

Fourteenth Loksabha

Session : 8

Date : 03-08-2006

Participants : [Bose Shri Subrata](#),[Patil Shri Shivraj V.](#),[Bose Shri Subrata](#)

an>

Title : Further discussion on the Report of Justice Mukherjee Commission of inquiry regarding alleged disappearance of Netaji Subash Chandra Bose and memorandum of Action Taken by the Government on the Report laid on the Table of the House on the 17th May, 2006, raised by Shri Prabodh Panda on 2nd August, 2006.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Further discussion under Rule 193.

Shri Subrata Bose.

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE (BARASAT): Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I am happy to have this opportunity to resume from where I stopped yesterday.

I would just recall that yesterday, I pointed out that how in spite of the various notings in the Government files, the then Prime Minister, Pandit Nehru continued to say in Parliament as well as in public that Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose has died in air crash and that it should be accepted by the people of India. But in his private letters he wrote otherwise. He wrote that he had no proof of his death in the air crash and he also acknowledged that there was need for further inquiry. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): My request to you, Sir, on behalf of the Government is that after the conclusion of the speech of Shri Bose today, we take up 'Zero Hour', and then the debate would continue. We can fix some other day. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL): I have a request to make. I think, this discussion will be continued in the next week also as many hon. Members would speak. I have to attend to the Cabinet meeting and there is only one subject in the Cabinet and that belongs to me. If you permit, I can leave and the Minister of State can be there. I will read all that the hon. Members speak from the record.

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE: I will not certainly keep you away from your urgent work.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: I said that this debate will continue. Shri Bose would conclude his speech today. Then, I would request that if any other Member wants to speak, then, it is up to the decision of the Chair to allow him. Then, the 'Zero Hour' will also continue. Remaining part of the debate would conclude next week. ... (*Interruptions*) माननीय सदस्य का भाषण समाप्त होने के बाद स्पेशल मेशन लिए जाएं, क्योंकि इस विषय पर काफी सदस्य बोलना चाहते हैं, अतः इसे अगले दिन के लिए स्थगित कर देंगे हैं, यह 193 आगे भी चलेगा।

सभापति महोदय : यह 193 आगे जारी रहेगा। सदन इससे सहमत है इसलिए इस विषय को हम आगे भी जारी रखेंगे। माननीय सदस्य सुब्रत बोस अपना भाग जारी रखें। यहां पर गृह राज्य मंत्री जी हैं, वह नोट कर लेंगे और सभी पाइंट्स बता देंगे।

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE : As I was saying, I shall just go back once to the time of Pandit Nehru, just to give a startling revelation. I think, the hon. Members of the House would be startled to hear this. This is a note of the Prime Minister's Secretariat. This bears the File No.23(II)/56-57/PM, dated 2.12.1954 and the note is signed by Shri M.O. Mathai[s77].

I quote from the note:

“A small amount of Rs.200 and odd was received by the Ministry of External Affairs from our Embassy in Tokyo and along with the ashes and other remains of the late Shri Subhas Chandra Bose. This money is being kept with the External Affairs Ministry.

I have consulted the Prime Minister about this and he agrees that this amount might be transferred to INA Relief Fund. The Ministry might get in touch with the General Secretary of AICC, 7, Jantar Mantar Road, New Delhi and have this money transferred to the INA Fund. The receipt might be obtained for the Ministry's record.”

That is about Rs.200 and odd in cash. But what happened to the ashes and other remains of late Subhash Chandra Bose which had been received from the Embassy in Tokyo by the Ministry of External Affairs, that is, the then Prime Minister?

If the ashes had come to India, handed over to the Prime Minister and then what were kept in the Renkoji Temple, then what happened to the ashes which had come to India? What happened to the other remains of late Subhas Chandra Bose, which were also handed over to the Prime Minister? This is something we have never known before. So, the whole thing, as you can see, is just a myth created by the Government of India about the ashes. All the hon. Members will agree with me. I would like to receive – I am sure all the hon. Members will join me to receive – or to hear from the Government of India, a very direct and a positive answer on this point.

