

Fourteenth Loksabha

Session : 9

Date : 29-11-2006

Participants : [Singh Shri Prabhunath](#), [Yadav Shri Devendra Prasad](#), [Dasgupta Shri Gurudas](#), [Advani Shri Lal Krishna](#), [Advani Shri Lal Krishna](#), [Dasmunsi Shri Priya Ranjan](#), [Singh Shri Mohan](#), [Acharia Shri Basudeb](#)

an>

Title: Regarding the conviction and arrest of Shri Shibu Soren.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI (GANDHINAGAR): Sir, This morning when this issue was sought to be raised by some of my other colleagues -- I also raised my hand -- you said that the issue should be taken up at 12 noon, and not during Question Hour. I would say that personally I am also inclined to agree that the Question Hour goes on as usual. If there are ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will hear you later on. Please sit down.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will hear your side later on. Please sit down. Shri Rupchand Pal, this is not right. I will also hear other side also.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : If there is a provision in the rules that on occasions ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : If there is a provision in the rules that on occasions that a Member may move for suspension of Question Hour, that is provided in order to see that when there are extraordinary situations ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: What is happening?[a8]

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: He is quoting the rule. Why are you objecting to it?

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, I have seen the Indian Parliament from 1970 as a Member. I have seen even the earlier years as a journalist. I can say that what happened yesterday is unprecedented in the history of Parliament.... (*Interruptions*) If you do not realise it, you are doing great harm to the whole political system.... (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Speaker, Sir, for the first time in the Indian political history has a Member of the Council of Ministers been found guilty and convicted for murder... (*Interruptions*) From the court, he was taken straight to the Tihar Jail. Yet they seem to think that it is ordinary and there is nothing extraordinary. (*Interruptions*) You should feel more ashamed than myself... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SANTOSH GANGWAR (BAREILLY): Sir, please ask them to listen... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: What more can I do?

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : If the ruling party thinks that this is ordinary, this is not extraordinary, I only feel sorry... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Leader of the Opposition, there is not even a notice for the suspension of Question Hour.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I have not given.

SHRI SANTOSH GANGWAR : I have given the notice.

MR. SPEAKER: No. You have not given.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : This is not Question Hour. He has given the notice.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no notice for suspension of Question Hour.

SHRI SANTOSH GANGWAR : I have given.

MR. SPEAKER: He has given it for the mention of it after the Question Hour. No. I cannot accept. This is the report.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, you have permitted me now. This is not Question Hour.

MR. SPEAKER: I have permitted you. That is different. There is no notice, no Motion for suspension of Question Hour.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : This is not the Question Hour. This is after the Question Hour.

MR. SPEAKER: About that, I have permitted you. It was said that there is a provision. Yes, I know that there is a provision,

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I know that.

MR. SPEAKER: Nobody took recourse to that.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : It was referred to that. They say that there is nothing extraordinary.

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार): अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने क्वेश्चन-ऑवर को स्थगित करने का नोटिस दिया था।

अध्यक्ष महोदय :आज नहीं दिया।

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Regarding Adjournment Motion, I have already admitted. I have received your notice.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : It is now more than two-and-a-half years that this Government has been in office.... (*Interruptions*) I remember that when Dr. Manmohan Singh formed his Council of Ministers and announced the names, at that time itself an important issue raised by the Opposition referred to the credentials of those Ministers. For the first time, it is remarked like this. Till now, we have been hearing of criminalization of politics. But now we have seen criminalization of the Council of Ministers of the Government!... (*Interruptions*) The reply at that time used to be that it is the prerogative of the Prime Minister to select his team. He has exercised his prerogative to select his team.

