

MINISTRY OF DRINKING WATER AND SANITATION

REVIEW OF SANITATION PROGRAMME IN RURAL AREAS

[Action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Estimates]

COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2016-17)

SEVENTEENTH REPORT

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

SEVENTEENTH REPORT

**COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES
(2016-17)**

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF DRINKING WATER AND SANITATION

**[Action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in Eighth
Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Estimates]**

(Presented to Lok Sabha on 11.08.2016)



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI
August, 2016 /Shravana, 1938 (Saka)**

E.C. No. _____

Price : ₹ _____

© 2016 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Sixteenth Edition) and printed by the General Manager, Government of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi – 110002.

CONTENTS

		PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2015-16)		
INTRODUCTION		
CHAPTER I	Report	1
CHAPTER II	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government	
CHAPTER III	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies	
CHAPTER IV	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee	
CHAPTER V	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited	

ANNEXURES

APPENDICES

- (i) Minutes of the Third Sitting of the Committee on Estimates held on 29.07.2016.....

- (ii) Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Recommendations/Observations contained in the Eighth Report of the Committee on Estimates (Sixteenth Lok Sabha).....

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2016-17)

Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi – Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri Sultan Ahmed
3. Shri A. Arunmozhithevan
4. Shri George Baker
5. Shri Kalyan Banerjee
6. Shri Ashok Shankarrao Chavan
7. Shri Dushyant Chautala
8. Shri Ashwini Kumar Choubey
9. Shri Ram Tahal Choudhary
10. Col. Sonaram Choudhary
11. Shri Ramen Deka
12. Shri Sanjay Dhotre
13. Shri P.C. Gaddigoudar
14. Shri Sudheer Gupta
15. Smt. Kavitha Kalvakuntla
16. Shri P. Kumar
17. Smt. Poonam Mahajan
18. Shri K.H. Muniyappa
19. Shri Rajesh Pandey
20. Shri Ravindra Kumar Pandey
21. Shri Raosaheb Danve Patil
- *22. Shri Bhagirath Prasad
23. Shri Konakalla Narayan Rao
24. Md. Salim
25. Shri Arvind Ganpat Sawant
26. Shri Gajendra Singh Shekhawat
27. Shri Anil Shirole
28. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
29. Shri Rajesh Verma
30. Shri Jai Prakash Narayan Yadav

* Elected Vide Lok Sabha Bulletin Part-II No. 3908 dated 28.07.2016 vice Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal appointed as Minister

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Devender Singh - Additional Secretary
2. Shri Vipin Kumar - Director
3. Shri Srinivasulu Gunda - Additional Director
4. Shri R. S. Negi - Under Secretary

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of the Committee on Estimates, having been authorized by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, do present this Seventeenth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Eighth Report of Estimates Committee (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on the subject 'Review of Sanitation Programme in Rural Areas' pertaining to the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation.

2. The Eighth Report was presented to Lok Sabha on 29th April, 2015. The Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation furnished their replies indicating action taken on the recommendations contained in the Eighth Report on 18th December, 2015. The Draft Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on Estimates (2016-17) at their sitting held on 29th July, 2016.

3. An analysis of action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Second Report of the Committee on Estimates is given in Appendix II.

**NEW DELHI;
5 August, 2016
Shravana 14, 1938 (Saka)**

**DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI
Chairperson,
Committee on Estimates**

CHAPTER I

REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on the subject 'Review of Sanitation Programme in Rural Areas' pertaining to the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation.

1.2 The Eighth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to Lok Sabha on 29.04.2015. It contained 9 observations/recommendations. Action Taken Notes on all these observations/recommendations were received from the Ministry of Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation on 18.12.2015.

1.3 Replies to the observations and recommendations contained in the Report have broadly been categorized as under:-

(i) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government:

Sl. Nos. 1, 4, 8 and 9

(Total 4)
(Chapter-II)

(ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's reply:

Sl. Nos. Nil

(Chapter-III)

(iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee:

Sl. Nos. 2, 3, 5, 6 and 7

(Total 5)
(Chapter-IV)

(iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final reply of Government is still awaited:

Sl. Nos. Nil

(Chapter-V)

1.4. The Committee desire that response to the comments contained in Chapter I of this Report should be furnished to them expeditiously.

