

>

Title: Further discussion on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address moved by Dr. Girija Vyas and seconded by Dr. Shashi Tharoor on the 13<sup>th</sup> March, 2012 (Discussion concluded).

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, further discussion on the Motion of Thanks on the President' Address. Shri Jaswant Singh.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (DARJEELING): Madam Speaker, I am really grateful that you are giving me this opportunity to intervene at this stage in the Address of the President delivered to both the Houses of Parliament.

मैं बहुत थोड़े में अपनी बात कह दूंगा, अध्यक्ष जी, क्योंकि मैं समझता हूँ कि संसद् का भाव भी अभी जल्दी-जल्दी काम को निपटाने का है, आने चलने का है, चन्द दिनों में संवत्सरी का अवसर है, शायद उस दिन मुझे सबसे इस प्रकार मिलने का सौभाग्य प्राप्त न हो।

देश अभी एक परीक्षा पर्व से गुजरा है, नव-वर्ष लगेगा, ईश्वर से मेरी प्रार्थना है कि सरकार इस परीक्षा पर्व से उत्तीर्ण हो, सफलता मिले और आने वाले दिन भी अच्छे रहें, मेरे सिर्फ 2-3 पाइंट्स हैं। एक अभी सवेरे मेरे काबिल दोस्त यशवंत जी ने और अन्य दोस्तों ने उस मसले को उठाया। मैं उसको नहीं दोहरा रहा, पर प्रधानमंत्री जी से अवश्य कहूंगा कि प्रधानमंत्री जी, कई बार ऐसा अखबारों में पढ़ने को आता है कि नवजात शिशु नाते के किनारे पाया गया।

मेरी आपसे अर्ज है कि रेल बजट कहीं ऐसा ही नवजात शिशु न हो जाए, जो किसी नाते के किनारे पड़ा है। It is because we realise, Mr. Prime Minister, that whereas maternity is always an established fact, paternity is quite often questioned. So, let this Railway Budget not be an orphan यह अनाथ न हो जाए, मेरा आपसे यह निवेदन है।

I have no comments at all on the General Budget. मेरे काबिल दोस्त यशवंत जी उस पर चर्चा करेंगे, मुझे सिर्फ दो बातें अर्ज करनी हैं, काबिल फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर साहब से, गुरुताखी माफ करें, you are highly learned and, by profession, a teacher. I am an illiterate. I have no degree. I am from the desert but Sir, may I request you to please re-examine the reference that you have made to Polonius? You have quoted Hamlet to say, "I have to be cruel to be kind." That is when Hamlet mistakenly thinking-- Polonius is his uncle--he puts a sword into him. A far more an appropriate reference. Very humbly if I may submit to you is about Polonius but when taking leave of his son, he said, "Take heed. Do not a borrower or a lender be." Now, for a Finance Minister, permit me to say, that would have been an infinitely better reference from Shakespeare than the one that you chose.

वह दूसरी बात है। मैंने आपका एक जिक् अखबार में पढ़ा कि फिसकल डेफिसिट को देखकर आपको रात को नींद नहीं आती है। मुझे इसको पढ़कर बड़ी तकलीफ हुयी। फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर साहब, आप गलती से नींद की गोलियां की दवाई वगैरह मत लेने लग जाना, फिसकल डेफिसिट तो अभी भी होते रहते हैं, जो हम इलाज करते हैं, उसका जरा एक-दो बार आजमाकर देखिए। आप हमारी बात नहीं मानते, तो मेरे दोस्त शत्रुघ्न जी से पूछ लीजिए, आप अच्छी तरह से चलाएं और आप सफल हों यह हमारी मंशा है। हम यह चाहते हैं, क्योंकि आपकी सफलता में मुल्क की सफलता है।

प्रधानमंत्री जी से मैं निवेदन करना चाहूंगा, we are not your political enemies, Mr. Prime Minister. As had been once said in the House of Commons, "We are your political adversaries." Sir, your enemies, political or otherwise, sit behind you and beside you. If you have to take heed, please take that heed.

मेरी वजीर-ए-आजम साहब से एक और अर्ज है। ऐसा मैंने पढ़ा, आप राष्ट्रपति भवन या कहीं और पधारें हुए थे, तब अखबार वालों ने आपसे पूछा, अखबार वाले अवसर ऐसा ही करते हैं, बड़े उट-पटांग से सवाल पूछ लिया करते हैं, तो उन्होंने आपसे पूछा कि आपके पास नंबर हैं या नहीं? आपने कहा कि "We have the numbers." मेरी आपसे एक अर्ज है, यह वाक्या हम पहले भी देख चुके हैं, इसी राष्ट्रपति भवन में, आपको शायद जरूर याद होगा ...[\(व्यवधान\)](#)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइए।

â€!([व्यवधान](#))

श्री शरद यादव (मधेपुरा): जसवंत जी, आप एक ट्रैक पर चलिए। आप अंग्रेजी में भी जा रहे हैं और हिंदी में भी जा रहे हैं, तो मुश्किल हो रही है। ...[\(व्यवधान\)](#)

श्री जसवंत सिंह : अब मैं हिंदी में ही बोलूंगा। कुछ हिंदी में बोलूंगा, लेकिन मुझे आपसे एक-दो अंग्रेजी में अर्ज करनी हैं। आपको याद होगा प्रधानमंत्री जी, राष्ट्रपति भवन से एक बार ऐलान हुआ था, "We have 272, and more are coming." कहीं आप वह गफलत तो नहीं कर रहे हैं। यह सवाल नंबरस का नहीं है, यह सवाल इकबाल का है। मेरा आप से अर्ज है कि आज के दिन वाकई में देश के इकबाल का सवाल है। अगर आज हम किसी बात की चिंता ले कर चलते हैं तो देश के इकबाल और इज्जत की ले कर चलते हैं। इसलिए शुरू में अर्ज किया था कि संवत श्री का पर्व है। जो परीक्षा पर्व देश का है वह समाप्त हो चुका है। हम चाहते हैं कि आप सफल हों। We want you to succeed because in your success is the success of the country. And, that is why I said, मेरे दो पार्ट और हैं। पहला, डेजर्ट नेशनल पार्क। मैं डेजर्ट नेशनल पार्क के बिल्कुल छोर पर रहने वाला हूँ। ...[\(व्यवधान\)](#) मैं डेजर्ट नेशनल पार्क का अनुवाद क्या करूँ? रेगिस्तान में उद्यान तो नहीं होता है। इसलिए डेजर्ट नेशनल पार्क ही कहना पड़ रहा है। ...[\(व्यवधान\)](#)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (विदिशा): मरुस्थल राष्ट्रीय उद्यान। ...[\(व्यवधान\)](#)

श्री जसवंत सिंह : सुषमा जी, मरूस्थल में उद्यान कहां से आएगा?

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : हम लगाएंगे, वह आएगा। आपके कार्यक्रम से आएगा। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री जसवंत सिंह : वहां बाईस गांव हैं। सरकार से मेरी अर्ज है कि बाड़मेर और जैसलमेर के इलाके के बाईस गांव हैं। अब इन बाईस गांवों में कुंए से पानी निकालने के लिए आप बिजली नहीं देते हैं। आप कहेंगे यह राज्य सरकार का काम है। हम कहां से दें? ... (व्यवधान) शतुधन जी, मैंने आप के गैरहाजिरी में आपका रेफरेन्स कर दिया है। ... (व्यवधान) आप कहेंगे यह सरकार का काम है। मेरी आप से अर्ज है कि उन बाईस गांवों में, मेरा घर, मेरा गांव उसके छोर पर है, मैंने अपना बतपन वहां बिताया है, हम कुओं से पानी नहीं निकाल पाएंगे तो क्या करेंगे? आप क्या चाहते हैं?

My next and the last point is about Gorkhaland Territorial Administration. Madam, unequivocally, without any reservation whatsoever, I would like to compliment, first of all, the hon. Finance Minister, then the hon. Home Minister and then his former Deputy, Shri Maken ji, who is sitting behind, for the support that they provided, for the support that the Union Government provided for this issue of Gorkhas, the support that the leadership of the Trinamool demonstrated in the establishment of the Gorkhaland Territorial Administration. It is really one of the most significant and strategically important steps that has been taken and all because of the alacrity and the efficiency of the Trinamool Government in Bengal. And, I do warmly compliment, Mamata ji and I do compliment very much the Union Home Minister, Shri Chidambaram and his able Deputies and Maken *sahib* and also you as the Finance Minister of the support that you had given.

I have two or three requests to make in respect of Gorkhaland. The entire House must please approve because it is strategically a very important area. The district of Darjeeling, which I accidentally happen to represent because my leader Advani ji, and the Gorkhas came from Darjeeling to ask me to represent them. It is the only district in the country that adjoin four international borders. Please recognize, therefore, the importance of this region.

The territorial administration is the first step towards the achievement of Gorkhaland, but they cannot jump to Gorkhaland. So, let this Gorkhaland Administration be built up. It also sits at the head of chicken's neck and, as I shared once with His Excellency, the present Governor of West Bengal, it is not just sitting on the neck, it is sitting on the gullet of the chicken's neck. It is a highly strategically important area, it must be developed. Therefore, I ask you, Mr. Finance Minister, please recognize the logic of contiguous areas, where good number of Gorkhas inhabit. This is my appeal to the Trinamool Members also that if a Committee has been formed to study as to what are the contiguous areas, then recognize the logic of that committee. Determination of contiguous areas and therefore they must be included.

SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY (KOLKATA UTTAR): If am allowed to speak for a moment, I may tell you for your information that a Committee has already been set up under Justice Shri Shyamal Sen, former Chief Justice and former Governor of West Bengal. The Committee has placed the report and the hon. Home Minister has the idea about what sort of report has been tabled. The latest is Gorkhaland Territorial Act (GTA); earlier it was Darjeeling Gorkha Hill Council (DGHC) and ultimately now it has been transferred to GTA. So, naturally, the decision has been approved by the Home Ministry with the initiative of our leader Kumari Mamata Banerjee. She had been to Darjeeling. There was a massive turnout. People endorsed the idea. Some confusions are reported to have arisen. We think all these would be sorted out through discussions. As Member of Lok Sabha representing that constituency, you can help us to sort it out. The Trinamool Congress and our leader Kumari Mamata Banerjee are very much trying to sort it out and we hope it will be sorted out, if CPI (M) at least does not disturb.... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : गुरुदास दासगुप्त जी, प्लीज, आप बैठ जाइए। We are not going to have a full-fledge discussion here on this. No, please take your seat.

â€¦ (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Are you yielding, Jaswant Singhji? आप बोलिए। We cannot have a discussion on this.

â€¦ (व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: He is not yielding. I do not think he is yielding. Are you? आप बोलिए। Nothing else will go on record.

(Interruptions) â€¦ \*

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing else is going on record.

(Interruptions) â€¦ \*

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : I am not suggesting anything. ...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: All right. Jaswant Singhji, please.

...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : Far be it for me to.....(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*) \*â€

अध्यक्ष महोदया : यह क्या हो रहा है?

â€(व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Kindly conclude.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : I really want to conclude if I am not interrupted. Kindly give me two minutes.

It is a highly sensitive issue. About 175 thousand of them are in uniform. I am not suggesting a bifurcation of Bengal. Please recognize what Yunnan has done next door to usâ€...(*Interruptions*)

I am not recommending. I am only a representative; you are residing there. ...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please address the Chair and kindly conclude now.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : There is one more issue.

MADAM SPEAKER: I think the time is of essence. Please conclude.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : My request is to the hon. Home Minister....(*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप लोग बैठ जाइए।

â€(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदया : थोड़ा सा शान्त हो जाइए।

â€(व्यवधान)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : Some Gorkhas have been granted a tribal status; others have not been granted. I hope the hon. Home Minister will handle this case with great sensitivity and understanding. I appeal to him and to the Government not to divide the Gorkhas into tribals and non-tribals because if some are tribals, then the balance are also tribals. This would answer a great concern.

My final request is to the hon. Finance Minister. I know the head-aches that all Finance Ministers have. I know the strains on the exchequer. But, please understand that after the difficulties of 30 years that Darjeeling has suffered, they require a start-up fund. Please consider that sympathetically.

