

an>

Title: Issue regarding use of defamatory, insulting and unparliamentary words by a Member of Parliament to another Member.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House shall now take up Item No.31.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI DEEPENDER SINGH HOODA (ROHTAK): No, Sir. We have given a notice....(Interruptions)

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE (GULBARGA): Sir, I would like to bring to your kind notice, I need not say that you are an experienced and one of the senior-most Members of this House. You also have a long record of being the Deputy Speaker of this House.

In the morning session, on the issue of food processing, which was raised by Rahul Gandhi ji yesterday...(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is raising a point of order.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Please refer to Rule 352. On that issue another Member of this House not only raised certain objections but also used defamatory, insulting and unparliamentary words to another Member. Though you are well aware, I will just read and bring to your kind notice, Rule 352 says:

"A Member while speaking shall not-

(I) refer to any matter of fact on which a judicial decision is pending; (This is not applicable)

(ii) make personal reference by way of making an allegation imputing a motive to or questioning the *bona fides* of any other Member of the House unless it be imperatively necessary for the purpose of the debate being itself a matter in issue or relevant thereto;"

So, he raised it in Zero Hour. It is not only that. He made allegations unnecessarily and used defamatory words. This is unparliamentary and unheard in the history of House proceedings. Who is he? He is not a Minister. A Minister can at least make a *suo motu* statement regarding food processing units. Already hon. Home Minister replied that if there is any such thing, he will get it verified. When he had promised, he kept quiet and we kept quiet. But a Member who has nothing to do with this issue unnecessarily spoke.

So, I request you to expunge all unparliamentary words. Apart from that, there was no need for the hon. Minister for Food Processing to intervene. She also provoked; she made allegations like "â€¦". When I say "â€¦" Shri Nishikant Dubey and others used to say that this is unparliamentary. Words like "â€¦" and other words were used.

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY (GODDA): Sir, I have a point of order to raise here....(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give my ruling and then you can raise your point of order. He is speaking on his point of order now.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Such words should not be used and this House has often reminded me not to use such words. They are using such words. They are instigating people and they are disturbing the smooth proceedings of the House.

Therefore, I request you Sir to expunge all unparliamentary words, things which are not necessary and irrelevant statements. These things should be taken off from the proceedings.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Shri Kharge, you have raised your point of order. A Point of Order may be raised in relation to the business before the House at the moment. This is what the rule says.

As you yourself know, it had happened in the morning before the House adjourned. At that time, hon. Speaker was presiding over the House. She is aware of all that had happened.

I will bring whatever is happening to the notice of the hon. Speaker so that she may go through it. What else can I do?

...(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will bring the matter to the notice of the hon. Speaker.

...(Interruptions)

14.24 hrs

At this stage, Shri Deepender Singh Hooda and some other hon. Members

came and stood on the floor near the Table.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: At that time, hon. Speaker was presiding over the House. I will bring this matter to the notice of the Speaker. I will pass on the message as to what is happening now to the hon. Speaker.

...(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI D.V. SADANANDA GOWDA): As far as removal of unparliamentary words is concerned, we have no objection.. But it cannot be removed in toto.

HON. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Already I informed the hon. Members that I would bring this matter to the notice of the hon. Speaker because she was presiding over the House at that time Whatever concerns you have expressed about the unparliamentary or provocative expressions, I will bring to the notice of the hon. Speaker to go through the records. Then, she will take the decision.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE (GULBARGA): My only request is that such things should not be allowed. It will become a practice. There should not be hit and run thing. मार दो और भाग जाओ, ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए

HON. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Already I told you that I am going to bring this matter to the notice of the hon. Speaker. She was presiding over at that time.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: You are presiding over the House. You can give the ruling. ...(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please take your seat. You have raised the matter. As you said, that happened before 1.30 p.m. Please listen to me.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI DEEPENDER SINGH HOODA (ROHTAK): As far as we are concerned, it is a continuing thing. The House adjourned then...(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The House was adjourned then. You have brought certain issue before the House. You are raising the issue of expunging certain words. I am going to bring this matter to the notice of the hon. Speaker. Definitely she will take a decision.

...(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: What are you expecting from me, I do not know.