Now, Sir, in this particular case, the person who was convicted yesterday has been sent to jail. The moment a Non-Bailable Warrant was issued against him, he was made to resign. At that time we were told – at least this is what I know – that the case related to some riots in Jharkhand. I did not know at that time that the case in which he was accused of murder was also going on. I am sure that the Government must be knowing it, the Prime Minister must be knowing it because this is a case which has been lodged by the CBI. It is the CBI that has done it. Now, here is this person convicted! In the eyes of political analysts, the UPA Government has brought disgrace upon itself.[\[R9\]](#)

The whole political system has been maligned and disgraced only because, in the exercise of his prerogative, perhaps, the Prime Minister did not exercise the necessary vigilance and caution. So, my request is that the Prime Minister must come to the House and offer an explanation as to what happened when he was appointed for the second time and when the CBI case was instituted against him. It may have been much earlier and the CBI case is not an ordinary case. It is a case in which there are components of blackmail, kidnapping and murder. All these aspects are there. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, my point is that the Prime Minister owes an apology to the nation and an explanation to the Parliament. Therefore, the Prime Minister must come here and explain as to what are the facts of this case, how did he exercise his prerogative, what has happened exactly and unless the Parliament is reassured on this, he will not be doing justice to the whole matter.

MR. SPEAKER: India's politics also requires that the House should function everyday properly.

Shri Dasmunsi.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Mr. Speaker, Sir, on behalf of the Government... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear him.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go to your seat.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear what he has to say.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, on behalf of the Government, in response to the comments made by the distinguished Leader of the Opposition Advaniji, I have to inform you that in this House we had the opportunity to witness two Ministers in the Council of Ministers being charge-sheeted, one while we were sitting on the other side and another while we are sitting on the Treasury Benches. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK (AHMEDABAD): Mr. Speaker, Sir, we want the Prime Minister's reply. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, if they do like this, this is not correct. Let them not threaten us. ... (*Interruptions*) If they are not afraid of hearing me, let them not do like this. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: He is the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. How can you dictate to him?

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, why are they afraid of listening to me? ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded. Any Member speaking without my permission will not go on record.

(*Interruptions*) ... *

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, I am not a jurist to interpret the criminal law. But in my lay knowledge of law, I can say that any crime which is committed either to murder an individual or a community, both are same. I have the privilege to see a Council of Ministers in which the distinguished Leader of the Opposition was there in which when he took the oath of office he had the CBI investigation going on against him for the heinous charge of communal riot. ... (*Interruptions*) At that time, the then Prime Minister Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee laid the standard that it is his discretion to choose his Council of Ministers and said that unless anybody is convicted he is not a criminal. Accordingly, our Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Harin Pathak, please don't provoke me to dig out everything, then it will be most embarrassing for you. ... (*Interruptions*)

* Not recorded

MR. SPEAKER: This is not right. The hon. Leader of the Opposition said that one should be prepared to listen to others also. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, our Prime Minister not only took the resignation but made it abundantly clear that anybody who is in the Government if they are convicted of any charge, they have to leave the Government. It is very clear. But in the legal jurisprudence, till a trial is on everybody has a right to defend himself before the court of law and till the end of that, nobody is guilty in the eyes of law. When Advaniji had the tenacity to carry on as the Deputy Prime Minister of the country in spite of having been charged by the CBI for indulging in communal riots in the country and for not killing one but motivating the rioters to kill thousands and thousands of people in the nation and demolishing the mosque, it is most unfortunate to see Advaniji raising this issue. It is really amazing to me. I would like to know in what capacity and with what moral authority he is sermonizing the House. If it had been raised by any other Member, I could understand that.

Sir, Advaniji is still facing the charge, still he is not free from the charge. So, it is better that he does not give advice to us. Our Prime Minister has taken a very clear stand on this matter and so he does not need to give an apology to the House or to the nation. On the other hand, he has proved how transparent he and his Council of Ministers are.[\[R10\]](#)

Therefore, he should not try to take a competent lawyer with him to defend his cases because he is charged with the case of dividing the nation, to kill not one but thousands of people... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us go one by one. I will call one by one. उनको बोलने दीजिए, वह आपके पार्टनर हैं।

... (Interruptions)

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव (झंझारपुर): अध्यक्ष महोदय...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपको भी बुलाएंगे।

...(व्यवधान)

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव : अभी आपने रूलिंग दी थी कि विपक्ष के नेता के बाद आपको बोलने का मौका देंगे।...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस मुद्दे के बाद देंगे। यह क्या बात है?