Last and final because यहां मैंने देखा स्पीकर साहिबा, आजकल यहां शेर-ओ-शायरी बहुत चलती है।...(व्यवधान)

श्री जयवंत सिन्हा (हज़ारीबाग): शेर-ओ-शायरी वाले गए। उनकी छुट्टी हो गई।...(व्यवधान)

एक माननीय सदस्य : वो त्रिवेदी जी थे।...(व्यवधान)

श्री जयवंत सिंह : मैं नहीं जानता कि अभी बदायूं के कौन रिप्रेजेंटेटिव हैं, लेकिन बदायूं के एक शायर फ़ानी थे। फ़ानी का एक शेर है प्रधान मंत्री जी के लिए --

देख 'फ़ानी' वो तेरी तकदीर की मैस्यत न हो,

जा रहा है इक जनाजा दौश पर तकदीर के।

**\*श्री नवीन जिन्दल (कुरुक्षेत्र):** मैं माननीय डॉ. गिरिजा व्यास जी द्वारा पेश किए गए तथा डॉ. शशी थरूर द्वारा अनुमोदित राष्ट्रपति भाषण पर धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव का पुरजोर समर्थन करता हूँ, जैसा डॉ. व्यास ने अपने प्रारंभिक भाषण में कहा कि महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी का भाषण देश की विभिन्न दिशाओं में वास्तविक स्थिति को स्पष्ट करके सरकार द्वारा विभिन्न समस्याओं के समाधान के लिए किए जा रहे तथा आने वाले वर्ष में किए जा रहे प्रयासों का विवरण है।

इनमें न किसी घटनाक्रम को छिपाने का प्रयत्न है तथा न ही वस्तुस्थिति को बढ़ा-चढ़ाकर रखने की अनावश्यक कोशिश की गई है। इससे पहले कि मैं इस अभिभाषण में की गई बातों का उल्लेख करूँ तथा उन पर अपने विचार रखूँ, अनुभव के आधार पर जो मेरी एक धारणा बनी है, वह मैं माननीय सदन को बताना चाहता हूँ।

इस वर्ष भारत की संसद की स्थापना के 60 वर्ष पूरे होने जा रहे हैं तथा हम पूरे विश्वास के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत में संसदीय संस्थाओं एवं प्रजातांत्रिक परंपराओं का लगातार विकास हो रहा है। इन संस्थाओं की जड़ें भारत में मजबूत हुई हैं तथा जनता जनार्दन की प्रजातांत्रिक शासन प्रणाली में अस्था बढ़ी है। भारत में संसद के प्रति उत्तरदायी सरकार है, निष्पक्ष न्यायप्रणाली है, व्यवस्थित कार्यपालिका है तथा पूर्णतः स्वतंत्र मीडिया तंत्र है। हर व्यक्ति एवं संस्था को बिना किसी भेदभाव के भारतीय संविधान के प्रति कटिबद्ध रहकर अपने विचार व्यक्त करने की तथा अपना विकास करने की पूर्ण स्वतंत्रता है। अभी पांच राज्यों में मतदाताओं ने अपने मत का अपने प्रदेशों की सरकार बनाने का प्रयोग किया है। यह वर्ग की बात है कि इतने बड़े स्तर पर भारत के लगभग एक चौथाई मतदाताओं ने बड़े शांतिपूर्वक तरीके से अपने मत का प्रयोग किया है।

अतने बड़े चुनाव को शांतिपूर्ण ढंग से करवाने के लिए मैं भारत के निर्वाचन आयोग तथा शासकीय व्यवस्था को बधाई देना चाहता हूँ। इससे भी यह सिद्ध होता है कि आम भारतीय मतदाता का विश्वास जनतांत्रिक प्रणाली में और मजबूत हुआ है।

यह भी हर्ष का विषय है कि इन चुनावों में मतदाताओं ने बढ़चढ़ कर हिस्सा लिया और इन्हीं प्रदेशों में पहले की अपेक्षा डाले गए मतों की संख्या में भारी बढ़ोतरी हुई है। हमारे आसपास के देशों में जो राजनीतिक उथल पुथल मची हुई है, उसके मुकाबले हमारे देश में राजनीतिक स्थिरता व परस्पर विश्वास का वातावरण है। यह हम सबके लिए हर्ष तथा गौरव का विषय है।

राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण में सबसे पहले देश की आर्थिक स्थिति की ओर ध्यान आकृष्ट किया गया है, उसमें यह स्वीकार किया गया है कि 2010-11 में हमारी अर्थव्यवस्था की वृद्धि दर 8.4 फीसदी थी, लेकिन वह इस वर्ष घटकर 7 फीसदी हो गई है। इस अभिभाषण में यह विश्वास दिलाया गया है कि इस विषय में उठाए जा रहे सकारात्मक सुधारों व योजनाओं के द्वारा देश की आर्थिक विकास दर पुनः 8-9 फीसदी पर आ जाएगी। जहां कई पाश्चात्य देशों में तथा यूरोप के देशों में मंदी फैली हुई है और उनकी विकास दर दिन-प्रतिदिन घटती जा रही है।

यह हमारे नीति निर्धारकों तथा भारत नेतृत्व तथा जनता की मूलभूत सुटढ़ सोच का फल है कि हमारे विशाल देश में उस मंदी और कमी का असर कम से कम हुआ है तथा अभी भी हमारी विकास दर एक अच्छे स्तर पर है। मुझे पूर्ण विश्वास है कि संसद के हर वर्ग द्वारा सरकार को हर प्रकार का सहयोग मिलेगा तथा देश उत्तरोत्तर प्रगति के पथ पर अग्रसर होगा।

खाद्यान्न उत्पादन, वितरण तथा कुपोषण उन्मूलन व लिंगानुपात समस्या दूसरी ज्वलंत समस्या जो देश के सामने मुंह खोले खड़ी है, वह है भुखमरी, कुपोषण तथा लिंगानुपात। हमारी आबादी 120 करोड़ से ज्यादा हो गई है। अभी हाल ही में प्रकाशित आंकड़ों के आधार पर लगभग 50 प्रतिशत से अधिक जनसंख्या कुपोषण का शिकार है। 2011 में हुई जनगणना के आधार पर 1000 बालकों के अनुपात में 0 से 6 साल की आयु तक केवल 914 बालिकाएं हैं। भारत की स्वतंत्रता के बाद यह अनुपात सबसे कम है जो गंभीर चिंता का विषय है और इस दिशा में राष्ट्रीय तथा राज्य स्तर पर शीघ्रताशीघ्र उचित कदम उठाए जाने की आवश्यकता है।

मेरा सुझाव है कि भ्रूण हत्या करणों वाले के विरुद्ध सख्त से सख्त कार्रवाई की जाए और इस दिशा में जो भी नियम हैं, उनका सख्ती से अनुपालन किया जाए। यह भी उतना ही आवश्यक है कि लड़कियों के लिए उचित शिक्षा की व्यवस्था की जाए, उनको आर्थिक रूप से स्वावलंबी बनाने के लिए योजनाएं चलाई जाएं, बाल विवाह पर पूर्णतः रोक लगे, तथा परिवार का आकार सीमित करने में मातृशक्ति का भी पूर्ण अधिकार हो।

2011 की जनगणना के आंकड़ों से यह भी स्पष्ट हुआ है कि 90 वर्षों में पहली बार ग्रामीण जनसंख्या की तुलना में शहरी जनसंख्या अधिक अनुपात में बढ़ी है। इसके कई कारणों का उल्लेख माननीय राष्ट्रपति जी ने भी अपने अभिभाषण में किया है। ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में उपयुक्त जीविका साधनों का न होना, शिक्षा, स्वास्थ्य की तथा अन्य सुविधाओं का न होना इनके मुख्य कारण हैं। बड़ी खुशी की बात है कि राष्ट्रीय ग्रामीण आजीविका मिशन की स्थापना इस दिशा में एक प्रभावशाली कदम है, जिससे ग्रामीण परिवारों को ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में ही लगातार रोजगार के अवसर उपलब्ध कराए जा सकेंगे।

इस प्रकार की योजनाओं के अंतर्गत काम ढूंढने वालों के लिए तथा अपने छोटे व्यवसायों को शुरू करने के लिए सस्ते ब्याज दर पर ऋण उपलब्ध कराए जाएं अन्य तकनीकी व प्रशासकीय सहायता आसानी से मिले, जिससे नगरों की तरफ जनता का पलायन रुके और हमारे देश के गांव अपने आप में एक समृद्ध इकाई के रूप में उभर सकें।

यहां पर एक और विषय पर ध्यान केन्द्रित करने की आवश्यकता है कि गांवों से शहर में हो रहे लगातार लोगों के पलायन से शहरों की बढ़ती जनसंख्या के कारण वहां की आधारभूत संरचना व लोगों को दी जाने वाली सुविधाओं में बढ़ोतरी की आवश्यकता है।

पिछले कई वर्षों से सरकार द्वारा संचालित जवाहर लाल नेहरू राष्ट्रीय शहरी विकास मिशन ने देश के महानगरों में लोगों के लिए अधिक से अधिक सुविधाएं जुटाने का सशहनीय कार्य किया है। महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी ने अभिभाषण में बताया है कि अब इस मिशन को देश के अन्य प्रथम श्रेणी और मध्यम नगरों में भी कार्यान्वित किया जाएगा। इस कदम से न केवल महानगरों पर दबाव कम होगा, बल्कि यह शहरीकरण के व्यापक प्रसार और विकास को भी सुनिश्चित करेगा।

बड़ी खुशी की बात है कि शहरी क्षेत्रों में आजीविका सुनिश्चित करने के लिए सरकार जल्दी ही आजीविका मिशन शुरू करने जा रही है, जो काम ढूंढने के इच्छुक कार्यगणों के लिए कौशल प्रदान करने की व्यवस्था तथा साधन उपलब्ध कराएगा।

राष्ट्रपति के भाषण में राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर मान्यता प्राप्त योग्यता पद्धति के विकास हेतु समान सिद्धांत और दिशा-निर्देश तय करने के लिए राष्ट्रीय व्यवसायी शिक्षा

योन्यता व्यवस्था स्थापित करने की बात कही गई है। मेरा यह मानना है कि इस व्यवस्था से आने वाले वर्षों में देश के युवाओं को कुशल एवं योन्य बनने के लिए बेहतरीन अवसर मिलेंगे।

यह भी प्रस्ताव है कि वर्ष 2012-13 में 85 लाख लोगों को और 12वीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में 8 करोड़ लोगों को कौशल प्रशिक्षण प्रदान किया जाएगा। 1500 नए औद्योगिक प्रशिक्षण संस्थाओं और 5000 कौशल विकास केन्द्रों की स्थापना की जाएगी। निश्चित रूप से इस व्यवस्था के स्थापित हो जाने पर आने वाले वर्षों में युवाओं को कुशल एवं योन्य बनने के बेहतरीन अवसर मिलेंगे।

इस अभिभाषण में भ्रष्टाचार उन्मूलन तथा काले धन को समाप्त करने के लिए सरकार द्वारा किए जा रहे प्रयत्नों का भी उल्लेख है। मेरी मान्यता है कि भ्रष्टाचार दूर करने के लिए सर्वप्रथम देश में औद्योगिक तथा कृषि उत्पादन में बढ़ोतरी की अत्यंत आवश्यकता है। 120 करोड़ की आबादी के लिए पौष्टिक भोजन की व्यवस्था करना अपने आप में एक विकराल समस्या है। बड़ी खुशी की बात है कि 12वीं पंचवर्षीय परियोजना में वर्तमान 2.5 फीसदी से 4 फीसदी कृषि विकास दर का लक्ष्य निर्धारित किया गया है, जो एक सराहनीय कदम है।

उचित उत्पादन के साथ-साथ उसके व्यवस्थित वितरण की व्यवस्था होना भी अति आवश्यक है। हमारी सरकार का यह प्रयास होना चाहिए कि किसान को उसके उत्पादन का उचित मूल्य मिले, उसके उत्पाद का उचित भंडारण हो सके, उन कारणों को समाप्त किया जाए जिनसे पैदा किए हुए अनाज की अनावश्यक बर्बादी होती है। यह अति चिंता का विषय है कि एक तरफ एकत्रित अनाज सड़ता रहे, तथा जिनको उसकी आवश्यकता है, उन तक वह न पहुंच सके।

देश की आंतरिक सुरक्षा तथा आतंकवाद पर समय समय पर सदन में चर्चा हो चुकी है और उस चर्चा के आधार पर केन्द्रीय तथा राजकीय सरकार जो कदम उठा रही है, उनमें एक समन्वय होकर इन तत्वों को समाप्त करने की क्षमता आनी चाहिए। इसके लिए एक समन्वित नीति की तथा उसके संपादन की आवश्यकता है। यदि किसी विषय को लागू करने से पूर्व चर्चा की आवश्यकता है, तो उसमें संकोच नहीं किया जाना चाहिए। यह सुनिश्चित करना अति आवश्यक है कि हमारी सरकारें देशवासियों को एक भयमुक्त तथा उत्पीड़न मुक्त जीवन जीने के लिए अनुकूल वातावरण दे सकें।

मैं स्वयं एक खिलाड़ी हूँ तथा देश में विभिन्न खेलों के प्रशिक्षण संचालन तथा खिलाड़ियों को अपने अपने क्षेत्र में विलाक्षणता प्राप्त हो सके इसका पक्षधर हूँ। मैं चाहता हूँ कि हर खिलाड़ी को उचित प्रशिक्षण मिले, सुख-सुविधाएं मिलें ताकि न केवल राष्ट्रीय अपितु अंतरराष्ट्रीय स्तर पर भी वह खेल के इतिहास में गौरवशाली प्रदर्शन कर सके। इस दिशा में समुचित धन सामग्री आवंटित की जाए, हो सके तो कॉरपोरेट सेक्टर को भी सरकार इसमें बराबर का भागीदार बनाए।

बहुत सारे अन्य विषय हैं, जिनकी ओर मैं समय के अभाव के कारण केवल संक्षेप में ही उनका उल्लेख करना चाहूँगा। जैसे

- सरल कर प्रणाली तथा कर दाताओं को सुविधाएं
- वरिष्ठ नागरिकों के लिए सुविधाएं
- लाभ वंचित वनवासियों के लिए सुविधाएं
- कमजोर, असुरक्षित तबकों का विकास
- अल्पसंख्यकों का सशक्तिकरण
- किसानों को उर्वरक (खाद) की उचित उपलब्धता तथा सब्सिडी
- शहरी बेघर लोगों के लिए राष्ट्रीय कार्यक्रम
- पर्यटन उद्योग में रोजगार पैदा करना
- विदेशी पूंजी आकर्षित करने के लिए उपाय
- रेलवे का आधुनिकीकरण
- सड़कों के विकास को प्राथमिकता
- गैस उत्पादन में वृद्धि
- वैज्ञानिक व औद्योगिक उत्कृष्टता के जरिए सामाजिक व आर्थिक परिवर्तन
- सेना के तीनों अंगों को आधुनिक व विकसित बनाने के लिए किए जा रहे उपाय

अंत में मेरा यह कहना है कि संयुक्त प्रतिशील संगठन की सरकार (यूपीए) माननीय डॉ. मनमोहन सिंह जी के नेतृत्व में तथा कांग्रेस अध्यक्ष माननीय श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी जी के मार्ग-निर्देशन में एवं युवा नेता श्री राहुल गांधी जी के अथक प्रयासों द्वारा भारत को एक सर्वांगीण व समग्र विकास की ओर निश्चित रूप से लेकर जाएंगे जिसमें हर भारतीय एक सामान्य सुख साधन सम्पन्न जीवन व्यतीत कर सकेगा, जिससे भारत विश्व में एक आर्थिक औद्योगिक व राजनीतिक शक्ति के रूप में जाना जाएगा।

इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ, मैं आपका आभार प्रकट करता हूँ कि आपने मुझे अपने विचार व्यक्त करने का अवसर दिया तथा राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण पर लाए गए धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव का पुनः समर्थन करता हूँ।

THE PRIME MINISTER (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Madam Speaker, I rise to join all Members of this august House in conveying our sincere thanks to the hon. President for her enlightened Address. The debate on the President's Address has been very wide-ranging and Shri Jaswant Singhji has made his contribution as well. I thank all the hon. Members from all sides who have contributed to this debate.

