

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF
SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES
(2014-2015)**

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

FOURTH REPORT

ON

**MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT
(DEPARTMENT OF SCHOOL EDUCATION AND LITERACY)**

**Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the
Thirtieth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on the Welfare
of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the subject
"Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal schemes in Government run
schools"**

Presented to Lok Sabha on 30.04.2015

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 30.04.2015



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

CONTENTS

		Page
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE.....		(iii)
INTRODUCTION.....		(iv)
CHAPTER I	Report.....	
CHAPTER II	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government.....	
CHAPTER III	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of replies of the Government.....	
CHAPTER IV	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.....	
CHAPTER V	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.....	

APPENDICES

- I-II. Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 8.4.2015 and 28.4.2015

- III. Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on
the Recommendations contained in the Thirtieth Report
(Fifteenth Lok Sabha).....

**COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED
CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2014-2015)**

Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste - Chairman

MEMBERS – LOK SABHA

2. Dr. Ravindra Babu
3. Shri Santokh Singh Chaudhary
4. Shri R. Dhruvanarayana
5. Shri Ramesh Jigajinagi
6. Shri Rattan Lal Kataria
7. Dr. Virendra Kumar
8. Shri Balbhadra Majhi
9. Smt. Pratima Mondal
10. Shri Kariya Munda
11. Shri Ram Chandra Paswan
12. Smt. Kamla Patle
13. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
14. Dr. Kirit Solanki
15. Shri Kadiyam Srihari
16. Shri Ajay Tamta
17. Shri Krupal Balaji Tumane
18. Dr. P. Venugopal
19. Shri Bhanu Pratap Singh Verma
20. Shri Chintaman Navsha Wanaga

MEMBERS – RAJYA SABHA

21. Shri Ramdas Athawale
22. Shri D. Raja
23. Shri Ambeth Rajan
24. Dr. Vijaylaxmi Sadho
25. Dr. Anil Kumar Sahani
26. Shri Nand Kumar Sai
27. Shri J.D. Seelam
28. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
29. Shri S. Thangavelu
30. Mahant Shambhuprasadji Tundiya

SECRETARIAT

- | | | | |
|----|--------------------------|---|----------------------|
| 1. | Dr. R.K. Chadha | - | Additional Secretary |
| 2. | Shri D.R. Shekhar | - | Director |
| 3. | Shri Vinay Pradeep Barwa | - | Under Secretary |
| 4. | Shri Mukesh Kumar | - | Committee Officer |

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes having been authorised by the Committee to finalise and submit the Report on their behalf, present this Fourth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Thirtieth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) regarding "Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools".

2. The draft Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on 28th April, 2015(Appendix-I).
3. The Report has been divided into the following chapters:-
 - I Report
 - II Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government.
 - III Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of replies of the Government.
 - IV Recommendations /Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.
 - V Recommendations / Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.
4. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Thirtieth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee is given in Appendix-II.

NEW DELHI
30 April, 2015
Vaisakha, 1936 (Saka)

FAGGAN SINGH KULASTE
Chairperson,
Committee on the Welfare
of Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes.

CHAPTER I

Report

This Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes deals with the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Thirtieth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) regarding "Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools".

1.2 The Thirtieth Report was presented to Lok Sabha on 22nd August, 2013. It contained 23 recommendations/observations. Replies of the Government in respect of all these recommendations/observations have been examined and may be categorized as under:-

- (i) Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government (Sl Nos. 2, 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 14, 16, 20, 21 and 23)
- (ii) Recommendations/observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in the light of the replies received from the Government (nil)
- (iii) Recommendations/observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (Sl. Nos. 1, 10, 13, 15, 17, 19 and 22)
- (iv) Recommendations/observations in respect of which final replies have not been received (Sl. Nos. 5, 6 and 18)

1.3 The Committee will now deal with the Action Taken by the Government on some of the recommendations which need reiteration or comments:-

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1, Para No. 2.20)

1.4 The Committee are distressed to note that the instances of untouchability are still prevailing in the country even after 65 years of Independence, though it is prohibited in the Constitution and punishable under the penal laws. The Committee observe that untouchability is mostly found in the remotest of the remote areas of the country and in coastal areas particularly in the State of Odisha. The Committee also find that the Central teams were not sent to the affected areas in the State of Odisha particularly in the coastal belt and therefore had recommended that the Central Government should depute special team to visit these areas at once to investigate the cases of untouchability, to see the gravity of the situation and to suggest ways to tackle the malaise accordingly. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.

Reply of the Government

1.5 As directed by the Committee, two teams of Officers from the Department of School Education & Literacy were sent to five coastal districts (Puri, Jagatsingpur, Baleshwar, Khordha, Bhadrak) in Odisha from 11-15 November, 2012 to investigate the cases of untouchability, to see the gravity of the situation and to suggest ways and means to tackle the malaise. A Scheduled Caste Officer of the rank of Deputy Secretary to the Government of India was also a member of the team. During the visit, the team made special efforts to contact the local Members of Parliament for seeking guidance to select such schools where discriminatory practices on the basis of caste were likely or prevalent.

1.6 The teams visited 76 schools in the above districts but could not come across a single case of discrimination in the visited schools. The copy of the report of the Teams on the above visit is enclosed at Annexure-I (copy of the report enclosed) for

information etc. Prior to the visit of the above two teams, two Monitoring Institutions (MIs) had also visited Sambalpur, Kendrapara, Dhenkanal, Angul, Ganjam and Cuttak. Both the MIs also did not find/report any instance of discrimination.

1.6A On the directions of the Committee, the Ministry of Human Resource Development again deputed Central teams to visit Banka and Sitamarhi districts of Bihar and Banda, Badaun and Bahraich districts of Uttar Pradesh from 27th to 31st January, 2015 and Chhatarpur, Dhar, Harda and Sheopur districts of Madhya Pradesh from 16th to 18th March, 2015 to get a wholesome view on the caste based discrimination under the Mid Day Meal Scheme. The Central teams observed that there was no caste based discrimination in sample schools visited for the purpose in the district of these States (The Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) F. No. 5-38/2012-MDM 1-1 (EES) dated 11th February, 2015 and 30th March, 2015).

Comments of the Committee

1.7 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that the teams constituted by them to investigate the cases of untouchability did not come across a single case of discrimination in the visited schools. The Committee apprehend the likelihood of leaking of information of the visits in advance and are of the view that teams/monitoring institutes should make regular surprise visits to the schools in SC/ST dominated districts of Odisha and other parts of the country to detect the instances of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme as also to send out a strong message that such acts will not be tolerated. The Committee also feel that NGOs in the area may be involved in the process of investigation.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 2.22)

1.8 The Committee note with concern that the Ministry of Human Resource Development had identified 144 poorly performing districts under the Mid-Day Meal Scheme. The Monitoring Institutes have been requested to cover these districts on priority. The Government of India is also sending Central team and Review Missions to these districts. The State Governments have also been requested to pay more attention on these districts to improve the performance of the scheme. The Committee find that though on paper the monitoring mechanism seems to be in order, still it is a matter of concern that 144 districts are under performing. The Committee would like to know the findings of the Government as to why these districts are under performing and corrective measures taken by the Government in this regard.

Reply of the Government

1.9 Coverage of children vis-à-vis enrolment is the key indicatory on the implementation of Mid-Day Meal Scheme. about 70% to 72% of the enrolled children were availing MDM on an average basis during 2011-12. The district wise information on coverage of children as submitted by the respective State Governments through their Annual Work Plan & Budget, 2012-13 was analysed and the districts where coverage of enrolled children was on the lower side were identified as the poor performing districts. The issue of less coverage of children in these districts was discussed in detail with the respective States during the meetings of Program Approval Board Mid-Day Meal.

1.10 The Joint Review Missions consisting of the Members from Central Government, State Government, Office of the Supreme Court Commissionerate, UNICEF, and Monitoring Institutes have been constituted to monitor the implementation of the scheme in poor performing districts. Nutrition Experts from Home Science Colleges in various Agricultural Universities, National Institute of Nutrition, Hyderabad, etc. have

also been included in the Joint Review Mission to capture data on the existing nutritional status of the children studying in elementary classes through anthropometric measurements so as to assess the level of malnutrition etc. The teams of Nutrition Experts are also mandated to suggest the area/region specific and low cost nutritionally balanced recipes under Mid-Day Meal Scheme. The JRM team also analyse during their visits, the reasons for poor coverage for taking corrective measures. Similarly, Social Audit through community participation is also proposed to be carried out on a pilot basis in two districts each in 9 States.

