

**COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2016-2017)**

SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA

TWELFTH REPORT

(Presented on -----)



सत्यमेव जयते

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI
August, 2017/Shravana, 1939(Saka)**

CONTENTS

PAGE

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2016-2017)	(iii)
INTRODUCTION	(v)
<u>REPORT</u>	
Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh	
ANNEXURES	
Annexure-I	Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh for the years 2012-2013 to 2015-2016
Annexure-II	The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh for the years 2012-13 to 2014-15

APPENDICES	
Appendix-I	The Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 18 April, 2016
Appendix-II	Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 20 July, 2017

COMPOSITION OF COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2016-2017)

Shri Chandrakant Khaire - **Chairperson**

M E M B E R S

2. Shri Dushyant Chautala
3. Shrimati Veena Devi
4. Shri P.C. Gaddigoudar
5. Shri Laxman Giluwa
6. Shri Choudhury Mohan Jatua
7. Shrimati Mausam Noor
8. Shri Bheemrao B. Patil
9. Shri Sanjaykaka Ramchandra Patil
10. Shri Bishnupada Ray
11. Shri Midhun Reddy
12. Shri Uday Pratap Singh
13. Shri Virendra Singh
14. Shri P.R. Sundaram
15. Shri Manohar Untwal

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. Preeti Srivastava - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Rita Jailkhani - Director
3. Smt. Maya Lingi - Additional Director
4. Shri K.P. Kashyap - Executive Assistant

INTRODUCTION

I, Chairperson of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table of the House (2016-17), having been authorized by the Committee to present this Report on their behalf, present this Twelfth Report in respect of delay in laying of the Annual Reports together with Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh.

2. In terms of the recommendation of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in its First Report, Second Report (5th Lok Sabha) and Second Report (6th Lok Sabha) presented to the House on 08 March 1976, 12 May 1976 and 22 December 1977 respectively, the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Organisation/Company are required to laid on the Table of the House within nine months of the closure of Accounting Year.

3. The Committee considered the matter of delays in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh and took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) at their sitting held on 18 April, 2016.

4. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 20 June, 2017.

5. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the officers of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) for furnishing the written replies, other material/information and for placing their views in the matter before the Committee.

6. The Observations / Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold letters at the end of the Report.

New Delhi
August, 2017
Shravana, 1939 (Saka)

Chandrakant B. Khaire
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table

REPORT

Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh

The All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh, Six AIIMS healthcare institutes are established by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India under the Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojna (PMSSY). The objective is to ameliorate regional imbalances in quality tertiary level healthcare in the country, and attain self sufficiency in graduate and postgraduate medical education and training. To hasten this objective the PMSSY proposed to set up 6 new AIIMS like institutions in an underserved areas in health care in the country. These institutions are being established by an Act of Parliament on the lines of the original All India Institute of Medical Sciences in New Delhi which imparts both undergraduate and postgraduate medical education in all its branches and related fields, along with nursing and paramedical training, to bring together in one place, educational facilities of the highest order for the Training of personnel in all branches of health care activity. As per Rule 212(3) of General Financial Rules (GFR), Government of India, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Autonomous organisations are required to be laid in the Table of the House within nine months of the closing of the Accounting year.

2. As per the recommendation of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in Paras 1.16 and 3.5 of its First Report (5th Lok Sabha), and Paras 4.16 and 4.18 of Second Reports of 5th Lok Sabha and Paras 3.6 to 3.8 of Second Report of 6th Lok Sabha presented to the House on 08.03.1976, 12.05.1976 and 22.12.1977 respectively, the Annual Report and Audited Accounts alongwith Review Statement of the Institutes are required to be laid within 09 months of the close of the respective Accounting Year. To comply with this requirement proper time schedule should be laid down for compilation of Annual Report and Accounts and their auditing. The Committee felt that normally a period of 3 months would be sufficient for compilation of accounts and their submission to audit; the next 6 months might be given for auditing of accounts; printing of the report and sending it to Government for laying. If for any reason, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes could not be laid within the prescribed period of 9 months, the Ministry concerned should lay a Statement within 30 days of the expiry of the said period or as soon as the House meets whichever is later, explaining the reasons as to why the documents could not be laid in time.

