

17

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS
AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (2016-2017)**

SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA

**MINISTRY OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD
AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION
(DEPARTMENT OF FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION)**

{Action Taken by the Government on the observations/
recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Committee (2016-17)
on the subject 'Computerization of Targeted Public Distribution System'
pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution
(Department of Food and Public Distribution)

SEVENTEENTH REPORT



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

July, 2017/ Shravana, 1939 (Saka)

(i)

SEVENTEENTH REPORT

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS
AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (2016-2017)**

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

**MINISTRY OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION
(DEPARTMENT OF FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION)**

{Action Taken by the Government on the observations/
recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Committee (2016-
17) on the subject 'Computerization of Targeted Public Distribution System'
pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution
(Department of Food and Public Distribution)}

Presented to Lok Sabha on 10.08.2017

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 10.08.2017



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

July, 2017/ Shravana, 1939 (Saka)

CONTENTS

Composition of the Committee	
INTRODUCTION	
Chapter I	Report.....
Chapter II	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government.....
Chapter III	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies.....
Chapter IV	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee
Chapter V	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited.....

APPENDICES

- (I) Minutes of the Fourteenth sitting of the Committee held on 02.06.2017
- (II) Analysis of the action taken by the government on the observations/ recommendations contained in the Twelfth report of the Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution (2016-17)

Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution (2016-17).

Shri J.C. Divakar Reddy, Chairperson

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Anto Antony
3. Shri R. K. Bharathimohan
4. Shri Babu Lal Choudhary
5. Shri Sanjay Haribhau Jadhav
6. Shri Dinesh Kashyap
7. Shri Dharmendra Kumar
8. Shri Ravinder Kushawaha
9. Smt. Sakuntala Laguri
10. Dr. Swami Sakshi Ji Maharaj
11. Shri Sunil Kumar Mondal
12. Shri Kamlesh Paswan
13. Shri Ram Chander Paswan
14. Shri C.S. Putta Raju
15. Smt. Priyanka Singh Rawat
16. Shri Midhun Reddy
17. Shri Bhola Singh
18. Shri Sukhbir Singh Jaunapuriya#
19. Shri Shibu Soren
20. Shri Bhagwanth Khuba#
21. Shri Nandi Yellaiah

Rajya Sabha

22. Shri Shadi Lal Batra
23. Smt. Misha Bharti
24. Shri Ripun Bora
25. Shri Vinay Katiyar
26. Smt. M. C. Mary Kom
27. Ms. Rekha
28. Dr. K. Keshava Rao
29. Shri Amar Shankar Sable
30. Shri Veer Singh
31. Vacant@

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

- | | | |
|----------------------------------|---|-------------------------|
| 1. Shri P.V.L.N. Murthy | - | Joint Secretary |
| 2. Shri Lovekesh Kumar Sharma | - | Director |
| 3. Shri Khakhai Zou | - | Additional Director |
| 4. Smt. Darshana Gulati Khanduja | - | Sr. Executive Assistant |

*Shri Prabhubhai Nagarbhai Vasava, M.P. (Lok Sabha) ceased to be a Member of the Standing Committee on FCA & PD w.e.f. 19th October, 2016.

#Bhagwanth Khuba, M.P. (Lok Sabha) and Shri Sukhbir Singh Jaunapuriya, M.P. (Lok Sabha) have been nominated as Members of the Standing Committee on FCA & PD w.e.f. 19th October, 2016.

@ Shri Mithun Chakraborty, MP (RS) ceased to be a member of the Committee upon his resignation from the membership of Rajya Sabha w.e.f. 28.12.2016.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution (2016-17) having been authorized by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, present this Seventeenth Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Committee (2016-17) on the subject 'Computerization of Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS)' of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution).

2. The Twelfth Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 23 November, 2016. The Government have furnished their replies indicating Action Taken on the recommendations contained in the Report on 16 February, 2017.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the Committee at their sitting held on 2 June, 2017.

4. An analysis of the action taken by the Government on Observations/Recommendations contained in the Report is given in **Appendix II**.

5. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations/Comments of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the text of the Report.

**NEW DELHI;
23 July, 2017
01 Shravana, 1939 (Saka)**

**J.C. DIVAKAR REDDY,
Chairperson,
Standing Committee on Food,
Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution.**

REPORT CHAPTER - I

This Report of the Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution deals with the action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Committee (2016-17), (16th Lok Sabha) on the subject 'Computerization of Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS)' pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution)

1.2 The Twelfth Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid on the Table of Rajya Sabha on 23.11.2016. It contained 10 observations/ recommendations. Action taken replies in respect of all the 10 observations/recommendations contained in the Report have been received and these have been categorized as follows:-

- (i) Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government -

Rec. Nos.:- 1, 2, 8 and 9

- (ii) Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government -

Rec. Nos.:- 6, 7 and 10

- (iii) Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee -

Rec. Nos.:- 3, 4 and 5

- (iv) Recommendations in respect of which the interim replies of the Government have been received -

Rec. No. :- NIL

1.3 The Committee desire that action taken notes on the Observations/Recommendations contained in Chapter I be furnished to the Committee expeditiously.

