

**Fourteenth Loksabha**

**Session : 5**

**Date : 02-08-2005**

**Participants : Salim Shri Mohammad**

>

Title: Presentation of 8<sup>th</sup>, 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Reports of the Standing Committee on Urban Development.

**12.13 hrs.**

MD. SALIM (CALCUTTA – NORTH EAST): I beg to present the Eighth, Ninth and Tenth Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Standing Committee on Urban Development (2004-2005) on (i) 'The Delhi Development Authority' (ii) 'Swarna Jayanti Shahari Rozgar Yojana' (SJSRY) and (iii) Action Taken on the Recommendations contained in the Third Report of the Committee on 'Implementation of Part IX A of the Constitution' respectively.

-----

MR. SPEAKER: Now, the House will take up item No. 15, which is Calling Attention.

... (Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने आपसे रिक्वैस्ट की थी कि नानावती कमीशन की रिपोर्ट आज तक सदन में नहीं रखी गई है। इतनी बार इसका वायदा किया गया। चार हजार सिखों की हत्या हुई।... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप इसे शून्य काल में उठाइए, मैं आपको बोलने का मौका दूंगा।

... (व्यवधान)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : मंत्री जी ने स्टेटमेंट देना है।... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I have not said that the matter is unimportant. I am only saying that after disposing of Calling Attention, I will allow you.

... (Interruptions)

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव (झंझारपुर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह गंभीर मामला है।... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइए। अभी नहीं होगा।

... (ब्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not the way. I will find out and let you know. Naturally, the law has to be complied with.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Only Shri Gurudas Dasgupta's observations will be recorded.

(Interruptions) ... \*

MR. SPEAKER: You have to wait for the 'Zero Hour'.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I beseech you. Rules are there. Procedure is well established. I am not doing anything which is against the rules.

... (Interruptions)

---

\* Not Recorded.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : आज दो कालिंग अटेंशन हैं।... (ब्यवधान) When will you take up 'Zero Hour'?... (Interruptions) यह मामला इतना सीरियस है। आज पेपर में आया है कि कांग्रेस लीडर पर गवर्नमेंट ने विद्वान करने का ... (ब्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not the way. You are a very senior Member.

... (Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : When will the 'Zero Hour' be taken up? ... (Interruptions) Nanavati Commission Report is so important. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not want the House to function, I cannot help it.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded. You can go on.

(Interruptions) ... \*

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : अगर ज़ीरो आवर नहीं होगा तो यह मामला उठेगा ही नहीं।... (ब्यवधान) कब उठेगा?... (ब्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : टाइम पर उठेगा।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: All of you are very senior Members. You are fully aware that the matters which are called 'Zero Hour' matters are raised after the Calling Attention is disposed of. You know it very well. You are fully aware of it.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Already your time is being taken unnecessarily.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I would try to regulate the Calling Attention if only you help me.

... (Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : आप साढ़े बारह बजे ज़ीरो आवर कर लीजिए।... (व्यवधान)

---

\* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot commit it now. It depends on the Members. There are two Calling Attention notices<sup>[14]</sup>.

I have been asked to allow more and more Calling Attention notices. Everyday, I am discussing with you. On Calling Attention, there are more and more demands.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not record.

(Interruptions) ... \*

MR. SPEAKER: Tell me, if you do want the House to function, I cannot help it.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : फंक्शनिंग का मतलब यह नहीं कि the Government can get away with anything.

MR. SPEAKER: Who is allowing? I have allowed the Adjournment Motion. I have allowed the motion under Rule 184. How can you say this?

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded. Except Mr. Gurudas Dasgupta's statement, nothing will be recorded.

(Interruptions) ... \*

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Because the Congress Party is involved.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am prepared to consider.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. It is very unfair Malhotra *saheb*. You know Phukan Commission Report; I compelled the Government to file. You are imputing motive to the Chair.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You did say that because it is the Congress Party, I am doing it.

... (*Interruptions*)

---

\* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: This is very unfair.

... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अनंत कुमार जी, हम आपको रोज रिक्वैस्ट करते हैं। अभी भी सात-आठ मिनट खराब हो गये हैं। These 7 or 8 minutes would have been saved.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not obliged to give you time. No, this is not the way to function.

... (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आज जीरो ऑवर होगा या नहीं होगा? ...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not want the luncheon recess, I do not mind. I will be sitting here.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Very well, you propose that at that time. But you cannot hijack the proceedings of this House. No, I will not allow. Even if you go on speaking till the end of the day, I will take it up only at the appropriate time.

... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: At the appropriate time, I will take it up. Unfortunately, 10 minutes have gone.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: There is not even a notice.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: There is not even a notice on it. It is not there. It is not my job to find out – I cannot. I do not doubt the honesty of my Secretariat. They are fully discharging their duties. आप बैठ जाइये।

...(ब्यवधान[mks5])

MR. SPEAKER: No. Nothing will be recorded.

