

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF
SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES
(1987-88)**

(EIGHTH LOK SABHA)

TWENTY-NINTH REPORT

MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION

**Reservations for, and Employment of Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes in Air India.**



Presented to Lok Sabha on..... 12 NOV 1987
Laid in Rajya Sabha on..... 12 NOV 1987

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

301.43R
P17

June, 1987/Asadha, 1909 (Saka)
Price : Rs. 4.00

CORRIGENDA

to

the 29th Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes on the Ministry of Civil Aviation - Reservations for, and employment of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in Air India.

<u>Page</u>	<u>Para</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Correction</u>
(v)	1	4	<u>Add for after Reservations</u>
4	2.1	-	<u>For 162/3% read 16.2/3%</u>
	Col.2 of (b)		
5	2.1	-	<u>For 7¹/₂% read 7¹/₂%</u>
	Col.3 of		
8	2.12	10	<u>For recommended read</u> recommend
15	3.1(13)	7	<u>For athority read</u> authority
17	3.6	6	<u>For examination read</u> examination
19	3.17	3	<u>For witing read</u> writing
22	3.28(ii)	1	<u>For section read</u> selection
23	3.29(3)	1	<u>For SI/ST read</u> SC/ST
24	3.32	2	<u>For shortful read</u> shortfal.
25	3.32	10	<u>For SC/IT read</u> SC/ST
	last word		
30	3.41	1	<u>For delected read</u> detected
30	3.42	5	<u>For wtness read</u> witness
32	3.52	7	<u>For recrutment read</u> recruitment
	(Recruitment)		
32	3.52	10	<u>For Penel read</u> Panel
	(Promotion)		

CONTENTS

PAGE NO.
(iii)

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER I—INTRODUCTORY

- A. Organisational set up 1
- B. Board of Directors 1

CHAPTER II—RESERVATIONS

- A. Reservation Orders and issue of Directives 4
- B. Liaison Officer and Cell 8

CHAPTER III—RECRUITMENT AND PROMOTIONS

- A. Recruitment Procedure 12
- B. Recruitment Boards/Departmental Promotion Committee 18
- C. Concessions/Relaxations 19
- D. Promotions 22
- E. Maintenance of Rosters 26
- F. Dereservation 31

CHAPTER IV—STAFF STRENGTH AND SHORTFALLS

- A. Staff Strength and Shortfalls 37
- B. In-service Training 43

CHAPTER V—MISCELLANEOUS

- A. Complaints/Grievances 45
- B. Reservation in Residential Quarters 46
- C. False Certificates 48
- D. Posting Abroad 52

APPENDICES

- I. Statement of complaints of false caste certificate
(vide Para 5.122 of the Report) 59
- II. Summary of conclusions/recommendations contained
in the Report 68

PARLIAMENTARY LIBRARY
(C... ..) (Microfilm)
7A-250.0
.....12-11-87

301.43R
M7

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED
CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES
(1987-88)**

Shri Ram Ratan Ram—*Chairman*

MEMBERS

Lok Sabha

2. **Shri Manoranjan Bhakta**
3. **Shri Bir Bal**
4. **Shri Somjibhai Damor**
5. **Shri Ganga Ram**
6. **Shri Manikrao Hodlya Gavit**
7. **Shri Maurice Kujur**
8. **Shri Kunwar Ram**
9. **Shri Lakshman Mallick**
10. **Shri Satyagopal Misra**
11. **Shri Arvind Netam**
12. **Shri Ram Pyare Panika**
13. **Dr. P. Vallal Peruman**
14. **Shri K.N. Pradhan**
15. **Dr. G. Vijaya Rama Rao**
16. **Shri Ajit Kumar Saha**
17. **Shri D.B. Shingda**
18. **Shri Ram Singh**
19. **Shri Ram Bahadur Singh**
20. **Shri R.P. Suman**

Rajya Sabha

21. **Shrimati Omem Moyong Deori**
22. **Dr. Faguni Ram**
23. **Shri Ramnarayan Goswami**

24. **Shri H. Hanumanthappa**
25. **Shri Radhakishan Malaviya**
26. **Shri Murasoli Maran**
27. **Shri Dharam Chander Prashant**
28. **Shri Thindivanam K. Ramamurthy**
29. **Shri Sukhdev Prasad**
30. **Shri Suraj Prasad**

SECRETARIAT

1. **Shri N.N. Mehra**—*Joint Secretary*
2. **Shri M.G. Agrawal**—*Chief Legislative Committee Officer*
3. **Shri D.M. Chanan**—*Chief Legislative Committee Officer*
4. **Shri Kuldip Sahai**—*Senior Legislative Committee Officer*

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, having been authorised by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, present this Twenty-Ninth Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Civil Aviation—Reservations, and employment of, Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Air India.

2. The Committee (1986-87) took evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Civil Aviation and Air India on the 24 December, 1986, 10 and 11 February, 24 and 25 March and 6 April, 1987. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the officers of the Ministry of Civil Aviation and Air India for placing before the Committee material and information the Committee wanted in connection with the examination of subject.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on the 29 June, 1987.

4. A summary of conclusions/recommendations contained in the Report is appended (see Appendix II)

NEW DELHI;
July 1, 1987
10 Asadha, 1909 (S)

RAM RATAN RAM
Chairman,
Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled
Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTORY

A. Organisational set up

The Committee have been informed that Air India is a statutory corporation which was established under the Air Corporations' Act, 1953. The general powers and functions of the Corporation are defined under Section 7 of the Air Corporations' Act, which *inter-alia* states that it shall be the function of the Corporation to provide safe, efficient, adequate, economical and properly coordinated air transport services whether internal or international or both and the Corporation shall so exercise its powers as to secure that the air transport services are developed to the best advantage and in particular so exercise these powers as to secure that the services are provided at reasonable charges.

1.2. The administration of the Corporation is divided into 16 departments headed by Directors/Deputy Directors who either directly or through Deputy Managing Directors are responsible to the Managing Director who is the Chief Executive of the Corporation. At the Ministry's level the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation looks after the working of the Corporation.

B. Board of Directors

1.3. Section 4(1) of the Air Corporations Act, 1953 provides that the general superintendence, direction and management of the affairs of the Corporation shall vest in a Board of Directors which may exercise all such powers and do all such acts and things as may be exercised or done by the Corporation.

1.4. Section 4(1-A) provides that the Board of Directors shall consist of a Chairman to be appointed by the Central Government, and not less than eight and not more than Fourteen other Directors to be appointed by the Central Government and the Chairman or any other Director may be required to render whole time or parttime service as the Central Government may direct. As intimated to the Committee by the Ministry of Civil Aviation, the composition of the present Board of Directors is as follows :

1. Shri Ratan Tata—Chairman
2. Shri Ranjan Jetley—Managing Director

3. Shri G.T. Pais—Director
4. Shri Sadanand Shetty—Director
5. Shri Dharni Sinha—Director
6. Shri Vivek Bharatram—Director
7. Shri Arun Nanda—Director
8. Prof. N.K. Singh—Director
9. Shri K.J.M. Shetty—Director
10. Shri H.K. Malik—Director

1.5. During their evidence on 24 December, 1986 the Committee enquired of the representatives of the Ministry of Civil Aviation whether any Director belonging to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe had been appointed on the Board. The Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation explained the position as under :

“In these things the Ministries are guided by the guidelines issued by B.P.E. or any other specific instruction about how the Board should be constituted. There has been recently a fresh guideline issued by the B.P.E. about the manner Boards from now onwards should be constituted. In the Central Government, there is a nodal Ministry for a specific subject like anything relating to Civil Aviation, or air transportation. In that, we are the nodal Ministry. If other Ministries have to take a view on that, they must consult us. It is under the rules of transactions of business laid down by the President. Now, about the function of public Enterprises, wage policy of public enterprises, how the Board should be constituted, how bonus should be paid, they relate to the nodal Department, the Department of Public Enterprises. Howsoever, we may wish to do a thing, whenever we have to take a policy issue on that matter, we have to consult that Department. That Department has issued instructions, a couple of months back, how the Boards of Directors should be constituted. That has been complied with in the recent Constitution of Boards of Air India and of the Indian Airlines. Those instructions do not contain any specific indication that we must have in this Board, a person belonging to Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe.”

1.6. The Committee regret to note that in the guidelines issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises relating to the appointment of Directors on the Board of Air India, there is no stipulation for appointment of persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee are of the view that with the reservation policy being in force over a number of years, these classes have been denied the opportunity all these years and hope that the Government will take action to include at least one person belonging to SC/ST in the Board of Directors of Air India.

CHAPTER II RESERVATIONS

A. Reservation orders and issue of Directives

2.1. The Committee have been informed by the Ministry of Civil Aviation through a note that the percentage of reservations made in Air-India in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and the date from which these are applicable in respect of posts filled by direct recruitment and posts filled by promotion are as follows :

(i) *Posts filled by direct recruitment*

Direct recruitment	Scheduled Castes	Scheduled Tribes	Date from which applicable
1	2	3	4
(a) Direct recruitment on all-India basis by means of open competitive test	12½% 15%	5% 7½%	Jan. 1966 March, 1970 onwards.
(b) Direct recruitment on all-India basis otherwise than as (a) above.	12½% 16.2/3%	5% 7½%	Jan. 1966 March, 1970.
(c) Direct recruitment made on local/regional basis in Group 'C' & 'D' posts (Cleaners, Loaders, Drivers etc.)	6% Bombay 20% Calcutta 18% Madras 16.2/3% Delhi	6% 6% 5% 7½%	These figures represent 100 point roster for respective States, followed since Feb. 1975. Earlier 40 point roster was being followed.
	7% Bombay 22% Calcutta 19% Madras 16.2/3% Delhi	9% 6% 1% 7½%	June, 1985 onwards.

1	2	3	4
(d) Recruitment to work charged i.e. Casual Labourer	6% Bombay 20% Calcutta 18% Madras 16.2/3% Delhi	6% } 6% } 5% } 7 1/4% }	Sept. 27, 1982
	7% Bombay 22% Calcutta 19% Madras 16.2/3% Delhi	9% } 6% } 1% } 7 1/4% }	
(e) Temporary appointment of more than 45 days duration	6% Bombay 20% Calcutta 18% Madras 16-2/3% Delhi	6% } 6% } 5% } 7 1/4% }	Jan., 1978
	7% Bombay 22% Calcutta 19% Madras 16-2/3% Delhi	9% } 6% } 1% } 7 1/4% }	

(ii) Posts filled by promotion

Promotion	Scheduled Castes	Scheduled Tribes	Dates from which applicable
Posts filled by promotion upto the lowest rung of class I (Group A)	15%	7 1/4%	July 23, 1975

2.2. It has further been stated that the Air India had, in pursuance of the Government's Directives received earlier, introduced a system of quota reservation of posts to the extent of 12 1/4% for SC and 5% for ST with effect from January 1, 1966, in regard to direct recruitment. This percentage was revised to 15% and 7 1/4% for direct recruitment on all India basis by means of open competitive test and 16-2/3% and 7 1/4% for direct recruitment, otherwise than by open competitive tests, with effect from March 1970, vide Ministry of Home Affairs resolution No. 27/25/68-EST (SCT) dated March 25, 1970. The principle of carry forward of unfilled reserved vacancies to subsequent recruitment years was introduced in 1968.

2.3. The formal directives on reservation of posts filled by direct recruitment and promotion was received in July, 1975 vide letter No. A/14012/2//74-SCT of July 23, 1975 from the then Ministry of Tourism and

Civil Aviation, and reservation was introduced in promotion with effect from July 23, 1975. The reservation of posts filled by SC/ST in licenced categories, which were hitherto exempted, were brought under reservations from May, 1976.

2.4. During their evidence, the Committee enquired of the representatives of the Ministry of Civil Aviation as to when the first directives regarding reservations for SC/ST in services were received by the Ministry of Civil Aviation and also when the Ministry of Civil Aviation issued instructions to the Air India. The Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation replied :

“The Ministry of Civil Aviation had issued the directive to Air India on 23rd July, 1975 directing them to take measures for implementing the orders relating to reservation for SC/ST in the matter of appointment of individuals for the various posts under the Corporation. On 27th September 1982, this Ministry issued consolidated instructions to all the organisations incorporating the various Government orders relating to reservation for SC/ST candidates. The point is that in July 1975 the first directive was issued to Air India.”

2.5. When the Committee desired to know the date when the Directive was actually implemented, the representative of Air India submitted :

“The Presidential directive was made applicable from 23rd July, 1975. There was correspondence between the Ministry and Air India in order to find out whether the Co-Pilots and Aircraft Maintenance Engineers should be exempted from reservation or they should also be included. In respect of licensed categories, the implementation was from May, 1976 For all other categories, it was from 23rd July, 1975.”

2.6 When asked by the Committee whether any assessment had been made by Air India in respect of implementation of the Directive in regard to Co-Pilots and Aircraft Maintenance Engineers, and the delay or damage done to them, the representative of Air India replied as under :

“I would like to submit the details in this regard. There was recruitment of four posts in the intervening period and out of the four co-pilots, there was one SC and one ST point. In actual fact, we have been able to get our first SC pilot only last month. Really speaking there was no damage or delay caused to those employees. For the past 10 years, we were not getting the SC/ST candidates. Only last month, we have got our first co-pilot.”

2.7. In a subsequent note to the Committee, the Ministry of Civil Aviation stated that the Directive regarding reservation for SC/ST in services was first received by the Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation on 10th May, 1974 vide Bureau of Public Enterprises O.M. No. M6/1/73-BPE (IC) dated 10th May, 1974.

2.8. When the Committee desired to know whether or not the implementation of the directives was ensured by the Ministry, the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation stated :

“In an organisation employing about 19,000 people, it is the management of the organisation which should ensure that the directive is implemented. Now, when we come to the Ministry, it has three or four ways to oversee that the implementation is done. One way is that through the media of periodical returns. We ask for periodical returns. They are received yearly or half-yearly. It is scrutinised as to whether the directives are implemented.

Secondly, the Ministry also carries out periodical inspection of the rosters. But they cannot carry out inspection on each and every roster. They can pick at random.

2.9. On a query from them as to why the principle of carry forward of unfill'd reserved vacancies was not introduced from 1966, when reservation for SC/ST in recruitment was enforced by Air India, the Committee were informed through a written reply by the Ministry of Civil Aviation as follows :

“The Presidential Directive under the Air Corporations' Act was received by the Corporation only in July, 1975, and prior to that, it was only in pursuance of the advice of the Government that the Corporation introduced the reservation from January 1, 1966 and the principle of carry forward of vacancies from 1.1.1968. The Corporation, at that time, had not found it feasible to adopt the carry forward principle right from 1.1.1966.”

2.10. The Committee regret to note that although the reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in posts were introduced in Air India w.e.f. 1 January, 1966 yet the principle of carry forward of unfilled reserved vacancies to subsequent recruitment years was introduced after more than two years in 1968 by the Corporation on the plea that in January, 1966 it had not found it feasible to adopt the carry forward principle. In the Committee's opinion

when a policy has been evolved and laid down after due consideration by the Government, the implementing authorities have no business to delay the implementation. It should have been the earnest endeavour of the Corporation to adopt the carry forward principle also w.e.f. the same day i.e. 1.1.1966. The Committee desire that proper steps should be taken to ensure that such things do not recur in future and hope that loss of posts for not carrying forward are made good.

2.11. The Committee cannot but express their anguish that the formal directives regarding reservations in recruitment and promotions for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in services received from the Bureau of Public Enterprises on 10th May, 1974 were communicated to the Corporation by the Ministry on 23rd July, 1975 after a lapse of 14 months with the result that the employees belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes were denied their due promotions for more than a year. Had the Ministry been prompt in conveying the directives to the Corporation promptly, such injustice to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes employees could have been averted. The Committee expect the Ministry to be more careful in such matters in future and also expect the Corporation to effect promotion with retrospective effect to remedy the injustice.

2.12. In regard to the monitoring of the implementation of the Directives regarding reservations, the Committee ^{were} are not convinced by the argument of the Civil Aviation Secretary that "It is the management of the organisation which should ensure that the Directive ^{is} implemented." In the opinion of the Committee this amounts to the Ministry washing of their hands of all responsibility about implementation of the Government Directive to the Corporation. The Committee feel that primarily it is the duty of the nodal Ministry to ensure that any such directives are implemented in letter and spirit and for that purpose they should get the necessary feed back or returns from organisations or bodies under their control. The Committee recommended that the Ministry should strengthen its machinery to monitor the implementation of the reservation directives so that the desired benefit goes to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe persons in matters of recruitment and promotions in the Corporation.

B. Liaison Officer and Cell

2.13. According to the Preliminary material furnished to the Committee by the Ministry of Civil Aviation, Deputy Director (Personnel) has been designated as the Liaison Officer in Air India to ensure due compliance of the Government orders by the appointing authorities and the instructions pertaining to reservation of vacancies in favour of SC/ST and other concessions admissible to them. The pay scale of the Dy. Director (Personnel), who heads the Personnel Department is Rs. 3000-3700.

