

>

Title: *Demanding recall of Indian Ambassador to United States of America about Indian Parliamentarians and the Media..

MR. SPEAKER: Very well, hon. Members, since some leaders wish to make mention of certain comments made by India's Ambassador in the USA, I am giving opportunities to them. Please be brief. You have made a lot of comments yesterday. Today, we can go on with the Listed Business.

Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, कल सदन में श्री प्रणव मुखर्जी ने रोनेन सेन के वक्तव्य और उनकी वलैरीफिकेशन को यहां कोट किया था, उन्होंने यह बात कही कि रोनेन सेन ने उनसे यह कहा है कि-

"I had an off-the-record conversation with the correspondent giving some assessments on this subject. A number of the comments were, however, either misunderstood or misquoted or quoted out of context."

अध्यक्ष जी, 'रिडीफ' के एडीटर जी. हनीफ ने बाद में इस बात का उत्तर दिया है। उन्होंने कहा है कि

"At no point of the conversation did the Ambassador specify that it was off-the-record or even on background. And, whenever he has said a conversation is off-the-record or on background, I have always honoured these ground rules."

He further said:

"I repeat that he did not specify that our conversation was off-the-record or on background. I unambiguously and unequivocally stand by my report and state categorically that nothing in it was deliberate." (Interruptions)[\[R2\]](#)

MR. SPEAKER: As you all know, we just cannot read out newspapers here.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : It is not a newspaper.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, you are reading out a newspaper. How can you do like this?

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You cannot throw to the wind all the rules of the House.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : महोदय, उन्होंने इस बात से इन्कार किया। ...[\(व्यवधान\)](#)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ठीक है, आप लोग बैठिए। मल्होत्रा जी बोल रहे हैं, मैंने उनको बोलने से मना नहीं किया है।

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : महोदय, उनका कहना है कि जो बयान रोनेन सेन साहब ने दिया था, वह वैसा ही पूरा का पूरा उनके पास रिकॉर्डेड उपलब्ध है। उसमें कोई अन्तर नहीं है, उसमें कुछ भी ऑफ दि रिकॉर्ड नहीं था। राजदूत का यह कहना कि वे बातें ऑफ दि रिकॉर्ड थीं, तो क्या राजदूत का ऐसी बातें ऑफ दि रिकॉर्ड कहना उचित है? मैं केवल हैडलेस विकन कहने की बात नहीं कर रहा हूँ। हैडलेस विकन तो उन्होंने कहा ही है, यह तो कहा ही है कि सांसद और अखबार वाले कटे हुए मुर्गे की तरह फड़फड़ाते हैं। इसके साथ आखिर मैं उन्होंने एक बात और कही है :

"We will not, and there has not been and I don't think in the near future we will see such a friend and supporter as this President. Absolutely. There is none."

वह हमारे भारत के राजदूत हैं या अमेरिका के राजदूत हैं? वह वहां पर बुश का सपोर्ट कर रहे हैं या भारत के राजदूत की हैसियत से काम कर रहे हैं? उन्होंने कहा था :

"We have not grown up, this lack of confidence and lack of self-respect."

इससे ज्यादा अपमानजनक बात हिंदुस्तान के सांसदों के लिए हो नहीं सकती है और मुझे आश्चर्य है कि सरकार अब तक चुप क्यों बैठी हुई है। सरकार ने उनसे केवल वलैरीफिकेशन मांगा है। By this time he must have been recalled immediately. उनके यह कहने के बाद कि मैंने यह बात बैकग्राउण्ड में कही है, किसी स्वाभिमानी देश और उसके सांसदों के बारे में इस तरह की बात कही जाने के बाद भी हम निर्लज्जता से सुनें और सारी बातों को सहन करते रहें, तो मैं समझता हूँ कि यह

अपमानजनक है।...*(व्यवधान)*

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ठीक है, मल्होत्रा जी, आपने अपनी बात कह ली है।

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : महोदय, हम फिर से यह मांग करना चाहते हैं कि उनको वापस बुलाया जाए। हमने आपसे कल भी कहा था कि हमने इसके बारे में अपना प्रिविलेज मोशन दिया है, आप उस पर विचार करें। उनको यहाँ बुलाया जाए, उनको बार पर खड़ा किया जाए और एडमॉनिश किया जाए, यह हम आपसे मांग करते हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL (HOOGHLY): Mr. Speaker, Sir, yesterday, in response to the issue raised by hon. Members that the Indian Ambassador to USA had made some very derogatory remarks about Indian parliamentarians and on an issue which is yet to be taken up by the Parliament – and it is very derogatory for the Indian Parliament also – the hon. Minister of External Affairs intervened twice and communicated that the Indian Ambassador to USA had stated that it was all off the record. This has been contradicted today unequivocally by the concerned correspondent. He has stated that it was never misunderstood and it was never misquoted.