This move of the Congress Government to bring the ashes and bury Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose continues, even after an interlude when the Congress came back to power. They were waiting for an opportunity to once again revive the proposal to bring the so-called ashes from the Renkoji Temple. What happened to the ashes in India, nobody knows; whose ashes in the Renkoji Temple, Justice Mukherjee has an answer. These are ashes of one Ichiro Okura.

So, they got that opportunity when the country was preparing to celebrate the Birth Centenary of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose, although in their heart of hearts, they did not want to. But the then Government felt that they had to do something. So, the Central Birth Centenary Celebration Committee was formed in 1994 – Kumari Mamata Banerjee will correct me, if I am wrong – with the then Prime Minister Shri P. V. Narasimha Rao as the Chairman and the then Leader of the House Shri Pranab Mukherjee as the Deputy-Chairman. In the first meeting, the first agenda was to bring the ashes from the Renkoji Temple and building a memorial. In the

Committee, other than Shri Narasimha Rao and Shri Pranab Mukherjee, there were other members. This Committee comprised of leaders of different political parties, two representatives of the family and other important personalities^[V78].

The record shows that when this agenda was taken up, there were some who boldly opposed it. I am certainly grateful to hon. Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, he was then I think the Leader of Opposition. I am also grateful to hon. Kumari Mamata Banerjee who was the Member of that Committee. We also recall with gratitude late Shri Chitta Basu and Shri Samar Guha. All those Leaders raised their voices against this proposal. The Chairman and the Deputy-Chairman had no other alternative but to drop it.

I think, again I am very lucky to be in the House in which Kumari Mamata Banerjee is also there. She will correct me if I am wrong. No further meeting was held. Some programmes were arranged by the Government but this Committee was not consulted. This was the character of the Congress Government.

But the Congress was toppled once again. The NDA Government came in power. In the mean time there was a High Court order that there must be a further inquiry. The West Bengal State Legislative Assembly also requested the Government of India, by passing unanimous Resolution, that there should be a further inquiry. My Party, All India Forward Bloc, and the Members of the family also urged upon the Government to institute a proper inquiry.

I think I shall be failing in my duty if I once again do not offer my gratitude to the NDA Government of that time, particularly to the then hon. Prime Minister, Shri Vajpayee and the then hon. Minister of Home Affairs, Shri Advani and other partners and associates in that Government, that in 1999 – I think on the 13th of May – the Government issued a Notification appointing justice M.K. Mukherjee as the Chairman of a one-man Commission of Inquiry and gave them very definite Terms of Reference. I shall also point out to you, Sir, that unlike the previous Committee of Inquiry and the Commission of Inquiry set up in 1956 and 1970 respectively by the Congress Government, this Government under the Prime Minister-ship of Shri Vajpayee decided that they will not appoint the Chairman of the Commission of their choice and a request was made to the hon. Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of India to recommend the name of a retired Supreme Court judge to be the Chairman of the Commission.

Justice Mukherjee's name was recommended by the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court. That is why, if I may say so, we got a judge as the Chairman of the Commission who was reputed to be a man of integrity, a man of intellect, a man of sincerity and a man who had perseverance and a lot of patience^[R79].

Above all he was a man who was honest. So, he started the inquiry with an open mind. Yesterday I said, perhaps the hon. Members would remember that I became a deponent before the Commission. I filed an affidavit. It is immaterial what I said in that affidavit but I also prayed in the affidavit that irrespective of my belief or the belief of others, I want the Commission to inquire into the alleged disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in August 1945 with an open mind. Let them judge all the evidences and the circumstances. Let

them hear people of all opinions who have different opinions. In fact, in that affidavit I said that I shall accept whatever findings the Mukherjee Commission would give.