1.5 The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their recommendations.

Sanitation in Schools

(Recommendation Para No. 2)

1.6 While examining the records of the year 2013-14 in regard to Sanitation in Schools, the Committee noted that there were 10,93,969 schools in the country. Out of these 94.45% schools had boys' toilets and 84.63% schools had girls' toilets. Out of total boys' toilets, 92.67% were functional. Similarly, 91.62% girls' toilets were functional. The percentage of girls toilets in both the terms were low as compared to boys toilets in the country. As the veracity of the data was challenged, the Committee sought further clarification from the Ministry. Subsequently, the Committee were informed that of the 11.22 lakh Government schools, 2.45 lakh schools do not have a toilet which translates to a gap of 4.19 lakh toilets if at least one toilet each is to be provided to girls and boys separately. In view of the discrepancy in the data the Committee recommended the Ministry to rectify the same and also apprise them of steps being taken and the time line by which each school would have adequate but separate toilets for girls and boys.

1.7 The Ministry in their Action Taken reply which they furnished in December, 2015 has stated that after launch of Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) on 2nd October, 2014, school toilets are to be provided by Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD). Under Swachh Vidyalaya Initiative which aimed to provide toilet blocks for girls and boys in each school, 417796 toilets were constructed in a period of one year from 15.8.2014 to 15.8.2015.

1.8 The reply furnished by the Ministry of drinking water and Sanitation is conspicuously silent as to the discrepancy/ mismatch in the data provided on the provision of toilet facilities in schools. For a policy to achieve its objective, the Committee believe the quality and reliability of the data is a sine-qua non for formulating correct responses and interventions. The questionable quality of data might not result in achieving the objective of the policy. Further, reply of the Ministry does not give any timeline by which all the schools in the country will have separate toilets for girls and boys. The Committee therefore, while reiterating their recommendation in this regard desire that suitable steps be taken to address the data quality and also urge the Ministry to take up the matter with Ministry of Human Resource Development for providing separate toilets for girls and boys in schools.

**[Action by Ministries of Drinking Water & Sanitation
And Human Resource Development]**

(Recommendation Para No. 3)

1.9 In view of low percent (22% national average, less than 1% in Bihar, Jharkhand and Uttar Pradesh and far below national average in Assam, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Manipur, Odisha, Rajasthan and West Bengal) of schools with toilets having water tap facility and also scarcity of water, the Committee recommended that (i) the matter needs to be taken up with the concerned States to ensure availability of tapped water in all the schools expeditiously; (ii) an action plan may be drawn up to provide the schools with running water (tap water) in a time bound manner, and; (iii) here is a need to identify expeditiously the schools which have non-functional toilets and the schools which have no toilets at all in the country in consultation with the Ministry of Human Resource Development and the Ministry of Women and Child Development so that the non-functional toilets were made functional on priority basis and the school without toilets were provided the facility and they be apprised of the action plan including timeline for attainment of the above objectives.

1.10 The Ministry in their Action Taken Reply have stated that after launch of Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) on 2nd October, 2014, school toilets are to be provided by Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD). Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation has instructed the States to provide water in the vicinity of school premises.

1.11 The reply furnished by the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation shows that the Ministry have merely instructed the states to provide water in the vicinity of schools and remained silent on the Committee's suggestion for (i) drawing up of an action plan for providing running water facilities (tap water) in all the schools in a time bound manner, and; (ii) identifying expeditiously the schools which have non-functional toilets and the schools which have no toilets at all in the country. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation that the non-functional toilets be made functional on priority basis, the school without toilets be provided the facility and the Committee be apprised of the action plan including the timeline for attainment of the above objectives within six months of presentation of this Report.

**[Action by Ministries of Drinking Water & Sanitation
And Human Resource Development]**

**Swachh Bharat Mission
(Recommendation Para No. 5)**

1.12 As the Government have fixed the timeline for completion of the Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) by the year 2019 even before finalization of the proposed sources of funds for the Mission (Contributions through the Swachh Bharat Kosh, commitments under Corporate Social responsibility (CSR), budgetary allocations in the years 2017-18 and 2018-19 , the Committee while observing that fixing timeline for accomplishing the mission, without identifying the resources, may not only affect the target of completion of the Mission but also create an avoidable uncertainty recommended that the Government must expeditiously explore the availability of funds needed for the Mission through various sources. The Committee also recommended that they be apprised of the current status in the matter including a complete review of the NBA/TSC and steps

needed to reformulate policy matters and estimates in the light of implementation of Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA) /Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC) within six months of presentation of this Report to Lok Sabha.

