

Fourteenth Loksabha**Session : 5****Date : 26-07-2005****Participants : [Advani Shri Lal Krishna](#),[Patil Shri Shivraj V.](#)**

>

Title: Regarding lathi charge on workers of Honda Motors at Gurgaon on 25th July, 2005.

12.12 hrs.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shri Shivraj Patil, hon. Minister for Home Affairs would like to make a statement.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL): Sir, what has happened yesterday, that does not make us very happy.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (PANSKURA): We want a copy of that.

MR. SPEAKER: What are you saying Mr. Dasgupta? Already he has been asked to make a statement and now you want a copy. What is happening, I do not know. Why this impatience?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Our Leader has expressed her unhappiness and concern about this incident. Hon. Prime Minister has also expressed his views on this incident. We have very carefully heard the statements made by the hon. Members in this House and can assure this House that we will bear the points made by them in mind in order to deal with this issue in a proper manner. I have been in touch with the Chief Minister and the officers over there and I talked to Mr. Dasgupta also yesterday. He has made certain statement on the floor of the House. His statement does not make us very happy. We would like to go into these details. We will collect the information from the State Government and decide as to how to deal with this situation. If no proper treatment was given to the hon. Member, we would like to decide as to how to deal with this. Sir, on the basis of the information, which I have received, I am making this preliminary statement. If necessary, later on, on getting the details, we can make a full statement.

(Placed in Library. See No. LT - 2344A/2005)

A large number of workers of Honda Motors had come in procession shouting slogans. In the area in which the procession was going on, prohibitory order under Section 144, Criminal Procedure Code was enforced. When the situation there went out of order, the lathi charge was done.

MD. SALIM (CALCUTTA - NORTH EAST): How it was done?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: We are informed that in the lathi charge, 92 persons were injured.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No, no... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This does not behove us.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have not asked that everyone of you should agree with him. You want the Government's version. For the time being he is giving the Government's version.

DR. SUJAN CHAKRABORTY (JADAVPUR): Hon. Minister should be more particular in collecting and giving the information... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Sit down please. It is not good to interrupt the Minister making the official statements. Dr. Chakraborty, please take your seat. Please take your seat.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, this is the information which I have received from the State Government. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I am informed that in the lathi charge... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठिए।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I am informed that in the lathi charge, 92 persons are injured, 35 police officers and men are injured. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It is very unfortunate. I can only say that you have spoken for 55 minutes.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not want to hear him, very well, he will not make a statement.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Only the Home Minister's statement will be recorded.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Out of 92 persons, 42 persons have been discharged.

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) B.C. KHANDURI (GARHWAL): Does the Minister believe these figures?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I do not believe that 700 persons have been killed and thrown into the ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Home Minister, you need not reply to every question; you need not respond to other interruptions.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I am not on the spot. This is the information I have received from the State Government, and you very rightly said that this is not in the jurisdiction ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It will not be treated as a precedent.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, out of 92 persons injured and admitted in the hospital, 42 persons have been discharged. Both the hands of DSP have been broken and three vehicles were set on fire and they were burnt down. The Chief Minister, Haryana had visited the spot. He visited the injured persons and he ordered a Magisterial Inquiry.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, the feeling expressed that the Report of the Magisterial Inquiry should be given to him. I have heard the hon. Members asking for a Judicial Inquiry. It is not for the Union Government or the Home Minister in the Union Government to issue an order with respect to that.

MR. SPEAKER: I agree with you.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: We have borne in mind what they have said, and we will convey it to the right quarters. ... (*Interruptions*)

मोहम्मद सलीम : अध्यक्ष जी, हम मिनिस्टर के स्टेटमेंट से इत्तफाक नहीं रखते, इसलिये हमारी पार्टी सदन से वाक आउट कर रही है।

12.17 hrs.

(At this stage Mohd. Salim and some other hon. Members
left the House.)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded, except the Home Minister.

(*Interruptions*) ... *

MR. SPEAKER: This is very unfortunate Mr. Basu Deb Acharia. Allow him to speak at least.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It cannot be said here. It is not in the jurisdiction of the Home Minister of India.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Okay. You do not want to listen to him. All right.