1.4 The Committee will now deal with action taken by the Government on some of the recommendations.

A. Computerization of TPDS

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1)

1.5 The Committee in their earlier report observed/recommended as follows:-

"The Committee observe that in order to provide infrastructure and financial support to States/UTs, Government has approved a Plan Scheme on End – to – end Computerization of TPDS Operations' in October, 2012 to be implemented during the 12th Five Year Plan (2012 – 17) in all States/UTs with a total cost of Rs. 884.07 crore for implementing Component – I of the scheme on cost sharing basis in the ratio of 90:10 in NE States and 50:50 in other States/UTs. The Committee also note that the administrative approval of the scheme has been issued by the Department to all States/UTs on 10.12.2012 and the Guidelines for implementation have also been prepared and sent to the States/UTs. The Committee further note that the Government of India as well as the States/UTs have initiated the work for implementation of Component-I of the scheme which comprises the digitization of beneficiary data bases, computerization of supply chain management, and setting up of transparency portal/grievance redressal mechanism. Component-II of the scheme i.e. automation of fair price shops shall be taken up in the next phase keeping in view the progress of Aadhaar enrolment, National Population Registration, availability of connectivity at ration shops etc. While appreciating the steps taken by the Government as well as the States/UTs, the Committee are, however constrained to observe that the progress of work of computerization is progressing at snail's pace and it, in their considered opinion, would negate the benefits reaching out the masses. Therefore, the Committee urge the Department of Food and Public Distribution to impress upon the States/UTs to speed up the work on war-footing and complete the work in a time bound manner so as to improve the over-all functioning of the TPDS operations in the country."

1.6 The Ministry in their action taken reply have stated as under:-

" Initially the progress of Computerization of TPDS Operations was slow but later on the pace of the computerization picked up and at present the status of various key activities under component-I of the scheme is as under:

- i. Ration cards have been completely digitised in all States/UTs.
- ii. Ration card details are available on transparency portal of all States/UTs.
- iii. Online Allocation has been implemented in 29 States/UTs.

- iv. Supply-chain has been computerised in 20 States/UTs.
- v. Transparency portal are implemented in all States/UTs.
- vi. Online grievance redressal facility/Toll-free helpline numbers have been implemented in all States/UTs.

Matter is being pursued with laggard States/UTs to expedite completion of all key activities of the computerization Scheme.”

1.7 The Committee had appreciated the steps taken by the Government but also urged the Department of Food and Public Distribution to impress upon the States/UTs to speed up the work of Computerization of TPDS operations in the country on war footing so as to complete it in a time bound manner. In their action taken reply, the Department has stated that the progress of the scheme was slow initially and the pace of computerization picked-up later on and at present digitization of ration cards, transparency portal and online grievance redressal facility/Toll-free helpline numbers have been implemented in all States/UTs while online allocation and Supply chain has been computerized in 29 States/UTs and 20 States/UTs respectively. The Department further stated that the matter is pursued with laggard States/UTs. The Department has, however, not indicated about the progress of work relating to Component – II of the scheme. The Committee, therefore, would urge the Department to vigorously pursue the matter and ensure that the work under Component – I of the scheme is completed by all States/UTs without any further delay. The Committee further desire to be apprised of the status of implementation of Component-II of the scheme by the States/UTs. Furthermore, they caution the Department not to furnish incomplete and ambiguous replies to their recommendations in future.

B. Need to expedite Aadhaar seeding in Ration Cards

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2)

1.8 The Committee earlier observed/recommended as under:

"The Committee are constrained to note the slow pace of progress with regard to Ration Card with Aadhaar seeding. The Committee find that progress of work relating to Aadhaar Card Seeding is almost zero in Arunachal Pradesh, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Gujarat, J&K, Karnataka, Manipur, Meghalaya, Odisha, Sikkim, Uttarakhand, U.P., West Bengal and in Lakshadweep. In big States like Madhya Pradesh, it is as low as 18% whereas in Maharashtra and Rajasthan, it is just only 1 %. The Committee have been informed that in some States/UTs, Aadhaar enrolment, generation and issuance itself is not complete and the Aadhaar Seeding progress varies across States/UTs depending upon pro-activeness of the State. Food Department and in some States/UTs, the PDS beneficiaries data was initially digitized without Aadhaar numbers and therefore, Aadhaar Seeding was required to be done afresh which is a time taking process. The Committee feel that Department of Food and Public Distribution need to make concerted efforts for expeditious completion of work relating to Aadhaar Seeding of the ration cards in all the States/Union Territories in the country in a time bound manner. They further desire the Government to look into the problem areas in this regard and engage proactively with the States that are lagging in this direction."

1.9 The Ministry in their action taken reply stated:-

"Department of Food & Public Distribution has made concerted efforts for completion of work relating to Aadhaar seeding of Ration Cards by organizing Video Conferences and meetings with concerned officers of the State/UT government as well as officers of UIDAI. A weekly report on the progress is obtained from States/UTs and the same is also submitted to the PMO & Cabinet

Secretariat etc. As on date the Aadhaar seeding at National level is 73.09% and in different States/UTs is as under:-

Sl.	States/UTs	Digitization of Ration Cards	Aadhaar Seeding in RCs
1	Andhra Pradesh	100%	100%
2	Andaman & Nicobar	100%	97%
3	Arunachal Pradesh	100%	44.5%
4	Assam	100%	0%
5	Bihar	100%	1.70%
6	Chandigarh	100%	100%
7	Chhattisgarh	100%	100%
8	Dadra & Nagar Haveli	100%	96%
9	Daman & Diu	100%	100%
10	Delhi	100%	100%
11	Goa	100%	89%
12	Gujarat	100%	100%
13	Haryana	100%	91%
14	Himachal Pradesh	100%	96%
15	Jammu and Kashmir	100%	62%
16	Jharkhand	100%	95%
17	Karnataka	100%	98%
18	Kerala	100%	98%
19	Lakshadweep	100%	98%
20	Madhya Pradesh	100%	87%
21	Maharashtra	100%	87%
22	Manipur	100%	1.28%
23	Meghalaya	100%	0%
24	Mizoram	100%	11.99%
25	Nagaland	100%	6.50%
26	Odisha	100%	86%
27	Puducherry	100%	97%
28	Punjab	100%	100%
29	Rajasthan	100%	98%
30	Sikkim	100%	72%
31	Tamil Nadu	100%	100%
32	Telangana	100%	100%
33	Tripura	100%	92.55%
34	Uttar Pradesh	100%	73%
35	Uttarakhand	100%	66%
36	West Bengal	100%	61%
		100%	73.09%