The President's Address lays down the objectives and the roadmap that our Government is following and will pursue with greater vigour to deal with the challenges that are mentioned in the President's Address. The President's Address in paragraph 10 refers to five important challenges that our country faces today. They are :-

- 1) to strive for livelihood security for the vast majority of our population and contribute to work for removal of poverty, hunger and illiteracy from our land;
- 2) to achieve economic security through rapid and broad-based development and creation of productive jobs for our people;
- 3) to ensure energy security for our rapid growth;
- 4) to realise our developmental goals without jeopardizing our ecological and environmental security; and
- 5) to guarantee our internal and external security within the framework of just, plural, secular and inclusive growth.

Madam, these five challenges sum up the task that lies ahead of our Government in the two-and-a-half years that remain.

As far as the economy is concerned, my colleague, the hon. Minister of Finance has placed *the Economic Survey* on the Table of the House and the *Economic Survey* gives an exhaustive account of the state of the economy. The Finance Minister has also referred to challenges facing us, in his Budget Speech. Madam, all these issues will be thoroughly debated during the general debate on the Budget next week. Therefore, I will be brief while dealing with the economy of the country.

I am sure, hon. Members are aware that we are charting our course through waters that are choppy for all countries today. The year 2011-12 has been a difficult year for all countries. Global growth decelerated everywhere. Industrialised countries grew at the rate of only 1.6 per cent in 2011, which is half the rate in the previous years. The international economic environment that we face is highly uncertain.

The developments in North Africa and West Asia have led to a steep increase in the prices of hydrocarbons adversely affecting among others prices of fertilisers and food grains that have also put pressure on our balance of payment.

Madam, in this background, our own economic performance of about seven per cent growth -- though slower than what we had hoped -- must be regarded as commendable. Of course, we cannot view this as acceptable. We must strive to improve upon this in the next year and return as quickly as possible to a higher growth path and we must do this while also ensuring that we will progress towards our objective of achieving inclusive growth with reasonable price stability. Madam, for all this, we need a broad-based national consensus covering all sections of political opinion represented in this august House. This is an occasion when we must rise above narrow partisan ends and stand united as a nation.

Madam, we grew at 9 per cent for five years before 2008, and I do believe that we can get back to that kind of growth rate provided we can agree on a number of difficult decisions. If we succeed in that objective, we will ensure that India continues its rise as an economic power and acquires the economic capability of reducing persistent poverty from which we have suffered and fills the gaps, which are all too evident in critical areas such as health, education, skill-development, and provision of clean drinking water and sanitation. Shri Jaswant Singh referred to the problem of drinking water supply. I assure him that our Government attaches high priority to ensuring that all our citizens have access to clean drinking water.

â€¦ (Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions) â€¦ \*

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH : Madam, several Members have referred to the problems faced by weaker sections of our society and I do agree with them that we need to focus, in particular, on the developmental gaps affecting the weaker sections of

our population such as Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, the Other Backward Classes, the Minorities and other disadvantaged groups. I would like to assure the hon. Members that we will rise to this important task. ...(*Interruptions*)

Madam, the Twelfth Five-Year Plan, which will be presented to the National Development Council (NDC) sometime in the middle of the year, will lay out a credible plan of action for faster, sustainable and more inclusive growth. I do not wish to go into details, but only wish to remind the hon. Members that our path is not easy.

I am sure that the hon. Members also realize that the difficult decisions that we have to take are made more difficult by the fact that we are a coalition Government and we have to evolve policy keeping in mind the need to maintain a consensus. The challenges that this poses have been sharply brought out in the developments following the presentation of the Railway Budget. I would like to use this opportunity to inform the hon. Members of the latest development. Madam, I received late last night an e-mail message followed by a formal letter from Shri Dinesh Trivedi tendering his resignation as the Railway Minister.

I propose to forward this letter to the President with the recommendation to accept Shri Trivedi's letter of resignation. I regret the departure of Shri Trivedi. He had presented the Railway Budget which promised to carry out the Vision 2020 that was outlined by his predecessor. A new Railway Minister will be sworn in shortly. He will have the onerous duty of carrying forward the challenging task of modernizing our railway system.

Madam Speaker, in a country as large and as complex as ours, and where the farmers of our country constitute 65 per cent of the labour force, it is inevitable that Parliament and the Government should be worried about the state of India's agriculture. I share the agony of the hon. Members, when they refer to the suicides of our farmers.

The House has my assurance that we will work with renewed vigour to ensure that no farmer in our country is forced to go to the extreme level of committing suicide.

Our Government has attached high priority to the development of agriculture, to increase public investment in agriculture, to ensure that there is more attention, technologically, paid to the development of agriculture and as a result, the growth rate of agricultural production within the last five years has been as high as three per cent to 3.5 per cent per annum. This year we are likely to achieve a record production of food grains of 250 million tonnes.

Last year, Rashtriya Krishi Vikas Yojana, the National Horticulture Mission, and the Food Security Mission have all contributed to create a more favourable environment for the growth of agriculture. But I will be the last one to say that more cannot be done. We will, in the Twelfth Five-Year Plan, focus more sharply on the development of our agriculture because the interest of farmers is uppermost in the minds of our Government. That will be the priority we will follow with due diligence.

Madam, there were references to the price situation in the country. I do admit that in the last two years, the prices have become a problem. Fortunately, there are indications that prices are coming under control, but we have to be vigilant. It was in this context that the Finance Minister's effort to control the fiscal deficit is very relevant. Our fiscal deficit did increase in the year 2008-09 because of the developments in the international economic environment, and it was our hope that we will be able to get back to a more reasonable level of fiscal deficit in the year 2011-12. The Finance Minister had projected a fiscal deficit of 4.8 per cent for that year. It turns out that the fiscal deficit will be as high as 5.9 per cent. The Finance Minister has committed our Government to work towards a reduction in the fiscal deficit to 5.1 per cent in the next year. It is very important that the Finance Minister succeeds in the control of fiscal deficit, in the control over the balance of payments deficit to a more reasonable level as it is essential for us to achieve our objectives of growth with reasonable price stability.

Since these matters will be debated at length during the debate on the Budget, I do not propose to spend more time in dealing with these issues. However, there are certain matters which I would like to refer to and one of these relates to the establishment of the National Counter Terrorism Centre. While discussing issue relating to the National Counter Terrorism Centre, Shri Rajnath Singh Ji questioned the sincerity of our Government while dealing with problems of terrorism.

Madam, dealing with terrorism and dealing effectively as well to control left wing extremism constitute two big challenges before our country and for all the growth objectives that we have, particularly, the development of the Central Indian regions. The States of Chattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh, Bihar, Jharkhand are infested with left wing extremism. Control over left wing extremism and control over terrorism are absolute necessities if we are to achieve our growth objectives.

Madam, let me assure the House that our Government is committed to providing fully secured living conditions to its citizens and it will take every possible step to deal with the menace of terrorism. In fact, setting up the NCTC is an important step in that direction. Concern has been raised that the Central Government is trying to encroach upon the

jurisdiction of the State Government and it has been suggested that they should be taken into confidence before the National Counter Terrorism Centre becomes operational. The question of setting up of National Counter Terrorism Centre has been discussed at various fora since the report of the Group of Ministers appointed by the previous Government and the recommendations of the Second Administrative Reforms Commission were submitted. The multi-agency Centre that was established in 2001 was a pre-cursor to the NCTC and the need for a single and effective point of consideration for coordination for counter terrorism has been discussed in meetings on internal security of Chief Ministers. As has been pointed out by some Members that a number of Chief Ministers have expressed their concern after the order was issued and I have replied to them that there will be consultations before the next steps are taken. The consultation was held on 12<sup>th</sup> March, 2012 with the Chief Secretaries and DGPs from different State Governments. The meeting of the Chief Ministers on Internal Security has been called which was originally scheduled for 15<sup>th</sup> February, 2012 but because of elections, it had to be postponed. It is now scheduled on 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2012. Therefore, adequate and full consultations will take place before the next steps are taken.

Madam, I think that the idea of NCTC and the manner in which the NCTC will function are two separate issues. The idea of NCTC, you have all agreed is unexceptional. And the manner in which the NCTC will function, there may be differences but I am confident that through discussions and dialogues, these differences could be narrowed down and a consensus can be arrived and that will be our sincere effort.

Madam, another issue which was raised during the debate relates to the state of Sri Lankan Tamils. Some Members have raised concern regarding the situation in Sri Lanka. The Central Government fully shares the concerns and sentiments raised by hon. Members regarding the welfare of Sri Lankan Tamils. Since the end of conflict in Sri Lanka, our focus has been on the welfare and well being of the Tamil citizens of Sri Lanka. Their resettlement and rehabilitation has been of the highest and most immediate priority for our Government. The steps taken by the Central Government in this regard has been outlined in the *suo motu* statement made by the External Affairs Minister on 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2012. As a result of our constructive engagement with the Government of Sri Lanka and our considerable assistance programme, a modicum of normalcy is beginning to return to the Tamil areas in Sri Lanka. There has also been progress, given the withdrawal of emergency regulations by the Government of Sri Lanka and the conduct of elections to local bodies in the Northern provinces of Sri Lanka.

Members have also raised the issue of human rights violations during the protracted conflict in Sri Lanka and on the US initiated draft resolution on promoting reconciliation and accountability in Sri Lanka at the on-going 19<sup>th</sup> Session of the UN Human Rights Council in Geneva. The Government of India has emphasised to the Government of Sri Lanka the importance of a genuine process of reconciliation to address the grievances of the Tamil community. In this connection, we have called for implementation of the recommendations contained in the report of the Commission appointed by the Sri Lankan Government that has been tabled before the Sri Lankan Parliament. These include various constructive measures for healing the wounds of the conflict and fostering the process of lasting peace and reconciliation in Sri Lanka.

We have asked the Government of Sri Lanka to stand by its commitment towards pursuit of a political process through a broader dialogue with all parties including the Tamil National Alliance leading to the full implementation of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment to the Sri Lankan Constitution so as to achieve meaningful devolution of power and genuine national reconciliation. We hope that the Government of Sri Lanka recognises the critical importance of this issue, acts decisively and with vision in this regard. We will remain engaged with them through this process and encourage them to take forward the dialogue with the elected representatives of Sri Lankan Tamils.

As regards the issue of a draft resolution initiated by the United States at the on-going 19<sup>th</sup> Session of the UN Human Rights Council in Geneva, we do not yet have the final text of the Resolution. However, I may assure the House that we are inclined to vote in favour of a Resolution. That, we hope, will advance our objective, namely, the achievement of the future for the Tamil community in Sri Lanka that is marked by equality, dignity, justice and self-respect.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (KARUR): Are you going to support the Resolution? ...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Let us continue. Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*) *â€¦* \*

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*) *â€¦* \*

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: Madam, Shri Jaswant Singhji has raised the issue of Gorkhaland Territorial Administration. I wish



to assure this House that we have worked with sincerity to find an amicable solution to this difficult problem. We recognise the contribution made by the Government of West Bengal in facilitating this outcome. Whatever issues are outstanding, the House has my assurance, we will work with the same constructive spirit to find a pragmatic, practical and viable solution.

Madam, I would not like to take more of the time of this House. I once again join all Members in thanking hon. President for her enlightened address which I hope we can adopt with acclamation.

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, the discussion on the Motion of Thanks is now complete. Before I put to vote of the House the Amendments to the Motion of Thanks, I may inform that slips indicating the serial numbers of the Amendments which the Members desired to move were handed over at the Table by Shrimati Sushma Swaraj, Sarvashri Bhartruhari Mahtab, Shailendra Kumar, Arjun Charan Sethi, Ganesh Singh, Raju Shetty, Gurudas Dasgupta, Basudeb Acharia, Dr. Ram Chandra Dome, and Shri Sk. Saidul Haque after an announcement to that effect was made on 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2012.

I may also inform that slips in respect of Amendment No. 1165 were handed over at the Table by Sarvashri Gurudas Dasgupta and Arjun Charan Sethi and in respect of Amendment No. 1279 by Shri Basudeb Acharia, Dr. Ram Chandra Dome and Shri Sk. Saidul Haque. Both the Amendments, that is, Amendment No. 1165 and 1279 are identical. In the normal course, the names of the Members tabling notices of identical amendment are clubbed in the printed list according to the date and time of receipt of notices. However, for want of time, the names could not be clubbed. Had the names been clubbed, the name of Shri Basudeb Acharia would have appeared above the names of Sarvashri Gurudas Dasgupta and Arjun Charan Sethi.

In this context, I would also like to draw the attention of the hon. Members towards Direction 42 which provides *inter alia* that an amendment placed on the order paper in the names of several Members is treated as moved on an indication being given by such Members in writing by that Member whose name appears first on the order paper, and if he is not present in the House or has not indicated his intention to move, then by the second Member or the third Member etc., who may be present and the name of only such Member shall be shown in the proceedings as the mover of that amendment.

In view of Direction 42, Amendment No. 1279 which is identical to Amendment No. 1165 shall be deemed to have been moved by Shri Basudeb Acharia. Slips sent by other Members in respect of this Amendment appearing at Sl. Nos. 1165 and 1279 shall not be considered.

I shall now put the amendments to the Motion of Thanks to the vote of the House. Shall I put all the amendments to the vote of the House together?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

MADAM SPEAKER: You have objection to that? Okay. Shrimati Sushma Swaraj.

