

BR>**Title:**Demand of a clarification on the two contradictory statements made by the ministers on vandalism, obscene demonstration and harassment of artists including Shri Dilip Kumar.

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL :Sir, please refer to page 954 of Kaul and Shakhder's Parliamentary Practice and Procedure which speaks on the Doctrine of Ministerial Responsibility. It says that the Parliamentary control over the Ministry rests on the fact that any action of the Ministry can be called in question by any Member. This is the Doctrine of Ministerial responsibility.

Sir, yesterday, the hon. Home Minister, Shri L.K. Advani made a statement disapproving of the vandalism and obscene demonstration and harassment of artistes and others including Shri Dilip Kumar. My point is totally different. An hon. Minister belonging to this Government has reportedly been threatening these artistes and supporting those people engaged in vandalism, obscene demonstration and all such things. It is not only that. It has never happened that once a film has been approved by the Censor Board a film which has been awarded at least 14 international awards - it has not been allowed to be screened. I am not going into the details of the film but the freedom of expression is jeopardized. The artistes are feeling that some extra constitutional authority has declared a cultural emergency. My point is different.

सभापति महोदय : आपने अपना सवाल उठा दिया, आपका पाइंट हो गया। अब आप बैठ जाइये।

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : How can a Minister say like that? He has not withdrawn what he has said. He must come to the House and explain why he has supported such an activity. I want a direction from the Chair. After a statement has been made by the hon. Home Minister, how can a Minister of State continue to say like that?... (Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Protection is not given to the producer of the film and for screening of the film...(Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : The Minister should explain it. We want a clarification from him.

सभापति महोदय : ठीक है, आपने सवाल उठा दिया और मिनिस्टर ने भी सुन लिया, अब आप बैठ जाइये।

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : We are not satisfied. It is a collective responsibility. The Government cannot speak in two voices. One Minister is making one statement and another Minister is making another statement. We want a ruling from the Chair. How can the Government speak in two voices?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : How can a member of the Cabinet hold a different view where there is collective responsibility?

... (Interruptions)

Where is the collective responsibility?... (Interruptions)

सभापति महोदय : आपने सवाल उठा दिया। अब आप बैठ जाएं।

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : He must come to the House and explain it. I am referring to page 954 of Kaul and Shakhder relating to the doctrine of ministerial responsibility...(Interruptions) When a Member has raised a question, he must come and explain it.

सभापति महोदय : अब इसमें बहस बढ़ाने की गुंजाइश नहीं है।

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : This is a very important matter...(Interruptions)

SHRI N.N. KRISHNADAS : As this is a very important matter, we want a clarification from the Government...(Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : The Government cannot speak in two voices. How can the Government speak in two voices? The Home Minister is making one statement and another Minister is telling other thing outside which is quite opposite to the letter and spirit of what has been said here...(Interruptions) I have a right to get a reply. The

hon. Minister must come and explain what he has said, why he has said and whether he agrees to the statement of the hon. Home Minister or not...(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Yesterday, the hon. Home Minister condemned the incident which happened in Mumbai. But another Minister has supported the action of the Shiv Sainiks. How can a film, which was approved by the Censor Board, be again sent back to the Censor Board?...(Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : We seek your protection. It is a privilege of a Member. I am referring to page 954 of Kaul and Shakhder...(Interruptions)

सभापति महोदय : ठीक बात है। आपने मजबूती से सवाल उठाया। अब कार्यवाही को आगे बढ़ाने दीजिए।

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, you should protect us...(Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : We want a ruling from the Chair...(Interruptions)

SHRI N.N. KRISHNADAS : Since this is a very serious matter, we want a ruling from the Chair...(Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : As I said earlier, the Home Minister has made a statement. Another Minister is not agreeing to the Statement. How can he continue to be a Minister? He should be removed from the Government.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : There should be collective responsibility. The Home Minister is holding one view and another Minister is holding another view.

सभापति महोदय : एक ही बात को बार-बार कहने से क्या लाभ है? आपने सवाल उठा दिया और सरकार ने सुन लिया।

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : We want a ruling on this...(Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : Sir, you can give a direction saying that he must come to the House and explain why he is differing from the stand taken by the Home Minister. He is opposed to the statement made by the Home Minister...(Interruptions)

SHRI AJOY MUKHOPADHYAY (KRISHNAGAR): What is your ruling?

सभापति महोदय : आप पहले बैठ जाइए। मैं इसके बाद रूलिंग दूंगा।

... (व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : कृपया आसन ग्रहण करिए।

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, you should give a ruling. We want a ruling from the Chair.

श्री बसुदेव आचार्य : आप पहले रूलिंग दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : माननीय संसदीय कार्य राज्य मंत्री संबंधित मंत्रियों को सूचित कर देंगे।

श्री बसुदेव आचार्य : क्या सूचित करेंगे?

... (व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : आपने जो सवाल उठाया।

श्री बसुदेव आचार्य : आप सवाल भी बता दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI RAM NAIK: Sir, he is challenging your ruling. How can he do like that?...(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : I am not challenging it.

* Not

Recorded