

**11.18 hrs.**

## **MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS**

Title: Discussion on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address moved by Shri Pawan Kumar Bansal and seconded by Shri Jyotiraditya M. Scindia (Not concluded).

MR. SPEAKER : We shall now take up the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. Shri Pawan Kumar Bansal to speak now.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (CHANDIGARH): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to move :

"That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms :-

'That the Members of the Lok Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on June 7, 2004'."

...(Interruptions)

Sir, the President's Address delineates the new Government's policy and plan for an accelerated development of the country. It reflects a commitment to the average Indian who was kept in oblivion, uncared for during the last six years. The policies of the BJP Government and the much-touted reforms had bypassed him.

In the recent elections, the first of the new millennium, the people have decisively voted out the BJP. The BJP, by calling early elections, had pleaded for euthanasia, mercy killing. The people of India have granted it to them. But they have proved to be not only bad losers, but singularly graceless. What the country witnessed in the election was a campaign that may have hypnotised the spin-doctors of the BJP, but not the people. Flushed with limitless resources, they forced an illusory 'India Shining and Feel-good' campaign on the people which was preposterous in ways more than one. ...(Interruptions)

A vicious and smear campaign was launched against the Congress President, Shrimati Sonia Gandhi. She, on her part, unprovoked and undeterred, toured the length and breadth of the country.

Wherever she went, people in large numbers, euphoric crowds surged forward to listen to what she had to say. The result is before each one of us. The result is before the country. ...(Interruptions) The renowned writer, Shri Khushwant Singh has also said that it could only be a person one hundred per cent Indian who could attract such crowds. ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I had called Shri George Fernandes.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go to your seats. I will allow you.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : हम हाथ जोड़कर आपसे बोलते हैं कि अपनी सीट्स पर जाइए।

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Sir, defeat in these elections should have mellowed the BJP leaders and prompted them to introspect. â€¦ (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please co-operate with me. I called Shri George Fernandes, but you did not allow him to speak.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : These self-proclaimed conscience-keepers of the nation went about whipping up lunatic passions, but Shrimati Sonia Gandhi announced her decision not to accept the Prime Ministership when not only 145 Members of the Congress Party, but the entire United Progressive Alliance and others, over 320 Members of this House extended their support to her. It is the rarest of rare cases of renunciation of power. ...(Interruptions) But, Sir, these people have the audacity to continue with their vilification campaign. No effort had been spared to

malign her. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please co-operate with me. I will give you all opportunities to speak, but you are not listening.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : She never reacted but went about her job stoically with determination. Her aim was not to seek power. Having agreed to lead the Congress at a critical juncture, she never looked back. Today she has refused to accept the Prime Ministership. She had declined to accept it when it was offered on a platter in 1991. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are all my good friends. Please go to your seats.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : As a true Indian, her knowledge of Indian history and civilisation and her commitment to nationalism are far more than the originators of the vicious campaign. By launching this campaign, they have tarnished the India's image in the eyes of civilised world. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: He is not a Minister. Let him speak.

...(*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : हम हाथ जोड़कर विनती करते हैं कि आप अपनी सीट्स पर वापस जाइए।

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: How can I allow you? He is not a Minister.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Sir, to them, I will only remind of the words of Rabindra Nath Tagore. In his poem *Bharat Tirath*, Tagore says:

"No one knows at whose bidding so many streams of people came and lost themselves in our sea. They gave and they took; they stirred and they mixed, but they did not ever go back from the vast Indian beachhead of human beings."

This is what they fail to understand. ...(*Interruptions*) Sir, Shrimati Sonia Gandhi accepted the challenge not for the sake of seeking power, but to start afresh the work on Shri Rajiv Gandhi's mission. To her, secularism is not a dogma, but a necessary prerequisite for this country of vast diversity to prosper. With this in mind, she led the Congress and set about to put in place an "inclusive, secular and united" coalition for governing India. Her victory and renunciation of power only prove that service and duty is her anthem of life, her literature, her poetry, her philosophy. It is this sense of service and duty, which kept her going, which made her aspire, aspire for a strong secular India. It is her legacy to the future, it is her prayer.