MR. SPEAKER: You are repeating the same thing. Who is more truthful, it has to be seen.

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : So, in this context I have submitted a notice for Privilege Motion against the concerned Indian Ambassador and we have demanded that he should be immediately recalled. What is happening is, he is not serving India's national interest, rather he is serving some one's interest which is against India's interest. In such a situation, he should immediately be recalled.

MR. SPEAKER: The privilege matter is with me. The other matter is with the Government. So far as I am concerned, you have to trust me.

...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats. Let there be some order in the House.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI TARIT BARAN TOPDAR (BARRACKPORE): Let it be sent to the Privileges Committee.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you for your suggestion.

श्री मोहन सिंह (देवरिया) : महोदय, कल यह मामला इस सदन में उठा और भारत के विदेश मंत्री ने सदन के सामने एक वक्तव्य दिया, जिसमें उन्होंने कहा कि अमेरिका में भारत के राजदूत द्वारा कहे गए अशुभ शब्दों को हम अग्राह्य करते हैं। इसके लिए उन्होंने "अनएवसेप्टेबल" शब्द का प्रयोग किया। हम उम्मीद करते थे कि सार्वजनिक जीवन में इतना लम्बा समय बिताने वाले विदेश मंत्री जी की ओर से इसके लिए सीधे-सीधे निन्दा और प्रताड़ना शब्द का इस्तेमाल होना चाहिए था। लेकिन उन्होंने अग्राह्य शब्द का इस्तेमाल करके हमारे जैसे लोगों की भावनाओं को ठेस पहुंचाई है। कल कहा गया था कि उन्होंने इसका प्रतिवाद किया है, लेकिन आज के समाचार पत्रों में यह खबर आई है कि उनका कहना है कि उन्होंने इस बात को ऑफ दि रिकॉर्ड कहा था, लेकिन उनकी बयान को प्रकाशित करने वाले पत्रकार का कहना है कि उन्होंने इस बात को ऑन दि रिकॉर्ड कहा था। दोनों के वक्तव्य से इस बात की पुष्टि होती है कि उन्होंने कुछ अशुभपूर्ण शब्दावली का इस्तेमाल इस देश के सार्वजनिक जीवन के लोगों के खिलाफ किया था। ऐसे में श्रीमन् आपने स्वयं कल वचन दिया था कि यह संसद इतनी अधिकारविहीन नहीं है। हम ऐसा समझते हैं कि आप हमें प्रताड़ित करते हैं, हमारे किसी अशुभ व्यवहार की निन्दा करते हैं, लेकिन हम आप पर विश्वास करते हैं कि आप हमारे हितों और हमारी प्रतिष्ठा दोनों के संरक्षक भी हैं। इसलिए ऐसी कठिन घड़ी में आपका दायित्व बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण हो जाता है। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि सारे पक्षों को सुनकर इस मामले को आप अपने हाथ में लें और 29 तारीख को जब यह संसद बैठे, तो निश्चित तौर पर सदन की भावना को ध्यान में रखते हुए सदन की प्रतिष्ठा के अनुकूल आप कोई ऐसा निर्णय देंगे, जिससे इस तरह से अशुभ व्यवहार करने वाले सरकारी अधिकारियों के विरुद्ध कोई सबक मिले और एक प्रताड़ना का संदेश जाए। मैं आपसे यह अपील करते हुए अपनी बात को समाप्त करता हूँ।

MR. SPEAKER: I hope, you will agree with me, before anybody said anything, I myself said that let us wait for the quote. Indian Parliament is not that powerless that we cannot take action. I have assured you that certainly action will be taken. There is no question of exoneration of anybody. But we have to follow certain procedures. You know that. I have only stated that let that procedure be followed. We have to act also consistent with natural justice. Everybody knows that.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN (CHIRAYINKIL): Sir, I have given a notice.

MR. SPEAKER: Very good, I will read it very carefully.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, I am entitled to raise the matter.

MR. SPEAKER: No, you are not entitled.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, the rules permit that a Member can raise it.

