

>

Title: Regarding certain remarks made by Shri George Fernandes, MP outside the House against the Prime Minister.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Sir, I would like to bring to your notice and through you to the entire country that, on any matter concerning the nation, it is not necessary that all parties should agree every time with the views of the Government. Every party has the right to reflect their views in the House. They may either support or oppose or express their dissent or resentment. That is the sense or the spirit of the House.

Sir, the day which you have fixed for the debate may be subject to the availability of the Prime Minister or the Minister for External Affairs on which I will report to you at the appropriate time. I respect your observations and I will not go beyond rules. But it is most unfortunate that when the opportunity is there to discuss the matter in the House, the Prime Minister of the country and the Leader of the other House are being accused . It is reported in today's *Indian Express*.

The Convenor of the NDA, Shri George Fernandes, whom I consider as mentally sound and alert, has said that on such treaty, had it been China, the Prime Minister of the country would have been shot with one bullet in his head. ...(*Interruptions*) I condemn such a kind of insinuation, incitement and provocation regarding the Prime Minister of India by the Convenor of the NDA. ...(*Interruptions*) He should either apologise or withdraw what he has said. We strongly condemn what he has said. ...(*Interruptions*) He should apologise. How can he say such a thing? Either he is mentally not sound; if he would have been sound, he would not have said so. ...(*Interruptions*) Sir, if he is not mentally sound, I have nothing to say. He should withdraw his comment.

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot compel any Member. It is for the hon. Member to take a decision. He has raised the matter and it is on record now.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: The House should condemn it. From the Government's side, we condemn it. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I can only say that every hon. Member is entitled to respect the Prime Minister and I think it behoves democratic polity that the highest dignitary of the country should be properly [\[MSOffice15\]](#)respected.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I can only say this, nothing else. I cannot compel any Member to say anything.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, by this statement, by bringing in the name of China, he has insulted the system of China also. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot compel him to say anything. It is entirely for him to decide.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, do not come here. Go to your seats.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Prabhunath Singh ji, he has not said anything about you.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot ask any Member to say anything. I have made my observations. That is enough.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: We should respect each other.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, let the Leader of the Opposition condemn it. If he respects the parliamentary system, let him condemn it. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri K.V. Thangkabalu, please go to your seat.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot compel any Member. It is entirely for him.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have said that we should respect each other.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: By bringing in the name of China, he has insulted the Republic of China and its system. He has also brought disrepute to the name of the nation. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please go to your seats.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You have made your point. The hon. Minister has said it.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot compel him. The statement was not made within the House. Therefore, I have no control over it. I have made my observations. All the hon. Members are entitled to respect. It is not becoming of a Member of the House to make such statements against the Prime Minister of the country.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Acharia to speak.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, this is very unfair.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, when I am on my legs, please sit down.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri K.V. Thangkabalu, I am on my legs.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Let Shri George Fernandes clarify whether he has made that statement. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing has been said within the House. I have no jurisdiction over what he has said.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, go to your seats. Otherwise, there will be problem.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have made my observation. Everyone of us is entitled to full respect from one another, whoever it may be. The Prime Minister of the country and other highest dignitaries of this country are entitled to full respect. Therefore, let us behave in a manner which upholds the dignity of this House so that there may not be accusations against one another.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot direct any hon. Member to say anything. It is entirely for him to decide. If his silence shows something, it is entirely for the House and the country to decide what is there.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, you can raise only one matter. I won't allow State matters to be raised.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, the landless! ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: No, you cannot raise that matter. You can raise the other matter. I won't allow this.

...(Interruptions)[\[MSOffice16\]](#)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, I am talking about dalits. ... (Interruptions) Sir, it is a question of dalits. ... (Interruptions) Sir, I will not refer to a State matter. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I have made my observations. Then, he has made observations.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : His statement is concerned with the security of the Prime Minister of India. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: We should avoid provocations in this House.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned till 1.45 p.m.

12. 56 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till forty-five minutes past

Thirteen of the Clock.[\[a17\]](#)

13.47 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at forty-seven minutes past

Thirteen of the Clock.

(Shrimati Krishna Tirath in the Chair)

MADAM CHAIRMAN: Now, the House will take up Item No. 17.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM CHAIRMAN: Wait for a minute. You take your seats, please.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM CHAIRMAN: Nothing should be recorded.

(Interruptions) अँ!*

MADAM CHAIRMAN: Please go to your seats now. Can you go to your seats?

...(Interruptions)

सभापति महोदय : हाउस चलेगा या नहीं चलेगा?

अँ!(व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : अगर आप ऐसा करेंगे तो हाउस कैसे चलेगा?

अँ!(व्यवधान)

MADAM CHAIRMAN: Please go to your seats now.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 3.30 p.m.

13.49 hrs.

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till thirty minutes past
Fifteen of the Clock.*

* Not recorded.

MR. SPEAKER : The House stands adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Monday.

16.04 hrs.

-

The Lok Sabha adjourned till Eleven of the Clock*

on [\[r18\]](#) Monday, 20 August 2007 / Sravana 29, 1929 (Saka).

*At 1530 hours quorum bell was rung. No quorum was made. At 1534 hours quorum bell was rung again and no quorum was made. At 1538 hours once again quorum bell was rung and no quorum was made. Thereafter, the Secretary-General informed the members present as follows:

"There is no quorum. So, the House cannot meet and we cannot start the House till there is a quorum. Hon. Speaker has directed that the House will re-assembled at 1600 hours of the Clock."

At 1600 hours again quorum bell was rung. No quorum was made. Thereafter, the Secretary-General informed the Members present as follows:

"There is no quorum. The House cannot meet till there is quorum. Hon. Speaker has directed that the House will now meet at 11 o'clock on Monday, 20 August 2007."

cd. by c [\[MSOffice1\]](#)

Cpmtd/ nu D [\[MSOffice2\]](#)

[\[R3\]](#)(Fd. by g1)

[\[rep4\]](#)gfd

(Fd.by h1) [\[r5\]](#)

Fd. by j1 [\[R6\]](#)

[\[R7\]](#)PL INSERT Q. 84 AND REPLY – 2 PAGES

[\[R8\]](#)Fd/ by k1

[\[r9\]](#)Fld by m1.e

[\[r10\]](#)Fd by q1.e

Fd by r1 [\[KMR11\]](#)

[\[r12\]](#)Fd by s

[\[R13\]](#)Fd. By 'u'

Fld by x1.e [\[R14\]](#)

[\[MSOffice15\]](#)cd. by y

[\[MSOffice16\]](#)Followed by Z

Fd. By a2.e [\[a17\]](#)

[\[r18\]](#) Friday, March 10, 2000/Phalguna 20, 1921 (Saka).