Her one decision has dwarfed all the BJP leaders. ...(*Interruptions*)

The Leader of Opposition is sitting there, but he cannot control or refuses to control his own Members on the floor of the House. Sir, we had heard of an '*Aar paar ki ladai*.' Today, the '*Aar paar ki ladai*' is confined to the BJP's headquarters. ...(*Interruptions*) The former Prime Minister Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee spoke with poetic abandonment. But from the results it is absolutely clear that Shri Vajpayee has been pipped by Shri Advani who . ...(*Interruptions*)

Sir, as the hon. President has observed, the people of India have spoken loud and clear. The verdict in these elections is a tribute to the vision of Shri Rajiv Gandhi who strove to take India into the 21<sup>st</sup> Century as a veritably developed country. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Please, I request you all to please cooperate. I will give you time.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : The six year *interregnum* may have delayed the process, but the new Government under Dr. Manmohan Singh shall soon catch up for our tryst with destiny. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It is also your House.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Sir, what could be greater intolerance than this? They are not prepared to accept defeat. The hon. President has observed that the verdict of elections is a rejection of the forces of divisiveness and intolerance. The hon. President observed that the verdict of the elections is for establishing the rule of law.

...(Interruptions) Sir, every action of the last Government smacked on intolerance, even arrogance. ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will give you full opportunity provided you please go back to your seats.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Sir, we have heard the pep talk from Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee when he rose to felicitate you on your election as hon. Speaker. What has happened to it now? The Leader of the Opposition is sitting on that side, but the entire lot of Members from that side has rushed to the well of the House. Sir, the sound democratic traditions of building a consensus on major national issues were given a go by. The democratic temper - the lack of which is demonstrated here again today -- which is so essential for running the affairs of a vast and diverse country like India was totally missing. There was perceptible, a sort of inebriation caused by the trappings of power. ...(Interruptions)

Sir, I am reminded of the Gujarat elections...(Interruptions) Huge portraits were hung, proclaiming "Modi banam Musharaff", painting every non-BJP candidate as an enemy to divide and seek vote on communal lines ...(Interruptions)

All that I have to say is that the nation is watching the B.J.P. It is not by words but by deeds that they will be judged by the people. People have passed their judgement now; the people have defeated them in the elections. With such actions, people will throw them into the dustbin of history. ...(Interruptions)

We have to embark upon, once again, the gigantic task of nation building. ...(Interruptions)

Sir, given this attitude of theirs, I stop here. And with these words, I move the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA M. SCINDIA (GUNA): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to rise to second the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address moved by Shri Pawan Kumar Bansal. ...(Interruptions)

हमारी सरकार का और हमारा नमन देश की जनता को जाता है, देश की जागरूक जनता को जाता है, जिसने साम्प्रदायिक सद्भाव बनाए रखने के लिए ऐसे तत्वों को, जो देश को तोड़ना चाहते थे, देश को जोड़ना नहीं चाहते, उनको उखाड़ फेंका है। (व्यवधान) जो स्थायित्व की बात करते हैं, सोवरेनिटी की बात करते हैं, देश को बनाने की बात करते हैं और देश को एक आर्थिक शक्ति के रूप में उभारना चाहते हैं, (व्यवधान) उन लोगों ने हमारे देश का क्या हाल बना दिया है। (व्यवधान) अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे खुशी है कि हमारे देश की जनता ने एक ऐसा ऐतिहासिक निर्णय 21वीं सदी में लिया है, जो पूरे इतिहास में एक नये पन्ने की तरह उभरेगा। (Interruptions)

The President's Address is a charter of the Government's policy and a mandate for action. ...(Interruptions) It is a mandate to take this country into the Twenty-first Century. It is a mandate not to be cowed down by anyone. ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please sit down.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA M. SCINDIA : It is a mandate to make India a powerful country. ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I am requesting you all to please go back to your seats. Please cooperate with the Chair.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA M. SCINDIA : The important thing is to ensure an economic growth rate of above eight per cent. Fifty million households or 250 million people today live below the poverty line. With over eight per cent growth rate, as Dr. Manmohan Singh has shown in the past, we will be able to raise one hundred million people above the poverty line in a period of five years. ...(Interruptions)

Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is also important to look at agriculture. We need increased investment in agriculture, increased investment in rural development and increased investment in irrigation. The level of investment in agriculture has come down from 33 per cent in 1994 to about 24 per cent in 2003. ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I will give an opportunity to everyone. With folded hands, I am requesting you all to please go back to your seats.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA M. SCINDIA : Sir, we will not be cowed down by this sort of behaviour.

It is important to look at education. We have committed six per cent of GDP to be spent on education. Education is what is going to lead India into the Twenty-first Century. The NDA Government has messed up our future. ...(Interruptions) Out of every Rs. 100 spent by the Central Government in the last four or five years, only one rupee went to education, 34 paise to health and 45 paise to child development.