3. The scrutiny by the Parliamentary Committee on Papers Laid on the Table reveals that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes for the years 2012-13 to 2014-2015 were laid on the Table of the House with delays ranging from 19 months to 2½ months and 2015-16 were laid on the Table of the House within stipulated time period. The dates of laying and extent of delay, in laying of the Annual Reports/Audited Accounts of the Institutes have been given at Annexure-I.

4. The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) has laid a Statement along-with Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 on 13 August, 2015 and for the year 2014-15 on 16 March, 2016. Hon'ble Minister of State for Health and Family Welfare submitted the reasons for delay in laying of the Annual Reports 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15 on the Table of the House.

5. On being asked by the Committee, about the chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Institutes for the years 2012-2013 to 2014-2015 the Institutes have furnished the same details, which have been given at Annexure-II.

6. On being enquired by the Committee about the justification for repeated delays in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes, the Institutes in its written note submitted as under:-

"The broad reasons for delay in laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of are as follows:

(i) AIIMS, Raipur :

"The Annual Report of AIIMS, Raipur for the year 2012-13 and 2013-14 were laid down in the Parliament on 13-08-2015. The delay occurred due to reason that the CAG Audit was conducted on 21-04-2014 (for year 2012-13) and 19-12-2014 (for year 2013-14) and the final audited statement from CAG was received on 29-09-2014 (for year 2012-13) and 27-05-2015 (for year 2013-14). As this was the 1st Audited Report to be laid down by the Parliament, same was prepared and sent to MoHFW on 03-08-2015."

(ii) AIIMS, Bhopal :

"The Annual Report of AIIMS, Bhopal for the year 2012-13 and 2013-14 were laid down in the Parliament on 13.08.2015. The reason for delay is that AIIMS Bhopal was a new institution established in 2012. However, the Annual Report has been laid in the Parliament with minimal delay. MoHFW has now set the deadlines to the AIIMS to avoid any delay in future."

(iii) AIIMS, Bhubaneswar :

"AIIMS, Bhubaneswar is a new Institute started during 2012. As the project is not yet completed, the issue of manpower recruitment, construction etc. are yet to be completed. The required infrastructure for preparation of Annual Report was not available causing delay in submission in spite of our best effort."

(iv) AIIMS, Jodhpur :

"AIIMS Jodhpur was set up after enactment of AIIMS (Amendment) Act, 2012 w.e.f. 16.07.2012, so Financial Year 2012-13 was the first year of its operation. The annual accounts for F.Y. 2012-13 were placed before the first meeting of Adhoc Committee on Finance of AIIMS Jodhpur held on 14.06.13 for consideration and adoption. Wherein it was decided that since the AIIMS Act, 1956 provide for audit of new AIIMS by C&AG of India, so Ministry of Health and Family Welfare would write to the C&AG to take up the audit of new AIIMS as per provisions of the act. Meanwhile, Secretary MoHFW request C&AG vide his D.O. No. Z-28016/118/2013-SSH dated 06.06.2013 to take up audit of the accounts of new AIIMS.

Thereafter, C&AG office asked AIIMS Jodhpur to submit annual accounts for the year 2012-13 along with minutes of meeting of Governing Body of AIIMS, Jodhpur in which the said annual accounts were approved vide their letter no. CRA-II(exp)/ABs/Annual A/c/ 2012-13/501 dated 31.07.2013. The annual accounts of F.Y. 2012-13 AIIMS Jodhpur were submitted to C&AG for their audit on 07.08.2013. But on 01.10.13 C&AG audit team refused to audit the accounts till the accounts are approved by the Governing Body of AIIMS Jodhpur. Then, Ministry vide letter no Z-28016/118/2013-SSH dated 22.01.2014 authorized the Director of each new AIIMS to approve the accounts of the Institute and to submit it to C&AG for audit. Thereafter, audit of annual accounts for FY 2012-13 was conducted by C&AG. Due to all these initial issues audit were delayed for FY 2012-13 which lead to delay in all further activities. As there was delay in audit of first year F.Y. 2012-13, subsequent audit by C&AG for FY 2013-14 was also delayed."

