. In 1974 there was an agreement signed by the great leader of this country the late Shrimati Indira Gandhi. Mother Indira signed that agreement with Shrimati Sirimavo Bandaranaike. The two Prime Ministers signed the agreement on 28-6-1974. Article 4 of that agreement says, "Each country shall have its sovereignty and exclusive jurisdiction and control over the waters, the islands, the continental shelf and subsoil thereof falling on its own side of the aforesaid boundary." Article 5 of the agreement reads, "Subject to the foregoing, Indian fishermen and pilgrims will enjoy access to visit Kachativu as hitherto and will not be required by Sri Lanka to obtain travel documents and visas for these purposes". Article 6 is more important and it says, "The vessels of India and Sri Lanka will enjoy in each other's waters such rights as they have traditionally enjoyed thereon".

Traditional rights have been established in this 1974 agreement which was signed by Madam Indiraji. What happened after 1974? In 1974 itself, Shri Swaran Singh, the Former External Affairs Minister made a statement.

In his statement, he also says: "I wish to remind the hon. Members that in concluding this Agreement, the right of fishing, pilgrimage and navigation, which both



sides have enjoyed in the past, have been fully safeguarded for the future.” It has become a parliamentary document. Once again, during his speech, he says: “I am sure that the hon. Members know that the 1921 Fishery Line was a Line, it was about three or three and a half miles West of Kachativu, that is, to the western side of the Fishery Line was an exclusive fishery rights of the Indian citizens and to the east of that was, the right of Sri Lankan fishermen.” This is what late Swaran Singh stated in Parliament, on the same floor.

Finally, he says: “Although Sri Lanka claims to sovereignty to Kachativu has been recognised, the traditional rights of Indian fishermen to pilgrims to visit the Island will remain unaffected” - I repeat, remain unaffected – “similarly the traditional navigation rights exercised by India and Sri Lanka in each other’s waters will remain unaffected.” This is the assurance given by late Swaran Singh, the former External Affairs Minister.

What went wrong in 1976? There was a sheer transaction of two letter correspondences between one Secretary of External Affairs Ministry of the Government of India by name Shri Kewal Singh and another Secretary by name Shri Jayasinghe of the Defence Ministry of Sri Lanka. The letter says that: “The fishing vessels of fishermen of India shall not engage in fishing – in the historic waters – in territorial sea and exclusive economic zone of Sri Lanka nor shall the fishing vessel and fishermen of Sri Lanka engage in fishing in the historic waters, the territorial sea and exclusive economic zone of India without the express permission of Sri Lanka or India, as the case maybe.” It is a blow on the heads of the fishermen of India. This has happened in 1976. It is an Executive Order of Secretary – from the Government of India, without the consent of Parliament and without the consent of political hierarchy, without the consent of the State Government.

The State Government of Tamil Nadu was never taken into confidence. Moreover in the first Agreement in 1974 itself, it has not been placed. The Agreement was signed on 28.06.1974 by Madam Indira ji. In July only, the discussion took place. In June, the Agreement was signed by the Government. But in July, 1974, the discussion took place

in Parliament. That is why, many parliamentarians took exception because an Agreement has been signed and an Agreement is brought before the House getting an approval *fait accompli*. Why should the Government do that? That is what the hon. Members had asked at that point of time during discussion. After this, two letter transaction has become a part and parcel of the Agreement. That is a blow on the heads of fishermen at that particular point of time.

The then parliamentary party leader of DMK, Era Sezhian – many senior hon. Members like Shri Jaswant Singh and Shri Advani should be knowing him –has said categorically that: “This Agreement goes against the interests of the country. It is a pure surrender of our territory without going through any norms. This is an unholy and disgraceful act of statesmanship unworthy of any Government. Therefore, we do not want to associate ourselves with the statement that is going to be made by the hon. Minister and we want to disassociate ourselves by walking out of the House.” We have made strong exception. The DMK has made is clear that we are not conceding this and conceding Kachativu to Sri Lanka is against the interests of the India. That is what he had said and he walked out.... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please conclude.

SHRI T.R. BAALU :Before I conclude, as requested by the hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu and my leader, *Kalaignar* Karunanidhi many times, and the Members of Parliament, cutting across party lines, I would request the Government of India to revisit the Agreements and renegotiate to get back Kachativu Islands. Secondly, the Government must increase the Coast Guard patrolling to protect the Tamil fishermen. Third is the most important and the immediate action needed is to establish on-line interactive dispute redressal mechanism involving all stakeholders – Government of India, Sri Lanka, State Government of Tamil Nadu and the fishermen. Unless and otherwise you establish linkage, you cannot solve this problem. Otherwise, you have to get back the Kachativu Islands back to India.



DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (KARUR): Attacks on Indian fishermen by Sri Lankan Navy is a very burning and a serious problem in Tamil Nadu. I have read the statement of the hon. Minister. Even though he described certain incidents as to how Sri Lankan Navy attacked Tamil Nadu fishermen, but he forgot to mention as to how many people died. Even after this Agreement, you can see that these incidents are taking place.

Recently, on 7<sup>th</sup> July 2010, more than 100 Indian Tamil fishermen were taken by the Sri Lankan Navy and also a fisherman, Chellappan of Vedaranyam had died due to firing. Even the hon. Minister has stated about this incident in his statement.

Nearly 500 fishermen died because of firing by the Sri Lankan Navy. Nearly 1,000 fishermen were handicapped due to this. Thousands of fishermen were also missing. These instances are regularly taking place. All this is due to Kachativu issue, as the other hon. Member stated. All these incidents are taking place because of that only.

The only remedial measure to protect the lives and livelihood of our fishermen is to nullify the Indo-Sri Lankan Agreement on Kachativu and retrieving the Kachativu Island from Sri Lanka. As the hon. Member stated, this Agreement was made without the Parliamentary Approval. Any Indian land to be given away or to add to the Indian territory, Parliament must approve this. We cannot do this without amending the Constitution. Therefore, the Agreement on Kachativu is illegal and we should get that back.

The other threat we are facing now is that nearly one lakh Chinese Army people are in Sri Lanka in civilian dress. China is now making attempts to control the Indian Ocean. It is now engaged in building a harbour at a huge cost of Rs.5,000 crore in Sri Lanka. No doubt, Rajapakse has consented to all these schemes. Sri Lanka also had decided to give the fishing rights to China in Kachativu. From AIADMK Party, we strongly oppose this decision. The gifting away of Kachativu was unconstitutional. My Party's General Secretary, hon. Amma, Jayalalitha has already moved the Supreme Court to rescind this agreement. On behalf of the AIADMK, I would request the Government of India to take action to retrieve Kachativu, to

alleviate the problems of the Indian Tamil fishermen. Kachativu is not a closed chapter; it has to be reopened. I want to raise these questions now. Our hon. Minister said that there was an understanding reached between India and Sri Lanka on 26<sup>th</sup> October, 2008. According to the understanding reached between India and Sri Lanka, Indian Tamil fishermen have been barred from entering the sensitive areas, designated by the Sri Lankan Government along the coastline. We cannot understand what the so-called understanding is. The so-called understanding cannot override or supercede the sovereign Treaty.

MADAM SPEAKER: Please ask your question, Dr. Thambi Durai Ji, and take your seat. Your time is up.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : I am putting the question. This is a very burning issue, please allow me.

You have already bartered away the Katchativu Island and now you are bartering away the rights of the Indian Tamil fishermen. We have a strategic cooperation with Sri Lanka, which is going on. May I know whether that strategic cooperation takes into account the rights of the Indian Tamil fishermen and the sensitivities of the people of Tamil Nadu over this issue? What prevented the Indian Navy and the Coast Guard from providing protection to the Indian Tamil fishermen? It is said that they are in league with the Sri Lankan Navy since both are bound by the strategic contract, under-written by the US Naval Command. Is that true? Is that the reason why our Indian Tamil fishermen are being killed by them mercilessly? Is the Government of India opposed to the age-old bondage between the Tamil fishermen and the Sri Lankan Tamil fishermen? Or is it a part of a well-planned strategy to cut the umbilical cord existing between the fishermen of Tamil Nadu and the Sri Lankan Tamil fishermen?

MADAM SPEAKER: You are putting so many questions.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : I am concluding.

Before reaching such a far-reaching understanding, did the Government of India consult the Tamil Nadu Government? Did the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu give his consent to take away the rights of the Indian fishermen? How can the so-called

understanding supersede the rights conferred upon by a sovereign Treaty? Which is the designated area? Where is it? Has that been specified clearly so that the fishermen can understand that?

Instead of preserving the rights of the fishermen conferred by a Treaty and giving protection to the Indian fishermen, the Government of India is asking them not to stray into the designated zone.

MADAM SPEAKER: You are supposed to put one question, but you are putting so many. Please take your seat now; thank you so much.

Shri Natarajan.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : I am putting my last question.

The hon. Member said that in 1974, we had an agreement on Katchativu. In 1974, the then Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu colluded with the Central Government and gifted the Katchativu unconstitutionally. Will the Government of India take steps to retrieve the Island, as is demanded by our Party General Secretary, hon. Amma, Jayalalithaa? ...  
*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down. What is going on here? This is Calling Attention. What is this going on here?

... *(Interruptions)*

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : What is the use of writing letters? ... *(Interruptions)* Did the Government of India take some action?

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Baalu, take your seat. Do not get agitated.

... *(Interruptions)*

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : He said that letters were written to the Government of India. I want to know what is the action that it has taken on them. ... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, you may please sit down.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : Finally, I want to ask this one question. I am concluding. ...  
*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, please conclude. You have exceeded.

... *(Interruptions)*

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : I am concluding. The hon. Member said that the Chief Minister had written many letters to the Central Government. What action the Government has taken on them? Has it responded to them? Writing letters would not solve the problem. The real problem can be solved only with this – let them come out of the coalition Government. Then only the problem can be solved.

SHRI P.R. NATARAJAN (COMBATORE): Madam Speaker, thank you for the opportunity given by you.

I want to put a question to the hon. External Affairs Minister, through you, Madam.



Firstly, I fully associate with Dr. Thambi Durai's statement. Secondly, I want to know this. Now, the Secretary of the External Affairs Ministry is in Sri Lanka. Has he given any direction to her regarding the excesses of the Naval Forces of Sri Lanka?

Just ten days back I heard that about 40 Pakistani people illegally crossed the border, who were caught by the police and punished by the court. After that, they had been released and a ceremonial function was celebrated at the Wagah border. Through Wagah border, we have sent all these persons who illegally crossed the Indian border from Pakistan.

This is not the method that Sri Lanka is adopting. They start firing; this is to be stopped. I fully associate with Dr. Thambi Durai's statement.

MADAM SPEAKER: Thank you so much.

\*SHRI A. GANESHAMURTHI (ERODE): Madam Speaker, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak on this motion and draw the attention of this House to the plight of Indian fishermen in the coastal areas of Tamil Nadu.

This is not the first time that we raise it in the House about our Tamil fishermen being attacked in our own Indian territory, well within our borders. Through Calling Attention motion on several occasions, the very same problem has been highlighted by various Members belonging to different parties cutting across party lines. This is continuing for the past 35 years. As pointed out by both Dr. M. Thambidurai and Shri T.R. Baalu the heinous act of Sri Lankan Navy firing at our Indian fishermen goes on unabated only after our giving away the islet of Katchativu to Sri Lanka. The Sri Lankan Navy has shot at our fishermen killing and maiming many at least on 22 occasions in the past one year.

I would like to know from the Government of India whether they are aware of these continuous attacks and killings. If so, I would like to know whether they have taken any action. If it is not so, whether they are contemplating any action to save the lives and properties of Tamil fishermen. If a country's Navy attacks the citizens of another country,

---

\* English translation of the speech originally delivered in Tamil

does it not amount to an attack on its sovereignty? When the Sri Lankan Navy is attacking our Indian citizens, it must be taken as an affront against our sovereignty by our Government. I would like to know as to what our Government is doing to safeguard our sovereignty and save our citizens. Is it not the responsibility of the Government of India to save our own citizens in whichever part of the country they live? Does it mean that the fishermen of Tamil Nadu are not being considered as Indian citizens by the Government of India?

Katchativu was part of Tamil Nadu even before Tamil Nadu became part of India. We, Tamils, have lost our rights over Katchativu after our becoming part of you. Even before the Indian Union was carved out, Katchativu belonged to Tamil Nadu which became part of India. Is it not true that you are not raising your voice firmly to quell the problem faced by our fishermen of Tamil Nadu? As was pointed out rightly by both Dr. Thambidurai and Shri Baalu, having a relook at the rights over Katchativu alone can help us to find a lasting solution to this vexing problem.

We have entered into several agreements with the Government of Sri Lanka of which many have been violated by Sri Lanka. Rajiv Gandhi-Jayawardhane Accord is one of them that has been given a go-by. That is why I would like to ask of this Government as to why not we scrap the Katchativu Agreement as our traditional fishing rights are not honoured. So, I would like to know from the Government whether any step would be taken to protect our Indian fishermen on realizing that getting back Katchativu alone is the way out.

Whenever such violations take place, stern warnings are given by the Government of India to Pakistan, but not in the case of Sri Lanka which attacks our fishermen continuously all these years. I would like to know as to why no such warnings are given to Sri Lanka. I may be given the reason for this omission.

SHRI S.M. KRISHNA: Madam Speaker, I would like to associate with the sentiments expressed by my esteemed friend Shri T. R. Baalu and other distinguished Members of this august House.

SHRI SYED SHAHNAWAZ HUSSAIN (BHAGALPUR): He is Dr. Thambi Durai!

SHRI S.M. KRISHNA: That was with reference to the hardships that the Indian fishermen are facing in Sri Lankan waters. I would like to put the whole question in its right perspective.

Almost every Member who participated in this Calling Attention notice, has mentioned about the Katchativu Island. But the fact of the matter is that in 1974 and in 1976, two agreements had been entered into between the Government of India and the Government of Sri Lanka wherein it has been expressly stated that Katchativu is a part of Sri Lanka. A copy of the agreement has been laid on the Table of this August House.

SHRI T.R. BAALU : It has become a *fait accompli*. You are entering into an agreement without the Parliament's approval. ... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Let the Minister reply.

SHRI T.R. BAALU : Actually, it was ruled by the Raja of Ramnad. ... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Let him complete his reply. What is this going on? How can he reply?

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: He is not yielding. Please take your seat.

SHRI S.M. KRISHNA: We are dealing with a sovereign Government of Sri Lanka; and incidentally, it is also a friendly country to India. We will have to consider and we will have to factor in all this, while making an assessment, whether we can legitimately lay our hands on the Katchativu Island, when once the Government of India has taken the position that it is a part of Sri Lanka.

So, it is in this perspective that we will have to look at the Katchativu Islands. Even in that Agreement, there have been certain concessions given to our fishermen. They can go to Katchativu, dry their nets and can rest there. Beyond that they cannot do anything else. So, in the light of this, we will have to understand that we cannot go back on the solemn Agreement that has been entered into between two Governments.

Now, the fact is, at least in recent past, there have been less number of incidents of arrest. If I can quote some figures, Madam Speaker, in 2008, 1456 Indian fishermen

were arrested by the Sri Lankan authorities. In 2009, it came down to 127. In 2010, till the end of July this year, only 26 fishermen have been apprehended by the Sri Lankan Navy. So, these figures do indicate that there has been a declining trend in terms of Indian fishermen getting arrested or being taken in by the Sri Lankan Navy. We have advised our fishermen that they should not get into the sensitive waters of Sri Lanka. After all, we will have to respect the sovereignty of Sri Lanka on their territorial water....  
(Interruptions) Let me complete. Then you can say what you want to. You have already had your say.

Apart from the two Governments, Madam, I think one other positive development is that the representatives of the fishermen of Sri Lanka and the representatives of the fishermen of Tamil Nadu have had an informal meeting between themselves.

SHRI T.R. BAALU : It has failed.

SHRI S.M. KRISHNA: My friend, Shri Baalu says that it has failed but one failure should not be taken as a failure for ever. I think repeated attempts will have to be made because when there are such contentious issues between our fishermen we will have to repeatedly keep trying to bring about an understanding between fishermen. After all, the common aim of the fishermen in Tamil Nadu and the fishermen in Sri Lanka is to earn a livelihood.


MADAM SPEAKER: Mr. Minister, please address the Chair.

SHRI S.M. KRISHNA: So, I would request the hon. Members, particularly Shri Baalu - because he has been a Minister earlier and as a result of that I expect a greater appreciation - to realise whether the positions taken by the successive Governments need to be honoured or not. This is the question. If the question is to be answered in the affirmative, as I know, the question of Katchativu is solved or taken care of. Right now the Foreign Secretary is in Sri Lanka and she is taking up some of these issues.

Shri Thambi Durai has mentioned about certain movements of Chinese in that region. The Government of India have come to realise that China has been showing more than the normal interest in the Indian Ocean affairs. So, we are closely monitoring the Chinese intentions. We are closely monitoring the developments in the Indian Ocean. I


could assure this House that appropriate action and measures will be taken to safeguard (a) the territorial integrity of India and (b) the welfare and well-being of the fishermen of India so that their interests can be safeguarded.

**12.00 hrs.**

Then I am myself planning a visit to Sri Lanka some time in the month of October. Perhaps, this will be the one subject which I will be discussing with the leadership of Sri Lanka.... *(Interruptions)* 

MADAM SPEAKER: Now we would take up a second Calling Attention.

... *(Interruptions)*

 MADAM SPEAKER: Mr. Baalu, please take your seat.

... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: What do you want?

SHRI T.R. BAALU : Madam, he has not replied to what we have asked... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: He has given his reply. He will see what further can be done about it. But at the moment, he has given his reply. Now we are taking up the next item. Now, Madam Harsimratji to speak.

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3105/15/10)

---

**12.01 hrs.**

- (ii) **Situation arising out of rejection of 40 Lakh tones of rice variety PAU-201 by the Food Safety Standards Authority of India citing provisions of Prevention of Food Adulteration Act 1954 and Food Safety Standards Act, 2006 and steps taken by the Government in regard thereto.**

SHRIMATI HARSIMRAT KAUR BADAL (BHATINDA): Sir, I call the attention of the Minister of Health and Family Welfare to the following matter of urgent public importance and request that he may make a statement thereon:

“The situation arising out of rejection of 40 lakh tonnes of rice variety PAU-201 by the Food Safety Standards Authority of India citing provisions of Prevention of Food Adulteration Act, 1954 and Food Safety Standards Act, 2006 and steps taken by the Government in regard thereto.”

MADAM SPEAKER: Shrimati Badal, if you have received a copy of the Statement and have also read it, then we would have it laid on the Table. Have you received it?

SHRIMATI HARSIMRAT KAUR BADAL : Yes.

MADAM SPEAKER: Mr. Minister, she has read your Statement. Therefore, you may lay it on the Table.

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Madam, I lay my statement.

\*The hon. Member has called the attention of the House to the rejection of 40 lakh tonnes of rice of variety PAU-201 by the Food Safety Standards Authority of India citing provisions of the Prevention of Food Adulteration or PFA Act and the Food Safety and Standards Act 2006. In this connection, I would like to inform this House that the reason attributed to the Food Authority for rejection of the rice variety does not depict the actual picture of the incident.

During December 2009, Food Corporation of India (FCI) and Department of Food and Public Distribution informed that the PAU-201 variety of Paddy rice milled in Punjab is

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table.

showing higher incidence of damaged grains in rice. The issue was examined by the Indian Council of Agricultural Research (ICAR) and according to it, the blackened grains /slightly blackened grains and pin –point blackened grains in the rice of this variety were ranging from 3.39 to 8.79 per cent. The ICAR viewed that blackened grains/slightly blackened grains and pin-point blackened grains in the rice were due to excessive iron content in this variety. In January 2010, on the request of the Food Corporation of India and the Department of Food & Public Distribution, 75 samples of rice were collected from various places of Punjab by a team constituted by the Department of Food & Public Distribution. The samples were sent to three Central Food Laboratories situated at Ghaziabad, Pune and Mysore for analysis as per the parameters prescribed in the PFA Act 1954. Out of the above three labs, only the Central Food Laboratory at Ghaziabad is under the administrative control of the Food Authority.

The standards for rice are prescribed under item A. 18.06.04 of Appendix ‘B’ of the Prevention of Food Adulteration Rules, 1955. This states that rice shall be the mature kernels or pieces of kernels of *Oryza Sativa Linn*, obtained from paddy as raw or parboiled. It shall be dry, sweet, clean, wholesome and free from unwholesome poisonous substance. The Rule also prescribes that:

- It should not contain moisture more than 16 per cent by weight (obtained by heating the pulverized grains at 130 C-133C for two hours).
- It should not contain foreign matter more than 1 per cent by weight, of which not more than 0.25 per cent by weight shall be mineral matter and not more than 0.10 per cent by weight shall be impurities of animal origin.
- It should not contain damaged grains more than 5 per cent by weight.
- It should not contain weevilled grains more than 10 per cent by count.

- It should not contain Uric Acid more than 100 mg. per kg.
- It should not contain Aflatoxin more than 30 mg. per kg.

The partially pin-point blackened grain of rice are considered as damaged grains as per definition and standards for rice prescribed under PFA Rules 1955. The analysis reports of the 75 samples revealed that only 9 samples were not found to be conforming to the standards of rice as prescribed under PFA Rules as stated above as these contained damaged grains, moisture and Aflatoxin more than the prescribed limits. The results of the analysis were conveyed to the Food Corporation of India as well as the Department of Food and Public Distribution.



SHRIMATI HARSIMRAT KAUR BADAL : Madam, I am deeply grateful to you for allowing me to raise this very urgent and important matter.

Today, we live in a country which ranks 94<sup>th</sup> out of 119 countries in the Global Hunger Index, a country where every day 7000 people die due to hunger and 20 crore people in our country sleep hungry every day. What is not only shocking but absolutely shameful is that every year in this same country we allow thousands of tonnes of grain worth crores of rupees to rot and decay due to the sheer negligence and callousness of those very people whose job it is to ensure that this food reaches from the farmers field to the plate of the poor and the hungry.

Madam, we have heard of Food Safety Standards, we have heard of Prevention of Food Adulteration and a host of other rules and regulations which are supposed to ensure what we are eating is not detrimental to our health or poisonous to our health. But in spite of these, be it synthetic milk, spurious medicine, oxytocin injected fruits and vegetables and host of other things are openly available in the market, flouting all norms of safety for the public. But what is sad is that instead of implementing stringent PFA laws and FSSA standards to control and stop this rampant sale of adulterated foods, in the name of maintaining food standards today this Government is working overtime to reject 40 lakh metric tonnes of rice worth Rs.4000 crore which would feed 50 lakh hungry people for one full year in the name of safety standards.

Madam, I would like to point out to you that in Punjab as of the last one year, 40 lakh metric tonnes rice of a variety called PAU-201 has been lying out in the open camp storage space and rotting because the FCI has said that they will not lift this rice because the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has declared this grain as damaged.

I would like to point out to you that PAU-201 is an a grade quality of rice which has 11 per cent higher yield than all other varieties, consumes 20 per cent less water, and is environment friendly. This rice was duly developed by the Punjab Agricultural University looking at the increasing demands of the increasing population and shrinking agricultural land. This was duly tested by the Indian Council of Agricultural Research which is the apex scientific research body under the Ministry of Agriculture.

After due clearance and seeing the benefits of this variety, this variety was promoted in Punjab and 10 lakh MTs was even lifted in the previous year. But last year when there was a drought in our country and one can imagine in an agrarian State where three-fourths of the farmers are in a debt trap, when there is no rain, what it means to them? Even then the debt-wrecked farmer, enterprisingly pulled all his resources and put everything he could afford to save his crop and in the process of saving the his crop he ensured the food security of this nation in the face of a countrywide drought.

Madam, but look at the irony. The paddy which was saved due to the labour, toil, hard work, money and sweat, invested by the farmer, has been allowed to rot and decay in the last one year in the name of food safety standards because the Health Ministry said that this is one per cent more damaged than the acceptable norm and the grain is one per cent more broken than the acceptable norm and that there is a pinpoint black spot on it.

Madam, I would like to tell you about this so called damage on the basis of which the Health Ministry has rejected this and the FCI has refused to lift it. I will quote from the ICAR Report. It says:

“The PAU-201 rice variety was released by Punjab Agricultural University in the Kharif season of 2007. It is a high yielding variety having yield potential 11 per cent higher and requiring less water than other varieties leading to considerable saving in irrigation water and this has a brown pigmentation which is genetic character of the seed and its health. The data on pathological studies has proved that the blackening is not due to fungal infestation as is suspected. The grain is not susceptible to Aspergillus attack and hence looking at the health benefits of its high iron content of this variety, the slightly blackened and black spot grain do not lose their aesthetic appeal compared to the white grain and can be considered as good grain due to the extra health benefits. The iron fortification is priority health concern of this country and this variety can easily provide the solution to this problem. The iron content in this variety is higher than other varieties which causes more slightly blackened and black spot grain and this fact need to be taken into consideration for exempting the classification of grain from rejection.”

The black spot is due to the iron content. Today 50 per cent of the children in this country are mal-nourished; 60 per cent of our women are anemic. The black spot in this

grain which is due to higher iron content can solve a host of other problems. This variety of rice is being rejected because of its aesthetic appeal. Is this what the law in this country promotes? Is this what the Health Ministry is promoting?

Madam, I would like to point out what the Agriculture Ministry says on the black spot. When this variety of rice was not lifted we requested the Health Ministry and also the Agriculture Ministry to take the sample of this variety of rice and have it tested. For your information I would like to submit that 75 samples were taken from various parts of Punjab for this PAU-201 variety. They were sent to three laboratories – one in Pune, one in Mysore and one in Ghaziabad, which are under the administration of the Ministry of Health. You would be surprised to learn that out of 75 samples tested, 66 samples were found to be absolutely okay. There was a problem in 9 samples. I would like to point out what the problem was in these 9 samples. The reply of the hon. Minister says that 9 samples were not found to be conforming to the standards of rice as prescribed by the PFA rules as these contain damaged grain, moisture and aflatoxin more than the prescribed limits. I have the reports. Out of the 25 samples that went to one laboratory, only two samples were found to have higher moisture levels. The acceptable moisture level is 16 per cent. One sample had 16.2 and the other had 16.3 per cent. All of the samples rejected because two samples had more. In what the Minister is saying is damaged, out of the 25 samples, 4 of them were found to have more damage, against the five per cent acceptable norm, the first had 5.7 per cent; the second had 5.7 per cent; the third had 5.7 per cent and the fourth had 6.2 per cent extra breakage than the acceptable 5 per cent norm.

Madam, when we come to aflatoxin, within the prescribed limit, namely, 30 ppb limit of aflatoxin, there were only two samples, i.e. the one which had 50.4 and one which had 49.9. It was two samples out of 75 and all the rest of the 23 samples had not only 30 but less than one ppb as against 30 ppb which is the acceptable norm.

So, these were the results of the three labs. I would like to point out that the Ghaziabad lab which comes under the Ministry reported all of them to be absolutely fine. In spite of this, today, 40 lakh tonnes of grain are lying there rotting in Punjab in open

cap storages because of bureaucratic hurdles of this Ministry. ... (*Interruptions*) Madam, the bureaucrats are not answerable when people die out of hunger.... (*Interruptions*)

I would just like to point out over here that in our country, grains are being allowed to rot. This is not just an issue where the grains are rotting and are still allowed to rot but it could actually feed 50 lakh hungry people for the last one year who have died of hunger. Every year, 25 lakh people die of hunger in our country.

Madam, it is besides the fact that they are not feeding hungry people, the bigger issue here is that even today, action is not being taken to lift this rice and what is the result of this today? The godowns of Punjab should be 75 per cent to 95 per cent free for the next crop which is coming in the next three weeks but today, our godowns are 95 per cent full with grains and 140 lakh more tonnes of rice will rot being kept in the open because our godowns are not empty as yet.

So, I would appeal to you, Madam, and to the Ministry to look at the urgency of the matter. This rice is being eaten by the people of Punjab, by the farmers of Punjab and others. I have also given the hon. Minister a sample of rice. I appreciate the pro-active steps which he has taken to solve this problem but the bureaucrats are not the ones who are answerable to the people, they are not the ones who have to feed the nation. You can have reports filled in as many times as you want. (*Interruptions*) Why should Punjab Government, the farmers and the storage officials bear the brunt of this rice rotting for the last one year? I request the Ministry to urgently have the rice lifted at the earliest possible because this 40 lakh tonnes are not poisonous, it is not harmful and it can save the lives of lakhs of hungry people who are dying due to hunger even this very minute.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD : Madam Speaker, I share the concern of the hon. Member but I would also like to make it clear that it is not the Food Ministry which has got into it but it was between the Punjab Government and the Food Corporation of India. ... (*Interruptions*)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (मैनपुरी): यह सारे देश का मामला है। पंजाब और यूपी में भी सड़ रहा है।... (ब्यवधान)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: So, it was referred to us and once anything is referred to us, we have to report faithfully and ultimately, it is the Food Corporation and the

Ministry of Agriculture which have to take a decision. It is not that we have done something pro-actively. ... (*Interruptions*)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : पहले भी बोल चुके हैं लेकिन कोई कार्यवाही नहीं हुई।... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइए। हरसिमरत जी, आप भी बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: As I said in the beginning, all of us are concerned about this matter including the hon. Member and the Government. I am also concerned not only about the farmers but at the same time, we would not like to rot such a huge amount of rice.

In this connection, I would like to put the record straight and inform the House that the reason attributed to the Food Authority for rejection of rice variety does not depict the actual picture of the incident. During December 2009, the Food Corporation of India and the Department of Food and Public Distribution, Government of India informed that the PAU-201 variety of paddy rice milled in Punjab is showing higher incidence of damaged grains in rice.

The issue was examined by the Indian Council of Agricultural Research and according to it, the blackened grains/slightly blackened grains and pin-point blackened grains in the rice of this variety were ranging from 3.39 to 8.79 per cent.

The Indian Council of Agricultural Research viewed that – I am talking of the Ministry of Agriculture and it has not come to my Ministry then – blackened grains, slightly blackened grains and pin-point blackened grains in the rice were due to excessive iron content in this variety.

In January, 2010 on the request of the Food Corporation of India and the Department of Food and Public Distribution, 75 samples of rice were collected from various places of Punjab by a team constituted by the Department of Food and Public Distribution.

The samples were sent to three Central Food Laboratories situated at Ghaziabad, Pune and Mysore for analysis as per the parameters prescribed in the PFA Act, 1954.

Out of the above three labs, only the Central Food Laboratory at Ghaziabad is under the administrative control of the Food Authority.

The analysis reports of the 75 samples revealed – I agree here with the hon. Member – that only nine samples out of the 75, were not found to be conforming to the standards of rice as prescribed under the PFA rules as stated above as these contained damaged grains, moisture and aflatoxin more than the prescribed limits. The results of the analysis were conveyed to the Food Corporation of India as well as to the Department of Food and Public Distribution.

So, they should have decided then whether to lift it or not. We did our job. But again I do not know the reason why they did not lift it. The hon. Deputy Chief Minister of Punjab and the hon. Member met me and told me that they are still not lifting. The meeting was held with the delegation of the Government of Punjab headed by the Deputy Chief Minister and the hon. Member, and it was decided that let the ICMR independently conduct analysis of the black portion of the PAU-201 rice for which samples be collected by the FCI and the Government of Punjab.

I think the hon. Deputy Chief Minister and the hon. Member must have approached the hon. Minister of Agriculture, and the Minister of Agriculture wanted to hold a meeting. So, another meeting was held on 15<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 in the Minister of Agriculture office where I was also present. Officers of the Ministries concerned, Indian Council of Agriculture Research, Indian Council of Medical Research, Food Safety and Standard Authority also attended the meeting. What was decided in the meeting presided over by the Minister of Agriculture? It was decided that the ICMR and the ICAR, the Health Ministry's Research Wing and the Agriculture Ministry's Research Wing will coordinate fresh collections of samples from Punjab and expeditiously test the composition of the blackened portion of rice and its toxicity. So, we have been assigned to find out the composition of the blackened portion of the rice and its toxicity.

In the meeting it was decided that ICMR will look into the two following issues, that is (i) the toxin level, which is called the aflotoxin level, in the damaged rice of this variety; and (ii) the content of the blackened portion of the damaged rice.

The Secretary, the Department of Health Research and the DG, ICMR constituted a Committee on the same day, that is on 19.8.2010, for collection of samples of PAU-201 variety from different parts of Punjab.

The members of the Committee consist of two senior scientists of the ICMR and the Assistant Director General (Seeds) of the Indian Council of Agricultural Research.

The team had a meeting on 20.08.2010 at Ludhiana in which, the Director of Central Institute of Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology (VIPHET) of ICAR, Director Research, Punjab Agricultural University (PAU, Ludhiana), Deputy Director, Food and Civil Supplies, Government of Punjab and other officers attended. They discussed the strategy of collection of samples.

Director Research, Punjab Agriculture University, nominated two rice breeders for identification of rice variety 201.

Director Central Institute of Post-Harvest Engineering and Technology (CIPHET) nominated another scientist to assist the team.

The joint team visited six districts of Punjab namely: Barnala, Muktsar, Ferozepur, Bhatinda, Mansa and Moga from 21<sup>st</sup> to 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2010.

Representatives of Punjab State Government and Food Corporation of India with their teams were also present during collection of samples.

35 paddy samples and 11 sorted damaged samples of rice were collected from 35 mills from the six districts of Punjab. Sorted damaged rice samples have been sent to ICMR's Institute, National Institute of Nutrition (NIN), Hyderabad for analysis of aflatoxin.

The paddy samples weighing more than 300 kg were collected and have been sent to Hyderabad for milling to get white and sorted damaged rice at Directorate of Rice Research, Hyderabad.

Secretary, Department of Health Research and DG, ICMR called a meeting on 25<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 of representatives of the Food Corporation of India (FCI), Indian Council of Agricultural Research (ICAR) and Food Safety and Standards Authority of India

(FSSAI) to discuss the follow up action after collection of paddy and sorted damaged rice samples.

