

r>**Title:** Need to notify the scheme and place before the Supreme Court on Cauvery water issue to implement the Cauvery Water Dispute Tribunal's interim order.

MR. SPEAKER: The House will now take up 'Zero Hour'.

Shri Vaiko to speak.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow all of you because you have given a notice with regard to an important issue. Please speak one by one. Now I have called Shri Vaiko to speak.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow Shri Vaiko, Shri Sathiamoorthy, Dr. Subramanian Swamy and Shri Baalu. Please speak one by one.

Shri Vaiko to speak.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Muthiah, I will allow you also.

... (Interruptions)

serial number 2.

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO (SIVAKASI): Hon. Speaker, Sir, through you, I would draw the immediate attention of the Central Government to the very serious problem of the Cauvery River water dispute(Interruptions)

श्री मोहन सिंह (देवरिया): सपोर्ट विदड़ा करो।

डा. सुब्रह्मण्यम स्वामी (मदुरै): वह इनके हाथ में नहीं है।

SHRI VAIKO : I will come to you.

On 25th June, 1991, the Cauvery Water Tribunal passed an Interim Award to be implemented. Seven long years have passed. The matter went to the constitutional Bench of the Supreme Court of India(Interruptions)

">SHRI R.L. JALAPPA (CHIKBALLAPUR): I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: This is 'Zero Hour'. I will allow you also.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Mr. Speaker, Sir, this cannot be allowed. Tomorrow, this matter is coming before the Supreme Court...(Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : On 9th April, 1997, the matter came before the constitutional Bench of the Supreme Court and the Attorney-general for India gave a commitment before the Supreme Court that a scheme would be formalised, finalised and placed before the Parliament. Sixteen months have passed. Till this minute, nothing has been done. Therefore, it is an issue on which...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, please take your seat for a minute.

Shri Jalappa, what is your point?

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Sir, tomorrow, this matter is coming before the Supreme Court. This matter is sub judice. This is likely to influence the decision of the Supreme Court. This matter cannot be allowed.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Sir, tomorrow, it is coming before the Supreme Court... (Interruptions)... So, it is sub judice now. This should not be allowed to be raised here... (Interruptions)... This is life and death question of Karnataka... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : It is not sub judice. It is a matter to be discussed here. It is a relevant matter to be raised in Parliament... (Interruptions).

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : I know, there is a threat given by Ms. Jayalalitha. They are threatening the Government... (Interruptions)... This should not be allowed... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, please complete.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : This cannot be allowed. It is highly irregular... (Interruptions)... They must resign and get out... (Interruptions) They are threatening the Government for anything and everything... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : The Attorney-General gave the commitment before the hon. Supreme Court of India that the scheme will be formalised and tabled in the Parliament of India... (Interruptions) The Government of Karnataka with all illegal and unconstitutional methods... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Impossible. There was nothing illegal. They want to ruin us. Sir, they are getting maximum water from Karnataka...(Interruptions)...They did not even allow us to have it... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, please complete now.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : We cannot tolerate this. They are trying to threaten the Government for anything and everything... (Interruptions)... They are blackmailing the Government... (Interruptions)... Instead of having such allies, the BJP Government must resign and go for polls once again... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : The Union Government of India should notify the scheme before the Task Force today and it should be tabled... (Interruptions)... The Counsel is going to appear before the Supreme Court. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please take your seats. I will allow you also.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, under the matter of talks and negotiations, Dr. Karunanidhi and Shri Patel made dubious attempts to disturb the Tamils...(Interruptions)... I am telling you this... (Interruptions)... No more talks and negotiations should take place... (Interruptions)... Two times, negotiations have taken place... (Interruptions)

12.07 hrs

(At this stage, Shri R.L. Jalappa and some other hon. Members came

and stood on the floor near the Table.)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, this is not good. Please go to your seats.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : In the United Front, Shri Baalu was also the Minister ... (Interruptions)... I would request the Government to give us justice... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Jalappa and other hon. Members, please go to your seats. You can raise your point from your seat itself. It is not good.

12.08 hrs

(At this stage, Shri R.L. Jalappa and some other hon. Members went back to their seats.)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, we want our rights to be protected. Our basic rights should be protected. We want justice from this Government... (Interruptions)...The previous Government of Shri Devegowda and Shri Gujral destroyed the interest of the Tamils. They betrayed the interest of Tamils. The previous Government where Shri Baalu was also a Minister, betrayed the Tamils... (Interruptions)...