2.14. A Special Cell has been set up in the Personnel Department to look after the interests of SC/ST employees.

2.15. As regards the appointment of Liaison Officer in the Ministry of Civil Aviation the Committee have been informed in a note that there is a special SC/ST Cell in the Ministry which is headed by an officer of the rank of Director, who is also the Liaison Officer. He is required to ensure the implementation of different orders of the Government of India relating to reservation of posts for SC/ST candidates in the Govt. Departments and Public Undertakings under the control of the Ministry including Air India. The Cell assists the Liaison Officer in the discharge of his duties.

2.16. In regard to the staff strength of the Cell in the Ministry of Civil Aviation the Committee have been informed that there is one Assistant in the SC/ST Cell. His work is supervised by a Section Officer and then by an Under Secretary. The overall incharge of the Cell is the Director, who is the Liaison Officer in the Department of Civil Aviation for the purpose of implementation of orders relating to reservation of posts for Scheduled Castes/ Scheduled Tribes.

2.17. When the committee asked during evidence on 24th December 1986 whether the staff in the Cell was adequate the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation replied in the affirmative. He further explained as follows :

“Data collection and conveying to the Ministry of Home Affairs is only one of its functions. In addition, the Cell examines all the returns which are received from the various public sector enterprises under the administrative control of the Ministry. It also examines and follow up the representations and complaints received. It supervises whether the various public sector enterprises are following the directives or not. One Assistant in the Government of India is dealing with it. The staff has the necessary zeal to do the job.”

2.18. As regards the number of times the Liaison Officer in the Ministry of Civil Aviation visited Air India (Head Office) during the last two years to check the implementation of reservation in services the Committee were informed through a written note as follows :—

“It has not been possible to inspect the Headquarters’ office of Air India during the last two years. The inspection will be taken up shortly. However, the Under Secretary concerned, who is in charge of the SC/ST Cell in the Ministry of Civil Aviation, has inspected the Northern India Regional Office of Air India located in New Delhi on 27.11.1986.

Whenever the inspections are carried out, appropriate reports are made and submitted and necessary corrective action is taken by Air India."

2.19. In reply to a question as to how many times the Liaison Officer in the Ministry had inspected the rosters of Air India during the last three years and whether any case of violating of reservation orders had been detected during the course of inspection the Committee were furnished the following note :—

"Under Secretary of the Ministry of Civil Aviation, who is in charge of the SC/ST Cell in the Ministry conducted an inspection of the rosters maintained in the Northern India Regional Office of Air India during the month of November, 1986.

In the Inspection Report prepared by the Liaison Officer in respect of the inspection of Air India office, the following irregularities were noticed :—

- (a) Before appointing a general candidate against a reserved vacancy, prior approval of the competent authority, prescribed in the Directives for dereservation, was not being obtained.
- (b) It was not clearly indicated under appropriate column that what is the number of reserved vacancies carried forward, year of recruitment and remarks.

The above deficiencies were pointed out to the Northern India Regional Office of Air India. They have assured that they would take remedial action and these irregularities will not occur in future."

2.20. The Committee are surprised that Liaison Officer in the Ministry of Civil Aviation has not visited the Head Office of Air India for the last two years. This shows that neither the Ministry nor its Liaison Officer attach the importance and urgency to the implementation of the reservation policy that it deserves more so when the visit of the Under Secretary-in-charge of SC/ST Cell to Northern India Regional Office of Air India brought to light a number of irregularities.

2.21. Keeping in view the fact that the Liaison Officer has to monitor the reservations in all the departments of the Ministry and the organisations and Undertaking thereunder, the Committee recommend that he should visit the Head Office as well as Regional Offices of Air India at least once a year if not more to ensure that reservation orders are implemented meticulously in letter and spirit.

2. 22. The Committee firmly believe that mere appointing a Liaison Officer is not enough. What is needed is concerted action on the part of the Liaison Officer to ensure due compliance by the appointing authorities of the orders and instructions pertaining to the reservations in favour of SC/ST and other concessions/relaxations admissible to them.

2. 23. The Committee ~~have been~~^{is} informed by the Civil Aviation Secretary that the SC/ST Cell attached to Liaison Officer at present ~~is~~^{is} manned by an Under Secretary, one Desk Officer and one Assistant. Further that this Cell has been entrusted with the responsibility of overseeing the implementation of reservations in all the Departments and offices and Undertakings under the Ministry. Seeing the enormity of the work, the Committee recommend that the staff strength of the Cell should be suitably augmented by appointing more staff who are well conversant with the orders/instructions relating to reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes so that the interests of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes ~~are~~^{is} properly looked after.)

CHAPTER-III

RECRUITMENT AND PROMOTIONS

A. Recruitment Procedure

3. 1. As regards the procedure followed for recruitment of staff in various categories of posts in Air India, the Committee have been informed by the Ministry of Civil Aviation through the Preliminary Material as under :—

“(1) All India Recruitment :

Recruitment of staff in posts carrying the salary grade of Rs. 910-1700 and above and other specified categories like Asst. Flight Pursers, Air-Hostesses etc. is normally done on All-India basis.

(2) Recruitment on Local/Regional Basis :

Recruitment of staff in categories other than those for which recruitment is made on All-India basis is done on local/regional basis.

(3) Recruitment at Headquarters :

Recruitment at Headquarter in unskilled categories and common categories like Clerks, Typist-Clerks, Stenographers etc., and also categories like Traffic Assistants, Storekeepers, Asst. Flight Pursers, Air-Hostesses is made by the Personnel Department. Recruitment to other categories of staff is normally made by the individual Departments concerned. For example, the Commercial Department directly recruits Asst Station Superintendents and above, while the Engineering Department directly recruits Technicians, Trainee Technicians, Licenced Engineers, Technical Officer etc. Similarly the Operations Department directly recruits Pilots, Navigators, Flight Engineer Cadets, Flight Dispatchers and Technical Officers etc., while the Accounts Department directly recruits candidates for the post of Asst. Accounts Officers.

(4) Recruitment at Outstations :

Recruitment at Outstations in respect of categories other than the Asst. Station Superintendents and above in the Commercial Department and comparable posts in other Departments is normally made

locally by the other stations. Exceptions to this principle are, however, made in respect of Departments like Operations, Engineering or Stores in the exigencies of service and staff are transferred to such stations on a temporary or regular basis to fill the vacancies. Recruitment at Outstations in respect of categories of Asst. Station Superintendent and above in the Commercial Department and comparable posts in other Departments is made at Headquarters by the respective Departments.

(5) *Employment Exchange :*

All vacancies which are filled otherwise than by promotions and which extend over a period of 90 days are notified to the Employment Exchanges, as required under the Employment Exchanges (Compulsory Notification of Vacancies) Act, 1959. Notifications are also sent to the Directorate General of Resettlement and Employment, Ministry of Labour and Employment as well as the Directorate General of Resettlement, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi and other concerned authorities.

(6) *Reservation of Posts for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes :*

The Corporation has been following a system of quota reservation for Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates in accordance with the instructions contained in the Ministry of Tourism & Civil Aviation letter No. A. 14012/2/74.SCT of July 23, 1975, which provides for reservation for SCs and STs in appointment to various posts in the Corporation as per the prescribed percentage of reservation.

(7) *Reservation of Posts for Ex-Servicemen :*

The Corporation has been following the reservation of posts for Ex-Servicemen and dependents of those killed in action at 10% and 7½% respectively as per Government instructions in Group 'C' and 20% and 7½% in Group 'D' posts, subject 14½% and 24½% for Groups 'C' and 'D' respectively, wherever reservation for the physically handicapped is followed.

(8) *Reservation of Posts for Physically Handicapped Persons :*

The Corporation has been following the principle of reservation of posts for physically handicapped persons in identified categories in Group 'C' & 'D' posts as per the Government instructions at the rate of 1% each in the category of (1) Blind (2) The deaf (3) The Orthopaedically handicapped.

(9) Employment Notice :

When the vacancies are filled otherwise than by promotion, they are notified to staff both in common categories as well as other categories through Employment Notice.

(10) Advertisements :

According to the instructions contained in Bureau of Public Enterprises (Ministry of Finance) O.M. No. BPE/CL/007/78/MAN/2 (2)/75-BPE (GM-1) of April 20, 1978, the recruitment to posts in Public Enterprises carrying pay scales the maximum of which does not exceed Rs. 800/- per month must be made only through the National Employment Services and other sources of recruitment can be tapped only after the Employment Exchanges issue a "Non-availability Certificate."

Accordingly, the vacancies in posts other than those in unskilled categories like Cleaners, Loaders and Peons etc., are notified in English, Hindi and regional language and local dailies after the receipt of "Non-Availability Certificate" However, the vacancies in posts for which recruitment is made of All India basis like Asstt. Flight Purser, Air Hostesses and Asstt. Station Superintendents etc. are advertised on All India basis in leading Newspapers as well as in the Employment News (in English) and Rozagar Samachar (In Hindi).

(11) Radio Announcement :

Reserved vacancies in Group 'C' and 'D' posts are announced on selected stations of the All India Radio where there is a concentration of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe population in accordance with the procedure laid down by the Government.

(12) Method of Selection :

After the applications are received, they are scrutinised and candidates who fulfil the minimum requirements, are called for test or interview or both, as the case may be. Aptitude test/written examinations are held for the selection of Asstt. Flight Pursers, Traffic Assistants and Jr. Executives in the Commercial Department etc., followed by assessment interview. Besides, trade tests are conducted for categories of posts like Typists, Stenographers, Cooks, Drivers and other Technical posts in the Operations and Engineering Departments etc., to ascertain their proficiency in the respective trades.

(13) Interview :

Where tests/written examinations are held, candidates who pass the tests/examinations are called for assessment interviews. Selection Panel for common categories generally consists of one or two representatives on the employing departments and a representative of the Personnel Department. With regard to categories other than common categories, Selection Committees are constituted by the appointing authority. Such committees generally consist of 2 to 3 members.

(14) Appointment :

Candidates who are found suitable by the Selection Committee are offered employment according to their order of merit subject to the availability of vacancies. If there are more suitable candidates than the number of vacancies, they are kept on the approved list and offered employment as and when vacancies occur. The wait-lists are generally valid for a period of one year. All the appointments are subject to candidates passing the Medical Test by the Corporation's Medical Officer and the due verification of their antecedents and character."

3.2. During the evidence on, 24th December, 1986, the Committee asked the representative of the Ministry of Civil Aviation the basis for Government directives with regard to regional selection *i.e.* selection of candidates region-wise. The representative of Air India stated as under :

"According to the Presidential directive, for all-India basis direct recruitment by open competition, the percentages are 15% and 7½% and direct recruitment otherwise than by open competition 16-2/3% and 7½%. Recruitment for C & D posts, the percentages for each State are given in proportion to the population of SC and ST in the respective States."

3. 3. The position was further clarified by the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation as under :

"There is either the all-India level reservation or the State level reservation. At the State level, percentages are fixed on the basis of the population figures of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The 1975 Circular was based on the 1971 Census and the 1985 Circular on 1981 Census. Most of the recruitment is done only at four places, that is, Bombay, Calcutta, Madras and Delhi. Now,

there are certain percentages fixed for these States. Apparently, they have been following those percentages at that level. The mistake which seems to have occurred, to my mind, is this. Jalandhar has a small office and when there is some recruitment, they might have followed the percentages fixed for the Union Territory of Delhi. In the same way, for recruitment at Trivandrum, they might have applied the percentage fixed for Madras. This mistake seems to have occurred because major portion of recruitment is done only at these four metropolitan cities. Because of this error, some people might have been put in a disadvantageous position. But looking at the very minor percentage of staff recruited at places other than the four cities, the damage caused to the interests of the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates would indeed be very slight and insignificant. But still, we will look into this aspect and analyse correctly what extent it has happened."

3. 4. In reply to a written enquiry by the Committee as to whether the appointing authorities in Air India indicate the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates to the Employment Exchanges so as to facilitate them to sponsor the right type of candidates belonging to these communities, the Ministry of Civil Aviation apprised the Committee through a written note as follows :

"The Employment Exchanges are informed of the prescribed qualifications and experience for the posts notified to them so as to enable them to sponsor the right type of candidates. The precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates as well as general candidates are not informed to the Employment Exchange as the same have not been requested for by them so far. However, the reasons for non-selection of SC-ST candidates are recorded during interview in the assessment sheets, which are available for the approving authority for reference."

3. 5. Pursuing the matter further the Committee asked the representatives of the Ministry during the evidence on 6 April, 1987 as to why the reasons for rejection of candidates sponsored by Employment Exchanges were not communicated to them when there were specific Government orders to that effect.

The witness replied :—

"The names of candidates are forwarded by the Employment Exchange in the proforma and that proforma contains 7 columns including the name of the candidate, age etc. and in the last column,

- we are required to indicate about the results. Generally in several cases, the candidates are absent and there are no reasons necessarily to be given apart from saying that he has failed in the written tests. In other cases, where the candidate passed in the written test but failed in the interview etc., it is difficult to really indicate the precise reason. So, we say that he was not found suitable as per criteria. So, the employment exchange has a record that the candidates forwarded by it have been considered and what is the result.

So far as the general reason as to why the candidates are not found suitable, are concerned, I would like to point out once again that we have a good record of selection of SC/ST candidates and by and large, I think, one can say that most of the candidates who fulfilled the requirements are selected. That is why, we have been able to achieve a good percentage in our organisation."

3.6. I reply to a specific question as to whether the appointing authorities proposed to intimate the Employment Exchange about the reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by them to enable them to sponsor the right type of candidate in future recruitments belonging to these communities, the representative of Air India stated as under :—

"Where a candidate has failed in the written examination the reason that he has failed to pass the written examination should be enough reason why he has not been selected. There may also be cases where a person has qualified in the written examination but has been failed in the interview. So, we will try to be more specific with immediate efforts instead of just saying that the candidate did not come upto the mark, we will try to give more specific reasons with immediate effect."

3.7. The Committee notes that while making recruitment at Delhi, Bombay, Calcutta and Madras to Group 'C' and 'D' posts from amongst the candidates belonging to local area or region, the percentages of reservations for SC/ST fixed for those areas are adhered to yet this is not the case in case of recruitments in these categories made at Jalandhar and Trivendrum. In the Committee's opinion this anomaly might have deprived a number of SC/ST candidates employment at the recruitments at Jallundhar and Trivandrum and is a serious lapse on the part of Air India.)

3.8. The Committee recommends that Ministry of Civil Aviation should look into the matter in depth and find out whether any injustice had been done to

SC/ST candidates.) In case it comes to their knowledge that some injustice has been done to SC/ST candidates, ^{an} they should take steps to redress it in future recruitments.) *the injustice if long*

3.9 The Committee further recommend ^{that} orders relating to percentages fixed for SC and ST for Group C and D posts ^{to} be filled on regional basis ^{are} followed meticulously.

3.10 The Committee regret that the appointing authorities in Air India do not indicate the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates to the Employment Exchanges to enable them to sponsor right type of candidates in subsequent recruitments even though there are specific instructions to that effect contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs O.M.No. 14/12/67—Est (D) dated 10 April, 1968.

3.11. However, the Committee have been assured by the representative of Air India that in future the concerned authorities will strictly adhere to the afore-said instructions and invariably convey to Employment Exchanges the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates so as to enable them to sponsor for subsequent vacancies right type of candidates from these communities. The Committee hope that the Air India authorities will keep their promise.

3.12. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry of Civil Aviation issue, if not already done, the necessary instructions to all the public undertakings including Air India under their control, so that whenever the appointing authorities reject the SC/ST candidates they should communicate reasons for rejection of these candidates to the Employment Exchanges so that the latter may sponsor for subsequent vacancies the right type of SC/ST candidates.

B. Recruitment Boards/Departmental Promorion Committees

3.13. In the Preliminary material furnished to the Committee by the Ministry of Civil Aviation it is stated that the Recruitment Boards constituted for selecting candidates for appointment to various categories consist of one member from the concerned Department, the other from Personnel Department and the third belonging to the SC/ST. In case of posts in Groupe 'C' and 'D' a member of Minority community is also associated on the Selection Board.

3.14. As regards composition of Departmental Promotion Committees, generally one member from the concerned Department, one from the Establishment Department and one belonging to SC/ST are nominated on the Departmental Promotion Committees.

3.15. The Recruitment Board/D.P.C. consists of officers in the grade of Rs. 910—1700 and above including SC/ST members. The rank of the officers

sitting in Selection Board/D.P.C. is normally two grades above the post for which Selection Board is constituted. The SC/ST members are also associated with the Boards during the interview of general candidates.

3.16. It has further been stated that in case of Departmental Promotion Committee, SC/ST members are nominated on all the Departmental Promotion Committees whenever promotions are regulated by the reservation orders. In case of promotion above the lowest rung of officers in Group 'A' whenever SC/ST candidates are within the zone of consideration within such Group 'A' posts, SC/ST officer is on the Panel. In cases where SC/ST officers within the Corporation in appropriate grades are not available, SC/ST members from Government/Public Undertaking etc, are included.