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (विदिशा):** धन्यवाद अध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं संशोधन संख्या (1) जो एक नंबर सूची में प्रकाशित है, प्रस्तुत करती हूँ। सामान्यतः महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी को भेजे जाने वाला धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव संशोधनों के साथ पारित नहीं होता है लेकिन अगर परिस्थिति असमान्य हो जाए तो इस विधा का उपयोग करना पड़ता है। इस बार भी एक ऐसी असाधारण परिस्थिति निर्मित हुई है कि मुझे लोकसभा की नियमावली के नियम 18 का उपयोग करना पड़ रहा है, मैंने एक ही संशोधन पेश किया है, जो आपके सामने अभी प्रस्तुत किया है। हमारे संविधान का ढांचा कुछ बुनियादी तत्वों पर खड़ा है। उन बुनियादी तत्वों की जब गणना की जाती है तो संघीय ढांचा प्रमुखता से आता है। देश के सर्वोच्च न्यायालय ने अनेकानेक निर्णय देकर यह कहा है कि देश के बुनियादी तत्वों से किसी तरह की छेड़छाड़ नहीं की जा सकती है। मुझे अफसोस से कहना पड़ता है कि यह सरकार जब से आई है, बार-बार अलग-अलग तरीके से देश के संघीय ढांचे पर प्रहार कर रही है, उसके साथ छेड़छाड़ कर रही है।...**(व्यवधान)** हमने अलग से चर्चा मांगी है।...**(व्यवधान)** हमने केंद्र राज्य संबंधों पर अलग से चर्चा मांगी है। बीएसी में चर्चा तब भी हो गई है इसलिए उन तमाम उदाहरणों और प्रसंगों को हमारी तरफ से उस समय प्रस्तुत किया जाएगा जब केंद्र राज्य संबंधों पर चर्चा करेंगे। आज मैं चर्चा का फलक लंबा नहीं कर सकती क्योंकि मुझे केवल संशोधन पर बोलना है। मैं अपनी बात संशोधन तक ही सीमित रखूंगी और कहूंगी कि एनसीटीसी का गठन इस सरकार की एक ताजा मिसाल है जिसने संघीय ढांचे पर प्रहार किया है। मेरे पास 3 फरवरी, 2012 का ऑर्डर है जिसमें संविधान की धारा 73 से शक्तियां लेते हुए इस सरकार ने एक आफिस मेमोरेण्डम जारी किया, इसको कहा गया - "National Counter Terrorism Centre (Organization Functions, Powers and Duties) Order, 2012." मैं केवल इसका 3.1 और 3.2 एक छोटा सा पैराग्राफ पढ़ना चाहती हूँ।

"Para 3.1 & 3.2: The Director, NCTC shall be specified as the Designated Authority under Section 2(e) of the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967. The Officers of the Operations Division of the NCTC shall have the power to arrest and the power to search under Section 43A of the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967."

इससे दो पृष्ठ उभरते हैं, पहला है कि एनसीटीसी का गठन इन्टेलिजेंस ब्यूरो में किया जा रहा है। एक गुप्तचर एजेंसी को एक जांच एजेंसी बनाया जाए, यह अपने आप

में, न्यायिक व्यवस्था में विकृति पैदा करता है। लेकिन आप उन्हें इतनी बृहद शक्तियां दे दें, पावर टू सर्व, पावर टू अरेस्ट, जो काम कानून के नीचे राज्य और राज्य सरकारों का है। आप कहते हैं कि डायरेक्टर्स और सारे एनसीटीसी के अफसर पावर आफ सर्व, पावर आफ अरेस्ट रखेंगे, क्या यह सीधे-सीधे संघीय ढांचे पर अतिक्रमण नहीं है?... (व्यवधान) क्या यह राज्य के अधिकारों का हनन नहीं है। जैसे ही यह आर्डर जारी हुआ, उसके बाद एक के बाद एक मुख्यमंत्री ने विरोध जताते हुए प्रधानमंत्री जी को पत्र लिखा। दस मुख्यमंत्री हैं, पश्चिम बंगाल, उड़ीसा, तमिलनाडु, गुजरात, बिहार, कर्नाटक, हिमाचल प्रदेश, मध्य प्रदेश, छत्तीसगढ़ और उत्तराखंड। ये एक ही विचारधारा के मुख्यमंत्री नहीं हैं। अगर इसमें छः भाजपा के मुख्यमंत्री हैं तो एक डीजेडी के हैं, एक अन्ना डीएमके, एक जदयू के हैं और एक इनकी सरकार में शामिल दल, सहयोगी दल तृणमूल कांग्रेस की मुख्यमंत्री कुमारी ममता बनर्जी हैं। मेरे पास सभी मुख्यमंत्रियों के पत्र हैं, लेकिन मैं केवल ममता बनर्जी के पत्र के दो पैराग्राफ पढ़ना चाहती हूँ, जो इनके सहयोगी दल की मुख्यमंत्री हैं, उन्होंने लिखा है-

"Under this Order, extensive powers have been given to the National Counter Terrorism Centre, NCTC located in the Intelligence Bureau. Officers of the Operations Division of the NCTC shall have the power to arrest and the power to search under Section 43A of the Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Act, 1967. Also, all authorities including the functionaries of the State Governments are required to provide information/documents to the NCTC. "

आगे लिखती हैं -

The Order, therefore, appears to be an infringement on the powers of State Governments, in matters of investigation and maintenance of order.

और आगे वह कहती हैं

"In a federal structure like ours any decision of the Central Government, which infringes upon the powers and rights of the State Governments, should be taken only after adequate consultation and with the consent of the State Governments. This has not been done in the instant case. "

यह उनका आरोप है।

"It is difficult for the State Government to accept such arbitrary exercise of powers by the Central Government or Central agencies which have a bearing on the rights and privileges of the State as enshrined in the Constitution of India.  
I would, therefore, request " "

यह ममता जी कह रही हैं।

"I would, therefore, request your intervention for review and withdrawal of the Order dated February 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2012."

यह ममता जी का पत्र है और ऐसे ही पत्र दस और मुख्य मंत्रियों ने लिखे हैं। अध्यक्ष जी, मैं केवल एक बात कहना चाहती हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी जब यह मुद्दा विवादित हो चुका था तो राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण में इसका उल्लेख करवाने की क्या जरूरत थी और अगर आपने उल्लेख करवाना ही था, आपको यह लगता था कि यह आपकी उपलब्धि है तो एक वाक्य आप आगे डलवा देते कि एनसीटीसी के गठन को लेकर कुछ आशंकाएं मुख्य मंत्रियों द्वारा प्रकट की गई हैं, हम उनकी शंका का समाधान करने के बाद ही इसे लागू करेंगे। अगर आप इतना ही लिख देते तो मामला समाप्त हो जाता। लेकिन यह आपने नहीं लिखवाया, क्यों नहीं लिखवाया? अध्यक्ष जी, यह इस सरकार की अहंकारी कार्यशैली है, जिसके कारण ऐसे संकट खड़े होते हैं। इसलिए मैं कहना चाहती हूँ कि यह इसी अहंकारी कार्यशैली का परिणाम है कि रेल बजट प्रस्तुत होने के बाद रेल मंत्री को इस्तीफा देना पड़ता है। यह इसी अहंकारी कार्यशैली का परिणाम है कि आपके अपने दल के संसदीय कार्य राज्य मंत्री आपके नेतृत्व को ललकारते हैं।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** अब समाप्त कीजिए, आपकी बात आ गई। यह अमैण्डमेंट है।

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** यह इसी अहंकारी कार्यशैली का परिणाम है कि आपके सहयोगी दल के मंत्री गांधी मूर्ति के सामने धरना देने पर मजबूर होते हैं। यह आप ही की अहंकारी शैली का परिणाम है कि जिस दिन वित्त मंत्री बजट प्रस्तुत करते हैं तो आपके सहयोगी दल के वित्त राज्य मंत्री सदन से नदारद होते हैं।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** सुषमा जी, अब आप समाप्त कीजिए।

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** अध्यक्ष जी, मुझे एक बहुत महत्वपूर्ण बात कहनी है, अभी-अभी प्रधान मंत्री जी ने एनसीटीसी पर बोला है। मैं आज भी यह कहती हूँ कि अगर गृह मंत्री खड़े होकर यह कहने के लिए तैयार हैं, क्योंकि इस ऑर्डर में लिखा है कि यह 1 मार्च, 2012 से लागू होगा। अगर आप यह कहने के लिए तैयार हैं कि आपने मुख्य मंत्रियों की जो बैठक 16 अप्रैल को बुलाई है, उसमें उनकी शंकाओं का समाधान करने के बाद आप इसे लागू करेंगे तो मैं यह संशोधन वापस ले सकती हूँ ... (व्यवधान) नहीं, यह नहीं कहा, उन्होंने कहा कि बैठक बुलाई है। मैं इसे स्पष्ट कर दूँ। बैठक एक औपचारिकता मात्र है। अभी प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा कि 12 तारीख को डीजी और चीफ सैक्रेटरीज को बैठक बुलाई गई थी। मैं बता दूँ कि उस बैठक में स्थिति को बद से बदतर करने का काम किया है। अगले ही दिन इंडियन एक्सप्रेस में एक खबर निकली थी -

"Delhi lectures States on NCTC: 'Don't be CMs' stenographers'."

गृह मंत्री जी आपको याद है कि अगले दिन एक पूरक प्रश्न पूछते हुए मैंने आपसे कहा था कि इसकी सचाई क्या है और आपने कहा था कि आपने होम सैक्रेटरी को बुलाकर पूछा।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** अब आप समाप्त कीजिए। Let me run the House.

वेद! (व्यवधान)

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** तब होम सैक्रेटरी ने कहा कि उन्होंने ऐसी कोई बात नहीं कही। लेकिन मैं अध्यक्ष जी कहना चाहती हूँ...

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** अब आप समाप्त कीजिए, पूरा स्टेटमेंट मत दीजिए। You are speaking on the amendment.

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** मैंने इसकी खोज की है। आपने यहां यह कहकर कि होम सैक्रेटरी ने यह बात नहीं कही, इस बड़े अखबार की प्रतिष्ठा और उसके संवाददाता की प्रतिष्ठा के सामने प्रश्नचिह्न लगाया था। लेकिन मैं आज इस सदन में खड़े होकर कहना चाहती हूँ कि मैंने उस अधिकारी से स्वयं बात की है, जिसका उल्लेख इसमें है।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** देखिये, आप अमैन्डमेंट पर बोलिये, आप और विषय पर मत जाइये।

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** उस अधिकारी ने कहा है कि होम सैक्रेटरी ने यह कहा कि "I do not like this tendency of being stenographers".

उस अधिकारी ने यह तक कहा, उस अधिकारी ने विरोध जताते हुए कहा कि मैं कुछ दिन पहले तक यही था, क्या राज्य में जाकर मैं स्टेनोग्राफर हो गया।

MADAM SPEAKER: Sushma ji, please confine yourself to the amendment. Do not make a full speech.

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** मैं कहना चाहती हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री यहां बैठे हैं, गृह मंत्री यहां बैठे हैं, अगर आपने यह बैठक उसी औपचारिकता के तौर पर बुलानी है और अगर उन्हें धमकाना है तो हमारा समाधान नहीं होगा। लेकिन अगर गृह मंत्री यह कहने के लिए तैयार हैं कि वह 16 तारीख की मीटिंग तक इसे लागू नहीं करेंगे, क्योंकि इसमें 1 मार्च, 2012 लिखा है।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** अब ठीक है, आपकी बात समाप्त हो गई।

**13.00 hrs.**

-

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** अगर आप यह कहने को तैयार हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please, let me run the House. What is this?

...(Interruptions)

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** अध्यक्ष जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से यह कहना चाहती हूँ कि अगर आप यह कहने को तैयार हैं कि 16 अप्रैल तक आप इसे लागू नहीं करेंगे और मुख्यमंत्रियों की शंकाओं का समाधान करने के बाद ही लागू करेंगे तभी मैं अपना संशोधन वापस ले सकती हूँ, वरना हम इस पर मतदान करवाएंगे।

MADAM SPEAKER: Do any other hon. Members want to put their amendments separately to the Vote of the House?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): I would like to put my amendment separately.

MADAM SPEAKER: Which is your amendment number?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : My amendment number is 1279. This is exactly the same amendment, which has been moved by the Leader of the Opposition.

MADAM SPEAKER: It has to be a separate amendment.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : I am moving the amendment on setting up of NCTC.

Madam, when NIA Bill was brought before the House in 2009, we raised our objections. We opposed to that. We said in the House at that point of time that this would encroach upon the powers of the State. While replying to the debate on that Bill, the Minister for Home Affairs assured that he would consult the State Governments and if necessary he would revisit the matter without consulting the State Governments.

अध्यक्ष महोदया : आप बैठ जाइए, खड़े क्यों हो गए हैं। I have read it in my observation. Have you heard my observation?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Madam, let me speak and finish. ...(*Interruptions*) Now, without consulting the State Governments, the Government decided to set up NCTC. An order has been issued that NCTC would start functioning from 12<sup>th</sup> March. This shows the intent of this Government. Today, the Prime Minister while replying to the President's Address said that there would be consultation with the State Governments.

My question is that before taking such decision – which would infringe upon the powers of the State - how the State Governments, the federal structure of

this country and the Constitution are being assaulted by this Government one after another?

MADAM SPEAKER: All right. Thank you, please conclude.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : I would like to know whether the decision to set up NCTC would be withdrawn. There would be wider consultation with the State Governments. We are against such organization which would infringe upon the powers of the State. Already, the federal structure of the country and the Constitution has been disturbed by many actions of this Government. So, I oppose it and I put my amendment for voting.

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab. Be very brief please. What is your amendment number?

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (CUTTACK): Madam, my amendment number is 1177. Eleven hundred and seventy seven deals with powers of the Central Government under the National Counter Terrorism Centre.

Here the hon. President has mentioned that the National Intelligence Grid and the National Counter Terrorism Centre aim to improve India's capability to counter internal security threats. This National Counter Terrorism Centre claims to improve India's capability to counter internal security threats...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Let us have order in the House.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : The hon. Prime Minister has mentioned that consultation will take place. Some deliberations have taken place with the DG (Police), with the Chief Secretaries of respective States and consultation will take place on 16<sup>th</sup> of April with respective Chief Ministers of different States.

