

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF
SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES
(2013-2014)**

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

THIRTY-THIRD REPORT

ON

MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION

**Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the
Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on the Welfare
of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the subject
"Reservation for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled
Tribes in National Aviation Company of India Ltd. (NACIL)".**

Presented to Lok Sabha on 11.2.2014

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 11.2.2014



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

11 February, 2014/22 Magha, 1935(Saka)

CONTENTS

		Page
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE.....		(iii)
INTRODUCTION.....		(v)
CHAPTER I	Report.....	
CHAPTER II	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government.....	
CHAPTER III	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of replies of the Government.....	
CHAPTER IV	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.....	
CHAPTER V	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.....	

APPENDICES

- I Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 06.1.2014.....
- II. Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Recommendations contained in the Twenty-first Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha).....

**COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED
CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2013-2014)**

Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

MEMBERS – LOK SABHA

2. Shri M. Anandan
3. Shri Khiladi Lal Bairwa
4. Shri Bhudeo Choudhary
5. Smt. Jyoti Dhurve
6. Dr. Manda Jagannath
7. Shri Mohan Jena
8. Shri Mohinder Singh Kaypee
9. Shri Kamal Kishor 'Commando'
10. Shri Mithilesh Kumar
11. Shri Basori Singh Masram
12. Shri Arjun Meghwal
13. Shri Kishanbhai V. Patel
14. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
15. Shri Bajju Ban Riyan
16. Shri C.L. Ruala
17. Smt. Rajesh Nandini Singh
18. Shri Rajaiah Siricilla
19. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
20. Shri Bhausahab Rajaram Wakchaure

MEMBERS – RAJYA SABHA

21. Dr. Pradeep Kumar Balmuchu
22. Shri Shashi Bhusan Behera
23. Shri Thaawar Chand Gehlot
24. Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste
25. Shri Lalhming Liana
26. Shri D. Raja
27. Shri Nand Kumar Sai
28. Shri Veer Singh
29. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
30. Shri Nandi Yellaiah

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. R.K. Chadha - Additional Secretary
2. Shri D.R. Shekhar - Director
3. Shri S. Chatterjee - Additional Director
4. Shri R.C. Wadhwa - Under Secretary
5. Shri Mukesh Kumar - Committee Officer

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes having been authorised by the Committee to finalise and submit the Report on their behalf, present this Thirty-third Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Twenty-first Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on "Reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in National Aviation Company of India Ltd. (NACIL)" pertaining to the Ministry of Civil Aviation.

2. The draft Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on 6th January, 2014 (Appendix-I).

3. The Report has been divided into the following chapters:-

- I Report
- II Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government.
- III Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of replies of the Government.
- IV Recommendations /Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.
- V Recommendations / Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.

4. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee is given in Appendix-II. It may be observed therefrom that out of 26 recommendations/observations made in the Report, 5 recommendations i.e. 19 per cent have been accepted by the Government. The Committee do not desire to pursue 15 recommendations i.e. 58 per cent of the total recommendations in view of replies of the Government. There are 6 recommendations i.e. 23 per cent in respect of which reply of Government has not been accepted by the Committee and which require further reiteration.

NEW DELHI
11 February, 2014
22 Magha, 1935 (Saka)

GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR
Chairman,
Committee on the Welfare
of Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes.

CHAPTER – I

REPORT

This Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Twenty-first Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) pertaining to the Ministry of Civil Aviation regarding "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in National Aviation Company of India Ltd. (NACIL)".

1.2 The Twenty-First Report was presented to Lok Sabha on the 9th August, 2012. It contained 26 recommendations/observations. Replies of the Government in respect of all these recommendations/observations have been examined and may be categorised as under:-

- (i) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government (Sl. No. 5, 11, 12, 21 and 26).
- (ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government (Sl. Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20 and 22).
- (iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (Sl. Nos. 4, 13, 17, 23, 24 and 25)
- (iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received (NIL).

1.3 The Committee will now deal with the Action Taken by the Government on those recommendations which need reiteration or comments.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 2.5)

1.4 The Committee note that reservation is applicable to all posts in Air India Ltd. filled by direct recruitment and promotion. In respect of posts filled by selection, however, reservation was applicable upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' posts only. Consequently reservation was not applicable to some categories of posts filled by selection. However, if any direct recruitment was effected for these posts, the reservation orders were applicable. The Committee feel that there is an urgent need to lay down policy guidelines for providing reservation for all categories of posts including all rung of Group 'A' posts both in selection and promotion.

Reply of the Government

1.5 Air India has been following the instructions issued by DoPT and the recruitment/promotion Rules of the Company have been framed by incorporating the provisions of these instructions as also guidelines of DoPT. All recruitment and promotions in Air India are governed by these rules.

In Air India Ltd. as per the provisions of Presidential Directives, in respect of posts filled by selection in the specific cadre, reservation is applicable up to the lowest rung of Group 'A' posts only.

Comments of the Committee

1.6 The Committee note that Air India Ltd. are following the instructions of DoPT and accordingly framed their rules in regard to the recruitment and promotion in the company. However, the Committee would like to draw attention to Judgement (1995) 3 Supreme Court cases 532 (before R.M. Sahai, B.P Jeevan Reddy and Suhas C. Sen, JJ) National Federation of SBI and others versus Union of India and others in WP© No. 896/1990 dated 10.3.1995 wherein it was held that

the concessions as interpreted by Hon'ble Supreme Court shall have to be applied and implemented by State in promotion by Selection within Group 'A' in favour of SCs/STs. The Committee, therefore, recommend that keeping in view the judgement of Supreme Court, the Government should render justice to SC/ST Officers by giving concessions in promotion to the higher grades i.e. from Deputy Managers up to General Managers post. Action taken by the Government in view of the judgement of the Supreme Court in the matter may be communicated to this Committee within three months of presentation of the report.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 4, Para No. 2.17)