1.11 As a result of these efforts the number of poorly performing districts could be reduced to 64; unfortunately 47 new districts have joined this group. Therefore, the total number of poorly performing districts currently stands at 111.

Comments of the Committee

1.12 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that despite all efforts, the number of poorly performing districts under MDMS stands at 111. The Committee are of the view that besides making efforts for improving the performance of poorly performing districts, the government should also monitor the performance of other districts regularly to maintain their performance. The Committee would also like be apprised about the outcome of the Social Audit proposed to be carried out on a pilot basis in two districts each in 9 States.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 6, Para No. 2.25)

1.13 The Committee also note that the Government propose to send five Review Missions consisting of representatives of the Central Government, UNICEF, State Governments of Karnataka, Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh, Sikkim and Nagaland to cover the remote areas to check instances of discrimination. The Committee recommend that MP/MLA and Members of SC/ST Communities should be included in the Review

Mission. The Committee would like to be apprised about the findings of the Review Mission district-wise and the action taken against the persons provoking or practicing untouchability and also the post visit performance of the schools.

Reply of Government

1.14 As indicated, the Review Mission to the 4 of the 5 States mentioned above have already been completed as per the following details;

S. No.	State	Period of JRM	Districts Covered
1.	Karnataka	25th February to 4th March 2013	Chitradurg and Bengaluru
2.	Chhattisgarh	26th February to 2nd March 2013	Durg and Kanker
3.	Rajasthan	28th January to 4th February 2013	Kota and Tonk
4.	Nagaland	17th to 24th March 2013	Kohima and Dimapur

Sikkim could not be taken up because of the earthquake and Landslide. It is proposed to be taken up during 2013-14.

1.15 In addition, Review Missions have been completed for the following States;

Status of the 5th Joint Review Mission 2013			
S. No.	States	Time	Status
1.	New Delhi	22 April 1st May 2013	Done
2.	Gujarat	22 April to 30 April 2013	Done
3.	Himachal Pradesh	21 May to 30 May 2013	Done
4.	Andhra Pradesh	24 June to 4 July	Done
5.	Uttar Pradesh	8 July to 17 July 2013	Done
6.	Manipur	22 July to 31st July	Done
7.	Tripura	18 June to 27 June	Done
8.	Tamil Nadu	29 July to 9th August 2013	Done
9.	MP	11 August to 21 August 2013	Done
10.	Bihar	21 August to 31st August 2013	Done
11.	Maharashtra	30th Sept to 9th October 2013	Done
12.	Odisha	20 Sept to 33 September 2013	Done
13.	Jharkhand	21 October to 30 October 2013	Done
14.	Assam	11th November to 19th November	Done
15.	West Bengal	19th November to 29th November	Done
16.	Meghalaya	22nd November to 30th November 2013	Done
17.	Puducherry	4th December to 11th December 2013	Done
18.	Arunachal Pradesh	10th December to 19th December 2013	Done

1.16 One case of discrimination in Newari Block of Tonk district, village Banasthali was noticed by JRM during its visit to Rajasthan. The Brahmin cook was not serving mid day meal to children who primarily belonged to Bhil and Gujjar community. The services of the cook have been terminated.

Comments of the Committee

1.17 The Committee note that Review Mission could not be completed in Sikkim due to earthquake and landslides and is proposed to be taken up during 2013-14. The Committee would like to know the latest status of the Review Mission in Sikkim. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the status of Review Missions in the remaining States/Union Territories.

The Committee further note that one case of discrimination in Newari Block of Tonk district, village Banasthali have been noticed by JRM during its visits to Rajasthan where a Brahmin cook was not serving Mid day Meal to children who primarily belonged to Bhil and Gujjar Community and the services of the cook was terminated. The Committee observe that mere termination of the services of the erring cook is not sufficient. An FIR under provision of atrocity Act, 1989 should be lodged against such person so the incidents of such nature may not be repeated at all. The reply furnished by the Government is silent about the inclusion of MP/MLA and Members of SC/ST community in Review Mission. The Committee would like to know the view of the Government in this regard.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 10, Para No. 3.11)

1.18 The Committee note that it has been alleged that ISKCON and Akshay Patra are collecting unauthorized and illegal donations/contributions from public in India and abroad for the Government sponsored Mid-Day Meal Scheme for school children in

Karnataka. The Committee further note that cook-cum-helpers were agitating on the involvement of Akshaya Patra Foundation in MDMS because it was depriving their employment in the school based cooking and serving the meal to the children. The independent Monitoring Institute of MDM Scheme has also reported that foundation is not serving eggs to the children on demand on the plea that it serves only vegetarian meals. The Committee are of the view that the allegations made against the Akshaya Patra Foundation should be examined thoroughly and if found guilty action should be initiated against the NGO and its involvement in the scheme should be reviewed/monitored. The Committee would like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.

Reply of the Government

1.19 Mid-Day Meal Guidelines provide that NGOs/Trusts/Centralized kitchens may be engaged for serving the meal to the children of the schools located in urban areas where there is shortage of space for construction of kitchen-cum-store in the school premises. 447 NGOs in 16 States/UTs are delivering mid day meal to 74,63,226 children. The mid-day meal guidelines prescribe that protein should be provided through dal. However, a few states like Odisha, Tamil Nadu, West Bengal are providing eggs in mid-day meal from their own resources. No central assistance is provided for eggs. Hence no punitive action can be taken against Akshaya Patra for not providing eggs under Mid-Day Meal. The Committee would like to be apprised of the progress made by the Government in this regard.

Comments of the Committee

1.20 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that no punitive action can be taken against Akshaya Patra for not providing eggs as no central assistance is provided for eggs. The Committee are of the view that eggs are

protein rich so they should be included in children's diet and required assistance should be given by the Government. The Committee are also of the view that those children who avoid eating eggs should be given some other protein rich substitute. The Committee would like to be apprised of the progress made by the Govt. in this regard.

Recommendation (Sl. No.13, Para No. 4.13)

1.21 The Committee note that Mid Day Meal Scheme has been launched by the Government in order to encourage poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections to attend school regularly and to improve nutritional status of children in Class I to VIII in Government, local body and Government aided schools etc. The Committee fully support the objectives of the MDMS. However, recently it has been reported in print and electronic media that due to serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the State of Bihar some children died. The Committee take a serious view in the matter and, therefore, impress upon the Monitoring and Implementation agency of MDMS to maintain high standard of quality of food before serving to children and it must be checked and verified by the specialist Doctor to obviate any possibility of adulteration which is injurious to health or may cause death. The Committee strongly recommend that responsibility should be fixed for lapses in serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the light of incident taken place in State of Bihar recently. The Committee would also like to be briefed of the report of Expert Committee constituted in this regard.

Reply of Government

1.22 23 children died on 16th July, 2013 after availing of Mid-Day Meal at Navsrijit Govt. Primary School, Gandaman, Block Masrakh, District Chhapra of Bihar and 46 children and 01 cook were hospitalized. A case was filed in Masrakh Police Station

against Smt. Meena Kumari, Head Teacher of the School and others under Sections 302, 307, 328 and 120 (B) of Indian Penal Code. She was arrested and placed under suspension and disciplinary proceedings have been initiated against her. The services of the Block Resource Person have been terminated. The allegations against the Head Teacher as well as Shri Arjun Rai, husband of Head Teacher have been found to be true and charge sheet against them has been filed in the Court. The case is sub-judice. The incident is being investigated by Special Investigation Team (SIT) under the supervision of District Superintendent of Police.

1.23 MHRD received 34 complaints of poor quality of MDM during the last three years and in the current year. These complaints were referred to the concerned State Governments, who have taken necessary action in 25 out of the 34 cases. The allegations were not proved in 11 cases, while action has been taken by the State Governments in the remaining 14 cases. The action taken included a warning to the concerned NGO and officers responsible, the initiation of departmental proceedings against Principal/Headmaster and Inspector, the suspension of erring officials, the registration of criminal cases against the contractor / concerned staff for negligence, the cancellation of the contract of the supplier, the changing of cooks where required, and compensating children as per the directions of the court.

1.24 The report of the Expert Nutrition Committee is still awaited. The Committee will assess the adequacy, improving the quality and the safety of the Mid-Day Meal served in schools, thereafter submit the Report.