MR. SPEAKER: No, I do not agree with your interpretation.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, under the rules, a Member can raise it.

MR. SPEAKER: No, you cannot question the Speaker's observation.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : I may be given a chance to raise the matter.

MR. SPEAKER: You are committing a breach of privilege. You know that. It is well established. You read Kaul and Shakhdar, it is very properly stated there.

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव (झंझारपुर): अध्यक्ष महोदय, कल से आज तक जिस तरह का परिदृश्य संसद के सामने आया है और जिस तरह का परिदृश्य आपको और देश की जनता को देखने को मिला है कि किस तरह से एक भारतीय राजदूत ने अमेरिका में बैठकर गैर जिम्मेदाराना ही नहीं, बल्कि आपत्तिजनक बयान दिया है। उसने अपने अधिकार क्षेत्र से बाहर जाकर कहा कि यह ऑफ दिकार्ड है। माननीय विदेश मंत्री द्वारा कल सदन में यह बताया गया था कि उनका यह बयान ऑफ दिकार्ड था। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या ऑफ दिकार्ड या इंडिविजुअल कैपेसिटी में भी यह सब कहा जा सकता है? रोनेन सेन जो अमेरिका में भारतीय राजदूत हैं, क्या इस तरह का बयान देना उनके अधिकार क्षेत्र में है? यह बात कोई अधिकार क्षेत्र में नहीं आती और न ही इंडिविजुअल कैपेसिटी में जाकर इस तरह का कोई बयान दे सकते थे। यह केवल दलों का सवाल नहीं है, उन्होंने पूरे राष्ट्र को अपमानित किया है। लोकतंत्र में संसद, एक महत्वपूर्ण पितर है। उसके साथ ही मीडिया, न्यायपालिका और जनता भी पितर के रूप में हैं। एक स्ट्रॉंग डेमोक्रेटिक पितर को इंडिकेट करके जिस तरह का हमला किया गया, जिस तरह का बयान दिया गया, यह घोर आपत्तिजनक है। यदि वह अपने बयान से भागते हैं, तो उनके बयान का टेप रिकॉर्ड मंगाकर ऐसे राजदूत को तुरंत वापस बुलाना चाहिए।

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY (PURI): Mr. Speaker Sir, the statement of Indian Ambassador in USA is most unfortunate. The entire Parliament and the people...(Interruptions)

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, I may be allowed to speak.

MR. SPEAKER: I will bring you to the Chair. I will ask you to come here.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, it is not the question of coming to the Chair...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is being recorded.

(Interruptions)*

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : Sir, the whole Parliament and the people of this country are insulted by the statement of the Indian Ambassador in USA...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You come to me or write to me.

Today, there are about 300 hon. Members. If all of them speak on this issue, then I shall be totally confused. Therefore, please do not do that.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY: Sir, I am really astonished with the audacity of this Ambassador to issue such statement. Sir, the Government's statement in this regard has further added *ghee* to this entire fire. It was not his private conversation or off the record conversation.[\[r3\]](#)

Completely, deliberately he has tried to insult the House and the Members of the House by this way. We are not the headless chicken. Rather, I can say, he is mindless, tactless and he is not in sound mind to speak like this just to insult the Parliament.

The Government is considering this Ambassador more important than the prestige of this House. The entire House, Members from all sections, even the Ruling Party Members are not appreciating it. I am thankful for the statement of

Shri Dasmunsi, Minister of Parliamentary Affairs; he has also not appreciated it. He has told that he has a vegetarian heart so he was also not appreciating it. It has come out in newspaper. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Everybody is referring to the newspaper reports with impunity. You cannot do that.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : I am thankful; he has also not appreciated. He is a part of this Government. The Government should take action. What is the action of the Government? The Government should come forward; they should ask why he has told like this to the Members of the Parliament. This is not good.

MR. SPEAKER: I believe the vegetarians are very happy.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : He should be immediately recalled. He should not continue there. We are also thankful to you; you have also considered our concern. I do not know whether this Government has courage to take action. It is because this will also antagonize USA. They do not want to antagonize USA; and they will not take any action. We have hundred per cent confidence on you. You will not sit silent. The notices of Privilege Motion are already with you. You will definitely take some action which will give a complete reply to this Ambassador.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (PANSKURA): Sir, I am on a different point.

MR. SPEAKER: Are you on some other issue, not on this?

