

12.35 hrs.

**Title:** Mr. Speaker disallowed the notice of question of privilege of Shri Priya Ranjan Dasmunsi alleging the Prime Minister misled the House on 1.05.2002 while intervening in the discussion on the motion regarding Gujarat situation.

**SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI (RAIGANJ):** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I gave a privilege notice against the hon. Prime Minister. When a privilege notice is given, it should be conveyed to the hon. Member concerned with a note whether it is allowed or disallowed. That is the tradition. When a privilege notice was given against the hon. Minister of Home Affairs, the hon. Minister himself, from the Ministry, conveyed to the hon. Member concerned about the status and it was disallowed. If it has been accepted, fair enough, you can say so; if not, I should have the privilege to know and I should be told on what grounds it was disallowed. This is the minimum a member could expect. I found from the book by Kaul and Shakder that this has always been the practice. Therefore, I would urge upon you to inform me of the status of the privilege notice. I should get to know whether it is allowed or disallowed. Whether it is right or wrong, the status of the notice should be provided to the Member concerned.

**MR. SPEAKER:** I have gone through the privilege notice given by Shri Priya Ranjan Dasmunsi and also I have received a reply from the hon. Prime Minister. I would like to give the ruling on the privilege notice right now.

Shri Priya Ranjan Dasmunsi gave a notice of question of privilege on 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2002 alleging that the Prime Minister had misled the House on 1<sup>st</sup> May, 2002 while intervening in the discussion on the motion regarding Gujarat situation. I had called for the comments of the Prime Minister on the notice of Shri Dasmunsi which have since been received.

Shri Dasmunsi had stated in his notice that the Prime Minister, while seeking to clarify misgivings about certain portions of a public speech made by him at Goa, stated on the floor of the House and I quote: "Whatever I said about Islam is as follows— Wherever such Muslims live, they tend not to live in co-existence with others, not to mingle with others; instead of propagating their ideas in a peaceful manner, they want to spread their faith by resorting to terror and threats". Shri Dasmunsi contended that in the video recording of the speech of the Prime Minister made by him at Goa, the word "such" had not been used before the word "Muslims" and by this interpolation an attempt was made to alter the meaning of the sentence. Shri Dasmunsi alleged that this amounted to misleading the House by the hon. Prime Minister.

The Prime Minister, while admitting that the video tape of his speech made at Goa does not contain the word "such", has stated that "no one who reads my entire speech, and takes note of the tribute I have paid to the tolerant and compassionate teachings of Islam, can be in any doubt that my reference in the second paragraph is only to followers of the militant Islam." A clarificatory note/statement to this effect was issued by the Prime Minister on 14<sup>th</sup> April, 2002 and the Prime Minister's Office also released the entire text of his speech to the media with necessary correction. The Prime Minister has also stated that "It is this corrected version from which I read out the relevant paragraphs while speaking on the Gujarat situation in the early hours of May 1, 2002."

I am inclined to accept the clarification given by the Prime Minister. No question of privilege is, therefore, involved in the matter. The notice of Shri Dasmunsi is disallowed.

-----