Comments of the Committee

1.25 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that action has been initiated against those found prima-facie guilty in Navsrijit Govt. Primary School, Gandaman, Block Masrakh, District Chhapra of Bihar case. The State

Government have also taken action where allegations referred by MHRD have been proved. The Committee also note that the report of the Expert Nutrition Committee is still awaited which is mandated to assess the adequacy, improving the quality and the safety of the Mid-Day Meal served in schools. The Committee reiterate that responsibility should be fixed for lapses in serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal to check recurrence of such incidents. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the status of the Expert Nutrition Committee report in the matter.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 15, Para No. 4.16)

1.26 The Committee would also like to know whether any study has been conducted to ascertain the impact of MDMS on the drop-out rates of children from school and on the educational development of SCs/STs. The Committee had recommended the Government to undertake such a study, to find out the efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries particularly SCs/STs. The Committee would also like to know the outcome of the study.

Reply of the Government

1.27 The efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries is regularly assessed by the Joint Review Missions in each of the states on a regular basis. The Supreme Court Commissionerate also reviews the efficacy of the Scheme. Special field visits are also undertaken to assess the efficacy of the Scheme for SCs/STs. The common findings of the reports of 16 Joint Review Missions conducted in 2013 are as follows:-

- (i) Sensitisation of officials at District and Block level towards their role and responsibilities is essential for effective implementation of MDMS.

- (ii) Too many levels of fund flow should be reduced so that the funds should reach in time to the implementing agencies. Fund flow system may be streamlined for timely release of funds to the Districts, schools for the uninterrupted and smooth implementation of scheme; timely payment to cook-cum-helpers and Food Corporation of India. Andhra Pradesh' Green Channel Scheme may be adopted.
- (iii) The undernourished children, especially the 14 years age group, should be identified by periodical health checkups. The identified children should be given special care during MDM.
- (iv) The MDMS guidelines with respect to tasting of the meal by the teachers should be strictly followed.
- (v) In MDM menu, greens are used only as seasoning, quantity is very less. Separate green based recipes should be incorporated in menu.
- (vi) Serving size is not accurate. Measures should be used to serve food as per norms.
- (vii) Better convergence with the School Health program is essential. There is a need for the regular health monitoring. Vitamin A, Iron and Folic Acid supplements and deworming tablets should be provided on regular basis to the schools. Further, proper instructions regarding their dosage should be given to the teachers. Health cards, with duly filled record of each child need to be maintained and updated regularly in all the schools.
- (viii) The State Govt. should engage adequate number of Cook-cum-Helpers in the schools as per norms. There is need to educate the cooks regarding proper weight of raw ingredients.
- (ix) Drinking water should be tested for any type of biological contamination and remedial purification to be done accordingly.

- (x) The rights and entitlement of children, menu, MDM logo, and emergency contact numbers should be displayed prominently on the outside wall of the schools.
- (xi) The meals should be more nutrient dense and nutritionally balanced. Inclusion of higher amounts of non tube vegetables is recommended.
- (xii) The gunny bags used for food grains can be auctioned and the amount can be utilized for better implementation of MDMS.
- (xiii) FIFO (First in and First out) system may be followed in the utilization of oil and other ingredients before their prescribed shelf life or 'best before use' period. Cooks and Helpers should be sensitized to 'First in First out principle.
- (xiv) A concerted effort for Health and Nutrition Education (HNE) is required for children, parents, teachers, cooks and caretakers. Feeding program along with HNE, may prove more effective in improving the health and nutritional status of the children.
- (xv) Effective monitoring mechanism should be developed by the State Govt. to ensure periodic inspection of the scheme by officials at all levels. Inspecting Officers should record their observations on the implementation of MDMS.
- (xvi) Provisions of Social and Community Audits should be made by the government to evaluate the implementation of programme and to identify gaps, with the involvement of.
- (xvii) The process of capacity building of the PRIs and S.M.C members should be initiated.
- (xviii) The authorities may work out feasibility of supplying grains in MDM-Stamped gunny/Poly bags to avoid pilferage during transportation.
- (xix) In view of the high prevalence of fire wood chulhas as a mode of cooking in the rural areas action may be initiated to provide environment eco-friendly

- smokeless chulhas in convergence with the concerned department in the State.
- (xx) Certain amount may be earmarked from the MME fund for procurement of large containers for storing food grains in schools so that rats and other insects may not spoil the rice.
 - (xxi) Cooking is done mainly by firewood which not only denudes the forests but also produces a lot of smoke which is hazardous for health. The State Government may now install/convert chulhas into smokeless chulhas to combat the above problem.
 - (xxii) The State Govt. should also constitute Review Mission at the State level and send them to various districts of the State every six months to review the implementation of the programme. The State Govt. officials looking after MDMS may join the Review Mission in other states under exchange scheme. Orientation visits to other states to see the implementation of the scheme will also widen the horizon of the officials.
 - (xxiii) The Mid Day Meal Program is routed through schools so that correct nutrition messages, good eating habits and hygiene and sanitary practices are imparted and inculcated in children. Most of the Missions have strongly recommended availability of adequate water, adequate hygienic and sanitary toilet facilities and safe drinking water for the school going children.
 - (xxiv) Action Plan may be drawn up with the time lines for construction of kitchen-cum-stores for which central assistance has already been received by the State Governments.

Comments of the Committee

1.28 The Committee had recommended the Government to undertake a specific study to find out the efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries particularly SCs/STs and had also desired to know the outcome of such study. The Ministry of Human Resource Development has instead furnished the findings of various Joint Review Missions. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation that a specific and comprehensive study should be undertaken to assess the impact of MDMS on drop out rates and its efficacy in socio-economic development of SC/STs.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 17, Para No. 4.21)

1.29 The Committee observe that proper infrastructure facility for cooking and distributing the Mid-Day Meal is not available in most of the schools across the country. The Committee note that where sufficient space is not available cluster of five/six schools is made for cooking and distributing mid day meal. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Government should provide proper infrastructure to each school for preparing MDM and its distribution. The Committee also recommend that Government should explore possibility to serve packed food having same calories and prepared in hygienic manner to the students where such facilities is not available.

Reply of the Government

1.30 The Central Govt. has started providing central assistance for infrastructure development under MDMS since 2006-07. Rs.7638.22 cr. has been released for 9.78 lakh kitchen cum stores. Central Assistance for procurement of kitchen devices for 11.01 lakh schools has been provided till date.

1.31 As per the direction of Hon'ble Supreme Court, MDM guidelines were issued for serving of hot cooked meal only to the children under MDMS. The packaged food is not allowed under MDMS. The National Food Security Act, 2013 also mandates that only hot cooked meals is to be served to the children under MDMS.

1.32 A national level workshop was organized in New Delhi in April 2013 to present before the States/UTs a model design for kitchen cum stores for adaptation at their level.

Comments of the Committee

1.33 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that only hot cooked meals are to be served to the children under MDMS. The Committee had recommended that proper infrastructure should be provided to each school for preparing MDM for the students. The Committee had also recommended that possibility of providing packed meals may be explored. The Committee are of the view that where infrastructural facilities are not available, the children should get clean cooked food from the vicinity of the school which could be from e.g. a group of women living around the area cooking food under the strict monitoring of the staff of the school in hygienic condition where infrastructure is available. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should come out with innovative solutions instead of giving lame excuses.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 18, Para No. 4.22)

1.34 The Committee note that Rs.5,962 crore were released for construction of 9,55,433 kitchen sheds, out of which 5,60,546 kitchen sheds have been constructed and 95,867 are under construction. The Committee would like to know the present status of the construction of kitchen sheds and amount utilized for the construction. The

Committee also desire to know about the status of remaining 2,99,060 kitchen sheds. The Committee, also recommend that construction work should be completed expeditiously without compromising quality of work to avoid the time and cost overrun.

Reply Of Government

1.35 The current status of the progress on construction of kitchen-cum-store is as under:

1. Sanctioned	-	9.78 lakh
2. Constructed	-	6.40 lakh
3. In progress	-	2.32 lakh
Construction not yet started	-	2.32 lakh

A State/UT wise details of the status is at Annexure-V. The low performing State/UTs are being followed up.