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जो चर्चा चल रही है...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: कोई नहीं सुनता है। I will allow you to speak. आप संक्षेप में बोलिये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Your hon. Minister has spoken on behalf of the Government, I take it. Now you are also trying to say something, I do not take that. Is this the way the House will function? No.

... (Interruptions)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, अभी जो चर्चा चल रही है, माननीय आडवाणी जी ने यह चर्चा उठाई है और प्रियरंजन दासमुंशी जी ने जो कहा है, प्रियरंजन दासमुंशी जी की बातों से मैं अंशतः सहमत हूँ। उन्होंने कहा है कि प्रधानमंत्री जी को विशेषाधिकार है, इसमें कहीं दो मत नहीं कि प्रधानमंत्री जी का विशेषाधिकार होता है। वे जिसको चाहें, मंत्रिमंडल में रख सकते हैं। दूसरे, यह कानून में है कि जब तक किसी का दो सिद्ध नहीं हो जाये, तब तक वह मंत्रिमंडल में शामिल हो सकता है। इसमें भी हमारी कहीं कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। हम सिर्फ एक बिन्दु उठाना चाहते हैं। हम यह बिन्दु उठाना चाहते हैं कि यह जो मामला शिबू सोरेन का था, हम किसी का नाम नहीं लेना चाहते। ... *

MR. SPEAKER: This will not go on record.

...(व्यवधान)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : सर, हम किसी का नाम नहीं ले रहे हैं। ... *

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह सही नहीं है। No, that will not go on record.

...(व्यवधान)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : चूंकि सी.बी.आई. ने इसकी जांच की...(व्यवधान)

Not recorded

MR. SPEAKER: I have called him. I have allowed him to speak. आप बोलिये, क्या बोलना चाहते हैं।

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : सी.बी.आई. ने जांच की। सी.बी.आई. प्रधानमंत्री के अधीन होती है। सब कुछ प्रधानमंत्री को पहले से जानकारी होगी कि इस मामले में क्या सच्चाई है और क्या सच्चाई नहीं है। यहां तक कि सी.बी.आई. ने यह भी सूचना दी होगी कि शिबू सोरेन का अन्तिम क्या होने वाला है। वैसी परिस्थिति में, अध्यक्ष महोदय, हम यह कहना चाहते हैं कि यह एक राजनैतिक साजिश भी हो सकती है।

वैसे जेल की जहां तक बात है, अब चर्चा चल रही है तो देखिये, इस सरकार में और भी लोग हैं, जैसे मान लीजिए हम पर भी आरोप हैं, हम जेल गये हुए हैं।...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठिये न, यह क्या बात है। उन्हें बोलने का हक है।

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : हमारे ही खिलाफ आपको बोलने वाला कोई नहीं मिलेगा, मैं बोल देता हूँ आप सुनिये।...(व्यवधान)

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded.

(Interruptions)* ...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप हमको बोलिये, हम क्या करें। आप लोग मेहरबानी करके बैठ जाइये। हम आपके लीडरको भी बोलने का मौका देंगे।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You are violating my order by speaking from there. I will issue a notice of privilege against you. Violation of the Chair's direction or order is a breach of privilege. It applies to all sides. आप बोलिये।

... (Interruptions)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जेल में जाने पर जेल का बन्दी एक नारा लगाता है कि जब तक जेल में चना रहेगा, तब तक आना-जाना बना रहेगा, यह नारा जेल में चलता है। हम बता देते हैं, यह जेल के बन्दी का नारा है।...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अभीयह विाय नहीं है। ये सब बातें छोड़िये।

* Not recorded

gÉÉÒ |É£ÉÖxÉÉIÉ ÉË°Éc : +ÉÉè® °É®BÉÉÉ® àÉâ 'Éè°Éä £ÉÉÒ àÉÆjÉÉÒ cé, VÉÉä ¢É®É®É®
VÉääÉ àÉâ +ÉÉiÉä ®cä cé, VÉÉiÉä ®cä cé* *

MR. SPEAKER: Delete that name.

