

LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Monday, November 24, 1997/Agrahayana 3, 1919 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at
Eleven of the Clock

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

[English]

SHRI SANAT MEHTA (SURENDRA NAGAR): Sir, what about the National Government? ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (DUMDUM): It will come only after the elections.

11.01 hrs

WELCOME TO PARLIAMENTARY DELEGATION FROM RUSSIA

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, at the outset, I have to make an announcement.

On my own behalf and on behalf of the hon. Members of the House, I have great pleasure in welcoming His Excellency Mr. Gannaday N. Seleznev, Chairman of the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation and other members of the Russian Parliamentary Delegation who are on a special visit to India as our honoured guests.

The other hon. Members of the Delegation are:

1. Mr. Nikolai I. Ryzhkov
2. Mr. Anatoli I. Lukyanov
3. Mr. Alexei V. Mitrofanov
4. Mr. Boris A. Moiseev
5. Mr. Anatoli T. Morozov
6. Mr. Alexander N. Lotorev
7. Mr. Vladimir N. Plotnikov

The Delegation arrived in Delhi on 23rd November, 1997. They are now seated in the Special Box. We wish them a happy and fruitful stay in our country. Through them, we convey our greetings and best wishes to the President, the Parliament and the friendly people of the Russian Federation.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Q. No. 61. Shri Sontosh Mohan Dev is not here. Shri Raghunandan Lai Bhatia.

(Interruptions)

DR. K. P. RAMALINGAM (TIRUCHENGODE): Mr. Speaker, Sir, we want that the Thakkar Commission Report should be placed on the Table of the House....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (BARAMATI): Sir, this Government has lost its legitimacy. This Government has no right to perform any business in the House...*(Interruptions)* Therefore, we have written a letter to the Prime Minister asking him to drop the DMK Ministers because they cannot function as Ministers here...*(Interruptions)*

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I really do not understand what exactly you want.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Let me have a say. Please sit down. Listen to me. I have a notice from Shri A.C. Jos for suspension of Question Hour. I had read the rules and regulations very clearly on the first day. For what reason do you want suspension of Question Hour? Which Motion do you want to be taken up? What should be discussed? I am prepared to suspend the Question Hour. But after that, what do you want? What is to be discussed in the House? You tell me which Motion, which agenda of the House should be taken up after suspension of Question Hour. You tell me that. What discussion do you want to have?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: We do not want any business to be performed by this Government. This Government has lost the legitimacy.

MR. SPEAKER: That means, you are not asking for suspension of Question Hour.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: This Government has no right to perform at all.

MR. SPEAKER: That means, you are not asking for suspension of Question Hour. You are asking for adjournment. Even for adjournment, you have to give a notice. It cannot be like that. The House cannot be run like that. I am sorry.

(Interruptions)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (MUMBAI-NORTH EAST): The House cannot be held to ransom for a political decision. If the Congress does not support the UF, they should withdraw immediately...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I will listen to Shri Jos.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: We cannot accept this Government as a Government. That is the reason that we have sent a notice to them. If the DMK is going to continue, then we cannot support this Government. They have lost the legitimacy. They have no right to perform any business in the House. That is the reason, we do not want to continue any business in the House...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Pawar, you have to decide that elsewhere and not on the floor of the House. If it is to be discussed on the floor of the House, it has to be through a proper Motion of No-Confidence. There is no other way. I am very sorry. What is your reason, Shri Jos?

(Interruptions)

SHRI A. C. JOS (IDUKKI): Sir, my submission is that for the past two-three days a very serious situation has arisen in the country as well as in this House because of which on Thursday and Friday, no business could be taken up in the House. So, there is no meaning in continuing with the Question Hour.

So, under Rule 388 (Suspension of Rules) and Rule 389 (Residuary powers) of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Lok Sabha, I had given a notice—not as a motion but as a notice—to suspend the Question Hour so that other business can be taken up...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: What? Let me understand which item of the business should be taken up after suspension of the Question Hour?

