

>

Title: Ruling regarding Member's speech on Combined discussion on disapproval of an Ordinance and Bill.

MADAM SPEAKER: I would like to interrupt you for a minute. I want to give the ruling.

As per Rule 358 (2), a Member cannot speak more than once on a motion except by way of reply. As per practice, therefore, if a combined discussion takes place on a Statutory Resolution to disapprove an Ordinance and a Bill to replace the Ordinance, the Member, moving the Resolution, can speak on both the Bill and the Resolution. This is to facilitate saving of time. In the past, in all such cases, we have followed the same practice. I, therefore, rule out the point of order.
मुरली मनोहर जोशी जी, हमने इसलिए इसको अभी पढ़ा कि आप दोनों पर बोल सकते हैं।

22.46 hrs

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock

on Tuesday, August 27, 2013/Bhadrapada 5, 1935 (Saka).

* Due to continuous interruptions in the House, Starred Questions could not be called for oral answers. Therefore, these Starred Questions were treated as Unstarred Questions.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Not recorded.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* English translation of the speech originally laid on the Table in Tamil

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Not recorded.

* English translation of the speech originally delivered in Malayalam.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Not recorded.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Not recorded.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table.

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Speech was laid on the Table

* Not recorded.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes: 172** (-) Rao Inderjit Singh (+) Dr. Ratan Singh Ajanala, S/Shri Rudramadhab Ray, Radha Mohan Singh, Kalikesh Narayan Singh Deo and Shiv Kumar Udasi = 176

Noes: 239 (+) S/Shri Tara Chand Bhagora, Jitender Singh Malik, Sis Ram Ola, Jitin Prasada , Rao Inderjit Singh and N. Dharam Singh = 245

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes: 141(+)** Dr. Ratan Singh Ajanala, S/Shri S. Pakkirappa, A.T. Nana Patil, Radha Mohan Singh and Kalikesh Narayan Singh = **146**

Noes: 277 (+) Shrimati Ashwamedh Devi, S/Shri Mahadeo Singh Khandela, Jitin Prasada and Manicka Tagore = **281**

* Not recorded.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

Ayes: 149(+) S/Shri L.K. Advani, Kirti Azad, Shrimati Harsimrat Kaur Badal, Shrimati Darshana Jardosh, Kumari Soroj Pandey, S/Shri A.T. Nana Patil and Radha Mohan Singh = **156**

Noes: 258 (+) Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shrimati Santosh Chowdhary, S/Shri Ram Sundar Das, Salman Khursheed, Shrimati Mausam Noor, Shri Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad =**267**

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[# Corrected through slip for Noes.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

Ayes: 144 (-) Shri Ram Sundar Das (**+**) S/Shri Basu Deb Acharia, Kalyan Banerjee, Bhartruhari Mahtab, Ramesh Rathod, Prof. Saugat Roy, Shri Rewati Raman Singh and Shrimati M. Vijaya Shanthi = **150**

Noes: 241 (+) Shri Raj Babbar, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, S/Shri Ram Sundar Das, Paban Singh Ghatowar, Baliram Jadhav, Shrimati Jayaprada, Shri Mahadeo Singh Khandela, Dr. Nirmal Khatri, Shri Pradeep Majhi, Shrimati Mausam Noor, Shri Jitin Prasada, Chaudhary Lal Singh, Shrimati Meena Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad and Shri Sajjan Verma =**258**

Abstain: 001 (-) Mahadeo Singh Khandela = **000**

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

* **Ayes: 138 (+)** Dr. Ratan Singh Ajnala, S/Shri A.T. Nana Patil, Radha Mohan Singh = **141**

Noes: 266 (+) Shri E. Ahamed, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shri Bhudeo Choudhary, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Dr. Jyoti Mirdha, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, Shri Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **277**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes: 147 (+)** S/Shri A.T. Nana Patil, Ramesh Rathod and Radha Mohan Singh = **150**

Noes: 255 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Dr. Jyoti Mirdha, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Jitin Prasada, Francisco Cosme Sardinha, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon, Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad and Shri Om Prakash Yadav = **268**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes 145 (+)** Sk. Saidul Haque, S/Shri Narenbhai Kachhadia, A.T. Nana Patil, Radha Mohan Singh = **149**

Noes 254 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Shriprakash Jaiswal, Dr. Jyoti Mirdha, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Jitin Prasada, Ilyaraj Singh, Shrimati Meena Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon, Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad and Shri Beni Prasad Verma = **269**