There was an allegation that he took too long a time – six and a half years. But perhaps the Government of India has forgotten that for one year, they could not find even a suitable accommodation to house the Commission of Inquiry. After one year, the West Bengal Government had to come to their rescue and the then Minister of Food of the State Government graciously vacated his own office so that the Commission could start its work. The Government of India never bothered. In Kolkata, they had their office. The Commission wanted a liaison office in Delhi because they had to always be in touch with the Government of India. That was given after a lapse of two years. That was the cooperation extended from the beginning itself. If the Commission took six and a half years, actually five and a half years because one year was lost, it was due to the Government's non-cooperation and the Government's attitude of not being helpful. If the hon. Members have the time to go through Volumes 2A and 2B of the Report, they would find, it only contained a record of non-cooperation from the Government of India. It is a disgraceful and shameful thing. Yes, you can say that for five years the NDA Government was in power at that point of time. But it is a fact. As I praise them I also take them to task for not cooperating with the Commission of Inquiry which they themselves had set up.

The Commission wanted to go to Taiwan. I will give you a few examples because the hon. Members have read the report, I believe. After many months of persuasion, the Government of India came out with a suggestion that since we do not have any diplomatic relationship with Taiwan, you go to Taiwan but show that you had been elsewhere. Naturally, Justice Mukherjee would not agree. He said that you want me to tell an untruth. So, again after many months the Commission was granted permission to go to Taiwan, account for Taiwan visit and draw the money from the Government of India. In India, they took evidence from many persons. The number was more than hundred and they made four foreign visits^[r80].

19.00 hrs.

They first went to Japan, then to the United Kingdom, then to Taiwan and lastly to Russia.

When the Commission visited Japan, they went there with two purposes in mind. First, to visit the Renkoji temple where allegedly the ashes of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose were kept. They went to inspect that. Hon. Members will be surprised to know that the whole programme of visit was drawn up by the Indian embassy in Tokyo. I also went there in my individual capacity on my own expenses. I had the right to go where the Commission went and attend the hearings of the Commission. We went to the Renkoji temple. The Commission wanted to take the evidence of the priest, but he refused to give any evidence. They said that they were prepared to talk to us but not on record. Agreed. It is because if someone is not willing to give evidence, one cannot be forced.

We had the first meeting downstairs. In the upstairs there was a hall where the urn was kept containing the alleged ashes of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. We went upstairs. Hon. Justice Mukherjee requested them to open the urn and wanted to see the contents. They suddenly looked at each other and after about ten minutes

they came and told Justice Mukherjee that they were sorry about the fact that since there were no carpenters available, they could not open the urn. I thought it was made of wood covered by a glass case and with batons put on an ordinary wooden table and they were just screwed up. Justice Mukherjee humbly suggested that it could be opened with the help of a screwdriver. They refused the suggestion and said that in Japan there was nothing like that and only a carpenter was allowed to touch it and that we may have been able to open it, but we are not allowed to do so. We came back without seeing the contents. What was the reason given? That day was a national holiday in Japan and so the carpenters did not come for work. The Indian embassy knowing that it was a national holiday had fixed up the programme for the Commission to visit the Renkoji temple. So, the first purpose was lost.

Second, the Commission went to interview the doctor, whose name was Yoshimi, who had claimed to have treated Netaji Subhas Bose when he was brought to the hospital after sustaining very serious burn injuries in the air crash. He was asked as to whether he had treated Netaji Subhas Bose or not. His reply was 'no'. He did not know whom he treated as he had never seen Chandra Bose. They referred to him as 'Chandra Bose' in Japan. He had never even seen his photograph. He said that a person was brought badly burnt and that he did not know if that was Chandra Bose. He was only told by a Japanese military officer that he was the great Indian leader Chandra Bose. This man gave the name as Nakamura. We subsequently found that this man, namely, Nakamura gave evidence before the Shah Nawaz Committee and he was no more alive when the Mukherjee Commission was constituted. But when Nakamura was interrogated by the Shah Nawaz Committee as to whether he recognised Chandra Bose or not, his reply was 'no' and that Dr. Yoshimi told him that he was Chandra Bose^[snb81].

About other witnesses who appeared before the Shah Nawaz Committee, I had said yesterday and that has gone on record.