1.13 The Ministry in their Action Taken Reply had stated that ₹ 4125 crore have been allocated so far for Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) in 2015-2016 and additional funds are expected in the Second Supplementary. 0.5% Swachh Cess on services has been imposed w.e.f. 15.11.2015 to supplement the budgetary source for Swachh Bharat Mission. Besides this, Swachh Bharat Kosh has been established in November, 2014 under Ministry of Finance to attract CSR funds for sanitation. In the second meeting of Swachh Bharat Kosh Trust, ₹ 445.07 crore have been approved for Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin). In addition, ₹ 50 crore for toilets in villages around the Ganga river have been approved from Swachh Bharat Kosh. Funding from Overseas Indians is also being tapped. For this purpose, India Development Foundation of Overseas Indians (IDF-OI) Trust has been established under the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs. The States may also utilize other sources of funds such as 14th Finance Commission grants, States own resources, CSR etc.

1.14 The Committee note from the reply of the Ministry that efforts are being made to tap the funds from various sources such as levies, Corporate Social Responsibility funds , budgetary allocations, voluntary contributions from NGOs from abroad, etc. However, the Committee would like to be apprised of the funds so collected, cess-wise and the expenditure incurred on the Swachh Bharat Mission so far and the requirements of funds for the mission in next three years.

**Solid Waste Management
(Recommendation ParaNo.6)**

1.15 Citing lack of positive response from state/ UT Governments namely Assam, Dadra & Nagar Haveli, Goa, Nagaland, Puducherry and Sikkim, the overall decline in

setting up of solid waste management infrastructure as reflected in decline in number of Gram panchayats which set up solid waste management Infrastructure from 2729 in 2011-12 to 1624 in 12-13 and further to 1250 in 2013-14) and also the demand driven nature of the scheme, the Committee were informed that the Ministry were not fixing the annual targets for creating sanitation. Terming such a plea specious the Committee desired that the Government should re tailor their policy and fix annual targets for their schemes so that the mission is accomplished successfully within the timeline. They also recommended for creation of awareness among the Gram Panchayats to undertake solid waste management activities at village level.

1.16 The Ministry in their Action Taken Reply have stated that Solid and Liquid Waste Management (SLWM) is an integral part of the Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin). Under SBM(G) SLWM projects can be taken up in each Gram Panchayat and total assistance shall be worked out on the basis of total number of households in each GP, subject to a maximum of ₹ 7 lakh for a GP having up to 150 households, ₹ 12 lakh up to 300 households, ₹ 15 lakh up to 500 households and ₹ 20 lakh for GPs having more than 500 households. Any additional cost requirement is to be met with funds from the State/GP. The Ministry organizes National/Regional workshops on SLWM to disseminate awareness amongst the States. Guidelines on SLWM have also been developed and shared with States. Newer technologies and best practices in SLWM are shared with the States.

1.17 The Committee are surprised that the Ministry has not responded to the Committee's concern about the poor response of the State Governments for creating solid waste infrastructure. The reply is conspicuously silent as to the need for retailoring the policy in view of the poor response from the State Governments. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation for revisit of the solid and liquid waste management policy considering the responses of the States and take up the matter on a mission mode for its speedy execution within given time lines.

R&D in Sanitation Equipments/ Technology
(Recommendation Para No. 7)

1.18 In the light of wide difference in the inclination of the toilet pan is 42 degree which uses, on an average, 0.6 litre of water per use whereas the consumption of water for the same purpose in urban area varies significantly between 2.2 litres and 6.6 litre, the Committee recommended that there is an imperative need to bridge the urban – rural divide in the matter of water being used by the rural and urban toilets inequitably. The Committee had also felt strongly that the bio-digester technology developed by DRDO be also explored for adoption, if found efficient, economic and environment friendly by the Government. The Committee were informed that only 2 out of 65 R&D solid waste management projects have been recommended for implementation at site/field level. In view of the massive and ever increasing problem of solid waste management, they desired that the Government should play a far more proactive role to propagate the two projects and provide incentives for their fast tracking from lab to land. The Committee also desired that a fresh impetus be provided to R&D on solid waste management so that better, cost effective and environment friendly technologies for the purpose developed on war footing to address the mounting threat of solid waste.

1.19 The Ministry in their Action Taken Reply have stated that Sanitation is a State subject and the role of Government of India is to provide financial and technical assistance. The Ministry promotes innovation and R&D. An Expert Committee headed by Dr. R.A. Mashelkar to examine the Innovative Technologies has been formed. This committee has enlisted various innovative technologies and a Compendium consisting of such technologies has been published and uploaded in the website of the Ministry for benefit of various stakeholders. Regular exhibitions of Innovative technologies (Innovation) are organized by the Ministry (Three such exhibitions held in New Delhi on 26-27th August 2014, 23-24 January 2015 and 2-3 July 2015) wherein various innovative technologies in respect of Toilet, Solid and Liquid Waste Management and Water Treatment are showcased to various Stakeholders / Users including various

State Governments, NGOs and Research & Academic Institutions. The choice of the technology lies with the State government depending on their local factors.