3.17. In response to a query about the rank of the officer belonging to SC/ST who sits on the Board of Selection or D.P.C., the Committee has been informed in writing by the Ministry as follows :—

“There is no fixed rank of the officer belonging to SC/ST who sits in the Board of Selection/D.P.C. The rank of the officer belonging to SC/ST as well as general category depends upon the level of posts for which the selection made. According to the rules of the Corporation, the Selection members are generally two grades higher than the post for which the selection/promotion is effected.”

3.18. The Committee note that Air India is associating one officer belonging to SC or ST in the Recruitment Boards and Departmental Promotion Committees irrespective of the fact whether they are interviewing Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe or general candidates are so as to ensure that Schedule Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are judged with relaxed standards and not with the standards by which the general candidates are judged. The Committee also note that in case Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe officer of appropriate status is not available with Air India, they requisition the services of SC/ST officer of comparable status from some Government Department or some public undertaking.

3.19. The Committee trust that they will continue to adhere to this practice in future also to safeguard the interests of SC/ST candidates.

C. Concessions/Relaxations

3.20 The Committee have been informed in writing by the Min. of Civil Aviation that the following concessions/relaxations are provided to the SC/ST candidates by Air India at the time of recruitment :—

1. *Relaxation of standards* : Scheduled Castes/Tribes candidates are judged by relaxed standards at the time of written/trade tests, and oral interviews for appointment against reserved vacancies.

3.21. "Relaxed Standards" means the relaxation of qualifying marks made in favour of SC/ST candidates in as much as the qualifying standard for SC/ST candidates in the written test, is fixed at a lower level than the standard fixed for candidates belonging to general category (non-SC/ST). Relaxation in standards is also given in respect of trade tests for the post of Stenographers and Typist-Clerks by lowering the standards for qualifying in the tests in favour of SC/ST, as compared to candidates belonging to general category (non-SC/ST).

3.22. As regards the percentage of relaxation given to SC/ST candidates in the written test, it may be stated that the qualifying standard for general candidates for all posts where written tests are conducted in respect of common categories of posts like Typist-Clerks, Stenographers, Traffic Assistants, Storekeepers and allied categories; and Asstt. Flight Pursers and Air Hostesses is normally fixed at 56% to 60% while it is relaxed in favour of SC/ST candidates to the extent of 36% to 40%.

3.23. In the case of trade tests for Stenographers/Typist-Clerks, the extent of relaxation is as follows :—

Category	Minimum qualifying standards for the trade test in the case of general category (non-SC/ST)	Minimum relaxed qualifying standard for the trade test in the case of SC/ST.
Stenographers	100 w p.m in shorthand	80 w.p.m. in shorthand
Typist-Clerks	40 w.p.m. in typewriting	35 w.p.m. in typewriting

2. *Relaxation in Experience* : The condition regarding minimum experience prescribed for various posts is relaxed in the case of SC/ST candidates at the discretion of the competent authority.

3. *Separate Interviews* : The candidates belonging to SC/ST communities are interviewed separately so that they are not judged in comparison with the general candidates. The Selection Committee members are also advised of the need of judging the SC/ST candidates by relaxed standards.

4. *Age Limit* : The maximum age limit prescribed for appointment to posts is increased by 5 years in the case of candidates belonging to SC/ST communities.

5. *Concession in Fees* : Full exemption of fees payable for admission to any recruitment examination/selection is allowed in respect of SC/ST candidates effective from 1st July, 1985.

6 *Grant of Travelling Allowances* : SC/ST candidates called for test/interview are paid travelling allowance as per the Government instructions.

In the advertisement, it is indicated that the SC/ST candidates called for test/interview will be paid T.A. as per the Government rules.

7. *In-service Training* : In-service Training is provided to SC/ST candidates who are found below the required standard necessary for immediate appointment in categories of posts like Asst. Flight Pursers, Stenographers, Typist/Clerks, Junior Operators and Air Hostesses.

3.24. The Committee have further been informed that the following concessions/relaxations are provided to SC/ST candidates while considering them for promotions to the next grade :

- (1) In regard to the promotions which are made on the basis of seniority subject to rejection of unfit, the SC/ST candidates are promoted irrespective of their seniority in the list of length of service against reserved vacancies.
- (2) SC/ST employees are imparted training within the Corporation to enable them to improve their capabilities.
- (3) The SC/ST officers who are senior enough in the zone of consideration so as to be within the number of vacancies for which the select list is drawn, are included in the Select List provided they are not considered unfit for promotion.
- (4) The promotions in technical categories where level examination (written examination) is conducted, a concession of 5%, as compared to the general categories, is given to SC/ST candidates, in the qualifying marks.

3.25 During their evidence before the Committee on 10 February 1987, the representative of the Ministry was asked whether any relaxation in educational qualifications was given to SC/ST candidates. The witnesses replied that no such relaxation was given. The witness further submitted :—

"In written examinations...they are given relaxation in marks. There are other relaxations also, such as experience, standards, evaluation of papers etc. These are the areas where we give relaxations."

3.26. The Committee asked the witness whether the relaxations given to SCs/STs are notified in the advertisements for the recruitments. The representative of the Air India replied as under :—

"It is not notified in the advertisement."

3.27. The Committee regret that the concessions and relaxations available to Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are not notified in the recruitment advertisements issued by the Air India. They recommend that the concessions and relaxations should invariably form part of the advertisements.

It should also be made clear in the advertisements that "if adequate number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates who satisfy the minimum standard are not available to fill reserved vacancies, then SC/ST candidates may be selected to the extent of shortfall in vacancies by relaxing minimum standard provided they are not considered unfit to hold the post" as provided in Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension O.M. No. 36011/8/84-Estt (SCT) dated 17th October, 1986. Such an advertisement will enable the candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes who do not strictly fulfil the educational standards to apply and facilitate the filling up of reserved posts.

D. Promotions

3.28. According to the Preliminary material furnished to the Committee the procedure followed for promotion of staff in various categories of posts in Air India, is as under :

(i) *Promotion on the basis of seniority subject to fitness* : This is applicable to the lower categories of posts such as Heads of unskilled categories, cooks and head cooks. SC/ST candidates who are confirmed are considered irrespective of their position in the seniority against reserved vacancies.

(ii) *Promotion by section on the basis of merit combined with seniority* : This covers categories higher than those referred to in (i) above but lower than those indicated in (ii) below. The zone of consideration being five times of the number of vacancies is applicable.

(iii) *Promotion by selection is purely on merit* : This applies to promotion from the appropriate lower categories to posts broadly in the pay scale of Rs. 1720-2680 and above. The zone of consideration is five times the number of vacancies.

The main features of the procedure are that the selection is made by a panel appointed by the competent authority. The employees eligible for promotion are considered in the order of seniority. The number of employees who are considered for selection is five times the number of vacancies. The selection panel considers the suitability of employees for promotion, generally on the basis of Performance Appraisal Reports. However in certain Technical/Licensed categories, suitability for promotion is determined on the basis of a written and oral examination followed by the normal selection by a Selection Panel, on the basis of Appraisal Reports.

3.29. As per information furnished to the Committee the following concessions/relaxations are provided to SC/ST candidates while considering them for promotions to the next grade :

- (1) In regard to the promotions which are made on the basis of seniority subject to fitness, the SC/ST candidates are promoted irrespective of their seniority in the list or length of service against reserved vacancies in lower categories. As regards Senior Clerks/STAs etc. a minimum qualifying service of 7 years/3 years is required, depending upon the category.
- (2) SC/ST employees are imparted training within the Corporation to enable them to improve their capabilities.
- (3) The ST/ST officers who are senior enough in the zone of consideration so as to be within the number of vacancies for which the select list is drawn, are included in the select list provided they are not considered unfit for promotion.
- (4) The promotion in technical categories where level examination (written examination) is conducted, a concession of 5% as compared to the general categories, is given to SC/ST candidates, in the qualifying marks.

3.30. During evidence the Committee enquired about the criteria followed for promotion by seniority or by merit. The representative of Air India explained as under :

"There are categories where the promotions are effected on the basis of seniority subject to fitness, there are categories where it is done by merit combined with seniority and there are also categories where it is done by merit alone."

The witness further added :

"My submission is there are two or three categories. It is done by selections that we have made, then some selections are on the basis

of pure merit, and others on the basis of merit-cum-seniority. It is not that we are in any way depriving them but all the promotions are done within the parameters that have been laid down."

3.31. To a specific query by the Committee as to whether promotions purely on merit affect the chances of SC/ST candidates, the witness replied :

"You have raised a question whether the third category which we have created where promotion is done purely by merit affects the chances of SC/ST candidates. It does not, because that criteria of pure merit is applicable in the case of Station Managers and upwards. In those posts at those levels there is no reservation for SC/ST candidates."

3.32. Finding from the written information furnished by the Ministry that there was shortfall in promotion even in the lower categories like peon, head cleaner, sweeper, gardener besides the shortfall in clerical posts like senior clerk, office Assistant and Stenographers, the Committee desired to know the reasons therefor. In response the Ministry furnished the follow information :

"The Corporation introduced the scheme of percentage promotions with effect from 1.4. 1978 for unskilled categories viz. Peons, Cleaners, Sweepers, Gardeners, Loaders, etc. The distribution of total strength in various categories is as under :

60% in the lowest grade (recruitment level) 25% in the next senior grade with designations as Senior Peon, Sr. Cleaner, Sr. Loader, etc. 15% in the next higher grade with the designations as head Peon, Head Cleaner, Head Loader etc.

The promotions in all these categories were based on the principle of seniority subject to rejection of unfit. This exercise is done on an annual basis on 1st April every year and the persons are accordingly promoted from one grade to the other against the vacancies arrived at by applying the percentages as indicated above. While effecting these promotions, reservation is provided for SC/ST at 15% and 7½% respectively.

The shortfall in the case of Senior Loaders, Senior Cleaners, Senior Gardeners or Head Peons, Head Loaders, Head Cleaners, etc. has arisen because there was no SC or ST available in the lower category from which the promotions were effected at that point of time when promotions were effected. Since the promotions were made on the basis of seniority subject to rejection of unfit, all the SC/ST candi-

we are required to indicate about the results. Generally in several cases, the candidates are absent and there are no reasons necessarily to be given apart from saying that he has failed in the written tests. In other cases, where the candidate passed in the written test but failed in the interview etc., it is difficult to really indicate the precise reason. So, we say that he was not found suitable as per criteria. So, the employment exchange has a record that the candidates forwarded by it have been considered and what is the result.

So far as the general reason as to why the candidates are not found suitable, are concerned, I would like to point out once again that we have a good record of selection of SC/ST candidates and by and large, I think, one can say that most of the candidates who fulfilled the requirements are selected. That is why, we have been able to achieve a good percentage in our organisation."

3.6. I reply to a specific question as to whether the appointing authorities proposed to intimate the Employment Exchange about the reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by them to enable them to sponsor the right type of candidate in future recruitments belonging to these communities, the representative of Air India stated as under :—

"Where a candidate has failed in the written examination the reason that he has failed to pass the written examination should be enough reason why he has not been selected. There may also be cases where a person has qualified in the written examination but has been failed in the interview. So, we will try to be more specific with immediate efforts instead of just saying that the candidate did not come upto the mark, we will try to give more specific reasons with immediate effect."

3.7 The Committee note that while making recruitment at Delhi, Bombay, Calcutta and Madras to Group 'C' and 'D' posts from amongst the candidates belonging to local area or region, the percentages of reservations for SC/ST fixed for those areas are adhered to yet this is not the case in case of recruitments in these categories made at Jalandhar and Trivendrum. In the Committee's opinion this anomaly might have deprived a number of SC/ST candidates employment at the recruitments at Jalandhar and Trivandrum and is a serious lapse on the part of Air India.

3.8 The Committee recommend that Ministry of Civil Aviation should look into the matter in depth and find out whether any injustice had been done to

SC/ST candidates. In case it comes to their knowledge that some injustice has been done to SC/ST candidates, they should take steps to redress it in future recruitments,

3.9 The Committee further recommend that orders relating to percentages fixed for SC and ST for Group C and D posts to be filled on regional basis are followed meticulously.

3.10 The Committee regret that the appointing authorities in Air India do not indicate the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates to the Employment Exchanges to enable them to sponsor right type of candidates in subsequent recruitments even though there are specific instructions to that effect contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs O.M.No. 14/12/67—Est (D) dated 10 April, 1968.

3.11. However, the Committee have been assured by the representative of Air India that in future the concerned authorities will strictly adhere to the aforesaid instructions and invariably convey to Employment Exchanges the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates so as to enable them to sponsor for subsequent vacancies right type of candidates from these communities. The Committee hope that the Air India authorities will keep their promise.

3.12. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry of Civil Aviation issue, if not already done, the necessary instructions to all the public undertakings including Air India under their control, so that whenever the appointing authorities reject the SC/ST candidates they should communicate reasons for rejection of these candidates to the Employment Exchanges so that the latter may sponsor for subsequent vacancies the right type of SC/ST candidates.

B. Recruitment Boards/Departmental Promorion Committees

3.13. In the Preliminary material furnished to the Committee by the Ministry of Civil Aviation it is stated that the Recruitment Boards constituted for selecting candidates for appointment to various categories consist of one member from the concerned Department, the other from Personnel Department and the third belonging to the SC/ST. In case of posts in Groupe 'C' and 'D' a member of Minority community is also associated on the Selection Board.

3.14. As regards composition of Departmental Promotion Committees, generally one member from the concerned Department, one from the Establishment Department and one belonging to SC/ST are nominated on the Departmental Promotion Committees.

3.15. The Recruitment Board/D.P.C. consists of officers in the grade of Rs. 910—1700 and above including SC/ST members. The rank of the officers

sitting in Selection Board/D.P.C. is normally two grades above the post for which Selection Board is constituted. The SC/ST members are also associated with the Boards during the interview of general candidates.

3.16. It has further been stated that in case of Departmental Promotion Committee, SC/ST members are nominated on all the Departmental Promotion Committees whenever promotions are regulated by the reservation orders. In case of promotion above the lowest rung of officers in Group 'A' whenever SC/ST candidates are within the zone of consideration within such Group 'A' posts, SC/ST officer is on the Panel. In cases where SC/ST officers within the Corporation in appropriate grades are not available, SC/ST members from Government/Public Undertaking etc, are included.

3.17. In response to a query about the rank of the officer belonging to SC/ST who sits on the Board of Selection or D.P.C., the Committee has been informed in writing by the Ministry as follows :—

“There is no fixed rank of the officer belonging to SC/ST who sits in the Board of Selection/D.P.C. The rank of the officer belonging to SC/ST as well as general category depends upon the level of posts for which the selection made. According to the rules of the Corporation, the Selection members are generally two grades higher than the post for which the selection/promotion is effected.”

3.18. The Committee note that Air India is associating one officer belonging to SC or ST in the Recruitment Boards and Departmental Promotion Committees irrespective of the fact whether they are interviewing Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe or general candidates are so as to ensure that Schedule Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are judged with relaxed standards and not with the standards by which the general candidates are judged. The Committee also note that in case Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe officer of appropriate status is not available with Air India, they requisition the services of SC/ST officer of comparable status from some Government Department or some public undertaking.

3.19. The Committee trust that they will continue to adhere to this practice in future also to safeguard the interests of SC/ST candidates.

C. Concessions/Relaxations

3.20 The Committee have been informed in writing by the Min. of Civil Aviation that the following concessions/relaxations are provided to the SC/ST candidates by Air India at the time of recruitment :—

1. *Relaxation of standards* : Scheduled Castes/Tribes candidates are judged by relaxed standards at the time of written/trade tests, and oral interviews for appointment against reserved vacancies.

3.21. "Relaxed Standards" means the relaxation of qualifying marks made in favour of SC/ST candidates in as much as the qualifying standard for SC/ST candidates in the written test, is fixed at a lower level than the standard fixed for candidates belonging to general category (non-SC/ST). Relaxation in standards is also given in respect of trade tests for the post of Stenographers and Typist-Clerks by lowering the standards for qualifying in the tests in favour of SC/ST, as compared to candidates belonging to general category (non-SC/ST).

3.22. As regards the percentage of relaxation given to SC/ST candidates in the written test, it may be stated that the qualifying standard for general candidates for all posts where written tests are conducted in respect of common categories of posts like Typist-Clerks, Stenographers, Traffic Assistants, Store-keepers and allied categories; and Asstt. Flight Pursers and Air Hostesses is normally fixed at 56% to 60% while it is relaxed in favour of SC/ST candidates to the extent of 36% to 40%.

3.23. In the case of trade tests for Stenographers/Typist-Clerks, the extent of relaxation is as follows :—

Category	Minimum qualifying standards for the trade test in the case of general category (non-SC/ST)	Minimum relaxed qualifying standard for the trade test in the case of SC/ST.
Stenographers	100 w p.m in shorthand	80 w.p.m. in shorthand
Typist-Clerks	40 w.p.m. in typewriting	35 w.p.m. in typewriting

2. *Relaxation in Experience* : The condition regarding minimum experience prescribed for various posts is relaxed in the case of SC/ST candidates at the discretion of the competent authority.

