

LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Thursday, August 7, 2003/Sravana 16, 1925 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the Clock

(MR. SPEAKER in the Chair)

Title: Regarding alleged refusal by the Government to make available report of the Central Vigilance Commission on certain defence deals to the Public Accounts Committee.

RE: SUSPENSION OF QUESTION HOUR

(Interruptions)

श्री रामजी लाल सुमन (फिरोजाबाद) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, सरकारी कर्मचारियों की हड़ताल पर सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने जो रोक लगाई है, वह संविधान की भावना के विपरीत है। (व्यवधान) यह लोकतंत्र की हत्या है। (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Friends, I have received notices for suspension of the Question Hour from several Members on different issues. The important issues quoted in the notices for the suspension of the Question Hour and Adjournment Motions are: the Supreme Court order banning strikes, the PAC Report, the Report on the *Pradhan Mantri Grameen Sadak Yojana*, etc. These are some of the issues on which several Members have given notices to me.

You are all aware that today we have decided to take up the Constitution Amendments, and it has also been decided in the Business Advisory Committee that there would not be any 'Zero Hour' today. At 12 o'clock itself, we are going to take up these Constitution Amendments. In the meantime, since I have received notices for suspension of the Question Hour.

(Interruptions)

श्री चन्द्रनाथ सिंह (मछलीशहर) : सबसे पहले हमारा नोटिस है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मेरे पास इनका भी नोटिस है। पी.ए.सी. का जो विाय है और प्रश्न काल स्थगित करने के जो नोटिस हैं, मैं एक के बाद एक लेने की बात कह रहा हूँ।

श्री चन्द्रनाथ सिंह : हमारा नोटिस पहले नम्बर पर है। (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप लोग जानते हैं कि मैं एक मिनट में सब डिसपोज आफ कर सकता हूँ, लेकिन जो पी.ए.सी. का विाय है, यह बड़ा महत्वपूर्ण विाय है।

(व्यवधान)

श्री चन्द्रनाथ सिंह : हमारा विाय भी बड़ा महत्वपूर्ण है और वह नम्बर एक पर है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यहां नम्बर का प्रश्न नहीं है। मैं एक के बाद एक सदस्य को उसके नोटिस पर बोलने का मौका दे सकता हूँ। अभी मैं इनको बोलने को कह रहा हूँ।

श्री चन्द्रनाथ सिंह : इसके बाद हमारा नम्बर आएगा।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह विाय पूरा होने के बाद मैं आपको भी सुनूंगा।

SHRI N.N. KRISHNADAS (PALGHAT): judgment given by the Supreme Court is a disastrous judgment.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): It is an unprecedented one. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : How can they take away the rights of the Government Employees? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (MIRYALGUDA): Mr. Speaker, Sir, we are today faced with an anomalous and unprecedented situation.

There are two functions of Parliament: One is law-making, the other is accountability. It is the right and duty of Parliament to call the Executive to account.

Sir, under Rule 308, the Public Accounts Committee is constituted, and it is the function of the PAC to examine the accounts. Let me read the Rule.

"There shall be a Committee on Public Accounts for the examination of accounts showing the appropriation of sums granted by the House for the expenditure of the Government of India, the annual finance accounts of the Government of India and such other accounts laid before the House."

Rule 308 (2) refers to the role that the PAC has to perform in the light of the paras produced by the Comptroller and Auditor General.

There is only one Committee, that is the Public Accounts Committee, which is to pronounce a judgement on the paras of the Comptroller and Auditor General. It is only the Public Accounts Committee which is competent to modify, agree with or reject even the recommendations or conclusions of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India. That Public Accounts Committee has been denied key documents. I bring to your notice that the Public Accounts Committee in its report stated that documents were made available to a retired journalist even before they were made available to the Public Accounts Committee. The Public Accounts Committee report says - I do not know what happened there in the Committee - 'The Committee unanimously felt that the Defence Minister Mr. George Fernandes was guilty of breach of privilege.' (*Interruptions*)

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष जी, यह आरोप बेसलैस है।(व्यवधान)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : This was a recommendation made unanimously by the Public Accounts Committee to you, Sir. I am not saying anything new. (*Interruptions*)

श्री कांतिलाल मूरिया (झाबुआ) : ये देश को बर्बाद करने वाले हैं।(व्यवधान)

श्री प्रमुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार) : अध्यक्ष जी, श्री जयपाल रेड्डी जी गैर-जिम्मेदाराना भाषा का प्रयोग कर रहे हैं। (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not going into the report. I just want to know why he wants the Question Hour to be suspended.