Implementation, Mr. Speaker, Sir, is what we must look at in the future. Implementation is a major challenge in front of us. The previous Government announced a plethora of measures, but implementation was completely absent. The new process of implementation mentioned in the President's Address will revolutionise the Panchayati Raj System... (Interruptions) For the first time, in the history of our country a Ministry has been created for Panchayati Raj and that Panchayati Raj was brought to bear by Mahatma Gandhi. His dream of Gram Swaraj and Poorna Swaraj has been institutionalised and brought to bear by Rajiv Gandhi. Now we are seeing the fruition of our dreams under the leadership of the UPA and Dr. Manmohan Singh ji. â€¦ (Interruptions) In summary, Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is a balanced charter of action. This Address speaks of economic reforms but with a human face; this Address speaks of massive investments in agriculture, rural irrigation and other areas. ... (Interruptions) Mr. Speaker, Sir, but this Address does not forget industry and exports. This Address seeks of public/private participation in crucial infrastructural sectors. At the same time, this Address seeks to strengthen profitable public undertakings. ... (Interruptions) At the same time, it corrects the upper class bias of the previous Government. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please go to your seats.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am requesting you to go to your seats. You would get the opportunity to speak.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA M. SCINDIA : I wish they were shouting for 4000 farmers who died; ... (Interruptions) I wish they were shouting for the people of India; I wish they were shouting for an economic resurgence. ... (Interruptions) It is important also to promote rural industry. But none of this would happen unless we have an environment of communal peace and harmony. ... (Interruptions) But the track record that the NDA Government has left is a permanent blot on the forehead of every Indian. ... (Interruptions) Riots in Jhabua, Madhya Pradesh and other areas are a blot on every Indian.â€¦ (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2.00 p.m.

**11.37 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.*

**14.00 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fourteen of the Clock.*

**[Mr. Speaker *in the Chair*]**

...(Interruptions)

**MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, may I request you to please take your seats?**

...(Interruptions)

**श्री हरिन पाठक (अहमदाबाद) :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, हमें न्याय चाहिए। â€¦ (व्यवधान) इस तरह से सदन नहीं चलेगा। â€¦ (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please take your seats. I am on my legs.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am on my legs. Please take your seats.

...(Interruptions)

**14.01 hrs.**

**MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS – contd.**

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shri Scindia.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Where is Shri Scindia? Has he finished his speech?

...(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):  
Yes, Sir, he has finished his speech...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am appealing to the leaders of the Opposition to ask their Members to please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ। <sup>â€</sup>(व्यवधान) अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप मुझे बोलने का मौका दीजिए।  
<sup>â€</sup>(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members present in the House, whose amendments to the Motion of Thanks have been circulated, may – if they desire to move their amendments – send slips to the Table within 15 minutes indicating the serial numbers of the amendments they would like to move. Those amendments only will be treated as moved.

A list showing the serial numbers of amendments treated as moved will be put up on the notice board shortly thereafter. In case any Member finds any discrepancy in the list, he may kindly bring it to the notice of the officer at the Table immediately.

...(Interruptions)

**14.01 hrs.**

*(At this stage, Shri Koli Patel Somabhai Gandabhai and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)*

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms :-

'That the Members of the Lok Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on June 7, 2004'."

Now, Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav, do you want to speak?

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इतने शोर में मैं कैसे बोल सकता हूँ ? <sup>â€</sup>(व्यवधान)

**TEXT OF AMENDMENTS**

SHRI ABDUL RASHID SHAHEEN (BARAMULLA): I beg to move:

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the steps to be taken for implementation of 'Resolution of J & K on Internal autonomy' passed by the J&K State legislature." (1)

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that 'Kashmir shall be put on a higher trajectory of economic growth so that the educated youth of the violence affected areas get respectful avenues of employment.'" (2)

**SHRI ASADUDDIN OWAISI (HYDERABAD):** I beg to move:

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about creation of a separate Ministry for Minorities." (226)

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address regarding restoring the subsidy Haj pilgrims." (227)

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about granting A City status to Hyderabad." (228)

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about increasing the representation of minorities in government jobs." (229)

That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any scheme to check unabated cases of suicides by farmers in Andhra Pradesh." (230)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again tomorrow, the 9<sup>th</sup> June, 2004 at 1100 hours.

**14.03 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock  
on Wednesday, June 9, 2004 /Jyaistha 19, 1926 (Saka).*

-----