1.10 The Committee had expressed the need for expeditious completion of Aadhaar seeding of ration cards in all States/UTs. The Department in their Action Taken Reply stated that concerted efforts were made for completion of Aadhaar seeding of Ration Cards by organizing video conferences and meetings with concerned officers of States/UTs as well as UIDAI. The Committee are, however, not satisfied with the status of Aadhaar seeding of Ration Cards which is 73.09% at National level. Observing the large variations in the figures of Computerization of Ration Cards and their Aadhaar Seedings across all the States/UTs, they express their reservation on the veracity of the progress shown in this respect. The Committee further observed that Aadhaar seeding of ration cards has not yet even started in Assam and Meghalaya and the progress in other NE States is also negligible which is 1.28% in Manipur, 11.99% in Mizoram, 6.50% in Nagaland. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend the Department to look into the matter closely with special reference to NE States and those States where the Aadhaar seeding of ration cards is below 50% and take necessary action to complete the same in a time bound manner. They would also like to be informed of the bottlenecks, if any, in this regard and would like them to be removed at the earliest to attain complete/total Aadhaar seeding of Ration Cards.

C. Need for expeditious digitization of database

Recommendation (Sl. No. 3)

1.11 The Committee recommended as follows:-

"The Committee note that digitization of ration cards will ensure availability of beneficiary information in electronic form and also enable ration card services like addition/deletion/modification of beneficiaries. Further, it will also enable validation and de-duplication of data and also compare with databases of Aadhaar, NPR, SECC, electoral data etc. besides automatic generation of SMS alerts for ration card related requests. The Committee also note that the digitization of other databases on information, FPSs, godowns etc. and hosting of such data on State portals without restriction on public access would go a long way in addressing the grievances of the consumers at large. The Committee also observes that the digitization of database will enable the availability of correct and upto date list of beneficiaries on public portal and also removal of bogus ration cards and better targeting of food subsidies. They, however, are sceptic of the 100% achievements shown in respect of FPS data, Godown data and Ration Card data furnished to them in respect of many of the States. They, therefore, desire that the authenticity of the data furnished by States be cross-checked with the ground situation available in the States, especially in respect of States like Uttar Pradesh, West Bengal, Assam, Gujarat etc. They desire to be apprised of the factual status in this regard. The Committee further desire that complete digitization of databases should be taken up expeditiously by the States/UTs in the interest of streamlining the operation of PDS in the country. They also desire that specific timelines need to be indicated for each of the activities so as to ensure real time end-to-end computerization of TPDS operations in the entire country. They further desire to be apprised of the steps taken in this direction."

1.12 The Ministry in their action taken note stated:-

"Operation of PDS is joint responsibility of the Central & State/UT Governments. States/UTs are expected to furnish correct figure about various key activities including digitization of Ration Cards & other databases. Weekly progress reports on completion of activities under computerization are also being obtained from States/UTs and the same are also furnished to the PMO, Cabinet Secretariat, etc. States/UTs are being requested to get third party evaluation of the scheme and furnish report to the department."

1.13 The Committee in their original report expressed scepticism as to the 100% achievement in respect of FPS data, godown data and ration card data furnished to them in respect of many of the States and desired to be apprised of the factual status after the authenticity has been cross-checked with the ground situation available with the States. The Government in their Action Taken Reply very casually stated that operation of PDS is a joint responsibility of the Central and State/UT Governments and the States/UTs are expected to furnish correct figures about various key activities including ration cards and other data-bases. The Committee are not satisfied with the non-serious approach of the Government and expect the Government to give due consideration to their recommendation. Although, implementation part of PDS operations is primarily a State responsibility, the Central Government should not evade their own responsibility in that they are providing huge sums of money to the States for operationalisation of various schemes. The Committee, therefore, urge the Department to fix specific timelines in respect of various activities including third party evaluations and furnish the State/UT-wise information in this regard. The Committee further caution the Department to refrain from submitting such incomplete and vague replies to Committee's recommendation in future as also observed elsewhere in this Report.

D. Need for expeditious Computerization of on-line allocation processes.

Recommendation (SI. No. 4)

1.14 The Committee earlier recommended as follows:-

"The Committee have been informed that on-line allocation has been implemented in 12 States namely Andhra Pradesh, Delhi, Gujarat, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Odisha, Tamil Nadu and Telengana. The scheme has been started in few districts namely, Arunachal Pradesh, Haryana, Jharkhand, Puducherry & West Bengal. The scheme of on-line allocation is in the process of implementation in A&N Islands, Bihar, Meghalaya, Mizoram and Nagaland while in rest of the States/UTs, it has not been yet initiated. They are, however, constrained to note that the Department has not indicated the exact timeline by when the process would be completed while passing the buck to States on the specious plea that these activities are to be undertaken by State Governments. The Committee are not convinced with this argument and desire that the Department should make all out efforts in consultation with concerned State Governments/UT Administrations for completion of work of online allocation of ration in a time bound manner and the States be pushed to complete this process by the end of this fiscal year so that the intended benefit of the computerization process is visible."

