

Fourteenth Loksabha

**Session : 4**

**Date : 12-05-2005**

**Participants :** [Chowdhury Smt. Renuka,Chatterjee Shri Somnath](#)

>

Title: Shri P. Karunakaran called the attention of the Minister of Tourism to the situation arising out of alleged irregular sale of Kovalam Ashoka Beach Resort at Trivandrum to M Far Hotels Private Ltd. And steps taken by the Government.

**12.33 hrs.**

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN (KASARGOD): Sir, I call the attention of the Minister of Tourism to the following matter of urgent public importance and request that she may make a statement thereon:

“The situation arising out of alleged irregular sale of Kovalam Ashoka Beach Resort at Trivandrum to M Far Hotels Private Limited and steps taken by the Government in regard thereto.”

\*THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Sir, the hon. Member has given this notice. But actually, on this matter, Kerala has filed a Special Leave Petition under the Constitution of India before the Supreme Court which is pending.

MR. SPEAKER : Is it by Government of Kerala?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : The matter is *sub judice*. Sir, it would, therefore, not be appropriate for me to offer any comment at this point.

MR. SPEAKER : I did not know this. Is it exactly the subject matter? Is it on this very matter that it is *sub judice*?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Yes, sir, on this very matter. On their own, the State Government has gone in appeal. I cannot comment on it.

MR. SPEAKER : Is it on the sale of this hotel?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Yes, sir. The same matter is *sub judice*.

MR. SPEAKER : I am sorry, I should not have allowed this. I did not know this.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN : Sir, we have to say something about it. It is a serious issue. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : I wish I had been informed.

... (*Interruptions*)

---

\* Also placed in Library, See No. LT 2263/05.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : This should not have been admitted at all.

MR. SPEAKER : This should have been informed by your Ministry.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : We did Inform. ... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइए, क्या बात है। यह क्या हो रहा है।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : When did you get the information?

... (*Interruptions*[\[rpm11\]](#))

MR. SPEAKER: Just one by one. This is not the way.

... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइये। यह क्या हो रहा है?

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: A point has been raised.

... (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइये। यह क्या हो रहा है?

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Karunakaran, I cannot do something which is not permitted by the Constitution and the rules.

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN : Sir, I want to place before the House the seriousness of the issue.

MR. SPEAKER: On which she cannot reply because on the merits, she cannot reply. How can she deal with the merit?

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN : She can understand what is there.

MR. SPEAKER: Then, you can go and meet her in her office. The House cannot discuss it.

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN : Sir, my notice is admitted. So, I want to be allowed to raise it.

MR. SPEAKER: Sorry. I did not know that the matter is *sub judice*. Since the matter is *sub judice*, it will not be appropriate to discuss it here. We will deal with it later on some time.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN : That is the way how private parties are trying to avoid ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is a matter which is very much pending before the hon. Supreme Court of India. How can they comment on this?

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN (CHIRAYINKIL): Sir, I want to raise an issue which is not *sub judice*. The matter is entirely different from the matter which is *sub judice*. Can I raise that? ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Do not put questions to me. This is not a good thing. I am not here to answer all your queries.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, it is a question of corruption. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats. I wish I had been told that it is a matter which is pending before the Supreme Court.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN : In this matter, almost all the people of our State are much interested, irrespective of political colour ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are aware of the significance of the matter being *sub judice*. Are you or are you not?

SHRI VARKALA RADHAKRISHNAN : Sir, what I raise is not a question of matter which is *sub judice*. It is entirely different from what is *sub judice*. I am raising the question of corruption which I am entitled to.

MR. SPEAKER: Not without permission. I am not giving any permission.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Not one word will be recorded.

(*Interruptions*)\* ...

---

\*Not Recorded.