The following were suggested in the meeting:

1. Three laboratories one at National Institute of Nutrition (NIN), Hyderabad and two others – one of Ministry of Commerce will analyse these samples for aflatoxin.
2. National Institute of Nutrition (NIN), Hyderabad will also analyze the content of the black/brown coloured portion of damaged rice.

National Institute of Nutrition (NIN), Hyderabad has initiated the analysis of 11 sorted damaged rice samples and the results are likely to be available by the second week of September, 2010. ... (*Interruptions*)

(Placed in Library, See No. LT 3106/15/10)

---



MADAM SPEAKER: Now, the House will take up 'Zero Hour' matters. Dr. Ratna Dey.

... (*Interruptions*)

DR. RATNA DE (HOOGHLY): Madam, thank you very much for giving me an opportunity. ... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : यह क्या हो रहा है? आप लोग बैठ जाइये।

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठिये। ज़ीरो ऑवर में आपको बोलने का मौका देंगे।

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आपकी बात हो गई। इस तरह से नहीं चलता है।

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : जगदम्बिका पाल जी, आप क्यों खड़े हो गये हैं, बैठिये। अजनाला जी, कॉलिंग अटेंशन समाप्त हो गया है, अब आप बैठिए।

... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Let Dr. Ratna De speak. Shri Jagdambika Pal, please take your seat. Dr. Rattan Singh Ajnala and Shrimati Harsimrat Kaur, please take your seats.

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: We have now moved on to 'Zero Hour'. The Calling Attention is over. Dr. Ratna De.

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go in record except what Dr. Ratna De says.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

DR. RATNA DE : Madam, cancer of the cervix is the most common cancer amongst the women in India. ... (*Interruptions*) With an age adjusted and incidence rate ranging from 19.4 to 43.5 per one hundred thousand in the registration under the National Cancer Registration Programme, it has been estimated that 95,000 to 100,000 new cases of cancer cervix occur in India every year and 70 per cent or more are stage three or higher at diagnosis. ... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Jagdambika Pal, please sit down. Your matter is over.

... (*Interruptions*)

DR. RATNA DE : Cancer Cervix occupies the topmost or second rank amongst cancers in women in developing countries.

Aetiology and possible risk factors of Cervical Cancer have been extensively studied. Socio-economic factor, education and income, sexual and reproductive life and virus, especially the Human Papilloma Virus, HPV 16 and 18, are being held responsible for Cervical Cancer. Most Cervical Cancers are preventable with a comprehensive programme of education, awareness, screening, treatment and vaccination. It was found that clinical stage at presentation was the single most important variable in predicting Cancer. The five-year survival rate for Stage-I is 63.3 per cent; for Stage-II, it is 44 per cent; for Stage-III, it is 33.3 per cent and for Stage-IV, it is 5.7 per cent.... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Dr. Ratna De is saying.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

DR. RATNA DE : Effective interventions against Cervical Cancer exist, including screening for, and treatment of, pre-cancer and invasive cancer. ... (*Interruptions*) HPV vaccines that prevent HPV 16 and 18 infections are now available and have the potential to reduce the incidence of cervical and other anogenital cancers. ... (*Interruptions*) The development of vaccines for prevention of Cervical Cancer holds tremendous promise for the developing countries like India. The routine HPV vaccination should be included in the National Immunization Programme provided that prevention of Cervical Cancer or

---

\* Not recorded

other HPV-related diseases, or both, constitutes a public health priority; vaccine introduction is programmatically feasible; sustainable financing can be secured; and the cost-effectiveness of vaccination strategies in the country or region is considered....

*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please do not disturb the other Member while speaking. When you spoke, others listened to you. When others speak, you do not listen to them. Please sit down.

... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Dr. Ratna De says. Hon. Members, this is not proper.

*(Interruptions) ...\**

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

DR. RATNA DE : In India, Quadrivalent HPV Vaccine has been licensed for use in girls and women of the age of 9 to 45 years for the prevention of following diseases caused by Human Papilloma Virus types 16 and 18: Cervical pre-cancers and cancers, cervical adenocarcinoma, etc.

So, I would request the hon. Minister to initiate the HPV in the National Immunisation Programme to prevent the Uterine Cervical Cancer in women because 82.5 per cent of invasive cervical cancers in India are attributed to HPVs 16 and 18....

*(Interruptions)*

It is very costly, So, I would request the hon. Minister to take effective measures so that it can be implemented at the district level..... *(Interruptions)*

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइये। आप लोग शांतिपूर्वक बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : अजनाला जी, आप बैठ जाइये।

---

\* Not recorded

...(व्यवधान)

DR. RATNA DE : It is a very important issue. Hence, we all want a Half-an-Hour Discussion on this topic.... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप लोग बैठ जाइये। अजनाला जी, आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइये। हरसिमरत जी, आप आयी थीं और आपने बहुत स्पेशल रिक्वेस्ट की थी कि लॉस्ट डे पर भी आप हमारा कालिंग अटेंशन कर दीजिये, वह हमने कर दिया है। आज के लिए हमारे पास 40 जीरो ऑवर मैटर्स हैं और हम चाहते हैं कि हम सभी को बुलावा लें। आप उनकी बात भी सुन लीजिये। अभी रत्ना डे जी बोल रही थीं, आप उनकी बात सुन लेते। हमें यहां सभी को अपनी बात रखने का मौका देना है। कृपया, आप शांतिपूर्वक अन्य माननीय सदस्यों की बात भी सुनिये।

...(व्यवधान)

डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला (खड्डर साहिव): महोदय, हमारी रिक्वेस्ट है। हम यह विषय कब उठायेंगे?... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : डॉ रत्ना डे को अपनी बात पूरी करने दीजिये।

...(व्यवधान)

डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला : महोदय, हम जवाब चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप लोग बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

DR. RATNA DE : I repeat that it is a very important issue. Hence, we all want a Half-an-Hour Discussion on this topic. Please allow it.



MADAM SPEAKER: Now, I call Dr. Jyoti Mirdha to speak.

... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please sit down. Nothing will go on record except what Dr. Jyoti Mirdha is saying.

(*Interruptions*) ...\*

DR. JYOTI MIRDHA (NAGAUR): Madam, I want to bring to the notice of this House that my colleague has just now mentioned about HPV vaccine. It is a total failure as of today. It has been introduced by a few developed countries but our country, probably, cannot afford it now.... (*Interruptions*) The two strains that she mentioned work only for two strains of HPV virus but we have hundred other strains of HPV virus. The MNCs and other international companies are promoting GARDASIL as a basic preventive measure for Cervical Cancer. This is a total MNC thing that we are trying to project as the best vaccine against Cervical Cancer. It is not going to work for our country. ... (*Interruptions*) It should not be allowed under the Universal Immunisation Programme unless further trials are conducted in our country and they should be unbiased. So, we should not say “yes” to it unless we go ahead with more, I would say, unbiased trials. (*Interruptions*) I say this because the Committee that is on right now has three people and one of the ladies herself is conducting a trial in her hospital. Thank you.... (*Interruptions*)

---

\* Not recorded

**12.31 hrs.**

**SUBMISSIONS BY MEMBERS**

**(i) Re: Caste based Census**

**श्री शरद यादव (मधेपुरा):** मैं आपकी बात भी उठाऊंगा, मुझे बोलने दीजिए। ... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष जी, जो मसला अभी सदन में चला हुआ है, आज एग्रीकल्चर मिनिस्टर यहाँ नहीं हैं। इनका इतना ही कहना है कि लाखों टन अनाज कैसे उठे जिससे कि आने वाली फसल का स्टोरेज हो सके। लेकिन मैं एक दूसरा मामला उठाने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ।

अध्यक्ष जी, इस संसद में पाँच या छः बार जाति जनगणना का मामला उठा। सारे सदन ने आम सहमति और आम राय से सरकार के सामने यह सवाल रखा। सरकार ने भी देखा, प्रधान मंत्री भी बोले, सदन के नेता प्रणव जी भी बोले। हमें दो-तीन बार बुलाकर कहा कि हो जाएगा, हो जाएगा। आज इस सत्र का अंतिम दिन है। फिर इसके बाद आपने पत्र लिखा। पत्र के बाद भी सारी पार्टियों ने कह दिया - बीजेपी और लेफ्ट से लेकर सारी पार्टियों ने कह दिया, इसके बाद भी आपकी पाँच या छः कैबिनेट की बैठक हो गई। देश में बेचैनी है। समय भाग रहा है, लेकिन इसके बावजूद भी आपने स्वयं देखा है कि यहाँ प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा, यहाँ पूरी पार्टियों से दो बार आपने राय ले ली, इसके बाद भी इस मामले में अभी तक कोई रास्ता नहीं निकला। ज़रा सा मेटर था, कोई बड़ी बात नहीं थी। आप हैडकाउंट में इसको डाल दें और इसका जवाब सरकार को तत्काल देना चाहिए, नहीं तो यह मामला बाहर बहुत बेचैनी के साथ है। इस बेचैनी को आपको दूर करना चाहिए और आपको साफ़-साफ़ आकर साफ़-साफ़ बात करनी चाहिए, यही मैं कहना चाहता हूँ।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप शांत हो जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (मैनपुरी):** अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपका बहुत कृतज्ञ हूँ। मैं कोई बड़ा भाषण नहीं दूँगा। अभी माननीय शरद यादव जी ने मामला उठाया। मुझे आश्चर्य इस बात का है कि जब सदन की आम सहमति हो गई तो कोई ऐसा दल नहीं था जिसने समर्थन न किया हो कि जाति आधार पर जनगणना होनी चाहिए। कोई भी दल ऐसा नहीं था। उसके बाद सदन के नेता ने भी कहा, और यह सही है कि सभी दल के नेताओं को बुलाया और मुख्य तौर पर हमको बुलाया अपने ऑफिस में और कहा कि आपकी बात हम मानेंगे और जल्दी से जल्दी जाति आधार पर जनगणना होगी। ताज्जुब तब होता है जब स्वयं प्रधान मंत्री जी ने खड़े होकर कहा कि मैं इस सवाल को कैबिनेट में ले जाऊँगा और इस पर हम कार्रवाई करेंगे। अब घुमा-फिराकर कुछ और कहने लगे। प्रधान मंत्री और सदन के नेता के कहने के बाद भी और पूरे सदन की आम सहमति के बाद भी अभी जनगणना बहुत तेज़ी से शुरू करा दी।

अभी जनगणना और भी तेजी से शुरू करवा दी है और जो बहाना बनाते थे कि इसमें बहुत देर लगेगी। अधिकारियों से मेरी बात हुई है और अधिकारियों ने साफ कहा है कि इसमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं है, हमें सिर्फ एक खाना बढ़ाना पड़ेगा, उसमें जाति लिख देंगे, आगे बैकवर्ड, अपरकॉस्ट या शड्यूलकॉस्ट है, वह लिख देंगे। आखिर क्या वजह है कि सरकार के आश्वासन देने के बावजूद भी इस पर कार्यवाही नहीं हुई है और न ही जनगणना रोकी गई है, जनगणना हो रही है। आप हमें बताइए हम कहां जाएं और क्या करें? हम शांत हैं और सदन को अच्छे से चलाना चाहते हैं। यदि शांतिपूर्वक कोई सदन नहीं चलने दे रहा है, तो वह सरकार है। सरकार जायज़ बात को भी मानने को तैयार नहीं है। यदि सरकार जायज़ बात मान ले तो इस सदन में अशांति कभी नहीं होगी। हम लोगों को कभी-कभी अशोभनीय कार्य करना पड़ता है।...(व्यवधान) मैं जानता हूँ। इसलिए आपकी तरफ से निर्देश चला जाए और सरकार यह बताए कि कब इसकी शुरूआत करेगी? जब प्रधानमंत्री जी एवं नेता सदन ने आश्वासन दिया और पूरे सदन की आम सहमति के बाद भी अभी तक जातिगत आधार पर जनगणना क्यों नहीं हो रही है?...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप इससे अपने को एसोसिएट कर लीजिए। इस प्रकार से तो बहस शुरू हो जाएगी और सभी इस पर बोलना चाहते हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री गोपीनाथ मुंडे (बीड):** महोदया, मैं केवल एक मिनट लूंगा।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** बोलिए, लेकिन जल्दी।

**श्री गोपीनाथ मुंडे :** अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं सदन का ज्यादा समय नहीं लेना चाहता हूँ। जातिगत आधार पर जनगणना करवाने की जो मांग थी, उस पर प्रधानमंत्री जी ने स्वयं यहां आश्वासन दिया था कि कैबिनेट में फैसला होगा। लेकिन बाद में सभी पार्टियों की राय क्यों मंगवाई गई? उसके बाद सदन के नेता माननीय प्रणव मुखर्जी ने भी सदन में वायदा किया था कि इस सेशन में यह फैसला करेंगे। जनगणना शुरू हो गई। जनगणना में जो आपकी मांग है, उसको एकमोडेट किया जाएगा, ऐसा स्पैसिफिक आश्वासन देने के बाद भी सरकार का इरादा क्या है?...(व्यवधान) सरकार का आखिर क्या इरादा है, समझ में नहीं आ रहा है?...(व्यवधान) मेरी मांग है कि सरकार इस बारे में आज सदन में बयान दे। यही मेरी मांग है।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप लोग बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

**डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला :** मैडम, जब सुप्रीम कोर्ट कह रही है कि उठा लो, तो क्यों नहीं उठा रहे हैं? सरकार को उठाना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** अपनी बात आपने कह दी है, अब आप बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला : हमें जवाब चाहिए कि वे कब तक उठाएंगे?... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : इतना जोर से मत बोलिए। आप लोग बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला : हमें सरकार से जवाब चाहिए कि कब तक उठाएंगे?... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप लोग बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Your Calling Attention is over. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला : सुप्रीम कोर्ट कह रही है कि उठाना चाहिए और गरीबों को दे दो। हम सरकार से जवाब चाहते हैं कि यह कब तक उठाएंगे?... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please let others speak.

... (Interruptions)

### **12.40 hrs.**

*At this stage Dr. Rattan Singh Ajnala and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table*

... (व्यवधान)

श्री दारा सिंह चौहान (घोसी): अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं जानता हूँ कि आज सत्र का आखिरी दिन है, हम समझते हैं कि सरकार की तरफ से बहुत महत्वपूर्ण वक्तव्य आने वाले हैं। ... (व्यवधान) लेकिन इस हाउस में जाति जनगणना का मामला बार-बार उठा।... (व्यवधान) सदन के नेता और इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री जी ने इस बात पर आश्वासन दिया कि जाति जनगणना होगी।... (व्यवधान) फिर क्या कारण है, इसमें कौन सी परेशानी है? ... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन में कहना चाहता हूँ कि सदन के नेता, प्रधान मंत्री जी, सरकार ने आश्वासन दिया है।... (व्यवधान) आज देश की जनता जानना चाहती है कि सत्र के आखिरी दिन में सरकार क्या आश्वासन देना चाहती है? इसमें कौन सा गुनाह है? मैं चाहता हूँ कि जो जाति जनगणना है, सदन के नेता और प्रधान मंत्री जी ने जो आश्वासन दिया है तो निश्चित रूप से जाति जनगणना होनी चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान) हम तो किसी एक जाति की नहीं, सब की चाहते हैं।... (व्यवधान)

### **12.41 hrs.**

*At this stage Dr. Rattan Singh Ajnala and some other hon. Members went back to their seats.*



THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Madam, in respect of the Caste Census, as the hon. Members are aware, in the last Session it was suggested and thereafter a Group of Ministers was constituted. I wrote to all the Political Parties. Most of them have responded and responded positively that Caste should be encompassed in the Census Report. Thereafter, the Group of Ministers has decided that it should and the modality would be house enumeration as it was done. But here it will be limited and information will be only collected in respect of the Caste and thereafter, the other biometric features and other things will go on parallel.

The only thing is that we have not yet announced it because this is not an Empowered Group of Ministers, it was Group of Ministers, and so this decision of the Group of Ministers will have to be endorsed by the Cabinet. I do hope that in the next meeting of the Cabinet it will be endorsed and thereafter all other necessary action will be taken. So, there is no apprehension in respect of that because every Political Party has agreed and they have sent their written communication to it and the Government has more or less decided. It is a question of formalities... *(Interruptions)*

---

MADAM SPEAKER: Please give chance to someone else to speak.

... *(Interruptions)*

अध्यक्ष महोदया: श्री राजा राम पाल जी, आप बोलिए।

... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down.

... *(Interruptions)*

अध्यक्ष महोदया: जीरो ऑवर में लोगों को बोलने दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री राजाराम पाल (अकबरपुर): अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपका आभारी हूँ कि आपने मुझे बोलने का समय दिया। आज पूरे देश में बढ़ती हुई जनसंख्या और तेज रफ्तार के वाहनों के चलते एक्सीडेंट के कारण बड़े पैमाने पर विकलांगता बढ़ रही है।... (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Raja Ram Pal is saying.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

**श्री राजाराम पाल :** यह बढ़ती हुई विकलांगता निश्चित तौर पर समाज और देश के लिए अभिशाप साबित हो रही है। सरकार ने विकलांगता को दूर करने के लिए, विकलांगों के संरक्षण के लिए और उनके अधिकारों के संवर्धन के लिए जो आरक्षण दिया है, वह तीन परसेंट है। भारत सरकार की तरफ से जो पेंशन दी जाने वाली है, ...(व्यवधान) वह तीन सौ रुपए प्रतिमाह है।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** कॉलिंग अटेंशन हो गया है। Everything is over. Please take your seats. Nothing will go on record except what Shri Raja Ram Pal is saying.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

**श्री राजाराम पाल :** अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह विकलांगता समाज के लिए वरदान साबित हो, इसलिए भारत सरकार इसमें हस्तक्षेप करके इसके आरक्षण को तीन परसेंट से बढ़ा कर पांच परसेंट और पेंशन को तीन सौ से बढ़ा कर एक हजार तथा जो जीवनोपयोगी उपकरण हैं, उन्हें पर्याप्त मात्रा में मुफ्त में मुहैया कराने का काम करें ताकि विकलांगता इस देश के लिए अभिशाप न साबित होकर वरदान साबित हो। मैं आपके माध्यम से मांग करता हूँ कि विकलांगों के संवर्धन के लिए, उनके हितों की रक्षा करने के लिए सामाजिक न्याय और आधिकारिता मंत्रालय विशेष ध्यान देने का काम करेगा। आपने हमें इस महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर बोलने का मौका दिया, मैं आपका बहुत-बहुत आभारी हूँ।

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri K. Sugumar.

*... (Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Only what Shri K. Sugumar says will go in record; nothing else will go in record.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

**12.46 hrs.**

*At this stage Shri Sher Singh Ghubaya and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

---

\* Not recorded

SHRI K. SUGUMAR (POLLACHI): Madam Speaker, I express my sincere thanks for giving me an opportunity to raise an important matter regarding Sainik Schools. ...

*(Interruptions)*

The Sainik School in our country is a dream project of the former Prime Minister Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru and the former Defence Minister Shri V.K. Krishna Menon. ...

*(Interruptions)* The schools were started to encourage the students to join Army. Ten years back, the fees was fixed at Rs. 3500 per year for a student and this includes tuition fees, mess fees, book fees etc. ... *(Interruptions)* More number of students from rural areas and from poor families were benefited. Thousands of students who joined these schools are now in a better position in Defence. ... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2 p.m.

**12.47 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.*

---

**14.00 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fourteen of the Clock*

(Mr. Deputy-Speaker *in the Chair*)

**MATTERS UNDER RULE 377 \***

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Hon. Members, Matters under Rule 377 shall be treated as laid on the Table of the House. Those Members who are desirous of laying their Matters under Rule 377 on the Table of the House may send slips at the Table within 20 minutes. Only those Matters for which slips have been received at the Table shall form part of the proceedings and the rest of the Matters shall be treated as lapsed.

**(i) Need to bring transparency in the interest rates charged by banks on various loans**

SHRI P.T. THOMAS (IDUKKI): Banks are charging compound interest for the loans instead of the simple interest they advertise. In that case, the Banks are expected to advertise their compound interest rate. Normally, Banks are advertising their simple interest rate. If a person takes a loan of Rs. 1 Lakh for the interest rate of 10% the bank can only charge Rs. 10000 for one year. However, some Banks are charging compound interest rate despite their commitment on simple interest given in their advertisement. In that case, they charge interest from the customers either monthly, quarterly or twice in a year and charge almost 13 % or 14% in effect. My submission is that in all such cases Banks should advertise that they charge compound interest rate. Similarly, in 2006 the Central Government has given 2% rebate to agricultural loans. But it is not being extended to the beneficiaries because of lack of clarity in interest calculation. Further, some banks charge more in the name of procedural expenses. They should not be allowed

---

\* Treated as laid on the Table

to charge additional charges. I request the Government should look into the matter and take immediate steps to address these concerns.

**(ii) Need to take concrete steps for poverty alleviation in the country**

SHRI N.S.V. CHITTHAN (DINDIGUL): Though there is a high economic growth in the country, still there is large scale poverty in India. Poverty in India can be defined as a situation when a certain section of people are unable to fulfil their basic needs. India has the world's largest number of poor people living in the country. Out of its total population of more than 1 billion, 350 to 400 million people are living below the poverty line. Nearly 75% of the poor people are in rural areas, most of them are daily wagers, landless labourers and self employed house holders. There are a number of reasons for poverty in India. Poverty in India can be classified into two categories namely rural poverty and urban poverty. Though the Government has complemented poverty eradication schemes they have not rendered the desired results as expected.

Main reasons for rural poverty are unequal distribution of income, high population growth, illiteracy, large families, caste system. Main causes for urban poverty are improper training, slow job growth and failure of PDS system.

I, therefore, request the Union Government to take concrete steps for removal of poverty in the country in a phased manner.

**(iii) Need to implement the 'one rank one-pension' scheme for retired military personnel**

**श्री महाबल मिश्रा (पश्चिम दिल्ली):** गत् 26 साल से कई पूर्व सैनिक अपने "एक पद - एक पेंशन" की मांग दोहरा रहे हैं। इस संबंध में विभिन्न प्रांतों से आये पूर्व सैनिकों ने अपने खून से हस्ताक्षर वाला एक ज्ञापन महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी को भी हाल ही में सौंपा है और इससे पहले भी वे अपने अलंकरण लौटा कर अपनी मांग पूरी न होने पर आक्रोश व्यक्त कर चुके हैं। बजट सत्र के दौरान संसदीय समिति भी "एक पद - एक पेंशन" देने की जोरदार सिफारिश कर चुकी है। परन्तु अभी तक यह मामला सरकार के विचाराधीन लम्बित पड़ा हुआ है।

अतः मेरा सरकार से अनुरोध है कि भारत माता के लिए अपने प्राणों को न्यौछावर कर देने वाले इन सभी पूर्व सैनिकों की मांग, जो एक पद एक पेंशन की है, इसे अति शीघ्र मंजूरी दी जाये।

**(iv) Need to construct the proposed new railway line between Ramganjmandi and Ujjain via Jhalawar**

**श्री सज्जन वर्मा (देवास):** महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी द्वारा इस वर्ष संसद के बजट सत्र के प्रारंभ में दिए गए अपने भाषण में इस बात का उल्लेख किया गया था कि अनुसूचित जाति एवं अनुसूचित जनजाति बाहुल्य क्षेत्रों में नई रेलवे लाइन बिछाने हेतु प्राथमिकता दी जायेगी। रेल मंत्री जी द्वारा भी अपने रेलवे बजट भाषण 2010 में भी उन्होंने इस बात का जोर देकर उल्लेख किया था कि बिना लाभ-हानि के आधार पर अनुसूचित जाति, अनुसूचित जनजाति एवं पिछड़े इलाकों में भी नई रेलवे लाइन बिछाई जायेंगी। मेरा सम्पूर्ण लोक सभा क्षेत्र अनुसूचित जाति बाहुल्य क्षेत्र है। यहां विगत वर्षों में एक नई रेलवे लाइन बिछाने का सर्वेक्षण कार्य पूर्ण हो चुका है। यह रेल लाइन है - रामगंजमंडी से उज्जैन वाया झालावाड़, आगरा। 850 करोड़ की यह महती योजना आज भी लंबित है। इस रेल लाइन को बिछाने का कार्य चालू नहीं किया जा रहा है।

अतः मेरा केन्द्र सरकार से अनुरोध है कि इस नई रेलवे लाइन बिछाने का कार्य अविलंब किया जाये।

**(v) Need to extend the period of exemption of service tax on Sheep Insurance Scheme in Andhra Pradesh upto 31.12.2012**

DR. MANDA JAGANNATH (NAGARKURNOOL): The Government of Andhra Pradesh had introduced sheep insurance scheme during the year 2006-07 for the benefit of the poor sheep rearers covering unavoidable risks as most of the sheep rearers belonged to weaker sections of the society i.e. scheduled castes, Scheduled Tribes and Backward class Communities.

The exemption of service tax on this essential and beneficial scheme has enormous positive impact for covering maximum number of sheep rearers to unwanted economic losses. With the exemption of service tax, the sheep rearers will be relieved of the burden of payment of an additional amount of service tax on premium.

The Government of Andhra Pradesh had been representing for the extension of period of exemption of service tax on sheep insurance from 31.12.2009 to 31.12.2012 for the benefit of the poor sheep rearer in the State which the Government of India had earlier given the exemption till 31.12.2009.

Under the above explained circumstances through you Madam, I request the Ministry of Finance, Government of India to consider the matter and issue necessary orders for extension of period of exemption of service tax as requested by Government of Andhra Pradesh up to 31.12.2012.

**(vi) Need to check the menace of wild animals threatening the lives and agricultural produce in Wayanad district, Kerala and provide regular compensation for the recurring losses incurred by farmers**

SHRI M.I. SHANAVAS (WAYANAD): The mainstay of economy of Waynad district is agriculture and a significant population of this district are small and medium farmers. A serious crisis is now looming over the farming community of Waynad. Animals, especially elephants, wild boars, and common Langur attack and destroy farms and cause severe loss to agricultural produce and pose threat to humans as well. The standard procedures to fend off animals are fencing and digging of trenches. However, the effective completion and maintenance of trenches and fences are not carried out by the state forest department. Trenches were built under the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme, but the effective maintenance and extension of such trenches are not carried out effectively.

The people residing in wildlife inhabited areas should be rehabilitated with necessary compensation for relocation. There must be immediate steps to check rapid deforestation and shrinking of forest space which act as the main reasons for animals straying into human habitations. Another serious issue about the compensation, which incidentally is given only once for a person, when attacks by animals take place on a recurring scale. This anomaly in release and award of compensation should be rectified immediately and a policy framework regarding the management and administration of wildlife administration with regard to damage to agriculture property should be framed.



**(vii) Need to construct a new National Highway from Gudihatnur village, Adilabad district to Oda Revu Prakasam district, in Andhra Pradesh**

SHRI PONNAM PRABHAKAR (KARIMNAGAR): I would like to draw the kind attention of the august House regarding the need for administrative sanction and laying of a new national highway starting from Gudihatnur village of Adilabad district to Oda Revu of Prakasam district in Andhra Pradesh in the remaining XI Five year plan with sufficient budget on priority basis.

This 700 kms. route covers most parts of backward Telengana region and particularly my Karim Nagar Parliamentary Constituency in Andhra Pradesh. It enters at Korutla and passes through Kathiapur, Vemulawada, Siricilla, Ellanthakunta, Husnabad which falls under my Parliamentary Constituency and ends at Duddeda before joining at Medak Constituency. People of my Constituency are facing lot of inconvenience due to absence of a national highway. Number of accidents are taking place on this route and innocent people are losing their valuable lives leaving their family members in chaos. It is a long-pending demand of the people of my constituency and, I have submitted a proposal in this regard to the Government of India for taking necessary action in the matter. The Government of Andhra Pradesh has also sent a proposal in this regard to take up this dream project in Telangana Region in Andhra Pradesh to improve the tourism sector also.

I, therefore, request the Hon'ble Minister of Road Transport & Highways to intervene in the matter and accord administrative approval for sanctioning and laying of a new national highway starting from Gudihatnur village of Adilabad district to Oda Revu in Prakasam district, Andhra Pradesh.

**(viii) Need to waive loans extended to SCs/STs, minority, backward and landless people in the country under various Central/State Schemes**

SHRIMATI SANTOSH CHOWDHARY (HOSHIARPUR): Late Smt. Indira Gandhiji wanted to fulfil the dreams of Mahatma Gandhi and Late Pt. Jawaharlal Nehru, the first Prime Minister of India for raising the standards of living and quality of life of the SCs/STs population in the country. She took a historic step of nationalizing the bank, so that the poor and downtrodden of the country could get the loan and make their livelihood better. They took the loan under various schemes extended by State and Central Governments Banks, Co-operatives, SCs/STs & BCs Finance Corporation. Because of the social milieu prevailing in the country and their being inexperienced in business and trade and other vocations, these poor people were unable to repay these loans and the interest thereon. Actually, the loans are given to them without upgrading their skills properly and without providing them a market for their goods. Now, deep unrest is prevailing in the hearts of these SCs/STs & BCs community for not waiving their loans.

Madam through you, I request the Government to take active consideration in waiving the debts of SCs/STs, Minority, backward and landless people. It will directly provide relief to the 23% of the population of India.