1.15 The Ministry in their action taken reply stated as noted below:-

"The department is making vigorous efforts to accelerate the pace of computerization in States/UTs. In addition to meetings and VCs held with the officers of the State/UT governments, a conference of Food Ministers and Secretaries of the State governments was held under the chairmanship of Hon'ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 23.11.2015, 21.05.2016 and 19.01.2017. A two day national conference of Food Secretaries of all States/UTs was also held under the chairmanship of Hon,ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 16th-17th September, 2016, wherein progress made by

various states was reviewed and it was emphasized that all key activities under computerization scheme should be completed at the earliest. Besides, regional Conferences were also held with NE States in Guwahati on 18th-19th November, 2015 and 3rd-4th October, 2016 w.r.t. issues and challenges in the TPDS Computerization programme in these States. So far 29 States/UTs have computerized Online Allocation.”

1.16 Not being convinced with the reasons cited by the Government, the Committee had desired that the Department should make all out efforts in consultation with State Governments/UT Administrations to complete computerization of online allocation of ration in a time bound manner. In their Action Taken Reply, the Department merely stated that they are making vigorous efforts to accelerate the pace of computerization in States/UTs by holding national/regional conferences and so far 29 States/UTs have computerized online allocation. The Committee are not still convinced nor satisfied with the reply of the Government which is vague and devoid of details of any specific outcome of the various meetings/conferences held during the last 3 years. They, therefore, again at the cost of sounding repetitive urge the Department to vigorously and continuously press upon the States/UTs to expeditiously complete all activities under computerization scheme at the earliest.

E. Need for expeditious computerization of Supply Chain Management

(Recommendation SI. No. 5)

1.17 The Committee in their earlier report observed/ recommended as follows:-

"The Committee note that Supply Chain Management component will enable on-line allocation of orders to be generated based on State Allocation Policy and beneficiary data. Further, District/Fair Price Shop-wise allocation order will also be put on State Portal and sent on-line to FCI, District F&CS Offices etc. The Computerization of Supply Chain Management will also facilitate on-line generation of release orders/truck challans/delivery orders and enable a person to access commodity information relating to lifting of commodity and SMS alerts to all beneficiaries as well as checking of stock position at godown at the portal. The Committee, however, note that computerization of Supply Chain Management has been implemented in only 3-4 States while some others are progressing slowly. It is needless to mention that apart from other areas, the computerization of Supply Chain Management would ensure correct account of foodgrains allocated and delivered at FPS, ensure efficient and timely delivery of foodgrains to beneficiaries and also help in checking leakages and diversion. As such, the Committee are of the firm opinion that computerization of Supply Chain Management will go a long way in solving the various problems in the existing PDS system. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Department should take up the job of Supply Chain Management in consultation with all State Governments/UT Administrations on top priority with a fixed timeline. They desire to be informed of the progress made in this direction."

1.18 The Ministry in their action taken reply to have stated as under:-

"The department is making vigorous efforts to accelerate the pace of computerisation in States/UTs. In addition to meetings and VCs held with the officers of the State/UT governments, a conference of Food

Ministers and Secretaries of the state governments was held under the chairmanship of Hon'ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 23.11.2015, 21.05.2016 and 19.01.2017. A two day national conference of Food Secretaries of all States/UTs was also held under the chairmanship of Hon,ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 16.09.2016 and 17.09.2016, wherein progress made by various states was reviewed and it was emphasized that all key activities under computerisation scheme should be completed at the earliest. So far 20 States/UTs have implemented Computerized Supply Chain Management of TPDS operations.”

1.19 The Committee in their original report had observed that computerization of Supply Chain Management has been implemented in only 3-4 States while some others are progressing very slowly and, therefore, recommended the Department to take up the job on priority in consultation with all States/UTs on top priority. The Department in their action taken reply has stated that so far 20 States/UTs have implemented computerized supply chain management of TPDS operations. The Committee are, however, not at all happy with the reply which is rather repetitive and lacks substance with respect to their specific recommendation to complete the job on top priority with a fixed timeline. The Committee, therefore, reiterate that the computerization of supply chain management of TPDS operation by all the States/UTs is all the more important as the completion of other activities would not let the benefit of the TPDS operations percolate owing to incomplete supply chain management which is equally important to ensure complete success of the programme. They, therefore, desire that utmost importance be given to completion of computerization supply chain management which would go a long way in plugging the holes in the PDS operations in the country. The Committee desired to be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

F. Need for submission of adequate proposals/ utilization certificates from the States/UTs

Recommendation (SI. No. 9)

1.20 The Committee in their earlier report recommended as:

“The scheme of Computerization of TPDS have been launched in December, 2012. During their deposition before the Committee, the representatives of Department of Food and Public Distribution have admitted that progress amongst States/UTs has been slow and uneven. Reasons cited were due to delay in finalization of action plan by States, late submission of their financial proposals and various other practical problems due to implementation of NFSA etc. The Committee find that till now financial assistance has been released to 28 States/UTs. (including Telengana) based on their financial proposals/action plans. The Committee also note that in Chandigarh and Haryana, Utilization Certificate for funds released under a Pilot Scheme has not been yet received. In Delhi amount payable as 1st instalment is less than amount paid under Pilot Scheme, second instalment is to be released on receipt of the proposal from them for activities completed under Component -I. Gujarat, Karnataka, A&N Islands and Sikkim have also not furnished the proposal for funds under Component – I. The Committee regrets that this scheme like other schemes of the Department has suffered for want of sufficient proposals and utilization certificates from the States/UTs. In the opinion of the Committee, it is the lack of coordination with the State Government and weak monitoring over the scheme on the part of the Department. The Committee desire that the Department should make sincere efforts for getting the utilization certificates from the concerned States/UTs. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Government should take up the matter with State Government/UT Administration at highest level and find out the reasons for non submission of utilization

certificates and sufficient proposals and persuade them to implement the scheme so that allocated funds are fully utilized in the financial year itself.”