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Vaiko says.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Therefore, I would emphatically request and urge upon the Government of India to notify the scheme and table the same in the Parliament ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, please conclude.

SHRI VAIKO : Today, it should be notified by the Government of India and submitted before the Supreme Court of India... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri T.R. Baalu, your notice is with me. I am going to allow you also to speak later. So, please take your seat now.

">SHRI R. MUTHIAH (PERIYAKULAM): Mr. Speaker, Sir, there is an urgent need to notify the scheme already formulated by this Government on Cauvery Water issue... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow Members from Kerala also. Hon. Members, please take your seats.

SHRI R. MUTHIAH : There is an urgent need to notify the scheme already formulated by the Government on Cauvery Water issue with a view to effectively implement the Cauvery Water Dispute Tribunal's interim order. The interim order had been awarded as early as 25.6.1991. After that, it had been notified by the Central Government on 10.12.1991. Even after that notification in the gazette, the then Government not at all tried to implement that award.

Afterwards the Karnataka Government had gone to the Tribunal itself and their plea had been dismissed by the Tribunal. After that, the Supreme Court also dismissed the plea of the Karnataka Government in this regard. ... (Interruptions) Yes, your plea has been dismissed. After that, on the suggestion of the Tribunal and the Supreme Court the then Government had formulated a scheme by name 'Cauvery River Authority Scheme' in April 1997 itself. After that, on 30th September 1997 the matter came up before the Supreme Court. The then Government had gone on a request in the Supreme Court for the adjournment of the case. After that, the then United Front

Government in which my friend Shri Baalu and others were Ministers had gone on record by asking postponement of the case. ...(Interruptions)

12.11 hrs (Shri P.M. Sayeed in the Chair)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Baalu, after Shri Muthiah, you are getting the chance. Please do not exhaust everything now.

SHRI R. MUTHIAH : They have requested the Supreme Court to postpone the case on five occasions. The participants in the United Front Government, that is, the DMK and the TMC have betrayed the people of Tamil Nadu. I have to place it on record in this House. After that it is coming up before the Supreme Court tomorrow. Even on 11th November 1997 the Attorney-General had asked for only four weeks time. They had said it in December last year also. Even after all these things, the earlier Government as well as the present Government are not at all taking any interest in notifying the scheme already formulated by the Government of India. The Supreme Court cannot be asked now and then to postpone the case as the matter is burning in Tamil Nadu. The people of Tamil Nadu are asking us as to what for 40 Members from the State are there in the Lok Sabha without doing anything to, at least, get the notification of the scheme issued. Already the earlier Government had betrayed the people of Tamil Nadu. The present Government has to do justice to the State of Tamil Nadu by notifying the scheme today itself. Otherwise tomorrow we cannot say anything. It is a burning issue for the people of Tamil Nadu. I have to warn the Central Government to at least do justice to the State.

Today is the crucial day. Please notify the scheme and place the scheme before the Supreme Court tomorrow and get justice for the State of Tamil Nadu.

">SHRI T.R. BAALU (MADRAS SOUTH): Mr. Chairman Sir, the Supreme Court of India has posted a list of issues pertaining to the Cauvery Dispute Tribunal award for tomorrow. The Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu has sent a fax message on 16.7.1998 urging the Government to see that no further adjournment would be asked for from the Supreme Court. I quote only one line from his letter.

"I request you to kindly instruct the Attorney-General to report compliance of its earlier commitment by the Government of India before the Supreme Court of India on 21st July 1998 without seeking further adjournment."

We want to know the exact instruction that has been given to the Attorney-General by the Government of India, pertaining to the case posted for tomorrow. The Government of Tamil Nadu as well as lakhs and lakhs of Tamil people are very much insecure about the attitude of the Central Government. I want to have a categorical reply from this Government as to what instructions have exactly been given to the Attorney-General for tomorrow's case. (Interruptions) I need a reply from the Government. I want to have a reaction from the Government. The Government's attitude is lukewarm.

The AIADMK and the MDMK are part of the Government. (Interruptions) They are shedding crocodile tears. That is why the Government is not coming forward. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Baalu, you have already stated whatever you wanted to state. Government. (Interruptions)

12.16 hrs

(At this stage, Shri T.R. Baalu and some other hon. Members left the House.)

">DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (MADURAI): Sir, I will not repeat what Shri Muthiah has said.