At the same time, the Prime Minister has also said two things – one is, conceptual formation of NCTC and second point is,

the functioning of NCTC. This is nothing new. Since last February, the Union Government has been always trying to mention that conceptually the formation of NCTC is not being objected to. But that is not the case. When certain Chief Ministers have been repeatedly writing to the Prime Minister to withdraw this Office Order of 3<sup>rd</sup> February, they are objecting to the concept of formation of NCTC, then it follows with the functioning of NCTC.

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** क्या आपकी बात हो गयी?

**श्री भर्तृहरि महाताब :** महोदया, अभी तक तो मैंने कुछ कहा ही नहीं है।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप कहिये, जल्दी कहिये।

â€|(व्यवधान)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down. Please conclude. Now Shri Shailendra Kumar to speak.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB: Madam, let me complete. A little knowledge that I have about English grammar, at least, I understand that conceptually the idea that was floated in 2001 was to have an identical NCTC on the lines of the United States of America. Nowhere in the world in the democratic set up, except the other autocratic countries like the Security Service during Hitler's regime where the Intelligence had police powers, the intelligence agencies had any police powers...*(Interruptions)*

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आपकी बात बहुत लंबी हो रही है। आप इतनी लंबी बात मत कीजिये। शैलेन्द्र कुमार जी सीट से उठिये और बोलिये।

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : Madam, I am just referring to the letter which our Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, had written to the Prime Minister on 13<sup>th</sup> February which said that Para 3.1 of the Order empowers Director, NCTC, as the designated authority under Section 2E of the Unlawful Activities Prevention Act, 1967. Through this, the Central Government is deriving power to take on the powers of the State to search, to seize and to arrest. These are police powers and these police powers should never be given to an intelligence agency. That is why, we are opposed to the formation of NCTC in this form. The NCTC Order should be withdrawn and then the Chief Ministers' Conference can be called by the Prime Minister.

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशाम्बी):** महोदया, मैंने भी महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण प्रस्ताव पर संशोधन दिये हैं। संशोधन संख्या 140 से 148 और 1179 से 1181 है। अभी सम्मानित सदस्यों ने अपने विचार रखे हैं।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप अपना अमेंडमेंट नम्बर बतायेंगे।

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार :** महोदया, मैंने अभी बता दिया है।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप कौन सा मूव कर रहे हैं?

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशाम्बी):** महोदया, 140 से 148 और 1179 से 1181, एनसीटीसी पर जो मैंने संशोधन दिया है।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** यह आप कौन सा अमेंडमेंट मूव कर रहे हैं?

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार :** संशोधन संख्या 140 से 148 और 1179 से 1181 है। इसमें मैंने कई संशोधन दिये हैं। इनमें मैं केवल एनसीटीसी पर कहना चाहूँगा। जैसा अभी सम्मानित सदस्यों के सुझाव आए हैं कि संवैधानिक संघीय ढाँचे में राज्यों को जो अधिकार दिये गये हैं, चूँकि एनसीटीसी पर वर्तमान में बहुत बृहद् रूप से चर्चा है, सभी राज्यों के प्रमुख सचिवों और पुलिस प्रमुखों की भी मीटिंग यहाँ बुलाई गई थी, उनकी भी राय ली गई थी। कुछ राज्यों से इस पर एतराज हुआ है। मैं उसमें ज्यादा विस्तार से नहीं जाना चाहूँगा लेकिन अपने दल की तरफ से इतना कहना चाहूँगा कि संघीय ढाँचे में राज्यों को जो अधिकार दिये गये हैं, उस पर कुलाशयात नहीं होना चाहिए, उसका हनन नहीं होना चाहिए। अगर प्राइम मिनिस्टर की तरफ से ...*(व्यवधान)*

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आप किस अमेंडमेंट पर बोल रहे हैं?

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार :** मैं एनसीटीसी पर ही बोल रहा हूँ।

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** आपने जो नंबर दिये हैं, वे एनसीटीसी से संबंधित नहीं हैं। आप नंबर कुछ और दे रहे हैं, बोल कुछ और रहे हैं। यह उस पर नहीं हैं।

â€|(व्यवधान)

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार :** मैंने कई सुझाव दिये हैं। उसमें एनसीटीसी का भी है। ...*(व्यवधान)*

**अध्यक्ष महोदया :** ठीक है, उसका नंबर बताइए।

**श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार :** 1179 से 1181 में मैंने चार-पाँच संशोधन दिये हैं। एनसीटीसी उसमें मुख्य है। उसी पर मैं बोल रहा था। मेरा कहने का मतलब यही है कि यदि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने आश्वासन दिया है, तो हम पूरी तरीके से उसका सपोर्ट करते हैं, लेकिन राज्यों के मुख्य मंत्रियों और पार्टी लीडर्स को बुलाकर विचार-विमर्श करें

और उसी आधार पर हो तो ठीक रहेगा।

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (GHATAL): Madam, I am moving my amendment numbers from 1166 to 1172. All these amendments relate to the problems of the working class of India which have never been dealt with neither by the hon. President in her Address, nor by the hon. Prime Minister while replying to the Address. It is really astonishing that the hon. President of the country on the advice of the hon. Prime Minister can make her speech without having referred to the galloping problems of violation of labour laws in the country; to the galloping problems of marginalization of the contract labourers; to the galloping problems of poverty amongst the working class. They are the producers of wealth. The workers are the producers of wealth. The hon. Prime Minister has time to talk a tax evader to discuss the problem of his airline. He has time to talk to the tax evaders but does not have time to talk to the trade unions of this country. Therefore, I move all these amendments.

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, I shall put Amendment No. 1, moved by Shrimati Sushma Swaraj, to the vote of the House.

The question is:

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that National Intelligence Grid and the National Counter Terrorism Centre have been set up without any consultation with the Chief Ministers of the States and the provisions of these two institutions encroach upon the federal structure of the country and violate the rights of the States."

MADAM SPEAKER: Those in favour may say 'Aye'.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: 'Ayes'.

MADAM SPEAKER: Those against may say 'No'.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No.

MADAM SPEAKER: I think the 'Noes' have it; the 'Noes' have it.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: "Ayes" have it.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Let the lobbies be cleared---

...(Interruptions)

श्री दारा सिंह चौहान (घोसी): अध्यक्ष महोदया, हम केन्द्र सरकार के द्वारा प्रदेश सरकारों के अधिकारों के अतिक्रमण का और संघीय ढांचे पर पृहार का विरोध करते हैं और वॉकआउट करते हैं।

13.15 hrs.

**Shri Dara Singh Chauhan and some other hon. Members then left the House**

...(Interruptions)

*At this stage, Shri Kalyan Banerjee and some other*

*hon. Members left the House*

...(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (GHATAL): Madam Speaker, I am on a point of order. How can they walk out?....(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions) \* \* \**

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing is going on record.

*(Interruptions) \* \* \**

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, lobbies are clear. The Secretary-General may now inform the Members about the procedure for operating automatic vote recording machine

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Kind attention of the hon. Members is invited to the following points in the operation of the Automatic Vote Recording System:-

1. Before a Division starts, every hon. Member should occupy his or her own seat and operate the system from that seat only.
2. As may kindly be seen, the red bulbs above display boards on either side of hon. Speaker's Chair are already glowing. This means the voting system has been activated.
3. For voting, please press the following two buttons simultaneously immediately after sounding of first gong, namely, one "Red" button in front of the hon. Member on the head phone plate and also any one of the following buttons fixed on the top of the desk or seats:

Ayes - Green Colour

Noes - Red Colour

Abstain- Yellow Colour

4. It is essential to keep both the buttons pressed till the second gong sound is heard and the red bulbs are "off".
5. **Important:** The Hon. Members may please note that the vote will not be registered if both buttons are not kept pressed simultaneously till the sounding of the second gong.
6. Please do not press the amber button (P) during Division.
7. Hon. Members can actually "see" their vote on display boards and on their desk unit.
8. In case vote is not registered, they may call for voting through slips.

MADAM SPEAKER: The question is:

"That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that National Intelligence Grid and the National Counter Terrorism Centre have been set up without any consultation with the Chief Ministers of the States and the provisions of these two institutions encroach upon the federal structure of the country and violate the rights of the States."

*...(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: I demand Division.

*...(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Now Division:

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

*...(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please wait for a minute. Since it is not operative, we are again switching it off and switching it on.

So, now again fresh Division:

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

**DIVISION NO. 1 AYES 13.30 hrs.**

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb

Adsul, Shri Anandrao

Advani, Shri L.K.

Agrawal, Shri Rajendra

Ahir, Shri Hansraj G.

Ajnala, Dr. Rattan Singh

Anandan, Shri M.

Angadi, Shri Suresh

Argal, Shri Ashok

\*Azad, Shri Kirti

Babar, Shri Gajanan D.

\*Bais, Shri Ramesh

Basavaraj, Shri G. S.

Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari

Bundela, Shri Jitendra Singh

Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya

Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.

Chauhan, Shri Prabhatsinh P.

Chavan, Shri Harishchandra

Choudhary, Shri Bhudeo

Chowdhury, Shri Bansa Gopal

Das, Shri Khagen

Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas

Deka, Shri Ramen

Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh

Devi, Shrimati Rama

Dhotre, Shri Sanjay

Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti

Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra

Dubey, Shri Nishikant



Gaddigoudar, Shri P.C.  
Gandhi, Shri Dilipkumar Mansukhlal  
Gandhi, Shrimati Maneka  
[\\*Ganeshamurthi, Shri A.](#)  
Gawali, Shrimati Bhavana Patil  
Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram  
Gouda, Shri Shivarama  
Haque, Sk. Saidul  
Hazari, Shri Maheshwar  
Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz  
Jadhao, Shri Prataprao Ganpatrao  
Jaiswal, Dr. Sanjay  
Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana  
Jat, Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai  
Jawale, Shri Haribhau  
Jigajinagi, Shri Ramesh  
Joshi, Dr. Murli Manohar  
Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
Karunakaran, Shri P.  
Kashyap, Shri Virender  
Kaswan, Shri Ram Singh  
Kumar, Shri Kaushalendra  
Kumar, Shri P.  
Kumar, Shri Virendra  
Kumar, Shri Vishwa Mohan  
Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
Lingam, Shri P.  
[\\*Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra](#)  
Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari  
Majumdar, Shri Prasanta Kumar  
Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan  
Mandal, Shri Mangani Lal

Manian, Shri O.S.

Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram

Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad

Mohan, Shri P.C.

\*Munda, Shri Karia

Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso

Namdhari, Shri Inder Singh

Natarajan, Shri P.R.

Nishad, Capt. Jai Narain Prasad

Panda, Shri Baijayant

Panda, Shri Prabodh

Pandey, Kumari Saroj

Pandey, Shri Ravindra Kumar

Pangi, Shri Jayaram

Paranjpe, Shri Anand Prakash

Paswan, Shri Kamlesh

Patasani, Dr. Prasanna Kumar

Patel, Shri Devji M.

Patel, Shri Nathubhai Gomanbhai

Pathak, Shri Harin

Patil, Shri A.T. Nana

Patil, Shri C.R.

Patle, Shrimati Kamla Devi

Potai, Shri Sohan

Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra

Raghavendra, Shri B.Y.

Rajendran, Shri C.

Rajesh, Shri M.B.

Ramshankar, Prof.

Rana, Shri Rajendrasinh

Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara

Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh

Ray, Shri Rudramadhab

Riyan, Shri Bajju Ban

Roy, Shri Arjun

Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar  
Roy, Shri Nripendra Nath  
Sahu, Shri Chandu Lal  
Sai, Shri Vishnu Dev  
Sampath, Shri A.  
Satpathy, Shri Tathagata  
Scindia, Shrimati Yashodhara Rajee  
Semmalai, Shri S.  
Sethi, Shri Arjun Charan  
Shantha, Shrimati J.  
Sharma, Shri Jagdish  
Shukla, Shri Balkrishna Khanderao  
Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
Singh, Shri Dushyant  
Singh, Shri Ganesh  
Singh, Shri Jaswant  
Singh, Shri Kalyan  
Singh, Shri Murari Lal  
\*Singh, Shri Pashupati Nath  
Singh, Shri Pradeep Kumar  
Singh, Shri Radha Mohan  
Singh, Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan  
Singh, Shri Rajnath  
Singh, Shri Rakesh  
Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
Singh, Shri Uday  
Singh, Shrimati Meena  
Singh Deo, Shri Kalikesh Narayan  
Sinha, Shri Shatrughan  
Sinha, Shri Yashwant  
Sivasami, Shri C.  
Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
Sushant, Dr. Rajan

Swamy, Shri Janardhana  
Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
Tandon, Shri Lalji  
Thakur, Shri Anurag Singh  
Thambidurai, Dr. M.  
Tomar, Shri Narendra Singh  
Tudu, Shri Laxman  
Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
Vasava, Shri Mansukhbhai D.  
Venugopal, Dr. P.  
Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
[\\*Yadav, Prof. Ranjan Prasad](#)  
Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
Yadav, Shri Sharad

**NOES**

Aaron Rashid, Shri J.M.  
Abdullah, Dr. Farooq  
Adhi Sankar, Shri  
Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash  
Ahamed, Shri E.  
Ajmal, Shri Badruddin  
Amlabe, Shri Narayan Singh  
Antony, Shri Anto  
Anuragi, Shri Ghanshyam  
Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram  
Azharuddin, Mohammed  
Balu, Shri T.R.  
'Baba', Shri K.C. Singh  
Babbar, Shri Raj

Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh

\*Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal

Baite, Shri Thangso

\*Baitha, Shri Kameshwar

Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar

Bapiraju , Shri K.

Bavalia, Shri Kunvarjibhai Mohanbhai

Beg, Dr. Mirza Mehboob

Bhagora, Shri Tara Chand

Bhoi, Shri Sanjay

Bhujbal, Shri Sameer

Biswal, Shri Hemanand

Chacko, Shri P.C.

Chang, Shri C.M.

Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar

Chaudhary, Shri Arvind Kumar

Chaudhary, Shri Jayant

Chauhan, Shri Sanjay Singh

Chidambaram, Shri P.