... (Interruptions)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : ऐसी स्थिति में हम आपसे कहना चाहते हैं कि दागी मंत्रियों को सरकारसे निकालिये और प्रधानमंत्री जी को...
(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: देवेन्द्र जी यह क्या बात है, I will call you.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shri Basu Deb Acharia.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Devendra Prasad Yadav, I will call you.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You do not have to provoke him.

... (Interruptions)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : मैं अपनी बात एक मिनट में समाप्त करता हूँ। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि देश में शायद यह पहली घटना घटी होगी कि मंत्री पद पर रहते हुए किसी को सजा हुयी या वे जेल गए। *... मैं आपसे यही निवेदन करता हूँ।

MR. SPEAKER: Delete that portion.

Now, Shri Basu Deb Acharia.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, the Court has convicted yesterday Shri Shibu Soren who was a Cabinet Minister in the UPA Government. ... (*Interruptions*) The Prime Minister asked him to tender his resignation and he immediately resigned as he has been convicted. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK (AHMEDABAD): How do you know? ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : It has come in newspapers and everyone knows. ... (*Interruptions*)

* Not recorded

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या बात है? क्या यह क्वेश्चन-आन्सर सेशन है? You are going on putting questions to him.

... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या बात है? आप सीनियर मेंबर होकर ऐसा करते हैं। You were a Minister also. It cannot be one-way traffic; you will speak and you will not allow others to speak.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : When BJP raised the question of morality, raised the question of the continuance of tainted Ministers, and raised the question of the Minister involving criminal cases, I am rather surprised. Sir, the then Deputy Prime Minister and the leader of BJP continued in the NDA Government for six long years. He was charge sheeted for the demolition of Babri Masjid on 6th December, 1992. After demolition of Babri Masjid, many innocent people were killed because of the action of BJP. Under the leadership of Shri L.K. Advani, the then Deputy Prime Minister in the NDA Government, Babri Masjid was demolished. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except Shri Basu Deb Acharia's observation.

(*Interruptions*)* ...

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : After the demolition of Babri Masjid, hundreds of innocent people were killed. Who are responsible? They are responsible. The three Ministers who were charge sheeted continued in the Government. We raised this issue on the floor of this House but they continued for six long years. Today, they are raising the question of morality and they are raising the question of tainted Ministers. They have no right to raise this question.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shir Mohan Singh.

... (Interruptions)

* Not recorded

MR. SPEAKER: You are not Shri Mohan Singh. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मोहन सिंह जी, आप अपनी बात कहिए।

...(व्यवधान)

श्री मोहन सिंह (देवरिया) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बहुत दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण है कि सार्वजनिक जीवन में स्टैंडर्ड्स लगातार गिर रहे हैं और दुर्भाग्य से इस देश में बड़े पदों पर ऐसे लोग विराजमान हो गए हैं, जिनके खिलाफ ऐसे ... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except Shri Mohan Singh's observation.

(Interruptions)* ...

श्री मोहन सिंह : यह बात सही है कि इस देश के इतिहास में यह पहली घटना है कि जो कैबिनेट रैंक का मंत्री है, उसको कोर्ट को सजा देनी पड़ी और उन्हें कितनी सजा होगी, यह 30 तरीख को पता चलेगा। अपने कार्यकाल के एक वा बीतने पर जब प्रधानमंत्री जी से अखबार वालों ने पूछा, तो प्रधानमंत्री जी ने कहा कि जो मिलीजुली सरकारें हैं, उनकी कुछ मजबूरियां हैं कि इस तरह के दागी लोगों को भी मंत्री बनाना पड़ता है, यानी प्रधानमंत्री जी ने इस बात को सार्वजनिक रूप से स्वीकार किया कि दागी लोगों को मंत्री बनाना उनकी विवशता है। [v13]