I have only a short point. The short point is that there is a Supreme Court order and the Government of Mr. Vajpayee has already taken two adjournments: one on the 30th March and the other in April. Now, the case is coming up tomorrow. So, unless they become thoroughly confused or impotent, they must take a stand here what

they are going to do tomorrow. They cannot take an adjournment. This is a very serious matter where the farmers of these States are vitally involved. When there is a Supreme Court order, the Government should have the courage to say that they are going to implement it. Or, if they do not implement it, they should be ready to face the consequences. But they should not shilly-shally and take another adjournment. (Interruptions)

">THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS, MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (SHRI RAM NAIK): Sir, the hon. Member, Dr. Subramanian Swamy has used the word 'impotent'. (Interruptions) It might be normal to them because they have also been impotent.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I seek a clarification from Dr. Swamy? What is the exact word that you have used?

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Mohan Singh, let me understand this.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I have used a parliamentary word to say that they are 'powerless', which means 'impotent'. I did not use it in the 'Viagra' sense!

SHRI RAM NAIK: I just want to draw your attention. (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Is this the opinion of Dr. Swamy or his leader? (Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: You may kindly examine it. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me hear the hon. Minister.

SHRI RAM NAIK: The hon. Member, Dr. Swamy did not have the courtesy even to say 'hon. Prime Minister'; he said 'Vajpayee'. So, I feel that the way he has been addressing in the House is not parliamentary enough. I request you to examine what he has said. (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Is it his opinion? Is it Dr. Swamy's opinion or his leader's opinion?

THE MINISTER OF CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ANANTH KUMAR): Sir, the DMK was part of the Government for the last two years. (Interruptions) Were they impotent then in the UF Government?

SHRI RAM NAIK: The hon. Member himself is*

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : The DMK is the most impotent party in India. They can never protect the Tamils of India. (Interruptions)

SHRI LALU PRASAD (MADHEPURA): Sir, we fully understand the meaning of the word 'impotent'. We know it. He has clarified it. 'Impotent' means

जो नपुंसक है। नपुंसक के मायने

... (व्यवधान)

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

हिन्दी भाषा जानने वाले लोग जानते होंगे कि नपुंसक का मतबल हीजड़ा होता है। हम किसी को बोल नहीं रहे हैं। आप व्याख्या कर दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

हम इस बात को जानते हैं।

श्री मदन लाल खुराना : आप नहीं हैं, हम जानते हैं। आपके नौ बच्चे हैं, हमें मालूम है।

MR. CHAIRMAN : The hon. Member has already explained in what sense he has used that word. If it is unparliamentary, I will expunge it.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALLAPPA : If it is the opinion of his leader, why should you remove it? ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: For that matter, if anybody uses any unparliamentary word, I will expunge it.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : The Cauvery issue between Tamil Nadu and Karnataka is not the problem of today or yesterday. It is there for the last 100 years. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI A.C. JOS (MUKUNDAPURAM): Sir, the State of Kerala is also involved in this issue. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI R. MUTHIAH: It is there only since 1974. He is misleading the House. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Muthiah, you were heard patiently. Let the hon. Member make his submission.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R. MUTHIAH : It was not there for the last 100 years. He is misleading the House. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have already given the ruling in respect of the word used by Dr. Subramanian Swamy. If it is unparliamentary, we will expunge it.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am saying that they must respond. Otherwise, they have to face the consequences afterwards. (Interruptions)

The consequences will be disastrous. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me hear Shi Jalappa.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : He has distorted the truth. The issue is not there for 100 years. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vaiko, let me hear Shri Jalappa. It is Zero Hour. You had your say. You cannot deprive him.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let me conduct the House.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. SATHIAMOORTHY (RAMANATHAPURAM): Sir, for the Zero Hour I have given the notice. I got the permission also. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Sathiamoorthy, I heard everyone of you. The hon. Member is also to be heard. How can you deprive him?