The Institutes in its written note further submitted as under:-

"However, Annual Report for FY 2014-15 was laid with minimal delay. MoHFW has been giving a high priority to this matter to ensure timely laying of the Annual Report. It would be ensured that delays are avoided in future."

(v) AIIMS, Patna:

"Audit of accounts for the year 2012-2013 started in January 2014. Moreover extension of time for laying of Annual Reports/Audited Statement of Accounts was sought by MoHFW vide letter no. H.11021/07/204-Parliament dated 30.12.2014. Thus 2012-2013 was initiated when MoHFW identified the region as Lucknow from where audit had to be done. For 2013-2014 submission was delayed due to late compilation of accounts. Delay was due to no regular AO in the institute since Nov. 2013. The accounts of 2012-2013 was submitted with 2013-2014."

(vi) AIIMS, Rishikesh :

"The Director and other few faculties were appointed in July 2012. There was no infrastructure and staff. The recruitment rules were also not in existence. Consequently, staff could not be appointed which resulted delay in compliance of statutory obligations. Thus, in view of Justification furnished above, the delays may please be condoned."

7. On being enquired by the Committee as to whether the Institute has identified the stages at which the delays have occurred during all these years and also as to how the Institute propose to contain delays in future, the Institutes in its written note submitted as under:-

(i) AIIMS, Raipur :

"The delay occurred in the FY 2012-13 & 2013-14 due to late receipt of audited Annual Account as the institution was new and it is now streamlined as the report for 2014-15 was submitted timely by the institute."

(ii) AIIMS, Bhopal :

"The delay occurred in the FY 2012-13 & 2013-14 because the institution was new and it is now streamlined as the report for 2014-15 was submitted timely by the institute."

(iii) AIIMS, Bhubaneswar :

"The delay was occurred due to non-availability of required infrastructure, manpower etc. No DD(A) till 15.02.2013 and from 4.4.2014 to 20.8.2015. No. FA from 2nd November 2012 to 1st September 2013 and No SE from 2nd September 2014 to 23rd October 2015 the Institute being only four years old. However, recruitment of regular manpower is under process to curtail delay in future."

(iv) AIIMS, Jodhpur :

"AIIMS, Jodhpur was set up w.e.f. 16th July, 2012 and the financial year 2012-13 was the first year of operation for AIIMS, Jodhpur. The issue of approval of annual accounts by the Director of the Institute was considered by the Ministry in place of its approval of Governing Body of the Institute as required by C&AG. The delay will not happen in future."

(v) AIIMS, Patna:

"The delay for the year 2012-2013 was mainly because letter relating to entrustment of audit was issued on 06.08.2013 and as such audit of the accounts started behind the schedule and audit of annual accounts started in March/April, 2014. The reasons are unlikely to occur from 2014-15 onwards and we will be paying due importance to the laid down schedule."

(vi) AIIMS, Rishikesh :

"As per notification dated 3rd March 1958, there is a provision in clause-10 that Annual Statement of Accounts including Balance Sheet up to 31st March every year together with the audit report thereon shall be forwarded annually to the government not later than 31st December following.

Whereas, the provision of submission of annual report has been fixed 31st August following.

The annual accounts and audit reports are part of the annual report. The delay submission of audit report from C&AG of India is also a cause of delay in submission of annual report. For curtailing the delay in future, the Institute has initiated recruitment of regular posts."

8. On further being enquired by the Committee as to whether there had been delay in appointment of auditors for the purpose of auditing of Annual Accounts of the Institute for the years 2012-2013 to 2014-2015, AIIMS, Patna in its written note stated as under:-

"In the initial year 2012-2013 there was delay in appointment of auditors since the year 2012 was the year of inception of the institute."

9. On being asked by the Committee about the work of translation of documents in Hindi Version and subsequent printing thereof, the Institutes in its written replies stated as under:-

"the Institutes initially has faced problem for translation of Annual Report in Hindi for the year 2012-13 and 2013-14. Now, the problem has been sorted out by identifying and listing an agency for this purpose."

AIIMS, Bhubaneswar also stated in its written Note that :

"The Institute is not having any regular staff other than three (i.e. DDA, FA & AO) and effort is being taken to recruit Hindi Translator/Hindi Officer to translate the documents into Hindi."