**(ix) Need to construct Railway Under Bridges at various level crossings in Bikaner Parliamentary Constituency, Rajasthan**

**श्री अर्जुन राम मेघवाल (बीकानेर):** रेलवे मंत्रालय द्वारा ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में आर.यू.बी बनाने के संबंध में स्पष्ट नीति की घोषणा होनी चाहिए। मैं बीकानेर (राजस्थान) संसदीय क्षेत्र से आता हूँ। वर्तमान में गेज परिवर्तन का कार्य प्रगति पर है, लेकिन ग्रामीणों के लिए रेलवे क्रॉसिंग के रास्ते बंद होने की स्थिति में ग्रामीण गेज परिवर्तन के कार्य को बाधित कर सकते हैं। रेलवे मंत्रालय का यह कहना कि ग्रामीण अवैध रूप से क्रॉसिंग कर रहे हैं, यह दलील ठीक नहीं है। ग्रामीण 40-50 वर्षों से इसी रास्ते का उपयोग कर रहे हैं। खेतों से फसल ढुलाई का भी यही रास्ता है, तो अब रेलवे क्रॉसिंग बंद होने पर ग्रामीणों में आक्रोश है। मेरा आपके माध्यम से रेल मंत्रालय से अनुरोध है कि आर.यू.बी. बनाने के लिए तकनीकी राशि रेलवे माफ करे तथा लेबर कम्पोनेन्ट का कार्य महात्मा गांधी नरेगा योजना से करवाने की व्यवस्था करें। शेष जो भी राशि बचती है, उसका मैटेरियल कम्पोनेन्ट के रूप में एमपीलैड/एमएलए लैड व अन्य किसी योजना से प्रबंध किया जा सकता है। ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में रेलवे फाटकों की समस्या सबसे बड़ी समस्या उभर कर सामने आ रही है। वर्तमान में रतनगढ़ से बीकानेर के मध्य गेज परिवर्तन का कार्य प्रगति पर है, लेकिन लगभग 10 स्थानों पर ग्रामीण जनता ने रेलवे क्रॉसिंग पर धरना दे रखा है। कुछ एक धरने 4 महीने से भी अधिक समय से चल रहे हैं। रेलवे को इस समस्या को गंभीरता से लेना चाहिए तथा सही ढंग से सर्वेक्षण कराकर जहां-जहां भी आर.यू.बी. बन सकते हैं, वहां पर आर.यू.बी. बनाने की व्यवस्था की जानी चाहिए, जिससे गेज परिवर्तन का कार्य भी समय पर पूरा हो सके एवं ग्रामीण जनता को भी सुगम आवागमन का साधन उपलब्ध हो सके।

**(x) Need to bring a stringent law to check the commercialization of education in the country**

**श्री गणेश सिंह (सतना):** सम्पूर्ण देश में शिक्षा का तेजी से व्यापारीकरण हो रहा है, जिससे गरीब एवं मेधावी छात्र शिक्षा से वंचित हो रहे हैं। उदारीकरण के बाद सरकारी नीतियों के फलस्वरूप निजी संस्थान अचानक उत्कृष्टता एवं धर्नाजन का केन्द्र बन गए हैं। शिक्षा के व्यापारीकरण का असर शिशु शिक्षा से लेकर स्नातकोत्तर शिक्षा तक देखा जा रहा है। शिक्षा के व्यापारीकरण के विषय में 2005 में सर्वोच्च न्यायालय के पी.ए. इनामदार केस के कहने पर तत्कालीन मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री ने इस संबंध में एक कानून के लिए प्रारूप तैयार करवाया था। परन्तु आज तक इस पर किसी भी प्रकार का निर्णय नहीं हो पाया है। यह बहुत दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण है। मैं केन्द्र सरकार से जानना चाहता हूँ कि शिक्षा के व्यापारीकरण को रोकने के लिए सरकार क्या प्रयास कर रही है। शिक्षा के व्यापारीकरण को रोकने के लिए एक कठोर कानून बनाए जाने की तुरंत आवश्यकता है। इस संबंध में सरकार की योजना की मुझे विस्तारपूर्वक जानकारी प्रदान की जाये। ऐसी मैं मांग करता हूँ।

**(xi) Need to accord approval for four-laning of N.H. 59A (Indore-Betul) in Madhya Pradesh**

**श्रीमती सुमित्रा महाजन (इन्दौर):** इन्दौर से अहमदाबाद राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग क्रमांक 59 का 4 लेन का कार्य स्वीकृत किया जा चुका है। इसके सथ ही इन्दौर-बैतूल राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग क्रमांक 59-ए है जिसकी वर्तमान स्थिति अत्यंत दयनीय है। जबकि इन्दौर-बैतूल के 4 लेन हो जाने से अहमदाबाद से कोलकाता के मार्ग तक का जुड़ाव विभिन्न राष्ट्रीय राजमार्गों द्वारा हो जायेगा। मेरे मत में इसके छोटे से भाग इन्दौर-बैतूल को 4 लेन करने से राष्ट्रीय आवागमन के महत्व के अहमदाबाद से कोलकाता की सुविधा प्राप्त हो सकती है। इससे वर्तमान में उपयोग होने वाले लंबे रास्ते का विकल्प छोटा मार्ग बन सकेगा, इससे यात्रा में समय एवं ईंधन की भी बचत होगी। मेरा सड़क परिवहन एवं राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग मंत्री जी से निवेदन है कि इन्दौर-बैतूल राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग को शीघ्र से शीघ्र 4 लेन निर्माण हेतु स्वीकृत किया जाये।

**(xii) Need to set up Kendriya Vidyalayas, Navodaya Vidyalayas and Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas in Ahmedabad, Patan and Mehasana districts of Gujarat**

**डॉ. किरीट प्रेमजीभाई सोलंकी (अहमदाबाद पश्चिम):** मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री महोदय जी से अनुरोध करता हूँ कि गुजरात के अहमदाबाद, पाटन और मेहसाना जिलों में नये शैक्षणिक सत्र से केन्द्रीय विद्यालय, नवोदय विद्यालय और कस्तूरबा गांधी बालिका विद्यालयों को प्रारंभ करने की उचित व्यवस्था करें ताकि इन जिलों में बच्चों को अच्छी और सुलभ शिक्षा दे सके। इन जिलों में आज भी स्कूलों का अभाव है। आदिवासी बाहुल्य अनुसूचित जाति/अनुसूचित जनजाति तथा पिछड़े वर्गों के जिलों वाली आबादी में युवाओं को उच्च शिक्षा के अवसर प्राप्त नहीं होते हैं तथा उच्च शिक्षा का खर्च वहन करना उनके लिए कठिन है। माननीय मंत्री महोदय जी 2011 के शैक्षणिक सत्र के पिछड़े जिलों में मंत्रालय की विभिन्न योजनाओं तथा केन्द्रीय सहायता के जरिए ऐसे विद्यालयों को शुरू करने हेतु सकारात्मक कदम उठाये, जिससे बच्चों का समग्र विकास हो तथा एक उज्ज्वल भारत का सपना साकार हो सके।

**(xiii) Need to accord approval to road projects in Fatehpur Parliamentary Constituency, Uttar Pradesh under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana and release adequate funds for the same**

**श्री राकेश सचान (फतेहपुर):** मेरे निर्वाचन क्षेत्र फतेहपुर में प्रधानमंत्री ग्राम सड़क योजना का कार्य बजट के अभाव में एक वर्ष से रुका हुआ है, जिस कारण से ग्रामीण क्षेत्र के नागरिकों को आज भी कच्ची सड़कों से ही आना जाना पड़ता है। भारत सरकार द्वारा प्रधानमंत्री ग्राम सड़क योजना के अंतर्गत फेज 8 के लिए उत्तर प्रदेश के बजट को जारी भी नहीं किया गया है। साथ ही उत्तर प्रदेश व फतेहपुर के नए प्रोजेक्टों को स्वीकृति प्रदान नहीं की गई है। सरकार द्वारा ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों, जहां की आबादी 500 से 1000 तक है, उन ग्रामों को पक्की सड़कों से मुख्य सड़क से जोड़ने का लक्ष्य वर्ष 2009-10 रखा गया था, परन्तु बजट के अभाव से सड़कों का निर्माण नहीं हो सका है, जिस कारण से मेरे क्षेत्र में मानक के अनुसार 106 ग्राम अभी तक मुख्य सड़कों से नहीं जुड़ पाये हैं। अतः सरकार से मांग है कि फतेहपुर, उत्तर प्रदेश की लम्बित पड़ी नई व पुरानी योजनाओं को शीघ्र स्वीकृति प्रदान की जाये। साथ ही बजट की धनराशि जल्द प्रदान की जाये, जिससे ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में आवागमन हेतु पक्की सड़कों का निर्माण प्रधानमंत्री सड़क योजना के अंतर्गत शीघ्र हो सके।

**(xiv) Need to take steps to check the soil erosion caused by river Ganga in rural and urban areas of Allahabad, Uttar Pradesh**

**श्री कपिल मुनी करवारिया (फूलपुर):** मैं सरकार का ध्यान उत्तर प्रदेश के जनपद इलाहाबाद में गंगा नदी से हो रही कटान की तरफ दिलाना चाहता हूँ। इलाहाबाद में गंगा नदी के कटान से ग्रामीण क्षेत्र के विकासखंड बहादुरपुर के ढोकरी, गोसमल पट्टी, लीलापुर कलां आदि गांव के हजारों एकड़ कृषि योग्य भूमि गंगा नदी में समाहित हो चुकी है एवं शहरी क्षेत्र के गोविन्दपुर, सलोरी, बघाड़ा, दारागंज सहित पौराणिक स्थल नागवासुकी मन्दिर के अस्तित्व को खतरा उत्पन्न हो गया है। यदि समय रहते गंगा नदी के कटान से उपरोक्त स्थानों को बचाने का प्रयास नहीं किया गया तो सैंकड़ों एकड़ कृषि योग्य भूमि के अलावा उपरोक्त मोहल्लों, गांवों एवं पौराणिक धार्मिक स्थल नागवासुकी मन्दिर का अस्तित्व समाप्त हो जायेगा।

इलाहाबाद के नगरीय व ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में गंगा नदी से हो रही कटान अत्यंत चिंता का विषय है इसलिए सरकार से मेरा यह अनुरोध है कि जनपद इलाहाबाद के ग्रामीण व नगरीय क्षेत्र में गंगा नदी से हो रही कटान को गंभीरता से लेते हुए कटान रोकने हेतु आवश्यक कदम उठाने का कष्ट करें।

**(xv) Need to construct a culvert bridge between Esalam and Periyathachur villages in Villupuram district, Tamil Nadu, through a Centrally Sponsored Scheme**

SHRI M. ANANDAN (VILUPPURAM): The Centre has been apportioning funds to augment rural road connectivity throughout the country. But still the important needs of a rural pocket in my constituency remain unattended. In Villupuram district, the remote Esalam village with a population of 3000 people is situated in Vikravaandi Panchayat Union. Adjacent to it, lie small villages like Ennayiram Brahmadesam, Mandakapattu, Thirunandhipuram and Nemur. Between Esalam and Vikravaandi, the village Periyathachur is situated with villages like Kongarampoondi, Saalai and Vinayakapuram around it. About 10000 people live in these hamlets and villages. Between Esalam and Periyathachur due to a steep wild stream path, the road gets submerged whenever it rains heavily resulting in flash floods. It has been disrupting the vehicular movement completely. People living in all these villages face great difficulty especially during the Monsoon season and they have to cover by foot the entire stretch which affects their livelihood. Hence, I urge upon the Union Government and the Rural Development Ministry to construct culvert bridge across that stream through a Centrally Sponsored Scheme to facilitate uninterrupted road connectivity that would benefit the villagers living in this remote rural area.

---



**14.01 hrs.**

**INDIAN MEDICINE CENTRAL COUNCIL  
(AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We shall now take up item no. 15 – Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill.

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): I beg to move\*:

“That the Bill further to amend the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970, as passed by Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration. ”

Today, Sowa Rigpa, one of the oldest and well documented traditional systems of medicine in the world is proposed to be given legal recognition as an Indian System of Medicine.

The Department of AYUSH under my Ministry was set up in the year 1995 with the objective to promote and propagate the Indian Systems of Medicine, including Ayurveda, Unani, Siddha, Yoga & Naturopathy as well as Homoeopathy.

Today, if given recognition to Sowa-Rigpa, another member of the family will be added to the AYUSH Family.

Sowa-Rigpa is widely practiced in countries like Tibet, Mangolia, Japan and some parts of China, Nepal and few parts of the former Soviet Union.

Within India, it is practiced in the trans-Himalayan Region, especially Ladakh region of Jammu & Kashmir, Sikkim, Tawang & Bomdika in Arunachal Pradesh, Darjeeling and Kalimpong of West Bengal, Lahaul Spiti and Kinnore in Himachal Pradesh and Hubli and Mysore in Karnataka.

Sowa-Rigpa is similar to the other Indian Systems of Medicine especially Ayurveda and, also includes, practices from the Tibetan/Chinese as well as the local health traditions of the sub-Himalayan Region.

---

\* Moved with the Recommendation of the President

Although the system is widely used in all these regions for treatment of all common diseases, its strengths are recognized in the treatment of chronic diseases like Arthritis, Cancer, neuro-muscular disorders etc.

The objective of my introducing this Bill is to give recognition to Sowa Rigpa, so that its practices could be regulated. For this purpose, the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970 (IMCC Act) needs to be suitably amended.

As all of you are aware, this Act provides for constitution of a Central Council of Indian Medicine for regulating educational standards of Ayurveda, Siddha and Unani systems of medicine at present.

The Sowa Rigpa system of medicine needs to be brought within the definition of Indian Medicine and practitioners of the system need to be enrolled in the Registers so as to develop the system and practices within a legal framework.

I am very happy to state that the Parliamentary Standing Committee attached to the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare examined the above said amendments to the Act had expressed its 'No Objection' to the amendments proposed.

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER:** Motion moved:

“That the Bill further to amend the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970, as passed by Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration.”



**डॉ. राजन सुशान्त (कांगड़ा):** उपाध्यक्ष जी, इंडियन मेडिसन सेंट्रल काउंसिल (अमेंडमेंट) बिल, 2010 पर चर्चा के लिए आपने मुझे बोलने का समय दिया, इसके लिए मैं आपको बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देता हूँ। चर्चा के लिए आवश्यक है कि हम सबको ज्ञात हो कि इस बिल के उद्देश्य क्या हैं, संशोधन क्या है, मूल रूप में बिल में मुख्यतः क्या था, संशोधनों का प्रभाव क्या होगा, उद्देश्य पूर्ति के लिए संशोधनों में क्या कमियां रह गई हैं और सुझाव क्या-क्या हैं। उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं इन सभी पहलुओं पर अपने विचार दे रहा हूँ। जहां तक उद्देश्यों का सवाल है, सीसीआईएम का गठन वर्ष 1970 में किया गया था जिसमें अब सीसीआईएम के गठन की प्रक्रिया में भारतीय चिकित्सा परिभाषा में आयुर्वेद, यूनानी व सिद्धा के साथ सोवा-रिग्पा को सम्मिलित करना है। सोवा-रिग्पा का विकास, संरक्षण व परिरक्षण करना है। सीसीआईएम के फंक्शन्स में सोवा-रिग्पा की सहभागिता क्या है, कितनी रहेगी, यह भी करना है।

उपाध्यक्ष जी, हम जानते हैं कि हमारी जो इनर सिस्टम ऑफ मेडिसन है, उसके उद्देश्यों में तीन-चार बातें विशेष तौर पर कही गई हैं -

स्वस्थस्य स्वास्थ्य रक्षणम्।  
आतुरस्य रोग विमोक्षणम्॥

अर्थात् स्वस्थ पुरुष के स्वास्थ्य की रक्षा करना और रोगी को निरोग करना। इसी तरह वैदिक में भी कहा गया है कि भारतीय संस्कृति का उद्देश्य है -

सर्वे भवन्तु सुखिना, सर्वे सन्तु निरामय  
सर्वे भद्राणि पश्यतु, मा कश्चिद् रोग भवेद्।

इसी तरह -

असतो मा सद्गमय,  
तमसो मा ज्योतिर्गमय  
मृत्योर्मा अमृतं गमय।

इसी तरह -

रोटी, कपड़ा और मकान  
सबको सेहत दो भगवान।  
जीवेम् शतम्।

इन सब चीजों के लिए, उद्देश्यों की प्राप्ति के लिए यह विचार करना जरूरी है कि जो नया सिस्टम सोवा- रिग्पा आ रहा है, वह क्या है, क्योंकि देश के बहुत से लोगों को यह जानकारी नहीं है कि सोवा-रिग्पा क्या है। इसमें क्या संशोधन आए हैं, क्या सुझाव हैं और आयुर्वेद व एलोपैथिक के सिस्टम के लिए अलग-अलग परिषदों का गठन करना क्यों जरूरी है, इन पर भ्रम बने हुए हैं।

जैसे, माननीय स्वास्थ्य मंत्री जी ने सोवा-रिग्पा के बारे में कहा, इसका मतलब है सिस्टम ऑफ मेडिसन। आजकल यह बहुत से देशों में प्रचलित है। परन्तु इसका ओरीजिन व डैवलपमेंट तिब्बत से जुड़ा है, इसलिए इसे

तिब्बतन मेडिसन भी कहते हैं। यह विश्वास किया जाता है कि शुरू में जब हमारी संस्कृति, सभ्यता आई, उस समय Art of healing was prerogative of Gods. जब तक काशीराज देवदास जो एंशिअंट इंडियन किंग थे, स्वर्ग में नहीं गए थे, तब तक यह विश्वास किया जाता था कि केवल देवता ही इलाज करने का प्रिरोगेटिव रखते हैं। लेकिन जब काशीराज देवदास इन देवताओं से चिकित्सा का ज्ञान प्राप्त करने स्वर्ग गए और ज्ञान प्राप्त किया, तो उन्होंने आकर अपने पुत्रों व शिष्यों को सिखाया था। शुरू-शुरू में यह ओरल ट्रेडिशन रहा और जब भगवान बुद्ध प्रकट हुए, उनका अवतार हुआ, तो उन्होंने इस चिकित्सा पद्धति का ज्ञान संस्कृत भाषा में लिखित तौर पर दिया, जिसका विस्तार बाद में गुरु रिंपोछे द्वारा आठवीं शताब्दी में बुद्धिज्म तिब्बत में फैलाया गया। गुरु रिंपोछे ने इनमें से कुछ को तिब्बतन भाषा में ट्रांसलेट किया। फिर तिब्बती राजाओं ने इसे प्रचार व प्रसार दिया। इसका प्रचार और प्रसार तिब्बत, हिमालय क्षेत्रों के साथ-साथ चीन, भारत व मुस्लिम वर्ल्ड में भी फैला हुआ था। पांचवें दलाई लामा के अधीन चागपोरी मेडिकल स्कूल, ल्हासा में स्थापित किया गया जो famous centre of healing बन गया था। तिब्बत में पांच मेजर ट्रेडिशनल साइंसेज़ हैं और उनमें से सोवा-रिग्पा एक विशेष साइंस है। Sowa means 'to heal, to nourish.'; and Rigpa means 'science or knowledge.' Sowa Rigpa means, science of Tibetan healing by Tibetan medicine.

The first international conference on medicine was held during the reign of King Trisong Deusten in 8<sup>th</sup> Century जिसमें इंडिया, पैरिस, चीन, ग्रीस, नेपाल, ईस्टर्न टर्किस्तान आदि देशों से बहुत से विद्वानों, स्कॉलर्स ने भाग लिया था।

सोवा-रिग्पा जिसे आमतौर पर आमची कहा जाता है, आमची समझा जाता है। संसार में अर्थात् यह ओल्डेस्ट सरवाइविंग सिस्टम ऑफ मेडिसन इन दी वर्ड है। जो भारत के हिमालियन क्षेत्रों में प्रख्यात और प्रचलित थी, जैसे माननीय आजाद जी ने कहा। आज भी हमारे देश में सिक्किम, अरुणाचल प्रदेश, हिमाचल के लाहौल-स्पीति, जम्मू-कश्मीर के लद्दाख तथा पश्चिम बंगाल में दार्जिलिंग में यह सिस्टम प्रचलित है। यह पद्धति आयुर्वेद की तरह ही है। इसमें कुछ चाइनीज मेडिसन का भी सम्मिश्रण किया गया है। इसे भगवान बुद्ध ने ही सिखाया है, क्योंकि हम इसे आयुर्वेद पद्धति में ही सम्मिलित करना चाह रहे हैं, इसलिए आयुर्वेद के बारे में हमारे सारे माननीय सदस्य जानते हैं कि इस देश में अष्टांग आयुर्वेद में ऐट डिसिप्लेन ऑफ आयुर्वेद ट्रीटमेंट रहे हैं। काय चिकित्सा अर्थात् इंटरनल मेडिसन, शल्य चिकित्सा अर्थात् सर्जरी, कौमारमृत्यु अर्थात् पिडिऑट्रिक्स, शालाक्य अर्थात् आई एंड ईएंडटी, अगदतंत्र अर्थात् टॉक्सीकॉलोजी, रसायन अर्थात् प्रिवेंटिव केयर एंड रिजुवीनलेशन, विजीकरण अर्थात् एप्रोडिएसिया एंड इम्प्रूविंग हैल्थ ऑफ प्रोजिनी और आठवां भूतविद्या है जिसे आजकल साइकेट्री कहा जाता है।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, सुश्रुत संहिता और चरक संहिता हमारे देश और संसार में प्रसिद्ध रहे हैं। सुश्रुत संहिता एक सर्जरी का ग्रंथ है, जिसके 184 चैप्टर्स हैं। इसमें 1120 बीमारियों का वर्णन है। 700 औषधियां प्लांट से, 64

खनिजों से और 57 पशुओं के द्वारा बनायी जाती है। जैसे आजाद साहब ने भी कहा कि जो काम्प्लेक्स एलीमेंट्स हैं, उनके ट्रीटमेंट का भी प्रावधान था, जिसमें एनजाइना पेक्टोरिस, हाइपरटेंशन, डायबिटीज, स्टोन्स, फिशटुलास, एमपुटेशन और सिजेरियन आपरेशन का भी प्रावधान है। इसी तरह से चरक संहिता के बारे में एक चाइनीज यात्री फा हसन आये थे, जिन्होंने लिखा कि गुप्त साम्राज्य के समय जो 320 से 550 एडी तक रहा है, उसमें चरक संहिता का वर्णन है। सुश्रुत व चरक संहिता का बाद में अरबी भाषा में ट्रांसलेशन हुआ, जिसमें खलीफा अब्बासीद ने इनको ट्रांसलेशन किया। यहां से ये ग्रंथ यूरोप गये, फिर इटली गये ब्रिटिश फिजिशियन जोसेफ कॉन्सटेनटाइन भी 20 साल भारत में रहे हैं। जिन्होंने भारत से प्लास्टिक सर्जरी सीखी। सुश्रुत संहिता में सर्जरी में जो इंस्ट्रूमेंट्स का वर्णन किया है, उनको वेस्टर्न वर्ल्ड ने मॉडर्न इक्विपमेंट को बाद में फर्दर मोडीफाई किया है।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, इसी तरह से जैसे आजाद साहब ने आयुष का वर्णन किया है, जिसमें एवाईयूएसएच का मतलब है—आयुर्वेद, योगा एंड नेचुरल पैथी, यूनानी, सिद्ध और साथ में होम्योपैथी आदि पांच पद्धतियां आयुष में आती हैं। मैंने अभी आपको आयुर्वेद का थोड़ा सा इतिहास बताया है। इसी तरह भारतीय उपमहाद्वीप में मुझे गौरव है कि यूनानी चिकित्सा के क्षेत्र में प्रसिद्धि प्राप्त हकीम अजमल खां, हकीम अब्दुल हमीद, हकीम मुहम्मद सईद और हकीम सैय्यद जिल्लुरहमान हमेशा याद रखे जायेंगे। आयुष का जैसे मैंने वर्णन किया। यह हमारा इतिहास रहा है।

उपाध्यक्ष जी, अब मैं संशोधनों पर आता हूं। माननीय स्वास्थ्य मंत्री जी ने शेष संशोधन इसमें दिये हैं। धारा 2, धारा 3 के (क) और (ख) में, धारा 8 में, धारा 9 में, धारा 17 और प्रथम अनुसूची में संशोधन दिये हैं। मैं पार्टी की ओर से इन सारी धाराओं में किये गये संशोधनों का समर्थन करता हूं और साथ ही मैं आजाद साहब से प्रार्थना करूंगा कि किसी वजह से एक आवश्यक संशोधन इसमें छूट गया है। उपधारा 3 में भी संशोधन आवश्यक है, क्योंकि इसी उपधारा में जहां सीसीआईएम के अध्यक्ष के चुनाव की बात है, वहां प्रत्येक इस पैथी में से एक-एक उपाध्यक्ष का चुनाव भी होना है। उपाध्यक्ष के चुनाव में आज जहां लिखा गया है --आयुर्वेद, सिद्ध और यूनानी, वहां पर मैं प्रार्थना करता हूं कि इनके साथ-साथ सोवा-रिग्पा भी जोड़ दिया जाये तभी हमारी सीसीआईएम के वाइस प्रेजीडेंट की चुनाव प्रक्रिया भी पूरी हो सकेगी। उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, आप जानते हैं कि आज सीसीआईएम का जो उद्देश्य है, उनमें सबसे पहले है अच्छी, उच्च और गुणवत्ता वाली शिक्षा को प्रदान करना। ...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** माननीय सदस्य, कृपया अब आप अपनी बात समाप्त कीजिए।

**डॉ. राजन सुशान्त :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, हमारी पार्टी के लिए पन्द्रह मिनट हैं। ...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** पूरे बिल के लिए एक घण्टे का समय है। इसलिए आप अपनी बात समाप्त कीजिए।

**डॉ. राजन सुशान्त :** महोदय, इसी के साथ-साथ सीसीआईएम का जो गठन हो रहा है, उसके बारे में मैं सुझाव देना चाहूंगा कि आज जो वोटर लिस्ट बन रही है, उसमें कुछ खामियां रह गयी हैं। आज यूटी और यूपी बराबर कर दिए गए हैं क्योंकि धारा में लिखा गया है कि एक राज्य से मैक्सिमम पांच मेंबर चुने जाएंगे, अगर यूनियन टेरिटरी में से



कम से कम एक मेंबर चुना जाए और यूपी में से पांच भी चुने जाएं, तो भी मैं समझता हूँ कि यूपी जैसे राज्य के साथ न्याय नहीं होगा क्योंकि यूपी की जनसंख्या एक यूटी की 80 गुना है। इसलिए मैं चाहता हूँ कि इसको ठीक किया जाए और राज्य सभा के पैटर्न पर चिकित्सकों की संख्या, जो रजिस्टर में दर्ज है, उसके अनुसार उस राज्य से सीसीआईएम के लिए सदस्यों की संख्या का पुनर्निर्धारण किया जाए।

इसके साथ ही दूसरी समस्या अवधि की है। आज जो सदस्य चुने जा रहे हैं, वे पांच साल के लिए चुने जाते हैं, लेकिन इसमें एक कमी रह गयी है। इसमें लिखा गया है कि अगर एक से पांच साल के लिए चुना जाता है और उसके बाद जब तक नया सदस्य चुनकर नहीं आता है, तब तक वही सदस्य कांटीन्यू करेगा। इसकी वजह से ऐसी स्थिति उत्पन्न हो गयी है कि जो चुनकर आता है, वह षडयंत्र करता है, इस विसंगति का दुरुपयोग करता है, उस राज्य में चुनाव ही नहीं होने देता है, कोई न कोई अड़चन खड़ी कर देता है और मामला कोर्ट में लटका दिया जाता है। इसलिए मैं चाहता हूँ कि इस प्रावधान में संशोधन किया जाए कि कोई भी सदस्य पांच साल के बाद सदस्य नहीं रहेगा, उसकी सीट खाली हो जाएगी और चुनाव अनिवार्य कर दिया जाएगा।

इसी तरह मेरा सुझाव है कि एजुकेशन में एडमिशन की जो परमीशन देनी है, वह जून के महीने तक दे दी जाए ताकि समय पर एडमिशन हो जाए और रजिस्ट्रेशन भी हर साल रिन्यु की जाए, तथाकथित अनक्वालीफाइड चिकित्सकों पर सख्त चेकिंग हो ताकि देशवासियों की जान से खेलने वाले इन लोगों को सजा दी जा सके। ...(व्यवधान)

इसी के साथ मेरा सुझाव है कि जिस तरह से सभी जगह सेन्ट्रल यूनिवर्सिटीज खोली गयी हैं, उसी तरह से हमारे आयुष सिस्टम को गुणवत्ता प्रदान करने के लिए सभी राज्यों में एक-एक यूनिवर्सिटी इंडियन सिस्टम ऑफ मेडिसिन को दी जाए। हिमालय के राज्यों - हिमाचल प्रदेश, जम्मू-कश्मीर और उत्तराखण्ड से इसकी शुरुआत की जाए। इसी तरह से सीसीआईएम में प्रावधान किया जाए, और सभी हॉस्पिटल, पीएचसीज, रेफरल हॉस्पिटल्स में, चाहे वे गांव में हों या शहर में हों, वहां आयुर्वेद, यूनानी, होम्योपैथी और सोवा-रिग्पा के भी डाक्टर लगाए जाएं। रजिस्ट्रेशन के लिए स्टैंडर्ड ऑफ टेस्ट के लिए ऑल इंडिया लेवल पर एक ही मापदण्ड निर्धारित किए जाएं।

अंत में, सीसीआईएम में हम इस पद्धति को ले रहे हैं, लेकिन इसमें एक कठिनाई यह आ रही है कि अभी यह पता नहीं है कि इनके डाक्टर कितने हैं, कितने कॉलेजेज हैं, इनकी फ़ैकल्टी क्या है, यूनिवर्सिटी क्या है, इनको एजुकेशन कौन देगा, फ़ैकल्टी कहां से आएगी, सिलेबस क्या होगा, इन बातों पर मैं चाहूंगा कि हम डिटेल्स में जाएं। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे पास मेडिकल, डेंटल, नर्सिंग, फार्मा और पैरा-मेडिकल, ये पांच कौंसिल्स हैं। इसी तरह इंडियन सिस्टम में आयुर्वेद, होम्योपैथी, यूनानी, सिद्ध की चार कौंसिल्स हैं और पांचवी हम सोवा-रिग्पा की बना रहे हैं। आज एमसीआई को भंग कर दिया गया है, स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय ने मेडिकल शिक्षा के क्षेत्र की सभी परिषदों को भंग कर इनकी जगह नयी व्यवस्था करने की कवायद तेज कर दी है। आजाद साहब का दावा है कि संसद के अगले

सत्र में एनसीएचआरएच अर्थात् राष्ट्रीय स्वास्थ्य एवं मानव संसाधन परिषद पेश कर देंगे जिसमें सारी पारम्परिक तथा एलोपैथिक पद्धति के मेडिकल कॉलेजों का नियमन अलग-अलग रहेगा, लेकिन दूसरी तरफ आदरणीय कपिल सिब्बल जी का प्रस्ताव है कि एनसीएचईआर अर्थात् राष्ट्रीय उच्च शिक्षा एवं शोध आयोग में मेडिकल शिक्षा को भी शामिल किया जाएगा, इससे भ्रम की स्थिति बनी हुई है। मैं चाहूंगा कि आजाद साहब इसको स्पष्ट करें।

अंत में, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि जैसे हमारी पार्टी ने सीबीआई के दुरुपयोग का मुद्दा बार-बार उठाया है, आज इसमें भी सीबीआई का दुरुपयोग होना शुरू हो गया है। भारत सरकार ने, सीबीआई के छापे इसी महीने में पंजाब, राजस्थान, यूपी में, केवल उन संस्थाओं में डाले गए हैं, जहां की परिषद या ट्रस्ट के मालिक विरोधी पक्ष से हैं, लेकिन जहां के मालिक सत्ताधारी दल के हैं, वहां सीबीआई ने कोई रेड नहीं की है।

मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि अभी कर्नाटक हाई कोर्ट में एक रिट पिटिशन दायर हुई है, जिसमें कहा गया है कि इस साल आयुर्वेद कालेजेज़ में एडमिशन पर बैन लगाया जाए, क्योंकि सीरियस इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर्स डिफेक्ट्स पाए गए हैं, अगर ये ठीक नहीं हुए तो सब स्टैंडर्ड कालेजेज़ आएंगे और बैड डाक्टर्स पैदा होंगे। इससे सीरियस हैल्थ हैजाडर्स पैदा होंगे।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय:** कृपया अपनी बात समाप्त करें, वरना रिकार्ड में नहीं जाएगा।

**डॉ. राजन सुशान्त :** इसी तरह से महाराष्ट्र से भी एक एसोसिएशन ने सीसीआईएम के प्रस्ताव का विरोध किया है, जिसमें सीसीआईएम यह कह रही है कि हम क्षेत्रीय भाषाओं को ड्रॉप कर देंगे। मेरी प्रार्थना है कि सरकार इन बिंदुओं पर ध्यान दे और इस सम्बन्ध में आवश्यक कदम उठाए।

---

**14.21 hrs.**

**SUBMISSIONS BY MEMBERS – Contd.**

**(ii) RE: Supreme Court's observation on free distribution of foodgrains among the poor in the country**

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय:** श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज। कृपया अपनी बात संक्षेप में कहें।

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (विदिशा):** उपाध्यक्ष जी, मैं आपकी अनुमति से और स्वास्थ्य मंत्री जी से क्षमा मांगती हूँ कि जिस बिल पर चर्चा हो रही है, उसे थोड़ी देर के लिए रोकते हुए मैं एक बहुत महत्वपूर्ण समाचार सदन को देना चाहती हूँ। पता नहीं मेरे साथियों ने अभी-अभी टेलीविजन पर देखा है या नहीं। आज सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने बहुत ऐतिहासिक निर्णय दिया है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने निर्णय देते हुए यह कहा है कि एक तरफ इस देश में लोग भूखों मर रहे हैं और दूसरी तरफ लाखों लाख टन अनाज गोदामों में पड़ा सड़ रहा है। इसलिए भूखों को, गरीबों को मुफ्त में यह अनाज बांटा जाना चाहिए। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने सरकार को फटकार लगाते हुए यह कहा है कि यह बात हमने सुझाव के तौर पर नहीं कही थी, हमने आदेश के तौर पर कही थी। यह एक बहुत ही क्रांतिकारी और ऐतिहासिक निर्णय सुप्रीम कोर्ट का है। आज संसद के इस सत्र का आखिरी दिन है। मुझे नहीं मालूम कि सरकार ने इसे सुझाव के तौर पर क्यों माना था। उस समय भी सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने आदेश ही दिया था। हम चाहते हैं कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट के इस आदेश की पालना सरकार करेगी, यह आश्वासन आज ही सदन में कृषि मंत्री जी के द्वारा आना चाहिए और एक सप्ताह के अंदर सरकार योजना बनाकर लाए कि किस तरह से निशुल्क यह अनाज गरीबों में बांटा जाएगा। ...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय:** यह शून्य काल नहीं है।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** इसलिए ऐसी योजना एक सप्ताह के अंदर सरकार लाए और ऐसा आश्वासन सदन में दे कि बिना पैसे के अनाज गरीबों और भूखों में बांटा जाएगा। सुबह भी हरसिमरत कौर जी ने यह मामला सदन में उठाया था, वह इससे जुड़ा हुआ है। देश में 40 लाख टन अनाज बेकार पड़ा सड़ रहा है।...(व्यवधान)

**डॉ. रघुवंश प्रसाद सिंह (वैशाली):** इन्हें अगर बीच में सुना है तो हमें भी सुना जाए और सबको मौका दिया जाए।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय:** उन्होंने लिखित में अनुमति मांगी थी, क्या आपने लिखित में दिया है?

