

Title:Regarding trial of accused in the Babri Masjid Demolition case.

1204 hours

(At this stage, Shri Rashid Alvi and some other hon. Members came and sat/stood on the floor near the Table.)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : पहले आप अपनी जगह पर जाइए। पहले आप बैठ जाइये।

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, the House will take up 'Zero Hour'. Shri Kodikunnil Suresh.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Kodikunnil Suresh.

... (Interruptions)

१२.०५ बजे

(इस समय श्री राशिद अल्वी तथा कुछ अन्य माननीय सदस्य अपने-अपने स्थानों पर वापस चले गए।)

... (Interruptions)

कुंवर अखिलेश सिंह (महाराजगंज, उ.प्र.) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, सरकार सही जवाब देने से कतरा रही है।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go to your seat. Coming to the Well of the House is not correct. Please go to your seat.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Member, you are disturbing the House. Please go to your seat. You can speak from your seat, not from here.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Kodikunnil Suresh.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Kodikunnil Suresh says.

(Interruptions) ... (Not recorded)

SHRI P.H. PANDIYAN (TIRUNELVELI): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Pandian, this is 'Zero Hour'. Please understand that there is no point of order during 'Zero Hour'.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (BOLPUR): Mr. Speaker, Sir, 6th December is one of the blackest days of Indian history.

(Interruptions) On that day in 1992, an important place of worship was deliberately demolished with the help and assistance of the then ruling political party and the Government of Uttar Pradesh in violation of the Supreme Court order. Therefore, I am sure that all the right minded sections of this House will join me in condemning that incident. (Interruptions)

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गौते (रत्नागिरि) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय पर बोलना चाहता हूँ।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I have allowed Shri Somnath Chatterjee. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, once again, we condemn that incident and we also condemn the Government's tardiness, if not complicity, in keeping this issue alive, to try to take political benefit out of it. We condemn this action on the part of the Government. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except what Shri Kodikunnil Suresh says.

(Interruptions) *

MR. SPEAKER: I have called Shri Kodikunnil Suresh. Shri Dasmunsi, I will allow you later. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Kodikunnil Suresh, do you want to make your submission?

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I have not permitted. Please understand that.

... (Interruptions)

* Not Recorded.

1210 hours

(At this stage, Shri Rashid Alvi and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

MR. SPEAKER: I have not permitted. Members must also know it.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go to your seats first.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, coming to the Well is not a good thing. Please go to your seats.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: What is this?

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप पहले अपनी सीटों पर जाइये।

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions) *

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please go to your seats first.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not the way.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you. Please go to your seat.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जायें।

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go to your seat, madam.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am appealing to you. ... (Interruptions)

* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: I have also noted it.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not the way.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप पहले बैठ जाइये, आपको बाद में चांस दूंगा।

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please go to your seats first.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You can present your views from your seats.

... (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : पहले आप बैठ जाइए।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I am appealing to you, please go to your seats.

... (Interruptions)

1215 hours

(At this stage, Shri Rashid Alvi and some other hon. Members went back to their seats.)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats, first.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not the proper way to speak. Please go back to your seats first.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You can raise the issue from your seat itself. Please go to your seats.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats.

... (Interruptions)

1216 hours

(At this stage, Shri Rashid Alvi, Kunwar Akhilesh Singh and some other hon. Members came and sat on the floor near the Table.)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2 p.m.

1216 hours

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.

1402 hours

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at two minutes

past Fourteen of the Clock.

(Mr. Speaker in the Chair)

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (MAYILADUTURAI): Sir, Shri Banatwalla's question has not been answered by the Home Minister. ... (Interruptions) We want to have a response from the Home Minister to the question raised by Shri Banatwalla. We wish to know whether the Government has got at least four cases in the Babri Masjid issue and whether we are going to have a Government run by people, who stand indicted in a court of law. The question before this House is, whether on the day of the demolition of the Babri Masjid, we can trust the Government, which is full of accused in that case, to prosecute the case properly. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI P.H. PANDIYAN (TIRUNELVELI): Sir, there is no provision ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Pandian, please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Keeping in mind that it is a serious subject, if the hon. Members want, I can allow one Member from each party to say something about the seriousness of this subject. Today we have a very lengthy legislative business. Please understand it.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA (GUNA): Sir, a question was pointedly asked by Shri Banatwalla. We would like to have a response from the Home Minister as to what is happening about the case that is taking place in the trial court. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Dasmunsi, do you want to say something on this?

... (Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the question asked by the hon. Member was not replied to by the Home Minister. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, I will allow you later. Now, Shri Dasmunsi.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI (RAIGANJ): Mr. Speaker, Sir, you yourself, with the Members of the House, took a stand to celebrate and to remember the Fiftieth Anniversary of the Republic.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, the very preamble of the Constitution, the essence of the secular fabric of the Constitution had been assaulted on the 6th December, 1992. Everybody knows about it. Now, the most important point is this.