10. When the Committee asked about the status of computerization of Accounts to facilitate speedy and timely compilation of Accounts of the Institutes, the Institutes in its written replies submitted as under:-

"Yes, Accounts of the Institute are prepared and compiled in computerized manner. We are using Tally ERP software to record and maintain the accounts of the Institute."

11. To a query about the internal auditing mechanism to ensure timely compilation of Accounts of the Institutes and also to minimize audit queries at the time of auditing, the Institutes in its written replies, stated as under:-

"The Institutes has internal Auditing mechanism to ensure timely compilation of Accounts and also to minimize the audit queries at the time of auditing. C&AG has found adequate internal audit system in the Institutes and the same has been mentioned in Separate Audit Report of C&AG."

The AIIMS, Patna has also submitted in its written note, as under :

"Though internal audit wing is not there, FA of the Institute discharge this responsibility"

12. When the Committee desired to know about the mechanism in place in the Ministry to monitor the progress of work so as to ensure timely laying of the documents, the Institutes in its written note stated as under :-

"Parliament Division of Ministry of Health & FW and also administrative division dealing with the Institutes regularly monitors the progress of work. During 2014-15, Ministry of Health & FW issued circular to all Institutes vide circular dated 19.08.2015 to submit the Annual Report within the set time. As a follow up, AIIMS were requested vide letter dated 09.09.2015 and D.O. letter dated 13.11.2015."

13. As regards the query of the Committee about the remedial measures taken to ensure timely laying of the documents in the House, within the prescribed period of nine months from the close of accounting year, the Institutes in its written reply stated as under:-

"remedial measures have been taken by the Ministry and the Institutes to ensure timely laying of the documents before Parliament within the prescribed period of nine months from the close of the Accounting Year, in future. Ministry of Health & FW issued circular to all Institutes vide circular dated 19.08.2015 to submit the Annual Report within the set time. As a follow up, AIIMS were requested vide letter dated 09.09.2015 and D.O. letter dated 13.11.2015. As a result, the Annual Report for FY 2014-15 could be laid with minimal delay"

14. The Committee considered the matter of delays in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes for the years 2012-2013 to 2014-2015 and took evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) and the Institutes on the issue on 18 April, 2016.

15. Elaborating further the reasons for delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes, the representative of the Ministry during the evidence stated as under:

"Sir, I would like to explain about delay. There are 57 autonomous organisations in our Ministry. Out of these Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 40 Institutes have been laid in the Parliament before 31st December for the year 2014-15 and Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 09 Institutes have been laid in the month of March in the first part of Budget Session. Thus Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 49 Institutes out of 57 Organisations have been laid. During the previous year Annual Report and Audited Accounts of 48 Institutes out of 56 Institutes were laid in time either before Budget Session or during Budget Session. So you can see that we have made sufficient progress in this regard."

As far as question of the Six AIIMS is concerned, 2012-13 was their first year. They prepared their respective accounts but approval of IB could not be obtained. IB was constituted in November 2013 at the end. That was the time to lay their report, but till then only the constitution of IB could not be summand immediately. Once it became clear that the meeting of IB cannot be solemnised then it was decided in January, 2014 the directors of the Institute concerned will approve their respective accounts. Once they are approved then the Audit work started. This work consumed seven to eight months.

The Audit was completed in August-September. As far as Annual Report is concerned this being their first year they could not take up the job simultaneously because of lack of experience. It was done in a series. Once Annual Report was prepared, its Hindi translation took some time and by that time it was April month. So that could be laid only during Monsoon Session. That's why it was delayed by eight months. As soon as the account of year 2012-13 was approved, the account of year 2013-14 was also approved and the same was also sent for Audit immediately. That's why there was little delay for this year. That was presented in 2015 and there was delay upto eight months for the year 2013-14. This year was finished by the end of December. The IB approval was taken. We wished it to be laid in Winter Session but could not do that; so we had to wait for Budget Session, so it caused delay of 2½ months. Now the system has been streamlined and it will be laid in time. We have written many letters to AIIMS. We will try to get it approved by G.B. and IB and definitely we will submit the Account of 2016 in time."