...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय:** कृपया बैठ जाएं। आप शून्य काल में उठा सकते हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय:** कुछ भी रिकार्ड में नहीं जाएगा।



...(व्यवधान) \*

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्री और जल संसाधन मंत्री (श्री पवन कुमार बंसल):** उपाध्यक्ष जी, अगर आपकी अनुमति हो, तो मैं कुछ बोलना चाहता हूँ।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइये, मंत्री जी कुछ बोलना चाहते हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री दारा सिंह चौहान (घोसी):** उपाध्यक्ष जी, सभी को बोलने दीजिए।...(व्यवधान)

**स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्री (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद):** मेरा निवेदन है कि बिल अभी शुरू हुआ है, बिल पर डिस्कशन करना है तो करिये, नहीं करना है तो इसे पास कीजिए और उसके बाद पूरा डिस्कशन कर लीजिए।

**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (मैनपुरी):** नहीं, ऐसे नहीं होगा, आपको हमें भी सुनना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान)

**श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद :** बिल के बीच में कैसे होगा?... (व्यवधान)

**डॉ. रघुवंश प्रसाद सिंह (वैशाली):** ये भेदभाव नहीं चलेगा। एक नेता ये खड़े हैं, दूसरे नेता ये खड़े हैं, इनकी बात भी आपको सुननी पड़ेगी।...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप सभी लोग बैठ जाइये। ठीक है, सभी नेता दो-दो मिनट बोलेंगे। श्री शरद यादव जी आप बोलिये।

**श्री शरद यादव (मधेपुरा):** उपाध्यक्ष जी, बिल पर बहस हो रही थी, विकट परिस्थिति है, नेता विपक्ष ने इसमें इंटरवीन किया। पूरा देश इस समय महंगाई और भूख से पीड़ित है। मैं कह रहा हूँ कि जो सर्वोच्च न्यायालय है, उसका अभी जो फैसला आया है, उसमें साफ कहा है कि हमारा जो पहला फैसला था वह आदेश था। इस देश के चार-पांच सूबों में अभी सूखा पड़ा है, सरकार कोई रास्ता निकाल करके, जो अनाज सड़ रहा है उसे बांटने का काम करे। एनडीए की सरकार में हमने पहले यह काम किया है। राजस्थान में हमने एक लाख टन अनाज फ्री में दिया था, यह कोई ऐसी नयी बात नहीं है। इसलिए सरकार से मेरा निवेदन है कि इस पर तत्काल कोई कार्रवाई करके, जिन इलाकों में सूखा है, वहां अनाज पहुंचाने का कार्य करना चाहिए।

**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, अनाज सड़ रहा है, सुप्रीम-कोर्ट का फैसला ही नहीं आदेश है। इसलिए हम कह रहे हैं कि संसदीय कार्य मंत्री जी सुन लें कि जब हमारी सरकार यूपी में थी और जब उस समय बाढ़ आई थी तो सारे कोल्ड-स्टोरेज हमने मालिकों से कहकर खुलवा दिये थे और कहा था कि लोगों को आलू दीजिए, हम आपका जितना पैसा बनेगा दे देंगे। इसके साथ-साथ हम वहां खुद गये और लोगों ने कहा कि इतना फायदा हमें

कभी नहीं मिला। हमने वहां टेंट लगवा दिये थे और उन लोगों के साथ खाना खाया। अब क्या इंसानियत बिल्कुल चली गयी है, हम यहां क्यों आये हैं, हमें उसी जनता ने भेजा है।

गेहूं है और सड़ भी रहा है। बहुत अधिक मात्रा में चावल भी हुआ था, लेकिन सरकार ने खरीदा नहीं। किसान को बहुत सस्ता धान बेचना पड़ा। देश में सूखे का प्रकोप और बाढ़ का प्रकोप भी है। आप उस अन्न को गरीबों में बंटवाने की व्यवस्था कीजिए। हमने अपने समय में बंटवा कर दिखा दिया था। हिंदुस्तान में भूख के कारण डेढ़ लाख लोग मर चुके हैं।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप अपनी बात समाप्त कीजिए।



**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव :** इससे ज्यादा सरकार के लिए शर्म की क्या बात हो सकती है कि गल्ला होने के बावजूद भी, अनाज भरपूर पैदा होने के बावजूद भी लोग भूख से मर रहे हैं। साठ सालों के अंदर पांच लाख से ज्यादा लोग भूख से मरे हैं। महोदय, बकायदा अन्न और चावल गरीबों में बंटवाया जाना चाहिए। सरकार के पास पैसे की कमी नहीं है। बहुत ज्यादा पैसा यात्राओं पर खर्च किया जाता है, लेकिन लोगों को मुफ्त में अन्न न देकर उन्हें भूख से मरने के लिए मजबूर किया जा रहा है।...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** हरसिमरत कौर जी, आप बैठ जाएं। आप सदन में इस तरह से चावल दिखा नहीं सकती हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** यह तरीका गलत है। आप बैठ जाएं।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री दारा सिंह चौहान :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, कई बार हाउस में इस मामले को लेकर चर्चा हो चुकी है। पूरे देश में किसान, गरीब, मजदूर हैं, वे बाढ़ और सूखे से परेशान हैं। किसान भूखे मर रहे हैं। सदन में इस विषय पर चर्चा हुई कि गोदाम के बाहर अनाज सड़ रहा है। सरकार को इस अनाज को गरीबों में बंटवाना चाहिए। यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है और सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने इसे नोटिस में लिया है। एक बार नहीं, दो बार सुप्रीम कोर्ट द्वारा निदेश देने के बाद सरकार द्वारा इसका संज्ञान न लेने का क्या कारण है? यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। अगर किसी विषय पर सुप्रीम कोर्ट का निदेश आता है, तो सरकार उसे नोटिस में लेती है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट गरीबों के, किसानों के पक्ष में फैसला देती है, तो केंद्र सरकार उसे नोटिस में नहीं लेती है। यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। इसलिए मैं चाहता हूं कि जो अनाज सड़ रहा है, उसे गरीबों में बंटवाना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप लोग बैठ जाएं और माननीय मंत्री जी को बोलने दीजिए।

...(व्यवधान)

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** Your Leader has already spoken on the subject. Why do you want to raise the issue again? ... *(Interruptions)*

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (KARUR): Sir, we also share the concern expressed by other hon. Members on this issue. ... (*Interruptions*) The godown facilities are very poor. The Food Corporation of India (FCI) is not in a position to preserve the food grains properly. They are wasting them. Hence, the Supreme Court has directed the Government that the food grains could be given to the poor people instead of wasting the same. This is a welcome suggestion as the farmers are not able to get a remunerative price. It is high time when harvest is taking place throughout the country.

Therefore, the FCI should come forward to procure rice, wheat and other products. At the same time, whatever is there in the godowns has to be given free to the labourers and other poor people. This is very important. I request the Government to concede this request. ... (*Interruptions*)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप लोग बैठ जाएं।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Everybody wants to speak on every issue. ... (*Interruptions*) Do you not want the Minister to respond? ... (*Interruptions*)

Shri Ananth Kumar, every time you disturb the proceedings of the House. ... (*Interruptions*) It is becoming your habit. ... (*Interruptions*) Unfortunately, you raise the issue, and you do not want the Minister to respond. ... (*Interruptions*)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप लोग बैठ जाएं और सदन की कार्यवाही चलने दीजिए।

... (*Interruptions*)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय: आप सब बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री नामा नागेश्वर राव (खम्माम): उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, यह इतना गंभीर विषय है।... (व्यवधान)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : In a minute, they raise the matter and they want the Minister to be present here. ... (*Interruptions*)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : बाकी आप सब लोग बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: It is very unfortunate that this is the attitude of the BJP. ... (*Interruptions*)

श्री पवन कुमार बंसल: सर, ये लोग पार्लियामेंट का मखौल बना रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान) They are making a mockery of the Parliament. क्या मंत्री एक मिनट में हाजिर हो जाएंगे? सर, इन बातों का इन्होंने मखौल बना लिया है।...(व्यवधान) एक सैकेंड में बात करते हैं और उसके बाद सभी खड़े होकर शोर मचाते हैं।...(व्यवधान) भारतीय जनता पार्टी केवल शोर मचाना चाहती है, इसके अलावा बात करना नहीं चाहती।...(व्यवधान)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :आप लोग बैठ जाइए। कृपया आप सब शांत रहिए। मंत्री जी की बात सुनिए। क्या हाउस नहीं चलाना है? आप बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Without giving a proper notice, everybody wants to speak. Leaders of every political party want to speak. Are there no rules?

श्री लालू प्रसाद (सारण): उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, गरीबों को मुफ्त में अनाज भिजवाइए। बिहार, यू.पी. और पंजाब में भी भिजवाइए।...(व्यवधान)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : ठीक है। बैठ जाइए। आपकी बात हो गयी। आपने अपनी बात कह दी। मंत्री जी खड़े हैं। अब उनको बोलने दीजिए। आप बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI ARJUN CHARAN SETHI (BHADRAK): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, this issue has been agitating the minds of the people not only today, but for quite a long time. The hon. Supreme Court of India has given its direction much earlier. The hon. Minister of Agriculture has already stated the Government would not distribute it free. This is something unheard of. Today, with the hon. Supreme Court's order, the matter has become very clear. When you do not have enough storage facility and the food grains are getting rotten in the open, then why should the Government behave in this manner? Why should they not abide by the direction of the hon. Supreme Court? They should immediately distribute those food grains.



I think the Government stands on prestige and it wants a confrontation with the Supreme Court. This is very bad. They should immediately take steps and issue the food grains to the eligible persons.

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री नामा नागेश्वर राव :** महोदय, हाउस में इस बारे में बहुत बार चर्चा हुई है। प्रश्न सं. 293 के उत्तर में कहा गया है...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप विषय के बारे में दो मिनट में बोलिए। यह डिस्कशन नहीं है।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री नामा नागेश्वर राव :** मैं इसी के बारे में बोल रहा हूँ। 300 लाख टन स्टॉक के बारे में सरकार का उत्तर है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने ऑर्डर दिया है लेकिन गवर्नमेंट सो रही है।...(व्यवधान) हाउस में चर्चा होने के बाद भी, गवर्नमेंट के सामने कितनी बार चर्चा होने के बाद भी गवर्नमेंट ख्याल नहीं कर रही है। आज के दिन सुप्रीम कोर्ट का ऑर्डर हुआ है, उसके अनुसार तुरंत पालन करें। (व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप डाटा मत दीजिए।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री नामा नागेश्वर राव :** जो सरप्लस स्टॉक 600 लाख टन का है, इसे तुरंत गरीब लोगों में बांट दीजिए। इसे एक दिन भी लेट मत कीजिए। आज के सुप्रीम कोर्ट के ऑर्डर के बाद कम से कम गवर्नमेंट आंख तो खोले और तुरंत गरीब लोगों को बांटे। आंध्र प्रदेश में गेहूं की बहुत प्रॉब्लम है।...(व्यवधान) मैं आपके माध्यम से यही कहना चाहता हूँ।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइए। अजनाला जी आप बोलिए।

...(व्यवधान)

**डॉ. रतन सिंह अजनाला (खडूर साहिब):** महोदय, मैं आपका बहुत धन्यवाद करता हूँ कि आपने मुझे बोलने के लिए ताकत दी है। हमारा मसला है कि हिन्दुस्तान के लोग भूखे मर रहे हैं। सुप्रीम कोर्ट कह रही है कि अनाज गरीबों में बांट दो लेकिन सरकार इसका कोई जवाब नहीं दे रही है। हमारा यही मसला है कि सरकार जवाब दे और अनाज खराब हो रहा है, उसे भेजे। हमारा यही मसला है।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** श्री लालू प्रसाद, आप बोलिए।

...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइए। आपके नेता ने बोल लिया है अब आप बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** लालू जी के अलावा किसी की बात रिकॉर्ड में नहीं जाएगी।

...(व्यवधान) \*

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप सब बैठ जाइए। आपके नेता ने बोल लिया है।

...(व्यवधान)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइए। लालू जी बोल रहे हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

**14.45 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fifteen  
of the Clock.*

---



**15.00 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fifteen of the Clock.*

(Dr. M. Thambidurai *in the Chair*)

**SUBMISSIONS BY MEMBERS- Contd.**

**(ii) RE: Supreme court's observation on free distribution of foodgrains among the poor in the country**

MR. CHAIRMAN : I request all the hon. Members to cooperate. It is a sensitive issue which we are discussing. Many hon. Members have expressed their views. Now, two hon. Members are left out – Shri Lalu and Shri Acharia. After that, the hon. Minister will reply. Please cooperate with the Chair.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please cooperate; we will finish this issue.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us finish this issue.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish this; after that, we will take it up. Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is the last day of this Session. Please cooperate, if we want to run the House. If every Member is taking this kind of attitude, we cannot do it. Please cooperate with the Chair. Shri Lalu, please continue.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. Please cooperate with the Chair.

... (*Interruptions*)

---

\* Not recorded

MR. CHAIRMAN: First let him speak. Let us first solve this issue. Please cooperate with the Chair. All the Members cannot be given a chance. Only three hon. Members will be given a chance. After that, the hon. Minister will reply.

... (Interruptions)

**श्री लालू प्रसाद (सारण):** सभापति महोदय, देश में प्रचुर मात्रा में गेहूं, चावल या अन्य अनाजों का संग्रह किया गया है, उनका उचित रख-रखाव न होने के कारण वह सड़ रहा है। इसके बारे में सदन के सभी माननीय सदस्यों और विशेषकर पंजाब से अकाली दल के माननीय सदस्यों ने चिन्ता जतलाई है। पंजाब के माननीय सदस्यों ने जो कुछ देखा, उसके बारे में जिक्र भी किया है। हम लोगों को अनाज को बर्बाद नहीं होने देना चाहिये। यह देश का और देश के गरीबों का सवाल है। जहां सूखा पड़ा हुआ है या बाढ़ आयी है, वहां लोग भूख के मारे तबाही के कगार पर हैं। न केवल उत्तर प्रदेश, बिहार, छत्तीसगढ़, उड़ीसा, पंजाब बल्कि प.बंगाल राज्य तक प्रभावित हैं। ..(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please do not disturb him. If you are serious, please listen to him.

... (Interruptions)

**श्री लालू प्रसाद :** देशभर के कई राज्य प्रभावित हो रहे हैं। इसमें राजनीति की बात नहीं हो रही है। यह न केवल सरकार की बल्कि हमारी भी जिम्मेदारी है। यह सवाल माननीय कृषि मंत्री जी के सामने उठा था लेकिन उन्होंने इस मामले को हल्के-फुल्के ढंग से लेकर टाल दिया। विवश होकर यह बात सुप्रीम कोर्ट के संज्ञान में लाई गई। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने कहा है कि जो अनाज गोदामों में सड़ रहा है, वह देशभर के गरीबों में फ्री बांटें यानी बांटने का आदेश दिया है...(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Lalu, please address the Chair.

इसमें एक-दूसरे पर अंगुली उठाने का सवाल नहीं है। हम जिनका प्रतिनिधित्व करते हैं, आज वे इंतजार कर रहे हैं कि हमारे लिए नून-रोटी का इंतजाम होगा या नहीं होगा।

महोदय, बिहार, उत्तर प्रदेश, छत्तीसगढ़ की हालत और पंजाब जहां से माननीय सदस्य आते हैं। You have already said all this.

... (Interruptions)

**श्री लालू प्रसाद :** आप हमें अपनी बात बोलने दीजिये। हम चाहते हैं कि आदेश का अनुपालन हो। सुप्रीम कोर्ट का आदेश तो है ही, ऊपर भगवान नीचे सुप्रीम कोर्ट और फिर संसद। यह संसद का आदेश है, साथ-साथ संसद का मैनेजेंट है, सरकार इसे मजाक में न ले। सारा गेहूं, चावल निकालकर गरीबों को बांटो, नहीं तो गद्दी छोड़ो, हटो। यह हमारा सवाल है।...(व्यवधान)



SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Sir, it is a matter of grave concern that one-fourth of the population goes to bed empty stomach.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are discussing a serious matter. Please do not disturb.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : India is positioned among the 80 countries where the largest number of starvation death is 68.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Acharia Ji, come to the point directly. Do not go into the details. Do not take too much of the time of the House. You may briefly tell what do you want.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : When such a situation is prevailing in our country the food grains are rotting. A large quantity of food grains is kept in godowns. When there was a discussion in this House, we also demanded that the food grains should be distributed and universalized Public Distribution System should be introduced in our country. Subsidised food grains should be provided to the people.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not go into the details. You may talk about the rotting food grains.


SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : The Supreme Court has directed this Government, it is rather a mandate, to distribute the food grains. Instead of allowing the food grains to rot, the Government should distribute food grains among the poor and the hungry people free of cost. This is our demand.

**श्री चंद्रकांत खैरे (औरंगाबाद):** महोदय, देश भर में फूड कॉर्पोरेशन ऑफ इंडिया के जो गोदाम हैं, उन गोदामों की हालत सारे इलेक्ट्रॉनिक मीडिया और प्रिंट मीडिया ने बतायी है। इसके लिए आज माननीय सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने जो आदेश दिया है, उस आदेश का पालन करने का कार्य मंत्री जी करेंगे। यह मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहता हूँ। आज भी कई गरीबों की बस्ती उजड़ रही है, उनके पास खाने का अनाज नहीं है। कई जगह बाढ़ आयी है। जैसे लेह में आपत्ति आयी, महाराष्ट्र में कई जगह आपत्ति आयी, छत्तीसगढ़ में आयी और इसके पहले भी उत्तर प्रदेश, बिहार, राजस्थान बहुत जगह बाढ़ आ गयी, आपत्ति आ गयी। वहां यह दिया जाना चाहिए। मैं शिव सेना की ओर से आपके माध्यम से सरकार से यह मांग करूंगा। माननीय शरद पवार साहब ने एक बार कहा था।... (व्यवधान)

महोदय, मैं यह डिमांड करना चाहता हूँ कि एक तो पंजाब का जो 40 लाख टन चावल सड़ रहा है, वह सरकार को लेना चाहिए।... (व्यवधान) मैं यह भी कहूंगा कि माननीय शरद पवार साहब ने यह कहा था कि जिन ऑफिसर्स ने नेग्लिजेंसी की है, देखभाल नहीं की है, उन ऑफिसर्स के ऊपर कार्रवाई करेंगे। मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या उन ऑफिसर्स के ऊपर कार्रवाई करेंगे? यह सारा अनाज गरीबों को मुफ्त दीजिये, फ्री दीजिये, यह मेरी डिमांड है।... (व्यवधान)

**श्री संजय सिंह चौहान (बिजनौर):** महोदय, मैं बहुत गंभीर विषय की ओर सारे सदन का ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूँ। हमारी स्थिति, संसद की स्थिति इतनी शर्मनाक हो गयी है कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट के कहने पर हमें काम करना पड़ता है। यह सबसे ज्यादा दुःखदायी और शर्मनाक स्थिति है।...(व्यवधान) जो काम हमारे देश की सबसे बड़ी पंचायत के करने का था, वह काम सुप्रीम कोर्ट के कहने पर करेंगे। जनता में भी यही संदेश जा रहा है कि इस देश को सुप्रीम कोर्ट चला रही है, संसद नहीं चला रही है। यह मेरा नम्बर एक प्वाइंट है।

दूसरी बात यह है कि मैं और श्रीमती बादल, हम दोनों पिछले छः महीने से फूड कमेटी के सदस्य हैं। मैं सरकार की बात क्या बताऊँ, सरकार तो फेल हो ही रही है, लेकिन उसके फेल होने का कारण लालफीताशाही है, ब्यूरोक्रेसी है। जितने अधिकारी आते हैं, उनसे बार-बार श्रीमती बादल ने अपने प्रदेश की बात उठाई। कमेटी बनती रही और अब नई फसल आने को तैयार है। ...(व्यवधान) चावल सारे पंजाब के घरों में खाया जा रहा है, जिन घरों में खाया नहीं जाता था। ...(व्यवधान) उसमें क्या दिक्कत आई? ...(व्यवधान) उस चावल को बाँटने को कहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Nothing will go on record  except the Minister's speech.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE AND MINISTER OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have heard about this from television.

**श्री लालू प्रसाद :** हिन्दी में बोलिये।

**श्री शरद पवार :** मुझे टेलीविज़न पर रिपोर्ट देखने को मिली और कुछ प्रिंट मीडिया के प्रतिनिधि भी मुझे मिले। उन्होंने सुप्रीम कोर्ट में अनाज के बँटवारे के बारे में, गोदाम कंस्ट्रक्शन के बारे में, पावर्टी लाइन के बारे में, एपीएल कैटागरी के बारे में कुछ डिस्मिज़न दिए, सुझाव दिए, ऑब्ज़र्वेशन किये, इस तरह की अलग अलग बातें मुझे यहाँ बतलाई गईं। मैंने तुरंत अपने दफ्तर में जाकर इसके फाइनल ऑर्डर जो कोर्ट ने दिये हैं, वह कलैक्ट करने की कोशिश की मगर अभी तक मेरे पास कोर्ट का फाइनल आर्डर नहीं आया है। मैं सदन को कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह सरकार सुप्रीम कोर्ट हो या हाई कोर्ट हो, इनके कोई भी डिस्मिज़न हों, इनकी पूरी तरह से इज्जत करेगी। इसके साथ-साथ इस संसद के माननीय सदस्यों ने इस संबंध में जो कुछ सुझाव दिये हैं उन पर भी सरकार गंभीरता से ध्यान देगी और यह दोनों तय कर इस पर जो कदम उठाने की आवश्यकता है, वह कदम उठाने की तैयारी इस सरकार की रहेगी, मगर ...(व्यवधान) But without reading the authentic order, it will be improper on my part to brief this House as anybody can claim that I have misled the House which I do not want. That is why, I am going in depth and then I will submit... *(Interruptions)*

---

\* Not recorded

श्री लालू प्रसाद : संसद की भावनाओं को ध्यान में रखना चाहिए! ... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions) ... \*


---

**15.13 hrs.**

**INDIAN MEDICINE CENTRAL COUNCIL  
(AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010 – Contd.**

SHRI P.C. CHACKO (THRISSUR): Sir, I rise to support the amendment moved by the Minister of Health and Family Welfare to amend the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970.

This Bill is brought to this House to include the Tibetan medicine which is known as the Sowa-Rigpa as part of the Indian medicine. It is said that this medical system, which is unique, is treating the human beings not only for the external ailments but it takes a holistic approach and probably that holistic approach will be very useful. Having seen what was going on in this House just now, I feel that it is very appropriate that the hon. Health Minister has introduced this system for making it a part of the Indian system because the Sowa-Rigpa system is very good for treating people in a holistic manner.

Some of our hon. Members lose their tempers and they behave in an unruly manner. It is not that they want to behave like that. But unfortunately when some hon. Members walk through isle of the House they gesticulate and shout at the House and sometimes we feel as to what was happening to them. They are all very learned Members. They know how to behave in the House. I am not blaming them... (Interruptions) There may be important issues... (Interruptions) 

श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल (झंझारपुर): महोदय, यह बिल पर चर्चा न करके, सदस्यों के आचरण पर चर्चा कर रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान)

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR (BANGALORE SOUTH): Sir, he cannot comment on the conduct of the Members... (Interruptions)

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : They should not have any objection to what I am saying... (Interruptions) I am speaking about this new medical system... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please come to the point.

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, I am speaking about this new Tibetan medical system and I do not know as to why Shri Ananth Kumar is unnecessarily getting angry... *(Interruptions)* The problem is that when the humans are treated with a particular system of medicine, if that medical system is not holistic, then one will not get the desired results. Today, in this country, the so called, modern medical systems like Allopathic is being practised the maximum in the country. There are other systems of medicine as well, like Unani, Siddha, Ayurveda, Homeopathy and others. These all form part of the Indian Medicine Central Council. We are now including a new system.

Sir, I only said that when people are not having some kind of extraordinary problems we need some new system of medicine for their treatment. That is what I said. Here, we know how to behave in a society; we know how to behave in the House and we know how to behave in the Parliament. The Parliament is always run on rules. Even they know the rules of the game. When we are losing our control means a suitable treatment is necessary. I am only saying that. This system of medicine... *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (विदिशा): सभापति महोदय, यह आईएमसीसी पर बोल रहे हैं या किसी ओर पर बोल रहे हैं?...*(व्यवधान)*

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, I am not yielding to them. I want your protection... *(Interruptions)* I am not yielding to her. She cannot speak now... *(Interruptions)* How can she speak?... *(Interruptions)* I am not yielding to her... *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : माननीय सदस्य बिल पर बोल रहे हैं या सदस्यों के कंडक्ट पर बोल रहे हैं, यह क्या है?...*(व्यवधान)* यदि यह कंडक्ट पर बोल रहे हैं तो इनके चैयरमैन रहते हुए, इन्होंने कंडक्ट को डिसरिस्पैक्ट किया है।...*(व्यवधान)*

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : How can she speak now?... *(Interruptions)* Sir, you will have to protect the interest of the Members... *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : यदि यह आईएमसीसी पर बोल रहे हैं तो इनकी भाषा को संयत किया जाए...*(व्यवधान)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: If anything unparliamentary is there that would be deleted.

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : This Bill was taken up for discussion. The Bill was presented by the hon. Minister and when a Member has started speaking, how can anybody stand

without observing any rules? They want to de-rail this... (*Interruptions*) What is happening? ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : I have taken permission from the Chair... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, you have allowed me to speak... (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : When the Chair allowed me, then only I spoke. I am not 'anybody'... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, the Leader of the Opposition cannot be allowed to speak like this. I am not yielding now... (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Chairman Sir, I am not yielding. You have allowed me to speak. She cannot speak now.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not get emotional.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am on my legs. Please take your seats and listen to me.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I request all the hon. Members to cooperate with the Chair as two important Bills have to be passed before 4.15 p.m. Only 45 minutes are left now. The Government wants to pass these two important Bills. So, kindly cooperate with the Chair. Every Member has the right to speak. You may express your views and there is nothing wrong in it. I am not objecting to it. At the same time, other Members also may cooperate with the Chair. If at all your feelings have been hurt, that will be taken care of in the proceedings. I will see to it that if any unparliamentary expressions are there, they are removed. Please co-operate with the Chair.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, after you have allowed me to speak, if any Member encroaches into my time, then I would seek your protection.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will give time for you. I will give you protection.

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, please understand that it is a deliberate attempt to derail the discussion in the House.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You may speak on the Bill, Shri Chacko.

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : We are discussing an issue on which there is no dispute. I only said that when we are introducing this..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please speak on the Bill.

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : Sir, this kind of interruption makes it very difficult for me to express my views. I am not mentioning about anybody. I am only saying that the discussion may not be derailed as it happened now. Let me be allowed to complete my speech. A deliberate attempt to derail the discussion should not be allowed.

An amendment to the Indian Medicine Central Council Act has become necessary. This Government has been giving a lot of importance to the traditional medicine. *Ayurveda, Siddha, Yoga, Unani* and all the traditional medicines are under a separate Department of the Government of India. It is a contribution to this country by the UPA Government and it is part of the whole thing. Now, AYUSH, a separate Department, is being made and they are giving a lot of encouragement to the States and the various systems of medicine to make it on a scientific basis.

India is a great country of 5000 years of history. We have our own systems of medicine which are not seen in other parts of the country. The word '*amchi*' means superior to all. *Amchi* system of medicine is a system of medicine which is practiced in the sub-Himalayan region. It is a Tibetan medicine. The hon. Minister for Health has felt that the *amchi* system of medicine is suitable to be included in the Indian medicine. I only casually suggested that whoever wants to have the benefit of this system can have its benefit. That is all I said.

Indian Medical Council is now being constituted with members representing different disciplines, like *ayurveda, siddha* and *unani*. In addition to that we want to have a register of *amchis*. *Amchis* are the practitioners of the Tibetan medicine. At present we have no system. Some people are not interested in making any system, but we want a system. We want a system of registration of practitioners. In this Bill, it is said that a

register will be maintained so that *amchis'* names will be registered, so that it gets systematised.

There is a great classical text of Tibetan medicine, that is Chatush Tantra. Chatush Tantra was delivered by Bhagwan Buddha 2,500 years back. Then this Chatush Tantra was enriched with various systems like Chinese medicine, Japanese medicine, etc. Now, it has become a very effective tool in the hands of men. Today, we are faced with new bacteria and diseases. The world is aghast at the spread of various diseases. Probably, here in India we have an answer. In this Bill it is said that if the Indian systems of medicines are given scientific basis, they can be propagated; research facilities can be created; and medicines can be manufactured.

The Government of India is digitising the whole thing. People are trying to take away India's traditional knowledge. For example, I can cite the *haldi* issue. Some scientific organisation in USA has taken the patent for Indian *haldi*. It was with great difficulty that India fought and got it cancelled. So, we are digitising our information, the entire *ayurvedic* medicine and the entire system of medicine. What are the medicines available, what are the cures available, etc. are being digitised so that nobody takes away from us our traditional knowledge.

Today, when the Tibetan system of medicine is made part of the Indian system of medicine, it is getting the protection of the Indian Medical Council. Now, we are taking the Tibetan medicine system. Tibetans are settled in various parts of the country. There is a miracle cure. There are so many diseases which modern system of medicine is not able to cure, but the Tibetan system of medicine offers a magical cure. To get this popularised, to make this available to the common man, I would request the hon. Minister to take steps through the National Rural Health Mission.

The National Rural Health Mission is giving money to these kinds of initiatives. I come from a State where the State Government is hardly able to buy medicines for the Primary Health Centres. Now, all the Primary Health Centres in the whole country are being run with the money given through the National Rural Health Mission. Under this, all these medicines should be made available in all the Primary Health Centres and in all

the dispensaries. Not only the modern medicine or allopathic system of medicines but also all other Indian systems of medicines should be made available. Then, people can choose what they want. The NRHM is a very great Scheme run all over India, which is now helping the State Governments to give effective treatment and preventive medicines to the people

It is good that we are passing this Bill in this Parliament. We are legalising it. The medicines should be made available through the NRHM in all the dispensaries.

Finally, it is the holistic approach to the human health is what we need. Today, allopathic system treats the eye or the ear or the throat or the chest separately, but this so-called specialisation is not a holistic approach. But the Indian system of medicine has got a different approach, which is holistic towards the human health. So, that is the plus point. When we are including the Tibetan system of *amchi* medicine in the great Indian traditional system of medicine, we are going one step ahead.

I would like to congratulate the Minister. We all wanted that we should have an opportunity to discuss the Indian Medical Council Bill in this House. Unfortunately we could not discuss that Bill.

That was also not the fault of the Government. The noisy scenes were created in the House. We could not discuss the Medical Council of India Bill. We just passed it. But, fortunately, the Indian system of medicines, at least, this Bill is being discussed in the House.

Sir, with the disturbance created to derail the discussion in the House, I am happy that this Bill is being discussed. I support this Bill. This Bill will give a sufficient scientific basis.


MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Shailendra Kumar. Please conclude within two minutes. We have to conclude the discussion on this Bill by 3.45 p.m. Then, we have to take up the second Bill. So, please try to be very brief.



**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशाम्बी):** माननीय सभापति महोदय, आपने मुझे भारतीय चिकित्सा केन्द्रीय परिषद् (संशोधन) विधेयक, 2010 पर बोलने का अवसर दिया, इसके लिए मैं आपका आभारी हूँ। यह बात सत्य है कि सदन का काफी समय खराब हुआ है और बड़े वरिष्ठ सदस्यों की टोकाटोकी से खराब हुआ है। जब हम बोलने के लिए खड़े हुए हैं, तो हमें बंदिश की गयी है कि कम समय में बोलिए। कम से कम आप हमें अपनी बात कहने का समय दीजिए। हम पूरी बात कहने के बाद ही बैठेंगे और बहुत संक्षिप्त में बोलेंगे।

महोदय, मेडिकल काउंसिल के बारे में माननीय स्वास्थ्य मंत्री जी एक बिल लेकर आए, उस पर बहस हुयी और तत्काल उसके बाद यह बिल हम लोगों के सामने इस सदन में आया। जहां तक यूनानी शब्द के आगे उन्होंने सोवा-रिग्पा शब्द जोड़ने की बात कही है। यह ठीक है कि आपने यूनानी शब्द को बिल्कुल विलुप्त नहीं किया और आपने यह मेहरबानी की। यूनानी शब्द को आपने कम से कम जोड़ रखा है। यूनानी पद्धति बहुत ही प्राचीन पद्धति है। जहां तक देखा जाए तो आयुर्वेदिक और यूनानी के साथ ही साथ बहुत से ऐसी प्राकृतिक चिकित्सा हैं, जिनसे गंभीर बीमारियों का इलाज होता है। इसमें आपने एक बात कही है, कारचिकित्सक की जगह चिकित्सय आमची शब्द रखे जाएंगे। इसमें कुछ ऐसे शब्द हैं, जिनको लोगों को बहुत मुश्किल से समझ में आएगी कि ये शब्द क्या हैं? जिन शब्दों का एक तरीके से आपने इसमें प्रचलन किया है, वे अगर और सरल होते तो हम लोगों को समझने में बहुत अच्छा लगता। तमाम यूनानी चिकित्सालय पूरे देश में खुले हैं। यह हमारे यहां इलाहाबाद में भी है। सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से मैं गुजारिश करना चाहूंगा कि यूनानी पद्धति के जितने भी चिकित्सालय हैं, उनकी स्थिति बहुत दयनीय है, बहुत खराब है। वहां मरीजों की भीड़ लग रही है। आज भी यूनानी दवाओं में लोगों का विश्वास है। इसलिए जहां-जहां भी मेडिकल स्टोर या चिकित्सालय खुले हुए हैं, उन पर आपको विशेष ध्यान देने की जरूरत है। इसके साथ-साथ तमाम प्राकृतिक चिकित्सक की इसमें बात कही गयी है। जहां तक हमारी तमाम जड़ी-बूटियों का पेटेंट हुआ है, अभी हल्दी का नाम लिया, आंवला, नीम की पत्ती, बबूल की पत्ती, ऐलोविरा जेल जो तमाम जंगलों में पाए जाते हैं, नोनी नामक फल होता है जो जंगलों में होता है, इससे बहुत सी दवाइयां हमारी आयुर्वेदिक दवाइयों बनती हैं और तमाम बीमारियों में इसका लाभ होता है। एक ही दवा है, एक ही पत्ती है, एक ही जड़ी-बूटी है जिसका अन्य सभी रोगों में प्रयोग होता है। मैं चाहूंगा कि राष्ट्रीय स्वास्थ्य मिशन में इसको भी शामिल करके, जहां-जहां भी यूनानी पद्धति के मेडिकल चिकित्सालय, मेडिकल स्टोर या तमाम प्राकृतिक चिकित्सा की सेवा है, आज साउथ इंडिया में भी बहुत प्राकृतिक चिकित्सा दी जाती है, इसमें जड़ी-बूटियों से, वाटर से, पत्तियों से चिकित्सा की जाती है, इन सबको बढ़ावा देने के लिए आपको प्रयास करना पड़ेगा। आप जिस विधेयक को लेकर आए हैं, हम इसका समर्थन करते हैं, लेकिन अगर आप यूनानी शब्द काटते, तो हम इसका विरोध करते। इन्हीं बातों के साथ हम अपनी बात समाप्त करते हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I want to make one important announcement in the House. We want to conclude the discussion on this Bill in another 15 minutes because the time allotted for this Bill is over as only one hour time was allotted. Anyhow, we will continue to discuss this Bill for another 15 minutes. Therefore, hon. Members who want to lay their speeches can lay their speeches on the Table now and other hon. Members can speak very briefly for about two minutes each.