Secondly, there is a very interesting document in the Government of India's file. But, before that, I must tell you that Dr. Yoshimi said that he died on 18th August. When he was preparing to write the death certificate, he was told by Nakamura to give the name as Ichiro Okura because they want to keep it as a secret. But mind you, after five days, they were announcing the death of Subhas Chandra Bose. It was a military hospital and he had to obey the orders there. They asked him whether he will sign a false certificate. He said he will sign a false certificate. I also signed the cremation certificate. In their country, there has to be a separate cremation certificate alongwith the death certificate requesting the crematorium for the last rites. That was also given in the name of Ichiro Okura. Then that interesting document which Justice Mukherjee found that in one of the files of the Government of India was taken out. Justice Mukherjee asked Dr. Yoshimi, "Did you on any day issue a death certificate in the name of Subhas Chandra Bose?" He said, "No. How could I? I issued that certificate in the name of Ichiro Okura." And that was meant to be Subhas Chandra Bose's certificate. He took it out and showed that that was the death certificate issued by Dr. Yoshimi in 1988 in the name of Subhas Chandra Bose. It was 43 years after the so-called death of Bose. When he showed the certificate, he got nonplussed. He said that he had forgotten. He said, "Under what circumstances did you issue a certificate after 43 years and this time in the name of Subhas Chandra Bose?" He said that one Indian and one Japanese came to him and asked him to give a certificate as the Government of India wants it to facilitate taking out the ashes back to

India. He asked, "Who was the Indian?" He said, "I have forgotten." He asked, "Who was the Japanese?" He replied, "I have forgotten the name." Then he started weeping requesting Justice Mukherjee to kindly not to report it to the Japanese Medical Council because his licence will be cancelled. Justice Mukherjee said that he had come to make an inquiry on behalf of the Government of India, he has to give a report to them and he has got nothing to do with the Japanese Government or the Japanese Medical Council. He asked, "Tell me, was it fair on your part to issue a death certificate after 43 years?" He said, "No." After all, death certificate has to be issued within a reasonable time of the death of the person and 43 years, by no means, can be considered as a reasonable period. So, that effort was continued to bring the ashes. Possibly, if leaders like Mamata Banerjee had agreed at the meeting of the first Birth Centenary celebrations to get the ashes, this certificate would have been the proof of the death of Subhas Chandra Bose as far as Government of India was concerned. This is how things were going on.

So, we came back and then there was a visit to UK. The United Kingdom Government said that we can go to the Public Records Office and there, we can get all the documents. We collected copies of whatever documents were released and what we really thought was related to the subject like the one I mentioned[[bru82](#)].

That copy of the letter of the British High Commission in Delhi, which certified that the Report of the Taiwan Government in 1956 was handed over to the Government, which was destroyed. The UK Government, whatever it does, want to do it openly. They said, "We have it".

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (CALCUTTA SOUTH): The Government destroyed this letter. I have with me a copy.

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE : She will talk and she will help. I hope she will talk.

Then they told that they have information about Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose's death. But, they said, "They are classified and we shall open it after 2020". Seventy-five years after the event of his death or his escape. It is because, they said, there is an Official Secrets Act in the UK. So, there are facts. Still facts and information are available in the UK.

In this context, I would also say, that like the UK Government, the Government of India also withheld two files on Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose from the Commission of Inquiry. In our country also there is an Official Secrets Act and the Government took advantage of it. Due to a judgement of the Supreme Court of India, the Government had to give reasons to the Commission as to why they want to keep it as a secret. I shall quote verbatim the reasons given by the Government of India to Justice Mukherjee for keeping these two files as classified and secret. I have read it so many times that I think I have it fully in my memory. I shall quote:

"Information contained in these files, if disclosed, will affect relations with friendly countries. "

I repeat, this is what the Government gave as reason:

"Information contained in these files, if disclosed, will affect relations with friendly countries. "

Shall I be wrong to assume that some friendly countries -- I do not know which -- did some unfriendly act as far as Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose is concerned and if that is disclosed now, that will affect the relations with those friendly countries because people of India will rise against them? Let the Government explain as to what they mean by this. They cannot reveal the information about Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose because it will affect relations with some friendly countries. Our national hero is not important, but relations with friendly countries is more important. That is a heinous and shameful attitude of the Government of India.