(*Interruptions*)

श्री कीर्ति झा आज्ञाद (दरभंगा) : ये हाउस को गुमराह कर रहे हैं।(व्यवधान)

श्री शीशराम सिंह रवि (बिजनौर) : अध्यक्ष जी, ये विषय से हटकर बात कर रहे हैं। (व्यवधान)

आप विषय पर बात क्यों नहीं करते हैं।(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I only want to know from Shri Jaipal Reddy as to why he desires that the Question Hour should be suspended.

(*Interruptions*)

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : I would like to say something on this.

MR. SPEAKER: Do you want to raise a point of order?

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : No, I want to say something.

MR. SPEAKER: Do you want to raise a point of order?

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Yes.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL (LATUR): Unless you suspend the Question Hour, there cannot be a point of order. He should know the rules.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Sir, I am not saying anything unparliamentary. I am not saying anything which is not true to the report. I am trying to interpret the report to the best of my light, I cannot do it according to their light. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Malhotra, you will be allowed to raise your point of order. But let him complete his point first.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: We have already decided that the Question Hour will be given priority. I want to go to the Question Hour as early as possible. I have permitted them to make a brief statement so that I can understand why they want the Question Hour to be suspended.

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, kindly give me time after him. I would like to say something on that.

DR. M.V.V.S. MURTHI (VISAKHAPATNAM): Sir, how can he speak like that about the Public Accounts Committee? He cannot give a judgement on behalf of the Public Accounts Committee. We are members of that Committee.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Sir, this was the report on the paras raised by the Comptroller and Auditor General, which was laid on the Table of this House. It is the duty of the Public Accounts Committee to scrutinise those paras. The Committee is assisted by the Comptroller and Auditor General. The Comptroller and Auditor General stated, according to the report, 'Whereas the observations of the Comptroller and Auditor General have been made public, '

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, if it is a debate, I would like to say something.

MR. SPEAKER: After he finishes, you can raise your point of order. I will permit you.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Sir, I am only making my submission on the basis of the report of the Public Accounts Committee. The report says that the Comptroller and Auditor General, who is an eminent Constitutional authority, himself stated (*Interruptions*)

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : The report does not say that. The report only talks about the CVC, not the C&AG.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Let me have my say. (*Interruptions*) The Comptroller and Auditor General himself stated that the situation is anomalous because the observations of the Comptroller and Auditor General have been made public while the report of the Central Vigilance Commissioner has not been made public. (*Interruptions*) The Comptroller and Auditor General (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I can understand that you all are agitating on the issue because we have to go to the Question Hour. I am trying to go to the Question Hour as quickly as possible. Please sit down.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Sir, the point I am making is that the CVC Report was not made available even to the Comptroller and Auditor General. It was denied to the Public Accounts Committee. The Public Accounts Committee, for the first time in the history of independent India, made a Report to the House that it is unable to submit a Report because of the refusal of the Government (*Interruptions*) The situation is absolutely unprecedented. It has led to a Constitutional deadlock. It has led to a Parliamentary stalemate.

Therefore, the House should discuss this and nothing else. (*Interruptions*) Therefore, the Question hour should be suspended.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, Dr. Vijay Kumar Malhotra, what is your point of order?

(*Interruptions*)/center>

MR. SPEAKER: The hon. Member has not told me what his point of order is. Unless I listen to his point of order, how can I give my ruling?