Chinta Mohan, Dr.

Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.

Choudhary, Shri Harish

Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti

Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan

Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh

'Commando', Shri Kamal Kishor

Das, Shri Bhakta Charan

Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa

Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen

Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra

Deora, Shri Milind

Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.

Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.

Dias, Shri Charles

Dikshit, Shri Sandeep

Dutt, Shrimati Priya  
Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.  
Engti, Shri Biren Singh  
Ering, Shri Ninong  
Gadhvi, Shri Mukesh Bhairavdanji  
Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo  
Gandhi, Shri Rahul  
Gandhi, Shrimati Sonia  
Gandhiselvan, Shri S.  
Gavit, Shri Manikrao Hodlya  
[\\*Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh](#)  
Gogoi, Shri Dip  
Guddu, Shri Premchand  
Handique, Shri B.K.  
Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul  
Harsha Kumar, Shri G.V.  
Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh  
Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan  
Hussain, Shri Ismail  
Jadhav, Shri Baliram  
Jagannath, Dr. Manda  
Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.  
Jain, Shri Pradeep  
Jaiswal, Shri Shriprakash  
Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram  
Jayaprada, Shrimati  
Jena, Shri Srikant  
Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha  
Jindal, Shri Naveen  
Joshi, Dr. C.P.  
Joshi, Shri Mahesh  
Kalmadi, Shri Suresh  
Kamal Nath, Shri  
Kamat, Shri Gurudas

Kaur, Shrimati Preneet  
Kaypee, Shri Mohinder Singh  
\*Khan, Shri Hassan  
Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
Khatri, Dr. Nirmal  
Khursheed, Shri Salman  
Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
Madam, Shri Vikrambhai Arjanbhai  
Mahant, Dr. Charan Das  
Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
Majhi, Shri Pradeep  
Maken, Shri Ajay  
Malik, Shri Jitender Singh  
Mani, Shri Jose K.  
Masram, Shri Basori Singh  
Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
Meena, Shri Namu Narain  
Meena, Shri Raghuvir Singh  
Meghe, Shri Datta  
Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
Mishra, Shri Mahabal  
Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
Mukherjee, Shri Pranab  
Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
Muttemwar, Shri Vilas  
Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
Naik, Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh

Narah, Shrimati Ranee

Narayanasamy, Shri V.

Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi

Nirupam, Shri Sanjay

Noor, Kumari Mausam

Ola, Shri Sis Ram

## Owaisi, Shri Asaduddin

Pal, Shri Jagdambika

Pal, Shri Rajaram

Pala, Shri Vincent H.

Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar

Patel, Shri Dinsha

Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.

Patel, Shri Praful

Patel, Shri Somabhai Gandadal Koli

Patil, Dr. Padmasinha Bajirao

Patil, Shri Pratik

Pawar, Shri Sharad

Pilot, Shri Sachin

Prabhakar, Shri Ponnam

Pradhan, Shri Amarnath

Prasada, Shri Jitin

Premdas, Shri

Punia, Shri P. L.

Purandeswari, Shrimati D.

Radadiya, Shri Vitthalbhai Hansrajbhai

Raghavan, Shri M.K.

Rahman, Shri Abdul

Rai, Shri Prem Das

Rajagopal, Shri L.

Raju, Shri M.M. Pallam

Rajukhedi, Shri Gajendra Singh

Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally

Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.



Ramkishun, Shri  
Rao, Dr. K.S.  
Rao, Shri Rayapati Sambasiva  
Rawat, Shri Harish  
Reddy, Shri Anantha Venkatarami  
Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
Reddy, Shri M. Sreenivasulu  
Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
Ruala, Shri C.L.  
Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
Sai Prathap, Shri A.  
Sangma, Kumari Agatha  
Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
Saroj, Shri Tufani  
Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
Scindia, Shri Jyotiraditya M.  
Selja, Kumari  
Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
Sharma, Dr. Arvind Kumar  
Shariq, Shri S.D.  
Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
Sibal, Shri Kapil  
Singh, Chaudhary Lal  
Singh, Dr. Sanjay  
Singh, Rao Inderjit  
Singh, Shri Ajit  
Singh, Shri Brijbhushan Sharan  
Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
Singh, Shri Jitendra  
Singh, Shri N. Dharam

Singh, Shri R.P.N.  
Singh, Shri Ravneet  
Singh, Shri Rewati Raman  
Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
Singh, Shri Virbhadra  
Singh, Shri Yashvir  
Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini  
Singla, Shri Vijay Inder  
Siricilla, Shri Rajaiah  
Solanki, Shri Bharatsinh  
Sudhakaran, Shri K.  
Sugavanam, Shri E.G.  
Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan  
Sule, Shrimati Supriya  
Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil  
Tagore, Shri Manicka  
Tamta, Shri Pradeep  
Tandon, Shrimati Annu  
Tanwar, Shri Ashok  
Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor  
Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath  
Tewari, Shri Manish  
Thamaraiselvan, Shri R.  
Tharoor, Dr. Shashi  
Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
Thomas, Shri P.T.  
Tirath, Shrimati Krishna  
Vardhan, Shri Harsh  
Venugopal, Shri D.  
Venugopal, Shri K.C.  
Verma, Shri Sajjan  
Verma, Shri Beni Prasad  
Verma, Shrimati Usha  
Vijayan, Shri A.K.S.

Viswanathan, Shri P.

Vivekanand, Dr. G.

Vundavalli, Shri Aruna Kumar

Vyas, Dr. Girija

Wasnik, Shri Mukul

Yadav, Shri Arun

Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.

Yadav, Shri Om Prakash

Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please sit down. Please take your seats.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Subject to correction\*, the result of the Division is:

Ayes: 141

Noes: 226

*The motion was negatived.*

*The amendment was negatived.*

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now move the amendment no. 1279, moved by Shri Basu Deb Acharia to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about that the National Intelligence Grid and the National Counter Terrorism Centre have been constituted without consultations with the Chief Ministers of the States and the provisions of these two bodies encroach upon the federal structure of the country and dilute the rights of the States."

...(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): I demand Division. ...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: The Lobbies are already cleared.

The question is:

"That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about that the National Intelligence Grid and the National Counter Terrorism Centre have been constituted without consultations with the Chief Ministers of the States and the provisions of these two bodies encroach upon the federal structure of the country and dilute the rights

of the States."

...(Interruptions)

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

**DIVISION NO. 2 AYES 13.32 hrs.**

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb

Adsul, Shri Anandrao

Advani, Shri L.K.

Agrawal, Shri Rajendra

Ahir, Shri Hansraj G.

Ajnala, Dr. Rattan Singh

Anandan, Shri M.

Angadi, Shri Suresh

Argal, Shri Ashok

\*Azad, Shri Kirti

Babar, Shri Gajanan D.

Bais, Shri Ramesh

Basavaraj, Shri G. S.

Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari

Bundela, Shri Jitendra Singh

Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya

Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.

Chauhan, Shri Prabhatsinh P.

Chavan, Shri Harishchandra

Choudhary, Shri Bhudeo

Chowdhury, Shri Bansa Gopal

Das, Shri Khagen

Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas

Deka, Shri Ramen

Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh

Devi, Shrimati Rama

Dhotre, Shri Sanjay

Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti

Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra  
Dubey, Shri Nishikant  
Gaddigoudar, Shri P.C.  
Gandhi, Shri Dilipkumar Mansukhlal  
Gandhi, Shrimati Maneka  
Ganeshamurthi, Shri A.  
Gawali, Shrimati Bhavana Patil  
Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram  
Gouda, Shri Shivarama  
Haque, Sk. Saidul  
Hazari, Shri Maheshwar  
Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz  
Jadhao, Shri Prataprao Ganpatrao  
Jaiswal, Dr. Sanjay  
Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana  
Jat, Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai  
Jawale, Shri Haribhau  
Jigajinagi, Shri Ramesh  
Joshi, Dr. Murli Manohar  
Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
Karunakaran, Shri P.  
Kashyap, Shri Virender  
Kaswan, Shri Ram Singh  
Kumar, Shri Kaushalendra  
Kumar, Shri P.  
Kumar, Shri Virendra  
Kumar, Shri Vishwa Mohan  
Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
Lingam, Shri P.  
\*Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra  
Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari  
Majumdar, Shri Prasanta Kumar

Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan  
Mandal, Shri Mangani Lal  
Manian, Shri O.S.  
Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
Mohan, Shri P.C.  
Munda, Shri Karia  
Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso  
Namdhari, Shri Inder Singh  
Natarajan, Shri P.R.  
Nishad, Capt. Jai Narain Prasad  
Panda, Shri Baijayant  
Panda, Shri Prabodh  
Pandey, Kumari Saroj  
Pandey, Shri Ravindra Kumar  
Pangi, Shri Jayaram  
Paranjpe, Shri Anand Prakash  
\*Paswan, Shri Kamlesh  
Patasani, Dr. Prasanna Kumar  
Patel, Shri Devji M.  
Patel, Shri Nathubhai Gomanbhai  
Pathak, Shri Harin  
Patil, Shri A.T.  
Patil, Shri C.R.  
Patle, Shrimati Kamla Devi  
Potai, Shri Sohan  
Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
Raghavendra, Shri B.Y.  
Rajendran, Shri C.  
Rajesh, Shri M.B.  
Ramshankar, Prof.  
Rana, Shri Rajendrasinh  
Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara  
Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh  
Ray, Shri Rudramadhab

Riyan, Shri Baju Ban  
Roy, Shri Arjun  
Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar  
Roy, Shri Nripendra Nath  
Sahu, Shri Chandu Lal  
Sai, Shri Vishnu Dev  
Sampath, Shri A.  
Satpathy, Shri Tathagata  
Scindia, Shrimati Yashodhara Rajee  
Semmalai, Shri S.  
Sethi, Shri Arjun Charan  
Shantha, Shrimati J.  
Sharma, Shri Jagdish  
Shukla, Shri Balkrishna Khanderao  
Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
Singh, Dr. Bhola  
Singh, Shri Dushyant  
Singh, Shri Ganesh  
Singh, Shri Jaswant  
Singh, Shri Kalyan  
Singh, Shri Murari Lal  
Singh, Shri Pashupati Nath  
Singh, Shri Pradeep Kumar  
Singh, Shri Radha Mohan  
Singh, Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan  
Singh, Shri Rajnath  
Singh, Shri Rakesh  
Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
Singh, Shri Uday  
Singh, Shrimati Meena  
Singh Deo, Shri Kalikesh Narayan  
Sinha, Shri Shatrughan  
Sinha, Shri Yashwant  
Sivasami, Shri C.

Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
Swamy, Shri Janardhana  
Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
Tandon, Shri Lalji  
Thakur, Shri Anurag Singh  
Thambidurai, Dr. M.  
Tomar, Shri Narendra Singh  
Tudu, Shri Laxman  
Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
Vasava, Shri Mansukhbhai D.  
Venugopal, Dr. P.  
Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
Yadav, Prof. Ranjan Prasad  
Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
Yadav, Shri Sharad

## **NOES**

Aaron Rashid, Shri J.M.  
Abdullah, Dr. Farooq  
Adhi Sankar, Shri  
Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash  
Ahamed, Shri E.  
Ajmal, Shri Badruddin  
Amlabe, Shri Narayan Singh  
Antony, Shri Anto  
Anuragi, Shri Ghanshyam  
Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram  
Azharuddin, Mohammed  
Baal, Shri T.R.



'Baba', Shri K.C. Singh  
Babbar, Shri Raj  
Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh  
\*Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal  
Baite, Shri Thangso  
Baitha, Shri Kameshwar  
Balmiki, Shri Kamlesh  
Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar  
Bapiraju , Shri K.  
Bavalia, Shri Kunvarjibhai Mohanbhai  
Beg, Dr. Mirza Mehboob  
Bhagora, Shri Tara Chand  
Bhoi, Shri Sanjay  
Bhujbal, Shri Sameer  
Biswal, Shri Hemanand  
Chacko, Shri P.C.  
Chang, Shri C.M.  
Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar  
Chaudhary, Shri Arvind Kumar  
Chaudhary, Shri Jayant  
Chauhan, Shri Sanjay Singh  
Chidambaram, Shri P.  
Chinta Mohan, Dr.  
Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.  
Choudhary, Shri Harish  
Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti  
Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan  
Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh  
'Commando', Shri Kamal Kishor  
Das, Shri Bhakta Charan  
Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa  
Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen  
Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra  
Deora, Shri Milind

Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.  
Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.  
Dias, Shri Charles  
Dikshit, Shri Sandeep  
Dutt, Shrimati Priya  
Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.  
Engti, Shri Biren Singh  
Ering, Shri Ninong  
Gadhvi, Shri Mukesh Bhairavdanji  
Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo  
Gandhi, Shri Rahul  
Gandhi, Shrimati Sonia  
Gandhiselvan, Shri S.  
Gavit, Shri Manikrao Hodlya  
[\\*Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh](#)  
Gogoi, Shri Dip  
Guddu, Shri Premchand  
Handique, Shri B.K.  
Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul  
Harsha Kumar, Shri G.V.  
Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh  
Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan  
Hussain, Shri Ismail  
Jadhav, Shri Baliram  
Jagannath, Dr. Manda  
Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.  
Jain, Shri Pradeep  
Jaiswal, Shri Shriprakash  
Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram  
Jayaprada, Shrimati  
Jena, Shri Srikant  
Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha  
Jindal, Shri Naveen  
Joshi, Dr. C.P.  
Joshi, Shri Mahesh

Kalmadi, Shri Suresh  
Kamal Nath, Shri  
Kamat, Shri Gurudas  
Kaur, Shrimati Preneet  
Kaypee, Shri Mohinder Singh  
\*Khan, Shri Hassan  
Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
Khatri, Dr. Nirmal  
Khursheed, Shri Salman  
Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
Lal, Shri Pakauri  
Madam, Shri Vikrambhai Arjanbhai  
Mahant, Dr. Charan Das  
Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
Majhi, Shri Pradeep  
Maken, Shri Ajay  
Malik, Shri Jitender Singh  
Mani, Shri Jose K.  
Masram, Shri Basori Singh  
Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
Meena, Shri Namoo Narain  
Meena, Shri Raghuvir Singh  
Meghe, Shri Datta  
Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
Mishra, Shri Mahabal  
Moily, Shri M. Veerappa

Mukherjee, Shri Pranab  
Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
[\\*](#)Muttemwar, Shri Vilas  
Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
Naik, Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh  
Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
Noor, Kumari Mausam  
[\\*](#)Ola, Shri Sis Ram  
Owaisi, Shri Asaduddin  
Pal, Shri Jagdambika  
Pal, Shri Rajaram  
Pala, Shri Vincent H.  
Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
Patel, Shri Dinsha  
Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
Patel, Shri Praful  
Patel, Shri Somabhai Gandlal Koli  
Patil, Dr. Padmasinha Bajirao  
Patil, Shri Pratik  
Pawar, Shri Sharad  
Pilot, Shri Sachin  
Prabhakar, Shri Ponnamm  
Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
Prasada, Shri Jitin  
Premdas, Shri  
Punia, Shri P. L.  
Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
Radadiya, Shri Vitthalbhai Hansrajbhai  
Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
Rahman, Shri Abdul  
Rai, Shri Prem Das

Rajagopal, Shri L.  
Raju, Shri M.M. Pallam  
Rajukhedi, Shri Gajendra Singh  
Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
Ramkishun, Shri  
Rao, Dr. K.S.  
Rao, Shri Rayapati Sambasiva  
Rawat, Shri Harish  
Reddy, Shri Anantha Venkatarami  
Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
Reddy, Shri M. Sreenivasulu  
Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
Ruala, Shri C.L.  
Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
Sai Prathap, Shri A.  
Sangma, Kumari Agatha  
Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
Saroj, Shri Tufani  
Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
Scindia, Shri Jyotiraditya M.  
Selja, Kumari  
Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
Sharma, Dr. Arvind Kumar  
Shariq, Shri S.D.  
Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
Sibal, Shri Kapil  
Singh, Chaudhary Lal  
Singh, Dr. Sanjay  
Singh, Rao Inderjit  
Singh, Shri Ajit

Singh, Shri Brijbhushan Sharan

Singh, Shri Ijyaraj

Singh, Shri Jitendra

Singh, Shri N. Dharam

Singh, Shri R.P.N.