3. *Separate Interviews* : The candidates belonging to SC/ST communities are interviewed separately so that they are not judged in comparison with the general candidates. The Selection Committee members are also advised of the need of judging the SC/ST candidates by relaxed standards.

4. *Age Limit* : The maximum age limit prescribed for appointment to posts is increased by 5 years in the case of candidates belonging to SC/ST communities.

5. *Concession in Fees* : Full exemption of fees payable for admission to any recruitment examination/selection is allowed in respect of SC/ST candidates effective from 1st July, 1985.

6 *Grant of Travelling Allowances* : SC/ST candidates called for test/interview are paid travelling allowance as per the Government instructions.

In the advertisement, it is indicated that the SC/ST candidates called for test/interview will be paid T.A. as per the Government rules.

7. *In-service Training* : In-service Training is provided to SC/ST candidates who are found below the required standard necessary for immediate appointment in categories of posts like Asst. Flight Pursers, Stenographers, Typist/Clerks, Junior Operators and Air Hostesses.

3.24. The Committee have further been informed that the following concessions/relaxations are provided to SC/ST candidates while considering them for promotions to the next grade :

- (1) In regard to the promotions which are made on the basis of seniority subject to rejection of unfit, the SC/ST candidates are promoted irrespective of their seniority in the list of length of service against reserved vacancies.
- (2) SC/ST employees are imparted training within the Corporation to enable them to improve their capabilities.
- (3) The SC/ST officers who are senior enough in the zone of consideration so as to be within the number of vacancies for which the select list is drawn, are included in the Select List provided they are not considered unfit for promotion.
- (4) The promotions in technical categories where level examination (written examination) is conducted, a concession of 5%, as compared to the general categories, is given to SC/ST candidates, in the qualifying marks.

3.25 During their evidence before the Committee on 10 February 1987, the representative of the Ministry was asked whether any relaxation in educational qualifications was given to SC/ST candidates. The witnesses replied that no such relaxation was given. The witness further submitted :—

“In written examinations...they are given relaxation in marks. There are other relaxations also, such as experience, standards, evaluation of papers etc. These are the areas where we give relaxations.”

3.26. The Committee asked the witness whether the relaxations given to SCs/STs are notified in the advertisements for the recruitments. The representative of the Air India replied as under :—

“It is not notified in the advertisement.”

3.27. The Committee regret that the concessions and relaxations available to Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are not notified in the recruitment advertisements issued by the Air India. They recommend that the concessions and relaxations should invariably form part of the advertisements.

It should also be made clear in the advertisements that “if adequate number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates who satisfy the minimum standard are not available to fill reserved vacancies, then SC/ST candidates may be selected to the extent of shortfall in vacancies by relaxing minimum standard provided they are not considered unfit to hold the post” as provided in Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension O.M. No. 36011/8/84-Estt (SCT) dated 17th October, 1986. Such an advertisement will enable the candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes who do not strictly fulfil the educational standards to apply and facilitate the filling up of reserved posts.

D. Promotions

3.28. According to the Preliminary material furnished to the Committee the procedure followed for promotion of staff in various categories of posts in Air India, is as under :

(i) *Promotion on the basis of seniority subject to fitness* : This is applicable to the lower categories of posts such as Heads of unskilled categories, cooks and head cooks. SC/ST candidates who are confirmed are considered irrespective of their position in the seniority against reserved vacancies.

(ii) *Promotion by section on the basis of merit combined with seniority* : This covers categories higher than those referred to in (i) above but lower than those indicated in (ii) below. The zone of consideration being five times of the number of vacancies is applicable.

(iii) *Promotion by selection is purely on merit* : This applies to promotion from the appropriate lower categories to posts broadly in the pay scale of Rs. 1720-2680 and above. The zone of consideration is five times the number of vacancies.

The main features of the procedure are that the selection is made by a panel appointed by the competent authority. The employees eligible for promotion are considered in the order of seniority. The number of employees who are considered for selection is five times the number of vacancies. The selection panel considers the suitability of employees for promotion, generally on the basis of Performance Appraisal Reports. However in certain Technical/Licensed categories, suitability for promotion is determined on the basis of a written and oral examination followed by the normal selection by a Selection Panel, on the basis of Appraisal Reports.

3.29. As per information furnished to the Committee the following concessions/relaxations are provided to SC/ST candidates while considering them for promotions to the next grade :

- (1) In regard to the promotions which are made on the basis of seniority subject to fitness, the SC/ST candidates are promoted irrespective of their seniority in the list or length of service against reserved vacancies in lower categories. As regards Senior Clerks/STAs etc. a minimum qualifying service of 7 years/3 years is required, depending upon the category.
- (2) SC/ST employees are imparted training within the Corporation to enable them to improve their capabilities.
- (3) The ST/ST officers who are senior enough in the zone of consideration so as to be within the number of vacancies for which the select list is drawn, are included in the select list provided they are not considered unfit for promotion.
- (4) The promotion in technical categories where level examination (written examination) is conducted, a concession of 5% as compared to the general categories, is given to SC/ST candidates, in the qualifying marks.

3.30. During evidence the Committee enquired about the criteria followed for promotion by seniority or by merit. The representative of Air India explained as under :

“There are categories where the promotions are effected on the basis of seniority subject to fitness, there are categories where it is done by merit combined with seniority and there are also categories where it is done by merit alone.”

The witness further added :

“My submission is there are two or three categories. It is done by selections that we have made, then some selections are on the basis

of pure merit, and others on the basis of merit-cum-seniority. It is not that we are in any way depriving them but all the promotions are done within the parameters that have been laid down."

3.31. To a specific query by the Committee as to whether promotions purely on merit affect the chances of SC/ST candidates, the witness replied :

"You have raised a question whether the third category which we have created where promotion is done purely by merit affects the chances of SC/ST candidates. It does not, because that criteria of pure merit is applicable in the case of Station Managers and upwards. In those posts at those levels there is no reservation for SC/ST candidates."

3.32. Finding from the written information furnished by the Ministry that there was shortfall in promotion even in the lower categories like peon, head cleaner, sweeper, gardener besides the shortfall in clerical posts like senior clerk, office Assistant and Stenographers, the Committee desired to know the reasons therefor. In response the Ministry furnished the follow information :

"The Corporation introduced the scheme of percentage promotions with effect from 1.4. 1978 for unskilled categories viz. Peons, Cleaners, Sweepers, Gardeners, Loaders, etc. The distribution of total strength in various categories is as under :

60% - in the lowest grade (recruitment level) 25% in the next senior grade with designations as Senior Peon, Sr. Cleaner, Sr. Loader, etc. 15% in the next higher grade with the designations as head Peon, Head Cleaner, Head Loader etc.

The promotions in all these categories were based on the principle of seniority subject to rejection of unfit. This exercise is done on an annual basis on 1st April every year and the persons are accordingly promoted from one grade to the other against the vacancies arrived at by applying the percentages as indicated above. While effecting these promotions, reservation is provided for SC/ST at 15% and 7½% respectively.

The shortfall in the case of Senior Loaders, Senior Cleaners, Senior Gardeners or Head Peons, Head Loaders, Head Cleaners, etc. has arisen because there was no SC or ST available in the lower category from which the promotions were effected at that point of time when promotions were effected. Since the promotions were made on the basis of seniority subject to rejection of unfit, all the SC/ST candi-

dates available in the lower categories were considered for promotions to fill the reserved vacancies. The SC/ST candidates, who-so-ever were available in the lower categories, had already been promoted to the senior grade.

It would be seen from the figures given below that the overall percentage of SCs/STs is about 46% to 50% in the categories viz. Senior Cleaner, Sr. Security Guard, Sr. Gardener, Sr. Handyman, Sr. Loader etc.

Scale of Pay.	Categories	Total No. of employees as on 1.1.1987	Total SC/ST among them.	Percentage of SC/TT
(1) Rs. 320-10-360-15-405-20-425-25-600	Sr. Cleaners/Sr. Gardener/Sr. Handy-men/Sr. Security Guards/Sr. Loaders/Sr. Lift Attendant/Sr. Peons/Sr. Messengers etc:	910	418	45.93
(2) Rs. 320-10-360-15-405-20-425-25-675.	Head Dresser/Head Cook/Hd.Loader/Hd. Cleaner/Hd.Lift Attendant/Hd. Security Guard/Hd. Gardener/Hd. Handyman/Hd. Peon etc.	545	285	52.29

3.33. From the material subsequently furnished by the Ministry, the Committee found that there were shortfalls in the promotions of SC/ST employees to the cadres of Personnel Assistants, Stenographers (Sr. Category) Senior Clerks and various other categories.

3.34. The Committee are surprised to ^{d with surprise} note that the Air India introduced reservation in promotion for unskilled categories viz. Peons, Cleaners, Sweepers, Gardeners, Loaders etc. from April 1978, although in their earlier reply it had

been stated that reservation in posts filled by promotion upto the lowest rung of class I was introduced w.e.f. 23 July 1975.)

The Committee regret the delay of about three years in introduction of reservation in promotions for unskilled categories. They strongly feel that as a result of delay of three years in enforcement of these orders the SC/ST employees have been deprived of the opportunity for three years to get promotional quota under these orders without any fault on their part.)

3.35. (The Committee desire that the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation look into the matter and fix responsibility for the serious lapse in applying these orders so late in Air India. The Committee also urged the Ministry to devise ways and means to compensate the SC/ST employees who have suffered on account of the delayed implementation of reservation orders.)

3.36. The Committee feel perturbed that there is shortfall of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in promotions even in the lower categories of posts like Peon, Head Cleaner, Sweeper, Gardener, besides the shortfall of SC/ST in Clerical posts like Senior Clerk, Office Assistant, Stenographer etc.

3.37. (The Committee also recommend that earnest efforts should be made to fill all the vacancies reserved for SC/ST in promotion.) In case candidates from the S.C. Community for which the vacancies are reserved are not available, the vacancies may be filled by the candidates from the S.T. community after carrying forward the vacancies for three recruitment years and *vice versa*.

3.38. The Committee also recommend that if the existing SC/ST employees are not suitable for promotion to the posts of Stenographers, Senior Clerks Office Assistants, the in-service training should be arranged for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to make them proficient and fit for promotion to these categories of posts.

E. Maintenance of Rosters

3.39. In the written information furnished to the Committee, the Ministry of Civil Aviation have stated that to give proper effect to the reservation policy, prescribed rosters are maintained by Air India in accordance with the Government instructions, as detailed below :

(i) *Direct recruitment made on All-India basis :*

Categorywise rosters consisting of 40 points are maintained for the posts filled by open competition, category-wise 40 Points Rosters are also maintained for the posts filled otherwise than by open competition,

(ii) *Direct recruitment made on Regional basis :*

100 points rosters are maintained for such of the posts falling in Group 'C' and 'D' which normally attract candidates on regional basis.

(iii) *Promotions made by selection :*

Reservations on promotions made by selection and by seniority-cum-fitness are being effected as per 40 points rosters, wherein point Nos. 1, 8, 14, 22, 28, and 36 are reserved for Scheduled Caste and 4, 17 and 31, are for Scheduled Tribe

In case of Recruitment the rosters are maintained effective since 1st January 1968 and with regard to promotions with effect from 23rd July, 1975 and being inspected every year by the Liaison Officer or his designated Officer from Special Cell. In addition, the Liaison Officer examines the rosters as and when the need arises.

3.40. The Committee desired to know whether any discrepancies in the maintenance of Rosters had been noticed by the Liaison Officer during his inspections. In this connection the following statement showing the irregularities observed by the Liaison officer during his inspections in 1983, 1984 and 1985 has been furnished to the Committee :

Year	Department/Station	Irregularities observed	Action taken
1	2	3	4
1983	Engineering	JR. TECHNICAL OFFICER De-reservation order not obtained for 3 Scheduled Tribe vacancies for the year 1983.	De-reservation obtained.
		TRAINEE TECHNICIAN After necessary adjustment during the year it is noted that 3 ST points remained unfilled.	3 Scheduled Tribe candidates appointed during the year 1984.
		CARPENTAR/TAILOR/ PAINTER I Scheduled Tribe Backlog in the above mentioned category was not cleared, instead appointed 2 Scheduled Caste during the year.	The Scheduled Tribe backlog of 1983 is carried forward.

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
1984	<p>Manpower Planning and Development</p> <p>Delhi</p>	<p>Prior de-reservation order was not obtained for 1 Scheduled Caste in the category of Dy. Manager.</p> <p>Prior de-reservation order was not obtained. Backlog position at the annual summing up was not written.</p>	<p>Post facto de-reservation orders to be obtained.</p> <p>Post facto de-reservation order obtained and the irregularities were subsequently rectified after pointing out by the Inspecting Authorities.</p>
	MADRAS	<p>(i) Roster was not maintained neatly.</p> <p>(ii) Annual summing up of the backlog was not shown at the end of the year.</p>	<p>The irregularities were subsequently rectified after pointing out by the Inspecting Authorities.</p>
	<p>CIVIL WORKS & PROPERTIES</p>	<p>Scheduled Caste reserved vacancy was blocked temporarily.</p>	<p>Temporary blocking was obtained for appointing general candidates due to urgently operations in the category of Works Supervisor.</p>
1985	Operations	<p>Roster in respect of Co-pilots requires review since the Department had observed deputant who were appointed from Indian Air Force.</p>	<p>Roster reviewed accordingly.</p>
1985	<p>Management Service</p>	<p>(i) De-reservation orders for 2 Scheduled Tribe reserved vacancies were not obtained.</p> <p>(ii) Backlog in the category of Programmer/O.R. Analyst was written wrongly.</p>	<p>2 Scheduled Tribe backlog has been cleared and subsequently the backlog position was rectified.</p>

1	2	3	4
Ground Services	I Scheduled Tribe point in the category of Progress Clerk should be revived due to termination of an Scheduled Tribe candidate.	The Scheduled Tribe point has been revived with an appointment of another Scheduled Tribe candidate.	
CALCUTTA	De-reservation was not obtained in the categories of Clerk (General)/Clerk (Accts.)/Store-keeper.	Subsequently the ST point was filled in by exchange with Scheduled Caste candidate in January 1986.	
MADRAS	(i) De-reservation orders for 1 Scheduled Tribe reserved vacancy in the category of Jr. Security Asst. should be obtained. (ii) Backlog position was not written at the Annual summing up and signatures of the appointing authority were not obtained.	De-reservation order was obtained. These irregularities were subsequently rectified by the inspecting authority.	
DELHI	(i) Post facto de-reservation orders should be obtained in Group 'C' and 'D' posts. (ii) Entries were not signed by the authorised officer. (iii) Adjustment of SC/ST points were not written. (iv) Remarks were written in pencil and annual summing up of the backlog was not written.	Post facto de-reservation orders are under process. These irregularities were subsequently rectified after pointing out, by the inspecting authority.	
1985 DELHI (Temporary)	(i) Annual summing up of the backlog should be shown at the end of the year.	The irregularities were subsequently rectified after pointing out by the inspecting authorities.	

1	2	3	4
		(ii) Adjustment of SC/ST appointments should be crossed written against the SC/ST reserved points.	
	Manpower Planning and Development	Prior de-reservation order was not obtained.	Post facto de-reservation orders to be obtained.

3.41. Pointing out that in the year 1983, it was detected by the Liaison Officer that orders for dereservation of posts had not been obtained and the same observation was made by the Liaison Officer in 1985, the Committee, asked why instructions were not issued in 1983 to follow dereservation orders strictly. In a subsequent note furnished to the Committee, the Ministry have submitted that irregularities were observed by the Liaison Officer in the year 1983 during inspection, in respect of the Engineering Department, was the appointing authority in respect of Junior Technical Officer, Trainee Technician and other technical categories ; whereas irregularities observed for the year 1985, relate to Management Services Department which was the appointing authority for categories like programmer, Operations Research Analyst, etc. Both these departments were issued instructions to rectify the irregularities observed in the inspection and the irregularities had since been rectified.

3.42 During their evidence on 10th February, 1987, pointing out to the representatives of the Ministry that the material furnished by them indicate all India figures only, the Committee enquired if the rosters were being maintained region-wise and how the reservation quota was ensured on all India basis, particularly for 'C' and 'D' categories, the witness explained that the total number of vacancies on the rosters was maintained with reserved points e. g. if there were 10 points in the rosters, Air India notified the vacancies accordingly and asked the Employment Exchanges to take care of that.

3.43 The witness continued : "certain posts are filled up on a head office basis, and their rosters are maintained on the head office basis. The remaining posts are filled on region-wise basis and roster is also maintained on region wise basis. In regard to the posts which are filled upon region wise basis, the position will be region-wise."

3.44 The Committee note that a number of irregularities in the maintenance of Rosters have been pointed out by the Liaison Officer of the Ministry

during his inspections of Rosters in 1983, 1984 and 1985. This only shows that proper care is not taken by the authorities in the maintenance of Rosters.

3.45 The Committee need hardly emphasise that the Roster is an important mechanism to keep a legitimate watch on the proper and adequate intake of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe persons in services and that it would cease to have any significance, whatsoever, if it is not maintained properly in the light of existing rules, regulations and instructions.