लेकिन हम दूसरी बात कहना चाहते हैं कि उन लोगों को यह प्रश्न उठाने का नैतिक अधिकार नहीं हो सकता, जो सीबीआई के तहत स्वयं चार्जशीट हैं और जिनके खिलाफ मुकदमे चल रहे हैं। हम सभी पक्षों से सिर्फ इतना निवेदन करना चाहते हैं कि हमें सार्वजनिक जीवन का एक आदर्श मानदंड, उसकी कुछ शर्तें, उसकी कुछ दशाएं निश्चित करनी चाहिए और चाहे यह पक्ष हो, चाहे वह पक्ष हो, जिनके विरुद्ध मुकदमे चल रहे हों, किसी भी हालत में उनको बड़े पदों पर आसीन करने पर पूर्णतया प्रतिबंध लगाया जाना चाहिए क्योंकि यह बहुत ही दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण स्थिति है कि जिस संसद में हम लोग बैठे हुए हैं, उस संसद के कई सदस्य आज जेल के भीतर कैद हैं और उनको कहना पड़ रहा है कि हम जेल के भीतर ही आत्महत्या कर लेंगे। सब लोग चाहे हम हों, यह पक्ष हो, वह पक्ष हो, जनता सबके बारे में बुरी राय रख रही है। इसलिए हम सब मिलकर सर्वसम्मत से सार्वजनिक जीवन के लिए एक आचार-संहिता तैयार करें। मैं ऐसा समझता हूं

* Not recorded

कि श्री शिवू सोरेन की घटना से हमें ऐसा एक संदेश मिलता है और श्रीमन्, आपको इस पर एक सर्वदलीय बैठक बुलानी चाहिए जिससे हम एक मानदंड निर्धारित कर सकें।

MR.SPEAKER: Mr. Devendra Prasad Yadav, I would call you on your issue separately. But if you want to say anything on this ongoing issue, you may do so.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या आप इस बारे में कुछ बोलना चाहते हैं?

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे सुनकर बहुत ताज्जुब हुआ क्योंकि यहां माननीय सदस्य बराबर टेन्टेड लोगों के बारे में चर्चा करते हैं। इस देश में एक पार्टी है जिसकी चाल, चरित्र और चेहरा स्पष्ट हो गया, जब वे सीबीआई से चार्जशीटेड रहे।... (व्यवधान) उन्हें कोई नैतिक हक नहीं है।... (व्यवधान) श्री शिबू सोरेन के सवाल पर वही बोल सकता है, जिसमें नैतिकता हो। बीजेपी को कोई नैतिक हक नहीं है क्योंकि उनके तीन सदस्य चार्जशीटेड होकर भी लगातार मंत्री बने रहे।... (व्यवधान) आपकी नैतिकता के साथ हम कभी नहीं रहे।... (व्यवधान) हम लगातार सवाल उठाते रहे, जहां भी रहे आपके दंगाई चरित्र पर मजबूती से सवाल उठाते रहे।... (व्यवधान) जब बाबरी मस्जिद को ढहाया गया था, उस समय करोड़ों लोगों में असुरक्षा का भाव उत्पन्न हो गया था। उस घटना के चलते जो साम्प्रदायिक सद्भाव का ताना-बाना था, धर्मनिर्पेक्ष सिद्धान्त था, वह जगह-जगह टूटा और दंगे का माहौल बना। देश बाहर के हमलावरों से कमजोर नहीं होगा, देश आंतरिक हमलावरों से कमजोर होगा, आप लोगों के चलते देश कमजोर हो रहा है क्योंकि आप देश और समाज को धर्म के आधार पर बांटना चाहते हैं। इसलिए श्री शिबू सोरेन के सवाल पर आपको बोलने का कोई नैतिक हक नहीं है। The law will take its own course.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (PANSKURA): Sir, I only wish my colleagues listen to me. I have a very bad throat.

I agree with Shri Priya Ranjan Dasmunsi-ji that till a man is not convicted, he is considered to be innocent. I agree with him. That is a legal position. But there is a question of morality also in the public life, and the morality of public life enjoins upon me to tell the House that we are unhappy with the situation. We are extremely unhappy with the situation that has occurred. It has given an opportunity and a weapon in the hands of your political opponents to pin down the Government.

MR. SPEAKER: Not mine! I have no opponent.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Not you, Sir. It is on the other side. You are above all of us in this House.

MR. SPEAKER: I hope you treat that.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : But Sir, I am saying that devil should not quote from the scriptures.... (Interruptions) That is my simple statement... (Interruptions)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK : It applies to you also.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA: Yes, it applies to me also. This is the problem inherent of impatience and intolerance... (Interruptions)[r14][r15]

Sir, I can only say this.