1.7 The Committee note that Air India was not utilizing the medium of All India Radio to advertise vacancies in view of the fact that no recruitment was being made in Group 'A' and 'D' posts. However, all vacancies were posted on the websites of Air India and its subsidiary companies. In some of the categories, the Company also encouraged online applications. The Committee also note that it was not the practice of the appointing authorities to indicate the reasons for rejection of SCs/STs candidates who are sponsored by the employment exchanges to these employment exchanges and the reasons for rejection of any candidate were normally recorded in assessment sheets of the panel members. The Committee are of the view that since many SC/ST candidates do not have access to Internet and other IT facilities, especially those residing in remote areas, the Committee feel that apart from using the facility of Internet and other technologies, the conventional system of advertising through National/Local Dailies newspapers, Employment News and correspondence through letters should be continued. The Committee also desire that copies of the advertisement issued should be provided to the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and recognized SC/ST Employees Welfare

Association of the Company. The Committee desire that the Company should intimate the precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by the employment exchanges to enable them to sponsor other suitable SC/ST candidates. The Committee also desire to know the procedure for recruitment of Group 'A' and 'D' posts in NACIL-A&I.

Reply of the Government

1.8 With the advancement in the field of Information Technology, it was decided to upload the advertisement on the website of the Company, which is available to the candidates for a specific period of time, while the advertisement on All India Radio was only momentary. Further window advertisement are inserted in the leading newspapers, full advertisements in the Employment News and copies of the same are forwarded to the recognized All India Associations of SCs and STs as per DOP&T order issued vide OM No. 36014/3/77 dated 23.04.1977.

Comments of the Committee

1.9 **The Committee are surprised to note that though the Committee had clearly directed the NACIL to intimate the precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by employment exchanges to enable them to sponsor other SC/ST candidates and also to know to the procedure for recruitment of Group 'A' and 'D' posts in NACIL-A&I, the reply of the Government is silent in this regard. The Committee are, therefore, reiterate that the precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates should be intimated to employment exchanges to enable them to sponsor other SC/ST candidates.**

The Committee also reiterate their desire to know the procedure for recruitment of Group 'A' and 'D' posts in the company.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 7, Para No. 2.34)

1.10 It has been reported that due to ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some of the vacancies, there has been no recruitment in non-operational areas and the backlog has not been filled up. However, NACIL-A has filled backlog SC/ST vacancies. The Committee note that recruitment process in NACIL has been kept on hold in view of the present financial crunch in the Company and till a reassessment of manpower and the reserved vacancies was carried out in the merged company (NACIL) which was formed by amalgamating erstwhile Air India and Indian Airlines in August, 2007. The Committee had recommended that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should make all out efforts to fill all the posts reserved for SCs and STs in all the categories within a reasonable time frame. The Committee had also recommended that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should provide the details of recruitment carried out in the year 2009, 2010 and 2011 and details of the backlog vacancies of SCs/STs in all categories of posts as on April 1, 2012 to the Committee.

Reply of the Government

1.11 Details of recruitment carried out in NACIL-A and NACIL-I is provided in Annexure-'B' and backlog vacancies of SC/ST as on 01.04.2012 is enclosed at Annexure-'C'.

1.12 The organizational structure i.e. standard force in the merged entity is being reviewed. On merger of seniority the rosters would be re-written. However, government guidelines on reservation would be followed while making appointments in AI.

Comments of the Committee

1.13 The Committee would like to know the latest status of review of organisational structure and emphasize upon the need to expedite the procedure

of review to facilitate merger of seniority and preparation of revised rosters expeditiously.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 11, Para No. 3.13)

1.14 The Committee are surprised to note that no appointments on compassionate grounds have been made by NACIL-A during the year 2006 to 2009 even though they had 201 applications from SC/ST candidates pending for consideration as on 30.03.2010. Similarly in NACIL-I, applications from 28 SC and 12 ST candidates were pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee feel that it is a matter of great concern that such a large number of SC/ST applications for appointment on compassionate grounds are pending in both the divisions of the Company. The Committee desire that the process of appointments on compassionate grounds should be expedited and accorded utmost priority as many of these SC/ST families belong to lower income groups with no other means of livelihood. The Committee, therefore, recommend that both the divisions of NACIL should initiate immediate action for filling up posts for SCs/STs from eligible SC/ST candidates whose applications are pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee should be apprised of the outcome of the above at the earliest.

Reply of the Government

1.15 In 1996, freeze on all recruitment was imposed by Ministry of Civil Aviation. Accordingly, all recruitments which included out-of-turn (OOT) compassionate appointments were not done since time. Subsequently, Ministry informed that operational categories of Air India could carry recruitments after permission from the Ministry and the same was being done. However, OOT appointments being unskilled and clerical category, the same could not be acted upon. Further, with the merger of Air India and Indian Airlines, a policy was formulated by the Board that all OOT

appointments would be carried out in the subsidiary companies on fixed termed contract basis.

1.16 The then CMD accorded approval vide letter dated 3/4th May 2011 of COO-AIATSL for Compassionate appointments in AIATSL for the post of Customer Agent, Security Agent and Ramp Service Agent in Mumbai, Chennai and Kolkata. Based on the approval, Selection Panel had conducted interview for Customer agent and screening for Handyman, the details of which are furnished in Annexure-'D'.

Comments of the Committee

1.17 The Committee would like to know the present status of the pending applications of SCs/STs for appointments on compassionate grounds and also the total number of appointments given to SCs/STs since 2011 under fixed termed contract basis. The Committee strongly recommend permanent appointments of SC/ST employees instead of fixed termed contract basis appointments policy in case of compassionate appointments as it has more permanency and is more secure then an appointment under fixed termed contract basis. The Committee therefore, feel that the policy of recruitment under fixed termed contract basis needs to be revisited and replaced for SC& ST employees.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 13 Para No. 3.20)

1.18 The Committee note that NACIL-I has furnished consolidated information with regard to in-service training given to SC/ST employees. Also both the divisions of the Company gave details without mentioning the category of posts for which such training was imparted. The Committee recommend that NACIL should conduct regular in-service training programmes for SC/ST employees in all categories of posts so as to bring up them at par with other employees and have better prospects for promotion to

next higher grade. The Committee should also be provided with break up of posts in which SCs/STs were given in-service training by NACIL-I. The Committee are also of the view that the Company should explore the feasibility of imparting pre-recruitment training to SC/ST candidates.