3.46. The Committee recommend that henceforth earnest efforts be made both by the appointing authorities and the Liaison Officer in the Ministry to see that the Government orders on the maintenance of rosters are meticulously followed so that no injustice is done to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe persons in the matter of recruitment and promotion.

3.47. The Committee regret that as pointed out by the Liaison Officer in his inspection report, certain posts were de-reserved without proper authorisation. They take strong exception to this and expect that in future no post be dereserved in contravention of the directions issued in this regard. Mean while responsibility should be fixed in earlier cases of dereservation without people authorisation.

3.48. The Committee also recommend that the Liaison Officer should invariably submit his inspection report to the managing Director, Air India for his information and necessary corrective action so that the deficiencies detected are brought to notice of all concerned and prompt action is taken to remedy the situation.

3.49. The Committee note that Air India maintains 40 point Roster for direct recruitment made on all-India basis and 100 point Roster for direct recruitment made on Regional basis. For promotions made by selection, a 40 point Roster is maintained as per Government order on the subject.

3.50. The Committee have however, been informed that for posts filled on head-office basis, rosters are maintained on head office basis, For posts filled on regional basis the position is region-wise. However, this has not been done in all cases.

3.51. The Committee urge that the instructions regarding the maintenance of Rosters for posts filled on regional basis should be followed strictly in each case.

F. Dereservation

3.52. The Committee have been informed that the following procedure is followed for de-reservation of vacancies reserved for SC/ST :

Recruitment

- (1) Vacancies are notified to Employment Exchanges, SC/ST Associations and also advertised in leading newspapers indicating the number of vacancies reserved for SC/ST.
- (2) If suitable SC/ST candidates are not available for appointment against reserved vacancies, then the unfilled reserved vacancies are exclusively advertised for SC/ST candidates when direct recruitment is done other wise then through examination.
- (3) Even after exclusively advertising the vacancies reserved for SC/ST, if suitable candidates in sufficient number are not available for appointment against reserved vacancies, then such shortfall vacancies are filled in by general candidates after obtaining the approval of the M.D./Board of Directors dereserving the reserved vacancies. The vacancies so de-reserved are carried forward to subsequent 3 recruitment years and efforts are made to clear the backlog of reserved vacancies.
- (4) Depending upon the availability of the SC/ST candidates in certain categories of posts, such as Stenographers, we also recalled SC/ST candidates who have failed in the written/trade tests conducted on relaxed standard to appear for re-test.

Promotion

Before any reserved vacancy is de-reserved and filled in by a general candidate by promotion, following procedure is followed :

- (1) Where there is no SC/ST candidates available within the zone of consideration prior approval of the Managing Director is obtained to de-reserve the reserved vacancy in favour of general candidates. Subsequently, a proposal in regard to the reserved vacancies meant for SC/ST filled up by general candidates, is put up to the Board for ratification.
- (2) Where SC/ST candidates are available within the zone of consideration but found unfit by the Promotion Panel, prior approval of the Board is obtained to de-reserve vacancies in favour of general candidates.

3.53. In a written note on the number of vacancies de-reserved in Group A, B, C, and D in recruitment and promotion during the years 1983, 1984, 1985 and 1986 (upto 30.6.86) it has been stated by Air India as under :

" 1. RECRUITMENT

Year	Group	No. of vacancies de-reserved	
		SC	ST
1980	A	13	9
	B	1	5
1984	A	4	13
	B	—	3
1985	A	4	3
	B	17	7
1986 (30.6.86)	A	13	6

PROMOTION

		No. of vacancies de-reserved	
		SC	ST
1983	Group A	15	7
	Group B	40	26
	Group C	—	1
	Group D	4	9
			<u>59</u>
1984	Group A	9	5
	Group B	38	42
	Group C	—	10
	Group D	—	10
			<u>47</u>
1985	Group A	13	5
	Group B	68	71
	Group D	—	19
			<u>81</u>
1986	Group A	3	1
	Group B	19	18
	Group D	—	1
			<u>22</u>

3.54. It can be seen from the statement that in recruitment there has been few de-reservation in Group 'C' and 'D' posts during the last 3 years. In Group 'A' de-reservation is restricted to categories like Co-Pilot Aircraft Maint. Engineers, Graduate Engineers, Asst. Accounts Officer and in Group 'B' the categories like Plant Technician, Apron Supervisor, etc. These jobs are of technical nature and highly sophisticated. After putting all our efforts, we were able to fill in some reserved points. However, due to induction of new aircraft and large number of vacancies in this cadre, the remaining vacancies were filled by general candidates after obtaining de-reservation orders."

3.55. When asked about the efforts made to find suitable SC/ST candidates before dereserving a reserved vacancy, it has been stated in a note furnished to the Committee that :

"In accordance with the prescribed procedure, whenever carried forward vacancies are to be filled in, advertisement calling for applications exclusively from SC/ST candidates are published in Newspapers.

Simultaneously, the said vacancies are notified to the Employment Exchanges, SC/ST Organisations, All India Radio, etc. In spite of these special advertisements, etc. sufficient number of SC/ST candidates with requisite qualifications and experience have not been forthcoming in some of the categories, even after applying relaxed standards of suitability. We shall continue to make concerted efforts to improve the intake of SCs/STs in the various posts in the Corporation.

It may be of interest to indicate that certain appointments have been made by Air-India in furtherance of the aim by encouraging as many SC/ST candidates as qualify for employment to the extent possible, as will be seen from the following :

- (1) We are providing special training for a period of 3 months to SC/ST candidates who are considered suitable as Apprentice Air-Hostesses having been found just below the standard required for immediate appointment. Such candidates are given coaching in English Language with a view to improving their ability to understand, write and converse in that language. At the end of the training, they are required to pass a test in English. On their qualifying the same they

are appointed as Trainee Air Hostesses and are given on the job training. So far we have employed 68 Air Hostesses under the above scheme."

3.56. The Committee pointed out that a large number of vacancies had been dereserved during 1983, 1984, 1985 and 1986 both in direct recruitment and promotions and desired to know whether SC/ST candidates were not available to fill direct/recruitment vacancies even for non-technical posts. It has been stated in a subsequent note furnished to the Committee that :

"In so far as non-technical categories are concerned, only few vacancies have been dereserved so far as recruitment is concerned, viz.;

Year	Category	No. of posts de-reserved	
		SC	ST
1983	Ast. Personnel Officer	1	—
1984	Ast. Accounts Officer	2	2
	Stenographer Calcutta	—	1
	TY/Clerk, Calcutta	—	1
1985	Air-hostess	14	—
	Ast. Accounts Officer	1	—
	Stenographer	2	6
	Catering Asst. (Delhi)	1	1

3.57. In regard to the number of reserved vacancies which lapsed has been intimated to the Committee :

"The numbers of reserved vacancies in different categories of posts which lapsed after having been carried forward for the prescribed period are as under :

Year	Sl. No.	Group & Category of post	Vacancies lapsed (year)	
			SC	ST
1		2	3	4
1983		Group 'A' Co-Pilots	8 3(1976) 5(1977)	4 2(1976) 2(1977)

1	2	3	4	5
	2.	Asst. Accounts Officer Group 'B'	—	1 (1977)
	3.	Stenographer	6 (1978)	3 (1978)
1984		...NIL... Group 'A'		...NIL...
	1.	Co-Pilots	2 (1978)	1 (1978)
	2.	Asst. Accounts Officer	—	1 (1982)"

3. 58. The Committee ~~request~~ ^d to note that a large number of vacancies in 1983, 1984, 1985 and 1986 both in direct recruitment and promotions reserved for SC/ST candidates have been dereserved and a number of reserved vacancies have been allowed to lapse by Air India.

3. 59. The Committee are ^{They were} not satisfied with the reasons given by Air India that sufficient number of SC/ST candidates with requisite qualifications and experience have not been forthcoming in some of the categories even after applying relaxed standards of suitability. The Committee feel that now there is no dearth of educated SC/ST candidates. What is lacking is ^{well} sincere and concerted efforts on the part of recruitment authorities to find out suitable SC/ST candidates before the expiry of three recruitment years. The Committee, therefore, recommend that dereservation of reserved vacancies ^{well} should be resorted to only when it becomes ^{well} inescapable after all possible efforts, including special recruitments, to locate and recruit adequate number of SC/ST candidates have failed.

CHAPTER IV
STAFF STRENGTH AND SHORTFALLS

A. Staff Strength and Shortfalls

4. 1. Statement furnished to the Committee showing the total number of employees in various categories of posts in Air India and the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes among them as on 30 June, 1986 is reproduced below :—

Category/ Designation of post	Total No. of Emple- yees	No. of SC	ST	Percentage SC	ST	Shortfall SC	ST	Percentage SC	ST
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Group 'A'									
(i) Other than Lowest rung	2095	108	20	5.16	0.95	206	137	9.84	6.55
(ii) Lowest rung	1607	242	78	15.05	4.85	NIL	42	NIL	2.55
Group 'B'	7563	1267	406	16.75	5.37	NIL	179	NIL	2.38
Group 'C'	1150	206	85	17.91	7.39	NIL	8	NIL	0.11
Group 'D'	3586	1199	189	33.44	5.27	NIL	80	NIL	2.23
Excluding Sweepers									
Sweepers	150	116	6	77.33	4.00	NIL	5	NIL	3.5

4. 2. After going through the statement, the Committee desired to know the reasons for a shortfall of 206 SCs and 137 STs in group 'A' posts and shortfall of STs in group B, C and D. It has been stated in a subsequent note furnished to the Committee that Presidential Directive for providing reservation for SCs/STs was received by Air India in July, 1975. In the statistical data furnished along with the note comparative figures of SC and ST employees as on 1 January, 1975 and 1 January, 1987 were given as below to show the improvement in intake of SC/ST in Air India.

Staff Position as on 01.01.1975

Class	Group	Total	Gen.	SC	Percentage	ST	Percentage
I	A	1767	1739	20	1.13	08	0.45
II	B	4492	4090	357	7.94	45	1.00
III	C & D	2129	1295	786	36.92	48	2.25
IV (Sweepers)	D	83	8	75	90.36	—	—
Total		8471	7132	1238	14.61	101	1.19

Staff Position as on 01.01.1987

Class	Group	Total	Gen.	SC	Percentage	ST	Percentage
I	A	3699	3233	364	9.84	102	2.76
II	B	7602	5887	1294	17.02	421	5.54
III	C & D	4712	3022	1411	29.94	279	5.92
IV (Sweepers)	D	151	29	115	76.15	7	4.64
Total		16164	12171	3184	19.70	809	5.00

The position has been further elaborated as under :—

“The total number of SC/ST, as on 1.1.1975 were only 1339 out of the total staff strength of 8471, whereas as on 1.1.1987, the total number of SC/ST is 3871 out of the total staff strength of 16,031. Thus, the increase of SC/ST employees is at a proportionately higher rate, as compared to the total increase of staff strength. To be precise the number of SC employees have increased by 2½ times and the number of ST employees have increased by 8 times, whereas, the overall increase in the staff strength is only two times. In Group ‘A’ posts, recruitment is restricted to only a few categories viz. Pilots, Chartered Accountants, Graduate Engineers and a small number in

other categories. A very large number of the total posts in Group A categories are filled by promotion from the lower grades. It will, therefore, be a gradual process for SC/ST employees to reach all levels of Group A posts. However, as can be seen from the comparative figures given above, the results are quite encouraging and satisfactory as we have improved from 1.13% of SCs in Group A on 1.1.1975 to 9.84% as on 1.1.1987.

Similarly, the percentage of ST employees, in total posts of Group A, has increased from 0.45% to 2.76%."

4. 3. During evidence when the Committee enquired about the reasons for huge shortfall in Group 'A' and how the management proposed to cover up the backlog, the representative of Air India stated as under :—

"In Group 'A' there is a shortfall, no doubt, and we have been making every effort to see that the shortfall is made up. The reason is that we had started reservation from a certain date. From that date onwards, we have been trying our best to fill the quota, but it will take some time before the shortfall is fully made up. In the last three years, in 1984, 1985 and 1986, we had a total recruitment of 2,051 employees out of which recruitment of Scheduled Castes was 372 and Scheduled Tribes 165; our recruitment in three years from SC was 18.14 percent and from ST 8.4 per cent, totalling 26.18 per cent. This shows that in the last three years we have been making every effort to speed up the recruitment; in the last three years, our total recruitment of SC and ST employees has been 26.18 percent as against the prescribed percentage of 22.5."

4. 4. When asked what efforts had been made by Air India since the visit of the Committee to their Head Office at Bombay in July, 1986 till 25 March, 1987, to wipe out the backlog, the representative of Air India stated during evidence as follows :

"I have already given the answer to the hon. Committee that in the last three years we have recruited nearly 27% of the total recruitment made from the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates. The shortfall is not in Scheduled Caste. It is mainly in Scheduled Tribe and we have sent teams to look for Scheduled Tribe candidates in different States. The States visited recently have been Rajasthan, Himachal Pradesh, Mizoram, Assam, and then they went to Ranchi in the tribal area. So, these 5-6 States have been visited recently."

The witness further stated as follows :

“We are having relaxed standard for selection of candidates from the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe. Whereas for general candidates, we insist on 60 percent marks, for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates, it is 55 percent.

In order to improve the intake of graduate engineers, we have had two special selections exclusively for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates. In the last selection, we were able to get six Scheduled Caste and two Scheduled Tribe candidates. We are carrying on our efforts to increase the intake.”

4. 5. In a subsequent note submitted to the Committee, it has been stated that the Selection Teams of Air India have not been visiting different States every year. They have visits States having tribal belts on different occasions and the details of Scheduled Tribe candidates selected during each of the visited are given below :

1978 :

A Selection Team which included an officer belonging to Scheduled Caste community visited Chamba, Dharamshala in Himachal Pradesh and selected 08 Scheduled Tribe candidates for the post of Loaders.

1979 :

Again in 1979, a Selection Team comprising one Scheduled Tribe Officer and two other officers visited Shimla, Bilaspur, Kulu, Dharamshala and Chamba in Himachal Pradesh. The Team selected 08 Cleaners and 07 Loaders/Handymen & 1 Junior Operator (Trainee)—all belonging to Scheduled Tribe communities.

1981 :

Having gauged the potential of Himachal Pradesh with regard to the availability of Scheduled Tribe candidates for different categories, it was considered appropriate to send a Selection Team to another tribal belt in North India—Rajasthan to select Scheduled Tribe candidates for the following categories :

Driver
 Trainee Technician
 Plant Technician/Bench Fitters
 Loaders
 Typist Clerk
 Stenographer

Accordingly, a Selection Team which included an Officer of Scheduled Tribe community established liaison with the Resident Commissioner and Liaison Officer, Govt. of Rajasthan in Delhi and after getting the relevant details from them, visited Udaipur and Jaipur and contacted various State Government authorities to seek their support in getting suitable Scheduled Tribe candidates for the above positions. As regards Plant Technician/Bench Fitters, it was categorically stated that it would not be possible to get the candidates for these categories in Rajasthan. Similarly, for Diploma Holders in Electrical, Mechanical, Automobile trades, it was informed by the Principal, Udaipur Polytechnic that no candidate was undergoing diploma course in the desired trades. The Selection Team also ascertained that Stenographers and Typist Clerks were not available in the State of Rajasthan.

With a view to induct Scheduled Tribe candidates, the Team arranged to have the details of requirements broadcast over All India Radio, Jaipur, to enable the candidates to contact the Team at the Employment Exchange, Jaipur. The State authorities even sent the call letters to candidates by special messengers.

However, in spite of these efforts, only two candidates belonging to ST communities appeared for interview for the post of Driver but only one was found suitable on relaxed standards who later on joined us as a Driver.

1983 :

In 1983, another Team visited Darjeeling, Guwahati, Shillong and Ranchi and selected 27 ST candidates for the positions of Traffic Assistant and 05 for the posts of Telex Operators.

4. 6. The Committee desired to know as to when the shortfall in the category of graduate Engineers would be wiped out completely in Air India, the representative of Air India stated during evidence as follows :

“We ourselves are very anxious to make up the shortfall in every category. For this category we have sent our teams to the Colleges, University campuses for interview and recruitment. In fact, there are many categories where we have exceeded the percentage prescribed. In the category, Inspector, the percentage of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates is 21.62 and 5.42 percent; next, Junior Technical Officer it is 19.70 and 1.52 percent.”

4. 7. When asked what was the backlog in the category of graduate Engineers, the representative of Air India stated during evidence as under :—

“We have a backlog of 10 SC and 8 ST candidates.”

4. 8. The Committee were further informed that special selection would be held for them shortly.

4. 9. When specifically asked during evidence to give time frame for wiping out the shortfall completely, the witness stated :

“How can I ensure or how can an organisation ensure that a certain number of candidates will be available in three months ? Yesterday, I had informed the hon. Committee that in the last three years, our recruitment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes has been nearly 27 percent as against the percentage of 22.5%. We have been trying our best. But in some categories like the pilots, Chartered Accountants and Graduate Engineers, where there is a shortage of qualified people, we can only give you our assurance that we will try our best as to whether the shortfall will be made up in 2-6 months, it will be very incorrect for me to give you the time limit or undertaking. Our efforts will continue in that direction.”