Comments of the Committee

1.36 The Committee are surprised to note that construction of 2.32 lakh Kitchen-cum-store are in progress and further 232 have not yet started. The Committee express its serious apprehension on the quality and safety of cooked food being served to the children in the non-availability of the 4.64 lakh constructed kitchen-cum-store in the different parts of the States/UT. The Committee had recommended that construction work should be completed expeditiously without compromising quality of work to avoid the time and cost overrun and to enable children to have safe and qualitatively cooked food. The Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation that work should be expedited and the Committee would like to be apprised of the monthly progress.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 4.26)

1.37 The Committee note that Mid-Day Meal Scheme covers children of Classes I – VIII studying in Government, Local Body, Government aided and National Child Labour Projects schools and the Centre run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) Alternative and Innovative Education (AIE) Centres including Madrasas/Maktabs supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). The Committee feel that inclusion of students of Class IX and X under MDMS will help in reduction of dropout ratio particularly the students belonging to SC/ST community and improve the nutritional status. The Committee, therefore, desire that the scope of the scheme should be widen to cover the students studying in IX and X Class also.

Reply of the Government

1.38 The Working Group on Elementary Education for 12th Plan proposed to extend Mid-Day Meal Scheme to Classes IX & X. However, Planning Commission did not approve the proposal.

Comments of the Committee

1.39 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that Planning Commission did not approve the proposal for including Class IX & X students under MDMS. The Committee are of the view that Class IX & X students need nutritious diet in larger quantities since they are growing up fast. The Committee feel that to prepare a nation of healthy individuals, the Government should explore the possibility of including Class IX & X students under MDMS. The Committee, therefore, are of the view that the Government should take up the matter with Planning Commission again and the Committee would like to be apprised of the view of the Planning Commission on the issue.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 20, Para No. 5.10)

1.40 The Committee note that the Working Group on Elementary Education (WGEE) for 12th Plan has recommended for enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers from existing Rs.1000 per cook per month to Rs.1500 for the year 2013-14 and 2014-15 and Rs.2000 per cook per month for the last two years of the 12th Plan. The revision will be made after approval of the competent authority. The Committee would like to endorse the view of WGEE and know the status of decision of the competent authority in the matter of enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers.

Reply of the Government

1.41 The proposal for the enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers has been included in the Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) Note for the 12th Plan. The comments of the appraisal agencies have been received and replies thereon given by MHRD. The EFC note has been finalized and submitted to the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) who have fixed the EFC meeting for the 30th January, 2014 for consideration of MHRD proposal on MDMS.

Comments of the Committee

1.42 The Committee are satisfied to note that the proposal for the enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers has been included in the Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) Note for the 12th Plan. The Committee would like to be apprised about the outcome of the EFC Meeting for 30th January, 2014 for consideration of MHRD Proposal on MDMS.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 21, Para No. 5.11)

1.43 The Committee note that there are fund constraints in replicating various initiatives taken by the Government of Andhra Pradesh at the National level. The Committee recommend that other States should be persuaded to implement the new initiatives for the welfare of SCs and STs in the States and for the success of MDM Schemes. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.

Reply of Government

1.44 Andhra Pradesh's 'Green Channel Scheme' pre-positions one month's requirement of funds to the implementing agencies in advance. The above initiative has ensured the availability of one month's funds in the schools in advance so that the Mid Day Meal Scheme is implemented smoothly without any interruption. The guidelines of the above scheme were circulated to all States/UTs with request to take necessary approval of competent authorities for introducing the Green Channel Scheme so that one month's requirement of funds are pre-positioned in advance to the implementing agencies in their States/UTs also.

Comments of the Committee

1.45 The Committee note from the reply of the Government that 'Green Channel Scheme' pre-positions one month's requirement of funds to the implementing agencies in advance to ensure the availability of one month's funds in the schools. The Committee are of the view that mere circulating guidelines of "Green Channel Scheme" to all States/UTs for taking necessary approval of competent authorities for introducing the scheme is not enough and it should be implemented in letter and spirit.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 22, Para No. 5.12)

1.46 The Committee are happy to note that the Working Group of Elementary Education for 12th Plan has recommended for inclusion of children in private unaided schools in 109 Scheduled Tribes (ST) and 61 Scheduled Castes (SC) concentration districts under the MDM Scheme in a phased manner. The Committee recommend the Government to explore the possibilities for inclusion of more SC and ST concentrated districts in the country under MDMS. The Committee would like to know the present status of 109 STs and 61 SC concentration districts for inclusion in MDM Scheme.

Reply of the Government

1.47 The proposal for provision of MDM to the children of unaided private schools in SC, ST and Minority concentrated districts identified under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan has not been approved because of shortage of funds.

Comments of the Committee

1.48 The Committee note with concern that provision of MDM to the children of unaided private schools in SC/ST and minority concentrated districts identified under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan has not been approved because of shortfall of funds. The Committee are of the view that the Ministry of Human Resource Development should pursue the matter with the Planning Commission and Ministry of Finance for increasing the fund. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation that the Government may also include children in private unaided schools in 109 ST and 61 SC concentrated districts under the MDM Scheme in a phased manner.

CHAPTER II

Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2, Para No. 2.21)

2.1 The Committee are further distressed to note that some schools and few teachers are playing roles in perpetuating untouchability and sowing seeds of castes related discrimination in young minds. The Committee recommend that these schools and teachers involved in such deplorable practice of untouchability should be given exemplary punishment. The Committee also recommend that periodic interactive sessions should be held with the teachers by the school management to make them understand the social fall out of untouchability and its ever lasting impact on the tender minds of the children.

Reply of the Government

2.2 Department of School Education & Literacy circulated the recommendations contained in the 30th Report of the Committee on Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, to all States/Union Territories with the advice that nodal officer or nodal agency in the States should make regular field visits and conduct surprise inspections every month for any incident of untouchability, and submit the report to the State Government/UT Administration. The States/UTs were further requested to advise the schools to hold periodic interactive sessions on untouchability particularly its fall out and impact on the minds of the tender age children.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 2.22)

2.3 The Committee note with concern that the Ministry of Human Resource Development had identified 144 poorly performing districts under the Mid-Day Meal Scheme. The Monitoring Institutes have been requested to cover these districts on

priority. The Government of India is also sending Central team and Review Missions to these districts. The State Governments have also been requested to pay more attention on these districts to improve the performance of the scheme. The Committee find that though on paper the monitoring mechanism seems to be in order, still it is a matter of concern that 144 districts are under performing. The Committee would like to know the findings of the Government as to why these districts are under performing and corrective measures taken by the Government in this regard.

Reply of the Government

2.4 Coverage of children vis-à-vis enrolment is the key indicatory on the implementation of Mid-Day Meal Scheme. about 70% to 72% of the enrolled children were availing MDM on an average basis during 2011-12. The district wise information on coverage of children as submitted by the respective State Governments through their Annual Work Plan & Budget, 2012-13 was analysed and the districts where coverage of enrolled children was on the lower side were identified as the poor performing districts. The issue of less coverage of children in these districts was discussed in detail with the respective States during the meetings of Program Approval Board Mid-Day Meal.

2.5 The Joint Review Missions consisting of the Members from Central Government, State Government, Office of the Supreme Court Commissionerate, UNICEF, and Monitoring Institutes have been constituted to monitor the implementation of the scheme in poor performing districts. Nutrition Experts from Home Science Colleges in various Agricultural Universities, National Institute of Nutrition, Hyderabad, etc. have also been included in the Joint Review Mission to capture data on the existing nutritional status of the children studying in elementary classes through anthropometric measurements so as to assess the level of malnutrition etc. The teams of Nutrition Experts are also mandated to suggest the area/region specific and low cost nutritionally

balanced recipes under Mid-Day Meal Scheme. The JRM team also analyse during their visits, the reasons for poor coverage for taking corrective measures. Similarly, Social Audit through community participation is also proposed to be carried out on a pilot basis in two districts each in 9 States.

2.6 As a result of these efforts the number of poorly performing districts could be reduced to 64; unfortunately 47 new districts have joined this group. Therefore, the total number of poorly performing districts currently stands at 111.

Comments of the Committee

2.7 Please see Para 1.12 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No.4, Para No. 2.23)

2.8 The Committee are happy to note that as and when any report of discrimination is received from any of the State/U.T. the Central Government invariably deposes its team for detailed investigation and for taking necessary corrective action wherever required. At present, there is no report of any discrimination is pending for detailed investigation. However, the Committee would like to know the outcome of investigations made by the Central Government regarding discrimination in MDM for last one year.

