

**Title:** Introduction of the the Appropriation (No.4) Bill, 1998.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI YASHWANT SINHA): Sir, I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 1998-99.

MR. CHAIRMAN :The question is:

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 1998-99."

The motion was adopted.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I introduce\*\* the Bill.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (MADURAI): Sir, I would like to speak on this.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (MAVELIKARA): Mr. Chairman, the House has extended time only for the Supplementary Demands for Grants.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I would just like to put one point for the consideration of the House. The Russian Prime Minister is here. I have to join a discussion later with him as part of the Indian delegation. I will be very grateful if this item of business is finished now.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN : Mr. Chairman, Sir, we have only extended time till the reply of the Finance Minister on the Supplementary Demands for Grants. Since that is over we have to as such move on to Item No.27, that is, discussion under Rule 193. ...(Interruptions) I am not saying that we should not take it up now. I am only saying that the time for this item of business has to be extended after taking the sense of the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If the House agrees, we will take up Item No.24 now.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We agree.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Prof. Kurien, we will now take up this item. It will take only two to three minutes.

---

\*Published in the Gazette of India, Extraordinary, Part-II, Section-2,

dated 21.12.98

\*\*Introduced with the recommendation of the President.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN : Mr. Chairman, you yourself gave a ruling earlier that Shri Bhakta can speak at the time of consideration of the Appropriation Bill.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (CALCUTTA SOUTH): The Finance Minister has appealed to the House that the Russian Prime Minister is here and that he has to take part in a discussion with him.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (MADURAI): That does not mean the Parliament has to close down.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Manoranjan Bhakta will speak on this Bill.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I also want to speak on this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister may now move that the Bill be taken into consideration.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 1998-99, be taken into consideration."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion moved:

"That the Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 1998-99, be taken into consideration."

... (Interruptions)

SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA (ANDAMAN AND NICOBAR ISLANDS): Sir, I want to say something... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (MADURAI): After him, you will have to call me... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: He had sought my permission and I have given him the permission to raise his point.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am seeking your permission... (Interruptions)... I am also taking your permission.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Bhakta had taken my permission. There are some rules. You had not given the prior notice.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am giving you the notice now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Bhakta had already given the notice and I have permitted him to speak.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am giving the notice now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, you cannot give. Please cooperate with the Chair.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : What cooperation? You are not permitting me... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please cooperate with the Chair.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Are you not permitting me?

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is on his legs.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I agree. I also have the right to speak... (Interruptions)... So, I want to know as to whether you are permitting me or not... (Interruptions)... Are you not permitting me?... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Swamy, please sit down. Your notice is not with me.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You tell me that you are not permitting me.. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: If a Member is desirous of speaking on the Appropriation Bill, he should send intimation to the specific points intended to be raised by him by 10.00 a.m. upto the House to the Minister concerned to find out position in respect of the points.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You have residuary power but you do not want to exercise it. That is the matter... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: He had given a prior notice and I have allowed him to speak. ... (Interruptions)

>SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA (ANDAMAN AND NICOBAR ISLANDS): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am thankful to you that you have permitted me to say a few words. The present Appropriation Bill No.(4), 1998 which is in relation to the Supplementary Grants, to authorise this Parliament, to give powers to the Government to draw money from the Consolidated Fund of India to the tune of Rs. 14,449.96 crore for the year 1998-99. I would like to specifically ask the hon. Finance Minister that on the one hand during this current year, for which he has sought more money, his Ministry has issued circulars to all the Ministries to 'follow 10 per cent austerity cut' and on the other hand, he has come with the demand of such a huge amount of money. Can he just tell us as to what is the principle of his budgeting the estimation.

It is a general trend we found that in every year wherever the original allocations are there, subsequently he has again sought more money during the time of Supplementary Grants. Subsequently, neither the original allocation was spent nor the Supplementary allocation was spent. Can he kindly enlighten this august House as to what principle he is following? How is he managing his financial system?

My second point is about the 10 per cent austerity cut which he has mentioned. This House is supreme to grant money to the executive, to the Government to draw and spend for the particular purpose against the heads and sub-heads. Now, when he is passing the Budget, he gives his commitment to the nation that 'these are the heads, these are the amount of money allotted and these are the works which he will be doing for the benefit of the people of this country.' But subsequently, while coming to Parliament, he is issuing back date back-door circulars to all the Ministries that 'you do not spend this money.' This way, is he not going against the interest of the country?

When he is giving 10 per cent austerity cut and also issued circulars then why is he again asking for more money? What will he do with that money? He has replied to the Supplementary Grants that he will find this money somewhere. Some more money will be needed.

There is some less money, some increase or some decrease. This will be taken into account. But can you clearly state what is your system of budgeting and estimation and how are you doing this? This is my question.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am following the same system in this country which Governments have followed over the years since 1950 when this Constitution came into existence. I had explained while replying to the debate on the supplementary demands that there are occasions where Ministries come up with requests for extra expenditure and it is the endeavour of the Minister of Finance to make sure that it does not result in additionality of overall expenditure because if we do not locate savings, then it will become absolutely unsustainable. That is why, we are not doing anything behind the back.

SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA: You have commitment to the nation.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I will draw the attention of the hon. Member to the Supplementary Demand for Grants. If you look at the Supplementary Demand for Grants, then for every item of expenditure, there is a justification there. We have said why we are making that provision and need of the circumstances. For overall economy and austerity, I am sure the hon. Member will agree that it is the prerogative of the Government to make sure that moneys are properly spent and where money cannot be spent, that money is saved. It is in national interest to make sure that we save even after we made budgetary provision. In all fairness, forthrightly I am coming to the House with the entire account. It is before you. Nothing is held back from this House and it is within the power of this House to approve it or reject it. I am pleading with you to approve it because it is all fair and above board.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The question is :

"That the Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 1998-99, be taken into consideration."

The motion was adopted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up Clause by Clause consideration of the Bill. The question is :

"That Clauses 2 and 3 and Schedule stand part of the Bill."

The motion was adopted.

Clauses 2 and 3 and Schedule were added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The question is :

"That Schedule stand part of the Bill."

The Motion was adopted.

The Schedule was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The question is :

"That Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Long Title stand part of the Bill."

The motion was adopted.

Clause, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I beg to move:

"That the Bill be passed."

MR. CHAIRMAN : Motion moved :

"That the Bill be passed."

>DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (MADURAI): There is a third reading. For that I do not need to give you notice before 10 o'clock. That is the tradition of the House. You have all the power. You can read Rule 318.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know that. If you want to say something, please do it in brief.

... (Interruptions)

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I have only one point. I would like the Finance Minister to take this House into confidence, whether it is a fact that in the Budget he had said that the total tax revenues would rise by 22 per cent and from April till the end of November for which statistics are available, according to our information, the annual rate is only 7 per cent.

17.00 hrs.

In fact, in the month of November, the tax revenues are actually negative. In view of all the indicators going downwards, I want to know whether the Minister of Finance would consider making a comprehensive statement or bringing a white paper so that we know exactly where we stand well before the Budget Session and advise him or whoever is there at that time to formulate a Budget to rescue the country. It is a question of the country.

For example, let us take foreign investment, for which they spoke so much. The cumulated amount of foreign investment in November of last year, which was itself a bad year, was Rs.9 billion. It has now gone down to Rs.8.5 billion. This means, people are selling. This means, we are following the Indonesian pattern. I would like the Minister of Finance to tell this House whether it is a fact that the rate at which he is getting his revenues is much, much lower than what he told us at the beginning of the year.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: As far as direct taxes are concerned, we are on target; as far as indirect taxes are concerned, we are at a shortfall. This is something which I have never hidden from the House. Whenever occasion has arisen, I have said that there is a shortfall. But what will be the nature and extent of the shortfall is something which should be calculated at the end of the year and not at this point of time.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Practically, this is the end of the year.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I would like to dispute in this House with all the emphasis and confidence at my command this repeated reference to Indonesia and other East Asian countries. India is not in trouble. Please remember this. Despite all the problems, we have successfully managed this economy. I would like Dr. Swamy to please take note of it and not keep on repeating it. India is not Indonesia and India will not go the Indonesian way.

Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The question is:

"That the Bill be passed."

The motion was adopted.

---

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House will now take up discussion under rule 193 on natural calamities.

... (Interruptions)

श्री थावरचन्द गहलोत (शाजापुर): सभापति महोदय, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

सभापति महोदय : जी हां, आपका क्या व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ?

श्री थावरचन्द गहलोत सभापति महोदय, आज की कार्यसूची के क्रम संख्या २६ पर तत्कालीन अनुसूचित जाति और जनजाति आयुक्त के वर्ष १९८९-९१ के ३० वें प्रोत्तिवेदन पर विचार करने का उल्लेख है तथा उसमें फुट नोट में उसका पूरा विवरण भी दिया गया है कि उस पर कब विचार किया जाएगा, किन्तु सभापति महोदय उस पर विचार नहीं किया जा रहा है और पिछली सरकार के समय में हुए अनेक आदेशों के कारण अनुसूचित जाति और जनजाति के कर्मचारियों का प्रमोशन रुका हुआ है। मेरा अनुरोध है कि इस पर चर्चा की जाए और मुझे बताया जाए कि यदि अभी इस पर चर्चा नहीं की जा रही है, तो कब की जाएगी ?

सभापति महोदय : कृपया आप बैठ जाएं। इसमें व्यवस्था का कोई प्रश्न नहीं है। उस मद पर चर्चा चार बजे होनी थी जैसा कि कार्यसूची में दिया गया है। चूंकि वह मद अभी समाप्त नहीं हुई है इसलिए बहस निर्णय के अनुसार आगे शुरू होगी।

श्री थावरचन्द गहलोत : सभापति महोदय, कार्य मंत्रणा समिति का निर्णय तो हो चुका है कि इस पर चर्चा कराई जाए और यह विषय पिछले कई दिनों से कार्यसूची में बहस के लिए इसी प्रयोजन से आता रहा है, लेकिन इस पर अभी तक बहस नहीं पूरी नहीं हुई है।

सभापति महोदय : इस विषय पर विचार होगा और बहस करने के लिए समय नियत होगा। तब इस पर आगे बहस होगी। कृपया आप स्थान ग्रहण करें।

... (व्यवधान)