## LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA	
LOTTOTION	

Monday, April 25, 2005 / Vaisakha 5, 1927 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the Clock

(MR. SPEAKER in the Chair)

Title: The Speaker made reference on the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniverary of the Asian-Africans Conference at Bandung, Indonesia, held from April 18-24, 2005.

## REFERENCE BY THE SPEAKER

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, half a century has passed since the First Generation of Leaders of Asia and Africa met in Indonesia from April 18 to 24, 1955 and gave voice to the yearnings of the people of their countries for freedom, justice and economic emancipation. It is indeed appropriate that we should commemorate the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the occasion when the newly emerging countries declared that they would fashion their destiny with their own hands.

It was a remarkable galaxy of Statesmen who had gathered in Bandung in 1955 for the Asian-African Conference – Jawaharlal Nehru of India, Sukarno and Ali Sastroamidjojo of Indonesia, Chou-En Lai of China, Prince Sihanouk of Cambodia, Nasser of Egypt, U Nu of Burma, Prince Wan of Thailand and Sir John Kotlewala of Ceylon. The historic significance of the Conference was heightened by their presence. The commemoration of the Bandung Conference also allows us to salute the leadership that they provided to an entire generation in shaking off the shackles of colonialism and embracing the new winds of freedom.

The Dasa Sila or the Ten Principles that resulted from Bandung have served as a code governing relations between States. The Dasa Sila are based on the idea of peaceful co-existence and represented the affirmation of developing countries to live in peace with one another.

The solidarity that Bandung brought about among the nations of Asia and Africa, enabled them together to launch a concerted struggle against colonialism. South-South Cooperation and the principles of Non-Alignment also find their origins in the Bandung Conference. It was Bandung that inspired the establishment of Non-Aligned Movement in 1961 and led to the creation of the Organization of the African Unity (OAU). The Bandung spirit led to the defeat of colonialism and the eventual eradication of the scourge of the apartheid.

The Bandung spirit is as relevant today as it was more than half a century ago and must be reinvigorated. The Golden Jubilee of the Bandung Conference should lead to the renewal of partnership between the countries of the developing world, a partnership that is based on shared vision and conviction, solidarity, common ownership and mutual respect. It should allow the countries of the South to effectively address the iniquities of power that still prevail and ensure equitable sharing of the benefits of the global economic relations. India, as one of the moving spirits of the original Bandung Conference, must once again take the lead in the revival of its noble sentiments, so that we can together overcome the challenges generated by a vastly transformed and rapidly transforming world.

We are happy that the Prime Minister of India was chosen to speak for the whole of Asia at the signing ceremony of a historic Asia-Africa strategic partnership agreement at Bandung.
(Interruptions)
<b>श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद ्याद्व (झंझारपुर)</b> : अध्यक्ष महोद्य, लालू जी के ऊपर गुजरात में जानले्वा हमला हुआ।…( <u>व्यवधान</u> )
MR. SPEAKER: I will listen. I know it.
(Interruptions)
MR. SPEAKER: Just give me one minute, Sushilji.
(Interruptions)
अध्यक्ष महोद्यः मोदी जी, एक मिनट मुझे ्बोलने दीजिए।
… ( <u>व्यवधान</u> )
MR. SPEAKER: I know there are some issues which both the sides wish to raise. I will try to give opportunity to every party one by one so that we can carry on with the House.
(Interruptions)
<b>श्री रघुनाथ झा (बेतिया)</b> : अध्यक्ष महोद्य, लालू जी के ऊपर जो हमला हुआ, ज्से लेकर गुजरात ्सरकार को ्बर्खा्स्त करना चाहिए। …( <u>व्यवधान)</u> गुजरात ्सरकार द्वारा इस हमले की जांच के लिए जो ्समिति गठित की गई है, वह मामले को रफा-दफा करने के लिए की गई है …( <u>व्यवधान</u> )
MR. SPEAKER: I will call you, Raghunathji.
(Interruptions)
MR. SPEAKER: It is my appeal to all sections let us conduct in a proper manner.
(Interruptions)
MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.
(Interruptions)* …
प्रो. <b>विज्य कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली)</b> : अध्यक्ष महोद्य, रांची कोर्ट ने लालू प्र्साद जी के ऊपर जाल्साजी, धोखाध्ड़ी के …( <u>व्यवधान</u> )
MR. SPEAKER: After the Question Hour.
(Interruptions)
*Not Recorded.
प्रो. विज्य कुमार मल्होत्राः ्स्ंवैधानिक तौर पर उनका मंत्री पद पर ्बने रहना बिल्कुल निर्श्यक है। …( <u>व्यवधान</u> ) उनको मंत्री ्बनाए रखने का कोई प्रश्न पैदा नहीं होता। …( <u>व्यवधान</u> )
MR. SPEAKER: You do it after the Question Hour.
(Interruptions)
MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please go to your seats.
(Interruptions)
MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ram Kripal Yadav, please go to your seat.
(Interruptions)
MR. SPEAKER: I am not minimising anybody's feelings.