आडवाणी जी से मैं सम्मानपूर्वक कहना चाहता हूँ। आडवाणी जी ने खुद एक मिसाल भारतीय लोकतंत्र में पेश की। जब हवाला का इश्यू उठा तो आडवाणी जी ने खुद कहा कि जब तक अदालत इसका फ़ैसला नहीं करती, तब तक मैं सदन में नहीं जाऊंगा और कोई जिम्मेदारी नहीं लूंगा।

अध्यक्ष महोदय, आज मैं एक अत्यन्त महत्वपूर्ण मसले को उठा रहा हूँ कि बाबरी मस्जिद केस में हमारी सरकार के चार मंत्रियों के नाम एक्यूज्ड की लिस्ट में आ गए हैं और इसके बाद बेल होकर उनको एपीरिअंस के लिए स्ट्रेट में मिला है, लेकिन स्ट्रेट को बैकट कराने के लिए सी.बी.आई. कुछ नहीं कर रही है। केन्द्र में मंत्री के पद पर वे सत्ता में बैठे हैं, यू.पी. में सत्ता पक्ष की सरकार है और वे लोग सत्ता में बैठे हैं जो एक्यूज्ड की लिस्ट में हैं। मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि देश की जनता को कैसे यह विश्वास आएगा कि इस मसले पर सही रूप में विचार हो पाएगा? क्योंकि एक्यूज्ड होने के बावजूद जब तक हम कुरसी लेकर सत्ता में बैठे हैं, तो क्या यह डेमोक्रेटिक प्रोप्रायटी है और क्या यह पार्लिटिकल मारोलेटो है?

महोदय, यह सवाल किसी व्यक्ति के खिलाफ नहीं है बल्कि यह सवाल इंस्टीट्यूशनल सवाल है। इसके ऊपर सरकार ने कोई कदम नहीं उठाया जिससे स्ट्रेट बैकट हो सके। इससे ऐसा लगता है कि सी.बी.आई. के साथ सरकार की कुछ मिलीभगत है ताकि प्रासीक्यूशन आगे नहीं बढ़े और कोई कार्रवाई न हो पाए।

This is a very serious thing. Therefore, I demand that all steps should be taken to ensure the fairness of the trial. Till the trial is not over, not disposed of by the court, those who are accused, those who figure in the list and who are sitting Ministers should not occupy the office. You cannot bring people like Shri Kalyan Singh and Shri Sakshi Maharaj here because they are not Members of the House. That is my fair submission.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, today is the black day in the history of our country when in the year 1992, on 6th December, Babri Masjid was demolished by Vishwa Hindu Parishad, Rashtriya Swayamsewak Sangh, Shiv Sainees and hoodlums, Sangh Parivar and also BJP in the presence of BJP leadership.

SHRI PRAKASH MANI TRIPATHI : Under what provision is this debate going on?

MR. SPEAKER: You please sit down.

SHRI PRAKASH MANI TRIPATHI : Under what provision is this debate going on?

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Member, please take your seat.

SHRI PRAKASH MANI TRIPATHI : Please pardon me, I just want a clarification. Under what provision is this debate going on? (Interruptions)

श्री श्याम बिहारी मिश्र (बिल्हौर) : मान्यवर अध्यक्ष महोदय, यहां जो चर्चा हो रही है वह किस प्रस्ताव या किन नियमों के तहत हो रही है।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री मनोज सिन्हा (गालीपुर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह चर्चा किस नियम के तहत हो रही है ?

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इसकी अनुमति मंने दी है। कृपया आप बैठिए।

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : On the 6th December, 1992, they have not only demolished the Babri Masjid but they have also demolished the secular fabric of our country. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I allowed them. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You please take your seat.

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO (KALAHANDI): (Interruptions) When the matter is sub judice, can it be discussed in the House? (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: We are not discussing it. Please take your seat.

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO : We are all discussing it indirectly. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is a submission please.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You will also get chance, please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : After demolition of Babri Masjid, communal riots took place in our country. Thousands of people were killed because of communal riots..(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is not discussion, but it is submission. Please take your seat.

प्रो. रासा सिंह रावत (अजमेर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, ये लोग ऐसा करके सदन का समय बर्बाद कर रहे हैं और गढ़े मुर्दे उखाड़ने का प्रयास कर रहे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record except Shri Basu Deb Acharia's speech.

(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Now, a large number of BJP leaders are accused in the Babri Masjid demolition case.... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Shri Mulayam Singh Yadav is here. When he was the Chief Minister of Uttar Pradesh, some conspiracy was hatched by the BJP but because of him, Babri Masjid could not be demolished by them.

When Shri Kalyan Singh became the Chief Minister of Uttar Pradesh, they hatched a conspiracy and the Babri Masjid was demolished. (Interruptions).

My question is that there are four members of the Cabinet who are accused in the Babri Masjid demolition case. We want to know as to who are these members of the Cabinet, who are accused and in whose presence the Babri Masjid was demolished. (Interruptions).

प्रो. रासा सिंह रावत : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह सदन का समय बर्बाद कर रहे हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री पवन कुमार बंसल (चंडीगढ़) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, क्या ये बार-बार खड़े होते रहेंगे?