(Interruptions) ... \*

MR. SPEAKER: I will take it up on the basis of the announcement that was already made. Extremely urgent matters, important national and international matters will be taken up for half-an-hour after the Calling Attention.

(Interruptions) ... \*

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा ) : आज आप इसे लेंगे, यह तो कह दीजिए कि आज लिया जाएगा।...(ब्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not do this. You are not doing justice to the House.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Prof. Malhotra, I have said that. You are a party to this. I will take it after the Calling Attention. We could have proceeded with that. More than 12 minutes were wasted. Then, if you feel that on any day, there should be no Lunch recess, I shall never stand in the way. Therefore, you may raise it but it will depend on whether notice has been given or not.

... (Interruptions)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : सर, नोटिस तो चार दिन से दे रहे हैं।...(ब्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You know the system of giving notices. Shri Gurudas Dasgupta, have you made your point?

... (Interruptions)

श्री सुखदेव सिंह ढींडसा (संगरूर) : सर, लास्ट टाइम आपने कहा था कि इस पर ध्यान देंगे।...(ब्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इसके लिए नोटिस देना पड़ता है। यह आपको जानना चाहिए।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You should know that. The notice does not continue from day to day.

... (Interruptions)

---

\* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: I am sorry. You can go on with this; I cannot stop you physically. There is no effect. Nothing is being recorded. I can only express my agony that more than 13 minutes have been lost for no purpose.

(Interruptions) ...

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : आप इसमें कह रहे हैं कि टाइम हो गया है। आपने भी एश्योर किया था और सरकार ने भी किया था।... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : 12-14 मिनट चले गये। कुछ भी काम नहीं हुआ।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I have never said that it is unimportant. Do not put words into my mouth.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am again appealing to all the sections of the House to allow the House to function.

... (Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Will it be placed on the Table of the House or not? The Leader of the House is here. I would like to know about it.... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is entirely for him. I cannot compel any Minister to say anything on it. Nothing is being recorded.

(Interruptions) ... \*

MR. SPEAKER: Why do you not wait for it? By this time, considerable progress could have been made. Why can you not wait for sometime if you are so much interested in it? Why do you not give a notice? You have not given any notice for it. I have got the list. There is no notice today for it.

... (Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, I came to you. I asked you about it. You said that you would allow it.

---

\* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: I thought that notice had been given. How do I know? Do you think that I remember all these things?

... (Interruptions[R6])

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please आप लोग बैठ जाइए। Go to your own seats and please sit down. Have little decorum in this House. For whom is this House, I do not know.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (CALCUTTA SOUTH): For all of us.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, you are right and it is also primarily for the people of this country. I have been saying everyday and I have been discussing every morning with you. As a matter of procedure we will try to accommodate as many Calling Attentions as possible. We have also agreed – I am not arbitrarily taking any action unilaterally – that extremely urgent matters will be taken after when the business comes in, when the matter comes in time and rest of it after 6 o' clock. I am prepared to sit as long as you want to complete the list of matters which are of urgent importance. You are party to that decision, Mr. Malhotra.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह बात सही नहीं है। आप लोगों में सुनने का धीरज भी नहीं है। मेरी बात सुनने का किसी में धीरज नहीं है। यह क्या बात है? I am not minimising the importance of the issues which you are raising but can the House function if the Rule books are thrown to the wind. Nobody bothers about procedure. Can you stand up any time you like and compel the Speaker to make a concession? Sorry. I shall take up important matters for which notices have been given to me.

श्री सुखदेव सिंह ढींङसा : हमें इसका आश्वासन दिया गया था।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I will do that. You know very well. You had been a Minister also.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इसमें कोई एश्योरेंस की बात नहीं है।

... (व्यवधान)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : You said that immediately after the Statement you can raise this question whether they will place or not.... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will look into it what has been recorded.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Malhotra, I am saying to you to follow the Rules.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, I will not allow. Very well, you can do whatever you want.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: There is no agreement.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I can only say this. आप बैठ जाइए। I will see that the law is complied with. Last time, I forced them to lay the report. You remember very well Mr. Malhotra. There is no question of the Government running away with their obligation to comply with the law. I am only requesting with folded hands, please follow the procedure and the rules. I am not saying anything. I have never said that this is an unimportant matter. You do not take the trouble. So many of you are concerned.

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY (SABARKANTHA): Right, Sir.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपके सर्टिफिकेट की जरूरत नहीं है।

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइए, when I am talking. Show a little respect to the Chair.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am saying that as you know very well, what is called matters of urgent importance are taken up after the Question Hour. Notices have to be given everyday. Yesterday it could not be taken up because the House was adjourned. It was not my fault. Today, notices should have been given. You did not bother to give notice and you are interrupting the House.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, do not take down.