Reply of the Government

1.19 Air India does not arrange any pre-recruitment training to any category. However, in respect of Trainee Technicians, Graduate Engineer Trainees, AME Trainees, Trainee Cabin Crew/Sr. Trainee Cabin Crew/Trainee Pilot/Sr. Trainee Pilot etc., absorption to regular scale of pay is subject to clearance of training imparted by Air India. All the new recruits in these categories including those belonging to SC/ST categories are imparted in-service training.

Comments of the Committee

1.20 The Committee are not satisfied with the reply furnished to them. The Committee had specifically recommended that NACIL should conduct regular in-service training programmes for SC/ST employees in all categories of posts and not in some of the posts as mentioned by the Government in their reply so as to bring them at par with other employees and have better prospects for promotion to next higher grade. The Committee had also sought break up of posts in which SCs/STs were given in-service training by NACIL-I. The Committee feel that scope for in service training being imparted by NACIL to all its employees including SCs/STs should be broaden to include almost all category of posts. The Committee also reiterate their recommendation that pre-recruitment training should be imparted to SCs/STs to enable them to perform better in the examination for final induction.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 17, Para No. 3.44)

1.21 The Committee note that during the years 2007 and 2008, a number of lacunae were noticed while inspecting the rosters of Air India (H.O. at Mumbai) by the representative of the Ministry and reported to Air India for corrective action and compliance. The Committee desire to know the details of the remedial action taken by NACIL on the lacunae noticed during the inspection and recommend that requisite steps should be taken to prevent recurrence of such lacunae in future. The Committee also recommend that the officials responsible for maintenance of rosters should be imparted proper training so that the chances of any lacunae are obviated.

Reply of the Government

1.22 The action taken is amended as Annexure – 'F'.

Comments of the Committee

1.23 The Committee are not satisfied with the misleading reply submitted by the Government. The Committee had specifically desired to know the details of remedial action taken by NACIL on the lacunae noticed during the inspection and recommended that requisite steps should be taken to prevent recurrence of such lacunae in future. The Committee had also recommended that the officials responsible for maintenance of rosters should be imparted proper training so that the chances of any lacunae are obviated. The reply furnished by the NACIL through the annexure is silent about these matters. From the reply it is obvious that Ministry is not serious to implement the recommendations of the Committee. They feel satisfied by merely submitting date of sitting held with Associations. The Committee take serious view on it and strongly recommend to fix responsibility for negligible attitude towards recommendations of the Committee

and reiterate that recommendations of the Committee should be implemented in letter and spirit.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 21, Para No. 3.61)

1.24 The Committee observed that in the case of Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, the Ministry of Civil Aviation had approved upgradation of the post of E.D. (Medical) against vacant post of E.D. (Hqrs) w.e.f. 01.09.2009. The Committee also note that the total vacant posts of E.D. in the Company are 22 out of sanctioned posts of 43. The Committee observe that Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, Executive Director (Medical) had been unceremoniously demoted to General Manager (Medical) for no fault of her's but due to Air India and the Ministry of Civil Aviation not taking any timely action. The Committee is of the view that the post of E.D. (Medical) should be adjusted against the 22 vacant posts of Executive Directors at the earliest so that Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa is restored to E.D. (Medical) at the earliest. Compliance report to this effect should be sent as early as possible for placing the same before the Parliamentary Committee.

Reply of the Government

1.25 Ministry of Civil Aviation vide their letter dated February 7, 2012 had advised Air India to bring up the matter of Dr. Nakhwa's regularization as ED-Medical Services before the HR Committee. Thereafter, the case was to be submitted to the Government for consideration.

1.26 The matter was put up to the HR Committee at its meeting held on May 14, 2012. The HR Committee approved the proposal for officiating arrangement in respect of Dr. Nakhwa for a period of three months or till finalization of the Organization Structure, whichever was earlier.

Comments of the Committee

1.27 The Committee would like to know the present position of regularization case of Dr. Nakhwa's as ED Medical Services and also reasons for making officiating arrangement in respect of Dr. Nakhwa's for a period of three months or till finalization of the organisation structure whichever was earlier.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 23, Para No. 4.6)

1.28 The Committee note that 11 cases of false caste certificates in NACIL-A are pending for verification with various agencies. The Committee recommend that the State Governments concerned should be pursued to complete the verification of caste certificates referred to them by the Company in a time bound manner. However, the Committee are happy to note that NACIL-I has registered criminal cases against five persons who obtained employment in the company on production of false caste certificates. The Committee had recommended that extra care should be taken while examining the caste certificates at the time of offering appointment letter itself by resorting to compulsory verification of all caste certificates at entry level. The Committee would also like to be apprised about the present status of pending cases in both the divisions of the Company.

Reply of the Government

1.29 The present status of False Certificate cases is enclosed at Annexure – 'I'.

Comments of the Committee

1.30 The Government has only furnished the present status of false caste certificate cases. The reply is, however, silent as to what steps have been taken by them to ensure that proper verification of certificate is done at the entry level itself. The Committee feel that growing incidents of false caste certificate is a matter of grave concern and should be looked into seriously and the gaps in the

system should be plugged immediately and the Company should take legal action on both the persons one who produced the false caste certificate and the officer responsible for verifying it at the entry level. The Committee, therefore, reiterate its earlier recommendation.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 24, Para No. 4.15)

1.31 The Committee regret to note that NACIL-A does not provide any reservation in Company's accommodation for SC/ST employees. Further, no housing loan facilities are provided to SCs/STs by both the divisions of the Company. The Committee strongly recommend that the Company should reserve quota in accommodation for its SC/ST employees in consonance with the orders of the Government of India and also provide housing loan to SC/ST employees on priority basis.