Reply of the Government

2.9 MHRD has advised all States/UTs to show zero tolerance to incidents of discrimination. The Government schools in Odisha have painted at prominent places on their walls that 'no gender/caste discrimination shall be practiced' in the schools. No instance of discrimination came to the notice of the Central Government during the last one year as the State Governments were given strict instructions to deal with instances of discrimination severely. This was followed up by a visit to the suspect areas by the

Monitoring Institutions and the special teams from MHRD, which also did not come across any instance of discrimination.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 7, Para No. 2.26)

2.10 The Committee note with satisfaction that as a remedial measure States/UTs have formed Committees/Samitis with members from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes to inspect preparation and distribution of food. Similarly, priority is given to these communities in recruitment of cook-cum-helpers. MDM guidelines lay down that on an average 25% of schools should be inspected every quarter by State Government officers belonging to different departments at District, Sub-Division, Tehsil/Taluka, block and other suitable levels. In addition the Joint Review Missions consisting of representatives of Central Government, to the States also help in detecting the malaise. Similarly, 40 independent Monitoring Institutions such as IIT Chennai, and Visva-Bharati also monitor this aspect. The Committee, however, strongly recommend to the Government to explore further ways and means as to how the social evil of untouchability and discrimination could be totally eradicated not only from the schools but also from the society at large through spreading awareness, imparting education, training and holding workshops for the purpose. The Committee also desire that for dissemination of such information Government should use Radio, TV, Vernacular Newspaper and electronic media so that people of the country can realize the sense of equality and respect to dignity of individual.

Reply of the Government

2.11 All States/UTs have been advised to ensure compliance with the recommendation of the Committee. (Annexure-II)

The Joint Review Missions to Karnataka and Nagaland (February and March 2013 respectively) recommended that awareness programme on MDM Scheme may be started to inform the beneficiaries about their entitlements and stake holders about the rights of the children. Accordingly films on MDM as a right and the critical role of the local community in monitoring, the same, are being regularly shown on the TV; and jingles on MDM broadcast on Radio Channels.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 8, Para No. 3.3)

2.12 The Committee note that the responsibilities of providing nutritious, cooked mid-day meal to every child lies with the State Government and Union Territory Administration under the guidelines issued by the Government of India. In this regard every State Government/UT Administration is required to designate the State Nodal Department and nodal officer or Agency at district and Block level. The Committee recommend that it must be made mandatory for nodal officer or nodal agency in the States to make regular field visit and conduct surprise checks every month to detect any violation of guidelines and persistence of untouchability, if any, and submit their report to the State Government concerned.

Reply of the Government

2.13 All States/UTs have been advised to ensure compliance to the recommendations of the Committee. (Annexure-II). Twenty five percent of the schools are checked every quarter; the inspecting officials also check any instances of untouchability. Similarly MLs and JRM teams, examine this aspect during the field visits.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 9, Para No. 3.4)

2.14 The Committee note that due to lukewarm approach of the implementing agencies, the untouchability still exist in some part of the country. The Committee strongly recommend that accountability should be fixed for non adhering to the rules and procedure and violating guidelines so as to implement the MDM scheme properly without any instances of discrimination and untouchability which otherwise defeat the very purpose of MDMS.

Reply of the Government

2.15 An advisory has been issued to all States/UTs to ensure compliance to the recommendation of the Committee. (Annexure-II). This aspect is also highlighted and reviewed during the meetings of the Education Secretaries.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 11, Para No. 3.12)

2.16 The Committee feel that involvement of NGOs is essential as the Government alone cannot implement various schemes meant for the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes properly. The Committee, therefore, recommend that credentials of all NGOs involved in MDM schemes should be verified so that well established, public spirited, non-profit making entity having a good reputation in the area can be given execution work of MDM Scheme. The Committee also recommend that monitoring team of the State Government should undertake field visits from time to time to verify the working of the NGOs and proper utilization of funds.

Reply of the Government

2.17 All States/UTs have been advised to ensure compliance with the recommendation of the Committee (Annexure-II). The Government of India has made special efforts to widen the network of institutions involved with the MDMS. In addition to 41 Monitoring Institutions, the senior nutritionists from the reputed Home Science Colleges of various Agriculture University located at Ludhiana, Pant Nagar and Coimbatore have been included along with representatives of the Supreme Court Commissionerate and UNICEF in the teams of Joint Review Missions.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 12, Para No.4.10)

2.18 The Committee note that 41 Independent Institutions of Social Sciences Research including IIT Chennai are engaged in monitoring MDM Scheme in the country. The Committee observe that monitoring of the MDM scheme is not satisfactory albeit involving 41 independent institutions. The Committee note with satisfaction that on the advise of the Committee, the Government have deputed two Monitoring Institutes to six districts of Odisha to see whether caste discrimination is prevalent in preparation, serving and eating of MDM in schools. The Monitoring Institutes in their report have stated that they have not come across any form of discrimination in MDM Scheme. One Monitoring Institutes also contacted the public representative representing the districts concerned. Three Public representatives from Cuttack, Ganjam, Aska had informed Monitoring Institutes that they had never come across any incident of discrimination in schools rather opined that MDM Scheme has reduced the distances among students belonging to different castes/communities. The Committee strongly recommend the SC/ST representative should always be included in the Monitoring Institutes/survey etc. The Committee appreciate that the letters were issued to all States/UTs to assess and report the cases of discrimination against SCs/STs. 26 States/UTs in their replies

stated that no such discrimination have come to their notice. The Committee would like to know the replies of the remaining 7 States/UTs.

Reply of the Government

2.19 All States/UTs have been advised to ensure compliance with the recommendations of the Committee.

Replies have been received from all 35 States/UTs. They have confirmed that no instance of any discrimination has come to their notice.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 14, Para No. 4.15)

2.20 The Committee note that expenditure made by the Government on MDM Scheme are less than the budget allocation for the scheme since 2005-06. The Committee desire to know the reason for less utilizing the funds allocated for the purpose thereby depriving target beneficiaries including SC/ST children of MDMS.

Reply of the Government

2.21 As per MDM Guidelines, all children of eligible schools are entitled to get hot cooked mid day meals on all working days including SC/ST children.

The expenditure on MDMS in the last 5 years is as under:

Year	Budget allocation	Budget spent	%Expenditure
2008-09	8000	6688.02	84%
2009-10	8000	6937.79	87%
2010-11	9440	9128.44	97%
2011-12	10380	9901.91	95%
2012-13	11937	10867.9	91%
2013-14	13215	11063 (till 20th Jan 14)	83.71%

The scheme was extended to Upper Primary Stage with effect from 2008-09. The States/UTs were required to complete various procedural formalities for the setting up administrative structure before extending the scheme to Upper Primary classes. The States/UTs could utilize the allocated funds only after setting up of their administrative structure, the expenditure under the scheme during 2008-09 was therefore low. However, as the scheme gained ground in the upper primary stage, the pace of expenditure increased during 2009-10. Year wise details regarding main reason for saving are at **Annexure III**.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 16, Para No. 4.17)

2.22 The Committee would also like to urge upon the Government to explore whether MDMS can be brought under the ambit of Corporate Social Responsibility so that more and more children get benefited from MDMS and inflow of funds is also increased substantially which can further be utilized to broaden the scope of MDMS and also the quality and quantity of food served and for betterment of infrastructure.

Reply of the Government

2.23 As per the extant instructions, Central Public Sector Enterprises earning profit after tax less than 100 Cr, between 100-500 Cr and above 500 Cr. during the previous year, would contribute 3-5%, 2-3% and 1-2% of Profit After Tax (PAT) during the previous year, under Corporate Social Responsibility. The State Governments have been requested to explore the possibility of seeking CSR funds under Mid-Day Meal Scheme.

Government of India has embarked on a new initiative to promote hand washing with soap before the Mid Day Meals, as a campaign in all schools of India.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 20, Para No. 5.10)

2.24 The Committee note that the Working Group on Elementary Education (WGEE) for 12th Plan has recommended for enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers from existing Rs.1000 per cook per month to Rs.1500 for the year 2013-14 and 2014-15 and Rs.2000 per cook per month for the last two years of the 12th Plan. The revision will be made after approval of the competent authority. The Committee would like to endorse the view of WGEE and know the status of decision of the competent authority in the matter of enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers.

Reply of the Government

2.25 The proposal for the enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers has been included in the Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) Note for the 12th Plan. The comments of the appraisal agencies have been received and replies thereon given by MHRD. The EFC note has been finalized and submitted to the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) who have fixed the EFC meeting for the 30th January, 2014 for consideration of MHRD proposal on MDMS.