SHRI V. SATHIAMOORTHY : We want a response from the Government. We do not want to be interrupted by some other hon. Members. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Sathiamoorthy, I am on my legs. Can you please sit? Just now, Dr. Subramanian Swamy, expressed a word about which many hon. Members took objection. I have given my ruling on that.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the hon. Member say whatever he wants to say. After all he is also the hon. Member of this House. He too has the right to say whatever he wants to say. You cannot deprive him.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : The Government of hon. Vajpayeeji is speaking the Karnataka language. So, why should he speak? ... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Sir, he is not speaking my language. ... (Interruptions) I am not supporting Shri Vajpayee's Government. It is these people who are supporting this Government. If at all he hears, it is their words and not mine. I have already told you that on 25.6.1991 the Cauvery Tribunal took a decision that the Government of Karnataka must allot 205 TMC of water to Tamil Nadu. That is one part. Second part is regarding the schedule, that is the Government of Karnataka must release this much water in the first week, this much water in the second week, this much water in June and this much water in July. So, the Tribunal wants that the Government of Karnataka should act as reservoir to feed water to Tamil Nadu at the cost of our farmers. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, let him be heard.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY What is the attitude of the Government? ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : It is a very serious and an emotional matter. Shri Vaiko and others, you are all leaders of parties and you all will have to behave like leaders here. You are representing your State and he is representing his State. After all, this is the supreme law making body of the country; let him also say whatever he wants to say.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him speak; you may kindly take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, they have no respect for the rules and regulations of the Award. They are not abiding by the verdict of the Tribunal. ... (Interruptions)

should be expunged. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Baalu, you had your say and everybody heard it. Let him also be allowed to be heard. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

correct.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him say whatever he wants to say.

... (Interruptions)

I want to know your ruling. He is going into the conduct of the Tribunal's Award. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : He is speaking against the judiciary.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him say whatever he wants to say.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Baalu, without allowing him to say what he wants to say, how can you come to the conclusion?

... (Interruptions)

Tribunal itself.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Whatever it may be, he can say that and you cannot object that. It is not that at your mercy, he has to speak. Please do not do that. Let him have his say.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is not good on your part to deprive him of the opportunity to speak. This is not good. Please do not interrupt him.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO: Sir, we cannot compromise on our birthright.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vaiko, you had your say. The hon. Members from Karnataka also have to say something about it. Please do not interrupt.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. Please do not interrupt. This is not the way. Do not interrupt him like this.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : If he talks something against the Tribunal, then I will definitely interrupt him.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vaiko, suppose he speaks strictly on the lines, I will allow him; if there is any unparliamentary words or some objectionable part which he expresses, then I will not allow.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, I respect the Chair; but he should not speak anything about the Tribunal.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vaiko, this is not the way.

Shri Muthiah, I have given the floor to Shri Jalappa. Please do not compel me to name you. You are a leader of a political party of this House. I have given the floor to Shri Jalappa. Let him be heard.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : But he should not speak anything about the Tribunal or the judiciary. He himself said that it is sub judice, then, how can he speak about it? ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: If there is anything objectionable, I will see. I am here to conduct the House and not you. Please do not do that.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, I respect the Chair and obey by whatever it says. But he should not mislead the House. ... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, I am on a point of order. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has raised a point of order.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, it will apply to parliamentary procedure at any point of time... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to yield to a point of order. Shri Swamy, under what rule are you raising your point of order?

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am quoting Rule 41.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please read out.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : It is at sub-rule (xxiii) in page 20. The issue is this. He can ask as to what the Government's stand is. He cannot comment on what the Supreme Court has said...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is a point of order raised by him.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, they do not understand what is a point of order. They understand only disorder. They are in disorder. The whole Government is in disorder. He has the right to ask a question to the Government but he cannot comment on the order of the Supreme Court...(Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, there is no point of order in 'Zero Hour'...(Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You are reading only RSS constitution. There are no rules in RSS...
(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I give the ruling? I have gone through page 20.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me give the ruling. He has raised a point of order.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR (MANGALORE): There is no point of order in what he has said.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Since I have allowed him to raise a point of order, I am giving the ruling.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : During 'Zero Hour', it has been the convention of the House that no point of order is allowed. Dr. Swamy knows it very well. He is interested not in getting the Cauvery water. He is interested only in technicalities.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Sir, he is a new Member.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, he is not a new Member.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : I am as old as you are. You are interested only in technicalities. Sir, he is not interested in getting water. MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dhananjaya Kumar, I ask you to resume your seat now. Let me deal with him.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, they have already presented their case. Now, we must be heard. Before pronouncing your ruling, we also must be heard...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Kindly resume your seat. I will call you. After Shri Jalappa speaks, you are going to be called.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Jalappa has not referred anything about the Tribunal and therefore, the question of point of order does not arise.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : He has commented about the Tribunal...(Interruptions)

SHRI R. MUTHIAH : He has referred to the orders of the Tribunal and the Supreme Court...(Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : The Government of Karnataka has no respect for law. The Supreme Court itself has said it about the Karnataka Government...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: As far as I understand, I heard him. I was also hearing him.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please hear me. He was only narrating the history and not the findings. Whatever has gone on record can be referred. Let me tell you and we all know that any case pending before any court or tribunal amounts to sub judice and that will not be referred to here. Everybody knows it. He is a senior Member. As far

as I could follow, I did not hear any such thing. Therefore, Shri Jalappa, having taken note of it, may please make his submission and conclude.