MR. SPEAKER: I hope you can imagine my problem.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Yes. While saying so that devils should not quote from the scriptures, I only remind that there had been occasions in the past where a charge-sheeted person in a

criminal case had occupied the exalted position of Home Minister of this country. Therefore, if politics has been polluted, at least, my hon. Friend Mr. Advani cannot claim immunity from that...
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go on. Your statement will be recorded and nothing else.

(Interruptions)* ...

MR. SPEAKER: Do not record anything except the speech of Mr. Gurudas Dasgupta.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : You see this. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Order please. Let there be order in the House. What is this going on? Mr. Kharabela Swain, please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

* Not recorded

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : The point is, if Parliament has to function, there has to be freedom of speech within Parliament also. I want Mr. Advani to respond to me. Freedom of speech should be guaranteed in Parliament.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : He has directly asked me to respond to it. I would say that in my entire public life, there had been occasions when there had been movements of different nature and if a movement somehow becomes very strong, then at the end of it, the police and the investigation authorities frame charges against so many leaders of that movement. I am sure the Communist Party...
(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : What type of movement?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I know what type of movement. Movement is a movement. Sir, a movement is a movement. The charges framed are always criminal. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: No, listen to him. What is this going on? Mr. Acharia, please sit down.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : He had asked me to reply.... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: What are you doing? I do not understand this. Please sit down.

Do not record anything. Nothing will be recorded.

(Interruptions)* ...

MR. SPEAKER: I have permitted Mr. Advani to respond.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. You have asked him to respond, and he is responding.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : You have asked me to respond. मैंने यह घिसी-पिटी बात बहुत बार सुनी है। इसलिए मैं एक बार फिर इस बात को स्पट करना चाहता हूँ कि मेरे जीवन में अनेक ऐसे आंदोलन हुए, जिन आंदोलनों के बाद ... (व्यवधान)

* Not recorded

MR. SPEAKER: I appeal to you all to please sit down.

... (*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल कृण आडवाणी : मेरे से उन्होंने स्पटीकरण मांगा है। ... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप सब मेहरबानी करके बैठ जाइये।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded.

(*Interruptions*)* ...

MR. SPEAKER: I am requesting all the hon. Members that a sensitive issue has been raised. Although I had made a request at that time, the Question Hour could not be held. Let us respond to each others' issue in a dignified manner. I am appealing to you all. How can this method of interrupting others continue? Therefore, Mr. Dasgupta, you had requested the Leader of the Opposition to respond. He is responding. Let us listen to him.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nobody is obliged to speak to suit the others' wishes. Everybody will speak what he wants to speak. [\[MSOffice16\]](#)

If it is unparliamentary, if it is derogatory, I am there to control that. It is my job. You are not there to control anybody else. But this is what is happening in this House. There is no intention to listen to each other. How can there be a debate or a dialogue?

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : You give that rule. I will ask him to get out immediately.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Advaniji, please conclude quickly. I am giving opportunity to all.

... (Interruptions)

* Not recorded

MR. SPEAKER : This is totally outside the rule that is happening now.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, I have not completed.

MR. SPEAKER : I know that you have not finished. You asked him to respond and he is responding. What can I do? You cannot object.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Let us have the decency to listen to each other.

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : अध्यक्ष जी, मैं अब तक हमेशा इन बातों की उपेक्षा करता था, लेकिन आज चूंकि इसे इस प्रकार से उठाया गया है जिसके कारण मुझे लगता है कि एक बार अब मैं यह स्पष्ट रूप से कह दूँ कि कभी मेरे मन पर इस बात का बोझ नहीं रहा कि अयोध्या के आन्दोलन में मैं बहुत सक्रिय था।... (व्यवधान) मुझे इस बात का अफसोस जरूर रहा कि ... (व्यवधान)
Sir, this is not fair. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I am sorry. I am very sorry to say this.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Athawale, I am going to name you. You have to go. You are not even in your seat. You are deliberately disturbing me and the House.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE (PANDHARPUR): No, sir. I am not.