Comments of the Committee

2.26 Please see Para 1.42 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 21, Para No. 5.11)

2.27 The Committee note that there are fund constraints in replicating various initiatives taken by the Government of Andhra Pradesh at the National level. The Committee recommend that other States should be persuaded to implement the new initiatives for the welfare of SCs and STs in the States and for the success of MDM Schemes. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.

Reply of Government

2.28 Andhra Pradesh's 'Green Channel Scheme' pre-positions one month's requirement of funds to the implementing agencies in advance. The above initiative has ensured the availability of one month's funds in the schools in advance so that the Mid Day Meal Scheme is implemented smoothly without any interruption. The guidelines of the above scheme were circulated to all States/UTs with request to take necessary approval of competent authorities for introducing the Green Channel Scheme so that one month's requirement of funds are pre-positioned in advance to the implementing agencies in their States/UTs also.

Comments of the Committee

2.29 Please see Para 1.45 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 23, Para No. 5.13)

2.30 The Committee note that web-enabled Management Information System with Interactive Voice Response System for monitoring of Mid-Day Meal Scheme on real time basis is being developed with the help of NIC. Regional Conference had been held in July, 2011 at Jaipur, Hyderabad, Lucknow and Agartala to obtain feedback from States Governments. The Committee would like to know the outcome of such conferences and the action taken on the decision arrived at the conferences and also the current status of the web enabled MIs for monitoring MDMS. The Ministry should further develop a web portal where students, parents or teachers can lodge their complain or feedback about the quality of food being served. Use of social networking sites should also be encouraged for the purpose. Patrons should be encouraged to upload the photographs of meals being stores, cooked, served etc. The Committee is of the view that strong monitoring mechanism will help in improving the MDM scheme to some extent.

Reply of the Government

2.31 In the 4 Regional Workshops, the NIC had made presentations on prototype of Management Information System integrated with Interactive Voice Response System. Detailed discussions were held on finalization of data capture formats from the States/UTs to improve the MIS.

The MDM-MIS system has been launched for monitoring of the Mid Day Meal Scheme in June, 2012. The MDM-MIS would be integrated with IVRS to monitor the scheme on real time basis through community participation. There is a provision in MDM-MIS with IVRS and social audit of the scheme by School Management Committee and other stakeholders. The MDM-MIS with IVRS would also provide platform to lodge online complaints or the feedback about the quality of food being served.

CHAPTER III

Recommendations/Observation which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government

-----NIL-----

CHAPTER IV

Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Government and which require reiteration

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1, Para No. 2.20)

4.1 The Committee are distressed to note that the instances of untouchability are still prevailing in the country even after 65 years of Independence, though it is prohibited in the Constitution and punishable under the penal laws. The Committee observe that untouchability is mostly found in the remotest of the remote areas of the country and in coastal areas particularly in the State of Odisha. The Committee also find that the Central teams were not sent to the affected areas in the State of Odisha particularly in the coastal belt and therefore recommend that the Central Government should depute special team to visit these areas at once to investigate the cases of untouchability, to see the gravity of the situation and to suggest ways and means to tackle the malaise accordingly. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.

Reply of the Government

4.2 As directed by the Committee, two teams of Officers from the Department of School Education & Literacy were sent to five coastal districts (Puri, Jagatsingpur, Baleshwar, Khordha, Bhadrak) in Odisha from 11-15 November, 2012 to investigate the cases of untouchability, to see the gravity of the situation and to suggest ways and means to tackle the malaise accordingly a Scheduled Caste Officer of the rank of Deputy Secretary to the Government of India was a member of a team. During the visit, the teams made special efforts to contact the local Members of Parliament for seeking guidance to select such schools where discriminatory practices on the basis of caste were likely or prevalent.

4.3 The teams visited 76 schools in the above districts but could not come across a single case of discrimination in the visited schools. The copy of the report of the Teams on the above visit is enclosed at Annexure- I (copy of the report enclosed) for information etc. Prior to the visit of the above two teams, two Monitoring Institutions (MIs) had also visited Sambalpur, Kendrapara, Dhenkanal, Angul, Ganjam and Cuttak. Both the MIs also did not find/report any instance of discrimination.

Comments of the Committee.

4.4 Please see para 1.7 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 10, Para No. 3.11)

4.5 The Committee note that it has been alleged that ISKCON and Akshay Patra are collecting unauthorized and illegal donations/contributions from public in India and abroad for the Government sponsored Mid-Day Meal Scheme for school children in Karnataka. The Committee further note that cook-cum-helpers were agitating on the involvement of Akshay Patra Foundation in MDMS because it was depriving their employment in the school based cooking and serving the meal to the children. The independent Monitoring Institute of MDM Scheme has also reported that foundation is not serving eggs to the children on demand on the plea that it serves only vegetarian meals. The Committee are of the view that the allegations made against the Akshaya Patra Foundation should be examined thoroughly and if found guilty action should be initiated against the NGO and its involvement in the scheme should be reviewed/monitored. The Committee would like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.

Reply of the Government

4.6 Mid-Day Meal Guidelines provide that NGOs/Trusts/Centralized kitchens may be engaged for serving the meal to the children of the schools located in urban areas where there is shortage of space for construction of kitchen-cum-store in the school premises. 447 NGOs in 16 States/UTs are delivering mid day meal to 74,63,226 children. The mid-day meal guidelines prescribe that protein should be provided through dal. However, a few states like Odisha, Tamil Nadu, West Bengal are providing eggs in mid-day meal from their own resources. No central assistance is provided for eggs. Hence no punitive action can be taken against Akshaya Patra for not providing eggs under Mid-Day Meal. The Committee would like to be apprised of the progress made by the Government in this regard.

Comments of the Committee

4.7 Please see para 1.20 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 13, Para No. 4.13)

4.8 The Committee note that Mid Day Meal Scheme has been launched by the Government in order to encourage poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections to attend school regularly and to improve nutritional status of children in Class I to VIII in Government, local body and Government aided schools etc. The Committee fully support the objectives of the MDMS. However, recently it has been reported in print and electronic media that due to serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the State of Bihar some children died. The Committee take a serious view in the matter and, therefore, impress upon the Monitoring and Implementation agency of MDMS to maintain high standard of quality of food before serving to children and it must be checked and verified by the specialist Doctor to obviate any possibility of adulteration which is injurious to health or may cause death. The Committee strongly recommend

that responsibility should be fixed for lapses in serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the light of incident taken place in State of Bihar recently. The Committee would also like to be briefed of the report of Expert Committee constituted in this regard.

Reply of Government

4.9 23 children died on 16th July, 2013 after availing of Mid-Day Meal at Navsrijit Govt. Primary School, Gandaman, Block Masrakh, District Chhapra of Bihar and 46 children and 01 cook were hospitalized. A case was filed in Masrakh Police Station against Smt. Meena Kumari, Head Teacher of the School and others under Sections 302, 307, 328 and 120 (B) of Indian Penal Code. She was arrested and placed under suspension and disciplinary proceedings have been initiated against her. The services of the Block Resource Person have been terminated. The allegations against the Head Teacher as well as Shri Arjun Rai, husband of Head Teacher have been found to be true and charge sheet against them has been filed in the Court. The case is sub-judice. The incident is being investigated by Special Investigation Team (SIT) under the supervision of District Superintendent of Police.

4.10 MHRD received 34 complaints of poor quality of MDM during the last three years and in the current year. These complaints were referred to the concerned State Governments, who have taken necessary action in 25 out of the 34 cases. The allegations were not proved in 11 cases, while action has been taken by the State Governments in the remaining 14 cases. The action taken included a warning to the concerned NGO and officers responsible, the initiation of departmental proceedings against Principal/Headmaster and Inspector, the suspension of erring officials, the registration of criminal cases against the contractor / concerned staff for negligence, the cancellation of the contract of the supplier, the changing of cooks where required, and compensating children as per the directions of the court.

4.11 The report of the Expert Nutrition Committee is still awaited. The Committee will assess the adequacy, improving the quality and the safety of the Mid-Day Meal served in schools, thereafter submit the Report.

Comments of the Committee

4.12 Please see para 1.25 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 15, Para No. 4.16)

4.13 The Committee would also like to know whether any study has been conducted to ascertain the impact of MDMS on the drop-out rates of children from school and on the educational development of SCs/STs. The Committee had recommended the Government to undertake such a study, to find out the efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries particularly SCs/STs. The Committee would also like to know the outcome of the study.