SHRI C.P.M. GIRIYAPPA (CHITRADURGA): We are pleading here the same that we are pleading before the Supreme Court. He was just referring to the history of the case...(Interruptions).

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (सम्भल): सभापति महोदय, मेरा पाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।

सभापति महोदय : क्या पाइंट ऑफ आर्डर है ?

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव: मेरा व्यवस्था का सवाल यह है कि यह बहस कर्नाटक और तामिलनाडु में चल रही है। हमारी राय है कि कावेरी के मामले को लेकर यह सरकार ... (व्यवधान) मेरा बात सुन तो लीजिये। मेरा पाइंट ऑफ आर्डर यह है कि ... (व्यवधान).. जाल्लपा साहब आप भी धीरज रखिये और आप भी धीरज रखिये। यह मामला नहीं होता तो आप सरकार से विदड़ा कीजिये। हम सब मिलकर पंचायत करवा देंगे।

श्री वी. धनंजय कुमार: आप क्या जाने कावेरी का मामला ?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri V. Dhananjaya Kumar, please sit down. Now, Shri Jalappa will speak.

... (Interruptions)

श्री सी.एच. विजयशंकर: हमने आपसे मौका मांगा, हमें नहीं दिया। क्या हमारे लिये अधिकार नहीं है ? आप हमें मौका दें।

सभापति महोदय : आपको भी मौका मिलेगा।

Please resume your seat.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am standing on my legs. Now, let us hear Shri Jalappa.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : He cannot criticise the Supreme Court.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, he will not do so.

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Tamil Nadu and Karnataka are neighbourly States. We have hitherto been living as brothers. Only in 1991, when this decision came, there was a turmoil. Properties worth crores of rupees were destroyed. A lot of lives were lost. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Our people were killed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vaiko, I am asking you to keep quiet. You cannot conduct the House like this.

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, I respect you. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete it.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no; I will not allow you to speak like this.

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Keeping all these things in view, we wanted to see that this matter was settled amicably. When Shri S.R. Bommai was in power, there was an understanding between Shri K. Karunanidhi and Shri

Bomma that they need not go before any court or tribunal. They would settle it among themselves. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him say.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, Shri Sathiamoorthy.

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA: These two parties, that is, the DMK and the AIDMK, just to settle the accounts...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want the Government of India to do?

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions) *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Baalu, please resume your seat.

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : In 1991-92, we - to the people of Tamil Nadu have released 332 TMC.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vaiko, let him complete.

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : In 1992-93, we have released 367 TMC.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is nothing objectionable in that. Please let him complete.

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : In 1993-94, we have released 223 TMC. ... (Interruptions) This is the figure given by their own Government, that is, the Government of Tamil Nadu. These are not my figures. ... (Interruptions) In 1995-96, we could not release more water. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want the Government of India to do?

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is 'Zero Hour'.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : I am requesting the Government to convene a meeting of four Chief Ministers and decide it.

*Not Recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is all right.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Dhananjaya Kumar.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have called Shri Dhananjaya Kumar.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Sir, secondly, I would like to bring to the kind notice of this august House that ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO (SIVAKASI): Sir, we do not want ... (Interruptions)

wants to score political mileage ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Vaiko and Shri Baalu, I am on my legs.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you please resume your seats?

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, these people have compromised ... (Interruptions) We will never compromise ... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Sir, I have already requested the Government to convene a meeting of the Chief Ministers and decide the matter ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Jalappa, please conclude now.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Yes, Sir. Day in and day out they have been threatening that ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, it is not a part of it.

Shri Dhananjay Kumar.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, we want justice which has been denied to us for all these years ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vaiko, I have called the name of Shri Dhananjay Kumar.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let me give the floor to Shri Dhananjay Kumar.

