

Fourteenth Loksabha**Session : 5****Date : 18-08-2005****Participants : [Tytler Shri Jagdish](#)**

an>

Title : Regarding personal statement under rule 199 by members who resigned as Minister.

-

SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER (DELHI SADAR): Mr. Speaker Sir, I sincerely thank you for acceding to my request to allow me to make a statement in this august House, to bring out the circumstances which made me submit my unconditional resignation from the Council of Ministers led by the hon. Prime Minister so that the people of this country at large and the people of my constituency, who voted me to this august House, the Sikh Community in its entirety, and those among the Sikh Community that suffered during the shameful riots in 1984, may come to know of the facts concerning me and my involvement there. I can very well realize the pain and sorrow and agony of the victims of the 1984 riots, for I have seen my own father cut to pieces during the exodus of partition.

Sir, I must also be permitted to say that what happened in the aftermath of the assassination of Shrimati Indira Gandhiji on the 31st of October, 1984 has left scars which generations to come will not easily forget, and I stand together with the hon. Prime Minister and Shrimati Sonia Gandhiji, in their commitment and their sincere efforts to assuage the feelings and compensate all those who have suffered.

The subject is the allegation involving me along with those who incited those riots. Every individual goes through moments of introspection and today, when my name has been dragged into it, I feel sad and hurt, because all along these last twenty-one years my political adversaries made their efforts to involve me. But the numerous Commissions and the inquiries including the investigations by the CBI, even whenever there was a non-Congress Government, negated all those allegations in their totality. ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI HARIN PATHAK (AHMEDABAD): They have not said it. ... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: He is giving his statement. You are not bound by it. This is not right under the rules.

... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI HARIN PATHAK : He is justifying it. ... *(Interruptions)*

It was his decision. ... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: You are all very senior Members. He is entitled to speak. How can I stop him?

... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI HARIN PATHAK : He himself resigned. ... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Jagdish Tytler, please go on. Nothing else will be recorded except the speech of Shri Jagdish Tytler.

*(Interruptions) ...**

MR. SPEAKER: I am allowing him under the rules. Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra, you know very well that he is entitled to make a statement under the rules.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: He has not said anything about the Nanavati Commission. I am sorry.

... (Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : नानावती कमीशन की रिपोर्ट में...(ब्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मल्होत्रा जी, आप जानते हैं, I have to do my duty according to the rules.

... (Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : ठीक है, तो हम सदन से वाकआउट करते हैं।

12.19 hrs.

(Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra and some other Hon'ble Members then left the House)

*(Interruptions) ...**

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Haribhau Rathod, please do not do it.

* Not Recorded.

Nothing will go on record, not even one word except Shri Jagdish Tytler's speech.

*(Interruptions) ...**

MR. SPEAKER: He is entitled to make a statement under the rules. I am allowing him to do that.

... (Interruptions[R18])

SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER : Whenever the media reports, instigated by my adversaries, appeared in the Press, instead of entering into arguments with them, I have always asked the concerned investigating agencies to bring out the truth and may I submit, Sir, that twice during the investigations, the Office of the Police Commissioner, Delhi has intimated me twice in writing that they have found no truth in these allegations.

Sir, may I avail of this opportunity to apprise you and through you to the nation that when the High Court in July, 1996 issued a Show-Cause Notice to the Delhi Police on this very aspect, the office of the Police Commissioner, the DCP-Headquarters submitted a report to the High Court stating that I was nowhere involved in the riots, leave alone in any manner in inciting these riots. Even on the 26th of August, 1997, Justice Anil Dev Singh of the Delhi High Court ordered a CBI inquiry and in that report, the CBI had very clearly given me a clean chit saying that I was not at all involved.

Sir, on the day of the assassination of Shrimati Indira Gandhi, I was in Shrimati Indira Gandhi's parliamentary constituency in Raebareli along with many important personalities including Shri Arun Singh, former Minister of State for Defence, Shri Sanjay Singh, former Minister of Communications and Shri Ahmed Patel, hon. Member of the Rajya Sabha.

* Not Recorded.

Immediately, on my return to Delhi, I, along with others, got extremely pre-occupied at the residence of Shrimati Indira Gandhi and if I recall correctly, I was first at Akbar Road in the morning and the rest of the day I was at Teen Murti Bhavan near her body.

All these allegations have no meaning till Justice Nanavati Commission's Report came under consideration, which has not basically found anything against me; but for reasons best known to the Commission, the Commission found it fit to drag my name unnecessarily, merely to give credence to baseless and vile accusations arraigned by my adversaries. But surely, Sir, falsehood repeated cannot become truth and it is "probably" true that the Commission has used the word that there is a "probability" of my being involved.

Sir, the Justice Nanavati Commission Report has chosen to give credence to some submissions and ignore others.

Sir, the accusations are bizarre because the blood in my veins is from a Sikh-Kapoor family. My elder brother has married into a Sikh family and one of the prominent Sikh families of Delhi, who was my next-door neighbour, along with other Sikh families were at my residence for more than ten days immediately after the assassination of Shrimati Indira Gandhi during this very tragic period.

The Action Taken Report of the Government laid on the table of Parliament proposed to take no further action as far as my involvement in the riots was concerned. But, as you are aware, Sir, due to the present prevalent political compulsions and the vociferous representations – like you saw today – the hon. Prime

Minister committed to the House that the matter would be re-investigated. My conscience guided me to put in my resignation so that the investigations are fair and any chance of embarrassment to the hon. Prime Minister; Shrimati Sonia Gandhi, leader of the UPA as well as my colleagues in the Congress Party, and the Parliament of which I have been a loyal member for the past thirty-two years and more, is obviated.

Sir, I only trust and sincerely believe that the investigations being ordered afresh are completed within a specific timeframe so that I stand vindicated.

I would like to challenge them to do the same. Thank you.

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing more.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Sir, we have a right to speak. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : No. Under the rules no debate is permitted. Sorry. We will take up item no. 12 – Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : As per the assurance given by the hon. Prime Minister ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (PANSKURA): Sir, we are seriously protesting. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : This is very unfortunate. You are all very senior members. Under the rules, a Minister resigning can make a statement. It is expressly provided in the rules. No debate is permitted on that statement.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, it is no debate but we are commenting. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : There is no place to comment.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It will not be recorded.

(*Interruptions*) ... *

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : We have a right to make a point. ... (*Interruptions*)

* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER : This is not fair. I cannot accept it. Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad to make the statement.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing else will be recorded.

(*Interruptions*) ... *

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot be a party to the breach of the rules. Sorry.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It is entirely for you to accept the statement or not. If you have to say that, you have to say it elsewhere.

... (*Interruptions*[\[krr19\]](#))

MR. SPEAKER: The hon. Minister.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, we have every right to make a comment under the Rules. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, you are not entitled to make a comment. You are wrong. Show me that rule under which you are entitled to comment.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Sorry. Shri Acharia, you know very well.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : The Prime Minister has assured the House that Government ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: He has said that his only expectation

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: When I am on my legs, you have to sit down.

... (*Interruptions*)

* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: His only request is that the investigation should be expedited. What is wrong with that?

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded.

(*Interruptions*) ...*

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot follow what you are trying to say.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: He has not denied the right of the Prime Minister. He has not questioned the Prime Minister's decision.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Sorry. Nothing is being recorded. You are very responsible and very senior Members. You know.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is being recorded.

(*Interruptions*) ...*

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Minister Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad.

Let us proceed with the business. We have so much business to transact. An important Bill is there.



* Not Recorded.