1.21 The Ministry in their action taken reply stated as under:

“So far funds of Rs. 361.96 crore have been sanctioned to 30 States/UTs. Gujarat and Karnataka did not require funds for implementation of component-I of the scheme. Haryana and UT of Chandigarh had been released funds of Rs. 25 crore and Rs. 1.10 crore respectively under the pilot scheme which has since been subsumed in the modified Plan scheme. Any further funds would be provided to them after they utilize already paid funds and submit utilization certificates. As regards A&N islands and Sikkim, they have also got funds from other sources. Position of submission of utilization certificates has also improved and UCs for full/part amount have been received from 20 States/UTs.”

1.22 In their original report, the Committee regretted that the scheme of Computerization of TPDS has suffered for want of sufficient proposals and non-submission of utilization certificates by the States/UTs which is due to lack of coordination with States/UTs and weak monitoring and, therefore, desired the Department to make sincere efforts for getting utilization certificates from the concerned States/UTs. The Department in their action taken reply have stated that position of submission of utilization certificates has also improved and utilization certificates for full/part amount have been received from 20 States/UTs. The Committee would like to be apprised of the detailed status of submission of utilization certificates along with the amounts utilized together with the amounts for which utilization certificates are yet to be received in respect of each State/UT as on date. They are of the view that reply to that extent is incomplete and it was expected from the Government that full and complete replies are invariably furnished to them. The Committee further desire the Department to make concerted efforts and persuade the rest of the States/UTs to submit proposals/utilization certificates for the amount utilized at the earliest to facilitate implementation of the scheme in letter and spirit.

CHAPTER II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Recommendation (SI. No. 1)

2.1 **General Observation on Computerization of TPDS**

The Committee observe that in order to provide infrastructure and financial support to States/UTs, Government has approved a Plan Scheme on 'End – to – end Computerization of TPDS Operations' in October, 2012 to be implemented during the 12th Five Year Plan (2012 – 17) in all States/UTs with a total cost of Rs. 884.07 crore for implementing Component – I of the scheme on cost sharing basis in the ratio of 90:10 in NE States and 50:50 in other States/UTs. The Committee also note that the administrative approval of the scheme has been issued by the Department to all States/UTs on 10.12.2012 and the Guidelines for implementation have also been prepared and sent to the States/UTs. The Committee further note that the Government of India as well as the States/UTs have initiated the work for implementation of Component-I of the scheme which comprises the digitization of beneficiary data bases, computerization of supply chain management, and setting up of transparency portal/grievance redressal mechanism. Component-II of the scheme i.e. automation of fair price shops shall be taken up in the next phase keeping in view the progress of Aadhaar enrolment, National Population Registration, availability of connectivity at ration shops etc. While appreciating the steps taken by the Government as well as the States/UTs, the Committee are, however constrained to observe that the progress of work of computerization is progressing at snail's pace and it, in their considered opinion, would negate the benefits reaching out the masses. Therefore, the Committee urge the Department of Food and Public Distribution to impress upon the States/UTs to speed up the work on war-footing and complete the work in a time bound manner so as to improve the over-all functioning of the TPDS operations in the country.

Reply of the Government

2.2 Initially the progress of Computerization of TPDS Operations was slow but later on the pace of the computerization picked up and at present the status of various key activities under component-I of the scheme is as under:

- i. Ration cards have been completely digitised in all States/UTs.
- ii. Ration card details are available on transparency portal of all States/UTs.
- iii. Online Allocation has been implemented in 29 States/UTs.
- iv. Supply-chain has been computerised in 20 States/UTs.
- v. Transparency portal are implemented in all States/UTs.

- vi. Online grievance redressal facility/Toll-free helpline numbers have been implemented in all States/UTs.

Matter is being pursued with laggard States/UTs to expedite completion of all key activities of the computerization Scheme.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No.1.7 of Chapter -I of the Report)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2)

2.3 Progress with regard to Ration Card with Aadhaar Seeding

The Committee are constrained to note the slow pace of progress with regard to Ration Card with Aadhaar seeding. The Committee find that progress of work relating to Aadhaar Card Seeding is almost zero in Arunachal Pradesh, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Gujarat, J&K, Karnataka, Manipur, Meghalaya, Odisha, Sikkim, Uttarakhand, U.P., West Bengal and in Lakshadweep. In big States like Madhya Pradesh, it is as low as 18% whereas in Maharashtra and Rajasthan, it is just only 1 %. The Committee have been informed that in some States/UTs, Aadhaar enrolment, generation and issuance itself is not complete and the Aadhaar Seeding progress varies across States/UTs depending upon pro-activeness of the State. Food Department and in some States/UTs, the PDS beneficiaries data was initially digitized without Aadhaar numbers and therefore, Aadhaar Seeding was required to be done afresh which is a time taking process. The Committee feel that Department of Food and Public Distribution need to make concerted efforts for expeditious completion of work relating to Aadhaar Seeding of the ration cards in all the States/Union Territories in the country in a time bound manner. They further desire the Government to look into the problem areas in this regard and engage proactively with the States that are lagging in this direction.