Singh, Shri Ravneet

Singh, Shri Rewati Raman

Singh, Shri Sukhdev

Singh, Shri Uday Pratap

Singh, Shri Virbhadra

Singh, Shri Yashvir

Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini

Singla, Shri Vijay Inder

Siricilla, Shri Rajaiah

Solanki, Shri Bharatsinh

Sudhakaran, Shri K.

Sugavanam, Shri E.G.

Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan

Sule, Shrimati Supriya

Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil

Tagore, Shri Manicka

Tamta, Shri Pradeep

Tandon, Shrimati Annu

Tanwar, Shri Ashok

Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor

Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath

Tewari, Shri Manish

Thamaraiselvan, Shri R.

Tharoor, Dr. Shashi

Thomas, Prof. K.V.

Thomas, Shri P.T.

Tirath, Shrimati Krishna

Vardhan, Shri Harsh

Venugopal, Shri D.

Venugopal, Shri K.C.  
Verma, Shri Sajjan  
Verma, Shri Beni Prasad  
Verma, Shrimati Usha  
Vijayan, Shri A.K.S.  
Viswanathan, Shri P.  
Vivekanand, Dr. G.  
Vundavalli, Shri Aruna Kumar  
Vyas, Dr. Girija  
Wasnik, Shri Mukul  
Yadav, Shri Arun  
Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.  
Yadav, Shri Om Prakash  
Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

MADAM SPEAKER: Subject to correction\*, the result of the Division is:

Ayes: 146

Noes: 227

*The motion was negatived.*

*The amendment was negatived.*

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now put Amendment No. 1177 moved by Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab to the vote of the House.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (CUTTACK): We want Division.

MADAM SPEAKER: The Lobbies are already cleared.

The question is:

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about powers of the Central Government under the National Counter Terrorism Centre."

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

**DIVISION NO. 3 AYES 13.32 hrs.**

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb  
Adsul, Shri Anandrao  
Advani, Shri L.K.  
Agrawal, Shri Rajendra  
Ahir, Shri Hansraj G.  
Ajnala, Dr. Rattan Singh  
Anandan, Shri M.  
Angadi, Shri Suresh  
Argal, Shri Ashok  
[\\*Azad, Shri Kirti](#)  
Babar, Shri Gajanan D.  
Bais, Shri Ramesh  
Basavaraj, Shri G. S.  
Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari  
Bundela, Shri Jitendra Singh  
Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya  
Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.  
Chauhan, Shri Prabhatsinh P.  
Chavan, Shri Harishchandra  
Choudhary, Shri Bhudeo  
Chowdhury, Shri Bansa Gopal  
Das, Shri Khagen  
Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas  
Deka, Shri Ramen  
Devi, Shrimati Rama  
Dhotre, Shri Sanjay  
Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti  
Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra  
Dubey, Shri Nishikant  
Gaddigoudar, Shri P.C.  
Gandhi, Shri Dilipkumar Mansukhlal  
Gandhi, Shrimati Maneka  
Ganeshamurthi, Shri A.  
Gawali, Shrimati Bhavana Patil  
Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram



Gouda, Shri Shivarama  
Haque, Sk. Saidul  
Hazari, Shri Maheshwar  
Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz  
Jadhao, Shri Prataprao Ganpatrao  
Jaiswal, Dr. Sanjay  
Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana  
Jat, Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai  
Jawale, Shri Haribhau  
Jigajinagi, Shri Ramesh  
Joshi, Dr. Murli Manohar  
Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
Karunakaran, Shri P.  
Kashyap, Shri Virender  
Kaswan, Shri Ram Singh  
Kumar, Shri Kaushalendra  
Kumar, Shri P.  
Kumar, Shri Virendra  
Kumar, Shri Vishwa Mohan  
Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
Lingam, Shri P.  
\*Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra  
Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari  
Majumdar, Shri Prasanta Kumar  
Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan  
Mandal, Shri Mangani Lal  
Manian, Shri O.S.  
Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
\*Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
Mohan, Shri P.C.  
Munda, Shri Karia  
Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso

Namdhari, Shri Inder Singh  
Natarajan, Shri P.R.  
Nishad, Capt. Jai Narain Prasad  
Panda, Shri Baijayant  
Panda, Shri Prabodh  
Pandey, Kumari Saroj  
Pandey, Shri Ravindra Kumar  
Pangi, Shri Jayaram  
Paranjpe, Shri Anand Prakash  
Paswan, Shri Kamlesh  
Patasani, Dr. Prasanna Kumar  
Patel, Shri Devji M.  
Patel, Shri Nathubhai Gomanbhai  
Pathak, Shri Harin  
Patil, Shri A.T. Nana  
Patil, Shri C.R.  
Patle, Shrimati Kamla Devi  
Potai, Shri Sohan  
Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
Raghavendra, Shri B.Y.  
Rajendran, Shri C.  
Rajesh, Shri M.B.  
Ramshankar, Prof.  
Rana, Shri Rajendrasinh  
Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara  
Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh  
Ray, Shri Rudramadhab  
Riyan, Shri Baju Ban  
Roy, Shri Arjun  
Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar  
Roy, Shri Nripendra Nath  
Sahu, Shri Chandu Lal  
Sai, Shri Vishnu Dev  
Sampath, Shri A.  
Satpathy, Shri Tathagata

Scindia, Shrimati Yashodhara Rajee  
Semmalai, Shri S.  
Sethi, Shri Arjun Charan  
Shantha, Shrimati J.  
Sharma, Shri Jagdish  
Shukla, Shri Balkrishna Khanderao  
Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
Singh, Dr. Bhola  
Singh, Shri Dushyant  
Singh, Shri Ganesh  
Singh, Shri Jaswant  
Singh, Shri Kalyan  
Singh, Shri Murari Lal  
Singh, Shri Pashupati Nath  
Singh, Shri Pradeep Kumar  
Singh, Shri Radha Mohan  
Singh, Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan  
Singh, Shri Rajnath  
Singh, Shri Rakesh  
Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
Singh, Shri Uday  
Singh, Shrimati Meena  
Singh Deo, Shri Kalikesh Narayan  
Sinha, Shri Shatrughan  
Sinha, Shri Yashwant  
Sivasami, Shri C.  
Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
Swamy, Shri Janardhana  
Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
Tandon, Shri Lalji  
Thakur, Shri Anurag Singh  
Thambidurai, Dr. M.

Tomar, Shri Narendra Singh  
Tudu, Shri Laxman  
Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
Vasava, Shri Mansukhbhai D.  
Venugopal, Dr. P.  
Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
Yadav, Prof. Ranjan Prasad  
Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
Yadav, Shri Sharad

#### NOES

Aaron Rashid, Shri J.M.  
Abdullah, Dr. Farooq  
Adhi Sankar, Shri  
Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash  
Ahamed, Shri E.  
Ajmal, Shri Badruddin  
Amlabe, Shri Narayan Singh  
Antony, Shri Anto  
Anuragi, Shri Ghanshyam  
Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram  
Azharuddin, Mohammed  
Baal, Shri T.R.  
'Baba', Shri K.C. Singh  
Babbar, Shri Raj  
Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh  
[\\*Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal](#)  
Baite, Shri Thangso  
Baitha, Shri Kameshwar  
Balmiki, Shri Kamlesh  
Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar  
Bapiraju, Shri K.  
Bavalia, Shri Kunvarjibhai Mohanbhai  
Beg, Dr. Mirza Mehboob

Bhagora, Shri Tara Chand  
Bhoi, Shri Sanjay  
Bhujbal, Shri Sameer  
Biswal, Shri Hemanand  
Chacko, Shri P.C.  
Chang, Shri C.M.  
Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar  
Chaudhary, Shri Jayant  
Chauhan, Shri Sanjay Singh  
Chidambaram, Shri P.  
Chinta Mohan, Dr.  
Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.  
Choudhary, Shri Harish  
Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti  
Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan  
Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh  
Chowdhury, Shri Adhir  
'Commando', Shri Kamal Kishor  
Das, Shri Bhakta Charan  
Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa  
Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen  
Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra  
Deora, Shri Milind  
Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.  
Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.  
Dias, Shri Charles  
Dikshit, Shri Sandeep  
Dutt, Shrimati Priya  
Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.  
Engti, Shri Biren Singh  
Ering, Shri Ninong  
Gadhvi, Shri Mukesh Bhairavdanji  
Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo  
Gandhi, Shri Rahul

Gandhi, Shrimati Sonia  
Gandhiselvan, Shri S.  
Gavit, Shri Manikrao Hodlya  
[\\*Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh](#)  
Gogoi, Shri Dip  
Guddu, Shri Premchand  
Handique, Shri B.K.  
Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul  
Harsha Kumar, Shri G.V.  
Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh  
Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan  
Hussain, Shri Ismail  
Jadhav, Shri Baliram  
Jagannath, Dr. Manda  
Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.  
Jain, Shri Pradeep  
Jaiswal, Shri Shriprakash  
Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram  
Jayaprada, Shrimati  
Jena, Shri Srikant  
Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha  
Jindal, Shri Naveen  
Joshi, Dr. C.P.  
Joshi, Shri Mahesh  
Kalmadi, Shri Suresh  
Kamal Nath, Shri  
Kamat, Shri Gurudas  
Kaur, Shrimati Preneet  
Kaypee, Shri Mohinder Singh  
[\\*Khan, Shri Hassan](#)  
Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
Khatri, Dr. Nirmal

Khursheed, Shri Salman  
Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
Lal, Shri Pakauri  
Madam, Shri Vikrambhai Arjanbhai  
Mahant, Dr. Charan Das  
Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
Majhi, Shri Pradeep  
Maken, Shri Ajay  
Malik, Shri Jitender Singh  
Mani, Shri Jose K.  
Masram, Shri Basori Singh  
Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
Meena, Shri Namu Narain  
Meena, Shri Raghuvir Singh  
Meghe, Shri Datta  
Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
Mishra, Shri Mahabal  
Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
Mukherjee, Shri Pranab  
Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
Muttemwar, Shri Vilas  
Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
Naik, Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh  
Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
Noor, Kumari Mausam

Ola, Shri Sis Ram  
Owaisi, Shri Asaduddin  
Pal, Shri Jagdambika  
Pal, Shri Rajaram  
Pala, Shri Vincent H.  
Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
Patel, Shri Dinsha  
Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
Patel, Shri Praful  
Patel, Shri Somabhai Gandamal Koli  
Patil, Dr. Padmasinha Bajirao  
Patil, Shri Pratik  
Pawar, Shri Sharad  
Pilot, Shri Sachin  
Prabhakar, Shri Ponnamp  
Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
Prasada, Shri Jitin  
Premdas, Shri  
Punia, Shri P. L.  
Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
Radadiya, Shri Vitthalbhai Hansrajbhai  
Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
Rahman, Shri Abdul  
Rai, Shri Prem Das  
Rajagopal, Shri L.  
Raju, Shri M.M. Pallam  
Rajukhedi, Shri Gajendra Singh  
Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
Ramkishun, Shri  
Rao, Dr. K.S.  
Rao, Shri Rayapati Sambasiva  
Rawat, Shri Harish  
Reddy, Shri Anantha Venkatarami



Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
Reddy, Shri M. Sreenivasulu  
Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
Ruala, Shri C.L.  
Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
Sai Prathap, Shri A.  
Sangma, Kumari Agatha  
Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
Saroj, Shri Tufani  
Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
Scindia, Shri Jyotiraditya M.  
Selja, Kumari  
Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
Sharma, Dr. Arvind Kumar  
Shariq, Shri S.D.  
Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
Sibal, Shri Kapil  
Singh, Chaudhary Lal  
Singh, Dr. Sanjay  
Singh, Rao Inderjit  
Singh, Shri Ajit  
Singh, Shri Brijbhushan Sharan  
Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
Singh, Shri Jitendra  
Singh, Shri N. Dharam  
Singh, Shri R.P.N.  
Singh, Shri Ravneet  
Singh, Shri Rewati Raman  
Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
Singh, Shri Virbhadra  
Singh, Shri Yashvir

Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini

Singla, Shri Vijay Inder

Siricilla, Shri Rajaiah

Solanki, Shri Bharatsinh

Sudhakaran, Shri K.

