

Title: Regarding issue of one Minister replying on behalf of another Minister.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri L.K. Advani.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI L.K. ADVANI): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I rise on a point of order. It relates to today's Question Hour and the objections raised in the course of the Question Hour to one Minister replying on behalf of another Minister. Sir, I would like your guidance in this regard. The former Speaker is also here. Shri Shivraj Patil's guidance also would be necessary. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (BARAMATI): Any Minister can reply. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: I know that. I may point out Rule 47. It says:

"A member may, by notice given at any time before the sitting for which his question has been placed on the list, withdraw his question, or postpone it to a later day to be specified in the notice and on such later day the question shall, subject to the provisions of rule 38, be placed on the list after all questions which have not been so postponed. "

This is a right given to a Member who has put a question and whose question has been listed. But Kaul and Shakhder says that this right is not given to a Minister ordinarily. I may read from Kaul and Shakhder, page 425, which says:

"The right to ask for postponement of a question after it is placed on the printed list of questions for a day is conceded to the member concerned and not normally to the Minister who is to answer the question. "

It goes on to point out the cases where such questions have been postponed at the request of the Prime Minister or the Minister.

Now, Sir, I would seek your guidance that here is a situation where one of our Ministers, the Health Minister has gone abroad. Either the Government comes to you that because the Health Minister has gone abroad, and, therefore, this question may be postponed. Instead of that, we went by the earlier precedent and we felt that any Minister can answer on behalf of the Government, on behalf of the Minister who is to answer. ...(*Interruptions*) Shrimati Margaret Alva, let me complete. I am not making an issue out of it. I am merely seeking the guidance of the Speaker because I know that when another Minister is assigned the duty on behalf of another Minister, he has to work harder in order to understand the issue and come to the House prepared with it. ...(*Interruptions*)

डा. रघुवंश प्रसाद सिंह (वैशाली) : कोई भी मंत्री उत्तर दे सकते हैं लेकिन उनको अध्यक्ष महोदय से परमीशन लेनी होगी।

MR. SPEAKER: The hon. Minister is raising a point of order. What is this? Let him complete.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: My point of order is simply whether we go by the rule book and what has been said in Kaul and Shakhder, that normally a Minister is not entitled to seek postponement of his question; and so, he assigns it to some other Minister, who would reply but there were protests today as to why another Minister is replying. Certainly we can request you to postpone it. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: As per the procedure only, the Minister of Chemicals and Fertilisers has been given the chance to answer on behalf of the Health Minister.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (BOLPUR): Should the Minister go abroad during the Session unless this is an important thing?

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Somnath Chatterjee, he has gone to attend the World Conference in Geneva.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (BOLPUR): Sir, I am sure, Shri Advani remembers that there have been many occasions in the past when other Ministers have had replied. After all it is a joint responsibility they are supposed to exercise. They have to make themselves acquainted with the subject a little more deeply....(*Interruptions*)

श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल (कानपुर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आपने खुद कहा है कि आपको अभी तक कोई सूचना नहीं मिली है। (ब्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अभी नहीं। जयपाल रेड्डी जी, आप बाद में बोलना।

श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल : आपने जो कहा है, हम उसी पर पूछ रहे हैं। क्या आपको सूचना मिल गई थी? (व्यवधान)

श्री राशिद अल्वी (अमरोहा) : बगैर आपकी परमिशन के मिनिस्टर ने जवाब दिया है।

बगैर आपकी इजाजत के उन्होंने खड़े होकर जवाब देने की कोशिश की है।

12.06 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH): Sir, on behalf of Kumari Mamata Banerjee, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Memorandum of Understanding (Hindi and English versions) between the Indian Railway Finance Corporation and the Ministry of Railways for the year 2000-2001.

(Placed in Library. See No. LT 1950/2000)

THE MINISTER OF URBAN EMPLOYMENT AND POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND MINISTER OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (SHRI SUKHDEV SINGH DHINDSA): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Lakshadweep Building Development Board (Finance and Accounts) Rules, 2000 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. F.No. W (XV)/Se/84 Vol. III (3) in Lakshadweep Gazette dated the 21st February, 2000 under section 31 of the Lakshadweep Building Development Board Regulation, 1997.

(Placed in Library. See No. LT 1951/2000)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (SHRI E. PONNUSWAMY): On behalf of Shri N.T. Shanmugam, I beg to lay on the Table

(Placed in Library. See No. LT 1952-58/2000)

पेट्रोलियम और प्राकृतिक गैस मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री संतो कुमार गंगवार) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं दसवीं, ग्यारहवीं, बारहवीं और तेरहवीं लोक सभा के विभिन्न सत्रों के दौरान मंत्रियों द्वारा दिये गये आश्वासनों, वायदों और वचनों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई दर्शाने वाले निम्नलिखित विवरणों की एक-एक प्रति (हिन्दी तथा अंग्रेजी संस्करण) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

(Placed in Library. See No. LT 1959-75/2000)

मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री जयसिंग राव गायकवाड़ पाटील) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:-

(Placed in Library. See No. LT 1976-2000/2000)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI CH. VIDYASAGAR RAO): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Citizenship (Amendment) Rules, 2000 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. G.S.R. 344 (E) in Gazette of India dated the 20th April, 2000 under sub-section (4) of section 18 of the Citizenship Act, 1955.

(Placed in Library. See No. LT 2001/2000)

12.07 hrs.