Abstain: 002 (-) Shri Shriprakash Jaiswal = **001**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes: 155** (+) Shrimati Darshna Jardosh, Kumari Saroj Pandey and Shri A.T. Nana Patil = **158**

Noes: 244 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, S/Shri K.P. Dhanapalan, Ninong Ering, Pradeep Jain, Shrimati Jayaprada, S/Shri Satpal Maharaj, Devendra Nagpal, P. Balam Naik , Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Jitin Prasada, S.D. Shriq, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **261**

Abstain: 001 (-) Shri P. Balam Naik = **000**

* Not recorded.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Ayes.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

* **Ayes: 252** (-) Shri Hukmadeo Narayan Yadav (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shri Hemanand Biswal, Dr. Tushar Chaudhary, Shri Bhudeo Choudhary, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Ninong Ering, Dr. Monazir Hassan, S/ Shri Shriprakash Jaiswal, Pradeep Majhi, Devendra Nagpal, Shrimati Raneer Narah, S/Shri P.R. Natarajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Sh. Somabhai Gandadal Koli Patel, Jitin Prasada, Mullappally Ramachandran, Harish Rawat, Arjun Roy, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **273**

Noes: 141 (-) Shri Hemanand Biswal (+) Shrimati Darshna Jardosh, Shri P. Kumar, Kumari Saroj Pandey, S/Shri A.T. Nana Patil, Radha Mohan Singh and Hukmadeo Narayan Yadav = **146**

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* **Ayes: 117** \(+\) S/Shri A.T. Nana Patil, Shivkumar Udasi = **119**](#)

Noes: 284 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, Shri Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Pratibha Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **294**

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[# Corrected through slip for Noes.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* **Ayes: 114** \(+\) Shri A.T. Nana Patil = **115**](#)

Noes: 250 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shri Kunvarjibhai Mohanbhai Bavalia, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Sis Ram Ola, Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **261**

Abstain: 002 (-) Shri Sis Ram Ola = **001**

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* Voted through slip.](#)

[* **Ayes: 109** \(+\) Shrimati Jyoti Dhurve, S/Shri Nishikant Dubey, A.T. Nana Patil, M.B. Rajesh and Subhash Bapurao Wankhede= **114**](#)

Noes: 235 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shrimati Ashwamedh Devi, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Jitin Prasada, A. Raja, Gutha Sukhender Reddy, Shrimati Annu Tandon, Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad, Dr. Girija Vyas, S/Shri Dinesh Chandra Yadav and Anjankumar M. Yadav = **250**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

* Voted through slip.

Ayes: 110 (+) Shri Pulin Bihari Baske, Shrimati Darshana Jardosh, S/Shri P. Lingam, A.T. Nana Patil, C. Rajendran, M.B. Rajesh and Subhash Bapurao Wankhede = **117**

Noes: 249 (+) Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Kishanbhai V. Patel and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **253**

Abstain: 001 (-) Shri Kishanbhai V. Patel = **000**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Ayes: 241 (+) Shri J. M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, Shri Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **251**

Noes: 109 (+) Shri A.T. Nana Patil = **110**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) **Ayes: 113** (+) S/Shri P. Kumar, A.T. Nana Patil and Shivkumar Udasi = **116**

Noes: 235 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Kishanbhai V. Patel, Shri Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **246**

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

<#> Corrected through slip for Noes.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*](#) **Ayes: 100** (+) Shri A.T. Nana Patil = **101**

Noes: 234 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Sis Ram Ola, Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **245**

Abstain:001 (-) Sis Ram Ola = **000**

[*](#) Voted through slip.

[*Voted through slip.](#)

<#> Corrected through slip for Noes.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

*Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

*Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

Corrected through slip for Noes.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes: 117** (+) Shri A.T. Nana Patil (-) Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, and Shrimati Annu Tandon = **114**

Noes: 232 (+) S/Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, E. Ahamed, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh Baghel, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shri Devendra Nagpal, Kumari Meenakshi Natrajan, Shrimati Mausam Noor, S/Shri Sis Ram Ola, Kishanbhai V. Patel, Ponnam Prabhakar, Jitin Prasada, Sarvey Satyanarayana, Chaudhary Lal Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, Shrimati Annu Tandon and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **248**

Abstain: 002 (-) S/Shri Sis Ram Ola and Kishanbhai V. Patel = **000**

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* Voted through slip.

* **Ayes: 102+Nil = 102**

Noes: 227 (+) Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, Shrimati Shruti Choudhry, Shrimati Raneer Narah, Shrimati Mausam Noor, Shri Jitin Prasada, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini Singh, and Dr. Prabha Kishor Taviad = **234**

* Not recorded.