Reply of the Government

2.4 Department of Food & Public Distribution has made concerted efforts for completion of work relating to Aadhaar seeding of Ration Cards by organizing Video Conferences and meetings with concerned officers of the State/UT government as well as officers of UIDAI. A weekly report on the progress is obtained from States/UTs and the same is also submitted to the PMO & Cabinet Secretariat etc. As on date the Aadhaar seeding at National level is 73.09% and in different States/UTs is as under:-

Sl.	States/UTs	Digitization of Ration Cards	Aadhaar Seeding in RCs
1	Andhra Pradesh	100%	100%
2	Andaman & Nicobar	100%	97%
3	Arunachal Pradesh	100%	44.5%
4	Assam	100%	0%
5	Bihar	100%	1.70%
6	Chandigarh	100%	100%
7	Chhattisgarh	100%	100%
8	Dadra & Nagar Haveli	100%	96%
9	Daman & Diu	100%	100%
10	Delhi	100%	100%
11	Goa	100%	89%
12	Gujarat	100%	100%
13	Haryana	100%	91%
14	Himachal Pradesh	100%	96%
15	Jammu and Kashmir	100%	62%
16	Jharkhand	100%	95%
17	Karnataka	100%	98%
18	Kerala	100%	98%
19	Lakshadweep	100%	98%
20	Madhya Pradesh	100%	87%
21	Maharashtra	100%	87%
22	Manipur	100%	1.28%
23	Meghalaya	100%	0%
24	Mizoram	100%	11.99%
25	Nagaland	100%	6.50%
26	Odisha	100%	86%
27	Puducherry	100%	97%
28	Punjab	100%	100%
29	Rajasthan	100%	98%
30	Sikkim	100%	72%

31	Tamil Nadu	100%	100%
32	Telangana	100%	100%
33	Tripura	100%	92.55%
34	Uttar Pradesh	100%	73%
35	Uttarakhand	100%	66%
36	West Bengal	100%	61%
		100%	73.09%

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No.1.10 of Chapter -I of the Report)

Recommendation (SI. No. 8)

2.5 Monitoring by the Department

The Committee are concerned to note that various problems are being faced by States/UTs during implementation of the scheme such as procurement of hardware, connectivity of the offices and godowns, setting of State Programme Management Unit and training of personal etc. In this context, the Committee desire the Department of Food and Public Distribution to strengthen its monitoring apparatus and also persuade States/UT Administrations to take vigorous steps to overcome/resolve aforesaid practical problems at the earliest.

Reply of the Government

2.6 Best practices adopted by forward states shared with other States/UTs in the conferences held on 23.11.2015, 16th-17th September, 2016 and 19.01.2017. A special workshop was organized for NE states in Guwahati on 18th-19th November, 2015 and 03rd-4th October, 2016. Tripura and Meghalaya have been provided 2 additional technical consultants through GIZ to assist them in implementation of the scheme.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution

Recommendation (Sl. No. 9)

2.7 Implementation Constraint

The scheme of Computerization of TPDS have been launched in December, 2012. During their deposition before the Committee, the representatives of Department of Food and Public Distribution have admitted that progress amongst States/UTs has been slow and uneven. Reasons cited were due to delay in finalization of action plan by States, late submission of their financial proposals and various other practical problems due to implementation of NFSA etc. The Committee find that till now financial assistance has been released to 28 States/UTs. (including Telengana) based on their financial proposals/action plans. The Committee also note that in Chandigarh and Haryana, Utilization Certificate for funds released under a Pilot Scheme has not been yet received. In Delhi amount payable as 1st instalment is less than amount paid under Pilot Scheme, second instalment is to be released on receipt of the proposal from them for activities completed under Component -I. Gujarat, Karnataka, A&N Islands and Sikkim have also not furnished the proposal for funds under Component – I. The Committee regrets that this scheme like other schemes of the Department has suffered for want of sufficient proposals and utilization certificates from the States/UTs. In the opinion of the Committee, it is the lack of coordination with the State Government and weak monitoring over the scheme on the part of the Department. The Committee desire that the Department should make sincere efforts for getting the utilization certificates from the concerned States/UTs. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Government should take up the matter with State Government/UT Administration at highest level and find out the reasons for non submission of utilization certificates and sufficient proposals and persuade them to implement the scheme so that allocated funds are fully utilized in the financial year itself.

Reply of the Government

2.8 So far funds of Rs. 361.96 crore have been sanctioned to 30 States/UTs. Gujarat and Karnataka did not require funds for implementation of component-I of the scheme. Haryana and UT of Chandigarh had been released funds of Rs. 25 crore and Rs. 1.10 crore respectively under the pilot scheme which has since been subsumed in the modified Plan scheme. Any further funds would be provided to them after they utilize already paid funds and submit utilization certificates. As regards A&N islands and Sikkim, they have also got funds from other sources. Position of submission of utilization certificates has also improved and UCs for full/part amount have been received from 20 States/UTs.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No.1.22 of Chapter -I of the Report)

CHAPTER III

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE GOVERNMENT'S REPLIES

Recommendation (SI. No. 6)

3.1 PDS Portal

The Committee note that Computerization of Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS) includes setting up of PDS Portal by all the States/UTs. Such PDS Portal will host all information relating to PDS and also provide linkage among various PDS data bases, provision for registration and tracking of grievances and this will be openly accessible to the public for 24 hours. The State PDS Portal will also be linked with the National Portal. The Committee, therefore, feel that setting up of PDS Portal by the States/UTs should be given topmost priority as it will go a long way in ensuring the efficient functioning of PDS operations in the country. The Department of Food and Public Distribution should, therefore, take up the matter with the States/UTs to expedite setting up of PDS Portals at the earliest.

Reply of the Government

3.2 All States/UTs have implemented their respective PDS *transparency* portal. The States/UTs PDS portals are also linked with the National Portal of Government of India. These portals are required to host all information relating to PDS.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Recommendation (SI. No. 7)

3.3 Grievance Redressal

The Committee note that for the convenience of the consumers, all the States/UTs are supposed to have Common Number 1967 and 1800 Toll Free Number series for grievance redressal and these are being set up in the States/UTs. They further note that so far 28 States/UTs are having 1967/1800

number series. The Committee are, however, constrained to note that these helpline numbers are not helpful in solving the day to day problems being faced by the consumers and it is common knowledge that such toll free numbers are usually not responsive to the needs of the users and most of the time go unattended to by the authorities. Nevertheless the proper functioning of such help line numbers will enhance transparency and public accountability in the Implementation of TPDS. The Committee, therefore, urge upon the Department as also the State Governments/UTs to streamline the functioning of these helpline numbers so as to make them functional in the interest of the consumers. The Committee also urge the Department to impress upon the remaining States/UTs to set up the toll free number and further to make it operational in the States/UTs where it has already been set up. They desire to be informed of the progress made in this regard.