Observations/Recommendations

16. The Committee have time and again emphasized that both the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of an Organisation should be laid on the Table of the House simultaneously so as to enable the Members of Parliament to get a complete picture of the working and activities of the Organisation. However, the Committee are disappointed to note that the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has failed to comply with the specific recommendations of the Committee in laying the requisite documents of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh before Parliament during the years 2012-13 to 2014-2015. The committee note that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 were delayed ranging from 07 to 19 months. The Committee also note that the reasons for delay was mainly that the five Institutes were newly established, without proper infrastructure, man power, lack of Hindi translator, delay in appointment of Auditor, delay submission of Audit Report from C&AG and also lack of experience in laying of the requisite documents on the Table of the House.

17. The Committee also note that the work related to laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for the year 2014-15 had been finished and Institution Board (IB) approval was taken by the end of December, but the requisite documents could not be laid in Winter Session. Further, the documents for the year 2014-15 were laid in Budget Session, 2016 with delays of 2½ months. The Institutes also assured to streamline the process of laying of documents in stipulated time in near future. The Committee appreciates the efforts taken by the Ministry/Institutes to lay the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for the year 2015-16 within the stipulated time period.

18. The Committee also impress upon the Ministry that if for any reasons, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institutes could not be laid on the Table of the House within the stipulated time; a statement explaining the reasons as to why the requisite documents could not be laid within prescribed period should be laid strictly within 30 days as recommended by the Committee in its earlier Report.

20, June, 2017
30 Jyaistha, 1939 (Saka)

Chandrakant B. Khaire
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table

Annexure-I
vide para 03 of the Report

Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh.

Year	Date of laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts	Extent of delay
2012-13	13.08.2015	19 months
2013-14	13.08.2015	07 months
2014-15	16.03.2016	2½ months
2015-16	16.12.2016	No Delay

Annexure-II
vide para 05 of the Report

The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences - Raipur, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna and Rishikesh for the years 2012-13 to 2014-15

S. No	Questions	Years	Raipur	Bhopal	Bhubaneswar	Jodhpur	Patna	Rishikesh
a.	The date on which the Institutes approached the Audit Authorities to appoint the auditors for auditing the Accounts and date of their appointment	2012-13	23-09-13	14-06-13	22-01-13	Vide letter dated 06th June, 2013, the Ministry requested the C&AG to take up the Audit of the Accounts of new AIIMS.	26-08-13	05-12-13
		2013-14	01-07-14	11-12-14	22-01-13		10-11-14	20-08-14
		2014-15	24.06.15	31.07.15	22-01-13		06.10.15	21.07.15
b.	The date of compilation of Annual Accounts of the Institutes	2012-13	20-09-13	11-06-13	07-02-14	31-05-13	28-02-14	20-05-13
		2013-14	30-06-14	10-12-14	30-06-14	27-06-14	19-12-14	27-05-14
		2014-15	23.06.15	30.07.15	20.06.15	10.06.15	06.11.15	14.07.15
c.	The date on which the Annual Accounts were submitted to Auditors for auditing	2012-13	23-09-13	14-06-13	07-02-14	07-08-13	28-02-14	05-12-13
		2013-14	30-06-14	11-12-14	08-07-14	30-06-14	19-12-14	20-08-14
		2014-15	24.06.15	31.07.15	20.06.15	11.06.15	06.11.15	21.07.15
d.	The date and duration for auditing the Annual Accounts of the Institutes by Auditors	2012-13	21-04-14 to 28-05-14	28-10-13 to 12-11-13	10-02-14 to 21-02-14	21-04-14 to 09-05-14	06-03-14 to 23-04-14	13-01-14 to 25-01-14
		2013-14	19-12-14 to 09-01-15	22-12-14 to 01-01-15	14-07-14 to 24-07-14	11-08-14 to 22-08-14	15-05-15 to 26-05-15	20-08-14 to 30-09-14
		2014-15	06.07.15 to 31.07.15	31.08.15 to 29.09.15	06.07.15	06.07.15 to 14.07.15	14.12.15 to 04.01.16	21.07.15 to 28.08.15
e.	The date of queries raised by Auditors during auditing of Annual Accounts	2012-13	20-06-14	28-10-13 to 12-11-13	10-02-14 13-02-14 17-02-14 18-02-14 19-02-14	21.04.2014	20-06-14	13-01-14 to 25-01-14
		2013-14	03-02-15	22-12-14 to 01-01-15	14-07-14 15-07-14 17-07-14 21-07-14 22-07-14 23-07-14 24-07-14	11-08-14	03-02-15	20-08-14 to 30-09-14
		2014-15	26.08.15	31.08.15 to 29.09.15	06-07-15 07-07-15 09-07-15 13-07-15 14-07-15 15-07-15 17-07-15 20-07-15	06.07.15	26.08.15	21.07.15 to 28.08.15