... (Interruptions)

*Expunged as ordered by the chair.

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, we want justice ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dhananjay Kumar is from Karnataka, let me hear him please.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI A.C. JOS : Sir, the Members from Kerala should also be heard ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, you will be given a chance.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI R.L. JALAPPA : Sir, this Government has gone to dogs ... (Interruptions) Let them dissolve the House and go in for elections ... (Interruptions)

SHRI P.C. THOMAS : Sir, Kerala is also entitled to the share of Cauvery water ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Thomas, I have already said that you will be given a chance. Now let me hear the Member from Karnataka.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI P.C. THOMAS : We are not interested in polluting the Cauvery with politics ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Nobody is playing politics ... (Interruptions)

SHRI MULLAPALLY RAMACHANDRAN : You people wanted to fish in troubled waters ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : How can you say that? ... (Interruptions)

This is our right ... (Interruptions) We are not here to play politics ... (Interruptions)

SHRI MULLAPALLY RAMACHANDRAN : You cannot have monopoly over the Cauvery waters ... (Interruptions) We equally are involved in it ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: It seems nobody is allowed to talk here.

Shri Mullapally, would you please resume your seat?

... (Interruptions)

SHRI P.C. THOMAS : Sir, we are not emotional ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Everyone of you is emotional. I find no exception.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : It is the right of our State ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please resume your seat. You all are emotional.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Muttaih, please take your seat. I am on my legs.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS : Sir, we are not against it ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dhananjay Kumar, please take your seat for a minute.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, I will be very brief ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: After all, it is a serious and emotional matter. Kindly restrain yourself.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, it will decide the future destiny of Tamil Nadu ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I ask my friend, Shri Vaiko to please sit down? It is an emotional issue for both the States and for other States as well. You have said whatever you wanted to.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, we are the affected people ... (Interruptions) We are the people who have been denied justice ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is not the way you should behave. Do you want the House to be run properly or not?

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, I have called the name of Shri Dhananjay Kumar.

Shri Kumar, please avoid all controversial matters.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, I will be brief ... (Interruptions)

डा. शकील अहमद (मधुबनी) : हम लोगों के नोटिस का क्या हुआ ?

... (व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : आपको समय कैसे मिलेगा ? अभी एक विषय ही खत्म नहीं हुआ है ।

">SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the outset let me assure Shri Vaiko, Dr. Swamy, Shri Muthiah and other friends from Tamil Nadu that we are for a moment not against the rights of Tamil Nadu. Let them be rest assured. We will never deny them their due share. When I say `we', I mean the the Government of Karnataka. I am giving them an assurance. Let them not interfere like this.... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Are you speaking on behalf of the BJP?

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Yes, the BJP is also committed to protect their right. The people of Tamil Nadu will get their due share. We do not deny that. We are on a very specific point today. There has been an age-old dispute between the two States on the sharing of Cauvery water.... (Interruptions) I am helping you. Why are you interfering like this? The tribunal has passed an interim award wherein they have said that every year Karnataka should ensure releasing about 205 TMC of water to Tamil Nadu. There is no dispute about that.... (Interruptions) Why are you interfering? History says, right from the day of the interim award of the tribunal, that is from 1991-92 to 1997-98, every year Karnataka has ensured that more than 205 TMC of water is released... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : It is the distortion of facts. He is misleading the House.... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : These are facts. They cannot dispute it. They are on technicalities. They are only interested in dispute. They are not interested in getting water. This is the difficulty with these people. They are not interested in getting the water released. I am very sorry to say this.... (Interruptions) Shri Vaiko

must understand, the Parliamentary etiquettes require that when a Member has presented his case, he should hear others also.... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Muthiah, will you resume your seat?

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : We have heard them and the Parliamentary etiquettes require that they must allow others also to have their say.... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : It is not necessary that you should get up after every second. Let others also say something.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, they should hear me patiently. They cannot interfere like this. You must come to my rescue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dhananjaya Kumar, you please address the Chair.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : He is misleading the House.... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Mr. Chairman, Sir, you must protect me. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are not allowing me to conduct the House. Every second you stand up and start saying something or the other. That is my difficulty. How can I conduct the House? I think nobody can conduct the House like this.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (HAJIPUR): You can allow a special discussion on this. There are other Members also who wish to raise certain important points. If all of them agree, you can allow a special discussion on this.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, facts are facts. Because of what Shri Vaiko, Shri Mutthiah or Dr. Swamy are saying, the day will not become the night or the night will not become the day... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want the Government of India to do?

