

- (2) Second Report on Action Taken on 97th Report of Public Accounts Committee (10th Lok Sabha) relating to System Appraisal-Functioning of Investigation Circles.
- (3) Third Report on Action Taken on 112th Report of Public Accounts Committee (10th Lok Sabha) relating to National Cancer Control Programme.

12.03 hrs.

### COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES

#### Fourth and Fifth Reports and Minutes

[English]

DR. M. JAGANNATH (Nagarkurnool) : Sir, I beg to present each of the following Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes including Minutes (Hindi and English versions) of the sittings of the Committee relating thereto :

- (1) Fourth Report on the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Fifty-eighth Report (Tenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Finance, Department of Economic Affairs (Banking Division) - Reservation for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development.
- (2) Fifth Report on the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendation contained in the Thirty-Eighth Report of the committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the Ministry of Finance, Department of Economic Affairs. (Banking Division) - Reservation for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Indian Bank, and Credit Facilities provided to SCs and STs.

#### RE: QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

[Translation]

SHRI LALMUNI CHAUBEY (Buxer) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have given a notice for privilege motion. I got a book recently written by Shri K. Venkatgiri Gowda, an Ex-M.P. The title of the book is

[English]

Shri H.D. Deve Gowda, Prime Minister, the King of Corruption and the Unmaking of India.

[Translation]

The intention of the writer has been apparant from the title of the book. The writer stating the Prime Minister the king of Corruption through the title of the book, who will ruin the country. It is a contempt of the House. Even the title of the book is...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot read like that.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You can ask what has happened to your notice for privilege motion. Why should you read it?

[Translation]

SHRI RAM KRIPAL YADAV (Patna) : Why is he raising a baseless point.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I have not disposed it of. The question is that I have not given the final ruling. I am giving the ruling now.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : He has the right to raise it.

[Translation]

SHRI LALMUNI CHAUBEY : Mr. Speaker, Sir, there are so many allegations in this book, which have not been levelled not only against our Hon'ble Prime Minister but against other members of the House also, which is very disgraceful.

That is why he said that he left Shri Sukhram, the member of this House...

He thought that the case of corruption has been proved against Shri Sukhram, that is why he passed bad remarks against him. On page 7 of the book, he passed disgraceful remarks about Shri Indrajit Gupta, who is a member of this House and also the Minister of Home Affairs...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : It is enough.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF TOURISM (SHRI SRIKANT JENA) : It should not go on record. This is not the way to raise the matter. He is deliberately doing that.

MR. SPEAKER : The Member has a right to raise the issue. He has given a Privilege Notice, and I have to dispose it of. He can present his case. Why not?

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[Translation]

SHRI LALMUNI CHAUBEY : After that for Hon'ble Prime Minister... word has also been used\* whether this word is appropriate for the Prime Minister?... (Interruptions) It has also been stated further that he has amassed property more than thousand times as compared to the property of his ancestors. Is it not a contempt of the House? Therefore, I would like to say that the privilege Motion given by me may be accepted... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : It is enough. I have given you more time than what is required. No more please.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have allowed you enough. Shri Ananth Kumar, you can speak one sentence.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR (Bangalore South) : Before you give your ruling on this important matter, I want to bring to you kind notice two things. One is, I want to quote Kaul and Shakdhar from Page 949. Secondly, I want to read the last but one paragraph written by Shri Venkatagiri Gowda in the preface of the book. Shri Venkatagiri Gowda clearly said that :

"If I am found to be guilty of malfeasance against the Prime Minister..."

(Interruptions)\*\*

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot read it; it is enough. Nothing will go on record now. I will give my ruling on this. You cannot quote from the book. I am sorry.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : Sir, I am referring to Kaul and Shakdhar. You should allow me.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Venkatagiri Gowda's book is out of circulation. It has been banned and you cannot quote from that.

(Interruptions)\*

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record. It is not going on record. I have said that nothing is going on record.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER : Sorry, it will not go on record.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER : What is your point of order? This is not your notice. I have just give you a chance. Please know that this is not your notice. This is Lalmuni Chaubey's notice. You have no right in this regard.

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

\*\* Not Recorded.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : Sir, before you give your ruling...

MR. SPEAKER : I have to give my ruling.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : Sir, I want to bring one small thing to your notice.

MR. SPEAKER : Please do not read from this book.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : No, Sir, I am referring to what Kaul and Shakdhar said at page 949... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : He is reading from Kaul and Shakdhar. One can read from Kaul and Shakdhar's book.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : At page 949, it is said :

"A Committee of Presiding Officers has considered the scope of the rule of *sub judice* and recommended the following guidelines."

The second guideline says :

"rule of *sub judice* has no application in privilege matters."

Therefore, Sir, before you give your ruling on this important matter, I want to draw your kind attention to what Shri Venkatagiri Gowda said in the preface of the book.