...(Interruptions)

...(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: I will give you an opportunity to speak. ...(Interruptions) अध्यक्ष महोद्य: हम आपको बोलने का मौका देंगे । आप अपनी सीट पर जाईए । ...(व्यवधान) अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप स्पीकर को बोलने नहीं देंगे, तो कैसे चलेगा । आप स्पीकर को बोलने दीजिए। अगर आप ही सब कुछ तय कर लेंगे तो चेयर को छोड़ दीजिए, चेयर को उठा दीजिए । आप सुनिए । हमें बोलने का मौका तो दीजिए। ...(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ramdas Athawale, please go to your seat. Do not do it. हम उनको भी बोल रहे हैं । क्या आप सुनेंगे? यह क्या बात है? ...(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ram Kripal Yadav, I have given permission. Shri Lalu Prasad will be coming in the afternoon. When he speaks, I will see what statement he makes, I can ask the Government also to make a statement. But let us do it when the statement is made by him. ...(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: Prof. Malhotra, you can do it after the Question Hour. I will give you full permission. ...(Interruptions) PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: He should resign immediately....(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: He cannot be asked to do it. I cannot decide it. ...(Interruptions) श्री राम कृपाल यादव (पटना): महोदय, स्टेटमेंट देने का सवाल नहीं है…(व्यवधान) MR. SPEAKER: Q.No.401. ...(Interruptions) अध्यक्ष महोदय : हमने ऑलरेडी बोला है। प्रश्न काल के बाद देखेंगे । ...(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: I am obliged to all of you. ...(Interruptions) श्री राम कृपाल यादव : महोदय, मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि …(व्यवधान) हम कैसे चलने देंगे …(व्यवधान) MR. SPEAKER: I do not know whose interest is being served. Your views are not being heard. ...(Interruptions) MR. SPEAKER: Your views are not being heard because nobody can hear. ...(Interruptions) अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप मंत्री हैं । हम अपील कर रहे हैं कि आप जो कुछ बोलेंगे और किसी को सुनने नहीं देंगे तो रिकॉर्ड भी नहीं होगा। ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not minimising the importance of the matter. Please go to your seats.

MR. SPEAKER: I am requesting you to say something in a manner which will be recorded. You should answer each other properly. I am not saying that you should not raise it. I have said that I would allow that but at the appropriate time.

श्री राम कृपाल यादवः सरकार का जवाब अभी तक नहीं आया और पूरी घटना की जानकारी भी नहीं है … (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: सरकार आज ही ज्वाब देगी। यह ठीक नहीं है।

...(व्यवधान)

श्री राम कृपाल ्याद्व : महोद्य, यह ठीक नहीं है कि कि्सी पर हमला कर्वा दीजिए …(<u>व्यवधान</u>) ऐसी ्सरकार क्या काम करेगी।…(<u>व्यवधान</u>)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not serving your cause.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Sushil Kumar Modi, do not show that. It is against the rules.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing should be recorded.

(Interruptions)\* …

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप लोग एक मिनट मुझे बोलने दीजिये।

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Athawale, nothing is being recorded except what I am saying. Do not say anything now.

My earnest appeal to all sections of the House is to please see that whatever you are saying even goes to the people. Even it is not being recorded. It cannot be recorded. I cannot blame the Reporters. How can they report anything? Probably I cannot even hear you.

\*Not Recorded.