Sugavanam, Shri E.G.

Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan

Sule, Shrimati Supriya

Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil

Tagore, Shri Manicka

Tamta, Shri Pradeep

Tandon, Shrimati Annu

Tanwar, Shri Ashok

Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor

Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath

Tewari, Shri Manish

Thamaraiselvan, Shri R.

Tharoor, Dr. Shashi

Thomas, Prof. K.V.

Thomas, Shri P.T.

Tirath, Shrimati Krishna

Vardhan, Shri Harsh

Venugopal, Shri D.)

Venugopal, Shri K.C.

Verma, Shri Sajjan

Verma, Shri Beni Prasad

Verma, Shrimati Usha

Vijayan, Shri A.K.S.

Viswanathan, Shri P.

Vundavalli, Shri Aruna Kumar

Vyas, Dr. Girija

Wasnik, Shri Mukul

Yadav, Shri Arun

Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.

Yadav, Shri Om Prakash

Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

MADAM SPEAKER: Subject to correction\*, the result of the Division is:

Ayes: 145

Noes: 227

*The motion was negatived.*

*The amendment was negatived.*

MADAM SPEAKER: I will put Amendment Nos. from 1166 to 1172 moved by Shri Gurudas Dasgupta to the vote of the House."

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (GHATAL): Madam, we want Division.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Madam, we want Division.

MADAM SPEAKER: The Lobbies are already cleared.

The question is:

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about not taking serious note of the growing incidents of farmers suicides in the country." (1166)

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about not taking note of the growing contractualisation of work of permanent/perennial nature where contract workers are denied the wages and other benefits given to the regular workers." (1167)

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to amend the Minimum Wages Act to ensure universal coverage irrespective of the schedules and fixation of the statutory minimum wages at not less than Rs. 10,000 per month." (1168)

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to introduce compulsory registration of trade unions within a period of 45 days and immediate ratification of the ILO Convention Nos. 87 and 98." (1169)

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to stop disinvestment of government equity in the profit making central public sector undertakings." (1170)

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need for strict enforcement of labour laws without any exception or exemption and stringent punitive measures for violation of labour laws." (1171)

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to provide universal social security cover for the unorganized sector workers without any restriction and creation of a National Security Fund with adequate resources in line with the recommendations of NCEUS and Parliamentary Standing Committee on Labour." (1172)

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

**DIVISION NO. 4 AYES 13.37 hrs.**

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb

Adsul, Shri Anandrao

Advani, Shri L.K.

Agrawal, Shri Rajendra

Ahir, Shri Hansraj G.

Ajnala, Dr. Rattan Singh

Anandan, Shri M.

Angadi, Shri Suresh

Argal, Shri Ashok

\*Azad, Shri Kirti

Babar, Shri Gajanan D.

Bais, Shri Ramesh

Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari

Bundela, Shri Jitendra Singh

Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya

Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.

Chauhan, Shri Prabhatsinh P.

Chavan, Shri Harishchandra

Choudhary, Shri Bhudeo

Chowdhury, Shri Bansa Gopal

Das, Shri Khagen

Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas

Deka, Shri Ramen

Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh

Devi, Shrimati Rama  
Dhotre, Shri Sanjay  
Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti  
Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra  
Dubey, Shri Nishikant  
Gaddigoudar, Shri P.C.  
Gandhi, Shri Dilipkumar Mansukhlal  
Gandhi, Shrimati Maneka  
Ganeshamurthi, Shri A.  
Gawali, Shrimati Bhavana Patil  
Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram  
Gouda, Shri Shivarama  
Haque, Sk. Saidul  
Hazari, Shri Maheshwar  
Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz  
Jadhao, Shri Prataprao Ganpatrao  
Jaiswal, Dr. Sanjay  
Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana  
Jat, Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai  
Jawale, Shri Haribhau  
Jigajinagi, Shri Ramesh  
Joshi, Dr. Murli Manohar  
Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
Karunakaran, Shri P.  
Kashyap, Shri Virender  
Kaswan, Shri Ram Singh  
Kumar, Shri Kaushalendra  
Kumar, Shri P.  
Kumar, Shri Virendra  
Kumar, Shri Vishwa Mohan  
Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
Lingam, Shri P.

\*Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra

Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari  
Majumdar, Shri Prasanta Kumar  
Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan  
Mandal, Shri Mangani Lal  
Manian, Shri O.S.  
Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
Mohan, Shri P.C.  
Munda, Shri Karia  
Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso  
Namdhari, Shri Inder Singh  
Natarajan, Shri P.R.  
Nishad, Capt. Jai Narain Prasad  
Panda, Shri Baijayant  
Panda, Shri Prabodh  
Pandey, Kumari Saroj  
Pandey, Shri Ravindra Kumar  
Pangi, Shri Jayaram  
Paranjpe, Shri Anand Prakash  
Paswan, Shri Kamlesh  
Patasani, Dr. Prasanna Kumar  
Patel, Shri Devji M.  
Patel, Shri Nathubhai Gomanbhai  
Pathak, Shri Harin  
Patil, Shri A.T. Nana  
Patil, Shri C.R.  
Patle, Shrimati Kamla Devi  
Potai, Shri Sohan  
Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
Raghavendra, Shri B.Y.  
Rajendran, Shri C.  
Rajesh, Shri M.B.  
Ramshankar, Prof.  
Rana, Shri Rajendrasinh

Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara  
Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh  
Ray, Shri Rudramadhab  
Riyan, Shri Baju Ban  
Roy, Shri Arjun  
Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar  
Roy, Shri Nripendra Nath  
Sahu, Shri Chandu Lal  
Sai, Shri Vishnu Dev  
Sampath, Shri A.  
Satpathy, Shri Tathagata  
Scindia, Shrimati Yashodhara Raje  
Semmalai, Shri S.  
Sethi, Shri Arjun Charan  
Shantha, Shrimati J.  
Sharma, Shri Jagdish  
Shukla, Shri Balkrishna Khanderao  
Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
Singh, Dr. Bhola  
Singh, Shri Dushyant  
Singh, Shri Ganesh  
Singh, Shri Jaswant  
\*Singh, Shri Kalyan  
Singh, Shri Murari Lal  
Singh, Shri Pashupati Nath  
Singh, Shri Pradeep Kumar  
Singh, Shri Radha Mohan  
Singh, Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan  
Singh, Shri Rajnath  
Singh, Shri Rakesh  
Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
Singh, Shri Uday  
Singh, Shrimati Meena  
Singh Deo, Shri Kalikesh Narayan

Sinha, Shri Shatrughan  
Sinha, Shri Yashwant  
Sivasami, Shri C.  
Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
Tandon, Shri Lalji  
Thakur, Shri Anurag Singh  
Thambidurai, Dr. M.  
Tomar, Shri Narendra Singh  
Tudu, Shri Laxman  
Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
Vasava, Shri Mansukhbhai D.  
Venugopal, Dr. P.  
Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
Yadav, Prof. Ranjan Prasad  
Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
Yadav, Shri Sharad

## **NOES**

Aaron Rashid, Shri J.M.  
Abdullah, Dr. Farooq  
Adhi Sankar, Shri  
Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash  
Ahamed, Shri E.  
Ajmal, Shri Badruddin  
Amlabe, Shri Narayan Singh  
Antony, Shri Anto  
Anuragi, Shri Ghanshyam



Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram  
Azharuddin, Mohammed  
BaalU, Shri T.R.  
'Baba', Shri K.C. Singh  
Babbar, Shri Raj  
Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh  
[\\*Bairwa](#), Shri Khiladi Lal  
Baite, Shri Thangso  
Baitha, Shri Kameshwar  
Balmiki, Shri Kamlesh  
Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar  
Bapiraju , Shri K.  
Bavalia, Shri Kunvarjibhai Mohanbhai  
Beg, Dr. Mirza Mehboob  
Bhagora, Shri Tara Chand  
Bhoi, Shri Sanjay  
Bhujbal, Shri Sameer  
Biswal, Shri Hemanand  
Chacko, Shri P.C.  
Chang, Shri C.M.  
Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar  
Chaudhary, Shri Jayant  
Chauhan, Shri Sanjay Singh  
Chidambaram, Shri P.  
Chinta Mohan, Dr.  
Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.  
Choudhary, Shri Harish  
Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti  
Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan  
Choudhury, Shri Adhir  
Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh  
'Commando', Shri Kamal Kishor  
Das, Shri Bhakta Charan  
Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa

Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen  
Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra  
Deora, Shri Milind  
Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.  
Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.  
Dias, Shri Charles  
Dikshit, Shri Sandeep  
Dutt, Shrimati Priya  
Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.  
Engti, Shri Biren Singh  
Ering, Shri Ninong  
Gadhvi, Shri Mukesh Bhairavdanji  
Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo  
Gandhi, Shri Rahul  
Gandhi, Shrimati Sonia  
Gandhiselvan, Shri S.  
Gavit, Shri Manikrao Hodlya  
[\\*Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh](#)  
Gogoi, Shri Dip  
Guddu, Shri Premchand  
Handique, Shri B.K.  
Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul  
Harsha Kumar, Shri G.V.  
Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh  
Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan  
Hussain, Shri Ismail  
Jadhav, Shri Baliram  
Jagannath, Dr. Manda  
Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.  
Jain, Shri Pradeep  
Jaiswal, Shri Shriprakash  
Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram  
Jayaprada, Shrimati  
Jena, Shri Srikant  
Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha

Jindal, Shri Naveen  
Joshi, Dr. C.P.  
Joshi, Shri Mahesh  
Kalmadi, Shri Suresh  
Kamal Nath, Shri  
Kamat, Shri Gurudas  
Kaur, Shrimati Preneet  
Kaypee, Shri Mohinder Singh  
\*Khan, Shri Hassan  
Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
Khatri, Dr. Nirmal  
Khursheed, Shri Salman  
Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
Lal, Shri Pakauri  
Madam, Shri Vikrambhai Arjanbhai  
Mahant, Dr. Charan Das  
Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
Majhi, Shri Pradeep  
Maken, Shri Ajay  
Malik, Shri Jitender Singh  
\*Mani, Shri Jose K.  
Masram, Shri Basori Singh  
Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
Meena, Shri Namonarain  
Meena, Shri Raghuvir Singh  
Meghe, Shri Datta  
Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
Meinya, Dr. Thokchom

Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
Mishra, Shri Mahabal  
Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
Mukherjee, Shri Pranab  
Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
Muttemwar, Shri Vilas  
Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
Naik, Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh  
Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
Noor, Kumari Mausam  
[\\*Ola](#), Shri Sis Ram  
Owaisi, Shri Asaduddin  
Pal, Shri Jagdambika  
Pal, Shri Rajaram  
Pala, Shri Vincent H.  
Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
Patel, Shri Dinsha  
Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
Patel, Shri Praful  
Patel, Shri Somabhai Gandlal Koli  
Patil, Dr. Padmasinha Bajirao  
Patil, Shri Pratik  
Pawar, Shri Sharad  
Pilot, Shri Sachin  
Prabhakar, Shri Ponnam  
Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
Prasada, Shri Jitin  
Premdas, Shri  
Punia, Shri P. L.  
Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
Radadiya, Shri Vitthalbhai Hansrajbhai

Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
Rahman, Shri Abdul  
Rai, Shri Prem Das  
Rajagopal, Shri L.  
Raju, Shri M.M. Pallam  
Rajukhedi, Shri Gajendra Singh  
Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
Ramkishun, Shri  
Rao, Dr. K.S.  
Rao, Shri Rayapati Sambasiva  
Rawat, Shri Harish  
Reddy, Shri Anantha Venkatarami  
Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
Reddy, Shri M. Sreenivasulu  
Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
Ruala, Shri C.L.  
Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
Sai Prathap, Shri A.  
Sangma, Kumari Agatha  
Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
Saroj, Shri Tufani  
Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
Scindia, Shri Jyotiraditya M.  
Selja, Kumari  
Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
Sharma, Dr. Arvind Kumar  
Shariq, Shri S.D.  
Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
Sibal, Shri Kapil  
Singh, Chaudhary Lal

Singh, Dr. Sanjay  
Singh, Rao Inderjit  
Singh, Shri Ajit  
Singh, Shri Brijbhushan Sharan  
Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
Singh, Shri Jitendra  
Singh, Shri N. Dharam  
Singh, Shri R.P.N.  
Singh, Shri Ravneet  
Singh, Shri Rewati Raman  
Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
Singh, Shri Virbhadra  
Singh, Shri Yashvir  
Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini  
Singla, Shri Vijay Inder  
Siricilla, Shri Rajaiah  
Solanki, Shri Bharatsinh  
Sudhakaran, Shri K.  
Sugavanam, Shri E.G.  
Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan  
Sule, Shrimati Supriya  
Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil  
Tagore, Shri Manicka  
Tamta, Shri Pradeep  
Tandon, Shrimati Annu  
Tanwar, Shri Ashok  
Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor  
Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath  
Tewari, Shri Manish  
Thamaraiselvan, Shri R.  
Tharoor, Dr. Shashi  
Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
Thomas, Shri P.T.

Tirath, Shrimati Krishna

Vardhan, Shri Harsh

Venugopal, Shri D.

Venugopal, Shri K.C.

Verma, Shri Sajjan

Verma, Shri Beni Prasad

Verma, Shrimati Usha

Vijayan, Shri A.K.S.

Viswanathan, Shri P.

Vivekanand, Dr. G.

Vundavalli, Shri Aruna Kumar

Vyas, Dr. Girija

Wasnik, Shri Mukul

Yadav, Shri Arun

Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.

Yadav, Shri Om Prakash

Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

MADAM SPEAKER: Subject to correction\*, the result of the Division is:

Ayes 144

Noes 227

*The motion was negatived.*

*The amendment was negatived.*

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now put all the other amendments to the vote of the House.

*All the amendments were put and negatived.*

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now put the main Motion to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:-

`That the Members of the Lok Sabha assembled in the Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which she has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on March

12, 2012.' "

*The motion was adopted.*

**13.32 hrs.**

**The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Thirty Minutes**

*past Fourteen of the Clock.*

---

**14.33 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha reassembled after Lunch at Thirty Three Minutes past*

*fourteen of the clock*

(Madam Speaker in the Chair)

DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193