1.20 The Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation (MDWS) have signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with Defence Research and Development Organisation (DRDO) vide which the States have been given an option to adopt the DRDO model of bio-toilet. Under Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin), the States are free to choose any technology for safe disposal of excreta, including bio-toilets.

1.21 The Committee take a serious note of the casual reply furnished by the Ministry stating that sanitation is a State subject and the role of Government of India is to provide financial and technical assistance only . The Committee are of considered view that such a stance goes contrary to the Spirit of Swachh Bharat Mission, launched with great fanfare by the Government of India and of which sanitation is an integral part. Since the role of the Government of India goes beyond merely providing assistance, the Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation that the states may be given all manner of assistance including a conducive policy climate needed to achieve the set objectives. Further, the reply of the Government is conspicuously silent on the Committee's recommendation for addressing the urban – rural divide in the matter of fixing of inequitable water norms for toilets. Considering the severe shortage of water being faced in many parts of India, the Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation that the issue of inequitable water usage norms for urban and rural toilets be addressed expeditiously and the Committee apprised.

CHAPTER II

Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government

Observation/Recommendation No. 1

Sanitation Coverage: Sanitation has a direct bearing on human health and resultantly on all human endeavours. The lack of sanitation facilities in a vastly populated country like India has a severely debilitating effect on not only the human health but also on environment, eco-systems and the economy. In fact, Mahatma Gandhi rightly said that 'cleanliness is next to Godliness'. The Committee note that due to various reasons including demographic, economic and attitudinal, the sanitation facilities in their modern form are lacking in the rural areas of the country though according to travelogues of some foreigners, Indian villages were model of sanitation right up with Eighteenth century. Rural sanitation coverage in the beginning of the 1980s was as low as 1%. With the launch of the Central Rural Sanitation Programme (CRSP) in the year 1986 and its substitution by the Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC) in 1999, rural sanitation rose, remarkably, to 22% as per the Census 2001 and to 32.7% as per 2011 Census. The figure touched 40.6% in 2012-13 as per Base Line Survey (BLS). The Committee note that while the growth in the decade between 2001 and 2011 has been 10.8% in the short period between 2011 and 2012-13, it has been as high as 7.9%. The break-up between individual toilets and the public toilets being 30.7% and 9.9% respectively. The low progress in regard to public toilets, the Committee find, is mainly due to difficulties being faced by the Government in maintenance and management of public toilets. The Committee also note that for the purpose of ascertaining the number of toilets constructed and those being utilized, there is absolutely no set up at the Central Government level and they have to depend on States to furnish this information on IMIS. This, as will be seen from the subsequent narrative, has a significant downside in the implementation of relevant schemes and programmes in the rural sanitation sector.

The Committee are deeply concerned to note the abysmally poor progress made by the country in 67 years after Independence in creation of rural sanitation facilities. It is a matter of serious worry that out of 75 odd crore people living in the rural areas, almost 50 crore do not have individual toilets. By Government's own admission in regard to the very low number of public toilets (9.9%) and their poor state of maintenance and management, most of these people would be resorting to open defecation not by choice but by compulsion. Notably, the launch of Swachh Bharat Mission on 2nd October, 2014 resolves to make India Open Defecation Free India (ODFI) by 2019. Having regard to the fact that collection of credible micro and real time data in regard to construction and utilization of toilets in rural areas is of paramount importance, the Committee strongly feel that the Government need to plan and involve participation of retired Government servants, teachers and school level students and NGOs in the nation-wide sustained sanitation campaign. Such abroad participation of persons from all sections of society will generate awareness about the importance of cleanliness in the country. Committee also desire that Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRIs) and NGOs should also be increasingly involved as an integral part of participatory strategy in planning, construction, maintenance and upkeep of public toilets.

Reply of the Government

The on-line monitoring has been strengthened. Data upto household level is included in the IMIS. A Mobile application for uploading photographs of toilets constructed after 2.10.2014 has been launched. Third party monitoring is also being done through agencies such as NSSO.

The Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) is being implemented as a citizen's movement with involvement of all sects of the society. Community approach has been mentioned as the preferred approach, wherein it is expected to involve the entire community to bring about a collective behavior change. Cleanliness campaigns are held

at regular intervals to continue the momentum. The schools and colleges are actively involved in such campaigns.