4.10. The Committee note that total number of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees in Air India which was 1238 (14.61%) and 101 (1.19%) respectively out of total employees in January 1975 has increased to 3184 Scheduled Castes (19.70%) and 809 Scheduled Tribes (5.00%) as on 1 January, 1987. The Committee are, however, surprised to note that the percentage of Scheduled Caste employees in class III has come down from 36.92% to 29.94% and in class IV from 90.36% to 76.15%.

4.11. The Committee are also unhappy to note that the percentage of Scheduled Tribes in all categories i.e. Group ‘A’, ‘B’, ‘C’ and ‘D’ is below the prescribed quota of reservations.

4.12. The Committee recommend that a time-bound programme should be chalked out to wipe out the shortfalls in all categories of posts, at least upto the lowest rung of class I, by resorting to special recruitments exclusively for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes and giving them liberal concessions/relaxations while considering them for appointment.

4.13. The Committee note that Air India has been sending teams of their officers to Tribal Areas and have met with some success in getting tribal

candidates for lower posts from Himachal Pradesh. However from the North-eastern States they have been able to select 27 Scheduled Tribe candidates for Traffic Assistant cadre and 5 Scheduled Tribes for post of Telex Operators.

4.14. The Committee feel that if more teams are sent at regular intervals to areas of tribal concentration especially to North Eastern States for recruitment of Scheduled Tribe candidates, the backlog of Scheduled Tribes can be wiped out to a great extent at an early date. The Committee will like to be kept apprised of the outcome of steps taken by Air India as suggested by them.

B In-service Training

4. 15. In a note furnished by the Ministry of Civil Aviation, the Committee have been informed that in order to ensure that Scheduled Castes/ Scheduled Tribes got adequate representation as per the reservation orders, the Air India has launched certain training schemes for reserved category candidates whereby SC/ST candidates with lower educational qualifications are recruited and trained for posts where candidates from reserved communities are not available through direct recruitment.

4.16 When asked to give the details of in-service training, the witness during evidence replied :—

“We give in-service training to those candidates who fail marginally. I can cite the example of typist. Suppose, if the standard is 35 w.p.m. and if a candidate fails by attaining 32 to 33 w.p.m., then we select him for in-service training. If somebody attains 25 or 20 w.p.m. then we do not select.”

4. 17. When the Committee asked whether it was called in-service training or it was after selection training, the representative of Air India stated :—

“The reply I gave was correct. The person is not yet selected. If a person fails to get the prescribed marks and if he is in short of a speed of 2 or 3 words, then he is selected for training. It is called in-service training. But the person is not yet an employee of Air-India. Till he comes up to the standard, he is called apprentice. Till then, the name is in-service training.”

4. 18. When asked whether there was any arrangement for giving training to pilots and co-pilots in Air India, the representative of Air India replied in

negative. He explained further as follows :—

“So far as Air India is concerned, as you know, our requirement is a little different. Air India requires pilots who have already got a certain degree of experience because they have to fly advance aircraft like the 747s, Airbus-310. We cannot take pilots straight from the market. Our recruitment sources are from Indian Air Force. We cannot train pilots initially because we want certain degree of previous experience.”

4.19. The Committee are surprised to note that Air India treat the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates as apprentices who are taken with relaxed standards and select them for employment only when they come up to the required standard.

4.20. In this connection the Committee draw the attention of the Air India authorities to the provisions in Chapter VI of Brochure on Reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in posts/services under the Public Enterprises issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises, which read as follows:—

“SC/ST candidates promoted or initially appointed on the basis of recruitment through competitive examinations or otherwise by relaxed standards should be given extra training to enable them to come up to the standards of other candidates. In-service training should be provided by the appointing authorities within their own offices. Such candidates should on their appointment be placed on probation, and the rules/orders of the enterprise regarding probation will apply to them.”

The Committee recommend that as per aforesaid Government instructions, the Air India should appoint the SC/ST candidates who are selected with relaxed standards as probationers and not apprentices.

CHAPTER V

MISCELLANEOUS

A. *Complaints/Grievances*

5.1. As regards the procedure followed for redressal of grievances of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees in Air India, the Committee have been informed in a note as follows :—

“On receipt of any representation/grievance from SC/ST employee, the matter is examined by the Special Cell and discussed with the Liaison Officer i.e. Dy. Director-Personnel. The Dy. Director-Personnel gets the comments, if necessary, from the Department concerned to redress the grievance. Similarly, the letters of grievances received from SC/ST Associations are looked and redressed. The officers of the Cell are associated with recruitment/promotions and also look into various recruitments and promotions effected in different Departments. The Special Cell maintains rosters and inspects the rosters maintained by various departments including Indian outstations.”

5.2 In reply to a written query as to when the Special Cell was set up in the Air India and whether the Cell maintained any grievance Register, the Committee were subsequently informed that a special Cell had been set up in the Corporation to look after the interests of the SC/ST in the year 1982 and the Cell maintains Grievances Register.

5.3 In reply to another written query about the nature of grievance received, the Committee were informed through a note that grievances mainly pertained to matters of selection promotion, appraisal reports, permanent absorption, housing, posting etc. During the last three years the Cell has received 44 grievances.

As regard the time taken to dispose of a grievance it has been stated in a note furnished to the Committee that the time required to dispose of a grievance depended on the nature of the grievance and its implications.

5.4 The Committee note that a Special Cell has been set up in Air India to look after the interests of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees. The Cell maintains Grievances Register.

5.5 The Committee ^(they) feel that more publicity among the SC/ST employees of Air India ~~may~~ be given about the existence of the arrangements for redressal of their grievances so that they ~~have~~ no difficulty in approaching the right person at the right time for redressal of the grievances, if any.)

5.6 The Committee ^(and ed) recommend that prompt action should be taken on the representations and grievances of the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees whatever be the nature of the grievance to inculcate confidence and sense of security and well being among them.)

B. Reservation in Residential Quarters

5.7 The Committee have been informed that since January, 1985 the Air India have introduced a system of reservation of accommodation in favour of SC/ST employees as indicated below :—

Type of Quarters	% of Reservation
A and A1	10%
B	10%
C	05%

5.8 In reply to a written query about the reasons for delay in introducing reservation in accommodation and the steps taken to clear the backlog in this regard, it has been stated in a note furnished by the Air India to the Committee that instructions were received from Bureau of Public Enterprises for providing reservation in residential accommodation for SC/ST in June 1974 and subsequently in April 1981 and October 1983, but the Corporation could not implement the percentage reservation system for the following reasons :—

- (i) Construction of Air-India Housing Colony-I, was completed in 1958 and Air India Housing Colony-II in 1971 in Bombay and in 1973 in Delhi. Subsequently, there was no construction of residential colonies in Bombay or Delhi.
- (ii) In these colonies allotment was made from the wait list prepared in 1958 for the first Housing Colony in Bombay and in 1971 another wait list was prepared for allotment of accommodation for the second Housing colony in Bombay.
- (iii) Similarly, allotment was made from the wait list prepared in 1973 for various types of accommodation at Delhi. All the above wait

lists were prepared by Housing Allotment Committee, consisting of representatives of the Management and Members of the Labour Relations Committee.

- (iv) The SC/ST employees who were in the said wait list were already given accommodation of various types of quarters as per their entitlements which was quite adequate in relation to the prescribed percentage of reservation in accommodation. The wait list exhausted at the end of 1984 and therefore, while making the fresh wait list, the principle of providing reservation in residential accommodation was introduced in 1985

The position of flats allotted to SC/ST as on 01.01.1987, at Bombay, Delhi and Calcutta is as under:—

Sttaion	Type	Total No. of flats available	No. of flats allotted to SC/ST	%age of flats allotted to SC/ST	%age for allotment of flats to SC/ST
Bombay	A and B	702	141	20.09	10
	C and D	134	19	14.18	5
Delhi	A1, A and B	147	19	12.93	10
	C	10	1	10 00	5
Calcutta	A1 and A	44	14	31.81	10

5.10 The Committee have been informed that instructions were issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises for providing reservation in residential accommodation for SC/ST in June, 1974 and subsequently in April, 1981 and October, 1983. However, the reservations in residential accommodation was introduced by Air India in 1985. The Committee are not convinced by the argument advanced by the Air India authorities that the list for allotment in Bombay had been completed in 1958 and 1971 and for Delhi in 1973 in consultation with the representatives of the Management and Members of the Labour Relations Committee.

5.11 The Committee are of the firm view that when the instructions were issued in 1974 by the BPE, it was incumbent on the Air India Authorities to revise their wait lists according to those instructions. It is really regrettable

that the reservation was introduced in 1985 *i.e.* after a lapse of about 11 years. This the Committee cannot condone it. They expect that such lapses should not recur and if there is a backlog because of the delayed implementation of the BPE instructions, Air India should make concerted efforts to clear it.

C. False Certificates

5.12 The Committee have been informed through a written note that during the last three years 24 cases of false certificates of castes having been furnished by employees have come to the notice of Air India. Detail of these cases are given in the statement at Appendix I.

5.13. It has been further stated that out of 24 cases, complaints were received in respect of 5 cases only and remaining 19 cases were detected by Special Cell while examining the documents before entering/reflecting their names in the Rosters. The above cases were noticed due to discrepancies in the supporting documents submitted by the concerned candidates which gave rise to doubts about their community status and, therefore, investigation from appropriate authorities was undertaken by Special Cell. Details of the cases and their present position as indicated by Air India are reproduced below :—

- | | |
|---|-----|
| “(i) Community status on investigation found to be correct. | ... |
| (ii) Candidates resigned during the course of investigation with appropriate authorities | ... |
| (iii) Investigation under process with appropriate authorities. | ... |
| (iv) Candidates removed/terminated from service after holding Departmental Enquiries under provision of Air India Employees' Service Regulations. | ... |
| (v) Candidates abandoned services voluntarily during the course of investigation with appropriate authorities. | ... |
| (vi) Cases where departmental enquiries are under progress after investigation revealed their community status otherwise than SC/ST. | ... |
| (vii) Candidates reverted to substantive posts after appointment to next category as he was initially appointed as a general candidate. | |

- (viii) Cases investigated and observed not belonging to SC/ST community but awarded punishment under Air India Employees' Service Regulations since they were selected and appointed on standards applicable to general candidates and no relaxation/concession as SC/ST were extended.

... 2

5.14 Out of the 4 cases where Departmental Enquiries are under progress, in 3 cases, the Domestic Enquiry is complete and report has been submitted to the appropriate authority for taking final decision in the matter, and one case is still under progress, which is likely to be completed within this month. Apart from the above cases, there is one more case of 1984, where the Enquiry is complete and the Report is being submitted by the Enquiry Committee shortly.

5.15 It may also be mentioned here that it has been decided to review the cases in all aspects, where the claim of the candidate belonging to SC/ST was found to be incorrect/false."

5.16 In this connection, the representative of Air India during his evidence before the Committee on 6th April, 1987 further stated as under :—

"I would like to submit that out of 24 cases of false certificates, only five were based on complaints and the balance 19 were detected by our own Cell. So, first of all, I would like to submit that our own Cell is quite active and while reviewing the certificates given by the candidates, it is our Cell which found out most of the cases. Based on the Cell's report action was initiated."

5.17. When asked what measures had been taken to check this malpractice including launching of criminal proceedings against the persons who produced false certificates, the representative of Air India stated as follows :—

"From our side we try to check each and every certificate. We see that every certificate has got the seal of the authorised recognised authority.

So far as your second point is concerned i.e. referring the matter to the police, we have discussed the matter. We are going into it. If there is any case of submission of forged documents, we will report the matter to the police."

5.17 In reply to written query about the steps taken by Air India to ensure that reserved posts are filled by genuine SC/ST candidates only, the

Committee have subsequently been informed that "in order to ensure that reserved posts are filled by genuine SC/ST candidates only, the concerned Departments have been advised to be more particular and cautious in scrutinising the documents submitted by the candidates at the time of selection. The members of the Selection Panel are also advised to go through such cases carefully before recommending for appointment. Subsequently, the documents are further scrutinised by the Special Cell to ascertain the community status of the candidates and doubts if any, are investigated by the Special Cell before confirming the candidates in the services of the Corporation. The candidates are allowed to join the services of the Corporation on production of prima-facie documents as provided in the Presidential Directive in this regard."

5.19 During their evidence on 24th December, 1986, the Committee desired to know the action taken against Shri Nagarajan who had got the job in Air India on the basis of bogus certificate. The representative of Air India explained the position as under :—

"Mr. Nagarajan's case was that he is alleged to have submitted a bogus certificate to join under the reservation quota. When he joined his certificates were examined and they were accepted by the recruitment officials. Later on, on receipt of a complaint that his certificates were false, a departmental enquiry was ordered. He was charge-sheeted and the Inquiry Committee exonerated him. They said that based on the evidence, he was not found guilty, by the competent authority. Competent authority accepted the findings of the Enquiry Committee. So, he was exonerated. Later on when we had come here for the meeting for evidence, this case came up again and we were asked to send all the files and that is the latest status of the case."

5.20 The Committee desired to know as to what action was taken against Shri Nagarajan in pursuance of the views expressed by the Committee during the evidence of the Air India authorities before them a few months earlier. The Managing Director, Air India, submitted as under :—

"Even last time there was discussion on this. There is no doubt Mr. Nagarajan when he was recruited in the reserved quota on the basis of a certificate that certificate afterwards was found to be not genuine but by the time this matter came to light in 1979 an inquiry was held. The competent authority at that time thought no action was possible against Mr. Nagarajan."

5.21. The Committee enquired that when it was proved that it was not a genuine certificate, why the employees concerned was not dismissed, the Managing Director of Air India stated :

“Legally it may be difficult for Air India to do this but we will take your opinion into account.”

Asked whether Air India had taken the legal opinion in the case, the witness replied :

“We shall certainly do that.”

5.22. When the Committee asked the stand of Management in respect of bogus certificates, the representative of Air India stated as follows :

“As regards the stand on bogus certificates I am making a categorical statement that anything which comes to light henceforth there will be forthright dismissal. Nagarajan’s case is a peculiar case and we will take legal opinion. I have given a categorical assurance that henceforward there would be dismissal in such cases. But we will have to deal with this case in the light of the legal opinion.”

5.23. During their evidence before the Committee on 24th March 1987 the representative of Air India was again asked what action was taken by Air India against Shri Nagarajan who got the job and even promotion on a false certificate produced by him. The representative of Air India stated as under :

“We have charge-sheeted him for misconduct, the punishment for which is dismissal or removal from service.”

The witness further added :

“The charges are—breach of rules and regulations applicable to the establishment and furnishing, at the time of employment, wrong information. He has been given seven days notice. After that, we shall initiate action against him. The inquiry Committee will go into these charges and if the charges are proved, the punishment for misconduct is removal or dismissal.”

5.24. Out of 24 cases of alleged false certificates, the Committee have been informed that in 6 cases only the caste certificates have been found to be

correct. In 3 cases investigations are under progress. Out of the remaining 15 cases, services of 6 employees have either been terminated or they themselves resigned or left the service during investigation. Of the remaining 9, it has been proved in six cases that bogus certificates were produced and departmental proceedings were underway; one person has been reverted to his substantive post as he had been recruited as general candidate but had got the promotion on the basis of a false caste certificate and in 2 cases it was found that the employees were not belonging to SC/ST community and they were awarded punishment as per rules and since they were selected and appointed on standards applicable to general categories they have been placed in that category.

5.25. The Committee are of the view that procedure for investigating the veracity or otherwise of alleged cases of false certificate is too cumbersome and involves inordinate delays. The expect Air India Authorities to streamline the procedure so that such cases are investigated promptly and the delays curtailed.

5.26. During the evidence before the Committee, the representatives of the Air India has categorically assured them that once it is proved on the basis of investigations that a person has given a false caste certificate he shall be dismissed forthright. The Committee hope that this procedure will be adopted in the six cases where departmental inquiry has been instituted after the investigations revealed that the Community Certificates submitted by the persons concerned were false.

5.27. In regard to Shri Nagarajan's case the Committee will like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.

5.28. The Committee are of the view that dismissal/termination in such cases may not meet the ends of justice in full. In their opinion, where it is proved that a person hat given a false caste certificate, criminal proceedings should also be invariably launched against the culprit which will act a deterrent for the commission of such offences.