**श्री विजय बहादुर सिंह (हमीरपुर):** सभापति महोदय, इंडियन मेडिसिन सेंट्रल काउंसिल (अमेंडमेंट) बिल जिस तरह आया है, इसमें सिर्फ नाम बदला गया है - तिब और सोवा रिग्पा। अंग्रेजी में एक कहावत है - “The contents of the bottle has to be seen, not the level.” रिग्पा कर दीजिए या जो भी फिल्मी नाम रख लीजिए, सवाल इस चीज पर है कि इसमें काउंसिल का गठन है। भारतवर्ष में मेडिसिन के लिए जब तक रिसर्च की कोई बात नहीं है,  लेजिसलेशन, अमेंडमेंट लाने से काम नहीं बनता। चाहे जितना बोलिए, कोई भी व्यक्ति अस्पताल में न होम्योपैथी की मेडिसिन चाहता है न यूनानी चाहता है, जब तक उनकी गुणवत्ता और रिसर्च न हो। इसमें जब काउंसिल बन जाएगी, काउंसिल का टीए, डीए होगा। वे लोग आएंगे, मीटिंग करेंगे या भारत भ्रमण करेंगे। लेकिन जनता के लिए मेडिसिन की बात लार्ज स्केल में आनी चाहिए, यह नहीं कि तिब्बत की हो तो हिमालय में जाइए और जड़ी-बूटी खा लीजिए। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि इस पर जो भी एक्ट बने, उस पर रिसर्च हो। अगर इस पर सीरियसली रिसर्च की जाए तो इसमें बहुत से गुण हैं और यह आगे भी बढ़ सकता है।

दूसरा, मैंने पार्लियामेंट में अनुभव किया कि हर बार 20-25 अमेंडमेंट और 25-30 एक्ट, there should be family planning in respect of all these amendments, Acts and legislations! यूपीए सरकार को सिर्फ रूल और लेजिसलेशन से रूल नहीं करना चाहिए, प्रैक्टिकल बात कहिए। मैं इस अमेंडमेंट को समर्थन देना चाहता हूँ, इसे सपोर्ट करना चाहता हूँ, लेकिन रिसर्च के साथ। यही मेरा कहना है।

**MR. CHAIRMAN :** Those hon. Members who have written speeches with them can lay their speeches on the Table of the House.

\*DR. KIRIT PREMJBHAI SOLANKI : I want to express my views on this topic.

- IMCCA 1970
- regulating educational standard of
- Ayurveda
- Sidda
- Unani systems
- Maintenance of register
- Approved medical practioners
- Said members are elected from practitioners of said pathics enrolled in state registers.

- From practitioners of said pathies enrolled in state registers.

- From universities having faculties of Departments

- Nominated from Central Government.

I welcome the inclusion of “Sowa-Rigpa” system of medicine.

This medicine is practiced in the sub Himalayan region. It is an important system of “Indian medicine” & practitioner be enrolled in Register.

- Sabhapati Mahoday, I would like the draw the attention of entire country through you & this august house regarding very high faith and effective importance of different sort of Indian Medicine system.

- Of course allopathic system is quick and effective pathy but the same time Indian system of medicine is very effective and curative Ayurveda is one of the most ancient treatment modality with goes upto the root cause and curative also. I demand to establish and develop it more.

- Moreover, I strongly demand through you to include the most ancient, oldest and effective system of medicines i.e. Yoga & Naturopathy to include in this bill. Yoga is very much effective Indian medical system. It cures Diabetes, Heart Disease, Hypertension, Depression, Relaxes stress, obesity, Rheumatism etc.

- I want to bring the amendment of introduction of these two Indian system of medicines.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

- It is widely practiced in our country and throughout the World also. It is holistic medicine and should be included in it.

- Regarding amendment of section 9, the central council shall constitute from amongs its members:

- A Committee for Ayurveda
- A Committee for Sidda
- A Committee for Unani
- A Committee for Sowa Rigpa.

I would like to add, members from

- Yoga

- Naturophay and

- Members from Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha

- I again support this bill and make the proposed amendment shall be included.

\*SHRI PRATAP SINGH BAJWA (GURDASPUR): I support the Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010 which seeks to amend the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970, which created a Central Council to regulate ayurveda, siddha, and unani medicine, set minimum standards for education and maintain a register of all practitioners in these fields.

The present Bill seeks to include the Sowa-Rigpa system of medicine, which is akin to Ayurveda, practiced in the sub-Himalayan region within the definition of Indian medicine.

The proposed amendments to various provisions of the above said Act are required in order to legalize Sowa-Rigpa as a system of Indian Medicine. This will also enable the protection and preservation of this ancient system of medicine and will help its propagation and development.

There is no doubt that the recognition of the Sowa-Rigpa system of Indian Medicine will also lead to the setting up of a regulatory mechanism in the field of its education and practice.

Coming to the provisions of the Bill, as stated in the Report of the Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare lack of proper records regarding the number of Amchis, both traditionally trained and those who are institutionally trained gives rise to ambiguity in determining the allocation of seats in the Central Council.

Here certain questions arise

- Have any qualifications and educational standards been prescribed for such practitioners?
- Where from would they get the recognition and certified that they are qualified practitioners of this Sowa-Rigpa system?
- Do we have any recognized institution or association which is recognized by the Central Government to issue certificates to them?

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

In case of traditionally trained Amchis, they do not carry any formal degree to be registered in State Registers of Indian Medicine in any of the States.

- How would such practitioners be registered in the State Register?
- Second, and the most important question is, when they are not registered in the State Register or the Central Register, will they be allowed to practice anywhere in India? Is a persons having no qualification as prescribed under the provisions of the Act, 1970, I am talking about traditionally trained Amchis, can be held to be qualified and entitled to practice anywhere in the State or in the country? The present Bill is silent on these questions.

There are some court judgments to the effect that unless the persons possesses the qualification as prescribed in Schedule II, III and IV of the Act, 1970, he cannot claim any right to practice any medical science and mere registration in any State Register is of no consequence. Hence, the above issue needs to be addressed while framing the rules or by carrying out amendments in the rules at the appropriate places.

The Standing Committee suggested that the representation of Central University of Tibetan Studies at Sarnath, which was accredited by the National Assessment and Accreditation Council with five-stars, the highest grading for quality assurance, should be considered. I am also in favour of it and I request the Government to examine the same.

There is also an urgent need for a survey for assessing the exact number of traditional Sowa-Rigpa practitioners and professionally trained practitioners in the country. This is all the more required when we are giving statutory recognition to this system.

After the grant of statutory recognition, I am sure, the Government would take necessary steps in respect of having a uniform standard syllabus for different courses, duly certified and recognized by the appropriate authority.

Before, I conclude, I am pained to refer to the recent controversy over homoeopathy in Britain where in some people wanted it to be banned as they alleged that


it is not based on scientific principles or recognized standards. I want the Government to ensure that the ingredients and composition of the Sowa Rigpa medicines should be properly tested in a transparent manner, and the composition and labeling of the Sowa Rigpa medicines should be made mandatory so that nobody would raise fingers at these very old and valuable system of medicines or about their efficacy.



**श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल (झंझारपुर):** सभापति महोदय, देश में जो सामयिक और सामाजिक परिवर्तन बदल रहे हैं, उसे देखते हुए समय की मांग है कि इसमें संशोधन होना चाहिए। इसमें सात संशोधन हैं। मैं समझता था कि श्री विजय बहादुर सिंह जी बोलेंगे, यह अधिवक्ता हैं, अधि खत्म हो गया वक्ता रह गए। इन्होंने ध्यान नहीं दिया। बिल में 'या' शब्द है। बिल में है - यूनानी तिब्बी शब्दों के स्थान पर यूनानी तिब्बी या सोवा रिग्पा शब्द रखे जाएंगे। मैंने अंग्रेजी में भी देखा कि 'और' शब्द है। कहीं ऐसा तो नहीं है कि जब रूल बनेगा, तो 'या' या 'और' के अनुसार दोनों में से कोई एक रहेगा। पुराने बिल में जो यूनानी तिब्बी था, उसके स्थान पर सोवा रिग्पा रख देंगे या दोनों के एक ही नाम हैं, पर्याय एक ही है। हमें यह संशय है, संदेह है कि आपने अंग्रेजी में भी 'और' रखा है और हिन्दी में 'या' रखा है, एंड शब्द का प्रयोग नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)

**स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्री (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद):** मैं शायद बाद में भूल न जाऊं, क्योंकि बहुत सारे आइटम्स के जवाब देने हैं। लेकिन आपका संदेह बिल्कुल बराबर है, क्योंकि जब मैं बिल पढ़ रहा था, तो मुझे भी ऐसा लगा क्योंकि 'और' लिखा है। बिल में कहीं और लिखा है, कहीं एंड लिखा है। मैंने अपने मंत्रालय से कहा कि 'और' और 'एंड' मुझे बड़ा गड़बड़ लगता है। या एंड में गलती हुई है या और में गलती हुई है। हमने वापिस इसी हफ्ते इसे लॉ मिनिस्ट्री में भेजा। उन्होंने कहा कि यह ठीक है। कई जगह लॉ की भाषा है 'और' एंड 'एंड', लेकिन यह किसी को रिप्लेस नहीं करेगा, एंड ही है, यह जोड़ेगा।

**श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल:** मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ। आप काम करके जाएंगे तो पुख्ता करके जाएंगे। कहीं आपके हटने के बाद अधिकारीगण रूल्स फ्रेम करके उसे बदल नहीं दें। मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि जब आपने अपना भाषण दिया तो ट्रेडिशनल शब्द का प्रयोग किया।

यह बात सही है कि हमारे यहां परम्परागत उपचार होता रहा है। जब यहां ऐलोपैथी पद्धति का ज्यादा विकास नहीं हुआ था, तब यह उपचार भारतीय पद्धति से होता रहा है। हमारे गांव में भी वैद्य रहा करता था। मुझे भी बचपन में कई लताओं के रस का सेवन कराया गया था। उससे ज्यादा उपचार होता था और कोई साइड इफैक्ट भी नहीं होता था। आप यह काम कर रहे हैं, मैं इसके लिए आपको बधाई और धन्यवाद देता हूँ। लेकिन मैं आपसे कुछ बातें कहना चाहता हूँ कि शोध पर ज्यादा ध्यान देना चाहिए।  इसके लिए आपको सभी राज्यों में केन्द्रीय विश्वविद्यालय खोलने चाहिए। अगर वित्तीय स्थिति अच्छी नहीं है और आप सभी राज्यों में केन्द्रीय विश्वविद्यालय की स्थापना नहीं कर सकते हैं, तो सारे देश में और उन राज्यों में विशेषकर जहां जंगल हैं, पहाड़ हैं, वहां आपको इसके शोध के लिए विश्वविद्यालय की स्थापना करनी चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान) मैं दो-तीन मिनट में अपनी बात समाप्त कर रहा हूँ। इसके साथ-साथ आपने ग्यारहवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में 625 करोड़ रुपये का प्रावधान किया है। आपने यह भी कहा है कि

एक हजार करोड़ रुपये हम ग्यारहवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में बढ़ाने का प्रयास करेंगे। इसे बढ़ाना चाहिए, बल्कि एक हजार करोड़ रुपये से भी अधिक बढ़े, तो वह भी करना चाहिए।

दूसरा, वर्ष 2007-08, 2008-09 और 2009-10 में आपने राज्यों को जो वित्तीय सहायता दी है, उसमें उत्तर पूर्व के कुछ ऐसे महत्वपूर्ण राज्य हैं, जहां पहाड़, जंगल और बहुत ज्यादा मेडिसिनल प्लांट्स हैं, वहां आपने इन तीन वर्षों में एक धेला भी नहीं दिया है। कुछ राज्यों को, जैसे झारखंड हैं, जहां जंगल हैं, मेडिसिनल प्लांट है, वहां इस वर्ष अस्पताल, औषधालय के लिए दिया है, लेकिन दूसरे औषधालय के लिए नहीं दिया है। तीसरी बात में आपके ध्यान में लाना चाहता हूं कि प्लान एक्सपेंडीचर पर आपने इन तीन वर्षों में कम पैसा दिया है और नॉन प्लान एक्सपेंडीचर पर ज्यादा पैसा दिया है। अब चेयरमैन साहब का बार-बार इशारा हो रहा है, नहीं तो मैं पढ़कर बताता कि इन तीन वर्षों में आपने जितना पैसा प्लान एक्सपेंडीचर में देना था, उससे दुगुना पैसा नॉन प्लान एक्सपेंडीचर पर दिया है। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि आप इसे रिव्यू कीजिए। प्लान एक्सपेंडीचर और शोध पर ज्यादा खर्चा होना चाहिए।

अंत में, मैं एक बात कहकर अपनी बात समाप्त करूंगा कि आपने इसके संशोधन में चिकित्सक या आमची शब्द का प्रयोग किया है। हमारे यहां वैद्य शब्द बहुत प्रचलित था। अब डाक्टर शब्द का हिन्दी अनुवाद चिकित्सक है। अभी आमची शब्द बहुत ज्यादा प्रचलित नहीं है। अगर आप इसमें वैद्य शब्द को शामिल कर सकें, तो उस पर विचार करना चाहिए। इसके साथ-साथ विश्वविद्यालय और शोध पर ज्यादा खर्च करना चाहिए।

**MR. CHAIRMAN :** The Minister has to reply at 3.45 p.m. So, please be very brief.

I request all those Members who have prepared speeches to lay them on the Table of the House.

\*SHRI PREM DAS RAI (SIKKIM): The amendment to the Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010. We are grateful that the Tibetan system of medicine has been given due importance. Our party the Sikkim Democratic Front has constantly suggested preservation of Tibetan amchis in our State of Sikkim. We are happy that it gets national recognition through this amendment. With these words, I end my speech in support of this significant amendment.

---

\*Speech was laid on the Table

**\*श्री पन्ना लाल पुनिया (बाराबंकी):** "द इंडियन मेडिसिन सेंटरल काउंसिल अमेंडमेंट बिल 2010" का मैं समर्थन करता हूं। आयुश विभाग के अंतर्गत आयुर्वेद, हौम्योपेथी, यूनानी, सिद्धा, योगा तथा प्राकृतिक चिकित्सा के साथ साथ "सोवा रिप्पा" को भी सम्मिलित किया जाना प्रस्तावित है, जिसका मैं स्वागत करता हूं। इससे हमारी प्राचीन चिकित्सा पद्धति को मान्यता मिल रही है। इसे बढ़ाने का प्रयास किया जाना चाहिए। मेरा सुझाव है कि मेडिसीनल प्लांट्स को बढ़ाने, उत्पादन बढ़ाने की व्यापक रणनीति बनाई जानी चाहिए। मैं बिल का समर्थन करता हूं।

DR. RATNA DE (HOOGHLY): Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the outset I would like to thank you for the opportunity given to me to speak on the Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010. This Bill is brought before this House for propagation and development of ancient systems of Indian medicine.

Sir, India is a vast nation. It has been the home to the ancient Indus Valley Civilization and a region of historic trade routes and vast empires. Indian Sub-Continent was identified with its commercial and cultural wealth. Health and spirituality are inseparable and together they reveal the true origin of any sickness.

The art of healing is, therefore, a dimension of secret. The system of medicine referred to as Sowa-Rigpa is practised in many countries today. The four medical tantras, which were originally in Sanskrit text, were unanimously considered to be the basic word of Sowa-Rigpa. It is based on the great principles of Buddhism and provides a comprehensive way of understanding the universe, men and his sickness. Buddhism itself is at the heart of Bhutanese and Tibetan medical traditions. Chakpuri Medical School became a famous centre of healing at Lhasa. Sowa-Rigpa is one of the oldest surviving Indian systems of medicine in the world. It is most popular in the Sub-Himalayan territories. It is an ancient and traditional healing system. It is set to become the seventh system of medicine to be recognized by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. It is now bestowed with legal status. This recognition given to Sowa-Rigpa would help to start a mechanism to regulate the education in the Himalayan region. It is a welcome step. I can say that better late than never.


MR. CHAIRMAN : The Minister is going to reply. Please conclude now.

DR. RATNA DE : Sir, I am concluding.

Sir, Sowa-Rigpa has, so far, been neglected in the medical system though it is not only practised in Sub-Himalayan territories but it is also a popular medicine adopted by everyone. I firmly believe that Sowa-Rigpa would become more popular among the poor and downtrodden as it would be affordable. I hope the Government would make efforts to dispense Sowa-Rigpa at cheap rates so that its benefits would reach large sections of the society in India.

With the passage of this Bill, the mankind in general will have another choice for the treatment of their ailments. Western medicine commonly known as Allopathic medicine is becoming more and more costly.

MR. CHAIRMAN : It is all known, Madam. Please conclude now.

DR. RATNA DE : Day by day, these allopathic medicines are becoming costlier. Poor people will get a chance to use these traditional medicines. In such a disturbing scenario, Sowa-Rigpa  has come as a breath of fresh air. I welcome this Bill and I support this Bill. I request the hon. Minister for allocation and disbursement of sufficient funds for the development and research associated with Sowa-Rigpa.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing more will go on record.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

---

\* Not recorded

\*SHRI S. SEMMALAI (SALEM): Sowa-Rigpa is a traditional system of medicine practiced in the Himalayan Region namely Sikkim, Arunachal Pradesh, Darjeeling, Ladakh and Lahul & Spiti Areas of Himachal Pradesh.

It is similar to Ayurveda System of medicine.

Through inclusion of Sowa-Rigpa system of medicine in the ACT, legal recognition to this system will be accorded.

This provision will lead to protection of preservation of ancient system of medicine. I welcome it.

At this juncture, I bring to the attention of honourable Health Minister, that is well known, but defying a solution for long I mean quacks and practice by unqualified persons.

This problem persists across the country and the gullible public falling a prey to quacks is not uncommon.

It is the obligation of the States and Centre to protect the Public health of the citizens and regulate medical practitioners under article 74 read with entry 6 & 26 of State list/ Concurrent list respectively of the 7<sup>th</sup> schedule of the constitution.

The innumerable of complaints received from the well informed public about the harm being done by the quacks on the general health of the patients needs to be looked into.

I feel it is high time the Centre/ State Governments take suitable steps to curb the menace.

Stringent Punishment to those practicing medicine/ and all those for making tall spurious claims of curing incurable diseases through false advertisements etc. should be awarded.

Suitable legislation must be brought in.

I am sure the traditional system of medicine including Sowa-Rigpa having greater patronage from the public will be suitably regulated by the Centre and Central Council of Indian Medicine will discharge its duties perfectly.



**\*श्रीमती जयश्रीबेन पटेल (महेसाणा):** भारत की चिकित्सा परिषद पहले 1933 के भारतीय चिकित्सा परिषद अधिनियम के तहत किया गया था। 1934 में स्थापना की परिषद बाद में 1956 की भारतीय चिकित्सा परिषद अधिनियम के तहत पुनर्गठित किया गया था। राष्ट्रपति द्वारा एम.आई.सी. को 13.3.2010 को भंग किया गया था।

मैं भंग के कारणों में पड़ना नहीं चाहती हूँ, किन्तु सरकार से अनुरोध करती हूँ कि एम.आई.सी. का स्वतंत्र अस्तित्व बरकरार रहने दें एवम् उसे ज्यादा ताकतवर बनाए जिसके चलते मेडिकन व्यवसायी बनते-पनपते हैं-जो शहरी एवं ग्राम्य विस्तारों में सेवा प्रदान करते हैं बल्कि विदेशों में उसके द्वारा किए गये कार्यों से देश का मान-सम्मान, इज्जत बढ़ रही है। मेडिकल कौन्सिल को 1956 के कायदेनुसार कार्य करने दें एवम् उसका बंधारण 1956 के कानूनों मुजब हो। नयी बनाई गई एम.आई.सी. की टीम जो एम.आई.सी. का दायित्व संभाल रही है वह न्यायपूर्ण कार्यभार करें। गैर कॉग्रेसी सरकारों के कॉलेजों का परमीशन रद्द न करें। उनके हितों की अनदेखी न करें।

अंत में एम.आई.सी. के पुनर्गठन हेतु शीघ्र ही कार्यवाही करें।

भारत की चिकित्सा परिषद पहले 1933 के भारतीय चिकित्सा परिषद अधिनियम के तहत किया गया था। 1934 में स्थापना की परिषद बाद में 1956 की भारतीय चिकित्सा परिषद अधिनियम के तहत पुनर्गठित किया गया था।

परिषद कार्य:

1.	भारत के चिकित्सा संस्थाओं द्वारा प्रदान योग्यता की पहचान
2.	भारत में विदेशी चिकित्सा अर्हताओं की मान्यता
3.	मेडिकल कॉलेजों (मेडिकल स्कूलों) की प्रत्यायन
4.	स्नातक चिकित्सा शिक्षा के लिए एक समान मानकों का रख रखाव
5.	यह चिकित्सा द्वारा मान्यता प्राप्त कॉलेजों में स्नातकोत्तर चिकित्सा शिक्षा के लिए एक सांविधिक निकाय है।
6.	मान्यता प्राप्त चिकित्सा योग्यता के साथ डॉक्टरों का पंजीकरण (डॉक्टरों का पंजीकरण और उनकी योग्यता आमतौर पर राज्य द्वारा, चिकित्सा परिषदों द्वारा किया जाता है)।
7.	सभी पंजीकरण डॉक्टरों की एक निर्देशिका रखते हुए भारतीय चिकित्सा रजिस्टर कहा जाता है।

बरखास्त:

राष्ट्रपति द्वारा एम.सी.आई. को 13.3.2010 को भंग किया गया कारण 22.4.2010निम्न लिखित अध्यक्ष केतन देसाई एम.सी.आई. केक सेंट्रल ब्यूरो की जाँच में देसाई और तीन अन्य ने कथित तौर पर रिश्वत स्वीकार करने के लिए पटियाला स्थिति ज्ञानसागर मेडिकल कॉलेज के छात्रों को एक ताजा बैच परमिट के लिए गिरफ्तार किया गया था।

राष्ट्रपति का आदेश संलग्न है।

मैं सरकार से जानना चाहूंगी कि सरकार एम.सी.आई. के पुनर्गठन के लिए क्या करने जा रही है।

\*DR. TARUN MANDAL (JAYNAGAR): I like to put a caution before the Health Ministry that to bring forth traditional practices of healing like “amchi” or sowa is good for evaluation, research and application but to put blind faith on a Rigpa system as because it is ancient and used by a substantial section of people is bad. A great leader and revolutionary Mao-Tse-Tung to utilize Chinese traditional and age old medical practices for the people like Acupuncture and Moxibustion said, Weed through the past to bring forth the new, let the ancient serve the present”. And on that philosophy evaluating those ancient methods of healing China helped modern medical science with acupuncture Anesthesia and other remedies.

I am not against inclusion of and control of Sowa-Rigpa system by Indian Medicine Central Council but the scientific experiments and research to establish its credentials by evidence may be inadequate before the medical profession and scientific world to accept it.

Reasons should take the position of authority was said by Stuart Mill, a western renaissance, philosopher and no superstition, emotion, belief or faith should prevail to determine truth. India, China, Egypt, Greece and Babylon were great historical centres of development of medicines and healing and today’s modern medicine took shape extracting goods from all such past resources co-coordinating and assimilating them on scientific facts and findings. That does not mean modern medicine or modern form of AYUSH have no ills and negative points. Side effects on toxic effects are there. But these have been based on modern Anatomy, Physiology, Bio-chemistry, Pathology, Microbiology, Psychology etc. As far as I know Sowa-Rigpa has not accepted these fundamental facets of knowledge of human body and mind.

If it accepts these like modern form of Ayurveda, Siddha, Unani, Homeopathy had adopted and made scientific their methods of examination and attitude the whole country will accept it beyond sub-himalayan areas. I do not know how only by `Seeing tongue,

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

physicians mainly traditional, detect diseases and treat patients. Let it be based on basic sciences. Let its inclusion in Council initiate evaluation of the system.

\*SHRI SANJAY BHOI (BARGARH): I support the Indian Medicine Central Council(Amendment) Bill, 2010. This will not only provide a big solution to cure the fatal ailments but help poor and needy patients to get medicines at a cheaper price. Also the Tibetan system of medicine does not have any side-effects to the human body as many allopathic medicines have. So I congratulate the Hon'ble Minister for Health and family welfare to introduce this bill.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

\*SHRI S. R. JEYADURAI (THOOTHUKKUDI): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank the Chair for giving me an opportunity to participate in this discussion on the Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010, on behalf of DMK.

This Bill, with a limited purpose, seeks to amend the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970, by way of including Sowa-Rigpa, the traditional medicine system practiced in Jammu and Kashmir, Sikkim and the Himalayan region in the Indian medicine system, giving recognition and importance. I appreciate the effort on the part of the United Progressive Alliance Government endeavouring to popularize the Sowa-Rigpa system of medicine popular in the Sub-Himalayan region. This amendment will bring the practitioners of this medicine system to come under the law and carry out their practice independently rendering their medical service to the community. As these medical practitioners would be registered, it will ensure the public to get a devoted service while paving way for taking this medicine system throughout the country.

By this amendment, this medicine system practiced by our ancestors is being protected. This will give rise to manufacture of medicine under this system giving a boost to its sale in the open market in a big way. This will add pep to public health.

Today, more than 50 per cent of those who have crossed the age of 50 are taking some medicine or the other. Now, the world population is moving towards traditional medicine system and herbal medicines. This revisit has been made possible because they become part of our natural daily life without giving rise to side effects and rendering complete cure with a holistic approach.

At this juncture, I would like to put forth certain suggestions. Tamil Nadu ranks ahead of many other States in providing public health facilities with both modern and ancient systems of medicine. The Government there in Tamil Nadu headed by our leader Dr. Kalaingar Karunanidhi promotes healthcare in an efficient manner.

In order to promote Siddha medicine system, tax exemption has been extended to Siddha medicines. Even in Primary Health Centres, the trained and graduate practitioners

---

\* English translation of the speech originally delivered in Tamil

of Indian systems of medicine, like Siddha, Ayurveda, Yoga, Unani, have been deployed and the Government of Tamil Nadu has ensured the availability of these medicines free of cost.

Siddha medicine system, which is at least 6,000 years old, cures effectively diseases that affect liver, lung, skin, uterus and also the knee-joint problem like arthritis. Three years back, when the Chickungunya viral disease was spreading and causing joint pains, it was found out that Siddha medicines could effectively control it using *nila vembu* and *thirukadugu choornam*.

Hence, I would like to urge upon the Government that there is a need to spread this medicine system to other States also encouraging research and development. In order to help the Government of Tamil Nadu to provide infrastructure facility for Siddha medicine system in all the Government Hospitals and Primary Health Centres, the Centre must allocate more funds.

All our Indian systems of medicine must be taken to all the States and they must be encouraged. In the same way in which Dr. Kalaignar led Government of Tamil Nadu is promoting and extending tax exemption, all other systems of medicine, like Ayurveda, Unani and Sowa-Rigpa along with Siddha must get tax exemption in all the States.

Further research on them must be carried out in identifying the effectiveness of certain medicines on certain diseases and they must get more of Central assistance to be promoted throughout the country.

More of CGHS Dispensaries must be set up with practitioners and medicines in other Indian Systems of Medicine throughout the country.

It must also be ensured that these medicines are available to the needy people easily and at an affordable cost, if not free of cost.

I am putting forth these suggestions and requests while lauding the efforts of the UPA Government to promote traditional systems of medicine.

With this, I conclude.

**श्री चंद्रकांत खैरे (औरंगाबाद):** महोदय, माननीय मंत्री जी जो अमेंडमेंट बिल लाए हैं, ... (व्यवधान) उस पर बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। इसमें एक आयुर्वेद समिति, सिद्ध समिति, सोवा-रिग्पा समिति का गठन होगा। इसमें आपने सिद्ध की बात की है, तो योगा के लिए भी प्रावधान होना चाहिए। यूनानी पद्धति जो बहुत पुराने समय से चल रही है, वह हर जगह, आपके पब्लिक हेल्थ सेन्टर्स में होनी चाहिए। जिला परिषद और नगरपालिका के जो हॉस्पिटल होते हैं, उनमें भी आप यूनानी चिकित्सा शुरू कीजिए। आयुर्वेदिक का भी डाक्टर होना चाहिए, योगा का अभ्यास एमबीबीएस में भी चालू करने का आपका विचार है, उसमें भी आप योगा का मैक्सिमम प्रचार-प्रसार कीजिए। यही कहकर मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ।



**\*श्री अर्जुन राम मेघवाल (बीकानेर):** महोदय, मैं इंडियन मेडिकल सेंट्रल काउंसिल अमेंडमेंट बिल 2010 में निम्नांकित सुझाव प्रस्तुत करना चाहता हूँ।

मैं राजस्थान से आता हूँ। राजस्थान में मेडिकल प्लांट बहुत मात्रा में एवं अलग-अलग किस्म के होते हैं, जैसे आकड़ा, तूम्बा, सफेद मूसली आदि इनका शोध भी इस काउंसिल का पार्ट होना चाहिए ताकि राजस्थान के रेगिस्तानी इलाकों में उपलब्ध प्राकृतिक मेडिसिन का प्रोपर शोध हो सके।



**डॉ. रघुवंश प्रसाद सिंह (वैशाली):** सभापति महोदय, मंत्री जी ने अच्छा काम किया है कि सोवा-रिग्पा जो देशी चिकित्सा से छूटी हुई थी, अभी तक चूक हुई थी, उसे इस विधेयक में लाकर चूक का सुधार किया गया है। सोवा-रिग्पा भगवान बुद्ध के समय से शुरू हुई थी। जीवक वैद्य थे। राजा बिम्बीसार थे। जीवक वैद्य की ख्याति तक्षशिला से लेकर गया और राजगीर तक फैली हुई थी।

महोदय, अभी तिब्बत में, मंगोलिया में, भूटान में, जापान में, नेपाल में और अन्य देशों में सोवा-रिग्पा पद्धति प्रचलित है। हमारे देश में जम्मू-कश्मीर में, खासकर लद्दाख में जो लेह इलाका है, उत्तराखंड में, हिमाचल प्रदेश में, अरुणाचल प्रदेश में, सिक्किम में सभी में सोवा-रिग्पी पद्धति गांवों के लोग अपनाते हैं और साधारण रोगों से मुक्ति पाते हैं। इसलिए सोवा-रिग्पा को भी जो जोड़ा है, वह अच्छा काम किया है।

भगवान बुद्ध के समय में इस बारे में एक ग्रंथ है और बुद्ध के समय में ही यह शुरू हुई थी। जैसे देशी चिकित्सा में आयुर्वेद है, ब्रह्मा जी से शुरू होकर, अश्विनी कुमार, धन्वंतरि सुखैन वैद्य से होकर यहां बाणभट्ट चरक संहिता आदि में इसका उल्लेख होता है। देश के ज्यादा हिस्सों में यजुर्वेद का जो उपवेद आयुर्वेद है, उसमें इसका जिक्र है और तब से इसका चलन है। वायु, पित्त, कफ इन तीन दोषों के चलते बीमारी होती है। चरक वचन है कि - सर्वसाम रोगानाम, निदानम कुपितामला। इसका अर्थ है कि अगर शरीर में जब मल विसर्जन ठीक से नहीं होगा, तो बीमारी होगी। यह मूल सिद्धांत है चरक विद्या का। उसी तरह से दक्षिण में तमिलनाडु में सिद्धा है। केरल में अगस्त्य ऋषि से उसकी शुरुआत होती है, वह भी आयुर्वेद से मिलती-जुलती पद्धति है। उसमें भी जड़ी-बूटी द्वारा दवा बनती है। इस मामले में चीन हमसे ज्यादा एक्सपोर्ट कर रहा है।

मेरा मंत्री जी से आग्रह है कि राज्यों में जहां-जहां सम्भावना है, वहां आयुर्वेद युनिवर्सिटी होनी चाहिए। इसी तरह से सिद्धा की भी युनिवर्सिटी हो और सोवा-रिग्पा की भी होनी चाहिए। जिससे आयुर्वेद में अनुसंधान में और व्यपाकता आए। आयुर्वेद में रोग चिकित्सा में प्राकृतिक चिकित्सा का प्रमुख स्थान है। इसका दुनिया ने भी लोहा मान लिया है। अगर देखा जाए तो हमारे यहां मेडिकल साइंस और आयुर्वेद इन दोनों में कोई तालमेल नहीं है। इस वजह से गड़बड़ी होती है। इसलिए इन दोनों में तालमेल होना चाहिए और दोनों के विशेषज्ञ एक-दूसरे के क्षेत्र में अनुसंधान करें। आयुर्वेद में, देशी चिकित्सा में और सोवा-रिग्पा में यही कमी रह गई थी कि इनमें अनुसंधान नहीं हुआ। इसलिए मेरा मंत्री जी से निवेदन है कि जिस उत्साह से उन्होंने यह बिल पेश किया है, उसी उत्साह से इन चिकित्सा पद्धतियों पर अनुसंधान पर जोर देना चाहिए।

अंत में मैं एक बात और कहना चाहूंगा। जो अंग्रेजी दवाएं होती हैं, उनमें एक्सपायरी डेट होती है, लेकिन आयुर्वेद में जितनी दवाएं हैं, जैसे द्राक्षासव, अर्जुनारिष्ट आदि दवाएं हैं, ये जितनी पुरानी होंगी, तो उनमें ज्यादा गुणवत्ता आती है। इसी फार्मूला को उसमें भी लागू किया जाए, क्योंकि द्राक्षासव जितना पुराना होता है, उतना ही फायदेमंद होता है। इसलिए इस पर भी ध्यान देना चाहिए।

\*SHRI AMARNATH PRADHAN (SAMBALPUR): I support this Bill. This system of medicine has come from Buddhist “Ashtangayoga”. Particularly Tibetan and Himalayan region people use these medicines and are cured from various ailments. Juse is equally important. Hence in this juncture I support this Bill.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

\*SHRI PRASANTA KUMAR MAJUMDAR (BALURGHAT) : I rise to support the Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010.

Since bygone era, different kinds of medical treatments are in vogue in our country. The Government gave sanction to Ayurveda, Siddha, Unani and other methods in the Indian Medicine Central Council Act 1970. The doctors treating and healing patients with these methods were given recognition and they were given the rights to treat patients.

Besides in the Sub-Himalayan region and Ladakh ancient healing procedures are used which are called Sowarigpa. The doctors using such methods are known as Aamchi.

Through this Amendment Bill, 2010, these doctors will get legal recognition and registration. They will also be given grants by the Government. The ordinary people of the country will receive Government – aided treatment. Government dispensaries will be opened and the license of drug manufacturing will also be given. The Aamchi doctors will be able to heal the common people.