As per SBM(G) Guidelines, the Panchayati Raj Institutions have a pivotal role in the implementation of SBM(G). The Gram Panchayats are to take lead in the social mobilization for the triggering demand, construction of toilets and also maintenance of the clean environment by way of safe disposal of waste. The Panchayat representatives are involved in various trainings and the States have been asked to involve them fully in the programme. Non Government Organisations (NGOs) are also actively involved for assisting in carrying out Inter-personal communication and training. The GoI also undertakes capacity building of various NGOs, so that they can be more fruitfully engaged by the States for effective work.

Observation/Recommendation No. 4

Physical Targets vis-à-vis Financial Targets: The Committee note that upto July, 2014, the overall allocations made under the Total Sanitation Campaign/Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan were ₹ 22,672.36 crore. This includes ₹ 14888.92 crore from Central share, ₹ 5549.20 crore from State share and ₹ 2234.24 crore as Beneficiary share. A sum of ₹ 20188.42 crore was released for the purpose. The break-up being ₹ 12781.52 crore from Central share, ₹ 5191.46 crore from State share and ₹ 2215.44 from the Beneficiary share. The amount actually spent was ₹ 16775.66 crore which includes ₹ 10659.52 crore from Central share, ₹ 4400.67 crore from State share and ₹1715.47 from the Beneficiary share. Notably, the actual expenditure from the fund released from the Central share is about 83% and that from the States' share is about 85%. As compared to the earmarked Outlays, the actual expenditure under Central share is on 72% or so and under the States' share it is about 79%. In the case of the Beneficiary share the actual expenditure is approximately 78% of released amount and 77% of the earmarked Outlay. The Committee are deeply distressed to note that the funds utilization for rural sanitation schemes is grossly dissatisfactory. The low funds utilization, in the considered view of the Committee, is a major contributory factor for the

insignificant achievements in the area of rural sanitation facilities. Notwithstanding the demand driven nature of rural sanitation schemes, the manner of allocation, its reduction and low expenditure with respect to finally released funds reflects, apparently, a complete lack of proper planning on the part of Union Government, the State Governments and other executing agencies. They, therefore, recommend that the spending Ministries/Departments adhere to the sound principles of financial discipline and fiscal responsibility while allocating resources and their release, utilization including monitoring the pace of expenditure and the outcome thereof.

Reply of the Government

Under Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin), the monitoring has been strengthened to ensure better financial discipline. Under Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) against RE of Rs. 2850 crore for the year 2014-15, expenditure amount is Rs. 2850 crore (100%). It is also proposed to introduce, in consultation with States, Public Financial Management System (PFMS) for monitoring of fund-flow on real-time basis. Close coordination with States is being done to help the States address various challenges that constrain efficient utilization of funds.

Observation/Recommendation No. 8

Participation of NGO/Social Organisations: The Committee note that under the Key Resource Centre Programme, NGOs and Social Organizations have also been assisting the Government in achieving the sanitation goals. These organizations have been organizing training programmes and workshops at State and National levels. Notably, during the period 2011-12 to 2014-15, five NGOs/Social Organizations who assist the Government in the field but only Plan India – WASH Institute was able to complete their assignment i.e. only in water sector during 2011-12 and 2012-13. Rest of these organizations have not been able to complete their projects. The Committee, therefore, urge the Government to look into the performance of the NGOs/Social

Organizations receiving grant-in-aid from the Government or foreign aid and take appropriate corrective action and apprise the Committee in due course.

Reply of the Government

An evaluation of the work of KRCs was got done through the UNICEF. Based on the evaluation report, the work of KRCs is being streamlined. Four regional Conclaves have been held to bring about greater coordination between the States and KRCs/NGOs. The States have been requested to propose the names of such organizations, as they consider appropriate for imparting training within the State to Gol for empanelment as KRCs. The Gol will endeavor to carry out further skill upgradation of such KRCs/NGOs. Also, looking at the potential of State ATIs/SIRDs, the States have been asked that they may be treated as deemed KRCs.

Observation/Recommendation No. 9

The Committee are deeply concerned over the aggravating sanitary conditions due to want of toilets, lack of adequate and regular water supply, the degradation caused by solid and liquid waste and the rising pollution of the water bodies posing serious threat to human habitations and the ecology. The Committee wish to recall that excavations of ancient sites like Mohenjo-daro and Harappa testify that there was great emphasis on sanitation in its all forms. The dictum that "cleanliness is next to godliness", captures the power and importance of sanitation. The Committee earnestly hope that the 'Swachh Bharat Abhiyan', being all encompassing, will achieve the intended objective by the year 2019.