D. Posting Abroad

5.29. The Committee have been informed by the Ministry of Civil Aviation through a note that the number of officers (category-wise) posted

abroad during the last 3 years and number of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe Officers amongst them are as follows :

Sr. No.	Category	Total No. of Officers posted abroad during the last 3 years	SC/ST amongst them		No. of SC/ST Officers available	
			SC	ST	SC	ST
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1.	Sr. Captain (Commandor)	11	—	—	—	—
2.	Captain (First Officer)	15	—	—	—	—
3.	Operations Manager	3	—	—	—	—
4.	Dy. Operations Manager	4	—	—	—	—
5.	Manager-Flight Engineer	2	—	—	—	—
6.	Chief Flight Engineer	1	—	—	—	—
7.	Regional Flight Despatch Manager/Dy. Manager-Flt. Despatch	3	—	—	—	—
8.	Asst. Finance Controller	1	—	—	—	—
9.	Asst. Controller of Stores and Purchases.	2	—	—	—	—
10.	Station Manager (Commercial)	31	1	—	1	1
11.	Manager-Cabin Crew Operations	1	—	—	—	—
11A.	Sr. Station Manager (Com)	14	—	—	—	—
11B.	Regional Manager (Com)	02	—	—	—	—
11C.	Regional Director (Com)	04	—	—	—	—
12.	Sr. Accounts Officer	6	—	—	—	—
13.	Flight Engineer	12	—	—	5	2
14.	Sr. Flight Despatcher	18	—	—	—	—

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
15.	Sr. Tech. Officer	1	1	—	1	—
16.	Stores Manager	1	—	—	—	—
17.	Dy. Manager-Stores	2	—	—	—	—
18.	Asstt. Communication Manager	2	—	—	—	—
19.	Asstt. Manager-Operations	1	—	—	—	—
20.	Station Supdt. (Commercial)	60	6	—	21	6
21.	Station Supdt. (Inflight Service)	1	—	—	—	—
22.	Sr. Security Officer	3	—	—	—	—
23.	Accounts Officer	1	—	—	—	—
24.	Asst. Accounts Officer	18	2	—	6	—
25.	Security Officer	1	—	—	6	2
26.	Asst. Station Supdt. (Commercial)	24	3	—	69	22
27.	Asst. Station Supdt. (Inflight Services)	3	—	—	2	—
28.	Asst. Supdt. (Stores)	1	1	—	5	1
29.	Jr. Officer (Signal)	1	—	—	—	—
30.	Accountant	24	—	—	14	1
31.	Asst. Supdt. (Engineering)	51	3	—	3	—
32.	Dy. Engineering Manager	1	—	—	—	—
33.	Sr. Cashier /O.A.	3	—	—	4	—
34.	Communications Officer	1	—	—	1	—
35.	Asstt. Engg. Manager (Engg.)	2	—	—	—	—

The criteria for determining the suitability of officers for foreign posting are as below :

- (i) Good record of service relates to the 'Above Average' ratings for 3 consecutive years immediately prior to the year of posting.
- (ii) An effective personality.
- (iii) Power of expression and ability to communicate co-related to the job requirements.
- (iv) Decision making in terms of initiative, drive and decisiveness.
- (v) Suitability and ability to get along with the people.

The SC/ST officers in the above categories are either not senior enough or do not meet with the requirements laid down above, hence they were not posted. However, they will be considered for posting in terms of the criteria laid down above in future.

5.30. During their evidence on 6th April, 1987, the Committee asked the representatives of Air India the reasons why only a few SC/ST candidates were selected for posting abroad. The representative of Air India stated as follows :—

"If I may explain the procedure which we follow for foreign posting. Foreign postings are given on the basis of seniority as and when the person's turn comes. Suppose in a particular cadre there are 200 people. We will start from the top and start selecting people for foreign posting subject to their being suitable. Therefore, a person has to be, in order to be eligible for foreign posting senior enough to be considered for foreign posting. Here the reasons for less number of SC/ST candidates being posted abroad are two-fold.

One is that in certain categories there are no SC/ST candidates available at all. For example, in the last three years we had posted 11 Commanders abroad, but we could not post any SC/ST candidate because there is no SC/ST Commander available. Similarly we posted 15 First Officers, but we could not post any SC/ST officer because there is no First Officer available from SC/ST officers. About Station Manager (Commercial), there is only one person available, there. So, the reason for the shortfall is that in the categories where foreign postings are available, the SC/ST officers have not come upto

the level where they are eligible for posting. As and when persons become senior, their turn will come and they will get the postings."

5.31. When the Committee enquired about the specific period of service required for becoming senior enough to get a foreign posting, the representative of Air India replied :

"There is no period of service specifically laid down. The senior most in a particular cadre who has not gone abroad is considered for the foreign posting provided he is suitable. If in a particular cadre all the candidates have had a foreign posting then the person who returned first and who has stayed in India for the longest period will be considered for the foreign posting. By seniority we don't mean the number of years of service ; but the above factors."

5.32. When the Committee wanted to know whether there was any quota of reservation or preference or relaxation for SC/ST officers for postings abroad the representative of Air India submitted as under :

"I would like to submit that in any given cadre, the number of post in India is many times the number of posts abroad. For example, we may have 200 pilots in India and the number of posts outside the country in that cadre may be only 6 or 7. So, out of these 200 people, if we have to send only 6 or 7 pilots abroad, some policy regulation has to be laid down by the management. This particular policy is not laid down by any particular departmental head, but it is the Corporation's policy contained in the circular according to which the few posts available have to be given to a large number of persons."

5.33. As regards the specific rule followed by Air India about the foreign posting, the representative of Air India stated as follows :—

"We would like to assure the Committee that progressively more and more SC/ST officers are now becoming eligible for foreign postings. Secondly I would like to say there is one area where we keep in mind the interests of the SC/ST, that is, we have the criteria laid down in selecting a person for abroad posting. While selecting officers for posting abroad we keep in mind that the SC/ST officers are judged leniently."

5.34. As desired by the Committee, the following information with regard to the countries where the SC/ST had been posted, was furnished by Air India :

Category	Country
Station Manager	Tripoli
Station Superintendent	U.S.A. Dhaharan Doha Accra West Germany
Buyer	U.S.A.
Assistant Accounts Officer	Saudia Arabia Japan Kenya Muscat
Maintenance Manager	Japan London Dubai
Asst. Station Superintendent	Sharjah Harare Jeddah

5.35. The Committee are surprised to note that out of 332 employees posted abroad by Air India, only 17 belonged to Scheduled Castes. The Committee agree that in certain categories of posts, Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are not available for posting abroad, but they find from the information furnished that in categories like Flight Engineer, Accountant etc. where Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees are available, they have not been considered for posting abroad.

5.36. The Committee recommend that the claims of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees should be considered favourably at the time of

making postings in foreign countries to give them a fair share in such postings and also to enable them to familiarise with the work culture of other countries. The Committee feels that a stay in a foreign country, however short, will, by itself, be a very purposeful experience for the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees and will help them a lot (in broadening their outlook and to enhance their efficiency which in the final analysis will be to the benefit of Air India.)

NEW DELHI;

July 1, 1987

10 Asadha, 1909(S)

RAM RATAN RAM

Chairman,

Committee on the Welfare of
Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes

APPENDIX I

Statement of complaints of False Caste Certificate
(Vide Para 5.12 of the Report)

Sr. No.	Name and Designation, Date of Appointment	Community claimed before/after appointment	Ref. No. and Authority	Date	Reply recd. Ref. and Date	Ref. No. and Date Referred to Deptt.	Remarks
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	
1983							
1.	Mr. S.P. Hotye, Cleaner, 10.7.1978	Christian Mahadev Koli (ST)-Discrepancy in School Leaving Cert. and Caste Certificate.	Collector, Thane No. SCT(35)/ 2528 of 1/ 5.9.1983	No. HB- DESK-I-T. No. 5-131 of 12.3.1985	No. SCT(35)/ 6240 of 23.3.9185		Does not belong to ST Com- munity and he is treated as General candidate.
2.	Mr. Ghanshyam Swaroop Asst. Accounts Officer, 2.6.1977	Johla (SC)-Complaint received from Mr. Hari Kishan, Delhi.	Dy. Commis- sioner, Delhi. No. SCT(20)/ 300 of 21/ 29.4.1983	No.F. 14(443) CCS-11/84/ 5678 of 18.10.1984	No. SCT(35)/ 3871 of 23.10.1984		Proved that he belongs to SC Community.
3.	Mr. R. Murali, Asst. Flight Purser 16.1.1979	Balagi(SC)-Complaint received Details not given	Dist. Magistrate Bangalore, SCT (35)/2527 of 5.9.1983	No. DD. DSTW/E and T(2) CR-116/ 83-84 of 31.5.1985	No.SCT(35)/1312 of 11.7.1985		Proved that he does not belong to SC community- Resigned.

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
4. Mr. M. Chandran, Traffic Asst., Madras 26.9.1983	Velluvan (SC)-Contra- diction between School Leaving and Commu- nity Cert.	Collector- Tiruchirapalli, Tamil Nadu SCT(20)/3506 of 13.12.1983	K. DIS. 192478 of 8.4.1985	SCT(35)/ 959 of 28.5.1985	Proved tha tbc belongs to SC community.	
5. Mr. G.K. Mali, Punch Operator, 5.9.1983	Zad Mali (SC) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Directorate of Social Welfare, Pune 16.9.1983	No. CVN/246/ No. 16 dt. 29.10.1983		Proved that he does not belong to SC community. (Departmental enquiry is under pro- gress.)	6
		Director-Tribal Welfare, Nasik 20.3.1984	DTD/Estt/D- III/Caste/ Repd/252 dt. 25.4.84			
		Divisional Commissioner, Kokan Bhavan, Divn., New Bombay.				
		11.5.1984 Collector-Thane, 26.7.1984 12.3.1985	Home/Desk-I/ SCT(35)/423 T. No. 5-875 dt. 14.3.1985			

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
6.	Mr. M. J. Piedade, Driver, 23.6.1983	Christian Koli (ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Collector, Bombay SCT(35)/ 3288 of 18.12.85	GSC/SCL/ST 515 of 13.9.1985	SCT(35)/4089 of 12.11.1985	Proved that he does not belong to ST Commu- nity. Warned and treated as general candidate since he ful- filled require- ment.
7.	Mr. R. Ram Mohan Traffic Asst., Madras 29.10.1979	Raddier (ST). Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Collector, Tiruchirapalli, Tamil Nadu. RMD/1-SCT(20)/ 4136 of 1.2.82	RC-M2. 17652/82 of 25.6.1982	SCT(35)/68 of 17.4.1986	Proved that he does not belong to ST Community and hence, after conduct- ing enquiry, he was removed from the services of the Corpora- tion.

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8. Mr. L.R. Shriyan, Traffic Asst., 1.9.75	Roger(SC) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Tahsildar, Mangalore. RMD-1/SCT/20/ 04 of 31.3.82	No. D. Dis. MIS No. SCT(35)/ Cr-91/82-83 of 12.8.83	3951 of 29.10.84	Proved that he does not belong to SC and he has has been reverted to the post of Clerk.	
9. Mr. S. Ranganathan, Aircraft Tech. 2.4.1982.	Konda-Reddi(ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving Cert./Caste Certificate.				Proved that he does not belong to ST Community and hence chargesheet issued The Enquiry Committee found him guilty and awarded him punishment of reduction in pay scale.	

10. Mr. K. Janardan, Asstt. Flight Purser, 30.3.1977	Kote Kashatriya(SC) Complaint	Dist Magistrate Mangalore, SCT/2559/of 1/6/9.1983	DD/SC-ST/ DK2/MNG/84- 85 of 14.6.1984	Proved that he does belong to SC commu- nity.
11. Miss Yasmin Shulai, Air Hostess, 19.4.83	Jaintia(ST) Complaint	Dist. Magistrate Shillong Maghalaya SCT(35)/1645 of 1.7.83	P. 15/III/(1)/ 83 of 4.10.83 SCT(35)/ 3064 of 28.10.83	Proved that she belongs to ST Community.
12. Mr. Shyam Singh, Chowkidar, 8.8.72	Dom Dodya(SC) Complaint	Dy. Commissioner Tis Hazari, Delhi SCT(35)/ 1386 of 23.6.1983	F. 14(450)/ CCS-11/84/ 829 of 10.2.1984 SCT(35)/ 3773 of 15/16.10.84	Proved that he does belong to SC Commu- nity.
13. Mr. P. A. Fernandes, Typist-Clerk 25.5.1982	Christian Madev Koli (ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving Caste Cert.	Collector of Bombay, Old Customs House, SCT(35)/1429 of 24.6.1983	GSC/SCL/ST 444 of 30.4.1984 (received on 21.5.84)	Proved that he does not belong to ST Community. Departmental enquiry is under pro-

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
14.	Mr. S.K. Kenny, Jr. Security Asst., 26.5.1982	Mahadev Koli(ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Collector of Bombay, SCT(35)/1642 of 5.7.1983	GSC/SCL/ST/ MISC/4266 of 30.6.1184	—	His services were termi- nated from the Corpn.
15.	Mr. S. Natarajan, Traffic Asst., Madras 22.9.82	Konda Reddi(ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving Caste Cert.	Collector, Thane, SCT(35)/3983 of 25.1.1984	MB/D-1/V/ 11/84 of 15.11.84	SCT(35)/ 4849 of 18.12.1984	Proved that he does not belong to ST Commu- nity. Resigned from the service of the Corpora- tion.
1984						
1.	Mr. J. I. Kofes Storekeeper, 31.8.1983	Mahadev Koli(ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Executive Magis- trate, Thane, SCT(35)/3995 of 23.1.1984	L-DIS(CL)/ 6501/83 of 24.6.84	SCT(35)/ 2023 of 26.7.1984	Enquiry with appropriate Govt. Author- ity is in progress.

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
2.	Mr. M.D. Parane, Tr. Technician 20.10.1984	Halba(ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Executive Magis- trate, Amravati., SCT(35)/5116 of 12.12.1984 Dist. Magistrate Amravati. SCT(35)/5331 of 17.1.1985	MPL/AK-2/D. 20/V.S. 196/ 19850 of 12.8.1985 (recd. on 29.8.1985)	SCT(35)/ 2015 of 9.10.1985	Proved that he does not belong to ST Commu- nity. Depart- mental enquiry is in progress.
1985	1. Mr. V.C. Tairipaccus, Tr. Technician, 28.11.1983	Koli(ST)Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.	Collector and Dist. Magis- trate, Thane. SCT(35)/5922 of 18.2.1985	MSC/Cast/US/ 1101 of 10.9.1985 (recd. on 28.10.1985)	SCT(35)/ 5076 of 30.11.1985	Proved that he does not belong to ST community. Depart- mental enquiry is in progress.

<p>2. Mr. V.S. Jadhav, Sr. Cleaner, 23.5.1978</p>	<p>Hindu Mahar (SC) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.</p>	<p>Dist. Magistrate, Combatore No. SCT(35)/158 of 16.4.1985</p>	<p>No. D.O. Roc. 10316/8544 of 13.9.85</p>	<p>SCT(35)/ 4019 of 30.10.1985</p>	<p>Proved that he belongs to SC.</p>
<p>3. Mr. R. Ravichandran, Graduate Engineer Trainee, 12.3.1985</p>	<p>Scheduled Caste Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.</p>	<p>Konda Reddi (ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.</p>	<p>Dist. Magistrate Tirunelveli, Tamil Nadu. SCT(35)/3028 of 28.10.1985</p>	<p>Enquiry with appropriate Govt. Authority is in progress. —do—</p>	
<p>5. Mr. M.B. Goranki, Storekeeper, 10.9.1985</p>	<p>Mannervaru (ST) Discrepancy in School Leaving and Caste Cert.</p>	<p>Dist. Magistrate, Nasik. SCT(35)/ 3029 of 15.11.85 Dist. Tribal Rese- arch and Trg. Inst. Pune, SCT(35)/5722 of 24.2.1986</p>	<p>GB. Desk VI MA-I-39/85 of 21.1.85 AS.P.S/Exam S.P D/D-332/ 8044 of 13.3.1986</p>		

<p>6. Mr. C.S. Durai, Loader, 8.9.1982</p>	<p>Hindu Nadar (SC) Complaint from the Secretary, SC ST Welfare Ministry Mantra- laya</p>	<p>Asst. Secty. to the Govt. of Maharashtra, Mantralya SCT(7)/5036 of 12/27.11.85</p>	<p>HQ/DS-317/ 6013 of 12.9.85</p>	<p>Proved that he does not belong to SC Community and was charged sheeted and awarded punishment of suspension for 4 days.</p>
<p>7. Mr. M. Ramasubramanian Ty. Clerk, Madras, 24.2.1986</p>	<p>Konda Reddi (ST) Discrepancy in the School Leaving and Caste Cert.</p>	<p>Collector of Madras, SCT(35)/ 278 of 20.5.86</p>		<p>Enquiry with appro- priate Govt. Authority is in progress.</p>

APPENDIX II

(Vide Para 4 of the Introduction)

Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations contained in the Report)

Sl. No.	Reference to Para number in the Report	Summary of Conclusion/Recommendation
1	2	3
1.	1.6.	The Committee regret to note that in the guidelines issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises relating to the appointment of Directors on the Board of Air India, there is no stipulation for appointment of persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee are of the view that with the reservation policy being in force over a number of years, these classes have been denied the opportunity all these years and hope that the Government will take action to include at least one person belonging to SC/ST in the Board of Directors of Air India.
2.	2.10.	The Committee regret to note that although the reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in posts were introduced in Air India w.e.f. 1 January, 1966 yet the principle of carry forward of unfilled reserved vacancies to subsequent recruitment years was introduced after more than two years in 1968 by the Corporation on the plea that in January, 1966 it had not found it feasible to adopt the carry forward principle. In the Committee's opinion when a policy has been evolved and laid down after due consideration by the Government, the implementing authorities have no business to delay the implementation. It should have been the earnest endeavour of the Corporation to adopt the carry forward

1

2

3

principle also w.e.f. the same day i.e. 1.1.1966. The Committee desire that proper steps should be taken to ensure that such things do not reccur in future, and hope that loss of posts for not carrying forward are made good.