...(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SKILL DEVELOPMENT AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, there have been precedents. Whenever a Member raises some issue, if the Minister is there and if the Minister is willing to give a reply, he responds to it. This is exactly what the hon. Speaker allowed. The Minister wanted to respond to a particular subject which was raised in this House. The hon. Speaker also went to the extent of saying: "If you want to make a statement, we can also allow you to make a Statement on Monday." The Member had asked a particular question...(Interruptions) It was in reference to a point made by the hon. Member Shri Rahul Gandhi that the hon. Minister said that the facts were with him and he was prepared to reply. So, the hon. Speaker allowed the reply to take place...(Interruptions)

HON. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: That matter is over. That is not the matter now.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: I can tell you that there was no mention of any such thing which was beyond the purview of this House or the purview of what was asked of her. I think the hon. Minister gave a reply which was pertinent, which was relevant and which was about the issue which was raised by the hon. Member. I think it was well within the norms and there is nothing in the speech which needs to be reviewed or expunged...(Interruptions)

श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खड़गे: सर, इसीलिए तो मैंने नोटिस दिया है, I have given notice because I know that this would come up. This issue was raised before 2 p.m. So, you need not take up because that is over. I know it may come up. That is why, I have given in writing under Rule 352 saying that I may be permitted to raise the matter regarding the conduct of the Members in the House. Based on that only, I am raising it. One thing is that provocative and derogatory words were used. It is not only that. All these things, for example, like use of offensive expressions about the conduct of the proceedings of Parliament or any statement made, are there in the Rule Book. On the one side, they are humiliating the Members. On the other side, it has nothing to do with them. They are raising the issue provoking the Members. Therefore, you can take a decision. That is not overruling the Speaker...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: I would just like to raise this issue. The hon. Minister did mention something to which the hon. Speaker immediately said that that would not go on record but she did not make any such observation about the whole reference made by the hon. Minister. This was in response to the issue raised by the hon. Member and the hon. Minister made a comprehensive reply because she felt that this was a reference to her Ministry, and some facts which were placed by the hon. Member were wrong, and this is why she came with an explanation; and explained it to the House, and to the country that a particular Member has made a wrong reference; and she told the exact reference which was required. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI D.V. SADANANDA GOWDA: Another thing is, as the Chair rightly said, it will be brought to the notice of the Speaker, and if there is any unparliamentary words, it would be looked into by the Speaker. You too are also demanding that the unparliamentary words should be removed. We never said that. The Deputy Speaker has given his ruling wherein he said that the unparliamentary words would be removed. ...(*Interruptions*) We can't expunge everything. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: If they are not ready to listen, then, we can start the discussion on the subject but they have to listen to what we have to say. We heard them peacefully. You have given a ruling. ...(*Interruptions*) The point of reference here is that an issue was raised by the hon. Member. The hon. Minister wanted to make a response. The hon. Minister made a response, and clarified all the situations. If there was anything which needed to be addressed, the hon. Speaker has already addressed that these two words would not go. But she has made a complete reference to the entire issue raised by the hon. Member about a particular issue. Let the proceedings come out but you cannot look into other aspects which were facts, and it is the property of the House. Those are facts. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (ALAPPUZHA): Hon. Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs told that he misquoted the Speaker actually. We are also present in this House. We never heard such words from the Speaker's mouth. While the Member is speaking, and making an allegation against another Member of this House, we are only asking to expunge. If there is any unparliamentary words, it should be expunged. That is what is our demand. This is a genuine demand. ...(*Interruptions*) You are misquoting Speaker. ...(*Interruptions*) We already verified it. ...(*Interruptions*)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Shri Venugopal, please take your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI M.I. SHANAVAS (WAYANAD): You are not Mr. Rudy, you are rude. ...(*Interruptions*) As a Minister, you are very rude.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Already you have raised the issue by stating that there are some unparliamentary words. At that time, the Speaker was presiding over. If at all she said that word, there is no problem. I will bring it to the notice of the hon. Speaker that you have raised this issue.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Whatever you have raised, I am going to bring before the Speaker. That is all.

...(*Interruptions*)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Once again I am repeating, whatever you have raised, I will bring that matter to the attention of the hon. Speaker. Let the hon. Speaker take a decision. That is all.

...(*Interruptions*)

14.41 hrs

At this stage, Shri Deepender Singh Hooda and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: For your sake only, I have given the observation. Already, I have made it. What can I do? Only to get you justice, I have made the observation.

...(*Interruptions*)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 3 p.m.

14.42 hrs

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till
Fifteen of the Clock.*

15.00 hrs

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fifteen of the Clock.

(Hon. Deputy Speaker in the Chair)

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House shall now take up Private Members' Bills and Resolutions.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE (GULBARGA): We have no objection to that because this is the right of the hon. Members and we cooperate. But my only request to you is that all derogatory and defamatory words should be removed from the record.

HON. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have already told that. I have also conveyed it to the hon. Speaker.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE : Okay, we will see it tomorrow.