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : I am coming to that. No amount of shouting will help them.... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am asking Shri Dhananjaya Kumar and not you. You have already stated what you wanted to.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You may come to the point. What do you want the Government of India to do?

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : What they want is,... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You should tell, what do you want and not what they want.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, unless I say what do they want, I cannot say what I want.... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Shri Baalu, you have.* the people of Tamil Nadu when you were in power. I have never cheated the people of Tamil Nadu. Today, you have no moral right to speak for the people of Tamil Nadu. ... (Interruptions) Sir, I would like the Government of India to prepare a scheme for implementation of the interim award of the tribunal. My point is, all along Karnataka has been faithfully abiding by the interim award of the tribunal.

The fact remains that the scheme is not prepared. Nothing is going to happen within 24 hours. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO (SIVAKASI): Sixteen months have already passed. There cannot be any further delay. ... (Interruptions)

*Not recorded.

**Expunged as ordered by the chair.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Shri Vaiko, Dr. Swami and Shri Muthiah, all of them are party to the National Agenda for Governance prepared by this Government. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Why do you shout now?

SHRI VAIKO (SIVAKASI): Sir, it was Dr. Karunanidhi, Shri Baalu and his party who had..*

t the State of Tamil Nadu.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, the whole House and the nation know that the National Agenda for Governance clearly says that this Government is going to pronounce a national water policy. Our only plea is that the river water policy be announced first. Then only this award can be implemented. The whole issue can be settled then.

SHRI VAIKO : This is a delaying tactic again to betray us.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, Shri Vaiko knows very well that heavens are not going to fall within a day.

SHRI VAIKO : The Government should notify it today.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR : Sir, their demand is there and our demand is also there. Ultimately the matter will have to be resolved amicably. We request the Prime Minister to convene a meeting of Chief Ministers of all these States. Let there be a meeting convened of the Chief Ministers by the hon. Prime Minister and let the matter be amicably settled.

SHRI VAIKO : I warn the Government not to commit a grave mistake by not notifying the award today itself.

">SHRI MULLAPALLY RAMACHANDRAN : Mr. Chairman, Sir, Cauvery water dispute is a very sensitive issue. It is my request to the Government that this matter must be viewed with the amount of seriousness it deserves. As you are perhaps aware, river Cauvery flows through Mananthavady of North Vynad which is in my constituency. So, this is not an issue between Karnataka and Tamil Nadu alone. It is an issue pertaining to all the four southern States of the country. So, it is in the fitness of things that Kerala is involved in any discussion on the dispute. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. SATHIAMOORTHY : You can also go to the tribunal. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. What is objectionable in it?

(Interruptions)*

*Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not disturb him.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : I do not approve of it. You kindly sit down. Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is not the way to react. What is wrong in his speech? For everything or anybody, you stand up. I will allow nothing of that sort. Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions) *

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is a limit. You are one of the Members of Panel of Chairmen. You have to behave properly. I am sorry to state that. Will you please resume your seat? I am on my legs. What is objectionable in his speech? ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is not the way to behave in this House. I am sorry to state that. You should not behave like this. What is objectionable in his speech? ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What he has said is, not only these two States, but all the four States are interested. Is anything wrong in that? That is not the way to behave. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Not now. Let him finish.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is applicable to you also.

Shri Mullapally Ramachandran.

SHRI MULLAPALLY RAMACHANDRAN : Mr. Chairman, Sir, while deciding the issue, it is my humble request that the State of Kerala is to be involved in the discussion. Time and again, the State of Kerala has represented this matter before this Government. Unfortunately, nothing has been done and the Govt. is sleeping over these representations. It is in the fitness of things that the State of Kerala is to be involved in all the discussions regarding Cauvery water dispute. Otherwise, it is going to be more serious, more intricate and it cannot be resolved amicably. ... (Interruptions)

*Not recorded

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Mallikarjuniah.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : There will not be any discussion. (Interruptions) There is no need for any discussion.

SHRI VIJAYASHANKAR (MYSORE): I would like to say only this much. ... (Interruptions) I am coming from Mysore constituency. The entire issue lies in my constituency. Under any circumstances, this Tribunal cannot solve this problem. * I have got every right to say.... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not do that. It is a matter of judiciary. That will not go on record.

(Interruptions) .*

MR. CHAIRMAN: What you want the Government of India to do now?