The other day, day-before-yesterday, I was in Indore and there at a meeting a very senior freedom fighter told me: "When I see certain things happening in the House tears come to my eyes. Did we fight for freedom for these scenes?" I said, I will communicate it to hon. Members of the House. A very senior freedom fighter says: "I cry when I see this situation."

My earnest appeal to you is, if I had been preventing you from speaking you could have taken it up. I said, I will allow you to speak. Please go one by one, take your turn and there is a proper time for that. I have already mentioned certain things. Question Hour is important. After that, if I stop you, then you can say that you are coming into the Well.

My earnest appeal to all sections of the House is, let the Question Hour be over. We have already spent 15 minutes in this. There are issues. I am not minimising the importance of them. You have your views, they have their views and, I am sure, the Government will suitably respond at some time. Therefore, may I, with your kind permission, go to the Question Hour now?

Q. No. 401 - Shri Subrata Bose.

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE (BARASAT): Q. No. 401.

प्रो. विज्य कुमार मल्होत्राः अध्यक्ष जी, फ्रीडम फाइर्ट्स ने टेंटेड मिनि्स्ट्र्स के लिये कुर्बानी नहीं दी थी… (<u>व्यवधान</u>)

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you very much for your kind cooperation.

Devendra Prasad ji, I am not minimising your feelings. If you want to say something, I will allow you to say at the appropriate time. Thank you. I am grateful to all of you. It is your House.

The hon. Minister of Steel will reply.

**श्री राम कृपाल यादवः** अध्यक्ष जी, हम लोगों के प्रश्न का जवाब कब होगा? हम लोगों ने उस दिन सदन में इस प्रश्न को पूछा था लेकिन सरकार का कोई जवाब

नहीं आया है। मेरी आपसे रिक्वैस्ट है कि आप सरकार से इसका जवाब मांगे।

MR. SPEAKER: I have asked them. They will make a statement, but not at your dictation. At the appropriate time they will make it, in the course of the day.

श्री विज्य कृण (बाढ): ्सरकार कितने दिन तक ज्वा्ब देगी?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सरकार आज ही जवाब देगी।

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : सरकार रैस्पौंड नहीं कर रही है।… (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: यह सही नहीं है, ठीक नहीं है। आप बैठ्ये। आप जानते हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: There cannot be immediate responses.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इनके बोलने से आपको क्या फर्क पड़ा है?

…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Are you bound by his statement? Let him say.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : ये इतने बुड़े ...(Not recorded) पर स्टेटमेंट क्यों दे रहे हैं?… (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप इसे छोड़िये।

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please strike off that.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us behave in a proper manner.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: सुशील जी, आप बैठिये।

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You are all responsible Members.

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद ्याद्व : अध्यक्ष जी, ज्ब 21 अप्रैल को रेल मंत्री जी पर गुजरात में जान ले्वा हमला कि्या ग्या, उस सम्य सरकार ने रैस्पौंड कि्या था …(<u>व्यवधान)</u> सरकार ने सदन में कहा था कि इसका ज्वाब शाम को होगा लेकिन 21 अप्रैल के बाद आज तक सरकार की तरफ से ज्वाब नहीं आ्या है…(<u>व्यवधान)</u> मैं आपसे यही निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि इसका जवाब दिया जाये…(<u>व्यवधान</u>)

MR. SPEAKER: I have already announced that the Government would make a statement later in the day. But why can you not wait? You cannot have easy solutions or readymade solutions. There are matters; there are feelings on both sides. It appears from the papers that there are different versions.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : उस दिन तो हाउस एडजर्न हो ग्या था।

श्री राम कृपाल याद्व : अध्यक्ष महोद्य, चार-पांच दिन ्से ्यह मामला चल रहा है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : तीन दिन तो हाउस बंद रहा है।… (व्यवधान)

श्री राम कृपाल याद्व : इसकी डिटेल्ड रिपोर्ट आ जायेगी।… (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you very much for your kind cooperation. Now, hon. Minister of Steel, please.