MR. SPEAKER : Yes, you are. I am so agonized.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I am making so many appeals. Can we not behave as serious persons with some responsibility? Who is benefiting by this? Who is benefiting?

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : That is your misconception that by disturbing, they are benefiting and that is why you are disturbing.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Please give some lessons to your Members.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It applies to all sides. Why is there this impatience not to hear each other?

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : I will do it now. It is enough. Mr. Athawale, I am going to do that.

... (*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : अध्यक्ष जी, माननीय सदस्य को क्षमा करें, छोड़ दीजिए।

MR. SPEAKER : I am going to ask you to leave.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, please do not do that.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, I am appealing to you. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Advaniji, please conclude.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, I will conclude by saying this. ... (*Interruptions*) अध्यक्ष जी, अयोध्या के श्रीराम जन्मभूमि आन्दोलन में भाग लेने का मुझे गर्व है, लेकिन उस दिन, वॉ 1992 में जो ढांचा ढह गया, उसका मुझे अफसोस है। ... (व्यवधान)

मोहम्मद सलीम (कलकत्ता-उत्तर पूर्व): तब आप कोर्ट में जाकर रिप्रेजेण्ट क्यों नहीं करते हैं? ... (व्यवधान) अगर ऐसा है तो हिम्मत के साथ लड़िए। ... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : What are you doing? What is this? I am very sorry. It seems you have no respect for the chair. I am very sorry.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Acharia, I am very sorry.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : If you do not want me, I will go away. If you do not want me to be in the Chair, I will go away without any regret. I cannot preside over the liquidation of the entire system of parliamentary democracy. I do not want to remain here. If you do not want me, please tell me. I will go away immediately. I will not take even a second. But I cannot allow, I cannot see, I cannot tolerate it any longer. Please. It is not a matter of amusement to any.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : I am requesting all hon. Members, particularly the leaders to cooperate.

... (*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल कृण आडवाणी : अध्यक्ष जी, मैं एक ही वाक्य कहकर अपनी बात समाप्त करूंगा, वह यह है कि अयोध्या के राम जन्मभूमि आन्दोलन में भाग लेने का मुझे गर्व है, लेकिन अयोध्या में उस दिन उस ढांचे के ढह जाने का मुझे सख्त अफसोस है और मैं कह सकता हूँ मैंने लिब्राहन कमीशन में भी कहा है, कि मेरा उससे प्रत्यक्ष या अप्रत्यक्ष रूप से कोई लेना-देना नहीं है।...
(व्यवधान) [\[MSOffice17\]](#)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shri A. Krishnaswamy.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, I have not concluded. I request you to please give me two more minutes to speak. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, through you, I would like to convey to the distinguished Leaders of the House that in the eyes of the law whether you kill a Private Secretary -- according to the observations of the court -- or kill so many people through the movement are the same. ...
(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If you disturb, then I will not call you.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, now it is clearly proved on the floor of the House that Shri Advani takes pride in the demolition of Babri Masjid. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, what is this? ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Advani, your views on this issue are on record, and you have said about it.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Mr. Advani, you have said it.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Advani, you have made your position clear, and you have expressed your regret on that issue.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, I have said it before the Liberhan Commission also. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, it is on record.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Perhaps, they did not listen to you carefully. I am listening to you carefully.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : But the intervention of the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs or what he is saying now is a deliberate ... (*Not recorded*)

MR. SPEAKER: That word will be deleted. It will be deleted

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, I am only saying that ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Dasgupta, please conclude.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, I am only saying that there are movements in the history of the world that have been applauded by history like the movement led by Mahatma Gandhi or the movement led by Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru. But there are also movements in the history led by Hitler, which have been blacklisted as one of the black chapters in the history of international political life. Mr. Advani will go down in the history as a ... (*Not recorded*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, please delete it.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have expunged it. It is expunged.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have expunged it. I also do not approve of such statements.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have expunged it.

... (*Interruptions*)

12.47 ½ hrs

(At this stage, Shri Harin Pathak and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

MR. SPEAKER: I have expunged it then and there itself.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned till 2 p. m.

12.48 hrs

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.