Reply of the Government

The Gol has launched Swachh Bharat Mission-Gramin (SBM-G) on 2nd October, 2014 to accelerate efforts to achieve universal sanitation coverage, improve cleanliness

and eliminate open defecation in India by 2019. The program is considered India's biggest drive to improve sanitation and cleanliness in the country. The effectiveness of the Programme is predicated upon generating demand for toilets leading to their construction and sustained use by all the household members. This is to be bolstered with adequate implementation capacities in terms of trained personnel, financial incentives and systems and procedures for planning and monitoring. The emphasis is on stronger focus on behaviour change intervention including interpersonal communication; strengthening implementation and delivery mechanisms down to the GP level; and giving States flexibility to design delivery mechanisms that take into account local cultures, practices, sensibilities and demands.

The Ministry has taken several recent initiatives to achieve the desired outcomes.

- The focus on capacity building has been increased, since there is a need to improve skills, especially those pertaining to community processes and triggering for collective behaviour change. In order to expand these skills and train the key stakeholders, State level workshops involving all the key stakeholders such as Collectors, CEO, Zilla Panchayats, Chairmen Zilla Panchayats etc. are being held in different States. Regional workshops to cross share learning amongst different States are also being held. The Government of India has also undertaken direct training of Collectors and more than 200 district Collectors from across India have been trained so far.
- The Centre-State coordination has been increased through increased visits to States, coordination meetings, and reviews. Realising the different socio-economic-cultural milieu in different States, the Swachh Bharat Mission has provided complete flexibility in implementation to the States.
- There is also a renewed focus on IEC and a 360 degree media campaign is being envisaged to further boost it. The social media – twitter (@swachbharat), Facebook (Swachh Bharat Mission) and

HIKE/WhatsApp is being extensively used for sharing innovative ideas and cross learning.

- A National Rapid Action and Learning Unit has been constituted to institutionalise learning from the field and provide quick feedback.

CHAPTER III

Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's reply

-NIL-

CHAPTER IV

Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee

Observation/Recommendation No. 2

Sanitation in Schools: As per records of the year 2013-14 submitted by the Ministry, there are 10,93,969 schools in the country. Out of these 94.45% schools have boys' toilets and 84.63% schools have girls' toilets. Out of total boys' toilets, 92.67% are functional. Similarly, 91.62% girls' toilets are functional. The percentage of girls toilets in both the terms are low as compared to boys toilets in the country. In this context when the Committee sought some further clarification from the Ministry in the light of the veracity of figures of DISE being challenged, the Committee were informed that of the 11.22 lakh Government schools, 2.45 lakh schools do not have a toilet which translates to a gap of 4.19 lakh toilets if at least one toilet each is to be provided to girls and boys separately. The Committee note with deep concern the apparent mismatch between the figures submitted to them by the Ministry and the steps being taken and the time line by which each school would have adequate but separate toilets for girls and boys. They, therefore, direct the Ministry to furnish a detailed explanation alongwith the action as desired to the Committee in this regard within three months of the presentation of this Report to Lok Sabha.

Reply of the Government

After launch of Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) on 2nd October, 2014, school toilets are to be provided by Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD). Under Swachh Vidyalaya Initiative which aimed to provide toilet blocks for girls and boys in each school, 417796 toilets were constructed in a period of one year from 15.8.2014 to 15.8.2015.

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No. 1.8 of Chapter-I)

Observation/Recommendation No. 3

On an average the overall percentage of school toilets having running water tap facility in the country is only 22.5%. The Committee note with concern that there are States like Bihar, Jharkhand and Uttar Pradesh where this coverage (water tap facility) percentage is as low as less than 1% and in States like Assam, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Manipur, Odisha, Rajasthan and West Bengal the same is far below the national average of 22.5%. This sorry state of affairs is totally unacceptable to the Committee. The Ministry of Human Resource Development has also drawn the attention of Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation to provide running water facilities in school toilets. In view of the growing scarcity of water, the Committee feel that the matter needs to be taken up with the concerned States to ensure availability of tapped water in all the schools expeditiously. The Committee further impress upon the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation to draw an Action Plan under which the schools which have no running water facilities are provided tap water in a time bound manner. Further, the Ministry need to identify expeditiously the schools which have non-functional toilets and the schools which have no toilets at all in the country in consultation with the Ministry of Human Resource Development and the Ministry of Women and Child Development so that the non-functional toilets are made, functional on priority basis and the school without toilets are provided the facility. They would like to be apprised of the action plan including timeline for attainment of the above objectives.

Reply of the Government

After launch of Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) on 2nd October, 2014, school toilets are to be provided by Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD). Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation has instructed the States to provide water in the vicinity of school premises.

