

Fourteenth Loksabha

Session : 8

Date : 11-08-2006

Participants : [Dasmunsi Shri Priya Ranjan](#), [Advani Shri Lal Krishna](#)

an>

Title : Hon'ble Leader of the House and Minister of Defence (Shri Pranab Mukherjee) made a statement regarding conduct of Business of the House and also made a statement on the letter dated 8 August, 2006 from the Chairman, NDA addressed to Speaker regarding the functioning of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, I come to Urgent Matters of Public Importance.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, I have not yet permitted you.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Mr. Speaker, Sir, may I submit that the hon. Leader of the House desires to make a statement and possibly the Leader of the Opposition may also respond. I appeal to the House, through you, Sir, that to get rid of the impasse, if both of them are heard patiently by the House it will be in the fitness of the House to run the Business of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: It is entirely for you. I am not asking anybody to make any statement.

... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Sir, with your permission, I would like to make the following statement:

The leaders of various parties and groups in the Lok Sabha express their deep anguish at the tone and the contents of the letter of 8th August, 2006, written by a veteran Parliamentarian and former Prime Minister to the hon. Speaker of this august House. By casting aspersions on the impartiality in the official conduct of the hon. Speaker, it casts a deep, dark shadow on the entire House and the democratic values that it cherishes and has nourished over decades.

The letter is more painful because it emanates from the pen of a person who has himself struggled to uphold the dignity of the House over several decades and is known for his commitment to parliamentary values. The Speaker is more of an institution rather than a person and any aspersions on the keystone of parliamentary democracy is an indictment upon all its constituents, who have faithfully served the people of India for five decades and more. Large numbers of leaders, including Parties

belonging to UPA and outside, feel very strongly that under no circumstances and provocation should there be any reflection on the conduct of the Chair in any form or manner.

Sir, as I mentioned the other day, we have full confidence and trust in you, in which you are conducting the business of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, the hon. Leader of the Opposition.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded except the observation of the hon. Leader of the Opposition.

(*Interruptions*)* ...

SHRI L.K. ADVANI (GANDHINAGAR): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I rise to record my strong disagreement with the statement just made by the Leader of the House. In deference to the wishes expressed by you ... (*Interruptions*)

Because a comment has been made on the letter written by my leader, the Leader of NDA, it would have been appropriate if the letter had been placed on record^[lh5]. But I was told just now by Prof. Malhotra that you desired that the letter should not be quoted here, and therefore, I am not quoting it. But I can say that every Party in the National Democratic Alliance, every Member of the National Democratic Alliance strongly endorses every word in that letter... (*Interruptions*)

I hold that there are no aspersions cast in that letter. There are no reflections in that letter at all. In fact, I really wonder how anyone can construe that letter as being disrespectful to the Chair... (*Interruptions*)

* Not recorded

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I request you to please do not disturb.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I regard that letter as the sage advice of a senior statesman to the Presiding Officers of the House, and it is not clearly to you, Sir... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing would go on record except what Shri Advani says.

(*Interruptions*)* ...

MR. SPEAKER: It is not being recorded. Why do you stand up?

... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठिए। यह क्या बात है ? जब मैं कह रहा हूँ कि उनका एक भी वर्ड रिकॉर्ड नहीं हो रहा है। Your leader is speaking and you are disturbing. Please do not prolong this painful episode. I have not made one

comment about that letter.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Yes, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: More than once I was asked. I have the highest respect, as much as you have, if not more, for him. I have seen him in this House; I have had the great fortune of working together with him from 1971, and that is my great privilege. Therefore, you do not think that only you have greater respect for him. Please do not prolong this episode.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, when this morning, the Leader of the House met me and said: "We would like the House to be conducted smoothly as there are several businesses to be transacted, there are several issues still pending relating to the welfare of the people, which should be taken up." Therefore, he said: "To us, it seems that this letter is an impasse." I said: "I am surprised that this letter should be regarded as an impasse. But if you propose to say something about that letter, then I would also like to say something about that letter."

* Not Recorded

Therefore, it is that I have expressed my disagreement with what the Leader of the House has said. I am firm again that this letter is a guidance for all of us, all parliamentarians, not merely the Speaker but everyone. That is all, Sir... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, we would take up Special Mentions.

Shri Madhusudan Mistry.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not recording it.

(*Interruptions*)* ...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप मेहरबानी कर के बैठ जाइए। Hon. Members, please sit down. I am earnestly requesting you to take your seats.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : चेयर की कुछ तो सुनिए। मैं आपको बताता हूँ। I am again and again stating that let this episode be over, at least, so far as the House is concerned.. You can do whatever you like, outside. I do not want to say; there are different interpretations. So far as my feelings are concerned, I need not express. But whatever has come to me has come to me. I request you all to please cooperate. There are so many other important issues to be taken up.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Acharia and Mr. Yadav, I would request you to please cooperate. That will add to the dignity of the House.

... (Interruptions)

* Not Recorded

MR. SPEAKER: Let Mr. Madhusudan Mistry make his submission. His is a very serious matter concerning floods in Gujarat.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Do not record one word except what Mr. Mistry speaks.

(Interruptions)* ...

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Basu Deb Acharia, please take your seat.

... (Interruptions[KD6])

MR. SPEAKER: I am thankful. This slanging match will not help. Only Mr. Madhusudan Mistry's observations will be recorded.

(Interruptions)* ...

अध्यक्ष महोदय :आप लोग बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I am trying to control. I have asked them not to speak. I have not recorded their speech. Not one word is recorded. I am admonishing them. हम इससे ज्यादा क्या कर सकते हैं, उनका गला तो नहीं पकड़ सकते हैं।

...(ब्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: What more do you want? You do not want to listen. If you are so respectful to the Speaker, please keep quiet. By that you will show more respect to the Chair than trying to enter into this controversy. I think studied silence is more eloquent than anything else.