3. 2.11.

The Committee cannot but express their anguish that the formal directives regarding reservations in recruitment and promotions for Scheduled Castes/ Scheduled Tribes in services received from the Bureau of Public Enterprises on 10th May, 1974 were communicated to the Corporation by the Ministry on 23rd July, 1975 after a lapse of 14 months with the result that the employees belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes were denied their due promotions for more than a year. Had the Ministry been prompt in conveying the directives to the Corporation promptly, such injustice to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes employees could have been averted. The Committee expect the Ministry to be more careful in such matters in future and also expect the Corporation to effect promotions with retrospective effect to remedy the in justice.

4. 2.12.

In regard to the monitoring of the implementation of the Directives regarding reservations, the Committee are not convinced by the argument of the Civil Aviation Secretary that "it is the management of the organisation which should ensure that the Directive is implemented." In the opinion of the Committee this amounts to the Ministry washing of their hands of all responsibility about implementation of the Government Directive to the Corporation. The Committee feel that primarily it is the duty of the nodal Ministry to ensure that any such directives are implemented in letter and spirit and for that purpose they should get the necessary feed back or returns from organisations or bodies under their control. The Committee recommend that the Ministry should strengthen its machinery to monitor the implementa-

1

2

3

tion of the reservation directives so that the desired benefit goes to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe persons in matters of recruitment and promotions in the Corporation.

5. 2.20.

The Committee are surprised that Liaison Officer in the Ministry of Civil Aviation has not visited the Head Office of Air India for the last two years. This shows that neither the Ministry nor its Liaison Officer attach the importance and urgency to the implementation of the reservation policy that it deserves more so when the visit of the Under Secretary-in-charge of SC/ST Cell to Northern India Regional Office of Air India brought to light a number of irregularities.

6. 2.21.

Keeping in view the fact that the Liaison Officer has to monitor the reservations in all the departments of the Ministry and the organisations and Undertaking thereunder, the Committee recommend that he should visit the Head Office as well as Regional Offices of Air India at least once a year if not more to ensure that reservation orders are implemented meticulously in letter and spirit.

7. 2.22.

The Committee firmly believe that mere appointing a Liaison Officer is not enough. What is needed is concerted action on the part of the Liaison Officer to ensure due compliance by the appointing authorities of the orders and instructions pertaining to the reservations in favour of SC/ST and other concessions/relaxations admissible to them.

8. 2.23.

The Committee have been informed by the Civil Aviation Secretary that the SC/ST Cell attached to Liaison Officer at present is manned by an Under Secretary, one Desk Officer and one Assistant. Further that this Cell has been entrusted with the responsibility of overseeing the implementation of reservations in all the Departments and offices and Undertakings under the Ministry. Seeing the

1	2	3
		<p>enormity of the work, the Committee recommend that the staff strength of the Cell should be suitably augmented by appointing more staff who are well conversant with the orders/instructions relating to reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes so that the interests of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are properly looked after.</p>
9.	3.7.	<p>The Committee note that while making recruitment at Delhi, Bombay, Calcutta and Madras to Group 'C' and 'D' posts from amongst the candidates belonging to local area or region, the percentages of reservations for SC/ST fixed for those areas are adhered to yet this is not the case in case of recruitments in these categories made at Jalandhar and Trivandrum. In the Committee's opinion this anomaly might have deprived a number of SC/ST candidates employment at the recruitments at Jallundhar and Trivandrum and is a serious lapse on the part of Air India.</p>
10.	3.8	<p>The Committee recommend that Ministry of Civil Aviation should look into the matter in depth and find out whether any injustice had been done to SC/ST candidates. In case it comes to their knowledge that some injustice has been done to SC/ST candidates, they should take steps to redress it in future recruitments.</p>
11.	3.9.	<p>The Committee further recommend that orders relating to percentages fixed for SC and ST for Group C and D posts to be filled on regional basis are followed meticulously.</p>
12.	3.10.	<p>The Committee regret that the appointing authorities in Air India do not indicate the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates to the Employment Exchanges to enable them to sponsor right type of candidates in subsequent recruitments even though</p>

1

2

3

there are specific instructions to that effect contained in the Ministry of Home Affairs O.M.No. 14/12/67-Est (D) dated 10th April, 1968.

13. 3.11. However, the Committee have been assured by the representative of Air India that in future the concerned authorities will strictly adhere to the aforesaid instructions and invariably convey to Employment Exchanges the precise reasons for the rejection of SC/ST candidates so as to enable them to sponsor for subsequent vacancies right type of candidates from these communities. The Committee hope that the Air India authorities will keep their promise.
14. 3.12. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry of Civil Aviation issue, if not already done, the necessary instructions to all the public undertakings including Air India under their control, so that whenever the appointing authorities reject the SC/ST candidates they should communicate reasons for rejection of those candidates to the Employment Exchanges so that the latter may sponsor for subsequent vacancies the right type of SC/ST candidates.
15. 3.18. The Committee note that Air India is associating one officer belonging to SC or ST in the Recruitment Boards and Departmental Promotion Committees irrespective of the fact whether they are interviewing Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe or general candidates so as to ensure that Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are judged with relaxed standards and not with the standards by which the general candidates are judged. The Committee also note that in case Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe officer of appropriate status is not available with Air India, they requisition the services of SC/ST officer of comparable status from some Government Department or some public undertaking.

1	2	3
16.	3.19.	The Committee trust that they will continue to adhere to this practice in future also to safeguard the interests of SC/ST candidates.
17.	3.27.	<p>The Committee regret that the concessions and relaxations available to Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are not notified in the recruitment advertisements issued by the Air India. They recommend that the concessions and relaxations should invariably form part of the advertisements.</p> <p>It should also be made clear in the advertisements that "if adequate number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates who satisfy the minimum standard are not available to fill reserved vacancies then SC/ST candidates may be selected to the extent of shortfall in vacancies by relaxing minimum standard provided they are not considered unfit to hold the post" as provided in Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension O.M.No. 36011/8/84-Estt. (SCT) dated 17th October, 1986. Such an advertisement will enable the candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes who do not strictly fulfil the educational standards to apply and facilitate the filling up of reserved posts.</p>
18.	3.34.	<p>The Committee are surprised to note that the Air India introduced reservation in promotion for unskilled categories viz. Peons, Cleaners, Sweepers, Gardeners, Loaders etc. from April 1978, although in their earlier reply it has been stated that reservation in posts filled by promotion upto the lowest rung of class I was introduced w.e.f. 23 July 1975. The Committee regret the delay of about three years in introduction of reservation in promotions for unskilled categories. They strongly feel that as a result of delay of three years in enforcement of these orders the SC/ST employees have been deprived of the opportunity for three years to get promotional quota under these orders without any fault on their part.</p>

-
- | 1 | 2 | 3 |
|-----|-------|--|
| 19. | 3.35. | The Committee desire that the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation look into the matter and fix responsibility for the serious lapse in applying these orders so late in Air India. The Committee also urge the Ministry to devise ways and means to compensate the SC/ST employees who have suffered on account of the delayed implementation of reservation orders. |
| 20. | 3.36. | The Committee feel perturbed that there is shortfall of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in promotions even in the lower categories of posts like Peon, Head Cleaner, Sweeper, Gardener, besides the shortfall of SC/ST in Clerical posts like Senior Clerk, Office Assistant Stenographer etc. |
| 21. | 3.37. | The Committee recommend that earnest efforts should be made to fill all the vacancies reserved for SC/ST in promotion. In case candidates from the S.C. community for which the vacancies are reserved are not available, the vacancies may be filled by the candidates from the S.T. community after carrying forward the vacancies for three recruitment years and <i>vice versa</i> . |
| 22. | 3.38. | The Committee also recommend that if the existing SC/ST employees are not suitable for promotion to the posts of Stenographers, Senior Clerks, Office Assistants, the in-service training should be arranged for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to make them proficient and fit for promotion to these categories of posts. |
| 23. | 3.44. | The Committee note that a number of irregularities in the maintenance of Rosters have been pointed out by the Liaison Officer of the Ministry during his inspections of Rosters in 1983, 1984 and 1985. This only shows that proper care is not taken by the authorities in the maintenance of Rosters. |
-

-
- | 1 | 2 | 3 |
|-----|-------|---|
| 24. | 3.45. | The Committee need hardly emphasise that the Roster is an important mechanism to keep a legitimate watch on the proper and adequate intake of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe persons in services and that it would cease to have any significance, whatsoever, if it is not maintained properly in the light of existing rules, regulations and instructions. |
| 25. | 3.46. | The Committee recommend that henceforth earnest efforts be made both by the appointing authorities and the Liaison Officer in the Ministry to see that the Government orders on the maintenance of rosters are meticulously followed so that no injustice is done to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe persons in the matter of recruitment and promotion. |
| 26. | 3.47. | The Committee regret that as pointed out by the Liaison Officer in his inspection report, certain posts were de-reserved without proper authorisation. They take strong exception to this and expect that in future no post be dereserved in contravention of the directions issued in this regard. Meanwhile responsibility should be fixed in earlier cases of deservations without proper authorisation. |
| 27. | 3.48. | The Committee also recommend that the Liaison Officer should invariably submit his inspection report to the Managing Director, Air India for his information and necessary corrective action so that the deficiencies detected are brought to notice of all concerned and prompt action is taken to remedy the situation. |
| 28. | 3.49. | The Committee note that Air India maintains 40 point Roster for direct recruitment made on all-India basis and 100 point Roster for direct recruitment made on Regional basis. For promotions made by selection, a 40 point Roster is maintained as per Government orders on the subject. |
-

1	2	3
29.	3.50.	The Committee have, however, been informed that for posts filled on head-office basis, rosters are maintained on head office basis. For posts filled on regional basis the position is region-wise. However, this has not been done in all cases.
30.	3.51.	The Committee urge that the instructions regarding the maintenance of Rosters for posts filled on regional basis should be followed strictly in each case.
31.	3.58.	The Committee regret to note that a large number of vacancies in 1983, 1984, 1985 and 1986 both in direct recruitment and promotions reserved for SC/ST candidates have been dereserved and a number of reserved vacancies have been allowed to lapse by Air India
32.	3.59.	The Committee are not satisfied with the reasons given by Air India that sufficient number of SC/ST candidates with requisite qualifications and experience have not been forthcoming in some of the categories even after applying relaxed standards of suitability. The Committee feel that now there is no dearth of educated SC/ST candidates. What is lacking is sincere and concerted efforts on the part of recruitment authorities to find out suitable SC/ST candidates before the expiry of three recruitment years. The Committee, therefore, recommend that dereservation of reserved vacancies should be resorted to only when it becomes inescapable after all possible efforts, including special recruitments, to locate and recruit adequate number of SC/ST candidates have failed.
33	4.10.	The Committee note that total number of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees in Air India which was 1238 (14.61%) and 101 (1.19%) respectively out of total employees in January 1975 has increased to 3184 Scheduled Castes (19.70%) and 809 Scheduled

1

2

3

- Tribes (5.00%) as on 1 January, 1987. The Committee are, however, surprised to note that the percentage of Scheduled Caste employees in class III has come down from 36.92% to 29.94% and in class IV from 90.36% to 76.15%.
34. 4.11. The Committee are also unhappy to note that the percentage of Scheduled Tribes in all categories i.e. Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' is below the prescribed quota of reservations.
35. 4.12. The Committee recommend that a time-bound programme should be chalked out to wipe out the shortfalls in all categories of posts, at least upto the lowest rung of class I, by resorting to special recruitments exclusively for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes and giving them liberal concessions/relaxations while considering them for appointment.
36. 4.13. The Committee note that Air India has been sending teams of their officers to Tribal Areas and have met with some success in getting tribal candidates for lower posts from Himachal Pradesh. However from the North-eastern States they have been able to select 27 Scheduled Tribe candidates for Traffic Assistant Cadre and 5 Scheduled Tribes for post of Telex Operators.
37. 4.14. The Committee feel that if more teams are sent at regular intervals to areas of tribal concentration especially to North Eastern States for recruitment of Scheduled Tribe candidates, the backlog of Scheduled Tribes can be wiped out to a great extent at an early date. The Committee will like to be kept apprised of the outcome of steps taken by Air India as suggested by them.
38. 4.19. The Committee are surprised to note that Air India treat the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates

1

2

3

as apprentices who are taken with relaxed standards and select them for employment only when they come up to the required standard.

39. 4.2). In this connection the Committee draw the attention of the Air India authorities to the provisions in Chapter VI of Brochure on Reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in posts/services under the Public Enterprises issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises, which read as follows :

“SC/ST candidates promoted or initially appointed on the basis of recruitment through competitive examination or otherwise by relaxed standards should be given extra training to enable them to come up to the standards of other candidates. In-service training should be provided by the appointing authorities within their own offices. Such candidates should on their appointment be placed on probation, and the rules/orders of the enterprise regarding probation will apply to them.”

The Committee recommend that as per aforesaid Government instructions, the Air India should appoint the SC/ST candidates who are selected with relaxed standards as probationers and not apprentices.

40. 5.4. The Committee note that a Special Cell has been set up in Air India to look after the interests of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees. The Cell maintains Grievances Register.
41. 5.5. The Committee feel that more publicity among the SC/ST employees of Air India may be given about the existence of the arrangements for redressal of their grievances so that they have no difficulty in approaching the right person at the right time for redressal of the grievances, if any.
42. 5.6. The Committee recommend that prompt action should be taken on the representations and grievances
-

1

2

3

of the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees whatever be the nature of the grievance to inculcate confidence and sense of security and well being among them.

43. 5.10. The Committee have been informed that instructions were issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises for providing reservation in residential accommodation for SC/ST in June, 1974 and subsequently in April, 1981 and October, 1983. However, the reservations in residential accommodation was introduced by Air India in 1985. The Committee are not convinced by the argument advanced by the Air India authorities that the list for allotment in Bombay had been completed in 1958 and 1971 and for Delhi in 1973 in consultation with the representatives of the Management and Members of the Labour Relations Committee.
44. 5.11. The Committee are of the firm view that when the instructions were issued in 1974 by the BPE, it was incumbent on the Air India Authorities to revise their wait lists according to those instructions. It is really regrettable that the reservation was introduced in 1985 *i.e.* after a lapse of about 11 years. This the Committee cannot condone it. They expect that such lapses should not recur and if there is backlog because of the delayed implementation of the BPE instructions, Air India should make concerted efforts to clear it.
45. 5.24. Out of 24 cases of alleged false certificates, the Committee have been informed that in 6 cases only the caste certificates have been found to be correct. In 3 cases investigations are under progress. Out of the remaining 15 cases, services of 6 employees have either been terminated or they themselves resigned or left the service during investigation. Of the remaining 9, it has been proved in six cases that bogus

1

2

3

certificates were produced and departmental proceedings were underway ; one person has been reverted to his substantive post as he had been recruited as general candidate but had got the promotion on the basis of a false caste certificate ; and in 2 cases it was found that the employees were not belonging to SC/ST community and they were awarded punishment as per rules and since they were selected and appointed on standards applicable to general categories they have been placed in that category.

46. 5.25. The Committee are of the view that procedure for investigating the veracity or otherwise of alleged cases of false certificate is too cumbersome and involves inordinate delays. They expect Air India Authorities to streamline the procedure so that such cases are investigated promptly and the delays curtailed.
47. 5.26. During the evidence before the Committee, the representatives of the Air India has categorically assured them that once it is proved on the basis of investigations that a person has given a false caste certificate he shall be dismissed forthright. The Committee hope that this procedure will be adopted in the six cases where departmental inquiry has been instituted after the investigations revealed that the Community Certificates submitted by the persons concerned were false.
48. 5.27. In regard to Shri Nagarajan's case the Committee will like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.
49. 5.28. The Committee are of the view that dismissal/termination in such cases may not meet the ends of justice in full. In their opinion, where it is proved that a person has given a false caste certificate, criminal proceedings should also be invariably launched against the culprit which will act as a deterrent for the commission of such offences.
-

1	2	3
50.	5.35.	The Committee are surprised to note that out of 332 employees posted abroad by Air India, only 17 belonged to Scheduled Castes. The Committee agree that in certain categories of posts, Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are not available for posting abroad, but they find from the information furnished that in categories like Flight Engineer, Accountant etc. where Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees are available, they have not been considered for posting abroad.
51.	5.36.	The Committee recommend that the claims of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees should be considered favourably at the time of making postings in foreign countries to give them a fair share in such postings and also to enable them to familiarise with the work culture of other countries. The Committee feel that a stay in a foreign country, however short, will, by itself, be a very purposeful experience for the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees and will help them a lot in broadening their outlook and to enhance their efficiency which in the final analysis will be to the benefit of Air India.