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI A.C. JOS (TRICHUR): Sir, under what rule he is raising his point of order? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI (RAIGANJ): His point of order must be under some rule. He must quote the rule (*Interruptions*)

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा पाइंट आफ आर्डर यह है कि पीएसी की रिपोर्ट कल सदन में रखी गई थी। पीएसी की रिपोर्ट के बाद (व्यवधान)
Sir, they must listen to me (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपका भी कुछ पाइंट हो सकता है और रूलिंग पार्टी का भी कुछ पाइंट हो सकता है और उसको सुनना चाहिए। Then, I will decide as to whether the Question Hour can be suspended or not.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I had permitted you to speak on this, and you have spoken. Now, you must also allow him to speak. Then, I want to listen to Shri Somnath Chatterjee also.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, you did not give permission to Shri S. Jaipal Reddy to speak on anything. You allowed him to speak because he gave a notice of a Motion of Adjournment and suspension of Question Hour. So, we want to know under what rule Dr. Malhotra is raising his point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI A.C. JOS : Under what rule he is raising his point of order, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please sit down. I have not allowed you to speak.

(*Interruptions*)

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : महोदय, पीएसी की रिपोर्ट को बाद में अखबारों और टीवी में, जो रिपोर्ट पीएसी ने नहीं दी, हाउस में नहीं आई, पीएसी ने नहीं दी, उसको बाद में बताया गया कि पीएसी की रिपोर्ट है। उसी रिपोर्ट के बारे में श्री जयपाल रेड्डी जी कह रहे हैं। पीएसी की रिपोर्ट में सिर्फ इतना है कि सीवीसी ने पेपर हमको नहीं दिखाए, इसलिए हम यहां पेश नहीं कर रहे हैं। जो सीएंडएजी ने कहा है, वह पीएसी की तरफ से डाल रहे हैं। आपको एक मैम्बर ने लिख कर दिया है(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: The Members of both the parties must try to understand as to what the other party has to say. Let me make it clear.

(Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (CHANDIGARH): He must specify the rule *(Interruptions)*

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : महोदय, कल आपको मैम्बर्स ने लिख कर दिया है कि रिपोर्ट गलत पेश की जा रही है। आपने कहा कि प्रिवलेज का सवाल उठाइए। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि मैजोरिटी-ऑफ-दि-मैम्बर्स-ऑफ-पीएसी ने इस रिपोर्ट को जाली बताया है, गलत बताया है, जो रिपोर्ट यहां पेश की गई है। *(व्यवधान)*

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, it is an insult of Parliament *(Interruptions)* He should withdraw these words. How can a Report be *jaali?* *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please resume your seats.

(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री जयपाल रेड्डी जी उसी पाइंट के बारे में बता रहे हैं। उन्होंने उसी पाइंट के बारे में बताया है, जो पाइंट सदन के सामने हैं।

(व्यवधान)

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : It is not a Report *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Dr. Malhotra, you can make your statement as to why this House should not be suspended.

(Interruptions)

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इनके खिलाफ प्रिवलेज का सवाल है क्योंकि इन्होंने हाउस की मर्यादा को भंग किया है। *(व्यवधान)* जो सीवीसी की रिपोर्ट आई जिसे 1999 में रखा था, उन्होंने इसे आपरेशन विजय के साथ जोड़ दिया। Sir, this is highly improper. हमने इनके खिलाफ जो प्रिवलेज का वक्चन आपके सामने रखा है, आप उस पर रूलिंग दीजिए। *(व्यवधान)*

MR. SPEAKER: I do not accept the point of order raised by Dr. Vijay Kumar Malhotra. Now, Shri Somnath Chatterjee.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. Let me know what Shri Somnath Chatterjee has to say.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Somnath Chatterjee's name is here; he wants to speak as to why the Question Hour should be suspended. Please allow him to speak. Both the Opposition and the Ruling Party must allow the Members of the other Party to speak.

(Interruptions)

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : जब उस तरफ से कोई बोलता है तो हमें बैठने के लिए कहा जाता है लेकिन जब हम बोलते हैं तो ये सब खड़े हो जाते हैं। यह कौन सा तरीका है? *(व्यवधान)*

MR. SPEAKER: Dr. Vijay Kumar Malhotra, when they obstructed you while you were speaking, I said that you must be allowed to speak. Now, when Shri Somnath Chatterjee is speaking, he should also be allowed to speak.