SHRI A. C. JOS: That is your discretion, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear Shri Jaswant Singh.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please be cool. It is much better to be cool. Let us hear Shri Jaswant Singh.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (CHITTORGARH): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member, Shri Jos has submitted that a very serious situation has arisen. I entirely agree with him. A very serious situation has indeed arisen. The United Front surviving in office on the support of the Congress Party now finds itself in a limbo. The Leader of the Congress Party in Parliament has stood up and I am sure, he said it with all responsibility that he will not permit any business to continue because as far as the Congress Party is concerned, they have lost their faith in this present Government...*(Interruptions)*... As my colleague has said, this is a very strange situation. But it is a very serious situation too. The Government cannot function if they do not have the numbers. If the numbers are with the Congress Party, firstly, this Government, then, have no moral authority to continue to give orders or to remain in office. They have no moral authority. Either this Government should withdraw from office or the Congress Party should follow the logic of the what they are saying. I urge the

Congress Party to carry the logic to its final conclusion. Let them move a motion of 'No-Confidence' or withdraw support. Let them do something. But this, Sir, is so serious because this is an insult to the country. It is certainly an insult to the Parliament. The Parliament is not able to function because the Government and those that support the Government are fighting. The country is held to ransom by this kind of theatre of the absurd. If this is what we are going to witness, this is no governance. This is a farce. This is not a coalition. It is an empty power sharing arrangement that has come to an end. If it has come to an end, then it must be brought to an end. That is what I say. Do not continue with this farce...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA (GWALIOR): He is lecturing. What have they done in Uttar Pradesh? They have lost all morality. I am not prepared to hear his lecture...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am not lecturing... *(Interruptions)*...

[Translation]

I am Surprised to see that the Hon'ble Members who have brought the country this situation become agitated when we show them their reality.

[English]

SHRI RAJESH PILOT (DAUSA): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to submit...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Let us hear Shri Rajesh Pilot. Let us see whether he can pilot the whole thing.

[Translation]

SHRI RAJESH PILOT: Mr. Speaker, Sir, what you have said is absolutely correct. We all share your feelings but the Government plays a major role in the functioning of the House. Government should see that the feelings of Members of different Parties is taken care of and proper replies should be given by the Government. You made a mention of Congress Party. We have given in writing that we can not extend support...*(Interruptions)* Government is not ready to reply to and they are not ready to reply till today and yet they want that the proceedings of the House should be conducted...*(Interruptions)* They are not ready to answer us.

[English]

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Is that letter the property of the House? If yes, then we will discuss on that letter. You please place the letter on the Table of the House, then the House can discuss about that letter. What priority can be given to it in the business of the House can be discussed. It is not the property of the House as yet. A private letter cannot be made the business of the house.

[Translation]

SHRI RAJESH PILOT: We don't want to convey this

type of message in a democratic country that Congress Party is trying to destabilise the Government.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Let Shri Pilot finish his submission.

[Translation]

SHRI RAJESH PILOT: We don't want to overlook the feelings of the country. We don't want to play with their feelings. We have clarified our view point, now you should reply to it so that proceedings of the House would be continued but they have no intention to reply, though they should do so and go ahead...(Interruptions).

[English]

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Can we treat it as Question No. 61 can can Shri Ram Vilas Paswan answer it? Shri Rajesh Pilot has asked the question.

MR. SPEAKER: I have given the floor to Shri Sharad Yadav.

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAD YADAV (MADHEPURA): Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Sharad Pawar ji and my friends from Congress Party have also said...(Interruptions) you are a friend too, we have difference of opinion but not division of hearts. As Shri Jaswant Singh ji has very rightly said that our political relations with Congress Party is altogether a different matter and the conduct of business in the House is a separate issue. you have honoured the feelings of all the Members on the motion of suspension of Question Hour. Members from Congress(I) and even I also admit that whatever has happened in Uttar Pradesh is totally against the dignity of democracy and notice for moving a motion in that regard...(Interruptions). If you allow a proper motion for which notice has given by the Communist Party can be moved. For the time being, matter is sorted out. Till such time if you feel proper the discussion can be taken up.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: In the meantime you would like to discuss the matter concerning our Party?

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: Till then I suggest that a meeting of the representatives of all the Parties should be called during Lunch hour to evaluate whether it will be in the interest of the nation to discuss or not to discuss the issue. There is a communication gap and there could be a dead lock on this report. Being Speaker and custodian of the House, I urge upon you that a meeting of the leaders should be convened to decide how the business of the House be conducted in such a situation. However, the motion regarding U.P. should be taken up first...(Interruptions). It would be better if you prepare yourself for that.

[English]

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: A senior member of the Congress Party has just now proposed that we should discuss the matter. He has said that we should take up this matter.

MR. SPEAKER: I am allowing Shri Surender Singh to speak on two conditions. He has to make the House laugh. If he cannot, this is the last chance for him.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (ALLAHABAD): You have already made the House laugh.