Reply of the Government

4.14 The efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries is regularly assessed by the Joint Review Missions in each of the states on a regular basis. The Supreme Court Commissionerate also reviews the efficacy of the Scheme. Special field visits are also undertaken to assess the efficacy of the Scheme for SCs/STs. The common findings of the reports of 16 Joint Review Missions conducted in 2013 are as follows:-

- (i) Sensitisation of officials at District and Block level towards their role and responsibilities is essential for effective implementation of MDMS.
- (ii) Too many levels of fund flow should be reduced so that the funds should reach in time to the implementing agencies. Fund flow system may be streamlined for timely release of funds to the Districts, schools for the

- uninterrupted and smooth implementation of scheme; timely payment to cook-cum-helpers and Food Corporation of India. Andhra Pradesh' Green Channel Scheme may be adopted.
- (iii) The undernourished children, especially the 14 years age group, should be identified by periodical health checkups. The identified children should be given special care during MDM.
 - (iv) The MDMS guidelines with respect to tasting of the meal by the teachers should be strictly followed.
 - (v) In MDM menu, greens are used only as seasoning, quantity is very less. Separate green based recipes should be incorporated in menu.
 - (vi) Serving size is not accurate. Measures should be used to serve food as per norms.
 - (vii) Better convergence with the School Health program is essential. There is a need for the regular health monitoring. Vitamin A, Iron and Folic Acid supplements and deworming tablets should be provided on regular basis to the schools. Further, proper instructions regarding their dosage should be given to the teachers. Health cards, with duly filled record of each child need to be maintained and updated regularly in all the schools.
 - (viii) The State Govt. should engage adequate number of Cook-cum-Helpers in the schools as per norms. There is need to educate the cooks regarding proper weight of raw ingredients.
 - (ix) Drinking water should be tested for any type of biological contamination and remedial purification to be done accordingly.
 - (x) The rights and entitlement of children, menu, MDM logo, and emergency contact numbers should be displayed prominently on the outside wall of the schools.

- (xi) The meals should be more nutrient dense and nutritionally balanced. Inclusion of higher amounts of non tube vegetables is recommended.
- (xii) The gunny bags used for food grains can be auctioned and the amount can be utilized for better implementation of MDMS.
- (xiii) FIFO (First in and First out) system may be followed in the utilization of oil and other ingredients before their prescribed shelf life or 'best before use' period. Cooks and Helpers should be sensitized to 'First in First out principle.
- (xiv) A concerted effort for Health and Nutrition Education (HNE) is required for children, parents, teachers, cooks and caretakers. Feeding program along with HNE, may prove more effective in improving the health and nutritional status of the children.
- (xv) Effective monitoring mechanism should be developed by the State Govt. to ensure periodic inspection of the scheme by officials at all levels. Inspecting Officers should record their observations on the implementation of MDMS.
- (xvi) Provisions of Social and Community Audits should be made by the government to evaluate the implementation of programme and to identify gaps, with the involvement of.
- (xvii) The process of capacity building of the PRIs and S.M.C members should be initiated.
- (xviii) The authorities may work out feasibility of supplying grains in MDM-Stamped gunny/Poly bags to avoid pilferage during transportation.
- (xix) In view of the high prevalence of fire wood chulhas as a mode of cooking in the rural areas action may be initiated to provide environment eco-friendly smokeless chulhas in convergence with the concerned department in the State.

- (xx) Certain amount may be earmarked from the MME fund for procurement of large containers for storing food grains in schools so that rats and other insects may not spoil the rice.
- (xxi) Cooking is done mainly by firewood which not only denudes the forests but also produces a lot of smoke which is hazardous for health. The State Government may now install/convert chulhas into smokeless chulhas to combat the above problem.
- (xxii) The State Govt. should also constitute Review Mission at the State level and send them to various districts of the State every six months to review the implementation of the programme. The State Govt. officials looking after MDMS may join the Review Mission in other states under exchange scheme. Orientation visits to other states to see the implementation of the scheme will also widen the horizon of the officials.
- (xxiii) The Mid Day Meal Program is routed through schools so that correct nutrition messages, good eating habits and hygiene and sanitary practices are imparted and inculcated in children. Most of the Missions have strongly recommended availability of adequate water, adequate hygienic and sanitary toilet facilities and safe drinking water for the school going children.
- (xxiv) Action Plan may be drawn up with the time lines for construction of kitchen-cum-stores for which central assistance has already been received by the State Governments.

Comments of the Committee

4.15 Please see para 1.28 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 17, Para No. 4.21)

4.16 The Committee observe that proper infrastructure facility for cooking and distributing the Mid-Day Meal is not available in most of the schools across the country. The Committee note that where sufficient space is not available cluster of five/six schools is made for cooking and distributing mid day meal. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Government should provide proper infrastructure to each school for preparing MDM and its distribution. The Committee also recommend that Government should explore possibility to serve packed food having same calories and prepared in hygienic manner to the students where such facilities is not available.

Reply of the Government

4.17 The Central Govt. has started providing central assistance for infrastructure development under MDMS since 2006-07. Rs.7638.22 cr. has been released for 9.78 lakh kitchen cum stores. Central Assistance for procurement of kitchen devices for 11.01 lakh schools has been provided till date.

4.18 As per the direction of Hon'ble Supreme Court, MDM guidelines were issued for serving of hot cooked meal only to the children under MDMS. The packaged food is not allowed under MDMS. The National Food Security Act, 2013 also mandates that only hot cooked meals is to be served to the children under MDMS.

4.19 A national level workshop was organized in New Delhi in April 2013 to present before the States/UTs a model design for kitchen cum stores for adaptation at their level.

Comments of the Committee

4.20 Please see para 1.33 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 4.26)

4.21 The Committee note that Mid-Day Meal Scheme covers children of Classes I – VIII studying in Government, Local Body, Government aided and National Child Labour Projects schools and the Centre run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) Alternative and Innovative Education (AIE) Centres including Madrasas/Maktabs supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). The Committee feel that inclusion of students of Class IX and X under MDMS will help in reduction of dropout ratio particularly the students belonging to SC/ST community and improve the nutritional status. The Committee, therefore, desire that the scope of the scheme should be widen to cover the students studying in IX and X Class also.

Reply of the Government

4.22 The Working Group on Elementary Education for 12th Plan proposed to extend Mid-Day Meal Scheme to Classes IX & X. However, Planning Commission did not approve the proposal.

Comments of the Committee

4.23 Please see para 1.39 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 22, Para No. 5.12)

4.24 The Committee are happy to note that the Working Group of Elementary Education for 12th Plan has recommended for inclusion of children in private unaided schools in 109 Scheduled Tribes (ST) and 61 Scheduled Castes (SC) concentration districts under the MDM Scheme in a phased manner. The Committee recommend the Government to explore the possibilities for inclusion of more SC and ST concentrated districts in the country under MDMS. The Committee would like to know the present status of 109 STs and 61 SC concentration districts for inclusion in MDM Scheme.

Reply of the Government

4.25 The proposal for provision of MDM to the children of unaided private schools in SC, ST and Minority concentrated districts identified under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan has not been approved because of shortage of funds.

Comments of the Committee

4.26 Please see para 1.48 of Chapter – I.

CHAPTER – V

Recommendations/Observation in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 5, Para No. 2.24)

5.1 The Committee are, however, unhappy to note that out of seven teams deputed to four States to verify the reports of MLs regarding untouchability, SC/ST members were included only in two teams. The Committee, therefore, recommend that whenever such teams is constituted to verify the facts and smooth interaction with the affected members of the society, SC/ST member should invariable be included.

Reply of the Government

5.2 Nil

Recommendation (Sl. No. 6, Para No. 2.25)

5.5 The Committee also note that the Government propose to send five Review Missions consisting of representatives of the Central Government, UNICEF, State Governments of Karnataka, Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh, Sikkim and Nagaland to cover the remote areas to check instances of discrimination. The Committee recommend that MP/MLA and Members of SC/ST Communities should be included in the Review Mission. The Committee would like to be apprised about the findings of the Review Mission district-wise and the action taken against the persons provoking or practicing untouchability and also the post visit performance of the schools.