Now, I go back to the most important visit to Taiwan. Justice Khosla had gone there. I had mentioned it yesterday. He had not met the Government officials. Here I must say that there is an unofficial trade organisation, called the Indo-Taiwan Trade Association in Taiwan. They had been unofficially requested by the Government of India to help the Commission and they did it. The Commission was given audience by the Ministry of External Affairs of the Taiwan Government; the Ministry of Health of the Taiwan Government; and the Ministry of Internal Security or the Home Ministry of the Taiwan Government[r83].

They told Justice Mukherjee unequivocally that they were absolutely sure and certain that there was no air accident in the whole State of Taiwan on the 18th August, 1945. He says that we have our records. I will tell you that there was an air accident in September, 1945. We will give you the record. It was an American plane carrying the American prisoners of war. We have the list of passengers who died and who were injured. But that also did not happen in Taihoku Airport, it happened in Southern Taiwan. Justice Mukherjee went to the crematorium. They said, no, this crematorium was built much later and in 1945 this was not the crematorium. But there is an old crematorium which still exists. It is not used as a crematorium, but it is today used as the Office of all Crematoriums and all records are there. You can go there and try to find out if records of 1945 are available. Justice Mukherjee went there. They said, 'yes, we have full records. But you are asking for records of 59 years ago. So, you will have to give us time and you will get this record within one month.' Justice Mukherjee asked them to please let him know whether Subhas Chandra Bose or Ichiro Okura was cremated between 15th August and 25th August, 1945 and also whether Lt. General Shidei of Japanese Army, a very high ranking official was also a passenger in that plane. General Shidei was reported to have died in that accident and the Chief Pilot, whose name I forget now, I think, I have seen the report, the pilot also has reported to have died and, therefore, Justice Mukherjee asked them to let him know whether these two persons were cremated. Crematorium kept its words and within three weeks, the record in Chinese language with certified English translation came to Justice Mukherjee. He found that Ichiro Okura was cremated on 22nd August, but his death was not on 18th but on 19th August, 1945. Lt. Gen. Shidei name was not there and the Chief Pilot's name was also not there. Those dead bodies vanished. He also found out that Ichiro Okura was a patient in that hospital. He died on the 19th August due to heart attack. A dead body was required to bury or cremate Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. Without a dead body how could they tell whether he died and cremated? So, Ichiro Okura's dead body was used. He died on the 19th August. According to Japanese customs, the cremation takes place on the third day. So, it took place on the 22nd August. Habibur Rehman had given the date as 20th August. So on 22nd August, Ichiro Okura was cremated. In the Japanese customs unlike our Indian customs bones are kept.

That is why, some bones are supposed to be there. That is why, Justice Mukherjee has concluded. There are other things in the Report but I will not go into that. Ichiro Okura's ash and bones are there. I think, the Government will come up with that question. I anticipate it[R84].

Why did Justice Mukherjee not arrange for the DNA test of whatever is there, whether it is Ichiro Okura's remains or whatever it is. After all, it is for the DNA test. Justice Mukherjee was not averse to it. He told us during the hearing: "I would like to take full advantage of the scientific advancement." He asked the Hyderabad Institute. At that time, the Hyderabad Institute said that it did not have the equipment to conduct the DNA test. Justice Mukherjee requested them for names of the Japanese or foreign experts. They gave the names; recommended the names of a German expert and a Japanese expert. Justice Mukherjee referred to them saying: "Certain remains are there. They were cremated in 1945. Would you conduct a DNA test to find out to which family he belonged?" No one can identify a person. Both the German and the Japanese experts said "no" to it. It is no use or not even worth a try because when a dead body is exposed to heat generated in a furnace – do not talk about the ashes because ashes have no quality – even bones, once they are charred – qualities required for conducting the DNA test – do not remain anywhere. After a lot of persuasion, the Japanese Government agreed. It said: "We shall ask the temple authorities if they would give it just to show it to the Japanese expert." He was already in Tokyo. The temple authorities said: "No. Our religious custom forbids handing over of the last remains to any human being." Subsequently they have agreed after Justice Mukherjee Commission closed its hearing. The Japanese expert had said: "No. You are forcing me. But I know that nothing can be found from that."