(*Interruptions*) ... [\[bts7\]](#)\*

MR. SPEAKER: I can assure you this.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

... (*Interruptions*)



MR. SPEAKER: Everyday you are assuring me of full cooperation. Let the country know what cooperation the Chair is getting.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am only saying I myself will see this. I can only give you this much assurance. I myself will see or look into the law whether it has been complied with or not. If it is not done, then I will personally take an action. But do not disturb the House.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am saying that I am admitting the importance.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I feel sad. I am not angry. I feel very sad. I can only say it is sadness.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Parliamentary Reporters, do not take down anything. Unless I permit, do not take down anything.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

---

\* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Gurudas Dasgupta.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Again I am appealing to all sections of the House. Please cooperate with the Chair. Every hon. Member's right will be recognised and preserved. It is my duty.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please, proceed according to the rules. I am not giving any credence to others. You know that this is not possible.

... (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : लीडर आफ दी हाउस की चुप्पी इस बात का सबूत है कि वह इस मामले को छिपाना चाहते हैं... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: The Chair has no such power to immediately ask him to dictate. I cannot do so.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Very well. It seems that you are not interested in this Calling Attention. If you do not want to perform the House in order, then I will adjourn this House.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Very well. Let there be no functioning of the House.

... (*Interruptions*)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : The House will be adjourned because of the Leader of the House....  
(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Maybe.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If some hon. Members want that no business should be transacted, then what more can I do?

... (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : आप बता दें कि कितने बजे इसे लेंगे?

MR. SPEAKER: If you had cooperated with me, I would have exercised some of my extraordinary authority.

... (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : हम तो पूरा कोआपरेट करते हैं।

MR. SPEAKER: But you have been openly defying the Chair. I would have tried to intervene. But now I will not intervene. Sorry.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You do not cooperate with them. You should cooperate with me.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, whatever you are saying, nothing is being recorded.

(*Interruptions*) ...\*

MR. SPEAKER: I can only appeal to you again. I am repeatedly appealing to you. Malhotraji, I am not minimising the seriousness of the matter. I am not minimising at all the importance of it. You are entitled to raise this question. My only earnest prayer to all sections of the House is, please follow the particular procedure which you have not only laid down, but you are also bound to follow. Is this a crime that I have committed by asking you to follow the appropriate procedure under rules as it is well established? It is known to everybody

that for raising matters on a particular day after the Question Hour, what is called, 'Zero Hour' matters, notices have to be repeated.

SHRI ANNASAHEB M.K. PATIL (ERANDOL): Yes; notice has been given. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are a senior Member. This habit should be curbed. If I am wrong, when I sit down, take my permission to speak, I will allow you.

... (*Interruptions*)

---

\* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: No comments should be made. I know everybody; who is doing what, I keep watching.

Therefore, I am only saying, please do it in a manner which will also emphasize the great importance of the subject. So, give me little time. During the recess I will go and find out the dates, what is the assurance and allow me to exercise little authority, whatever you have allowed to remain. Nothing seems to remain with the Chair! Will Members dictate what the Chair will do and not do? Therefore, put somebody here who will only nod his head.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, I took your permission and I want to know ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Not now, sorry.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, 30 minutes have gone. There are two Calling Attentions. I am prepared to sit throughout, what is called, the luncheon recess, there may not be luncheon recess. It is a well-established procedure that after the Calling Attention I will allow those important serious matters for which notices have been given.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : आप रिपोर्ट चाहते हैं या नहीं?

मोहम्मद सलीम (कलकत्ता-उत्तर पूर्व) : आप मौखिक हमदर्दी दिखलाते हैं, लिखित रूप में नोटिस नहीं देते हैं।

श्री बसुदेव आचार्य (बांकुरा) : 6 साल तक आप क्या करते रहे। उस समय क्या आप सो रहे थे?

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : हमने नानावटी कमीशन बैठाया। उसकी रिपोर्ट क्यों नहीं आने दे रहे हैं?

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot answer for him.

Mr. Dasgupta, are you ready to go on?

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : इसमें दिक्कत क्या है? लीडर ऑफ द हाउस ने कोई एश्योरेंस नहीं दिया है इसके प्रोटैस्ट में हम वाक-आउट करते हैं।

**12.39 hrs.**

(Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra and some other hon. Members  
then left the House.)

MR. SPEAKER: Please keep quiet. Please maintain silence in the House. I can only say it is a matter of great agony. I am allowing every important issue to be discussed. This is not fair.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KINJARAPU YERRANNAIDU (SRIKAKULAM): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Leader of the House, on many occasions, has responded on this issue. This is a very important and serious matter. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It is not being recorded. Your statement is not being recorded. Why are you saying this? Nothing will be recorded unless I give permission.

(*Interruptions*) ... \*

---

\* Not Recorded.