In the Central Council that is to be set up, the following branches will be there –

1. A Committee for Ayurveda
2. A Committee for Siddha
3. A Committee for Unani
4. A Committee for Sowarigpa

I think the Government should promote research in these ancient Indian medical treatments. From various herbs, in early days, medicines were prepared. So more modern research is required today.

Thus I urge upon the Government to take steps to give a boost to the Indian medical system. Thank you.

---

\* English translation of the speech laid on the Table originally in Bengali.

\*SHRI NILESH NARAYAN RANE (RATNAGIRI-SINDHUDURG): I support this Bill 'The Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010. The Tibetan System of medicine which is used in Himalayan and Tibetan region to cure many ailment. This system of medicine has become very popular and useful than allopathic medicines. Moreover it does not have any side-effects and the price or cost of these medicines are in the reach of common man. Hence I give my heartfelt congratulations to introduce this bill.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

**श्री पुलीन बिहारी बासके (झाड़ग्राम):** सभापति महोदय, इस बिल के द्वारा यूनानी और सोवा-रिग्पा पद्धति को नियमित किया जा रहा है। मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। इससे पहले इसी सदन में मेडिकल कौंसिल आफ इंडिया सम्बन्धी बिल जब पारित हुआ था, तो वह ठीक नहीं हुआ था, क्योंकि वह बिल बिना चर्चा के पारित हुआ था।

क्योंकि चर्चा का समय नहीं था। इसलिए मेरे दो-तीन सुझाव हैं। Quality and standardization of medicine should be done. Composition of the medicine shall be indicated in the label.

Secondly, there should be scientific evaluation rather than relying on anecdotes. Basic science of modern medicine should be incorporated in the syllabus.

Thirdly, there should be financial help and scholarship for the poorer sections of the people to study this system of medicine. Otherwise, instead of being beneficial it would be dangerous for the people. मेरा आग्रह है कि मेरे इन प्वाइंट्स पर माननीय मंत्री जी ध्यान दें।

\*SHRI B. MAHTAB (CUTTACK): In spite of the spectacular advances made by the system of modern/allopathic medicines, the alternative or traditional systems of medicine currently serve the health care needs of a large population in the world.

In India, this indigenous medicinal system comprises of different components, namely, Ayurveda, Yoga and Naturopathy, Unani and Sidha systems. These ancient systems of medicine which are a treasure house of knowledge for both preventive and curative healthy care are embedded in Indian culture well before the advent of Allopathic system of medicines and have continued to be an integral and significant part of our society. They are officially recognized, codified and well documented. However, its growth and development has not been an encouraging as it should be. Various problems and constraints are affecting the growth of Indian systems of medicines – neglect of Government, abuse of system by unscrupulous practitioners, ad-hoc growth, poor resources and allocation and neglect of basic research.

What is the total percentage of Health Budget of the Government and what is the percentage of AYUSH in the Health Budget? The Budget allocation in China in proportion to their population is much more. When China is exporting hugely, why can we not do it? What steps are we taking?

The Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970 provides for constitution of a Central Council of Indian Medicine for regulating of educational standards of Ayurveda, Siddha and Unani systems of medicine and the maintenance of Register containing names of approved Medical Practitioners of the Central Council of Indian Medicines.

We are told that the government in May has decided to set up a Pharmacopoeia commission at a cost of Rs.14 crore for developing indigenous medicines with the aim of raising the country's share in the \$ 62 billion global herbal drug market. Of this, China's share was \$ 19 billion and India has a meager share of \$ 1 billion in global trade. There are 1,000 kinds of drugs and an equal number of compound formulations. When cost of modern health care drugs is increasing and demand for herbal medicines is also

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

increasing, I would urge the Government to set standards for drugs in the Ayurveda, Siddha, Unani medical systems. This Commission should develop standards and quality specifications of identity and strength of raw materials as well. There is need to maintain a national depository that would provide authentic reference of the raw materials.

The Pharmacopoeia Commission should ensure quality, safety and efficacy of the drugs available in the public. This may help in undertaking collaborative research and standardization work with reputed Government and private universities and research organization like Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, Indian Council of Medical Research, Indian Council of Agricultural Research at national level and World Health Organisation, Food and Agricultural Organisation and US Food and drug Administration, etc. at international level.

This Bill is specifically brought to this House to include Sowa Rigpa within the ambit of the Indian Medical system. It is practiced in the sub-Himalayan region along with Tibet, Mongolia, Japan and some other countries. This Bill seeks to include registered practitioners of Sow-Rigpa in the Indian Medical Council. Large number of Indian herbs and plants are used in various traditional systems. I would like to know what steps the Government is taking to reach out to inaccessible areas and places where tribals live in, to identify their system of medicine and practitioners? Are you going to take steps to protect and preserve this ancient system of medicine?

Before concluding, I would say the Government does not have a perspective plan for the growth and development, popularization and expansion of Ayurveda, Unani and other Indian medicines outreach. There is a need to formulate a perspective plan, a roadmap for the next 20 years. Adequate infrastructure facilities should be set up in our country in a time-bound manner.

**\*श्री हंसराज गं. अहीर (चन्द्रपुर):** महोदय, सरकार ने सदन में लाये भारतीय आयुर्विज्ञान चिकित्सा परिषद 2010 के द्वारा युनानी और सोपा दिग्वा उपचार पद्धतियों को रिकग्नाईज करने के लिए विधेयक लाया, मैं इसका समर्थन करता हूँ। भारत में प्राचीन काल से पारंपरिक पद्धति से उपचार किया जा रहा है। लेकिन भारत के परमैत्रता के कारण हमारी उपचार पद्धति धीरे-धीरे समाप्त हो गई। इसलिए आज ग्रामीण तथा दुर्गम क्षेत्र में स्वास्थ्य सुविधाओं का अकाल दिखाई दे रहा है। एलोपैथिक उपचार पद्धति बहुत मंहगी है। इसके सतत मंहगे होने के कारण आम आदमी को भी यह आज आसान नहीं रही है। स्वास्थ्य सुविधा के अभाव के कारण हमारे जनजातिय क्षेत्र में कुपोषण लगातार बढ़ रहा है। कुपोषण के कारण हमारी भावी पीढ़ी अगर कमजोर पैदा हो रही है तो हम कैसे प्रगति का दावा कर सकते हैं।

आदिवासी क्षेत्र में उनके अज्ञान का फायदा लेकर झोला छाप डॉक्टर एलोपैथिक के प्रेक्टिस के द्वारा उन्हें ठग रहे हैं। सरकारी स्वास्थ्य सुविधा निचले स्तर पर पहुंचाने में हमारी असफलता को देखते हमें एलोपैथिक पद्धति पर निर्भरता खत्म कर अब हमारी पारंपरिक उपचार पद्धतियों को बढ़ावा देने की आवश्यकता है। मैंने पिछली बार कहा था कि हमारे पारंपरिक औषधी पादपो, वनस्पतियों का विदेशों में पेटेंट किया जा रहा है। सरकार द्वारा की जा रही उपेक्षा का यह परिचायक है। अगर हमने अपने पारंपरिक औषधियों को वैज्ञानिक कसौटी पर परखने के लिए एक तंत्र का निर्माण किया और उसे बढ़ावा दिया तो हमें सस्ते इलाज के लिए स्वास्थ्य सुविधा उपलब्ध हो सकती है। सरकार इस पर विचार करे। सरकार ने आयुष विभाग द्वारा आयुर्वेदिक औषधियों को बढ़ावा देने के लिए प्रयास किये हैं। उसी तरह अन्य पारंपरिक उपचार पद्धतियों को भी बढ़ावा दिया जाये। इस श्रेणी में युनानी और सोपा रिग्वा को हम देखते हैं। मैं इतनी बात कह कर अपना वक्तव्य समाप्त करता हूँ।

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table



\*DR. PRABHA KISHOR TAVIAD (DAHOD): The system of medicine is good, when the person who studied the system if he practice that system of medicine.

Pharmacopia:

Medicine we study the structure composition, pharmacological action, side effects, advantages and disadvantages etc.

While treating the patient with kidney and liver disease etc. we have to become more careful in giving this medicine the dosages also we have to be very careful signs of over dosages are also to known to us.

All the systems of medicine are excellent but if the person not studied the system will practice that system is dangerous.

Oxytocin is helpful in delivery of a pt. but the higher dosage can give rise to rupture of uterus and which may kill the mother. In chronic diseases like allergy, asthma, arthritis, skin diseases, homeopathy and ayurveda are having very good effects.

**Allovera:** It is very helpful in immediate burns. It will help in deep burns also and it will not allow it to have blisters.

**Steroid:** Sir I wish that sometimes this steroid are used by them without knowing steroid.

When it is to be given, it is given carefully and then it is to be tapered given in reduced doses. Long term steroid is very harmful and the people of other system of medicine are not knowing the danger of long term use and they are using them which should be not allowed at all.

**Antibiotics:** Sir, I will say that irregular and frequent change of antibiotics which lead to resistance to such antibiotics which should not be allowed.

---

\*Speech was laid on the Table

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the outset I would like to thank and congratulate the hon. Members for the keen interest that they have shown in this legislation.

As I had said in the beginning, this particular ... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशाम्बी):** माननीय मंत्री जी, इस विषय पर अगर आप हिंदी में बोलें तो ज्यादा अच्छा रहेगा।

**श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद:** मुझे बहुत खुशी है कि माननीय सदस्यों ने इसमें बहुत रुचि दिखाई है, मैंने शुरु में ही कहा था कि पूरे देश में अभी इस सिस्टम का चलन नहीं है, क्योंकि इससे पहले भी आयुष में, चाहे आयुर्वेद हो, यूनानी हो, सिद्धा हो, होम्योपैथी हो, अगर हम कहें कि पूरे देश में लोग इन्हें इस्तेमाल नहीं करते हैं, तो अलग-अलग जगहों पर और अलग-अलग व्यक्ति इन्हें इस्तेमाल करते हैं। इसी तरह से यह सोवा-रिग्पा भी हमारे देश के कम क्षेत्रों में उपयोग में आता है, जैसे लद्दाख, सिक्किम और अरुणाचल प्रदेश में किया जाता है, वैस्ट-बंगाल, दार्जिलिंग और कालिमपोंग, हिमाचल में, लाहौलस्पीति में, किन्नौर में किया जाता है। कर्नाटक में हुबली और मैसूर में किया जाता है। बड़े अर्से से इन लोगों की मांग थी क्योंकि आमतौर पर मैसूर और हुबली को आप देखेंगे तो ये सभी क्षेत्र हिमालयन रीज़न में हैं। दूसरे कई कारणों की वजह से, जिन क्षेत्रों में एलोपैथी पहुंच नहीं पाती है तो जिस तरह से केरल में आज आयुर्वेद पूरी दुनिया में मशहूर हो गया है, उसी तरह से सदियों से, इन सब हिमालयन रीज़न में इस दवाई का चलन है और प्रैक्टिशनर्स इसे अमची बोलते हैं। हमारे किसी साथी ने कहा कि इसे वैद्य बोलिये, तो वैद्य क्यों बोलेंगे, जो इस्तेमाल करते हैं वे ही तो नाम रखेंगे, हम इस्तेमाल नहीं करते हैं तो हम अपना नाम क्यों थोपेंगे, यह गलत बात है। जो लोग उसे इस्तेमाल करते हैं और जो नाम हजारों सालों से चलता आया है वही होना चाहिए, हमें दूसरे किसी सिस्टम का नाम इनके सिस्टम में थोपने की कोशिश नहीं करनी चाहिए। ऐसा करना उचित नहीं रहेगा।

सर, यह एक छोटा सा बिल है, नया बिल है और अभी इसके बारे में हमें जानकारी नहीं है। मैं बधाई देना चाहता हूं हमारे माननीय सदस्य डॉ. राजन सुशांत जी को, जिन्होंने इस पर सबसे पहले बोला, यह कह रहे थे, हमें जानकारी है, मुझे लगता है कि जितनी हमारे मंत्रालय में जानकारी है और मुझे जानकारी है, उससे दस गुना तो आपको जानकारी है और आप यहां बोल चुके हैं। हम उसका जरूर उपयोग करेंगे, जब यह काम आगे बढ़ेगा, आपकी जो इसमें रुचि है और आपने इसमें पूरी रिसर्च की है और कुछ चीजों की हमें भी जानकारी नहीं थी, उनकी हजारों साल पहले आपके लोगों ने खोज की है, उसके लिए मैं आपको हार्दिक बधाई देना चाहता हूं।

### **16.00 hrs.**

आपने अमेंडमेंट्स के बारे में इसका समर्थन किया है, इसके लिए मैं आपका आभारी हूं, लेकिन आपने सैक्शन-3 में एक्ट में संशोधन के बारे में चर्चा की है। इस बारे में अभी संशोधन करना सम्भव नहीं है, क्योंकि जैसा मैंने शुरु में



कहा कि बहुत लिमिटेड है कि हम पांच बिरादरी में इंडियन सिस्टम आफ सिस्टम में छठा भाई या बहन इसमें जोड़ रहे हैं। इस समय हम जनरल आयुष में अगर कहीं कमियां या कमजोरियां हैं, उनके बारे में न तो चर्चा कर रहे हैं और न ही उनके बारे में हम अमेंडमेंट लाने के बारे में विचार कर सकते हैं। मैं सभी माननीय सदस्यों से, जिन्होंने अमेंडमेंट्स के बारे में या कुछ विचार पूरे आयुष डिपार्टमेंट पूरे इंडियन सिस्टम आफ मेडिसिन्स के बारे में चाहे आयुर्वेदा के बारे में, चाहे यूनानी के बारे में, सिद्ध के बारे में, चाहे होम्योपैथी के बारे में सुझाव दिए हैं, वे अलग से मुझे लिखें। हम उन्हें अलग से कम्पाइल करेंगे। आपके सभी विचारों से हम देख सकते हैं कि कहां-कहां कमी है, तो उसमें अगर बदलाव लाने की जरूरत होगी, तो हम जरूर करेंगे, लेकिन चूंकि आज हम उस बारे में बात नहीं कर रहे हैं, सिर्फ सोवा-रिग्पा के बारे में बात कर रहे हैं, इसलिए मैं आपको पूरी तरह से यकीन नहीं दिला सकता हूं और केवल इतना ही कह सकता हूं कि अगर आप कुछ और कहना चाहते हैं, तो उससे भी हमें अवगत करा सकते हैं।

आपने कहा है कि कालेज की परमिशन समय के अनुसार होनी चाहिए। मैं आपको यकीन दिलाना चाहता हूं कि इस बारे में पूरा प्रोटोकाल बना है। मेडिकल काउंसिल और डेंटल काउंसिल के लिए सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने बनाया है, लेकिन जो दूसरा इंडियन सिस्टम आफ मेडिसिन्स है, उसके लिए भी हमारी मिनिस्ट्री में पूरा प्रोटोकाल बना है कि कब से इनकी इन्सपेक्शन्स होनी चाहिए और कब तक डेट निर्धारित की जाती हैं, ताकि उसके अंदर ही कालेजिज को अनुमति दी जाए।

महोदय, पी.सी. चाको जी से मैं बहुत सहमत हूं। उन्होंने कहा कि यह बहुत अच्छा काम है और यह बहुत होलिस्टिक अप्रोच है। यह बिलकुल सही है। इंडियन सिस्टम आफ मेडिसिन्स के बारे में केरल के अलावा किसका नाम है। सबसे आयुष तो अगर हम आयुर्वेदा कहेंगे, तो पहले आयुर्वेदा के लिए लोगों को केरल जाना पड़ता था। आज न सिर्फ हमारे देश में ही, बल्कि विदेशों में भी केरल के आयुर्वेदा का उपयोग हो रहा है। उसके लिए मैं बधाई देता हूँ, लेकिन उन्होंने कुछ शंकाएं जाहिर की हैं कि डिजिटलाइजेशन होना चाहिए। मैं आपको बताना चाहूंगा कि आयुष के बारे में, इंडियन सिस्टम आफ मेडिसिन्स के बारे में डिजिटलाइजेशन का नालेज है और हम इसका भी डिजिटलाइजेशन उनके साथ-साथ करेंगे। इसके साथ चाको जी ने स्टैंडर्ड्स के बारे में कहा। मैं उन्हें यकीन दिलाता हूँ कि आयुष के बाकी सिस्टम आफ मेडिसिन्स में सिस्टम्स हैं, उन्हीं की तर्ज पर इसमें भी वही माप-दंड को सिस्टम में लाया जाएगा। उन्होंने कहा कि इसे एनआरएचएम के साथ जोड़ कर दवाइयां मिलनी चाहिए। आपको मालूम है कि जब एनआरएचएम बना था, तब यह भी तय हुआ था कि मेन स्ट्रीमिंग आफ आयुष होनी चाहिए और इसका यही मतलब था कि एलोपैथी और आयुर्वेद की को-लोकेशन होनी चाहिए, इसलिए पिछले तीन-चार वर्षों में जो भी डिस्ट्रिक्ट अस्पताल बन रहे हैं, सब-डिस्ट्रिक्ट अस्पताल बन रहे हैं, प्राइमरी हेल्थ सेंटर्स बन रहे हैं उनमें आयुर्वेदा के लिए, जो डिस्पेंसरीज़ हैं, चाहे यूनानी की है, आयुर्वेदा की हैं, उनकी को-लोकेशन का प्रोवीजन एक ही छत के नीचे रखा है। इससे पहले वे कहीं किराये पर थे, कहीं पहाड़ों पर जहां लोग नहीं पहुंच सकते थे, वहां थे। चूंकि इनका

सब-डिस्ट्रिक्ट, डिस्ट्रिक्ट और प्राइमरी हैल्थ सेंटर का चयन बहुत सेंट्रली लोकेटिड जगह पर होता है, इसीलिए उसकी को-लोकेशन और मेन स्ट्रीमिंग की जा रही है।

मैं आपको यकीन दिलाना चाहता हूँ कि हमारी तरफ से पूरी कोशिश है कि जहां जहां भी जिले से निचले स्तर तक खासकर प्राइमरी हैल्थ सेंटर तक जहां जहां भी एलोपैथिक दवाइयां मिले, वहां आयुर्वेदिक दवाइयां भी मिलें। जिन राज्यों में नहीं बल्कि जिन इलाकों में मैं कहूंगा क्योंकि पूरे राज्य में तो सोवा-रिग्पा नहीं है क्योंकि जब यह सोवा-रिग्पा का सिस्टम आएगा, हम कोशिश करेंगे कि जिन क्षेत्रों में, जिन इलाकों में, सोवा-रिग्पा का चलन है, उसको भी हम मेनस्ट्रीमिंग करके उन इलाकों में पीएचसीज, सीएचसीज और डिस्ट्रिक्ट हैड हॉस्पिटल्स में उपलब्ध कराएंगे।

फार्माकोपिया के बारे में यहां चर्चा नहीं की गई लेकिन मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि फार्माकोपिया कमीशन के बारे में आयुर्वेद, यूनानी और सिद्धा सिस्टम के बारे में हम बनाना चाहते हैं क्योंकि वह स्टैंडर्ड उसी में तय हो जाता है। यहां माननीय सदस्यगणों ने इसी के बारे में चर्चा की कि यह जरूरी नहीं है और इधर से हमारे किसी साथी ने जिक्र किया कि यह जरूरी नहीं है कि आपने दवाई बनाई फिर 10 साल, 20 साल वह सूखी है, सड़ी है तो यह खाली एलोपैथिक में नहीं देखना चाहिए, आयुर्वेदिक में भी देखना चाहिए। जब हमारा फार्माकोपिया कमीशन बनेगा और इसके बारे में सिस्टम बनेगा, स्टैंडर्ड्स बनेंगे, उसमें यह सोवा-रिग्पा भी लाया जाएगा।

क्वालिटी के बारे में यहां चर्चा की गई। क्वालिटी आस्पेक्ट पर हम जरूर ध्यान देंगे क्योंकि हमारे साथियों ने यहां रिसर्च के बारे में बात कही। रिसर्च बहुत जरूरी है। हम एलोपैथिक में अगर देखेंगे तो पाएंगे कि कोई भी नया मोलीक्यूल, कोई भी नयी मेडिसिन शुरू करने से पहले फार्मास्यूटिकल कंपनीज कई कई हजार करोड़ रुपये उस पर खर्च करती हैं। इसीलिए जब शुरू में कोई दवा बाजार में आती है तो वह बहुत महंगी होती है क्योंकि किसी भी नयी टैबलेट को या किसी भी नये कैप्सूल को बनाने के लिए 500 करोड़ रुपये से लेकर 5000 करोड़ रुपये तक खर्चा आ जाता है लेकिन जब वह दवाई पूरे देश में या पूरी दुनिया में फैल जाती है और उसका जब वॉल्यूम बढ़ जाता है तो उसकी कीमत घट जाती है। इस तरह से एलोपैथिक वाले बहुत पैसा खर्च करते हैं लेकिन आयुर्वेद में वह अभी तक नहीं था।

माननीय सदस्य विजय बहादुर सिंह जी को यह जानकर बहुत खुशी होगी कि इस साल से हमने जो रिसर्च का कंपोनेंट है, वह बहुत बढ़ा दिया है। हमारा आयुष का वैसे ही ज्यादा बजट नहीं है। आयुष में पहले 5 थे और अब 6 हो गये हैं। इसलिए हमारा पूरे साल का बहुत छोटा सा बजट 800 करोड़ रुपये है। इसमें डिस्पेंसरीज, अस्पताल, प्लांट प्रोटेक्शन और प्लांट रियरिंग भी है। इसलिए पूरे देश के लिए और सेंटर और राज्य के लिए...(व्यवधान)

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार :** बजट बढ़वा दीजिए न। 1600 करोड़ रुपये करवा लीजिए।...(व्यवधान)

**श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद:** हमें पूरी उम्मीद है और हमारे वित्त मंत्री जी ने हमें बताया है कि अगले साल बजट बढ़ाएंगे। लेकिन अभी का बजट जो 800 करोड़ रुपये था, इसमें से हमने इस साल रिसर्च के लिए 133 करोड़ रुपये रखे हैं। यह एक बहुत बड़ा जम्प है। यह रिसर्च का काम हमने ऑलरेडी शुरू किया है और जब रिसर्च हो जाएगी तो अपने आप क्वालिटी इम्प्रूव हो जाएगी।

एक्सपायरी के बारे में भी मैं यह कहूंगा कि हमारे ऑलरेडी ड्रग एंड कॉस्मैटिक एक्ट में संसोधन किया गया है और उसमें गुड मैनुफैक्चरिंग प्रैक्टिस को बड़ी सख्ती से लागू किया जा रहा है। ये तमाम चीजें इसमें भी लागू होंगी चाहे वह लैवलिंग की हो या इंग्रेडिएंट्स की बात हो या एक्सपायरी की बात हो। इसलिए ये कुछ मुद्दे थे जिनके बारे में माननीय सदस्यों ने सदन में चर्चा की। मैं एक बार फिर आप सभी का बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद करता हूँ। हालांकि इस एरिया में आम तौर पर एमपीज इसके बारे में नहीं जानते हैं लेकिन पहाड़ों में जो लोग इसका इस्तेमाल करते हैं, उसको मेनस्ट्रीम में लाने के लिए जो आपने सोचा और सभी दलों ने इसमें सहयोग प्रकट किया, मैं उसके लिए आपका आभार व्यक्त करता हूँ और आपसे यही निवेदन करता हूँ कि इसे पास किया जाए। धन्यवाद।

MR. CHAIRMAN : First, let him put the question. I will call you next.

SHRI B. MAHTAB (CUTTACK): It was very kind of the Minister to mention about the Pharmacopoeia Commission of Indian Medicine. A decision, as far as I have learnt, has been taken by the Cabinet in May last. Accordingly, around Rs.14 crore to Rs.15 crore has been allocated for this. My point is about the national depository that is to be maintained by the Government. At some level, if the Pharmacopoeia Commission of Indian Medicine comes into force, the depository will also come into force where all the Indian systems of medicine can be registered, including the types of herbs that are being used.

This leads to a very basic question. Today, Ministries of Commerce and Industry can also give the details, around 62 billion US dollars of trade is being conducted in the world. Out of this, China's share is 19 billion US dollars whereas our contribution to the international market is only 1 billion US dollars. We should have this Pharmacopoeia Commission of Indian Medicine as early as possible. I would like to understand from the Minister as to what steps he is going to take specially to frame the rules and to maintain the depository council.

**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (मैनपुरी):** माननीय सभापति महोदय, स्वास्थ्य मंत्री जी आपने अच्छा किया है कि बजट कुछ बढ़ाया है लेकिन ज्यादा बजट बढ़ाना चाहिए। हिन्दुस्तान में बहुत जगह है, यूपी में भी बहुत जगह है - आयुर्वेदिक, होम्योपैथिक और यूनानी तीनों के लिए बहुत जगह है। वैद्य अच्छा काम कर रहे हैं। क्या आप उन्हें विशेष सुविधा देकर पद्धति को आगे बढ़ाने का काम करेंगे? आपको मालूम होगा एलोपैथिक दवा ज्यादा खाने से साइड अफेक्ट्स हुए हैं और तत्काल फायदा पहुंचाने के लिए एंटीबायोटिक देना भी मजबूरी हो जाती है। लेकिन इससे बहुत लोगों के किडनी और लिवर फेल हुए हैं। आपने अच्छा काम किया है, इसे और आगे बढ़ाइए। जो हिन्दुस्तान में काम कर रहे हैं, उन्हें बढ़ावा दीजिए। मैंने आयुर्वेदिक एलोपैथिक बोर्ड बनाया था और अच्छे डॉक्टरों का बोर्ड बनाकर सुविधा दी थी, मदद की थी। उस वक्त बहुत प्रोत्साहन मिला था और बहुत तेजी के साथ यह पद्धति बढ़ी थी। क्या आप इसे करेंगे? आयुर्वेदिक, होम्योपैथिक और यूनानी के डॉक्टर अच्छा काम कर रहे हैं, क्या आप उन्हें सुविधा देंगे?

**SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (CHENNAI NORTH):** The knowledge about these medicines should spread to all parts of the country when an additional system of medicine is included in the Indian system. People from all parts of the country should be benefited by that. For that, we need textbooks in all Indian languages. I would like to know whether the Government proposes to spend some money for preparing textbooks in these systems of medicines in all Indian languages, so that people can read it and use it in all parts of the country.

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** As far as Pharmacopoeia Commission of Indian Medicine is concerned, I have already said that the Government has taken a decision to set up the Commission for Ayurveda, Unani, Siddha and also Sowa Rigpa. Naturally, once the Commission comes into being, the depository will automatically become a part of it.

Insofar as the suggestion given by hon. Member Shri Mulayam Singhji is concerned, it is a very good suggestion. We have already got the Councils. We have elected ones, we have university representatives, we have nominated ones for Ayurveda, Unani, Siddha and so will be for Sowa Rigpa. He has said about the facilities to be given. If such facilities and benefits are given to individuals, then it will be opening a Pandora's Box. I am afraid, I do not know to how many people these facilities will be given.

MR. CHAIRMAN :

The question is:

“That the Bill further to amend the Indian Medicine Central Council Act, 1970, as passed by Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration.”

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. CHAIRMAN : The House will now take up clause by clause consideration of the Bill.

The question is:

“That clauses 2 to 7 stand part of the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clauses 2 to 7 were added to the Bill.*

*Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.*

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I beg to move:

“That the Bill be passed.”

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That the Bill be passed.”

*The motion was adopted.*

---

**16.16 hrs.**

**REPRESENTATION OF THE PEOPLE  
(AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010**

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I beg to move:

“That the Bill further to amend the Representation of the People Act, 1950, as passed by the Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration.”

**16.16 ¼ hrs.**

(Shri Inder Singh Namdhari *in the Chair*)

Sir, it is a long awaited Bill, being agitated over for a long time. In fact, it came to Parliament some time back, in the year 2005 and was referred to the Departmentally Related Standing Committee. The Departmentally Related Standing Committee examined the whole Bill. They wanted the Government to bring a comprehensive Bill. Now, the present Bill, in fact, comprises of all the elements and it has implemented in letter and spirit the Report of the Departmentally Related Standing Committee.

Sir, it is a very simple Bill. In fact, it restores the right to vote for those Indian citizens who have gone abroad for employment, education etc. It is not that we are conferring something on them. There are as many as 25 million Indian citizens who are abroad and they do not have the right to vote. Due to this logistic reason, this Bill is being brought. There are only three elements in this Bill. The proposed section 20A.(1) says:

“..... every citizen of India,--

- (a) whose name is not included in the electoral roll;
- (b) who has not acquired the citizenship of any other country; and
- (c) who is absenting from his place of ordinary residence in India owing to his employment, education or otherwise outside India (whether temporarily or not),



shall be entitled to have his name registered in the electoral roll ....”

These are the only three elements of the Bill.

It is not that we, in our country, are bringing it as a unique feature. In fact, many countries, maybe about 20 or 25, have given this kind of a right to their own citizens. So, I commend this Bill for consideration of the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion moved:

“That the Bill further to amend the Representation of the People Act, 1950, as passed by the Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration.”

**श्री उदय सिंह (पूर्णिया):** सभापति महोदय, इस सत्र के आखिरी दिन और शायद आखिरी विधेयक पर आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए मैं आपको बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देता हूँ। रिप्रजेन्टेशन ऑफ पीपुल (अमैन्डमेंट) बिल, 2010 एक वैलकम विधेयक है। इस सत्र में हमने देखा है कि सरकार के द्वारा तरह-तरह के ऐसे विधेयक पेश किये गये हैं, जो विवादों में घिरे रहे हैं और जिनकी वजह से संसद में शोर-शराबा भी हुआ और हम लोग विभाजित भी हुए। लेकिन यह एक ऐसा बिल है, जिसका सभी लोग समर्थन करेंगे, ऐसा मुझे लगता है। लेकिन मैं कुछ बातें कहना चाहता हूँ। मैं जानता हूँ कि आज आखिरी दिन है और सुबह से हम सांसदों ने काफी वर्जिश भी की है और गले भी काफी साफ किये हैं, इसलिए सब थके हुए होंगे। अब जाने का समय नजदीक है। लेकिन कुछ महत्वपूर्ण बातें मैं कहना चाहता हूँ। यह इतना आसान और साधारण नहीं है, जितना हमारे आदरणीय कानून मंत्री ने बताने की कोशिश की है।

महोदय, सबसे पहले मैं इस सरकार को बधाई दे दूँ, क्योंकि इनकी गति इतनी तीव्र है कि आप देखें मात्र चार वर्षों में यह बिल सदन में आया है। वर्ष 2006 में राज्य सभा में यह विधेयक लाया गया था, लेकिन शायद लॉ एंड जस्टिस मिनिस्ट्री ने पार्लियामेन्ट्री स्टैंडिंग कमेटी की बातों को कुछ ज्यादा गहराई से सोचने की कोशिश की।

यह बिल 2006 से लेकर 2010 तक पैडिंग पड़ा रहा। सरकार इस गति से चलती है या उस गति से तीव्र काम हुआ है? स्टैंडिंग कमेटी ने जो रिक्मेंडेशन दी थीं, वे सरकार ने नहीं मानी। मैं सरकार का ध्यान इस ओर दिलाना चाहता हूँ जिसमें उसने कहा है - *The Bill allows for all citizens to be enrolled in the electoral rolls in the constituency.* यह कहते हैं कि जहां का पासपोर्ट है, वहां उसकी कांस्टीट्यूवेंसी का नाम एंटर होगा। मान लीजिये, मैं पूर्णिया निवासी हूँ, पढ़ने के लिये बाहर जाता हूँ, मेहनत करता हूँ और नौकरी करता हूँ। तरक्की पाता हूँ। मैं अपने पूर्णिया गांव के अलावा पटना में अपना एक निवास रखना चाहता हूँ तो यह छूट मुझे होनी चाहिये। खासकर कि जब यह आर.पी.एक्ट में दिया गया है कि यदि कोई व्यक्ति दूसरी जगह चला जाता है तो उस जगह पर अपना नाम वोटर लिस्ट में जुड़वा सकता है। पहली जगह वाले लिखकर दे देते हैं कि फलां व्यक्ति का नाम उस जगह की वोटर लिस्ट में नाम हटा दिया जाये। इस विधेयक में जो बताया गया है वह उचित नहीं है। यह बात खुले दिल और दिमाग से इस बिल में नहीं आयी है। *NRI is loosely defined.*

सभापति महोदय, वोटर लिस्ट में किसी एन.आर.आई का नाम जुड़ेगा, इस बिल में कहीं चर्चा नहीं की गई है। सरकार यह कानून बनायेगी। मैं कानून मंत्री जी से कहना चाहूंगा - *“Citizen of India not enrolled in the electoral rolls ...”* इलैक्शन कमीशन आपसे सलाह करके रूल बनाये तो मेरे ख्याल से उचित बात होगी। ऐसा अमेंडमेंट आना चाहिये था। मैं समय सीमा को देखकर बोल रहा हूँ...(व्यवधान)

**सभापति महोदय :** क्या आपको समय सीमा का पता है?

**श्री उदय सिंह :** मालूम नहीं है लेकिन जैसा आपका आदेश होगा, उसी अनुसार बोलूंगा।

**सभापति महोदय :** आप जिस गति से चल रहे हैं, वह थोड़ा परिधि से बाहर हो रहा है।

**श्री उदय सिंह :** सभापति महोदय, मैंने अभी महत्वपूर्ण बात तो कही नहीं है। It would have been better. We have waited from 2006 to 2010. Our NRI people would have waited another year if you had brought a comprehensive Bill.

The Election Commission of India has sent you a comprehensive list of the amendments required in the Representation of People Act, but you have chosen from them selectively. You have chosen from them what suits you, and you have ignored what does not suit you.