Reply of the Government

1.32 Revised guidelines have since been issued vide circular dated 10.04.2012 which provide for reservation in allotment of quarters for SC/ST across both erstwhile companies as under:

Type of Flats	SC/ST	
A-1	10%	In respect of ER, NR and SR.
A&B	5%	
A	10%	In respect of WR since no A-1 type of quarters available
B	5%	

Comments of the Committee

1.33 The Committee are happy to note that revised guidelines have been introduced to provide for reservation in allotment of quarters to SC/ST across both erstwhile companies and at the same time Committee are concerned to note that the reply of the Government is silent about providing housing loan to SC/ST

employees on priority basis. The Committee would like know the response of the Government in this regard.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 25, Para No. 4.20)

1.34 The Committee are concerned to note that no specific projects have been initiated by the Company for the upliftment of SC/ST people at any point of time. The Committee further note with concern that under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SC/ST communities, no funds have been provided by the Company. The Committee feel that the company is avoiding its social responsibility for upliftment of the down trodden section of the society. The Committee therefore, recommend that the Company must provide sufficient funds under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SCs/STs on priority basis.

Reply of the Government

1.35 Air India extends a number of welfare schemes to its employees such as canteen facilities, subsidized transport, holiday homes, medical facilities, educational scholarships for the wards of employees, financial assistance for pursuing higher studies, staff housing colonies etc. For certain welfare amenities such as Housing Colonies, Educational Scholarship Schemes for the wards of the employees, employees belonging to SC/ST categories are given reservation/relaxation in eligibility in comparison to general category employees. However, a few welfare schemes have temporarily been withdrawn for the time being in view of present financial crunch in the Company.

Comments of the Committee

1.36 The Committee are not satisfied with the casual reply furnished to them. The Committee had specifically recommended that the Government must provide sufficient funds under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SCs/STs on priority basis. Reply of the Government is silent in this regard. The Committee therefore, reiterate their recommendation.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 26, Para No. 4.23)

1.37 The Committee are not satisfied with the casual reply of the NACIL-I. The Committee also note with concern that in NACIL-A out of 487 casual labourers only three belonged to ST category. The Committee are of the view that like NACIL-A, NACIL-I should provide separate data of SC and ST casual labourers engaged by them during the last three years. The Committee, however, feel that even if the SC/ST reservation policy is not applicable in the case of casual employment, the Company should have explored possibility of giving employment to SC/ST persons. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Company should take affirmative action to give employment to as many SC/ST as possible as casual labourers and also regularize their services within a stipulated period. The Committee should be apprised about the action taken in this regard.

Reply of the Government

1.38 Engagement of casuals is resorted to address unexpected issues like clash of flight timings, delays and disruptions to flights, absence of regular employees, ground handling activities of other airlines, cargo freighters, temporary increase in work, etc. In order to meet the additional requirement of work force arising out of the aforesaid contingencies/exigencies, Air India resorts to engaging casual workers on daily rated basis subject to availability of work on each day from amongst those who are willing and

make themselves available. Necessary instructions have been issued in this regard. A copy the same is placed at Annexure – 'A'.

Comments of the Committee

1.39 The Committee are of the view that mere issuing of instruction for engaging SC/ST persons as casual labourer is not enough. There should be clear cut instruction and follow up mechanism for implementation of instructions in letter and spirit. The Committee would like to know the number of SC/ST casual labourers were engaged during last one year.

CHAPTER – II

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Recommendation (Sl. No. 5, Para 2.21)

2.1 The Committee note that reservation was made in case of direct recruitment for various posts in Groups 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' in Air India Limited. Normally, the vacancies for the posts under Groups 'C' and 'D' were notified to the Employment Exchange(s) and a copy of the notification was also sent to various SC/ST Associations/Agencies. Posts under Group 'A' and 'B' vacancies were notified in the Press and a copy of the advertisement was also sent to SC/ST Associations/Agencies, Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha Secretariats. It is, however, observed that copies of the advertisements are not received in the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee desire that copies of the advertisements should be invariably endorsed to the Secretariat of the Committee for information. Advertisements were also released in Employment News and local newspapers to attract SC/ST candidates. Eligible candidates are subjected to written/trade test, group discussion and personal interview as applicable from time to time and candidates found suitable in the interview were empanelled in the order of merit. Separate panels were formed for SC and ST candidates qualifying on relaxed standards. SC/ST candidates qualifying on merit were, however, placed on the general panel. Reservation for SCs/STs is applicable to all posts filled by Direct Recruitment.

Reply of the Government

2.2 As and when recruitment is initiated necessary action of forwarding copies of the advertisement to all agencies including Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of

Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes will be done in future. Necessary instructions have been issued in this regard. A copy of the same is placed at Annexure-'A'.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 11, Para 3.13)

2.3 The Committee are surprised to note that no appointments on compassionate grounds have been made by NACIL-A during the year 2006 to 2009 even though they had 201 applications from SC/ST candidates pending for consideration as on 30.03.2010. Similarly in NACIL-I, applications from 28 SC and 12 ST candidates were pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee feel that it is a matter of great concern that such a large number of SC/ST applications for appointment on compassionate grounds are pending in both the divisions of the Company. The Committee desire that the process of appointments on compassionate grounds should be expedited and accorded utmost priority as many of these SC/ST families belong to lower income groups with no other means of livelihood. The Committee, therefore, recommend that both the divisions of NACIL should initiate immediate action for filling up posts for SCs/STs from eligible SC/ST candidates whose applications are pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee should apprise of the outcome of the above at the earliest.

Reply of the Government

2.4 In 1996, freeze on all recruitment was imposed by Ministry of Civil Aviation. Accordingly, all recruitments which included out-of-turn (OOT) compassionate appointments were not done since time. Subsequently, Ministry informed that operational categories of Air India could carry recruitments after permission from the Ministry and the same was being done. However, OOT appointments being unskilled and clerical ground category, the same could not be acted upon. Further, with the merger of Air India and Indian Airlines, a policy was formulated by the Board that all

OOT appointments would be carried out in the subsidiary companies on fixed termed contract basis.