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat. I have allowed Shri Basu Deb Acharia. Please take your seat.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, the demolition of the Babri Masjid is a criminal case. It is a criminal offence. (Interruptions).

अध्यक्ष महोदय : पहले आप बैठ जाइये।

... (व्यवधान)

प्रो. रासा सिंह रावत : ये देश की साम्प्रदायिक एकता में बाधा पहुंचाने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : We want to know from the Government whether a person, who is an accused for criminal offence, can continue as a member of the Cabinet or not. (Interruptions). We want to know who are these members of the Cabinet who are accused in the Babri Masjid demolition case. We want to know from the Government whether a person who is an accused in a criminal case can continue or not. (Interruptions). We want to have a clarification from the Government on this. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: I have called Shri Anant Gangaram Geete.

... (Interruptions)

कुंवर अखिलेश सिंह (महारानगंज, उ.प्र.) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, ये बाबरी मस्जिद गिराने के दोषी हैं

... (व्यवधान)

इसलिए सच्चाई को सामने नहीं आने देना चाहते। ... (व्यवधान)">

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गीते (रत्नागिरि) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब यह बोल रहे थे तब हम सुन रहे थे।

... (व्यवधान)

अब आप हमें सुनने की कोशिश करिये।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL (HOOGLY): Sir, I am on a point of order. (Interruptions). Before he speaks, I have a right to speak as I am on a point of order. I am quoting rule 376. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Rupchand Pal, what is your point of order?

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL (HOOGLY): Please look at rule 50 in respect of Supplementary Questions. One hon. Member has asked a Supplementary Question. I will quote rule 50 (2):

"A supplementary question shall be held out of order by the Speaker, if in his opinion:

(i) it does not arise from the main question."

But the Supplementary Question, to my mind, was very much...(Interruptions).

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) B.C. KHANDURI (GARHWAL): Under this point of order are we questioning the Speaker's ruling? He is questioning the Speaker's ruling. (Interruptions). How can we reply to that?

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : Sir, you have not ruled it out. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: On a point of order, he is quoting some rule. I can clarify it.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : Sir, the hon. Minister has refused to reply to the question. The hon. Minister himself cannot rule it out in this manner and refuse to reply. Has he any right not to reply to any relevant Supplementary Question, particularly on this day of 6th December, on which day, seven years ago, a very heinous crime had taken place when a place of worship was demolished? (Interruptions).

Now, four of the offenders are in the Cabinet. They were involved in the crime. This Government is protecting the offenders.

One hon. Member has asked a question. You have not ruled it out. The hon. Minister has refused to reply. (Interruptions). He is bound to reply. He has to reply to this question. (Interruptions). You have not ruled it out. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Rupchand Pal, in the morning it was already decided. I have disallowed the Supplementary Question because it does not arise from the main question. Please understand it. You are again quoting the rule.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order. It has already been replied to.

... (Interruptions)

">MR. SPEAKER: I have called Shri Geete.

श्री बसुदेव आचार्य : आप क्या बोलेंगे?

... (व्यवधान)
आप तो उसके लिए जिम्मेवार हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गीते : आप सुनिये कि मैं क्या बोल रहा हूँ।

... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जाइये। मैंने इन्हें बोलने के लिए बुलाया है।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गीते : अध्यक्ष महोदय, बाबर आक्रामक था जिसने इस देश पर, हिन्दुस्तान पर आक्रमण किया था।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री बसुदेव आचार्य : अध्यक्ष महोदय, क्या यह चर्चा हो रही है?

... (व्यवधान)

... (व्यवधान)

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गीते : अध्यक्ष जी, ये लोग अशान्ति फैलाना चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

1415 hrs.

(इस समय कुंवर अखिलेश कुमार सिंह तथा कुछ अन्य माननीय सदस्य सभा पटल के निकट खड़े हो गए।)

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गीते : जो ढाँचा गिराया गया है, वह जन-आन्दोलन था। ... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I request the hon. Members to please go to their seats.

श्री अनन्त गंगाराम गीते : मिट्टी का ढांचा गिराया गया, उसके लिए हम शोक मना रहे हैं लेकिन इस देश के जो हजारों युवक मारे गए हैं, उनके लिए हम शोक व्यक्त नहीं कर रहे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, please go to your seats. The entire nation is watching you.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : The entire nation is watching as to how the Members are behaving. Please understand that.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : The nation is watching you. Please go to your seats.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : How can we run the House in this way? Please understand.

... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : The House is adjourned to meet again at 4 p.m.

1420 hours

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till

Sixteen of the Clock.

1600 hrs.

लोक सभा १६०० बजे पर पुनः समवेत हुई।

(डॉ. लक्ष्मीनारायण पाण्डेय, सभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए।)

सभापति महोदय : हम नियम ३७७ को कार्यवाही प्रारम्भ कर रहे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You can raise your issue after matters under Rule 377.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: After matters under Rule 377, you can raise your issue.

... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Matters under Rule 377 may be treated as laid on the Table.