(Interruptions)

श्री प्रमुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, हम लोगों की बात भी सुनी जाए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय: क्या आपका प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है?

(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय: मैं इनकी बात सुनने के बाद आपको बोलने का मौका दूंगा।

(व्यवधान)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (BOLPUR): I will not take a long time. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Somnath Chatterjee, I have permitted you; you may speak.

(Interruptions)

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : हम बैठ जाएंगे लेकिन इनको कौन बिठाएगा? जब मैं बोल रहा था तो आपने इनको क्यों नहीं बिठाया? (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please wait for a minute. Let me make the position clear. I would request the Opposition Members that whenever Members from the Ruling Party speak, they should not obstruct them. I would also request the Ruling Party Members that whenever the Members from the Opposition speak, they should also be allowed to speak. Now, Shri Somnath Chatterjee. I am making this request to both the Parties.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, I was sitting quietly, for getting a chance from you. I never stood up.

(Interruptions)

श्री विष्णु पद राय (अंडमान और निकोबार द्वीप समूह) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, पहले हमारी बात सुननी पड़ेगी और उसके बाद यह बोलेंगे। (व्यवधान)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : How can we cooperate with the Government? How can the business of this House run? How can this House run? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : We know how to stop them. I will disclose everything what you did. Do not worry. *(Interruptions)*

श्री प्रमुनाथ सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा पाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपका व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। मैं उत्तर देने के लिये खड़ा हुआ हूँ। आपने जो प्रश्न किया है, मैं उसका उत्तर देना चाहता हूँ।

(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I have taken Notices of Suspension of Question Hour and Adjournment Motion together. Shri Somnath Chatterjee has given a notice of Adjournment Motion and, therefore, I have permitted him to speak.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It has also been the practice to allow the Leader of a political party to speak.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : We have agreed to pass the Constitution (Amendment) Bills. The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs had rung me up and I have said that we shall fully cooperate with the Government. *(Interruptions)* Now, I am not allowed to speak. Leader of one of the major Opposition parties is not getting a hearing. *(Interruptions)* Who will conduct this House? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : We will not cooperate with the Government in conducting any business of the House. Let the Government decide. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Let the country know that to suppress their corrupt practices, they are doing it deliberately. *(Interruptions)*

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं सभी मैम्बर्स से रिक्वैस्ट करता हूँ। आप सुनिये, मैं खड़ा हूँ, प्लीज सिट डाउन।

(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: The House can be conducted properly provided all sections of the House allow other Members to speak. I would request the Opposition parties that whenever I permit..

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: जब आप लोग स्पीकर को नहीं बोलने देंगे तो अन्य मैम्बर्स को कैसे बोलने देंगे? कृपया बैठिये। Let me complete what I want to say.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not going to tolerate this type of behaviour. Whenever hon. Members from the ruling party want to speak, they should be allowed to speak.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am trying to bring the House to order.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am making a statement.

(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या आप स्पीकर को नहीं बोलने देंगे?

(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You do not want the Speaker also to speak. You are still speaking when I am standing here. What does it mean?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not the way. Members are not even prepared to listen to the simple point that I want to make.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I expect that the entire House must run in a very excellent manner. You are all aware that there are very important Constitution (Amendment) Bills to be taken up at 1200 noon. The Opposition parties had said that they have no objection to it. The ruling party must also realise that when the Opposition has said that they will cooperate with the Government, they should allow the Opposition Members to speak. Similarly, when the ruling party Members speak, Opposition should allow them also to speak.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY (CALCUTTA NORTH WEST): You should then allow Shri Vijay Malhotra to speak first. *(Interruptions)*