2.5 The then CMD accorded approval vide letter dated 3/4th May 2011 of COO-AIATSL for Compassionate appointments in AIATSL for the post of Customer Agent, Security Agent and Ramp Service Agent in Mumbai, Chennai and Kolkata. Based on the approval, Selection Panel had conducted interview for Customer agent and screening for Handyman, the details of which are furnished in Annexure-'D'.

Comments of the Committee

2.6 Please see Para No. 1.14 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 12 Para 3.17)

2.7 The Committee note that NACIL-A has furnished the details of postings abroad of Group 'A' posts only despite the fact the Committee had asked for category-wise details. The Committee have been informed that there was no reservation in the matters of posting abroad in both the divisions of the Company and reservation orders were not applied in the matter of postings abroad. However, the Committee feel that the management should give priority to SC/ST employees who are qualified and eligible for posting abroad. The Committee, therefore, urge the management to give due consideration to their suggestion and nominate as many as possible eligible SC/ST candidates for postings abroad.

Reply of the Government

2.8 Suggestions to be considered in future foreign postings. Instructions have been issued in this regard. A copy of the same is placed at Annexure-'E'.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 21, Para 3.62)

2.10 The Committee observed that in the case of Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, the Ministry of Civil Aviation had approved upgradation of the post of E.D. (Medical) against vacant post of E.D. (Hqrs) w.e.f. 01.09.2009. The Committee also note that the total vacant posts of E.D. in the Company are 22 out of sanctioned posts of 43. The Committee observe that Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, Executive Director (Medical) had been unceremoniously demoted to General Manager (Medical) for no fault of her's but due to Air India and the Ministry of Civil Aviation not taking any timely action. The Committee is of the view that the post of E.D. (Medical) should be adjusted against the 22 vacant posts of Executive Directors at the earliest so that Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa is restored to E.D. (Medical) at the earliest. Compliance report to this effect should be sent as early as possible for placing the same before the Parliamentary Committee.

Reply of the Government

2.11 Ministry of Civil Aviation vide their letter dated February 7, 2012 had advised Air India to bring up the matter of Dr. Nakhwa's regularization as ED-Medical Services before the HR Committee. Thereafter, the case was to be submitted to the Government for consideration.

2.12 The matter was put up to the HR Committee at its meeting held on May 14, 2012. The HR Committee approved the proposal for officiating arrangement in respect of Dr. Nakhwa for a period of three months or till finalization of the Organization Structure, whichever was earlier. The decision of the HR Committee was communicated to The Ministry for their consideration. The decision of MOCA in this regard has been received. Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, General Manager (Medical), Mumbai has been allowed to officiate as Executive director (Medical), in addition to her own duties for a

period of three months or till finalization of Organizational Structure of Air India, whichever is earlier. A copy of Notification issued in this regard is enclosed at **Annexure 'H'**.

Comments of the Committee

2.13 Please see Para No. 1.20 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 26, Para 4.23)

2.14 The Committee are not satisfied with the casual reply of the NACIL-I. The Committee also note with concern that in NACIL-A out of 487 casual labourers only three belonged to ST category. The Committee are of the view that like NACIL-A, NACIL-I should provide separate data of SC and ST casual labourers engaged by them during the last three years. The Committee, however, feel that even if the SC/ST reservation policy is not applicable in the case of casual employment, the Company should have explored possibility of giving employment to SC/ST persons. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Company should take affirmative action to give employment to as many SC/ST as possible as casual labourers and also regularize their services within a stipulated period. The Committee should be apprised about the action taken in this regard.

Reply of the Government

2.15 Engagement of casuals is resorted to address unexpected issues like class of flight timings, delays and disruptions to flights, absence of regular employees, ground handling activities of other airlines, cargo freighters, temporary increase in work, etc. In order to meet the additional requirement of work force arising out of the aforesaid contingencies/exigencies, Air India resorts to engaging casual workers on daily rated basis subject to availability of work on each day from amongst those who are willing and

make themselves available. Necessary instructions have been issued in this regard. A copy the same is placed at Annexure- 'A'.

Comments of the Committee

2.16 Please see Para No. 1.36 of Chapter I.

CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1, Para No. 1.12)

3.1 The Committee note that appointment of Directors on the Board of National Aviation Company of India Limited is done in accordance with the procedure laid down by the Public Enterprises Selection Board and guidelines issued by the Department of Public Enterprises from time to time. The Committee also note that presently no Director on the Board of the Company belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee further note that at present there are seven functional directors and four independent directors in the Company and none of them belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee feel that the Company does not promote SC/ST officers in higher scales even though Article 16(4) of the Constitution of India states that “Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any provision for the reservation for the appointments or posts in favour of any backward class of citizens which, in the opinion of the State, is not adequately represented in the services under the State” and Article 16(4A) which states that “Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any provision for reservation in matter of promotion, with consequential seniority to any class or classes of posts in the services under the State in favour of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes which, in the opinion of the State are not adequately represented in the Services of the State”. The Committee are of the view that having atleast one member on the Board of Directors from SC/ST category was essential to represent these communities. The Committee, therefore, recommend that in view of the constitutional mandate, the Government should provide reservation on appointment and promotion of officers in higher scales so that SC/ST officers could also get an

opportunity to become Functional Directors of the National Aviation Company of India Limited. Further, Government should ensure that atleast one SC/ST member is nominated as Independent Director of the Board.

Reply of the Government

3.2 All appointments in Air India are being made in accordance with the Government of India's policy on reservation for SC,ST and OBCs. Since no provision of reservation for SC/ST/OBC exists at Board level appointees in AI. However, no discrimination is adopted towards any candidates, who apply for the Board level position, on the basis of Cast/Religion. The selection is being done purely on merits. However, the observations of the Committee have been forwarded to DPE, which is the nodal Ministry for laying down guidelines for CPSEs.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2, Para No. 1.13)

3.3 The Committee note that the Company has two divisions i.e. NACIL (A) and NACIL (I). In NACIL (A), the Board of Directors make a periodical review of the implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs. However, on the other hand in NACIL (I) no such periodical review is made by the Board of the Directors. Only the Liaison officer – Corporate and Liaison Officers in the regions ensure due compliance of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs. The Committee are unable to understand the reasons for adopting two different criteria by the Company in this regard, although the Board of Directors of both the Divisions of the Company is the same. The Committee are of the view that the Board of Directors of the Company should also make periodical review of the implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs in NACIL (I) so that SC/ST employees are not deprived of their genuine claim.