[Translation]

SHRI SURENDER SINGH (BHIWANI): Mr. Speaker, Sir, three days back, a one line motion was given in this House by the leader of Congress Party, Shri Shard Pawar. At that time you had asked all the Members of Congress Party as to what was the basis for asking for suspension of Question Hour.

You had asked them repeatedly as to which issue they wanted to take up and against which rule. I want to urge upon you that whenever you address such questions to Members of Congress Party, give them some time to answer because their eminent rule-knowing and decision making members are in the other House...(Interruptions)

My second submission is that many senior Congress leaders like Antulay ji, Sharad Pawar ji & Pilot Sahib are sitting in this House and Sharad Pawar ji being the leader of the Congress Party here has full power and he should tell you the reasons for withdrawal of their support from the Government, as they have already informed the President about this. He should, therefore, stand up and request you to convey this message to the Hon'ble President that they have formally withdrawn the support from the Government. The Government will fall down next moment. I request him through you to stand up and tell this....(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Surender Singh, I think, you have passed the examination with distinction. You will get more chances.

SHRI AJIT KUMAR PANJA (CALCUTTA NORTH-EAST): Sir, our demand is that the House should not function any more. (Interruptions)

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: Why?

SHRI AJIT KUMAR PANJA: I will certainly tell the reason. I am not saying it without any reason.

I take strong exception to it and submit that on such an issue and this august House should not go on laughing.

That is my first objection. This is such an issue where there are international ramifications. We have lost our leader Shri Rajiv Gandhi. It is not a place to smile away. We object to that.

The second is this. I am citing two precedents before you...*(interruptions)*

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE (PANSKURA): Whether this House should function or not is for the hon. Speaker to decide.

SHRI AJIT KUMAR PANJA: On Thursday, last on the Jain Commission issue, you have adjourned the House, a very recent decision of yours. On last Friday, on the same issue, Hon'ble Deputy Speaker adjourned the House. It is such a situation and the decision has been taken by you. Once it was done by you and on another occasion it was done by the Deputy-Speaker. Therefore, under these two precedents, on such similar issue, the House must be immediately adjourned.

We can make it clear that we stand by our Leader as a solid team in stating that the House cannot function.

On page 352 of Jain Commission Report Chapter II, Vol VI the names of Minister sitting here are mentioned....*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: We are not discussing the report.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: Not at all. It is not allowed.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: That is enough. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAT PATNAYAK (BALANGIR): Remove D.M.K and save the nation...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI P.M. SIVA (PUDUKKOTTAI): They should not assume the powers of the Chair...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI MRUTYUNJAYA NAYAK (PHULBANI): Remove D.M.K. and save Tamil Nadu...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet at 2 p.m.

*Not recorded

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

[English]

Firing Incidents on Indo-Pak Border

*61. SHRI SONTOSH MOHAN DEV:

SHRI RAGHUNANDAN LAL BHATIA:

Will the Minister of DEFENCE be pleased to state:

(a) whether there has been unprovoked firings at Indo-Pak border during the past few months;

(b) if so, the details thereof and number of civilians and security forces killed/injured therein;

(c) the details of loss of property etc. due to these incidents in the border areas;

(d) whether the Pakistani intervention has helped further infiltration of terrorists in J&K State resulting into large civilian tracts of fertile lands remaining uncultivated;

(e) the compensation paid by the Government to the civilians and security forces personnel who were killed/injured or whose property was damaged in these firings; and

(f) steps taken by the Government to check recurrence of such incidents in future?

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV): (a) Yes, Sir, Pakistan resorted to unprovoked firing along the border in J&K.

(b) Details of firing and resultant casualties during the last six months are given in the statement laid on the Table of the House.

(c) Due to unprovoked Pakistani firing in Kargil sector of Line of Control in September 1997, loss of property occurred at Kargil town where 8 shops, one hospital and one mosque were damaged. Damage was also caused to some Army bunkers etc.

(d) Pakistani firing is intended to help infiltration and at times such firing incidents also adversely affect cultivation specially in Jammu sector.

(e) There are adequate provisions in the Liberalised Pension Scheme for Armed Forces personnel to compensate for casualty suffered by them due to firing at the border. In order to alleviate the sufferings of civilian population in the Kargil sector due to Pakistani firing in September 1997, relief has been sanctioned from Prime Minister's Relief Fund in addition to the relief sanctioned by the State Government.

(f) A constant vigil is maintained all along the border. Our forces are prepared to meet any threat posed from across the border.