Now, I refer to pages 22 to 31, Volume-I of the Report. Since the book is there, I would not like to waste the time of the House. The subject is regarding DNA test of that. He explained that he tried his best but nothing could be done in the matter. He was ready although the experts said nothing would be found. That is why, he has concluded that although the DNA Test was not done, he was completely satisfied that it was not Subhas Chandra Bose who died in an air crash because the air crash did not happen taking into view the Japanese doctor's evidence but he said that still he would conclude and come to this finding. I would just read the last sentence on Page 107 of the Report. I quote from the Report.

"Considered in that backdrop, the inability of the Commission to subject the mortal remains to DNA test in the circumstances beyond its control has not stood in the way of recording its conclusive finding in that regard – a finding arrived at on the basis of robust circumstantial evidence on record."

He has given it. One can study it. I think the concluding part of Justice Mukherjee's Report is there from pages 100 to 107. I hope the Government would also definitely have studied it. They have nothing to say....
(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Bose, how much time would you take?

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE : I will conclude. I have nothing more to say. I have taken enough time[R85].

Sir, there is one thing. I did not want to mention that. But while intervening when I was speaking last evening, the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs referred to the differences within the family. You and the hon. Members may remember, Sir, that when I started talking I said: "Yes, I happen to be a member of the

family, but that does not give me the sole right to represent Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.” He belongs to the nation and he belongs to the people of India. Today I am speaking here because I also again fortunately happen to be a Member of Parliament. But since he had mentioned that and I know that that will be a point which will be taken by him again, I have to mention this although I did not like to do so.

He was referring to Shrimati Krishna Bose, a former Member of this House. She wrote to the Government of India apart from making public her views. She wanted that irrespective of the Report the ashes should be brought. I would only like to inform the hon. Members that because Justice Mukherjee had a very open mind, he had requested both Shrimati Krishna Bose and her husband late Dr. Sisir Bose to appear before the Commission and tell what they know and what they believe. So, the Commission wanted to hear all that.

Late Dr. Sisir Bose wrote to the Commission and said: “I have no facts or information on this matter. So I would like to be excused because I cannot be of any use to the Commission”. Then, naturally the Commission said that he had written that he has no facts.

When Shrimati Krishna Bose was invited, she also wrote back and said: “I have no facts or information on Subhas Chandra Bose’s death. I was a mere child then in 1945 when he is supposed to have met his end, but I believe that he died in the air crash and the ashes are there because my husband late Dr. Sisir Bose believed that. So, she has no information or facts which she has said which is on record. The Government of India can find it in the records of Justice Mukherjee Commission which are all now in the custody of the Government. Therefore, her opinion today is not worthy of any consideration.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : But this is not a family matter.

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE : Sir, as I said, I am not saying the House will all agree with me when I say that he did not die in air crash or I agree with the findings of the Mukherjee Commission. It is for the House to decide and give its sense of views to the Government and then it is for the Government to consider that. But I thought I should mention that and so I did that.

So, I end by making certain accusations. First of all, I accuse the Government of India of deliberate suppression of facts and information from 1947 onwards till today.

Sir, I accuse the Government for destruction of files and for making files missing which contained relevant information, material information on Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and his disappearance or, as the Government contends, his so-called death.

I accuse the Government of continued non-cooperation with the Commission of Inquiry headed by Justice Mukherjee[k86].

The [Rs87]Government stands accused not by me, not only in the docks of a court of law, but I think, it stands accused in the court of the people of India.

I demand that the Government withdraw the Action Taken Report, which they have submitted. I demand that the Government of India accepts the findings of the Justice Mukherjee Commission of Inquiry. This will be

the chance for the Government to amend itself, and amend the wilful misconduct of the Government over 59 years. I demand that the Government of India should inform immediately to the Government of Japan that it is not concerned with the so-called ashes kept in the Renkoji Temple in Japan. I also demand that the Government of India immediately withdraws the financial assistance which they are giving to the Japanese Temple authorities for maintenance of Renkoji Temple.