Reply of the Government

3.4 Consequent to the merger of the two companies in the year 2007, i.e. Air India Ltd. and Indian Airlines Ltd. into National Aviation Company of India Limited (NACIL), which has subsequently been renamed as Air India Ltd., the single Board of Directors was constituted for the unified entity. However, the rules and procedures (including Recruitment & Promotion Rules of the erstwhile two companies) are being followed. The merged Recruitment and Promotion rules are being finalized. The recommendations of the Committee would be considered. However, all reservation orders for SC/ST are being followed and would continue to be followed.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 2.5)

3.5 The Committee note that reservation is applicable to all posts in Air India Ltd. filled by direct recruitment and promotion. In respect of posts filled by selection, however, reservation was applicable upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' posts only. Consequently reservation was not applicable to some categories of posts filled by selection. However, if any direct recruitment was effected for these posts, the reservation orders were applicable. The Committee feel that there is an urgent need to lay down policy guidelines for providing reservation for all categories of posts including all rungs of Group 'A' posts both in selection and promotion.

Reply of the Government

3.6 Air India has been following the instructions issued by DoPT and the recruitment /promotion Rules of the Company have been framed by incorporating the provisions of these instructions as also guidelines of DoPT. All recruitment and promotions in Air India are government by these rules.

3.7 In Air India Ltd., as per the provisions of Presidential Directives, in respect of posts filled by selection in the specific cadre, reservation is applicable up to the lowest rung of Group "A" posts only.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 6, Para No. 2.22)

3.8 The Committee desire that in case local Employment Exchanges fail to sponsor adequate number of candidates, efforts should be made to search for the candidates from adjoining States through specific advertisement.

Reply of the Government

3.9 Air India generally notifies its vacancies in one particular Region, i.e., Eastern, Western, Southern, Northern which comprise of a number of states. Candidates from all over the Region/country can apply against any vacancy irrespective of the Region.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 7, Para No. 2.34)

3.10 It has been reported that due to ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some of the vacancies, there has been no recruitment in non-operational areas and the backlog has not been filled up. However, NACIL-A has filled backlog SC/ST vacancies. The Committee note that recruitment process in NACIL has been kept on hold in view of the present financial crunch in the Company and till a reassessment of manpower and the reserved vacancies was carried out in the merged company (NACIL) which was formed by amalgamating erstwhile Air India and Indian Airlines in August, 2007. The Committee recommend that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should make all out efforts to fill all the posts reserved for SCs and STs in all the categories within a reasonable time frame. The Committee also recommend that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should provide the details of recruitment carried out in the year 2009, 2010 and 2011 and details of the backlog vacancies of SCs/STs in all categories of posts as on 1st April, 2012, to the Committee.

Reply of the Government

3.11 Details of recruitment carried out in NACIL-A and NACIL-I is provided in Annexure-'B' and backlog vacancies of SC/ST as on 01.04.2012 is enclosed at Annexure-'C'.

The organizational structure i.e. standard force in the merged entity is being reviewed. On merger of seniority the rosters would be re-written. However, government guidelines on reservation would be followed while making appointments in AI.

Comments of the Committee

3.12 Please see Para 1.10 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 8, Para No. 2.52)

3.13 The Committee note that in NACIL-I, the backlog exists in some technical categories due to non-availability of suitable SCs/STs candidates. In certain other categories, it was created due to reserved posts carried forward on account of compassionate appointments or single appointments, etc. In view of the present financial condition being faced by the Company, all recruitments/promotions have been put on hold. As and when it is decided to make recruitment from open market and promotions from within, priority will be given to clear all the backlog vacancies. The Committee also note that there is no de-reservation in Direct Recruitment. However, in promotion the procedure for de-reservation as per the Presidential Directives was followed. For Group A&B posts, approval of the Board of Directors and for Group C&D posts approval of Managing Director was obtained in the prescribed proforma. Such de-reservation arose only when suitable candidates belonging to reserved categories were not available even with relaxed standards and in the extended zone of

consideration. One post of SC and ten posts of ST in the year 2008 were de-reserved after following the due process during the last years.

Reply of the Government

3.14 Committee's observation only. The backlog will be clear in future.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 9, Para No. 2.53)

3.15 It is difficult to believe that NACIL is not able to recruit SC/ST candidates for technical posts due to non-availability of suitable candidates. They should make efforts to recruit SC/ST candidates in all categories of posts by advertising in National Dailies, TV Channels, writing to Universities/Technical Collages, etc. The Committee are of the view that the Company should have considered giving further relaxation/training to SC/ST candidates before de-reserving the one post of SC and two posts of STs in the year 2008. Further after taking the approval of Managing Director, the Ministry of Civil Aviation should also be consulted in this regard to avoid such de-reservation of SCs/STs posts. The Committee would like to be apprised of the details of posts de-reserved by both the divisions of the Company during the year 2009-2012 as also the steps taken by the Company to avoid de-reservation of SC/ST vacancies in promotion.

Reply of the Government

3.16 No de-reservation of any posts has been carried out either by Narrow Body or Wide Body during the year 2009-2012.

3.17 It may be clarified that the extreme step of de-reservation of vacancies is resorted to only when there are no such candidates available in the feeder cadres. Affects will be made to fill up unfilled technical post.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 10, Para No. 3.3)

3.18 The Committee note that NACIL-A had taken eight officials on deputation from other Government Department(s) during the year 2006-2009, but none of them belonged to SC/ST category. NACIL-I had also sent one of their employees on deputation and taken one employee on deputation from other Department. However, neither of them belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee feel that for career progression of SC/ST employees, they should be given opportunities in the matter of deputation as it opens an avenue for them to get exposed to new work environment, improve their working skill and aptitude which eventually will benefit the employee and the organisation. The Committee, therefore, desire that it should be apprised of details deputation in both the divisions of NACIL during last three years.