(*Interruptions*)

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव (सम्भल) : अध्यक्ष जी, गृह मंत्री जी द्वारा दिये गये वक्तव्य से हम संतुष्ट नहीं हैं, इसलिये विरोधस्वरूप हमारी पार्टी सदन से वाक आउट करती है।

12.18 hrs.

(At this stage Prof. Ramgopal Yadav and some other hon. Members
left the House.)

* Not Recorded.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I want to repeat ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is very unfair. I can only say you are responsible Members of the House.
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: I want to repeat and let them hear me.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA) We want the statement of the Prime Minister. ...
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: We have heard what they have said very carefully. We will try to find out as to how to deal with the situation. If any advice is required, we will consult the hon. Speaker and the hon. Members also.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let him finish.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have called the hon. Leader of Opposition.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am very sorry. Today is a very sad day for me, and I will send you the cassettes of today's proceedings to all of you.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI (GANDHINAGAR): I did not want to mention it but I would like to say that it was only after seeing on the television what was happening in Gurgaon that I rang up the Home Minister myself and informed him as to what was happening. At least, he seemed unaware at that time and he must have got information from the State Government. Let me say that the statement made today could have waited till the evening, could have waited till the morning, but it does not reflect the sense of outrage that has been felt by the entire country.

MR. SPEAKER: This is not fair on him because we asked him to do that.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I am aware of it. But at this point of time, I could have expected the Central Government to have persuaded the State Government by now that a Magisterial Inquiry is not sufficient. Therefore, he could have come saying that I have spoken to that Government, and now, a Judicial Inquiry has been ordered. Something of that kind merely conveying what the Chief Minister or the Police Officer has stated is not fair to the House.

MR. SPEAKER: We must put an end to this discussion.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I am aware, as a person, who has handled such situations. I am aware that merely conveying to the House whatever the State Government has said is not fair to the House. ...
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: But that is the only source of information.

(Interruptions)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, on both these counts, the nature of inquiry ordered in a case of this kind and secondly on the facts of the situation, he should not have gone ahead right now and said something in the House simply on the basis of the information received from the State Government and said that an inquiry has been ordered. Therefore, I feel that this kind of a statement could have been delayed for a few hours. So, to convey our sense of outrage, I would like to register our party's protest and walk out.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, may I respond to it?

12.21 hrs.

(At this stage, Shri L. K. Advani and some other

hon. Members left the House.)

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक (उन्नाव) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, गृह मंत्री जी जो बोल रहे हैं, हम उनकी बात से पूरी तरह से असहमत हैं। इसके विरोध में बहुजन समाज पार्टी सदन का बहिष्कार करती है।

12.21 ¼ hrs.

(At this stage, Shri Brajesh Pathak and some other

hon. Members left the House.)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is being recorded. I have not called you.

(Interruptions) ...*

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL; Sir, I just want to say one thing. Mr. Advani was speaking from that side. If he were here I would have reminded him as to what had happened in Gujarat and what he had done in regard to Gujarat. Of all the persons, the former Home Minister making this statement is very unfortunate. What we have said on the floor of the House is that right from the top leadership of our party and the Government, we have expressed our unhappiness and our concern and we have expressed our willingness to do all that is necessary and that can be done in the matter.

MR. SPEAKER: I also wish to say something.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not interrupt. Give up this bad habit. I have expressed strong reservation.

SHRI PRABHUNATH SINGH (MAHARAJGANJ, BIHAR): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to raise a matter.

MR. SPEAKER: I will give you chance. Please cooperate.

I feel that this is not a matter which can be discussed on the floor of this House. This does not deal with Parliament. But in view of the very serious nature of the incident and very strong emotions rightly raised, I permitted it and the hon. leaders have agreed with me that three hon. leaders would initially mention it for two minutes each and then there would be a statement by the hon. Home Minister at 12.00 Noon. I really expressed a desire that if he could make it that would be better. I am thankful that they have respectfully responded to the Chair to that extent and the Home Minister has himself said that it is not a complete statement. He said that he is making this statement tentatively in reverence to the Chair's request and I thought that the hon. Members would appreciate that. I am very sorry. However, this would not be treated as a precedent so long as I am here.

* Not Recorded.