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : I am absolutely on this. The country is having a debate about Indo-US nuclear pact. There is going to be a debate. The Prime Minister is to make a speech. The Parliament is scheduled to discuss the whole issue. But the Ambassador of India in USA has taken part in that debate. That is the crux of the issue. He has taken part in the debate on behalf of the Prime Minister, on behalf of the Government. He has not called everybody 'without head'. My friends, please understand, he has not spoken ill of everybody. He has castigated those who are against the pact. He has categorically said that those who are speaking against the pact, they are all chickens without head. Secondly, he has said that they are all making haphazard statement; they are all raising an issue which is not possible; this pact cannot be renegotiated.

I would like to ask one thing from the Government, from my esteemed friend Priya Ranjan Dasmunsi, whether the Government has given the responsibility of defending their stand by an Ambassador in USA. He has committed not only breach; he has gone over the power that the Government has given to him. He has no right to take part in the debate. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, I will take one minute more.

He has no right to take part in the debate. It is outrageous. He has no authority to speak ill about us. We are all Indians. We are fighting this particular pact on the basis of understanding. He has no right to say that those who are against the pact are all doing haphazard. This is an insult to the Parliament and to us...(*Interruptions*) This is overdoing. The Government must say whether an Ambassador can overdo, the way it has been done. He should be brought to the bar of the House. He should be recalled and he should be sent to jail ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not giving me liberty to decide. You are also dictating what I should do. Please take your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : He is taking part in a political debate. Is it possible?...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You ask the Government to do something; I do not mind. Do not try to dictate me. Do not dictate to the Chair.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa. [r4]

श्री सुखदेव सिंह दींडसा (संगरूर): अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपका आभारी हूँ क्योंकि आपने बिलकुल सही स्टैंड लिया है कि पार्लियामेन्टरी डेमोक्रेटिक सिस्टम में एक एम्बेसडर साठी पार्लियामेन्ट को कुछ कह रहा है और हम केवल देखते रहें। आपने बिलकुल सही कहा कि हम इतने कमजोर नहीं हैं...(*व्यवधान*)

MR. SPEAKER: Certainly. I reiterate that.

श्री सुखदेव सिंह ढींइसा : सरकार ने कल अपना स्टैण्ड बता दिया था। अब आपके हाथ में है कि अब पार्लियामेंट ने उसके खिलाफ क्या एक्शन लेना है? मैं गुरुदास गुप्ता जी की बात में एक बात और जोड़ना चाहता हूँ, उन्होंने बिलकुल सही कहा है और यह एक टेकनिकल प्वाइंट है। प्रधानमंत्री जी ने केवल उस पर दस्तखत ही किए हैं। अभी इस पर पार्लियामेंट में डिबेट होनी है, लेकिन इसके पहले ही एक एम्बेसडर अपना व्यू देता है। आप यह समझ सकते हैं कि यह कितना बड़ा contempt of the House है। सबसे जरूरी आखिरी बात मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि जब कोई सरकार बनती है, हम एक दूसरे को कण्डैम करते हैं और कहते हैं कि वह चोर है, यह डाकू है, लेकिन किसी भी मंत्रालय का ब्यूरोक्रेट्स मंत्री को जो लिखकर देता है, वही मंत्री बोलता है। पूणब मुखर्जी जी जैसे सीनियर नेता भी वही बोल रहे हैं, जो उसने बोला या लिखकर दिया। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे बीच में इतनी कर्टसी होनी चाहिए कि हम एक-दूसरे को कण्डैम न करें। ब्यूरोक्रेट्स कभी एक-दूसरे को कण्डैम नहीं करते हैं। हम लोगों को भी उनसे कुछ सीखना चाहिए तभी डेमोक्रेटिक सिस्टम कामयाब होगा।

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you very much for your cooperation.