...(Interruptions)

श्री राम कृपाल याद्व : महोद्य, आप हम ्स्बके ्संरक्षणकर्ता हैं। आप ्स्भी मैम्ब्स् का ्संरक्षण करने ्वाले हैं।…(<u>व्यवधान</u>) हर मैम्बर आपके लिए महत्वपूर्ण है। ्यदि कि्सी मैम्बर के ्साथ ऐसा हो जाए।…(<u>व्यवधान</u>)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : हम आपका भी संरक्षण करेंगे, लालू जी का भी करेंगे और इन लोगों का भी करेंगे। यह हमारा दायित्व है।

श्री राम कृपाल ्याद्व : हमारी सुरक्षा और रक्षा का दायित्व आपके ऊपर है। हाज्स का कोई मैम्बर कि्सी ्स्टेट में जाए और वहां ज्स पर हमला हो जाए।… (ख़् वधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप हमें मौका दीजिए। यह सही नहीं है।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: राम कृपाल जी, मैं आप्से रिक्वैस्ट कर रहा हूं।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is to be recorded.

(Interruptions)\* â€

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not destroy this institution of Parliament.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप अपनी सीटों पर जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not destroy this great institution.

...(Interruptions)

\*Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not destroy the Parliament of India.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : क्या हो रहा है। यहां ्शाउटिंग करने ्से कोई फा्यदा नहीं होगा। आप ्बैठिये। आप ्स्पीकर के लिए कोई मिनिमम कर्ट्सी नहीं दिखाते हैं। हम आपसे रिक्वैस्ट करते हैं। हमने बोला है।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: छोड़िये, उनके कहने से क्या होगा। हम उन्हें बैठाने की कोशिश करते हैं तो आप लोग शुरू कर देते हैं और आपको बैठाने की कोशिश करते हैं तो वे लोग शुरू कर देते हैं।

श्री राजीव रंजन सिंह 'ललन' (बेगूसराय) : सर, सत्ता पक्ष के लोग क्या कर रहे हैं।… (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : क्या हो रहा है?

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not destroy this institution. I appeal to all of you with folded hands. Please do not do this. If I had stopped anyone, you could have shown your grievance. I have said, I will allow you after the hon. Minister of Railways comes here and makes a statement. He has told me that he cannot come in the morning. If he cannot come, he cannot come. In the afternoon, if he is there, I will allow him to make a statement and then you can have a discussion. I would request the Government to give a response to this. But unless that is there, nothing can be done. No solution can be achieved. Therefore, I request the hon. Leaders of all the Parties on all sides of the House to please see that this institution is not destroyed. I appeal to all of you.

...(Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Sir, you should ask the Government to also make a statement on the charges framed against him...(*Interruptions*) उनके खिलाफ जो चार्जेज हैं, उसके बारे में सरकार बयान दे।…(व्यवधान)

श्री **सुरेन्द्र प्रका्श गो्यल (हापुड़)** : ्ये ्स्ब गलत एफिडेविट देने ्वाले लोग हैं, इन्होंने गलत एफिडेविट दिया था… (<u>व्यवधान</u>) ्ये ्वे लोग हैं, जिन्हें देश की पर्वाह नहीं है।… (<u>व्यवधान</u>)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप् बैठ्ये, नहीं तो अ्भी नोट्स मिल जा्येगा।

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, the hon. Minister of Steel to reply to Q.401.

...(Interruptions)

श्री प्रमुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार) : अध्यक्ष जी, हमने जो कार्य स्थगन प्रस्ताव दिया था, उसका कुछ भी उत्तर नहीं आया? …(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय: वह तो स्थगित हो ग्या। स्थगित करा दिया। उसे छोड़िये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Q. No. 401, a very important question on SAIL.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am bound to give protection to all the hon. Members across the House. That will be done according to the procedure. Let me conduct it. I am not against any hon. Member.

श्री राम कृपाल ्याद्व : हम लोगों का उत्तर नहीं आ्या। … (<u>व्यवधान</u>)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : अभी उत्तर कै्से मिलेगा? Let the hon. Railway Minister come here. Let us hear him. Then, we shall do it. Please go to your seats.

श्री राम कृपाल यादवः सरकार यहां बैठी है। … (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: सरकार उनकी बात सुनने के बाद जवाब देगी। आप बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Go to your seats. Nothing is being recorded.

(Interruptions)\* â€

MR. SPEAKER: The Railway Minister has asked for time from me after lunch. I am waiting for him to come. Now, it is the hon. Minister of Steel to respond to Q. No. 401.

\*Not Recorded.

Thank you very much. I am deeply obliged. This is the spirit. I welcome it.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Devendra Prasad Yadav, then, I will make you sit here now.