SHRI VIJAYASHANKAR : I straight away come to the point. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I ordered for its expunction.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI K. VIJAYABHASKARA REDDY (KURNOOL): Somebody must answer. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister will be there to react.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI VIJAYASHANKAR : Fortunately we have received good rains. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want the Government of India to do?

SHRI VIJAYASHANKAR : This issue is going to be politicized. What I would like to say is, the National Water Policy should be formulated immediately, through which this problem should be solved. There is no other go and it should be done immediately. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : It should be notified today itself. ... (Interruptions)

*Not recorded.

संसदीय कार्य मंत्री तथा पर्यटन मंत्री (श्री मदन लाल खुराना): सभापति जी, इसके पहले कि मैं सरकार के बारे में बताऊं, हमारे माननीय मुलायम सिंह जी और बालू जी ने यहां कहा कि ए. डी.एम.के. शोम।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : मैंने नहीं कहा।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री मदन लाल खुराना: हां, आपने नहीं कहा।

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : आपने अभी मेरा नाम लिया है।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री मदन लाल खुराना: मैंने बालू जी के बारे में कहा है।

... (व्यवधान)

आपके बारे में मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि

... (व्यवधान)

मैंने एक कहानी पढ़ी थी कि अंगूर खट्टे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

13.00 hrs.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Baalu, allow me to conduct the House.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: As far as this is not unparliamentary, I can allow it.

... (Interruptions)

श्री मदन लाल खुराना: बालू जी को सुनने की सहनशक्ति भी होनी चाहिए।...

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Under what rule?

He should not tell any stories during Zero Hour... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no Point of Order.

... (Interruptions)

">

श्री मदन लाल खुराना: मैं श्री मुलायम सिंह के बारे में कहना चाहता हूँ, जैसा इन्होंने कहा, आज विदड़ा करो, उसके बारे में मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि लोमड़ी और अंगूर की कहानी आपके ऊपर फिट बैठती है। मैं बालू जी से कहना चाहता हूँ।... (व्यवधान)

(Interruptions) .*

*Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record except the speech of Shri Khurana.

... (Interruptions)

श्री मदन लाल खुराना: यह मामला पिछले सात साल से चल रहा है और अप्रैल १९९७ में अटार्नी जनरल ने सुप्रीम कोर्ट को रिटन अंडरस्टैंडिंग दी थी कि हम पोजीटिव चीज लेकर आएंगे।

... (व्यवधान)

बालू जी, आप पिछली सरकार में मिनिस्टर थे, मुलायम सिंह जी, आप भी पिछली सरकार में मिनिस्टर थे।

... (व्यवधान)

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Baalu, please take your seat. The hon. Minister is on his legs.

... (Interruptions)

श्री मदन लाल खुराना: सुप्रीम कोर्ट में रिटन अंडरस्टैंडिंग के चलते ग्यारह महीने आपकी सरकार रही, आपने कुछ नहीं किया

... (व्यवधान)

आप हमको शेम कहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान) आपने अंडरस्टैंडिंग देने के बाद भी कुछ नहीं किया।

... (व्यवधान)

(Interruptions) ..*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Baalu, will you please let him say?

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us hear, Shri Khurana, first!

श्री मदन लाल खुराना): मैं बालू जी से कहना चाहता हूँ कि केवल शेम कहने से काम नहीं चलेगा। यह मामला काफी सैन्सिटिव है।

... (व्यवधान)

कावेरी रिवर वाटर डिस्प्यूट का मामला सुप्रीम कोर्ट में पेंडिंग है और सुप्रीम कोर्ट के बाहर संबंधित राज्यों की कोई आम राय नहीं बन पा रही है। मामला काफी सैन्सिटिव है। इस समय कुछ कहना सुप्रीम कोर्ट की कार्यवाही को प्रभावित कर सकता है। इसलिए इस समय कुछ भी डेफिनेट ऐश्वोरेंस नहीं दी जा सकती। सदन की भावनाओं को मैं प्रधानमंत्री जी तक पहुंचा दूंगा।

... (व्यवधान)

In protest, we are walking out.

*Not recorded.

13.04 hrs

(At this stage, Shri T.R. Baalu and some other

hon. Members left the House.)

SHRI VAIKO (SIVAKASI): Sir, this is our consistent demand. We will not compromise on this... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is over now. We have spent 45 minutes on this.