Now, Shri Kinjarapu Yerrannaidu.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपकी बात रिकार्ड में नहीं जा रही है, टोक-टाकी बंद कीजिए।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI KINJARAPU YERRANNAIDU (SRIKAKULAM): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Indian Parliament is the supreme body and the highest policy-making body. ...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप एनडोर्स कर दीजिए।

SHRI KINJARAPU YERRANNAIDU : Sir, the Members of Parliament are representing the Parliament. The hon. Members of Parliament are degraded by the Indian Ambassador in the USA. He should be recalled immediately. This is a shameful thing for the Members of Parliament and also for the Indian Parliament that he has treated the Members like this. He should be recalled immediately.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप सभी इस बात से सहमत थे कि एक-एक वाक्य बोलेंगे।

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइए, क्या रनिंग कमेंट्री कर रहे हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सिर्फ प्रभुनाथ सिंह जी का भाषण रिकार्ड में जाएगा।

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, हमें भरोसा है कि आप हमारा भाषण जरूर रिकार्ड कराएंगे।...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यहां तो एक ही हैड है, अगर चला जाएगा तो क्या होगा? मैं भी हैडलेस हो जाऊंगा।

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : Sir, you are a part of this House. ...(Interruptions)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : पूरे हाउस को उसने हैडलेस कहा है और आप हमारे चीफ हैं। उसने किसी को छोड़ा नहीं है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय, अमरीका में भारतीय राजदूत ने जो बयान दिया है, कल हमारे सदन के नेता तथा विदेश मंत्री उस बयान से सदन को अवगत करा रहे थे। उन्होंने स्वीकार किया है कि भारतीय राजदूत ने ऐसा कहा है। सिर्फ इतना अंतर है कि रिकार्ड में नहीं कहा है। लेकिन भारतीय राजदूत ने जो बयान दिया है, उसे माना है कि उन्होंने कहा है। आज भी अखबार में छपा है, उसका प्रतिवाद आ चुका है कि भारतीय राजदूत ने ऐसा कहा है और रिकार्ड में कहा है। हमें लगता है कि सरकार को इस बात पर प्रतिष्ठा नहीं बनानी चाहिए। चाहे वह मंत्री हों, प्रधान मंत्री हों, पहले वे सदन के सदस्य हैं, उसके बाद ही मंत्री या प्रधानमंत्री हैं। सदन के सदस्यों को सार्वजनिक ढंग से गाली दी जाए और इसके बाद सरकार संरक्षण दे, यह कहीं से उचित नहीं लगता है। आपने कहा है कि सदन को शक्ति है और सदन इस बारे में उचित कार्यवाही करेगी। आपके पास विशेषाधिकार की शक्ति है। अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह एक दूसरा पक्ष है, लेकिन सरकार की भी जिम्मेदारी बनती है कि सरकार यह कहती कि हम तुंत कार्यवाही करेंगे और हमें लगता है कि सभी माननीय सांसदों की भावनाओं को सुनकर सरकार जरूर रिस्पॉंस करेगी। सरकार की नजर में अगर सदन के सदस्यों के प्रति थोड़ी सी भी प्रतिष्ठा है, क्योंकि यह सवाल किसी एक दल का नहीं, किसी एक व्यक्ति का नहीं, सत्ता पक्ष के हों या विपक्ष के, सभी लोग इस बात पर आहत हैं। हमें लगता है कि जो भी मंत्री इस बारे में टिप्पणी करेंगे, सदन की भावना, प्रतिष्ठा, मर्यादा को ध्यान में रखते हुए करेंगे।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपका सुझाव बहुत अच्छा है।[R5]

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : इस बयान में जरूर कहेंगे कि वहां के राजदूत को तुरन्त वापस बुलाया जाएगा। हम को आपके ऊपर भरोसा है। प्रिवलेज में जेल भेजने का भी प्रवधान है।
...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय: मेरे पास पावर नहीं है, हाउस के पास है।

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : हम को लगता है कि आप उनको जरूर जेल भेजकर सदन की गरिमा को बढ़ाएंगे ताकि भविष्य में कोई ऐसी टिप्पणी न कर सके। ...*(व्यवधान)*

अध्यक्ष महोदय: मैं आपका बहुत सम्मान करता हूँ।

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE (BARASAT): Sir, I shall not waste the time of the House by repeating what all has been said. I strongly associate with the views expressed already by the previous speakers. I demand that the Ambassador should be recalled immediately. I hope that you will consider the notices of privilege motions placed before you as early as possible.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS (MUVATTUPUZHA): Sir, the way in which the matter has been explained, makes it further complicated. I have heard the explanation that the comment was not on the Members of Parliament but it was on the Media. What right has the Ambassador got, who is sitting on his official duty as Indian Ambassador in the USA, another country, to blame the Media of India? It is further disturbing. When the Media has become another forceful wing in the democratic polity, I think, it is also a matter of privilege. Not only that it is a matter of privilege for his utterances against the Members, indirectly it is also once again becoming a privilege issue because they have been reporting, not their own views, but they have been reporting what we, the Members of Parliament, have stated herein. So, on that issue also, it becomes a matter of privilege. I have moved a notice of privilege motion on that issue also.