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No. 1.11 of Chapter-I)

Observation/Recommendation No. 5

Swachh Bharat Mission: Considering the fact that rural sanitation has been allocated ₹ 37159 crore for XII Plan. In the first two years of the Plan, the Government have been able to utilize only ₹ 4723.61 crore which is only 12.71% of the total outlays made under XIIth Plan. The Committee further note that the Swachh Bharat Mission, launched on 2nd October, 2014, aims to make India Open Defecation Free (ODF) by 2019. As per the updated information furnished to the Committee, the total fund requirement of Swachh Bharat Mission (Rural) is ₹ 1,34,386 crore. Out of which Central share of funds is ₹ 1,00,447.02 crore in 5 years upto 2018-19. The current Central outlay for Rural sanitation for the XIIth Five Year Plan under Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation alone is ₹ 37,159 crore.

Out of this, ₹4,723.61 crores have been utilized in years 2012-13 and 2013-14. The balance of ₹ 34,885.39 crore (including an Opening Balance with States of ₹ 2450 crore) was available as on 1.4.2014 under the XII Plan period. The balance funds ₹ 65561.63 crore (in addition to the budgetary allocation for the XIIth Plan) required to achieve Swachh Bharat Mission (Rural), are to be made available via (i) contributions to the Swachh Bharat Kosh; (ii) through commitments under Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) and (iii) through Budgetary allocations in the first two years of the XIIIth Plan period 2017-18 and 2018-19. The Committee note that the Government have not yet finalized the fund availability for the Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) through the proposed sources though the Government have fixed the timeline for completion of the Mission by the year 2019. Fixing of timeline for accomplishing the mission, without identifying the resources, in their considered view, may not only affect the target of completion of the Mission but also create an avoidable uncertainty. The Committee,

therefore, recommend that the Government must expeditiously explore the feasibility of funds needed for the Mission through various sources. They would like to be informed of the current status in the matter including a complete review of the NBA/TSC and steps needed to reformulate the policy matters and estimates in the light of implementation of NBA/TSC within six months of presentation of this Report to Lok Sabha.

Reply of the Government

₹ 4125 crore have been allocated so far for Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) in 2015-2016 and additional funds are expected in the Second Supplementary. 0.5% Swachh Cess on services has been imposed w.e.f. 15.11.2015 to supplement the budgetary source for Swachh Bharat Mission.

Besides this, Swachh Bharat Kosh has been established in November, 2014 under Ministry of Finance to attract CSR funds for sanitation. In the second meeting of Swachh Bharat Kosh Trust, Rs. 445.07 crore have been approved for Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin). In addition, Rs. 50 crore for toilets in villages around the Ganga river have been approved from Swachh Bharat Kosh. Funding from Overseas Indians is also being tapped. For this purpose, India Development Foundation of Overseas Indians (IDF-OI) Trust has been established under the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs. The States may also utilize other sources of funds such as 14th Finance Commission grants, States own resources, CSR etc.

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No. 1.14 of Chapter-I)

Observation/Recommendation No. 6

Solid Waste Management: Sanitation also include solid waste management and accordingly Gram Panchayats are being provided assistance. In the prevailing scenario of urbanization and industrialization, the problem of solid waste management is as

daunting as providing sanitation facilities due to its severely adverse impact on environment, ecology and human and livestock health. The Committee were informed that the response of States for management of solid waste is very poor. There are States /UTs like Assam, Dadar & Nagar Haveli, Goa, Nagaland, Puducherry and Sikkim which have not shown their interest in creating solid waste management infrastructure during the preceding three years. The overall setting up of solid waste management infrastructure has disappointingly shown a declining trend. During 2011-12, a total 2729 Gram Panchayats have created infrastructure. This declined to 1624 in 2012-13 and 1250 in 2013-14. It was further informed that the Ministry has not been fixing any annual targets in respect of sanitation with the plea that NBA is demand driven scheme. The Committee find such a plea rather specious and therefore desire that the Government should re tailour their policy and fix annual targets for their schemes so that the mission is accomplished successfully within the timeline. They also urge the Government to create awareness among the Gram Panchayats to undertake solid waste management activities at village level.

Reply of the Government

Solid and Liquid Waste Management (SLWM) is an integral part of the Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin). Under SBM(G) SLWM projects can be taken up in each Gram Panchayat and total assistance shall be worked out on the basis of total number of households in each GP, subject to a maximum of Rs.7 lakh for a GP having up to 150 households, Rs.12 lakh up to 300 households, Rs.15 lakh up to 500 households and Rs.20 lakh for GPs having more than 500 households. Any additional cost requirement is to be met with funds from the State/GP. The Ministry organizes National/Regional workshops on SLWM to disseminate awareness amongst the States. Guidelines on SLWM have also been developed and shared with States. Newer technologies and best practices in SLWM are shared with the States.