(Interruptions)\*

MR. SPEAKER : It is not going on record.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have given you enough chance which I am not supposed to give you. Please sit down now.

SHRI ANANT KUMAR : Sir, I want to quote one more thing from Kaul and Shakdhar since you have ordered expunction of some of the remarks.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please read quickly.

[English]

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Mumbai-North East) : Sir, he is alternatively reading from the two books.

You have given the ruling to expunge some of the things. It is clearly said :

"As regards a matter which is *sub judice* and which has been referred to in a speech or debate or in any statement in the House, the Speaker has no power to order expunction of any words or phrases merely on the ground that they relate to a matter which is pending for a judicial decision in a court of law. Where a member insists on referring to a matter which is *sub judice* in spite of the

\* Not Recorded.

Chair asking him not to do so, the Chair may ask him to discontinue his speech forthwith."

But here because it is a privilege motion.

"Rule of *sub judice* has no application in privilege matter". (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : I will carefully go through the record again and I will take a decision.

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR, (Bangalore South) : Therefore, I request you to refer the whole matter to the Privilege Committee.

MR. SPEAKER : I will give my ruling :

"Shri Lalmuni Chaubey, Member, gave notice of a question of privilege on 12 December, 1996, against Prof. K. Venkatagiri Gowda, former Member, alleging that he had cast reflections on the Prime Minister and the Home Minister in a book authored by him and thereby committed a breach of privilege and contempt of the House. Shri Chaubey made specific reference to the passages in the book which, according to him, cast reflections on the Prime Minister and the Home Minister. He also enclosed a copy of the book with his notice.

I have since examined the matter on the basis of the well established parliamentary privileges, past precedents, facts on record and the legal position obtaining in the matter and come to the conclusion that no question of privilege and contempt of the House is involved in the matter.

I, therefore, withhold my consent to the raising of the matter by Shri Lalmuni Chaubey on a question of privilege in the House, under Rule 222 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Lok Sabha."

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

JUSTICE GUMAN MAL LODHA (Pali) : I have given a notice of privilege on Uttarakhand.

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Justice Guman Mal Lodha, it is not fair to interrupt every day. You have given notice yesterday. You have told me about this. We have received it. I have to get the comments. I cannot dispose of the privilege motion like that.

JUSTICE GUMAN MAL LODHA : Very well.

MR. SPEAKER : Thank you very much. Normally when there is a Call Attention, we do not have a Zero Hour and today is Friday and Private Members Bills will be taken up. But today being the last day of the Session, I had promised hon. Members yesterday that there will be a Zero Hour. But Zero Hour will have to be concluded at 1 o'clock and there will be no lunch. From 1 o'clock, Government business will start.

Shri Ilyas Azmi, since I could not admit your Call Attention, I am giving you a chance during Zero Hour to raise the issue you want to raise.

Shri Nitish Bharadwaj, your Call Attention will be taken up at 1 o'clock.

[*Translation*]

SHRI ILIYAS AZMI (Shahbad) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am very thankful to you for giving me an opportunity to express my views on the dictatorship of vice-Chancellor of Aligarh Muslim University and the worsening situation arising thereby. I would like to draw the attention of the Government of India and this House through you towards this situation. The Vice-Chancellor of Aligarh Muslim University... (*Interruptions*)' even the Administrative Officer of the University since when he became the Vice Chancellor of the University, he is not even misutilising his post but even his attitude is very shameful. He moves openly with a revolver and threaten the students. It has happened many times and he punished the boys without any reason. In the night of 1st October he put to death one boy named Nadim, who was from Azamgarh. It happened only three furlongs away from that place. There was no reason behind it. He was put to death in that place. After that incident he lodged a false FIR. FIR was also lodged against the boys who were not even present in Aligarh and got them arrested. The false FIR was also lodged against, one boy named Furkan who was busy in election campaign with Shri D.P. Yadav. M.P. Shri D.P. Yadav also gave evidence that Shri Furkan was with him.

I would like to urge the Government that the whole matter may kindly be got investigated by CBI and Vice-Chancellor of the University may kindly be removed. He came on deputation from Kashmir for two years. So he may kindly be sent back after completing two years and should be removed from this post.

SHRIMATI SHEELA GAUTAM (Aligarh) : Sir, whatever has been stated just now by an Honble member is entirely wrong. Since his appointment as a Vice-Chancellor there, discipline is being maintained in the University and all such bad people have been expelled from the hostel. The University is now functioning properly. There is no cheating even in the competitions and nothing is going wrong. Whatsoever he has stated is wrong... (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : You have made your point. Please sit down.

[*Translation*]

SHRI MOHAMMAD ALI ASHRAF FATMI (Darbhanga) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am very grateful that you have given me an opportunity to speak. I had given notice on this issue many times but I did not get opportunity to express my views. I myself had been residing there for many

\* Not Recorded.