Reply of the Government

3.19 Certain posts in Air India (for e.g. CVO, ED-Security, etc.) are earmarked for filling up on deputation basis from Govt. agencies. The Ministry of Civil Aviation is the appointing authority through prescribed procedures.

3.20 The following officials were/are on deputation to Air India during the last three years:

- a. Mrs. Urmila Subbarao, IAS, Chief Vigilance Officer (repatriated to her parent Department in August 2012).
- b. Mr. Satish Mathur, IPS, Executive Director-Security – repatriated to his parent cadre in Oct., 2012
- c. Mr. Ashutosh Dumbare, IPS, Dy. Chief Vigilance Officer
- d. Wg. Cdr (Dr.) H.M.K. Murthy from IAF as Aviation Medicine Specialist

Recommendation (Sl. No. 14, Para No. 3.42)

3.21 The Committee note that in both the divisions of the Company, the Special Cell for SC/ST reports to the Liaison Officer for SC/ST. At present, the Executive Director-

HQ has been designated as the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and entrusted with the responsibility of implementing the President's Directive, orders/instructions issued by the Ministry in the matter of reservation for SCs/STs. In order to implement reservation for SCs/STs in appointments filled by direct recruitment/promotion, the Company are following the Post Based Roster in compliance with the O.M.No.36012/2/96-Estt.(Res.) dated 2nd July, 1997. These rosters are examined and scrutinized by the Liaison Officer for SCs/STs of the Company. Any shortcomings observed are corrected at the time of inspection of rosters. In addition, annual statistics as required by the Ministry, are submitted from time to time by the Company.

Reply of the Government

3.22 Committee's observation shall be kept in mind.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 15, Para No. 3.43)

3.23 The Committee also note that Executive Director-HQ has been appointed as the Liaison Officer Corporate to ensure due compliance of the reservation orders. In addition, General Managers (Personnel) in each of four regions have been designated as Liaison Officer for their respective region. The Committee further note that there is no laid down procedure for selecting/appointing the Liaison Officers and also that the Executive Director-HQ has been entrusted with additional charge as Liaison Officer for SCs/STs.

Reply of the Government

3.24 Committee's observation only.

3.25 It may, however, be stated that consequent to the retirement of Executive Director-HQ in March, 2011 Offg. Executive Director (Pers.) has been appointed as the Liaison Officer (Corporate).

Recommendation (Sl. No. 16, Para No. 3.44)

3.26 The Committee stress that the nomination of Liaison Officers should not be considered as mere fulfillment of a formality. The Committee, therefore, recommend that only such officers should be appointed as Liaison Officers who are not only fully acquainted with reservation orders but are also committed to justify their appointment to safeguard the welfare of SC/ST employees. The Committee also desire that the Liaison Officers for SCs/STs should exclusively look after the matters relating to SCs/STs and should not be burdened with other matters. The Committee also feel that Chief Liaison Officers posted at Headquarters as well as the Liaison Officers at regional offices should preferably be appointed from people belonging to SCs/STs category.

Reply of the Government

3.27 Appointment of Liaison Officer (Corporate) and Liaison Officers in the Regions is made in terms of clause 24 of Presidential Directives on reservation for SC/ST. However, SC/ST Officers will be positioned as Liaison Officer, wherever feasible.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 18, Para No. 3.46)

3.28 The Committee also note that during the years 2006 to 2008 the Liaison Officer of NACIL-A held meeting with SC/ST Welfare Association at Chennai, Kolkata, Amritsar and Mumbai. However, NACIL-I has submitted details of meetings held in 2009 only. The Committee desire that NACIL-I should furnish the details of meetings held by the Liaison Officer with SC/ST Welfare Association during 2006 to 2008. The Committee further, recommend that the both the divisions of NACIL should furnish the details in this regard for the years 2010 and 2011 also.

Reply of the Government

3.29 The periodical meetings are held with SC/ST Employees Association to sort out their problems and grievances. In addition, the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and officers of

SC/ST Cell do meet the Association/SC-ST employees as and when they approach to get their grievances redressed. Details of the meetings held by Liaison Officer with the SC/ST Association are at Annexure 'G'.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 3.60)

3.30 The Committee note the reply of NACIL-A that the grievances/representations received from SC/ST employees are examined by the Special Cell and whenever required, it is discussed with the Liaison Officer and remedial action was taken. Also the Grievance Registers for SCs/STs were maintained at all the regions at Mumbai, Delhi, Kolkata and Chennai with the records of complaints/grievances.

Reply of the Government

3.31 Committee's observation only.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 20, Para No. 3.61)

3.32 The Committee also note that most of the complaints were disposed of during the year itself. The complaints were discussed with SC/ST Employees Association during the regional/inter regional meetings on a mutually convenient date and resolved to the satisfaction of the complaint. In view of the large number of Departments, the Special Cell for SC/ST is required to follow up with the concerned Department for redressal of grievances and efforts were made to resolve the same with a reasonable period.

Reply of the Government

3.33 Committee's observation only

Recommendation (Sl. No. 22, Para No. 3.63)

3.34 The Committee is of the view that there is an ample scope of improvement in handling the complaints of SC/ST employees. Management needs to be sensitized towards the grievances of SC and ST employees. They should get speedy justice. The Committee would like to be apprised about the steps taken by the Ministry of Civil

Aviation to tighten the grievances redressal machinery, as committed by the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation. The Committee would also like to know the status of the two pending cases from Chennai region relating to complaints/grievances in NACIL-A. The Committee should also be apprised about the total number of complaints relating to SCs/STs received by both the divisions of the Company during the year 2009 to 2011 (till date) together with action taken thereon.