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No. 1.17 of Chapter-I)

Observation/Recommendation No. 7

R&D in Sanitation Equipments/ Technology: The representative of the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation testified before the Committee that in rural areas the inclination of the toilet pan is 42 degree which uses, on an average, 0.6 litre of water per use whereas the consumption of water for the same purpose in urban area varies significantly between 2.2 litres and 6.6 litre. The Committee are surprised to note such a wide difference in respect of water being used in Rural and Urban toilets. The Committee also feel strongly that the bio-digester technology developed by DRDO be also explored for adoption, if found efficient, economic and environment friendly by the Government. The Committee also note that the Ministry have reviewed 65 R&D projects out of total 136 projects and found that most of the R&D projects are not viable either due to application base or due to being very old. Only two R&D projects have been recommended for implementation at site/field level. In view of the massive and ever increasing problem of solid waste management, the Committee desire that the Government should play a far more proactive role to propagate the two projects and provide due incentivisation for their fast tracking from lab to land. The Committee also desire that a fresh impetus should be provided to R&D on solid waste management so that better, cost effective and environment friendly technologies for the purpose are developed on war footing to address the mounting threat of solid waste. Further, there is an imperative need to bridge the urban – rural divide in the matter of water being used by the rural and urban toilets inequitably.

Reply of the Government

Sanitation is a State subject and the role of Government of India is to provide financial and technical assistance. The Ministry promotes innovation and R&D. An Expert Committee headed by Dr. R.A. Mashelkar to examine the Innovative Technologies has been formed. This committee has enlisted various innovative technologies and a Compendium consisting of such technologies has been published and uploaded in the website of the Ministry for benefits of various stakeholders. Regular

exhibitions of Innovative technologies (Indovation) are organized by the Ministry (Three such exhibitions held in New Delhi on 26-27th August 2014, 23-24 January 2015 and 2-3 July 2015) wherein various innovative technologies in respect of Toilet, Solid and Liquid Waste Management and Water Treatment are showcased to various Stakeholders / Users including various State Governments, NGOs and Research & Academic Institutions. The choice of the technology lies with the State government depending on their local factors.

The Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation (MDWS) has signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with Defence Research and Development Organisation (DRDO) vide which the States have been given an option to adopt the DRDO model of bio-toilet. Under Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin), the States are free to choose any technology for safe disposal of excreta, including bio-toilets.

Comments of the Committee

(Please see Para No. 1.21 of Chapter-I)

CHAPTER V

Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final reply of Government is still
awaited

-NIL-

**NEW DELHI;
5 August, 2016
Shravana 14, 1938 (Saka)**

**DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI
Chairperson,
Committee on Estimates**

MINUTES OF THE SEVENTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2016-17)

The Committee sat on Friday, the 29th July, 2016 from 1500 hrs to 1615 hrs. in Room No. '62', Parliament House, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi – Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri George Baker
3. Shri Dushyant Chautala
4. Shri Ashwini Kumar Choubey
5. Shri Ram Tahal Choudhary
6. Shri Ramen Deka
7. Shri Sanjay Dhotre
8. Shri P. C. Gaddigoudar
9. Shri K. H. Muniyappa
10. Shri Rajesh Pandey
11. Shri Bhagirath Prasad
12. Shri Arvind Sawant
13. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
14. Shri Anil Shirole
15. Shri Rajesh Verma

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Devender Singh – Additional Secretary
2. Shri Srinivasulu Gunda – Additional Director
3. Shri R. S. Negi – Under Secretary

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the members to the sitting of the Committee. Thereafter, the Chairperson apprised the Committee of the election of a new member Shri Bhagirath Prasad to the Committee. The Committee then welcomed the newly elected member.

APPENDIX - II

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE SECOND REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

(i)	Total number of recommendations/observations	09
(ii)	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government (Sl. Nos. 1, 4, 8 and 9)	4
	Percentage of total recommendations	44%
(iii)	Recommendation/Observation which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's reply	Percentage of total recommendations
		NIL
	Percentage of total recommendations	NIL
(iv)	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee (Sl. Nos. 2, 3, 5, 6 and 7)	05
	Percentage of total recommendations	55%
(v)	Recommendation/Observation in respect of which final replies of Government is still awaited.	Nil
	Percentage of total recommendations	Nil