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किस को परमिशन देनी है और किस को नहीं देनी है, यह मैं तय करूंगा, आप तय नहीं करेंगे। मैं समझता हूँ कि यह इम्पार्टेंट विषय जरूर है। शायद यह विषय रिजेक्ट या स्वीकृत करना नियम के अनुसार होगा लेकिन जब लोग चाहते हैं कि यह विषय क्वेश्चन ऑवर के पहले लेना चाहिये तो मुझे उन लोगों से पूछना पड़ता है कि आप क्यों सोचते हैं कि यह अर्जेंट है। वे बोल रहे हैं कि उसके बाद श्री मलहोत्रा बोलने के लिये खड़े रहे लेकिन उन्हें बोलने नहीं दिया गया और व्यवधान पैदा किया। मैंने उनसे विनती की है

(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Hereafter, please keep quiet. I want the issue to be heard by the Opposition, so also by the ruling party. If a ruling party Member starts speaking and the Members from the Opposition start objecting, then it will become very difficult. Let us go ahead as per the rules and listen to Shri Somnath Chatterjee.

(Interruptions)

श्री प्रमुनाथ सिंह : अध्यक्ष जी, मेरा नोटिस है।

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you also to speak.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am extremely thankful to you *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY : Sir, let Dr. Malhotra finish his submission first. *(Interruptions)*

डॉ. जसवन्त सिंह यादव (अलवर) : सर, श्री विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा जी को बोलने दिया जाए, उन्हें पहले बोलने नहीं दिया गया। *(व्यवधान)*

अध्यक्ष महोदय : पहले मैं उन्हें बोलने का मौका दे रहा हूँ, उसके बाद आपको मौका देने का प्रश्न आयेगा। मैं प्रमुनाथ सिंह जी को भी मौका दूंगा, पहले जरा उन्हें सुनिये।

SHRI KIRTI JHA AZAD : उनके पहले मल्होत्रा साहब बोलें, पूरे हाउस को पता लगना चाहिए कि उस रिपोर्ट में क्या है। *(व्यवधान)* Nobody listened to him. Let him finish first *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Now, that is past. You talk about future.

श्री कीर्ति झा आज़ाद : या फिर उनके बाद मल्होत्रा साहब बोलें। अगर पी.ए.सी. के मੈम्बर ने उस रिपोर्ट की खिलाफत की है तो पूरे हाउस को उसके बारे में पता लगाना चाहिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : कीर्ति आजाद जो बात हो गई, उसे देखने के बाद मैंने कहा है। इसके बाद मैं प्रभुनाथ सिंह जी को बोलने का मौका देने वाला हूँ। उसके बाद देखेंगे।(व्यवधान)

SHRI KAMAL NATH (CHHINDWARA): Sir, you should adjourn the House for the behaviour of the Ruling Party.
(Interruptions).

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : They are disturbing the House and all the blame would come to the Opposition
(Interruptions)

SHRI KAMAL NATH : They are doing all this only to cover up the huge fraud committed on the nation.(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is the responsibility of both the Opposition Parties and the Ruling Party to see that the business of the House is conducted properly. I would earnestly and lastly request that I want to go ahead with the business. I want to complete the business of the day which is important for the country. If all of you cooperate, then only it is possible.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, I am extremely thankful to you. Primarily there are two reasons why we wanted to raise this issue. These are very important issues. This is the first time when a Committee like Public Accounts Committee of Parliament of India has been treated in a manner that it cannot function. An attitude has been taken by the Government which makes it impossible for the PAC which has a statutory obligation to look into the Government spending to discharge its duties and functions. It is because of the deliberate and obstructive attitude taken by the Government.

Secondly, the issue before the PAC was of monumental corruption. Therefore, an attempt is being made to cover up corruption in this country (Interruptions)

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, I was not allowed to complete my submission. Now he is going into all those things. (Interruptions)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (CALCUTTA SOUTH): Sir, please allow me also to speak (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: If you raise a point of order, you will be allowed to speak.