Reply of the Government

3.4 All States/UTs have implemented the Grievance Redressal mechanism for the convenience of the consumers. They have set up common 1967/1800 Toll Free number series for grievance redressal. These numbers are also visible in the States/UTs PDS web portals.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Recommendation (Sl. No. 10)

3.5 Financial Performance

The Committee are constrained to observe that financial performance under the scheme is far from satisfactory. They observe that on the one hand, out of the Central share of Rs. 489.37 crore so far Rs. 261.51 crore only have been released to the States during the last three financial years viz. 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 including for 2015-16 (upto 31.05.2015). On the other hand, the cumulative expenditure reported for this period is a meager amount of Rs. 56.49 crore implying at the same time that the States have not been able to

spend about Rs. 205.02 crore. Further, though funds were released to 27 States/UTs, 14 States have not shown/reported any expenditure for the above period. This speaks volumes of the performance of this vital scheme aimed to prevent leakages, diversions in supply of foodgrains - an important component in the Government's policy for management of food economy of the country. It is further disconcerting to observe that in the process, while the State Governments have not been able to utilize the funds available during 12th Plan period, the efforts made by the Department of Food and Public Distribution too leave much to be desired. Though funds were allocated to many States, the Department was not able to track the progress of implementation and utilization of funds properly. The Committee, therefore, desire the Government to take concerted steps to closely monitor the progress of implementation of the scheme across States so as to achieve the desired goal of minimizing leakages and diversions, if not altogether eliminating the same, thereby attain transparency to a large extent. They desire to be informed of the progress made with regard to utilization of funds, receipt of Utilization Certificates etc. as at the end of June, 2016 within three months of presentation of this Report to the Houses of Parliament.

Reply of the Government

3.6 An amount of Rs.361.96 crore has been sanctioned to 30 States/UTs during 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15, 2015-16 and 2016-17 (up to 31.01.2017) as central share of funds for implementing the computerization scheme. Funds are sanctioned to States/UTs in installments on fulfillment of various conditions laid down by this department. Gujarat and Karnataka did not ask for funds for implementing component-I of the scheme. UT of Chandigarh and Haryana state had been released funds of Rs. 1.10 crore and Rs. 25 crore under a pilot scheme which has been subsumed in the plan scheme on 'End to end computerization of TPDS Operations'. Any further funds would be sanctioned to them after they fully utilize the already available funds. Further, Sikkim and A&N islands have obtained funds for the scheme from other sources. Utilization certificates for an amount of Rs. 198.98 crore have been received. The Department is closely monitoring the progress of implementation of computerization scheme and a

weekly report is obtained from States/UTs. A detailed statement indicating the present status is at annex-I.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE

Recommendation (SI. No. 3)

4.1 Digitization of Databases.

The Committee note that digitization of ration cards will ensure availability of beneficiary information in electronic form and also enable ration card services like addition/deletion/modification of beneficiaries. Further, it will also enable validation and de-duplication of data and also compare with databases of Aadhaar, NPR, SECC, electoral data etc. besides automatic generation of SMS alerts for ration card related requests. The Committee also note that the digitization of other databases on information, FPSs, godowns etc. and hosting of such data on State portals without restriction on public access would go a long way in addressing the grievances of the consumers at large. The Committee also observes that the digitization of database will enable the availability of correct and upto date list of beneficiaries on public portal and also removal of bogus ration cards and better targeting of food subsidies. They, however, are sceptic of the 100% achievements shown in respect of FPS data, Godown data and Ration Card data furnished to them in respect of many of the States. They, therefore, desire that the authenticity of the data furnished by States be cross-checked with the ground situation available in the States, especially in respect of States like Uttar Pradesh, West Bengal, Assam, Gujarat etc. They desire to be apprised of the factual status in this regard. The Committee further desire that complete digitization of databases should be taken up expeditiously by the States/UTs in the interest of streamlining the operation of PDS in the country. They also desire that specific timelines need to be indicated for each of the activities so as to ensure real time end-to-end computerization of TPDS operations in the entire country. They further desire to be apprised of the steps taken in this direction.

Reply of the Government

4.2 Operation of PDS is joint responsibility of the Central & State/UT Governments. States/UTs are expected to furnish correct figure about various key activities including digitization of Ration Cards & other databases. Weekly progress reports on completion of activities under computerization are also being obtained from States/UTs and the same are also furnished to the PMO, Cabinet Secretariat, etc. States/UTs are being requested to get third party evaluation of the scheme and furnish report to the department.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No.1.13 of Chapter -I of the Report)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 4)

4.3 On line Allocation of Ration

The Committee have been informed that on-line allocation has been implemented in 12 States namely Andhra Pradesh, Delhi, Gujarat, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Odisha, Tamil Nadu and Telengana. The scheme has been started in few districts namely, Arunachal Pradesh, Haryana, Jharkhand, Puducherry & West Bengal. The scheme of on-line allocation is in the process of implementation in A&N Islands, Bihar, Meghalaya, Mizoram and Nagaland while in rest of the States/UTs, it has not been yet initiated. They are, however, constrained to note that the Department has not indicated the exact timeline by when the process would be completed while passing the buck to States on the specious plea that these activities are to be undertaken by State Governments. The Committee are not convinced with this argument and desire that the Department should make all out efforts in consultation with concerned State Governments/UT Administrations for completion of work of online allocation of ration in a time bound manner and the States be pushed to complete this

process by the end of this fiscal year so that the intended benefit of the computerization process is visible.