One of the recommendations of the Election Commission is that : “Power to make rules under the Act must not lie with the Central Government”, which does so today in consultation with the Election Commission, but must be turned around the other way. स्टैंडिंग कमेटी ने कहा है -

“Since the present law requires a physical presence of the voter while casting his vote, the Committee feels that only a minimum number of NRIs will vote ...”

उसने यह भी कहा था - “The mode of casting votes by all categories of voters, who may not be physically present, which is, Armed Forces, Paramilitary Forces, Armed Police, forces serving outside and officials posted on foreign Mission, should be made uniform.” मैं समझता हूँ कि सरकार को सच्चाई कबूल करने में परहेज है। हमारी एन.डी.ए. सरकार के समय में एक प्रोग्राम शुरु किया गया था - नेशनल सिटीजन रजिस्टर बनाने का। नेशनल सिटीजन रजिस्टर प्रोग्राम पर इतना दबाव पड़ा कि इसकी जरूरत महसूस की गई जिसे आगे नेशनल पापुलेशन रजिस्टर के रूप में ले जाना पड़ा। वह सरकार और सदन कहता है कि हम देश को नेतृत्व देते हैं।

We give leadership to the country, but the Government does not have the gumption, does not have the courage to accept who are its citizens, who are not. We are trying to make an omnibus sort of National Population Register. जो नेशनल सिटीजन कार्ड होना चाहिए था, उसका हमने यूआईडी नाम दिया है। मैं सच में सरकार की सराहना करूंगा कि जिन्हें यूआईडी का काम दिया गया है, उनसे बेहतर व्यक्ति मिलना असंभव है। वह काम ठीक है, लेकिन अगर यह यूआईडी, नेशनल सिटीजन कार्ड बनता तो हमें कभी वोटर लिस्ट की जरूरत न पड़ती। इसमें व्यापक रूप से गड़बड़ी होती है।

महोदय, आप भी सदस्य हैं और आपको भी मालूम है कि क्षेत्र में क्या होता है। यह कन्सर्न आज इन्हीं की नहीं है, आज चाहे-अनचाहे में हम सांसद करीब 15 दिन पहले एक विवाद में, सैलरी आदि को लेकर फंस गये थे। उस पर मुझे कुछ नहीं कहना है। मेरी पार्टी की जो नीति है, जो मेरी पार्टी का मानना है, वह हमारे नेता ने स्पष्ट कर दिया है, लेकिन जो पब्लिक ओपीनियन निकलकर आयी है, वह सांसदों के पक्ष में नहीं आयी है। हमें अपने डेमोक्रेटिक प्रोसेस में लोगों का इंटरएक्शन बढ़ाना है। हम कैसे बढ़ायेंगे? 50 फीसदी से कम लोग मतदान करते हैं। मैं चेन्नई में रहता हूं, क्या मैं यहां से निकलकर होशियारपुर अपने कैंडीडेट को वोट देने जाऊंगा? जब आपके पास सब कुछ उपलब्ध है, बायोमैट्रिक कार्ड दे रहे हैं तो अगर आप उसे नेशनल सिटीजन रजिस्टर में कन्वर्ट करें, उस कार्ड को एक सिटीजन कार्ड बनायें तो आज सारी टैक्नोलॉजी उपलब्ध हैं कि मैं कर्नाटक में बैठा हुआ अरुणाचल प्रदेश के अपने उम्मीदवार के लिए वहीं से वोट दे सकता हूं। न सिक्युरिटी पर खर्च करने की आवश्यकता होगी और न किसी अन्य चीज पर खर्च करने की आवश्यकता होगी। यह मेरा सरकार से आग्रह है। मेरा कानून मंत्री जी से आग्रह है कि इलेक्शन कमीशन की जितनी भी रिक्मंडेशंस हैं, उन्हें आप सीरियसली लीजिये। सांसदों के बारे में क्या-क्या कहा जाता है, कौन से ऐसे अपशब्द हैं, जो हमारे लिए इस्तेमाल नहीं हुए, आप क्यों क्रिमिनलाइजेशन ऑफ पॉलिटिक्स अमेंडमेंट को नहीं लाते? क्या इतनी भी करेज नहीं है, इतनी भी विल नहीं है? आप इलेक्शन कमीशन की चीजों को पढ़िये और इलेक्शन कमीशन की चीजों को सलैक्टिवली पिकअप मत कीजिये, उन्हें काम्प्रिहेंसिवली पिकअप कीजिये। इन्हीं बातों के साथ मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि यह चाहे कम है, it is a case of too little, too late. I think it is a good Bill and we support it wholeheartedly.

SHRI P.T. THOMAS (IDUKKI): With pride, I am supporting this Bill. This legislation, no doubt, is a feather in the cap of the UPA Government, especially Madam Sonia Ji, and our hon. Prime Minister. The passage of this Bill has to be inscribed in golden letters in the annals of real democracy.

The NRIs are of Indian blood. Tens and thousands of NRIs are living in foreign countries without being enfranchised. Not only the Indian political leaders, but also the successive Presidents and Prime Ministers of USA, UK, UAE, Australia and France have time and again expressed and acknowledged the great contributions made by our NRIs.

We have to bow our heads before the glorious memories of the great martyrs of 1857, the First Freedom Struggle. The British Parliament was forced to pass the Indian Council Act, 1861 to provide space for Indian opinion in the Council. This is a landmark legislation. It bears the colour of the patriotic blood which was responsible for the Indian Council Act, 1861. By this historic legislation, we are expanding the horizon of the meaning of democracy. We have seen elsewhere in the world and in our neighbourhood countries, the Governments shattering and crumbling down as to allow military juntas suppressing people and democracies. But the Indian democracy stood the test of time. We are proud of being the largest and the greatest democracy of the world. With the enactment of the present legislation, our democracy attains more greatness.

There are as many as 25,000,000 Non Resident Indians. There has been a long-pending demand from our NRIs. I hope that nobody would have any objection to the purpose of the Bill. The Bill came before the august Parliament in the year 2006 and the Standing Committee gave its report on it. The Bill seeks to provide for granting voting right to every citizen who has not acquired the citizenship of any other country and who has been absent from his place of ordinary residence in India. The Bill empowers the Central Government to issue notification to specify after consulting the Election Commission of India the time and manner in which the name of a person who is not an ordinary resident be listed in the electoral rolls.

The Bill provides that the Electoral Registration Officer shall make corrections of entries in the electoral rolls and inclusion of names in the electoral rolls after proper

verification. The proposed amendment seeks to create a very valuable political right in favour of the Indian citizens working and living abroad. It will benefit all those people who are working abroad and students who have gone abroad to study. Countries like UK, USA, Canada, Australia allow their overseas citizens to vote subject to certain conditions.

There can be an issue like a person living abroad might like to contest election. The hon. Minister may kindly explain if that would be permissible. If they are allowed to contest election, they can become MLAs and MPs. However, they will be residing outside India. A clarification is needed in this regard. There should be a distinct difference between right to vote and right to stand in election.

My suggestion to the Government is that it should consider the possibility of allowing the NRIs to vote through the Internet. One problem can arise in this regard. Suppose a person from Kerala is working abroad for the last few years and after this amendment he wants to get his name registered in some other State like Delhi or UP. Can this be done? There is one more problem. If a person registered lives outside India, how will he cast his vote? They may ask for postal ballot. However, if postal ballot is allowed, it will take a long time to declare the result. The Minister may like to address this issue. Right to vote, to my mind, is a basic fundamental right of any citizen. This not only gives him a political right but also is the basic identity of a citizen of the country.

Regarding the issue of correcting the electoral rolls, it is generally seen that the Election Commission revises the rolls as on 1<sup>st</sup> January of each year. Many times, a large number of elector's names are deleted from the rolls and they come to know of it only when they go to vote and find that their names are not there in the list. In our State, in Kannur District, the ruling Party CPI(M) is always rigging and capturing the booths. Before deleting the names from the electoral rolls, the Commission should give the electors an opportunity to be heard. Most of the times the electors are ignorant of their names being struck off the rolls. Being a Member from Kerala, I am proud to say that the entire economy of our country is based on the NRIs who contribute to our economic system.

I support this Bill.

**श्री लालू प्रसाद (सारण):** सभापति महोदय, यह जो संशोधन विधेयक लाया गया है, यह बात ठीक है कि इसे लाया गया है, लेकिन जरूरी यह है कि भारत के जो मतदाता हैं, उनके आई-कार्ड बनाने में अरबों-खराबों रुपयों का खर्चा हो गया। अभी-अभी पचास प्रतिशत मतदाताओं का आई-कार्ड नहीं बना है। लोग डिबार कर दिए गए हैं। वोटर लिस्ट भी गलत प्रिंट हो गई है। हमने शुरू में कहा था कि आई-कार्ड गरीब कहां रखेगा, कहां नहीं रखेगा, सेशन साहब के समय से हम कह रहे हैं। कानून मंत्री जी आपको नियम बनाना चाहिए कि आप 100 प्रतिशत मतदाताओं का पहचान पत्र जब तक नहीं बन जाता है, तब तक आपको चुनाव नहीं कराना चाहिए। आप इसे मेनडेटरी कीजिए।...(व्यवधान) आप टेन्योर की बात छोड़िए, मैं उसकी बात नहीं कर रहा हूं। गरीब लोग डिबार हो रहे हैं। गरीब लोगों का 100 परसेंट आई-कार्ड नहीं बना है और पैसा खर्च हो गया। लोग एनआरआई हैं, ठीक है वे भारत आएंगे। जो नियम पालन करते हैं, उनका नाम वोटर लिस्ट में होना चाहिए, लेकिन आई-कार्ड आपने नहीं बनवाया, इसका मतलब जनता का जो मौलिक अधिकार है, उससे जनता को आप वंचित कर रहे हैं। आप इस बिल को लाइए और इन्श्योर कीजिए।

मैं एक बात और कहना चाहता हूं कि पहले लोग अपनी आंख से देख कर वोट देते थे। अब आप ईवीएस मशीन लाए हैं। बहुत से लोग अनपढ़ हैं, हर तरह के वोटर हैं। हम कह रहे हैं कि लालटेन के सामने वाला बटन दबाना, वह बटन लालटेन का दबाता है और वोट साइकिल को पड़ जाता है। साइकिल का जो दबा रहा है, वह कमल में जा रहा है, जो हाथ पर दबा रहा है, वह हाथी पर जा रहा है। यह सारा मैनुपलेशन हो रहा है। बड़े चुतराई से तकनीकी काम करके, जिस पार्टी को वोट मतदाता देता है, उसको वोट नहीं मिलता है। इसलिए ईवीएम को हटाइए। जो पुराना मैनुअल सिस्टम था, उसको लाइए। इस बात के लिए बीजेपी एवं सभी पार्टी के लोग साथ हैं। हम इलैक्शन कमीशन के पास भी गए थे। इसमें भारी गड़बड़ी है, भारी घालमेल है, ईवीएम के नाम पर। यह नियम बनाइए, ईवीएम मशीन को हटाइए।...(व्यवधान)

**सभापति महोदय :** लालू जी बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री लालू प्रसाद :** वोटिंग के समय ईवीएम खराब हो गया और पांच घण्टे इसी में खत्म हो गए। इसलिए यह जरूरी है। यह हमारी मांग है, इसे पूरा कीजिए।... (व्यवधान) बायोमीट्रिक करवा रहे हैं। काहे का बायोमीट्रिक? इसको लाइए, ताकि लालटेन में लगे तो लालटेन में निकले, साइकिल पर न चढ़ जाए। यह करना होगा, ईवीएम हटाइए और मैनुअल लाइए।

**MR. CHAIRMAN :** Those hon. Members who want to lay their written speeches, they can do so.



**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (मैनपुरी):** सभापति महोदय, माननीय लालू जी ने जो सवाल उठाया है, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है...(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: This will not go on record.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only the speech of Shri Mulayam Singh will go in the records, nothing else.

*(Interruptions) ... \**

**श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव :** सभापति महोदय, जहां तक बाबा की बात है, ये मंदिर में पूजा करें। ये मंदिर में पूजा कर रहे हैं और पुजारियों को भ्रमित करके वोट लेकर जीत कर आ रहे हैं। हम लोग कैसे जीत कर आते हैं, यह आपको पता है। आप धड़ाधड़ दोनों काम कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान) आप मंदिर में जाइए।...(व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय, मैं सिर्फ एक ही बात कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह जो कम्प्यूटर और मशीन का चुनाव हो रहा है, बटन दबाने को खत्म कीजिए। यह अनुभव है, अमेरिका में भी अनुभव किया गया, स्वीकार किया कि इससे बेईमानी हो सकती है, होती है और हो रही है। मंत्री जी और सदन के नेता से मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि इसे बंद कराइए और अपने हाथ से ठप्पा लगाने का जो पुराना सिस्टम था, वही चालू करना चाहिए। उसमें बेईमानी नहीं हो सकती है। बटन दबाने में बेईमानी होती है, कहीं बटन दबाइए, अगर उसमें जरा सी भी असावधानी हो जाए, हमारा एजेंट अगर टॉयलट में चला जाए, उस समय अगर बटन को दबा दिया, आप कहीं बटन दबाइए, मोहर कहीं लगेगी, जहां उसने फिट कर दिया है, यह साबित हो चुका है। अगर इसे इलैक्शन कमीशन नहीं मान रहा है तो आप यहां से इसे बदलिए, संसद सर्वोपरि है। मैं आपको बता रहा हूँ कि इसमें बेईमानी है, रात को प्रीजाइडिंग ऑफिसर और पोलिंग ऑफिसर को खरीद लो, उन्हें अच्छी तरह से फिट कर लीजिए और चाहे जहां दबाइए, वहीं बटन दबा देंगे।

सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहता हूँ कि आप खुद हस्तक्षेप करके निर्देश दीजिए।

**\*श्री पन्ना लाल पुनिया (बाराबंकी):** महोदय, मैं आभारी हूँ कि आपने मुझे "द रिप्रेजेंटेशन ऑफ द पीपल (अमेंडमेंट) बिल 2010 पर विचार प्रस्तुत करने का अवसर दिया।

बहुत समय से यह मांग थी कि हमारी हिन्दुस्तानी भाई विदेशों में रह रहे हैं, उन्हें चुनावों में मत का अधिकार दिया जाना चाहिए। इस संशोधन बिल के माध्यम से चिर अपेक्षित मांग की पूर्ती की जा रही है। विदेशों में रह रहे हमारे भाई-बहन हिन्दुस्तान से ज्यादा जुड़ाव महसूस करेंगे। मेरा प्रस्ताव है कि स्वागत योग्य इस संशोधन बिल को सर्वसम्मति से पास किया जाये।

**\*डॉ. राजन सुशान्त (कांगड़ा):** महोदय, मेरे निम्नलिखित सुझाव लोक प्रतिनिधित्व (संशोधन) विधेयक 2010 में जोड़ दें।

1. मैं धारा 20 क (1) की उपधारा क,ख,ग का समर्थन करता हूं।
2. धारा 20 क (2) व (3) का भी समर्थन करता हूं।
3. धारा 22 के (क) व ख का भी समर्थन करता हूं।
4. धारा 23 उपधारा (2) क व ख का भी समर्थन करता हूं।
5. धारा 28 उपधारा (2) का भी समर्थन करता हूं।

महोदय, इससे शिक्षा, व्यवसाय या अन्य किसी विशेष कारण से देश से बाहर गए देशवासियों को जो देश से बाहर रह गया हो, जसका नाम वोटर लिस्ट में न आ सका हो, उसे भी मतदान का प्रयोग करने की जो अनुमति दी जा रही है, वह प्रशंसनीय है। हम इसका समर्थन करते हैं।

\*DR. RATNA DE (HOOGHLY) : This Bill has been brought before the august House to extend voting rights to those Indians who are living abroad. Now, this Bill would enable the Non-Resident Indians (NRIs) to participate in this whole process of democracy by participating in voting. They are given the voting rights. Till now, they have been deprived of this genuine rights and they were not eligible to vote in the democratic process of the country.

This Bill also provides the manner in which enrolment of NRIs has to take place, as to what is the mode of voting and the conditionalities for contesting election. With the passage of this Bill, NRIs can register their names in the electoral rolls in their constituency and vote in the elections. This would also help NRIs to elect a Government in their home country. This would give NRIs a sense of satisfaction that they are being made a part of elections and they play a part in the election of a Government.

There is no doubt, this Bill is welcome. This is a long overdue, as far as I am concerned. Thought Indians go out for employment or business purposes for a fairly long time, they cannot be termed as Indians, by any stretch of imagination. They are Indians. There cannot be any two opinions on this aspect. By bringing this Bill, the Government has certainly making the NRIs feel that they are Indians and they have every right to vote during the electoral process.

They are also given the rights through this Bill to contest elections. These are legitimate rights, which are their due, as NRIs. But there are certain conditionalities, about which I do not want to go into detail due to paucity of time.

Conferring of voting rights on NRIs has to be welcomed by all right thinking people. NRIs contribute to India in their own way. This cannot be denied. They go out for a temporary period and come back to their motherland and wanted to serve and live in their own country. This pattern should be lauded, so to say.

With these words, I conclude.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

**सभापति महोदय :** गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय जी, आप बोलिए। शैलेन्द्र जी, आप अपनी स्पीच ले कर दीजिए, क्योंकि आपका नाम मैंने पुकारा था, लेकिन मुलायम सिंह जी खड़े हो गए।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशाम्बी):** आपकी बात का उन्होंने समर्थन किया।...(व्यवधान)

**सभापति महोदय:** अब मैंने पाण्डेय जी का नाम ले लिया है।

**श्री गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय (भदोही):** सभापति महोदय, आपने मुझे लोक प्रतिनिधित्व संशोधन विधेयक, 2006 के समर्थन में बोलने का अवसर दिया, इसके लिए मैं आपका आभारी हूँ। माननीय मंत्री जी ने कहा कि 2005 में जब बिल आया था तो उस समय कुछ संशोधन के साथ उसे पेश किया गया। सन् 2006 में भी इस एक्ट में कुछ कमियां रहीं, जिसे फिर से संशोधित करके लाया गया। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी को धन्यवाद देना चाहूंगा। आपने जिन तीन बिन्दुओं के बारे में कहा, पहला, जिनका नाम मतदाता सूची में नहीं है, दूसरा जिन्होंने किसी देश की नागरिकता स्वीकार नहीं की है और तीसरा, जो अपने मूल स्थान से किसी नियोजन या शिक्षा के उद्देश्य से बाहर गए हैं, उन्हें भी यहां मतदान देने का अधिकार हो, ऐसे प्रावधान की इसमें व्यवस्था की गई है।

### **16.43 hrs.**

#### **(Madam Speaker in the Chair)**

अध्यक्ष महोदया, इस संशोधन विधेयक में जो निर्णय लिया गया और जिन अनिवासी भारतीयों को मतदाता सूची में लाने तथा इस सूची में उनके नाम दर्ज करने के तरीके, मतदान के तरीके और चुनाव लड़ने के तौर-तरीकों का प्रावधान है। उसमें कहीं न कहीं कुछ शक की भी गुंजाइश जाती है।

अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी का ध्यान इस तरफ आकृष्ट करना चाहूंगा कि इस देश से बाहर लगभग एक करोड़ से भी अधिक ऐसे भारतीय हैं, जो विदेशों में रह रहे हैं और जिनकी दूसरी एवं तीसरी पीढ़ी भी आ गई है। उन्हें अपना परिचय पत्र जमा करना और उसके लिए 175 डालर शुल्क का भी प्रावधान किया गया है, जो कहीं न कहीं उनके लिए कठिनाई है। इसमें उदार दृष्टिकोण की आवश्यकता है।

अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी का ध्यान इस तरफ भी आकृष्ट करना चाहूंगा कि ऐसे भी कुछ लोग हैं, शिक्षा ग्रहण करने के लिए सामान्य परिवार के लोग भी हैं।



जो लोग विदेशों में रहते हैं, लेकिन उनका बाकी परिवार इस देश में रहता है, उनका लगाव है और उनका आना-जाना है। वे भी चाहते हैं कि हम अपने देश के इलैक्शन में, मताधिकार का प्रयोग कर सकें। दोहरी नागरिकता... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय जी, अब आप समाप्त करिये।

**श्री गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय :** माननीय अध्यक्ष जी, इसमें वोटर लिस्ट एक होनी चाहिए, चाहे वह पंचायत का चुनाव हो, चाहे विधान सभा का चुनाव हो और चाहे लोक सभा का चुनाव हो।... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** अब स्थान ग्रहण कर लीजिए।

**श्री गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय :** जांच-पड़ताल के साथ-साथ वोटर लिस्ट एक होनी चाहिए।

मैं एक बिन्दु पर आपके माध्यम से सरकार का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहूंगा। अन्तिम बिन्दु-आपने धारा 22 का संशोधन, आपने मूल अधिनियम की धारा 22 के 'क' में कहा: "अध्यधीन रहते हुए" शब्दों के पश्चात् "तथ्यों का ऐसी रीति में जो विहित की जाये, समुचित सत्यापन करने के पश्चात्" अन्तःस्थापित की जाये। इसमें गहन जांच की आवश्यकता है। इसका दुरुपयोग न हो, मिसयूज़ न हो, इसके लिए यह आवश्यक है। ... (व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** अब आप स्थान ग्रहण कर लीजिए। गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय जी, अब समाप्त करिये। बोलने वालों की अभी बहुत लम्बी सूची है।

**श्री गोरखनाथ पाण्डेय :** मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी का धन्यवाद करना चाहूंगा। मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करता हूँ।

\*SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (ALAPPUZHA): Respected Sir, I support the Bill moved by the honourable Law Minister. This piece of legislation indeed fulfilled the long pending cherish of the Indian Citizens those who are residing abroad. We are surely proud of the Indian system of democracy which is delivering true spirit of democracy to the Indian Masses. NRI people who has been contributing a lot of strength to the Indian economy has not got an opportunity for participating the electoral process. Actually this is creating discrimination to themselves and it leads a feeling of disappointment for themselves.

As far as my state, state of Kerala is concerned; the state has been totally supported by the NRI especially in the socio, economic areas. They are contributing a huge amount of money to our state and central government, but they were neglected by the governments in several ways. Our Airlines are using their international flight sector especially to Middle East only with a business eye. On season time they are collecting unreasonable fare from NRIs.

The treatment given by our National Career to the NRI is pathetic. The delay and cancellation of the flight is the general phenomenon as far as Air India is concerned. Perhaps some of them have lost their job due to the cancellation of the flight.

I would like to urge upon the Government to take necessary steps for addressing this problem of Air Journey and also International economical crisis also create major problems to the NRIs who are working in the real estate as well as in the construction area.

Lot of people had lost their job and some of them have facing several problems due to salary cut. The Central and State Governments should come together and make a comprehensive rehabilitation package for the returnees, those who are badly affected due to recession.

At the outset, I would like to congratulate the UPA Government for bringing such a legislation which makes the real happiness to entire Indian passport holders. I am taking this opportunity to sincerely congratulate Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh Ji,

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

UPA Chairperson Madam Sonia Gandhi and Mr. Vayalar Ravi, Honourable Union Minister of Overseas Indian Development for fulfilling their promise to the people. Madam, this is a historic moment in this era of Indian democracy and therefore I am also expressing my happiness for participating in this legislation.



**\*श्री अर्जुन राम मेघवाल (बीकानेर):** महोदय, लोक प्रतिनिधित्व (संशोधन) विधेयक, 2010 के संबंध में निम्नांकित सुझाव प्रस्तुत करना चाहता हूं।

यह स्वागत योग्य कदम है। मैं राजस्थान का रहने वाला हूं। मेरे राज्य से बहुत लोग मिडिल ईस्ट व यूरोप व संसार के अन्य भागों में पढ़ने व कमाने के लिए गये हुए हैं। उनके वोट कई कारणों से कट जाते हैं, उनको अब रिलीफ मिलेगी। ऐसी संभावना है लेकिन विधेयक में पूरी कार्यवाही "सत्यापन" के पश्चात होगी। मेरा सुझाव है कि यह सत्यापन की कार्यवाही सरल प्रक्रिया के तहत होनी चाहिये अन्यथा जटिल प्रक्रिया में पड़ कर एन आर आई अपने आपको परेशानी में पा सकता है। अतः प्रक्रिया सत्यापन की सरल हो, ऐसी व्यवस्था सुनिश्चित हो।

सत्यापन की प्रक्रिया हेतु जिला निर्वाचन अधिकारी कार्यालय से पृथक से प्रकोष्ठ खोला जाये ताकि उनको वोट का अधिकार पाने के लिए टेबल टू टेबल नहीं जाना पड़े।

\*SHRI S. SEMMALAI (SALEM): I welcome to introduction of the Bill, as it fulfilled the aspirations and long pending demand of NRIs. There are around 22 million NRIs living globally to whom the passage of the bill would be a happy news. The bill provides voting rights and enable the NRIs to have a participatory approach in the democratic process and also to have a say on who should be govern the country.

I welcome the bill on this concept. However, I have a strong reservation on granting voting right to all NRIs. There are two categories of NRIs. A section of NRIs who frequently visits India say once a year or once in two years. There are other NRIs who come back to India say once in five or seven years.

Are we going to treat them equally? Are we to treat both categories of NRIs alike and grant them equal rights of voting?

Hon'ble Minister must have to think over it. An NRI who makes a visit to India once a blue moon may not face the issues and problems that an ordinary Indian undergoes.

The suffering of Indian residents may not be known to him. He may not know the political situation, prevailing in our country. Should we allow such NRIs who are namesake Indian to have voting right to elect a Government. I think it is conceptually wrong and makes a mockery of democracy. Those NRIs who are frequenting to homeland, knows the perception of the country and have a feel of Indianness.

I am therefore, of the view that voting right may be granted only to such NRIs who are frequently visiting India.

All other non-serious NRIs need not be given voting right as they are not really interested in India and welfare of the country. They are money spinners only.

A mechanism may be evolved based on the entries in the passport of the NRIs to put my suggestion into action. While NRIs are permitted to vote, whether they are entitled to contest in the election. Hon'ble Minister was to clarify. Another issue in which I want to share my views is the method of casting vote.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

I presume Indian missions abroad will be designated as polling stations for NRIs to exercise their franchise but I would like to record my strong objection for use of electronic voting machine for casting votes of NRIs.

All experts express doubt over EVM machines being tamper proof and also bring their own version of EVMs and show it can be tampered with.

Hence I suggest that a suitable technology free from error and manipulation should be evolved before allowing NRIs to actually cast their votes.

To avoid any controversy and to make election free from rigging. It is better as suggested by my revered leader Puratchithalaivi J. Jayalathia the election future may be conducted through ballot paper system.

Hon'ble Minister may kindly consider the views in this regard.

**श्री अर्जुन राय (सीतामढ़ी):** अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपका धन्यवाद करता हूँ कि पीपुल्स रिप्रेजेंटेटिव्स एक्ट, 2010 पर आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया।

माननीय मंत्री जी ने इन बातों की ओर इशारा किया कि:

“Notwithstanding anything contained in this Act, every citizen of India,--

- a) whose name is not included in the electoral roll;
- b) who has not acquired the citizenship of any other country; and
- c) who is absenting from his place of ordinary residence in India owing to his employment, education or otherwise outside India.”

इन बातों की ओर माननीय मंत्री जी ने इशारा किया। इन्हीं तीन विषयों पर ये संशोधन बिल लाये हैं। 2004 में इलैक्शन कमीशन ने भारत सरकार को अपने 22 सुझाव दिये कि यहां जो इलैक्टोरल रोल है, पीपुल्स रिप्रेजेंटेशन का जो सवाल है या इलैक्शन का जो सवाल है, इसमें सुधार के लिए...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** कृपया शान्त हो जाइये, सुनिये। कृपया शान्ति से सुनिये। हां, आप बोलिये।

**श्री अर्जुन राय :** इसके सुधार के लिए भारत सरकार के द्वारा नियम बनना चाहिए। इस पर डिस्कशन तो पर्याप्त हुए, लेकिन इस पर भारत सरकार 2006 में जब राज्य सभा में बिल लाई तो वह बिल पर्याप्त नहीं था। उसको वापस करके फिर से सुधार करके अप्रवासी भारतीयों के लिए इन्होंने जो एक बिल लाया है, एट ए ग्लॉस इसमें बहुत सारी खामियां प्रतीत होती हैं। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि हम उस जगह से आते हैं, आप भी वहीं से हैं, जहां वैशाली के लिच्छवी में दुनिया में लोकतंत्र का जन्म हुआ। लोकतंत्र का मतलब वोटिंग राइट होता है, लेकिन इस देश में ऐसे लाखों लोग हैं, करोड़ों लोग हैं, जिनको आजाद भारत में 61-62 वर्ष की आजादी के बाद भी वोट देने का अधिकार नहीं मिला और वोटर लिस्ट में उनका नाम नहीं जुड़ा।

जो भारत के बाहर यहां के लगभग दो करोड़ लोग रहते हैं, जो अप्रवासी भारतीय हैं, जो भारत की वेषभूषा, यहां का रहन-सहन, भोजन...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** कृपया यह आपसी संवाद बन्द करिये। आपसी वार्तालाप बन्द करिये और सुनिये।

**श्री अर्जुन राय :** सारी कल्चर, सारी संस्कृति, सारा सोच-विचार उनका भारतीय है। वे अस्थाई रूप से रहने के लिए विदेश में गये, लेकिन 1950 का भारत सरकार का जो नियम है कि अगर कोई व्यक्ति अपने रेजिडेंस से 6 महीने से ज्यादा बाहर रहता है, दूसरे देश में चला जाता है तो उसका वोटर लिस्ट से नाम काट दिया जाता है। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ...(व्यवधान)


**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** अर्जुन राय जी, अब समाप्त करिये।

**श्री अर्जुन राय :** केवल विदेश में ही नहीं, हम ग्रामीण परिवेश के लोग हैं, मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि इस देश में भी व्यक्ति पंजाब, हरियाणा, सूरत, महाराष्ट्र में बिहार से काम करने के लिए आते हैं, उनका नाम भी वोटर लिस्ट से काट दिया जाता है। विदेश की बात तो दूर है, देश में रहने वाले व्यक्ति का नाम भी काट दिया जाता है। जिस गरीब व्यक्ति का छोटे से केस में नाम है, चुनाव के वक्त उसका नाम वोटर लिस्ट से काटकर उसे वोट से वंचित कर दिया जाता है। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो बिल ये लाये हैं, उस बिल के प्रावधानों से अप्रवासी भारतीय वोट कैसे डालेंगे?...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया:** अब आप समाप्त कर दीजिए, बैठ जाइये। अब आप समाप्त करिए। अपना स्थान ग्रहण करिए।

**श्री अर्जुन राय :** प्रवासी भारतीय वोट कैसे डालेंगे? डाक से डालेंगे, ई-मेल से डालेंगे या आकर डालेंगे, इस पर इन्होंने कोई चर्चा नहीं की है। बिहार में एक घुमक्कड़ वर्ग के लोग हैं, जो नट जाति के लोग हैं। उनका घर कहीं नहीं है और न ही उनका कहीं वोटर लिस्ट में नाम है। ...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप समाप्त करिए।

**श्री अर्जुन राय :** अध्यक्ष महोदया, हम आपके माध्यम से  मनीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहते हैं कि जो घुमक्कड़ लोग हैं, जिनका कोई घर नहीं है, जो इस देश के वासी हैं, उनका नाम कैसे वोटर लिस्ट में जुड़ेगा?

इन्हीं बातों के साथ मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ।

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (CHENNAI NORTH): Madam Speaker, at the outset, I welcome this amendment but I have one or two points of clarification which I would like to ask from the hon. Minister.

श्री गणेश सिंह (सतना): अध्यक्ष महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। माननीय सदस्य अपनी सीट पर नहीं हैं।

MADAM SPEAKER: Is this your seat?

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN : Yes, Madam.

MADAM SPEAKER: Then, what is your problem? Mr. Elangovan, please continue.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN : Madam, under Section 2, amendment 20A (1) says:

“Notwithstanding anything contained in this Act, every citizen of India,-  
 (a) whose name is not included in the electoral roll;  
 (b) who has not acquired the citizenship of any other country; ...”

Now when we are providing dual citizenship to the Indian origin people, I would like to know whether he is eligible to enroll his name in the voters' list of India. It is because he has already acquired the citizenship of some other country.

Secondly, hitherto the rule says that a person who is not ordinarily a resident of an area can register his vote. Now that this amendment removes the words 'ordinarily resident' so an Indian who is not ordinarily a resident of a specific area when his name is registered in the voters' list of that area, when he shifts his residence to some other place, whether the Electoral Registration Officer has the powers to delete his name on his own. That is my question. There are Electoral Registration rules and under these rules before deleting the name, the Electoral Registration Officer has certain steps to follow. He has to put the names on the display board for the person to verify. But many times the names are deleted without the knowledge of the voter himself. So, the Government should have some punitive measures and fix the responsibility on the Electoral Registration Officers so that the names are not deleted in an inappropriate manner.

With these words, I support the amendment.

\*SHRI NAVEEN JINDAL : This Bill fulfills a long felt demand of the people of India who have migrated to other countries but have their faith and loyalty to their motherland and want to ensure that they are also an equal partner in the process of electing the Government for the country.

The Government should now find out ways to ensure that not only these people are registered as voters but are also able to cast their votes through Internet, Proxy or Postal Ballot or any other convenient mode of voting in case they are not physically present at the place of voting where their names would be registered at the place of voting.

I am also grateful to the Hon. Prime Minister for having fulfilled his promise given in the last NRI's Conference. Having said that I would like to invite the attention of this August House through you to an equally important issue. This is regarding providing voting rights to the migratory population within the country who are not able to be present at the place of voting on the voting day where their name is registered.

It is a matter of deep concern that relates to upholding the voting rights of all citizens in India. Our democracy is based on the basic framework of ensuring the right to vote of all citizens who are eligible to vote. But in practice, the enforcement of this right is significantly undermined by the existing legal and regulatory regime.