f.	The date on which the replies to the audit queries was furnished to the Auditors	2012-13	04-07-14	29-10-13 to 12-11-13	21-02-14	09-05-14	14-07-14	25-01-14
		2013-14	17-02-15	22-12-14 to 01-01-15	24-07-14	22-08-14	03-07-15	30-09-14
		2014-15	01.09.15	31.08.15 to 29.09.15	21.07.15	14.07.15	01.02.16	29.08.15
g.	The date on which draft Audit Report was issued by Audit Authorities	2012-13	29-09-14	20-05-14	03-03-14	20-05-14	05-06-14	24-03-14
		2013-14	27-05-15	09-01-15	18-08-14	03-09-14	22-06-15	21-11-14
		2014-15	07.11.15	01.10.15	11.08.15	23.07.15	20.01.16	20.10.15
h.	The date on which the final audit report was received by the Institute	2012-13	29-09-14	18-08-14	03-03-14	10-09-14	17-11-14	23-01-15
		2013-14	27-05-15	27-02-15	20-10-14	10-12-14	29-09-15	09-02-15
		2014-15	07.11.15	07.12.15	30.10.15	06.10.15	Final Report awaited. DSAR by Dy. Director are enclosed.	11.12.15
i.	The date of finalization of Annual Reports	2012-13	17-06-15	30-04-15	17-04-15	21-04-15	10-07-15	29-04-15
		2013-14	17-06-15	30-04-15	17-04-15	31-04-15	10-07-15	22-04-15
		2014-15	24.11.15	04.11.15	27.10.15 While the Annual Report Under Process for printing the SAR on Accounts dated 30.10.2015 were added for printing at the last moment	06.10.15	10.02.16	11.12.15
j.	The date on which documents were got approved from the Competent Authority	2012-13	23-07-15	23-07-15	17-04-15	20-07-15	21-07-15	28-07-15
		2013-14	23-07-15	23-07-15	17-04-15	20-07-15	21-07-15	28-07-15
		2014-15	04.12.15	11.12.15	27.10.15 While the Annual Report Under Process for printing the SAR on Accounts dated 30.10.2015 were added for printing at the last moment	13.10.15	11.02.16 to 23.02.16 (through circulation)	11.12.15
k.	The date on which documents were taken up for translation & printing and the time taken for completing the task	2012-13	27-07-15	02-05-15 to 27-06-15	20-04-15	24-07-15	03-08-15	29-04-15
		2013-14	27-07-15	02-05-15 to 27-06-15	20-04-15	24-07-15	03-08-15	22-04-15
		2014-15	06.12.15	07.11.15 to 13.12.15	20.11.15	12.12.15	17.02.16	11.12.15

**THE EXTRACTS OF THE MINUTES OF THE EIGHTH SITTING OF THE
COMMITTEE HELD ON 18.04.2016**

* * *

The Committee held its sitting on Monday, 18 April, 2016, from 1100 hours to 1230 hours in Committee Room No.'62', Parliament House, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Chandrakant Khaire - Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri P. C. Gaddigoudar
3. Shri Laxman Giluwa
4. Shri Choudhury Mohan Jatua
5. Shri Bheemrao B. Patil
6. Shri Manohar Untwal

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri U.B.S. Negi - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Maya Lingi - Additional Director

**REPRESENTATIVES OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE
(DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE)**

1. Shri B.P. Sharma Secretary
2. Shri Sudip Srivastav Director
3. Shri S.C. Rajiv Director

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE ALL INDIA INSTITUTES OF MEDICAL SCIENCES

4. Dr. Nitin M. Nagarkar Director, AIIMS, Raipur and officiating charge of Director AIIMS, Bhopal
5. Dr. A.K. Mahapatra Director, AIIMS, Bhubaneswar
6. Dr. Sanjeev Misra Director, AIIMS, Jodhpur
7. Dr. G.K. Singh Director, AIIMS, Patna
8. Dr. Raj Kumar Director, AIIMS, Rishikesh

2. At the outset, Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee.

3. xx xx xx xx

4. xx xx xx xx

5. Thereafter, the Committee called the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health & Family Welfare) and All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Patna; All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Rishikesh; All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhopal; All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Raipur; All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar; and All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Jodhpur.

6. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of the Ministry and the Institutes to the sitting of the Committee and explained the purpose of convening the meeting. The Chairperson also explained to the witnesses the provisions of Direction 58 of Directions issued by the Speaker, Lok Sabha regarding confidentiality of the proceedings.

7. On being asked by the Committee about the reasons for delays ranging from 2½ to 19 months in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of All India Institutes of Medical Sciences for the period of 2012-2013 to 2014-2015, the Secretary of the Ministry explained that there are 57 autonomous organisation. Out of these, Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 40 Institutes have been laid in the Parliament before 31 December for the year 2014-15 and Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 9 Institutes have been laid in the month of March in the first Part of Budget Session. Thus Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 49 Institutes out of 57 Organisation have been laid. During the previous year Annual Report and Audited Accounts of 48 Institutes out of the 56 institutes were laid in time during Budget Session.

He further added regarding these 06 AIIMS - 2012-13 was their first year. They prepared their respective Accounts but approval of Institutes Body (IB) could not be obtained. IB was constituted in November 2013 at the end. that was the time to lay their report, but till then only the constitution of IB could take place and the meeting of IB could not be summoned immediately. He also stated in January, 2014 the Directors of the Institutes concerned will approve their respective accounts. The Audit work consumed seven to eight months and completed in August-September. Regarding Annual Report he added it is their first year they could not take up this job simultaneously because of lack of experience. They also took some time upto April for Hindi translation, so that they laid documents during Monsoon Session with

delayed by eight months. The Accounts of year 2013-14 was also approved with 2012-13 and sent for Audit immediately, so that they laid the documents for the year 2013-14 with delays upto eight months. He further stated this year we finished it by the end of December and IB approval was taken, but it could not laid in Winter Session. They had laid the documents for the year 2014-15 in Budget Session with delays of 2½ months. He also assured that now system has been streamlined and it will be laid in time, we have written many letters to AIIMS and will try to get it approved by Governing Body and Institutes Body and definitely submit the accounts by 2016.

8. Thereafter, the Chairperson thanked the representatives of the Ministry and the Institutes for the useful discussion and responding to the queries raised by the Members - in connection with examination of the subject and hoped that utmost care would be taken to ensure that there would not be any delay in laying of the reports on the Table of the House.

9. The witnesses then withdrew.

10. A copy of the verbatim proceedings of the sitting of the Committee has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.

**THE EXTRACTS OF THE MINUTES OF THE TENTH SITTING OF THE
COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2016-2017)**

The Committee sat on Tuesday, 20 June, 2017 from 11:30 hrs to 13:00 hrs. in Committee Room 'E', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Chandrakant Khaire - **Chairperson**

MEMBERS

2. Shri P.C. Gaddigoudar
3. Shri Choudhary Mohan Jatua
4. Shrimati Mausam Noor
5. Shri Sanjay Kaka Patil
6. Shri Bishnu Pada Ray
7. Shri Virendra Singh
8. Shri P.R. Sundaram
9. Shri Manohar Untwal

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. Preeti Srivastava - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Rita Jailkhani - Director
3. Smt. Maya Lingi - Additional Director

XX XX XX XX

2. At the outset, Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee.
3. Thereafter, the Committee took up for consideration the draft twelfth Report regarding delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the (a) All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Patna (b) All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Rishikesh (c) All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhopal (d) All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Raipur (e) All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar (f) All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Jodhpur.

3. After deliberations, the Committee adopted the Report without modifications.
4. The Committee authorized the Hon'ble Chairperson to present the same to the Parliament.

XX XX XX XX

XX XX XX XX

The Committee then adjourned.