Here also, I just mention how the Government has been playing sly in the matter. The Renkoji Temple evidently sought for assistance saying 'that we are keeping Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose's ashes for you, so you should financially assist us, Temple does not have the money'. Our Finance objected to it saying 'that Netaji's death is in doubt. Whose ashes are these?' They are in doubt. How can you give money? But you can give under general head, that is, Discretionary Financial Head, which the Ambassador has. Pay the money as if you are just donating to a Temple. That is how they are paying the money. Officially, they cannot acknowledge that it is the ashes of Netaji.

The files say otherwise. So, let that be withdrawn. Let the Government now take the right stand which the people of India expect of them. Whatever mistakes they have done over the years, I think, people of India are always gracious to condone and forgive. But if the Government does not act, I think, the people of India will not forgive them for showing disrespect to Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and for spreading false things, false news about Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose. I have done.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, this will be an opportunity to us to get some information from the hon. Member and it will help us to come to correct conclusions.

He referred to the statement made by the former Prime Minister Morarji Desai saying that he did not believe in the findings given by the Committee and the Commission. Was it possible for the Mukherjee Commission to refer to any document to which the reference was made by Morarji Desai and if no references to any document or any file was available and if it was not made available, which document could have been given by the Government?

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE : Sir, the hon. Minister of Home Affairs has raised a very important point. But is it the duty of Justice Mukherjee Commission to find out or is it the duty of the Government of India to find out how the Prime Minister made a statement in the House?

Sir, I will tell you. This was reported in the proceedings of the Parliament and this has been read out also [[Rs88](#)].

The Prime Minister, Morarji Desai was clear. He said that a new information had come to light which caused more serious doubts on the air crash story. I would like to say with my little experience in the State Assembly and in the Parliament; I do not have the experience like the hon. Home Minister or like many hon. Members present here. When the Prime Minister makes a statement, has he to refer to a file? I think, it is customary that

when you are answering a Starred Question, there should be back up papers. The hon. Prime Minister does not speak without backup papers; no hon. Minister speaks without backup papers. Justice Mukherjee Commission requested the Government of India to give it back up papers on the basis of which the Prime Minister made the statement. It was hunted. Firstly, it was referred to the Ministry of External Affairs, I do not know why. Then it was referred to the Home Ministry, and then to PMO. It is for the House to believe or not; ultimately, PMO said: "There are no back up papers; the Prime Minister must have been speaking out of his mind." This was the reply that the Justice Mukherjee Commission got from PMO. I am told that Justice Mukherjee thought that PMO does not destroy the papers. Is the Prime Minister replying to a Starred Question without back up papers believable? You can say you have destroyed many files; you have had many files missing. But to allude that the Prime Minister was saying something from his own mind, I think, it is an insult to the Office of the Prime Minister if not the greatest insult to Shri Morarji Desai, who became the Prime Minister of India. I have nothing more to add.... (*Interruptions*)

सभापति महोदय : बहुत से माननीय सदस्य स्पेशल मेशन के लिए इंतजार कर रहे हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI PRABODH PANDA (MIDNAPORE): Let me respond to the points raised by the hon. Minister here. I have got only two points to make.... (*Interruptions*)

सभापति महोदय : जब जवाब होगा, उस समय आपका स्पटीकरण आएगा।

...(व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : आज माननीय मंत्री जी जवाब नहीं दे रहे हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : यह उनका प्वाइंट आफ इन्फार्मेशन था, अभी जवाब नहीं हो रहा है।

...(व्यवधान)

सभापति महोदय : पांडा जी आप तो पुराने सदस्य हैं।

SHRI PRABODH PANDA : Just one minute.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will not allow a new type of debate.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*)* ...

सभापति महोदय : यदि सदन सहमत हो, तो इस चर्चा को आगे लिया जाएगा।

* Not recorded

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we will take up Special Mentions.

Shri Alemao Churchill. Please be brief.