Sir, I would humbly say that in this matter, the Government need not take it as a prestige. He has gone *ultra vires* of his powers.

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not repeat.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS : So, he must be recalled and further action should be taken.

अध्यक्ष महोदय: गीते जी, एक-दो लाइन में सपोर्ट कर दीजिए।

श्री अनंत गंगाराम गीते (रत्नागिरि): अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं एक ही लाइन में सपोर्ट करूंगा। अमेरिका में बैठे भारतीय राजदूत ने जो सदन की अवमानना की है, उसे लेकर सदन के बहुत से सदस्यों ने यह मांग की है कि उन्हें वापस बुलाया जाए, मैं इससे सहमत हूँ। आप सदन के अध्यक्ष होने के नाते इस संदर्भ में कड़ी कार्रवाई करें।

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Shivanna.

Speak in English for the time being. I see, interpretation is available. Please go on.

SHRI M. SHIVANNA (CHAMRAJANAGAR): Okay, Sir. Wherever it is possible, I would try to speak in English.

SHRI. M. SHIVANNA :- Sir, I would like to draw the attention of our Government to the statement made by Indian Ambassador to U.S. His statement has disturbed the Parliament for the last 2 days. We should condemn such statements. Though he is an Ambassador, he has insulted the Parliament of India, its members and also media representatives. Therefore on behalf of our party Janata Dal (S), I urge, upon the Government that he should be recalled immediately and should be punished. I hope the Government will take immediate steps in this regard.

*English Translation of the speech originally delivered in Kannada.

MR. SPEAKER: I admire your tenacity, Mr. Radhakrishnan. What do you want to add, tell me? What is the new thing that you want to add?

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Thank you, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: To protect myself, I have to call you!

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, I raise a privilege question not based on any party politics. We have assembled here as the Members of the largest democracy in the world.

MR. SPEAKER: We have to remind ourselves of that.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : We, the Members, have to maintain the dignity of this House. Here is a question that involves challenging the dignity of this House.[\[r6\]](#)

I would like to bring to your kind notice that the word used is *prima facie* defamatory and contemptuous. It is contempt against the House. It is equally applicable to this side and that side. Now, whenever an aspersion is cast on the dignity of this House, we are duty bound to uphold our dignity. On that basis, I have given this notice under rule 223 of the Rules of Procedure.

MR. SPEAKER: When you disturb the proceedings, you also say that it is contempt of the House.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, I would request the hon. Speaker that you have two options before you. One is, either you can take action *suo motu* or you can refer this matter to the Committee of Privileges. The Committee will summon this man, and let him answer. It is not to be answered by the Minister concerned.

MR. SPEAKER: I believe you are a Member of the Privilege Committee. You should not speak on this subject.

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : The matter is *prima facie* contemptuous. So, your honour, you may kindly refer this either to the Committee or take a decision, and this is a matter on which we cannot decide now and here without communication.

MR. SPEAKER: That is enough. Now, I will come to urgent matters. Please conclude.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठिए, आप क्या कर रहे हैं?

वेद!(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I will ask them. Please sit down. You are insulting this House every moment.

Will the Government make any observation now? I am not compelling you.

SHRI JOACHIM BAXLA (ALIPURDUAR): Sir, I would like to associate with all other hon. Members.

MR. SPEAKER: All right but not with Radhakrishnanji!

SHRI JOACHIM BAXLA : It is including Mr. Radhakrishnan.

MR. SPEAKER: All right.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I heard the respected hon. Members' observations and comments, and I sincerely appreciate the way they have articulated the whole issue.

Sir, yesterday, you may recall that at the first instance before the whole text came, the hon. Foreign Minister was here to give the first reaction. He had said a very important sentence, if I may recall correctly, that is, unwarranted and unacceptable....(Interruptions) Then, I did not trouble you. Then, the House adjourned till two.

Then, in the second instance when the House reassembled, whatever available official information came from the Embassy, that is, from Washington, the Foreign Minister came forward and again reiterated, including conveying the unqualified apology.

Sir, I am to comment on behalf of the Government on two aspects. Aspect one is that at this juncture the Foreign Minister should have been here but he kindly conveyed, through you, his regret to the entire House that he is engaged with the Prime Minister of Japan and he could not come forward. I can only tell you that on the privilege matter, I will not make any comment. The Government never makes any comment.