The fact of the matter is that a significant number of our citizens are not able to exercise their right to vote. For instance, there are no provisions in the Indian Law to enable millions of migrant workers, students studying at a place other than where their names are registered, traveling business professionals, senior or unwell citizens who may not be able to travel to the polling booth to exercise their right to vote in any alternative manner.

The right to vote under the Indian law flows from both the Constitution of India and the Representation of the People Act of 1950 and 1951 as amended from time to time and the Rules framed there-under. A citizen of India, who has completed 18 years of age, has a right to be registered as a voter in a constituency irrespective of his or her race,

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

religion, caste or sex. Given the democratic aspirations of the citizens of India and India's global standing as the world's largest and one of the most vibrant democracies, there is a case for providing a stronger constitutional foundation for strengthening the right to vote.

The best practices that prevail in different parts of the world demonstrate that governments need to make substantial efforts to ensure greater participation of their citizenry in the electoral process. A number of developed countries implement various forms of absentee voting such as internet voting (Switzerland, US, France, etc.), Proxy Voting (Netherlands) and postal voting, which has emerged as the most popular form of absentee voting. People in countries such as the US, UK, Switzerland, Australia and some other countries have benefited by implementing postal voting measures with a view to providing greater access to the people towards exercising their right to vote. India does implement a limited form of postal voting, but the regulation covers very few people to create a meaningful impact towards making the electoral process more inclusive. For instance, the conduct of Election Rules 1961 in section 18 (a) provides for a list of persons entitled to vote by post in a parliamentary or assembly constituency; special voters (e.g. the President of India, Vice-President of India, Governors etc); service voters (e.g. armed forces, member of a force to which the Army Act applies, etc.); voters on election duty (e.g. Polling agent, pooling officer etc.); and electors subjected to preventive detention. This provision provides for the right to vote for certain specified categories of persons in India, but still leaves out a large number of people who have difficulties in exercising their legitimate right provided for enabling: "...Any persons belonging to a class of persons notified by the Election Commission in consultation with the Government to give this vote by postal ballot..." While this provision provides scope for the recognition of a "class of persons" to be entitled to exercise their right to vote by way of postal ballot, it has been used in the past for a limited number of cases concerning migrants from Jammu and Kashmir, and Bru and Reang tribal migrants from Mizoram and Tripura, For allowing this provision of a new "class of persons" can be identified by



the Election Commissioner of India in consultation with the Government of India with a view to granting the right to vote by postal ballot for a larger group of persons.

A large number of Indian citizens, for a variety of reasons including travel, illness, disability and personal difficulties including education, employment and other innumerable reasons may not be able to physically be present on the day of the elections in the constituencies where their vote is registered. In the true spirit of Indian democracy, it is imperative that we make efforts to expand the postal ballot system to include all Indian citizens to exercise their right to vote by post. The purpose of this effort to make the electoral process in India far more inclusive and far less cumbersome, so that each and every Indian is able to exercise not only the right to vote, but also have the opportunity to vote.

In the end, I am trying to seek the facility of exercising legitimate voting right by an individual, who for reasons stated earlier by me is not able to present himself at the place of voting on the date polling is held. If the person concerned is able to produce satisfactory evidence to convince the poll conducting machinery of his reasons of absence from the place of voting, then the poll officials should facilitate his exercising of right of poll either through postal ballot or by an authorized proxy or in any other manner considered convenient and desirable by them. I appreciate the efforts of the Chief Election Commissioner and the official machinery under him in providing voting facility to persons residing in remote areas, high altitudes and the like. On the same analogy this facility may be extended to the category of the people which I have just mentioned.

I request you to kindly consider seeking law reforms and policy changes for upholding the right to vote of all Indian citizens as suggested by me above.

With these few words, I again compliment the Hon. Minister of Law.

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN (KASARGOD): Madam, I am really happy and I congratulate the hon. Minister for bringing this legislation in this august House. Though it was not scheduled for today, but he has taken special efforts.

This has been a matter which is being discussed for a long time. We were rejecting their right to vote. But there is no reason for rejecting their right. As far as the present law is concerned, a person who resides in his house or in his locality, his name can be included in the voter list. If he is out of the country either for employment or for education, his name is not included. There are lakhs of people who work abroad but they have families and properties here. They are paying taxes also. But the Government says that they have no voting rights. So, the stand which was taken earlier has no validity at all. The Government has realized the fact that this has to be admitted. So, I fully agree with this law.

Madam, I would speak strictly on the provisions of the Bill and not on other political issues, as has been mentioned by some others here, which has no relevance to the Bill at all.

As I understand, there could be some problems in the implementation of some of the provisions of this Bill because there are millions of people who work outside the country. Elections may take place in India or in the State of Kerala on a stipulated date and these people may not be able to come and exercise their voting rights because they may not get permission to come either from their owners or from their employers. That is one of the difficulties. I do not want to take much time of the House. While I appreciate the provisions of the Bill, I would like to point out some of the problems being faced by the NRI people.

The functions of the Embassy in various countries have to be strengthened. What we feel is that there is insufficient staff especially in the embassies of the Gulf countries. There are about 25 million NRIs and out of that 32 lakhs are from the State of Kerala alone. They have not gone there for pleasure trips, or for honeymoon trips or for any other purposes. They have gone there for reasons of getting employment in order to provide some assistance to their families which also in turn provides assistance to the

nation. Last year, a sum of Rs. 24,000 crore came by way of foreign earnings from the Gulf countries alone. In the year preceding last year a sum of Rs. 32,000 crore came by way of foreign earnings. But, what have we done for these people? That is really the question. In the last three Budgets we have not made any rehabilitation scheme for these people, particularly insofar as the people from the State of Kerala are concerned. During the time of global recession they contributed by way of foreign exchange a sum of Rs. 80,000 crore. We are, in some form or other, getting crores and crores of rupees because of their working outside the country, but we are not able to give anything to them. So, I would like to request the Government to make some provisions for the people of Kerala. The State has made some provisions like providing for pension schemes and some other welfare measures. But it is not possible to make such provisions by the State alone. There are lakhs of people from States like Kerala, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka and some other States who are working outside the country. So, my first demand is that the Government should make a special scheme for them and also the functioning of the embassies should be strengthened.

Madam, the most important issue is about the sponsors and the agents who are working in India. They are really the persons who are recruiting people. There are both kinds of people, good and bad, engaged in this. When some of these sponsors and agents recruit people, they promise them better wages, better employment wages etc. But what we see in reality is that they cheat even the poor people and those people after having gone there have no money even to come back to their native country. So, the Government should take measures with regard to the proper scrutiny of the sponsors and the agents. At the same time they should not be blamed because they are doing a good job. I fully appreciate that and I also welcome this legislation.

**\*श्री रतन सिंह (भरतपुर):** महोदय, माननीय विधि मंत्री महोदय लोक प्रतिनिधित्व अधिनियम 1950 में संशोधन करने वाले बिल को संसद में स्वीकृति हेतु लाये हैं। मैं इसका पुरजोर समर्थन करता हूँ। इस बिल के माध्यम से भारतीय नागरिक जो किसी भी कार्य से विदेशों में गये हुए हैं, उनको मतदान करने का अधिकार मिलेगा, जो कि उनका मौलिक अधिकार है एवं भारत के निर्माण में सक्रिय तौर पर मतदान द्वारा उनका सहयोग मिल सकेगा।

सादन निवदेन हे कि सरकार द्वारा निर्धारित प्रक्रिया के तहत ऐसे सभी प्रवासी भारतीयों के पहचान पत्र निर्धारित समय में बनवाये जायें एवं उन्हें चुनाव प्रक्रिया में भाग लेने के लिए नियमानुसार अधिकृत किया जाये।

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

SHRI B. MAHTAB (CUTTACK): Madam, Speaker, thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. As has been stated by the hon. Minister that India has the second largest overseas community which is estimated at 25 million people spanning over 189 countries around the world. The remittances, as was mentioned by my predecessor speaker, received from overseas community have increased by seven to eight per cent to the tune of US dollar 46.9 billion during the year 2008-09.

Madam, I would deal with four issues, which I think, the hon. Minister can explain. The four issues which arise from this Bill are, firstly, the mode of voting. How they would come to vote? It has been restricted in this Bill saying that the person who carries a passport has to be registered in the place from where the passport has been issued. The residence is notified there. He will be entitled in the voters' list and he will come to cast his vote in that polling booth. Only a patriotic Indian can demonstrate their patriotism but that patriotism will cost them dearly. It has been mentioned in other countries. Several countries facilitate exercise of franchise through postal ballot as it is in countries like the United States, Spain, Italy, Portugal, Canada and in the United Kingdom.

**17.00 hrs.**

It may be in Embassies and Consulates of Poland, Lithuania Ukraine, Columbia, Venezuela, Peru, France, Russia, Sweden, Philippines, Japan, Dominican Republic and Spain. They can also cast their vote through Internet as it is being done in France. We are not going into this aspect. We are asking NRIs to come down to our country, to go to their polling booth and cast their vote. It becomes very costly. This is one point.

The other point which I would like to mention here is about contesting in an election. As far as common knowledge demonstrates, the one who is enrolled in the voters list is eligible to contest. Who is eligible to be enrolled in the voting list? A person who is above the age of 18 years. Who can contest for Parliament and the Assembly seat? A person who is 25 years of age. A person who is 35 years of age can contest for President and Vice-President of India. To contest for Rajya Sabha, one should be of 30 years of age. But here, once a person is enrolled in the voters' list, can he

contest? The Bill is silent on this point. I would like to get an answer from the Minister on this point.

Another great aspect in this Bill is, we are maintaining a double standard. We have not discussed this aspect. I do not know whether it has been discussed in the other House or not. Do the persons who are serving outside, who are sending money to our country, which is no doubt a great thing, pay tax? A person who is a voter in this country pays tax. And here, a provision is being made, it may come up later on, on this Bill. We may witness that problem later on, that is, a person who is not paying tax is becoming eligible to contest, to cast his vote and to form a Government for which he is not paying any tax in this country. This needs to be explained.

Lastly, I would like to mention about deletion from the electoral roll. That is a great problem and it deals with the Election Commission and there is no doubt about it. But it needs to be addressed. We have seen the manner in which deletion of names are happening. We are contesting elections for many years. We have seen how names have been deleted randomly and arbitrarily. This needs to be addressed. In this respect, a lot of provisions have been made in this Bill but it has all been mentioned as 'as may be prescribed'. It means that rules will regulate it.

With these words, I would like that the Minister may tell us on certain points. We have Non-Resident Indians. We have Persons of Indian Origin and we have Overseas Citizens of India. For Overseas Citizens of India, there is an amendment of 2003 and 2005 which clearly state that they cannot contest to become MPs, judge, MLAs or hold higher offices.

I would conclude by saying that this Bill accommodates the concern and specifies the deletion from electoral rolls. It can happen after proper verification of facts in such a manner as may be prescribed. But the Bill is not clear with regard to the rights of permanent residents of other countries. It does not deal with citizens. It deals with permanent residents of other countries. Is an Indian citizen who holds permanent resident status or a green card in the US eligible to come here and vote? This needs to be clarified.

With these words, I conclude.

MADAM SPEAKER: I request Dr. Sanjeev Naik, Shri E.T. Mohammed Basheer, Shri Prasant Kumar Majumdar and Shri Anto Antony to lay their speeches on the Table of the House. The hon. Minister may reply now.

... (*Interruptions*)

\*SHRI ANTO ANTONY : First of all, I appreciate the Government in its decision to grant voting rights to the non-resident Indians (NRIs). Amendment of the People's Representation Act 1950 in this regard will be a great relief for the crores of NRIs who are contributing a lot for the development of the country.

I represent a State and a Constituency where the contribution of the NRIs is one of the major sources of income. According to a study conducted in 2006 there exists at least one bread-winner abroad in 15.8% families in Kerala.

In this modern era, 'right to vote' is considered as one of the fundamental rights of a citizen. In view of this fact, many countries have granted voting rights to their overseas citizens. Developments in the field of technology have made it possible to overseas citizens to cast franchise in the electoral process of their mother country. Having understood the developments across the world, our Government is also going to introduce voting rights to our overseas citizens.

On this occasion I have some humble suggestions before the Government. Section 19 of our People's Representation Act says that citizen to avail voting rights should be an ordinary resident in his/her constituency. However, Section 20 of the Act negates voting rights to NRIs on the ground that they are not the ordinary residents in any of the constituencies in India.

However, Section 20 stipulates that voting rights shall not be denied to a person, who temporarily vacates his residence; a patient, who undergoes treatment in mental asylum; or prisoners who are undergoing imprisonment. This Section, in fact, emphasizes the truth that an NRI shall not even be treated at par with a prisoner. This is against all canons of political propriety and democratic principles, for they are denied the basic right to participate in the democratic process of the nation. therefore, I request the Government to amend Section 19 and 20 of the People's Representation Act, so that the NRIs will be registered in to the voters list and able to cast their votes.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table



Granting of voting right to the NRIs will be justified only if the Government can make necessary arrangements that allow them to cast their vote in their host countries. Otherwise, a large number of NRIs will not be able to register their votes. This condition is none other than negating their right to vote. Many countries are allowing their nationals working in abroad to exercise adult franchise through embassies. India can also follow this method by making necessary arrangements in our High Commissions. Therefore, I request the Government to include provision to ensure that NRIs can register their votes in our missions abroad.

Moreover, I also request the Government to include provisions to identify the Constituency of the NRIs as per the address mentioned in their passports.

Once again I appreciate the intention of the Government for the noble cause of the NRIs and also request to kindly consider my suggestions regarding the implementation of the voting rights to the NRIs

**\*श्री ए.टी. नाना पाटील (जलगांव):** महोदय, सरकार द्वारा इंडियन मेडिकल काउंसिल सेंटर बिल 2010 पेश किया गया है। इसमें यूनानी और सोपा रिग्वा उपचार पद्धतियों को रिकग्नाईज करने का उपबंध किया गया है। आज देश में स्वास्थ्य सुविधा की भारी कमी है और स्वास्थ्य सुविधा आम आदमी के लिए कठिन और असाध्य हो रही है। हमारे यहां एलोपैथिक उपचार पद्धतियों के द्वारा अधिकतर उपचार किया जा रहा है। इसमें काफी संशोधन भी हो रहा है। इससे नई नई उपचार पद्धतियां भी आ रही हैं। हमारे यहां जीवन पद्धतियों में आ रहे बदलावों के कारण भी आज कैंसर, हृदय रोग, मधुमेह जैसे बड़े रोग हो रहे हैं, इसका सार्वजनिक फैलाव भी हो रहा है। ऐसे रोगों के लिए एलोपैथिक औषधियों के द्वारा उपचार सही हो सकता है लेकिन हमारी जो पारंपरिक औषधियां हैं, उसके द्वारा रोगों को समूल नष्ट करने का कार्य होता है। सदियों से पारंपरिक पद्धति से यह उपचार प्रणाली आज की ग्रामीण, जनजातीय क्षेत्र में दिखाई देती है। अगर हमने हमारी उपचार पद्धतियों पर जोर दिया होता तो आज हमें एलोपैथिक प्रणाली पर निर्भर रहने की आवश्यकता नहीं होती। दूसरी बात है कि सरकार ने एलोपैथिक औषधियों की तरह हमारी पारंपरिक औषधियों के लिए आवश्यक संशोधन और इसकी वैज्ञानिक उपयोगिता के बारे में कभी कोशिश नहीं की है इसलिए हमारी आयुर्वेदिक, यूनानी तथा अन्य उपचार पद्धतियां आज उपेक्षित हो रही हैं। सरकार ने हाल ही में आयुष विभाग के द्वारा जिला स्तर के रुग्णालयों में आयुष उपचार के माध्यम से आयुर्वेद के उपचार की सुविधा उपलब्ध कराई है। इसे लोगों का अच्छा प्रतिसाद मिल रहा है। लेकिन हमें अपनी उपचार पद्धतियों को विश्व स्तर पर मान्यता प्राप्त कराने के लिए इसके उपचार पद्धति की विशेषता और उपयोगिता साबित करनी होगी। साथ में इसके वैज्ञानिक कसौटी पर भी हमें आगे बढ़ना होगा। आज हमारी उपेक्षा के कारण कडूनीम, हल्दी आदि उपयोगी वनस्पती औषधियों के पेटेंट विदेश स्थित कंपनियों द्वारा प्राप्त किये जा रहे हैं। इसका हमें ध्यान रखना होगा। सरकार ने पारंपरिक उपचार पद्धतियों के लिए एक अच्छा कदम उठाया है, मैं इसका समर्थन कर, अपना भाषण समाप्त करता हूं।

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

\*SHRI MOHAMMED E.T. BASHEER : This is a golden moment in the history of Indian democracy.

All Indians can be proud of the greatness of our democracy. It goes without saying that in the democracy, power is held by the citizens under a free electoral system. In a democracy people from all walks of life can ultimately decide the things and have opportunity to participate on the process of governance. Thereby they can mark their presence in the society. I am quite happy to note that this government is dedicated to make our democracy meaningful. While passing this kind of legislations, glorious memories of the great leaders like pundit Jawaharlal Nehru who guided us through the initial stage of parliamentary democratic process inspire us more on our duties and responsibilities.

Shri Manmohan Singh, who is in that chair now, declared in the Pravasi Bharatiya Diwas at Delhi “I recognize the legitimate demand of Indians living abroad to excise the franchise and have a say in who governs India.”

Yes, the legitimate rights of NRIs have been recognized by him with the blessing of Smt. Sonia Gandhi. Shri Veerappamoily, while piloting this bill, in the Rajya Sabha yesterday, expressed his gratification in bringing out such an Amendment and Hon’ble Minister for NRIs, Shri Vayalar Ravi, has expressed his gratitude to all the concerned for bringing out these amendments to the Representation of Peoples Act.

After this bill is passed, NRIs who are physically present in India, at the time of elections, can cast their votes. This bill is a fine-tuned version of Amendment proposed in 2006 in the light of the Standing Committee recommendations.

I wish to add that this is a much awaited legislation. Many years have lapse in fulfilling this cherished dream.

We all must realize a fact that NRIs are to be treated with all the facilities that we are enjoying in this main land. A country would be thankless if they forget those citizens who are not physically present here. There are around 25 million NRIs around the world.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

They all will be quite happy to hear this news. While congratulating the Government, may I submit that, all the Indians living abroad should be able to vote from there itself. In this era of digital technological advancement, this should not be a problem. Countries like US, Spain, Italy, Portugal, Canada, UK, Poland, Lithuania, Ukraine, Columbia, Venezuela, Peru, France Russia, Sweden, Philippines and Japan have already implemented this either through internet voting or through embassies.

I appeal the Government to think in a wider angle and try to make a situation through which all the NRIs can vote from any part of the world.

I once again express my heartfelt congratulations and conclude saying that this is another feather on the cap of UPA.

**\*श्री जगदम्बिका पाल (डुमरियागंज):** पिछले कई वर्षों से लगातार मांग उठ रही थी कि जो भारतीय विदेश चले गए हैं, वे यहां की चुनाव प्रणाली में हिस्सेदारी चाहते थे, लेकिन उन्हें अभी तक यह अवसर नहीं मिल रहा था, जबकि भारतीय विदेशों में शिक्षा, व्यापार अथवा अन्य कारणों से गये हैं और उनका नाम भारत की निर्वाचक नामावली में सम्मिलित नहीं है तथ उन लोगों ने किसी अन्य देश की नागरिकता अर्जित नहीं की है। जो किन्हीं कारणों से भारत से अनुपस्थित रहा हो, जो भारत से, अपने मामूली निवास स्थान से नियोजन, शिक्षा या अन्यथा भारत से बाहर हैं, उन्हें भी इस संशोधन से वोट देने का अधिकार प्राप्त होगा। भविष्य में प्रवासी भारतीयों के लिए अपने भारत में वोटिंग राइट मिलने जा रहा है। निःसन्देह यह संशोधन भारत के लोक प्रतिनिधित्व के विधेयक में एक पुरानी एवं प्रतीक्षित मांग पूरी हुई है। भविष्य में ऐसे निर्वाचन क्षेत्र की, जिसमें भारत में उसका ऐसा निवास, जो उसके पासपोर्ट में उल्लिखित है, अवस्थित है, वह निर्वाचक नामावली में अपना नाम रजिस्ट्रीकृत कराने का हकदार होगा। इस धारा के अधीन रजिस्ट्रीकृत प्रत्येक व्यक्ति को, यदि वह अपने मताधिकार का प्रयोग करने के लिए अन्यथा पात्र है, तो उसे उस निर्वाचन क्षेत्र में होने वाले किसी निर्वाचन में मतदान करने की अनुज्ञा दी जाएगी। विधेयक की धारा 28 का संशोधन, उसकी उपधारा (2) में खंड (ग) के पश्चात् निम्नलिखित खंड अन्तः स्थापित किए जाएंगे। धारा 28 के उपधारा (2) में धारा (गग), धारा 22 के अधीन निर्वाचक नामावलियों में किसी प्रविष्टि का संशोधन करने , उसे अन्यत्र रखने या निकालने के लिए तथ्यों के समुचित सत्यापन की प्रक्रिया होगी। इसी तरह (गगग) धारा 23 की उपधारा (2) के अधीन निर्वाचक नामावलियों में नामों को सम्मिलित करने या काटने के लिए तथ्यों के समुचित सत्यापन की प्रक्रिया अपनाई जाएगी। विश्व के 189 देशों में 35 लाख विदेशों में प्रवासी भारतीय हैं। इस विधेयक में चार महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दे संशोधन से जुड़े हैं। ऐसी संशोधन भारतीयों के लिए जो उनके मन में देश भक्ति है, उसे वोट का अधिकार देने से उनके मन की इच्छा पूरी होगी इस संशोधन से प्रवासी भारतीय एक तो इस मुल्क में जहां से उसके पासपोर्ट में एड्रेस है, वहां से वोट देने का अधिकार है, वहीं दूसरी तरफ भारत आने का और अपने मातृभूमि से लगाव भी प्रदर्शित करने का अवसर भी सुलभ होगा। आज भी लोक प्रतिनिधित्व के निर्वाचक नियमावली के सूचियों में व्यावहारिक रूप से काफी त्रुटि मिलती है। कभी-कभी वोटर लिस्ट से वास्तविक मतदाताओं के नाम भी काट दिए जाते हैं। मैं आभारी रहूंगा

यदि माननीय मंत्री जी भविष्य के लिए शत प्रतिशत वोटर कार्ड तथा सत्यापित वोटर लिस्ट को भी दुरुस्त करने की कार्यवाही सुनिश्चित करें। भविष्य में इंटरनेट से वोट देने की व्यवस्था पर सरकार को विचार करना चाहिए।

मैं इसी के साथ माननीय मंत्री जी द्वारा प्रस्तुत लोक प्रतिनिधित्व संशोधन विधेयक का समर्थन करता हूं।

\*SHRI S.S. RAMASUBBU (TIRUNELVELI): I support this Bill.

The main aim of the Bill is to allow the NRI to cast their vote in India where there is an election in their respected area. It is their legitimate right to vote if they are having their name in the voter list.

Our beloved leader Rajeev Gandhi during his regime provided the opportunity to the youngsters who were in the age of 18 could also cast their vote. He brought such a historical amendment that the voters age was reduced from 21 to 18.

Now the amendment bill gives opportunity for more than 22 million NRI, who are living in various centres for the purpose of job and education.

The Bill should clarify whether they can cast their votes directly in India or they can vote in countries in which they are occupying.

The Government should be aware that the foreign element should not take the advantage in defeating genuine people internally.

There should not be any double entry if they are having dual citizenship.

Anyhow it is a welcome decision to give the right through this bill to get the voting chance.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

\*DR. SANJEEV GANESH NAIK (THANE): I want to raise only three issues.

(i) The person who is staying outside the country will be allowed to be a prospective candidate for contesting any election like local body and assembly election and general election.

(ii) How would that person cast his vote from the country where he is staying and what is the mechanism to cast the vote.

(iii) How the person will enroll his name in the voter list by which form and how he will get the form (1) by internet (2) by post.

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY): Madam Speaker, I am highly grateful for the overwhelming support expressed by the hon. Members for this Bill.

Insofar as the provisions which have come before this House in the form of an amendment conferring voting rights to the NRIs, I think, it is undisputed. None of them has disputed any of these provisions. But certain additional information has been sought. I will make an attempt to answer some of them.

Coming to internet voting, we have not introduced that in India. When necessary, when technical feasibility and infrastructure is made available in this country, we may then go to that extent of exercising vote through the internet.

Another question which I would like to answer here is about the option of registering in any constituency. If the option of registering in any constituency is allowed, there may be a danger of multiple registration. We have to find out another solution to resolve this kind of a problem. National Register is a different matter altogether, not related to voting. So, I do not want to deal with it further.

Another question was with regard to the credibility of EVMs. As far as the EVMs are concerned, this issue has been examined a number of times. A Technical Expert Committee headed by Prof. P.V. Indiresan, who was the former Director of IIT, Chennai, totally examined it and then gave a finding that it is tamper proof. Of course, allegations have been made against the EVMs. But till today, nobody is able to disprove this. Of course, this is a matter which is agitating the minds of hon. Members of the House. A number of times it has been replied to and ultimately this is the finding as on today.

**श्री लालू प्रसाद (सारण):** अच्छी वाली मशीन लाकर आपको दिखा दिया और जो मैनीपुलेशन होती है, उसके बारे में नहीं बोल रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** लालू प्रसाद जी, आप बैठ जाइए। मंत्री जी को बोलने दीजिए।

**श्री लालू प्रसाद :** अच्छी वाली मशीन आपको दिखा दी और जो मैनीपुलेशन करते हैं, वह नहीं दिखाया।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप बैठ जाइए।

**श्री लालू प्रसाद :** इसमें गड़बड़ है।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप बैठ जाइए। मंत्री जी को बोलने दीजिए।



SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY: It is mentioned by the hon. Members that Election Commission has made 24 proposals for a comprehensive amendment to the election laws. In fact, they have made 22 proposals. Out of these 22 proposals, we have already implemented six proposals through the Representation of People (Amendment) Act of 2009. This very House has passed it.

Insofar as other proposals are concerned, they are before the Departmentally Related Standing Committee. As and when it gives the Report, we will definitely come forth with the amendment. ... (*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Minister, you can address the Chair.

SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY: It is an ideal situation where we have ID cards for everyone. We are making all-round efforts to ensure that every voter will have an ID card. We will make all those efforts. Of course, attempts have been made before too. But till today that could not be done.

I would like to mention that our Ministry is making all-round efforts to have comprehensive electoral reforms. Maybe within two or three months' time we will be holding two-day national consultation and all those proposals which are coming would be examined. If necessary, we will definitely come forward to this House for a comprehensive amendment of electoral reforms.

With these words, I conclude. I commend the Bill for consideration.

MADAM SPEAKER: The question is:

“That the Bill further to amend the Representation of the People Act, 1950, as passed by the Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration.”

*The motion was adopted.*

MADAM SPEAKER: Now the House will take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill.

The question is:

“That clauses 2 to 5 stand part of the Bill.”



*The motion was adopted.*

*Clauses 2 to 5 were added to the Bill.*

*Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Long Title were added to the Bill.*

SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY: I beg to move:

“That the Bill be passed.”

MADAM SPEAKER: The question is:

“That the Bill be passed.”

*The motion was adopted.*

---

**17.19 hrs.****VALEDICTORY REFERENCE**

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, the fifth session of the Fifteenth Lok Sabha, which commenced on 26<sup>th</sup> July, 2010 is coming to a close today.

During the Session, we had 26 sittings spread over 136 hours and ten minutes

The Session saw the disposal of important Financial, Legislative and other Business. Discussion on Supplementary Demands for Grants (General) for 2010-11 lasted for 3 hours and 27 minutes before the demands were voted and the related Appropriation Bill was passed.

A discussion on Supplementary Demands for Grants in respect of the State of Jharkhand 2010-11, lasted for 1 hour and 21 minutes before the demands were voted and the related Appropriation Bill was passed.

Discussion on the Supplementary Demands for Grants (Railways) 2010-11 was held on 19<sup>th</sup> August, 2010. The debate lasted for over 2 hours and 40 minutes, and the Demands were voted and the Appropriation Bill was passed.

During the Session, 18 Bills were introduced and 20 Bills were passed. Some of the important Bills passed were the Securities and Insurance Laws (Amendment and Validation) Bill, 2010; the State Bank of India (Amendment) Bill, 2010; the Industrial Disputes (Amendment) Bill, 2010; the Foreign Trade (Development and Regulation) Amendment Bill, 2010; the Code of Criminal Procedure (Amendment) Bill, 2010; the Indian Medical Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010; the Personal Laws (Amendment) Bill, 2010; the Mines and Minerals (Development and Regulation) Amendment Bill, 2010; the Civil Liability for Nuclear Damage Bill, 2010; the Educational Tribunals Bill, 2010; the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Bill, 2010; Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2010; and the Representation of the People (Amendment) Bill, 2010.

During the Session, 460 Starred Questions were listed, out of which 46 Questions could be answered orally. Thus, on an average, about 1.91 Questions could be answered per day. Written replies to the remaining Starred Questions along with 5,283 Unstarred

Questions were laid on the Table. Unfortunately, the Question Hour was disrupted on 11 days and Questions listed on those days could not be answered by the concerned Ministers orally.

One half-an-hour discussion was raised by Shri Rudra Madhab Ray on the availability of Fertilizers and the Minister replied thereto.

About 314 matters of urgent public importance were raised by the Members after the Question Hour and by sitting late in the evening. Hon. Members also raised 276 matters under Rule 377.

The Standing Committees presented 45 Reports to the House.

The House also held six short duration discussions under Rule 193 on the subjects of urgent public importance.

Out of the six discussions, discussion concluded on the four discussions, namely, (i) the situation arising out of delay in preparation for Commonwealth Games, 2010; (ii) on Bhopal Gas Tragedy; (iii) Flood and drought situation in the country; and (iv) situation arising out of increasing atrocities against Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the country. Two short duration discussions on the (i) illegal mining in various States; and (ii) on the Statement made by the Minister of Home Affairs in the House on 4<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 regarding the situation in Jammu and Kashmir remained part-discussed.

The House also held discussions on two Motions on important subjects, namely, (i) inflationary pressure on the economy and its adverse impact on the common man; and (ii) on the issues of Population Stabilization in the country

During the Session, seven matters were raised by way of Calling Attention, namely, (i) the situation arising out of recent spurt in the incidents of "Honour Killings" in the country; (ii) situation arising out of rampant adulteration of food and edible substances in the country; (iii) the situation arising out of economic blockade by Naga Organisations on the National Highway Nos. 39 and 53 in Manipur; (iv) rehabilitation of Sri Lankan Tamil Internally Displaced Persons (IDPS); (v) the need to include Bhojpuri and Rajasthani languages in the Eighth Schedule to the Constitution; (vi) situation arising out of recent attacks on Indian Fishermen by Sri Lankan Navy; and (vii) the situation

arising out of rejection of 40 lakh tonnes of rice variety PAU-201 by the Food Safety Standards Authority of India citing provisions of Prevention of Food Adulteration Act, 1954 and Food Safety Standards Act, 2006. In response to these Calling Attention, the Ministers concerned made Statements and also replied to the clarifications sought by Members.

As many as 57 Statements were made by the Ministers on various other important subjects and four Statements were made by Hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs on Government Business.

Coming to the Private Members' Business, 24 Private Members' Bills were introduced during the Session. Discussion on a Bill, the Compulsory Voting Bill, 2009 seeking to provide for compulsory voting in elections to the House of the People or Legislative Assemblies by every eligible citizen of the country, which had remained part-discussing during the last Session, was further discussed on 13<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 and was withdrawn by leave of the House by Shri J.P. Agarwal, the Member-in-charge of the Bill. Another Bill, namely, the Child Welfare Bill, 2009 seeking to provide for various measures for welfare of children moved by Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury on 13<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 remained part-discussed.

Discussion on Private Members' Resolution regarding identification of families living below poverty line and welfare measures for them moved by Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh on 21<sup>st</sup> April, 2010 during the last Session continued on 6<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> August, 2010. The Resolution was withdrawn by Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh on 21<sup>st</sup> August, 2010. Another Resolution regarding special status to the State of Bihar, moved by Dr. Bhola Singh on 21<sup>st</sup> August, 2010, remained part-discussed.

Hon. Members, we lost 45 hours of time due to interruptions and forced adjournments. Parliament is meant for debates and discussions. Any matter permissible under the Constitution and Rules of Procedure can be discussed here. But the trend of disrupting the proceedings days on end is alarming and, if not checked, will ultimately lead to unforeseen consequences. Political parties and individuals should seriously ponder over the irreparable damage being done to parliamentary democracy by such



disruptions. We are sitting here today because of the sacrifices of countless patriotic Indians. The institution of Parliament is the magnificent legacy of the glorious struggle for independence. It is the sacred duty of successive generations to preserve and protect this institution. I call upon all concerned to resolve to preserve the sanctity of Parliament. Let informed debates and discussions take place inside the Chamber at all time instead of slogans and mock discussions.

I would like to thank the hon. Deputy Speaker and my colleagues in the Panel of Chairmen for their help and cooperation in the completion of Business of the House. I am extremely grateful to the hon. Prime Minister, Leader of the House, the Leader of the Opposition, Chairperson of UPA, Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, Leaders of various Parties and Groups as well as the Chief Whips apart from the hon. Members for their cooperation. I would also like to thank, on behalf of all of you, our friends in the Media. I take this opportunity to compliment the Secretary-General for his competent and expert assistance. I thank the officers and staff of the Lok Sabha Secretariat for their dedicated and prompt service to the House. I also thank the allied agencies for their able assistance in the conduct of the proceedings of the House.

Members may now stand up as *Vande Mataram* would be played.

**17.22 hrs.**

**NATIONAL SONG**

*(The National Song was played.)*

**17.23 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned sine die.*

---