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद ्याद्व : एक मिनट हमारी ्बात ्सुनि्ये। 21 अप्रैल को ्सरकार की तरफ ्से ्सदन को आ्ख्र्स्त किया ग्या था कि ्सरकार ज्वाब देगी।…(ख़् वधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : मल्होत्रा जी, आप छोड़िये। सुशील जी, आप बैठिये।

...(<u>व्यवधान</u>)

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव : 21 अप्रैल को इसी सदन में यह सवाल उठा था जिस समय राहत कार्यों का जायज़ा लेने गए लालू जी पर हमला हुआ… (<u>व्यवधान)</u>

MR. SPEKAER: Why are you angry? Why are you rising?

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is not your seat either. Go to your seat. I have said that I am waiting for the hon. Railway Minister to come and make a statement. I am sure the Government will make appropriate response. I have already said that.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : जब कुछ हुआ ही नहीं, तो क्या स्टेटमैंट देंगे। … (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप क्यों बोले जा रहे हैं? हम आप लोगों को बुलाएंगे।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Everybody wants to do it in his own way. Rules are thrown to the winds. Procedure has no relevance. Parliament has no relevance today to anybody. You are going to decide this question on the floor of the House.

श्री राम कृपाल ्याद्व : पार्लि्यामैंट ्बंद हो जाएगी तो क्या ्संविधान ्ब्रेक हो जाएगा? … (<u>व्यवधान</u>)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य: ठीक है, पार्लियामैंट बंद कर दीजिए।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing else will be recorded.

(Interruptions)\* â€

\*Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, I will be recording who will be disturbing. I will be noting.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ramdas Athawale, go to your seat.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You go to your seats. If you do not go, I will take action. This is not an empty threat. I will take action. I am keeping watch on all sides.

Only the statement of the hon. Minister of Steel will be recorded.

(Interruptions)\* â€

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Subrata Bose, put your first supplementary.

...(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : आप लोग प्लीज़ ्बैठ जाइए। आप छोड़िये। क्या हुआ है आपको? कुछ ्भी रिकार्ड पर नहीं जा रहा है। आपकी ्बात और उनकी ्बात रिकार्ड पर नहीं जा रही है।

(Interruptions)\* â€

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद याद्व : जो आपका आदेश है, वह हमें र्वीका्र्य है। हमारा सिर्फ इतना ही कहना है कि 21 अप्रैल को सरकार ने कहा था कि वह सदन को सूचना देगी। …(<u>व्यवधान</u>)

MR. SPEAKER: They will make a statement today, I have said that. Shri Subrata Bose, put your first supplementary.

SHRI SUBRATA BOSE: Sir, the hon. Minister has given ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Every day, by turn, I will make all the leaders sit in the Chair. For every fifteen minutes you have to sit here.

...(Interruptions)

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : हमने सदन का ध्यान आकृट कर्वा्या था। उसका कोई नतीजा नहीं निकला?

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : सदन का ध्यान आकृट हो ग्या।

...(व्यवधान)

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आपके रहते हमें जवाब नहीं मिला। … (व्यवधान)

\*Not Recorded.

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : क्या आप चाहते नहीं कि ्सदन चले? Do you not want this House to run? I want to find out whether you want this House to run or not.

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : हम चाहते हैं कि यह सदन चले। ...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You go to your seat and sit down.

...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, you sit down. You are not the advisor here for everybody. You do not have to advise me. You sit down. Here all are self-appointed Speakers.

श्री राम कृपाल यादव : महोदय, इसे हल्के ढंग से नहीं लिया जाना चाहिए ।

अध्यक्ष महोद्य : इसे इल्के ढंग ्से नहीं लि्या जा रहा है । If you think so, you are not fair to the Chair. I have taken it very seriously. The hon. Minister himself had requested me to allow him to speak after the lunch because he is not here. I have permitted him. I have asked the Government to make some response. What more can the Chair do? Even then you do not want the House to run. The hon. Minister is not here. Now what will be the response? That is different. But let him make the statement. Let the Government give its response. What more can I do? I am only saying that you create conditions where we can discuss everything. Therefore, do not have any apprehension. I am not going to shut up anybody.

Yes, the hon. Minister please.

...(Interruptions)