MR. SPEAKER: That will be a breach of privilege. Do not do that.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, that is your domain. I cannot say anything on this aspect, and your observation and rulings are always binding on the entire House.

Second thing is that anybody within the Government, either in bureaucracy or in diplomatic assignment, has no right to cast

aspersion even on media and including that of the dignity of the House and of Parliament. We strongly feel it, and we, from the UPA Government, shall continue to defend and uphold the dignity of all the Members and the Parliament all the time come what may, in whatever manner it is possible. ...(*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या बात है? Do not record.

*(Interruptions)**

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: If you just talk like that, I cannot answer and I will sit down.

Sir, pertaining to the issue of recalling, as the Members have said, I shall very faithfully and sincerely convey your demand, your concern, your views not only to the Foreign Minister but also to the Prime Minister.

*Not recorded.

Sir, I am now talking about media. Even if the media is there, be it in India or outside...(*Interruptions*)

श्री गणेश सिंह (सतना) : इसका जबाब प्रधानमंत्री जी को देना चाहिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठकर बोलते हैं, इस तरह से इन्सुल्ट करते हैं। What is all this? Are you showing respect to this House?

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, media carries one of the most important jobs in the world democracy and in any democracy. A Government or a Party or an officer may agree or may not agree. [\[MSOffice7\]](#)

There is no right to abuse and accuse the media also. I uphold the fundamental rights of the media, always, whether they agree or disagree with any Party, any Government, any policy or not. Dissent of this House on any issue including the present deal, is a matter of the country, of the Parties, not a matter of an individual outside or inside the country. Therefore, I appreciate all the views. I shall officially report it to the hon. Prime Minister and to the hon. Minister of External Affairs.

At this juncture I can only tell you that I also have some recollection, if not many of the hon. Members, I am also in this House from 1971; I have also learnt many things from the Opposition and from the Government. I can only tell you that I will not say it today. When an issue comes pertaining to an officer of the Government, on privilege matter, the Government may not talk. When the officer causes a misconduct, yes, Sir, I say on behalf of the Government that each Ambassador, each official, each Minister can have the orbit of their comments with their wives and children. But sitting in the official chair, there cannot be any orbit of talks to carry the office with him and, therefore, we do not appreciate and approve that also.

I can only tell you that I shall convey the feelings to the Government and I can assure on behalf of the UPA Government that we will not behave unlike others, we shall behave transparently with the sense of the House and the spirit and we shall not comprise an inch on this matter pertaining to the dignity of the House.

I also would like to add about the same Ambassador who was Ambassador to Russia during NDA time, and now he is Ambassador to USA in our tenure, how he did, what he did etc. the details are to be worked out and the details are to be sought. It is the job of the hon. Minister of External Affairs. I should report to him.

I conclude, by saying with pain, that if any hon. Member of this House is dishonoured the whole House should be together to defend his honour. But in the same House, I painfully convey, that – this is a newspaper report and you gave your observation; I cannot comment on the newspaper report, it is not stated in the House – when about the hon. Prime Minister of India the words of 'shot straightaway' were used and the Parties did not condemn them, do you have a moral right to support this issue? ...(*Interruptions*) That is my point.

Sir, I will do that, I assure the House that I will convey your sentiments and the UPA Government will act more effectively and aggressively in defence of the honour of this House. Thank you. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR (BANGALORE SOUTH): Sir, what is this? Please allow us to speak. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : No. Dr. Karan Singh Yadav to raise matters of urgent public importance now.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You wanted an opportunity. I have given you the opportunity. For 43 minutes it has gone on.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Forty-three minutes have been spent on this.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Dr. Karan Singh Yadav to speak now.

...(Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : सर, इस पर क्या एक्शन होगा, इस बारे में कोई आश्वासन नहीं दिया गया। सारी बातें गोलमोल कही गई हैं। सरकार को इस समय तक इस पर कार्रवाई करनी चाहिए थी। लेकिन प्रधान मंत्री और विदेश मंत्री ने भी कोई आश्वासन नहीं दिया और इनका कहना है कि यह रिपोर्ट करेंगे, जो काफी नहीं है। इसलिए प्रोटैस्ट में हम वाक-आउट करते हैं।

12.43 hrs.

(Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra and some other Hon'ble Members then
left the House)

MR. SPEAKER : Please go quietly.