(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बीच में मत बोलिये। मैं अन्य मੈम्बर्स को बोलने का मौका देने के लिए तैयार हूँ। If Kumari Mamata Banerjee wants to speak, after Shri Prabhunath Singh, she could also speak. But let me conduct the business properly. We are not interested only in conducting the Question Hour. We want to conduct the business for the whole day. If all the parties want it, then it can be done. If the parties do not want it, well, nothing can be done. If we are responsible to the people of India, then let us do some business in the House.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, our complaint is that inspite of it being a unanimous report of 22 Members, of which, 14 Members belong to the ruling Alliance. (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बीच में मत बोलिये। मैं अन्य मੈम्बर्स को बोलने का मौका देने के लिए तैयार हूँ। बीच में बोलने की इजाजत नहीं है।

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not agree with him, you can always dispute that afterwards.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, we find from the Report that the issue came up before the PAC itself and the issue was whether CVC Report should be given or not. Then the Committee decided that the matter should be referred to the hon. Speaker. The matter was referred to the hon. Speaker by the previous Chairman, and after the previous Chairman, the new Chairman also approached the hon. Speaker. Sir, in your wisdom, you directed that the views of the Members of the PAC be ascertained and you be apprised accordingly.

On the basis of this, it was unanimously decided by the Members of the PAC (Interruptions) I am reading it from the Report. (Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : I demand that all the Minutes and evidence of the Committee be laid on the Table of the House. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down, no cross talks will be permitted.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : I am not a Member of PAC. Sir, the Report of PAC says:

"On the question of CVC Report on defence deals, the Committee resolved unanimously that the Report should be made available to them by the Minister of Defence in the context of examination of CAG's Report on review of procurement for Operation Vijay of Army, which deals with the defence procurements. Then the Committee unanimously resolved that the matter regarding possible breach of privilege also amounting to interference in the functioning of the Committee by the Defence Minister be brought to the notice of the hon. Speaker for examination by the Privileges Committee. Therefore, there was no difference of opinion in the Committee that it was obligatory on the Defence Ministry to provide "

(Interruptions)

What is happening, Sir? I cannot read the Report. *(Interruptions)*

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Other Members are also waiting to speak, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : A new type of functioning is there. Why did they not give the Minutes of Dissent? They were in the majority also. This is a strange thing. Therefore, we are saying that this is a deliberate attack on the Parliament's functioning, and of parliamentary democracy because constitutional and statutory bodies are under attack from them. We are raising it everyday. Election Commission, NHRC and CBI are being abused and misused. It is happening everywhere. CAG has been castigated by a person who is nobody in the Government. This is the whole functioning of the Parliament. One of the basic principles of a parliamentary democracy is accountability of the Council of Ministers to the House of People. The House of People is the sole repository of the accountability of the Government so far as expenditure is concerned. Taxes are realised from the people, and the people's representatives have no authority to look into this. Therefore, this is a matter where it was the bounden duty of the Prime Minister to come here today and explain the position. Why is he keeping himself away? Why does the Prime Minister not come? Therefore, we demand for an Adjournment Motion, and that the matter be discussed.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I have permitted Shri Prabhunath Singh to speak. He is on a Point of Order. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

11.33 hrs

(At this stage, Shri Kantilal Bhuria and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

MR. SPEAKER: He is on a Point of Order. Please listen to him. He is a Member of this House, therefore, he has a right to raise a Point of Order. I have permitted him to raise a Point of Order.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Slogans will not be recorded. Nothing should be shown on TV. TV telecast should be stopped.

*(Interruptions) **

MR SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned till Twelve noon.

11.35 hrs

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Twelve of the clock.

*Not Recorded.

12.01 hrs

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Twelve of the Clock.

(Mr. Speaker in the Chair)

(Interruptions)

12.01-1/2 hrs

(At this stage, Shri Adhir Chowdhary and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned till 1.30 P.M.

12.02 hrs

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till thirty minutes past Thirteen of the Clock.

13.32 hrs

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at thirty-two minutes past Thirteen of the Clock.

(Mr. Speaker in the Chair)

(Interruptions)

13.32 1/2hrs

(At this stage, Shri Satyavrat Chaturvedi and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठिये, मैं आपको सुनूंगा।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपको जो कुछ कहना है, अपनी-अपनी जगहों पर जाकर कहिये। मैं आपको बोलने की इजाजत दूंगा।

...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप जब यहां आकर बोलते हैं तो मुझे कुछ सुनाई नहीं देता। आप अपनी जगहों पर जाकर बोलिये।

...(व्यवधान)