Reply of Government

5.6 As indicated, the Review Mission to the 4 of the 5 States mentioned above have already been completed as per the following details;

S. No.	State	Period of JRM	Districts Covered
1.	Karnataka	25th February to 4th March 2013	Chitradurg and Bengaluru
2.	Chhattisgarh	26th February to 2nd March 2013	Durg and Kanker
3.	Rajasthan	28th January to 4th February 2013	Kota and Tonk
4.	Nagaland	17th to 24th March 2013	Kohima and Dimapur

Sikkim could not be taken up because of the earthquake and Landslide. It is proposed to be taken up during 2013-14.

5.7 In addition, Review Missions have been completed for the following States;

Status of the 5th Joint Review Mission 2013			
S. No.	States	Time	Status
1.	New Delhi	22 April 1st May 2013	Done
2.	Gujarat	22 April to 30 April 2013	Done
3.	Himachal Pradesh	21 May to 30 May 2013	Done
4.	Andhra Pradesh	24 June to 4 July	Done
5.	Uttar Pradesh	8 July to 17 July 2013	Done
6.	Manipur	22 July to 31st July	Done
7.	Tripura	18 June to 27 June	Done
8.	Tamil Nadu	29 July to 9th August 2013	Done
9.	MP	11 August to 21 August 2013	Done
10.	Bihar	21 August to 31st August 2013	Done
11.	Maharashtra	30th Sept to 9th October 2013	Done
12.	Odisha	20 Sept to 33 September 2013	Done
13.	Jharkhand	21 October to 30 October 2013	Done
14.	Assam	11th November to 19th November	Done
15.	West Bengal	19th November to 29th November	Done
16.	Meghalaya	22nd November to 30th November 2013	Done
17.	Puducherry	4th December to 11th December 2013	Done
18.	Arunachal Pradesh	10th December to 19th December 2013	Done

5.8 One case of discrimination in Newari Block of Tonk district, village Banasthali was noticed by JRM during its visit to Rajasthan. The Brahmin cook was not serving mid day meal to children who primarily belonged to Bhil and Gujjar community. The services of the cook have been terminated.

Comments of the Committee

5.9 Please see Para 1.17 of Chapter – I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 18, Para No. 4.22)

5.10 The Committee note that Rs.5,962 crore were released for construction of 9,55,433 kitchen sheds, out of which 5,60,546 kitchen sheds have been constructed and 95,867 are under construction. The Committee would like to know the present status of the construction of kitchen sheds and amount utilized for the construction. The Committee also desire to know about the status of remaining 2,99,060 kitchen sheds. The Committee, also recommend that construction work should be completed expeditiously without compromising quality of work to avoid the time and cost overrun.

Reply of the Government

5.11 The current status of the progress on construction of kitchen-cum-store as under:

1. Sanctioned	-	9.78 lakh
2. Constructed	-	6.40 lakh
3. In progress	-	1.07 lakh
Constructions not yet started	-	2.32 lakh

State/UT wise details of the status is at Annexure V. The low performing State/UTs are being followed up.

NEW DELHI
April, 2015
Vaisakha, 1936 (Saka)

FAGGAN SINGH KULASTE
Chairman,
Committee on the Welfare
of Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes.

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES
AND SCHEDULED TRIBES
(2014-2015)**

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

TWELFTH SITTING

(08.04.2015)

MINUTES

The Committee sat from 1430 hrs. to 1700 hrs. in Room "G-074",
Ground Floor, Parliament Library Building, New Delhi

PRESENT

Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Dr. Ravindra Babu
3. Shri R. Dhruvanarayana
4. Shri Rattan Lal Kataria
5. Dr. Virendra Kumar
6. Shri Balbhadra Majhi
7. Smt. Pratima Mondal
8. Shri Ram Chandra Paswan
9. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
10. Shri Krupal Balaji Tumane
11. Dr. P. Venugopal
12. Shri Bhanu Pratap Singh Verma
13. Shri Chintaman Navsha Wanaga

RAJYA SABHA

14. Shri Ramadas Athawale
15. Shri D. Raja
16. Shri Ambeth Rajan
17. Dr. Vijaylaxmi Sadho
18. Shri J.D. Seelam
19. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
20. Shri S. Thangavelu
21. Mahant Shambhuprasadji Tundiya

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. R.K. Chadha, Additional Secretary
2. Shri D. R. Shekhar, Director
3. Shri Vinay Pradeep Barwa, Under Secretary

WITNESSES

MINISTRY OF HRD (DEPARTMENT OF HIGHER EDUCATION)

- | | | | |
|----|----------------------------|---|---|
| 1. | Shri Satayanarayan Mohanty | - | Secretary |
| 2. | Prof. Ved Prakash | - | Chairman (UGC) |
| 3. | Prof. Dinesh Singh | - | Vice Chancellor (University of Delhi) |
| 4. | Dr. Sukhbir Singh Sandhu | - | Joint Secretary (Central University and Language) |
| 5. | Shri R.C. Meena | - | Economic Advisor |
| 6. | Shri J.S. Sandhu | - | Secretary (UGC) |

MINISTRY OF HRD (DEPARTMENT OF SCHOOL EDUCATION & LITERACY)

- | | | | |
|----|------------------|---|---------------------------|
| 1. | Ms. Vrinda Sarup | - | Secretary |
| 2. | Ms. Rina Ray | - | Additional Secretary (SE) |
| 3. | Shri J.Alam | - | Joint Secretary (EEI) |
| 4. | Sri Gaya Prasad | - | Director |

The Committee called in the representatives of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) to take clarification regarding "Non-implementation of reservation policy in Delhi University in particular and other issues pertaining to Educational Development of SCs/STs in general".

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the representatives of Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education). Thereafter, Secretary, Department of Higher Education and the Vice Chancellor, Delhi University briefed the Committee on the subject. Subsequently the members raised certain queries relating to reservation for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes in teaching staff roster system in Delhi University and its affiliated colleges. The clarification given by the representatives of the Ministry as well as Delhi University were not satisfactory,

therefore, the Committee sought further information on their queries within 10 days. The Committee decided to hold further meeting in the subject matter in near future.

3. The evidence was not completed.

(The witnesses then withdrew)

4. A verbatim record of the proceeding was kept.

(At 1545 hrs.)

5. The representatives of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) were called in to take clarification on the subject "Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools".

6. At the outset, Chairperson welcomed the representatives of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy). Thereafter, Secretary briefed the Committee about the central teams visited some of the districts of Uttar Pradesh, Bihar and Madhya Pradesh to get wholesome view on the caste based discrimination under Mid Day Meal Scheme as desired by the Committee during the sitting held on 17th December, 2014. The central teams observed no caste based discrimination in these States. Thereafter, the Members raised certain issues in the subject matter which were responded by the representatives of the Ministry. The Committee requested the representatives of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) to send replies on the points on which information was not readily available with them to this Secretariat within 15 days.

7. The evidence was completed.

(The witnesses then withdrew)

8. A verbatim record of the proceedings was kept.

The Committee then adjourned.

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES
AND SCHEDULED TRIBES
(2014-2015)**

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

FOURTEENTH SITTING

(28.4.2015)

MINUTES

The Committee sat from 1500 hrs. to 1530 hrs. in Committee Room "C",
Ground Floor, Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi

PRESENT

Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Dr. Ravindra Babu
3. Shri Santokh Singh Chaudhary
4. Shri R. Dhruvanarayana
5. Shri Balbhadra Majhi
6. Smt. Kamla Patle
7. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
8. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
9. Shri Ajay Tamta

RAJYA SABHA

10. Shri Ramadas Athawale
11. Dr. Vijaylaxmi Sadho
12. Shri J.D. Seelam
13. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
14. Shri S. Thangavelu
15. Mahant Shambhuprasadji Tundiya

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. R.K. Chadha, Additional Secretary
2. Shri D.R. Shekhar, Director
3. Shri Vinay P. Barwa, Under Secretary

At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members of the Committee. The Committee then considered the draft Action Taken Report on the subject "Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools" and adopted the same without any modification.

2. The Committee also decided to undertake study visit to Srinagar, Bhubaneswar and Ahemdabad from 6th to 11th June, 2015.

The Committee then adjourned.

APPENDIX III

(Vide Para 4 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE THIRTIETH REPORT (FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA) OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES.

1. Total number of recommendations.....23

2. Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 2, 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 14, 16, 20, 21 and 23)
Number.....13
Percentage to the total.....57%

3. Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government.....NIL

4. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (vide recommendations Sl. Nos. 1, 10, 13, 15, 17, 19 and 22)
Number7
Percentage to the total.....30%

5. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received (vide Sl. No. 5, 6 and 8)
Number.....3
Percentage to the total13%