Reply of the Government

4.4 The department is making vigorous efforts to accelerate the pace of computerization in States/UTs. In addition to meetings and VCs held with the officers of the State/UT governments, a conference of Food Ministers and Secretaries of the State governments was held under the chairmanship of Hon'ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 23.11.2015, 21.05.2016 and 19.01.2017. A two day national conference of Food Secretaries of all States/UTs was also held under the chairmanship of Hon,ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 16th-17th September, 2016, wherein progress made by various states was reviewed and it was emphasized that all key activities under computerization scheme should be completed at the earliest. Besides, regional Conferences were also held with NE States in Guwahati on 18th-19th November, 2015 and 3rd-4th October, 2016 w.r.t. issues and challenges in the TPDS Computerization programme in these States. So far 29 States/UTs have computerized Online Allocation.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No.1.16 of Chapter -I of the Report)

Recommendation (SI. No. 5)

4.5 Supply Chain Management

The Committee note that Supply Chain Management component will enable on-line allocation of orders to be generated based on State Allocation Policy and beneficiary data. Further, District/Fair Price Shop-wise allocation order will also be put on State Portal and sent on-line to FCI, District F&CS Offices etc. The Computerization of Supply Chain Management will also facilitate on-line generation of release orders/truck challans/delivery orders and enable a person to access commodity information relating to lifting of commodity and SMS alerts to all beneficiaries as well as checking of stock position at godown at the portal.

The Committee, however, note that computerization of Supply Chain Management has been implemented in only 3-4 States while some others are progressing slowly. It is needless to mention that apart from other areas, the computerization of Supply Chain Management would ensure correct account of foodgrains allocated and delivered at FPS, ensure efficient and timely delivery of foodgrains to beneficiaries and also help in checking leakages and diversion. As such, the Committee are of the firm opinion that computerization of Supply Chain Management will go a long way in solving the various problems in the existing PDS system. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Department should take up the job of Supply Chain Management in consultation with all State Governments/UT Administrations on top priority with a fixed timeline. They desire to be informed of the progress made in this direction.

Reply of the Government

4.6 The department is making vigorous efforts to accelerate the pace of computerisation in States/UTs. In addition to meetings and VCs held with the officers of the State/UT governments, a conference of Food Ministers and Secretaries of the state governments was held under the chairmanship of Hon'ble Minister for CA,F&PD on 23.11.2015, 21.05.2016 and 19.01.2017. A two day national conference of Food Secretaries of all States/UTs was also held under the chairmanship of Hon,ble Minister for CA, F&PD on 16.09.2016 and 17.09.2016, wherein progress made by various states was reviewed and it was emphasized that all key activities under computerisation scheme should be completed at the earliest. So far 20 States/UTs have implemented Computerized Supply Chain Management of TPDS operations.

[Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food & Public Distribution
(Department of Food & Public Distribution)
O.M. No. 20(3)/2014-Comp. Cell Dated – 16th Feb, 2017]

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No.1.19 of Chapter -I of the Report)

CHAPTER V

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH
THE FINAL REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT
ARE STILL AWAITED**

-NIL-

**NEW DELHI;
23 July, 2017
01 Shravana 1939 (Saka)**

**J.C. DIVAKAR REDDY,
Chairperson,
Standing Committee on Food,
Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution.**

APPENDIX I

MINUTES OF THE FOURTEENTH SITTING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (2016-17) HELD ON FRIDAY, 2 JUNE, 2017

The Committee sat from 1500 hrs. to 1550 hrs. in Committee Room 'E',
Basement, Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri J.C. Divakar Reddy - Chairperson

Members

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Anto Antony
3. Shri R.K.Bharathi Mohan
4. Shri Babu Lal Choudhary
5. Shri Dharmendra Kumar
6. Smt. Sakuntala Laguri
7. Dr. Swami Sakshiji Maharaj
8. Shri Sunil Kumar Mondal
9. Shri Ram Chander Paswan
10. Shri Bhola Singh
11. Shri Sukhbir Singh Jaunpuria

Rajya Sabha

12. Dr. K. Keshava Rao

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri P.V.L.N. Murthy - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Khakhai Zou - Additional Director

2. At the outset, Hon'ble Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee convened for consideration and adoption of the Draft Report on Action Taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the 12th Report of the Committee on the subject 'Computerization of Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS)' pertaining to the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution).

3. Thereafter the Committee took up for consideration the Draft Report. After due deliberations, the Committee adopted the said Action Taken Report with slight amendment/modification.

4. The Committee then authorized the Chairperson to finalize the aforesaid Draft Report and present the same to Parliament in the coming Monsson Session of Parliament.

The Committee then adjourned.

APPENDIX II

(Vide Para No. 4 of Introduction of the Report)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE TWELFTH REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (2015-16)

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

- (i) Total number of Recommendations: 10
- (ii) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government :
Rec. Nos. :- 1, 2 8 and 9
(Chapter – II, Total - 4)
Percentage : 40%
- (iii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government
Rec. Nos. :- 6, 7 and 10
(Chapter – III, Total - 3)
Percentage : 30%
- (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:
Rec. Nos.:- 3, 4 and 5
(Chapter – IV, Total -3)
Percentage : 30%
- (v) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the interim replies of the Government have been received.
Rec. No.:- NIL
(Chapter – V, Total - 0)
Percentage : -