Reply of the Government

3.35 The status of the two pending cases from Chennai region relating to complaints/grievances in NACIL-A is as follows:

1) Mr. D. Ramesh, St.No.44727, Asst.Officer-Customer Services, Comml Dept, Chennai, regarding reduction in basic pay:

- Mr. Ramesh was initially appointed as Typist/Clerk wef 11.12.1986 in grade 04. He was further promoted as Sr. Typist/Clerk in grade 09 wef 01.01.1993. He was appointed as Traffic Assistant in grade 04 wef 09.12.1994 on basic pay @Rs.1360/-p.m.

As per the existing rules whenever employee is selected to lower grade post from higher grade post, the number of years an employee has rendered in higher grade is taken in to consideration and that many increments are considered from the minimum of the grade to which an employee has been selected and fixation is done accordingly.

Mr. Ramesh was in the higher grade i.e. grade 09 for nearly two years and accordingly two increments has been added in the minimum of grade 04 (for which he has been selected) and accordingly his basic pay was fixed correctly @ Rs.1360/- p.m. on 09.12.1994.

2) Mr. M.K. Munuswamy, St. No. 28550, Dy. Manager- Commercial Dept, Chennai regarding promotion/seniority:

- Mr. Munuswamy joined the Company on 30.11.1983 as a Teleprinter Operator in Dept. of Information Technology at Chennai and he was confirmed in the services on 01 June 1984. He was promoted as Sr. Teleprinter Operator (grade 09) on 01 January 1990, as Chief Teleprinter Operator (grade 11) on 01 January 1994 and as Teleprinter Supervisor (grade 14) on 01 July 1997. He had represented his case in August 2001 for promotion as Asst. Officer – Teleprinter against the SC backlog. Accordingly, as per review panel report, the promotions given to him were backdated. Hence, his promotion date as Asst. Officer-Teleprinter (grade 11) was revised to 01 January 1992 and as Officer-Teleprinter (grade 14) on 01 July 1996. Further he was promoted as Asst. Manager (grade 25) wef 01 July 1998. He was redeployed as Asst. Customer Services in the Commercial Dept. on 21st January 1999 due to closure of Telex section. Initially, it was decided by the management to retain the seniority of telex operator in the parent department viz DIT on redeployment.

The issue of seniority of telex operator was discussed with Air India Employees Guild by the management in the meeting on 04.03.1999, and as per the minutes of the meeting the telex operations staff on their promotion as Asst. Manager would continue to work in the department where they are redeployed and their seniority in the respective department would be at the bottom of the cadre of Asst. Manager, below the regular staff who are promoted as Asst. Manager as on that date. In view of the above, in stagnation promotion exercise of 2006, Mr. Munuswamy was further promoted as Dy Manager in Commercial Department w.e.f. 1st January 2007 and his seniority is maintained in the Commercial Department as present.

The matter has been clarified to the staff.

Number of complaints received.

Year	Mumbai		Delhi		Chennai		Kolkata	
	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
2009	06	01	01	Nil	01	01	Nil	Nil
2010	05	02	02	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
2011	09	02	01	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil

The nature of complaints were promotion, admin matters, seniority, training etc. The complaints are discussed with the SC/ST Association during the regional/inter regional meetings on a mutually convenient dates and resolved to the satisfaction of complainant. The complaints have been disposed off.

Ministry of Civil Aviation has a SC/ST Cell to look after the grievances/complaints of SC/ST employee. Whenever Ministry received grievances from SC/ST employee either through online or offline, their grievances are forwarded to the concerned organization with request to forward ATR. After receiving ATR Ministry of Civil Aviation scrutinize them and than give a suitable reply to the petitioner accordingly.

Comments of the Committee

3.45 Please see Para No. 1.24 of Chapter I.

CHAPTER – IV

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

Recommendation (Sl. No. 4, Para No. 2.17)

4.1 The Committee note that Air India was not utilizing the medium of All India Radio to advertise vacancies in view of the fact that no recruitment was being made in Group 'A' and 'D' posts. However, all vacancies were posted on the websites of Air India and its subsidiary companies. In some of the categories, the Company also encouraged online applications. The Committee also note that it was not the practice of the appointing authorities to indicate the reasons for rejection of SCs/STs candidates who are sponsored by the employment exchanges to these employment exchanges and the reasons for rejection of any candidate were normally recorded in assessment sheets of the panel members. The Committee are of the view that since many SC/ST candidates do not have access to Internet and other IT facilities, especially those residing in remote areas, the Committee feel that apart from using the facility of Internet and other technologies, the conventional system of advertising through National/Local Dailies newspapers, Employment News and correspondence through letters should be continued. The Committee also desire that copies of the advertisement issued should be provided to the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and recognized SC/ST Employees Welfare Association of the Company. The Committee desire that the Company should intimate the precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by the employment exchanges to enable them to sponsor other suitable SC/ST candidates. The Committee also desire to know the procedure for recruitment of Group 'A' and 'D' posts in NACIL-A&I.

Reply of the Government

4.2 With the advancement in the field of Information Technology, it was decided to upload the advertisement on the website of the Company, which is available to the candidates for a specific period of time, while the advertisement on All India Radio was only momentary. Further window advertisement are inserted in the leading newspapers, full advertisements in the Employment News and copies of the same are forwarded to the recognized All India Associations of SCs and STs as per DOP&T order issued vide OM No. 36014/3/77 dated 23.04.1977.

Comments of the Committee

4.3 **Please see Para 1.6 of Chapter I.**

Recommendation (Sl. No. 13, Para No. 3.20)

4.4 The Committee note that NACIL-I has furnished consolidated information with regard to in-service training given to SC/ST employees. Also both the divisions of the Company gave details without mentioning the category of posts for which such training was imparted. The Committee recommend that NACIL should conduct regular in-service training programmes for SC/ST employees in all categories of posts so as to bring up them at par with other employees and have better prospects for promotion to next higher grade. The Committee should also be provided with break up of posts in which SCs/STs were given in-service training by NACIL-I. The Committee are also of the view that the Company should explore the feasibility of imparting pre-recruitment training to SC/ST candidates

Reply of the Government

4.5 Air India does not arrange any pre-recruitment training to any category. However, in respect of Trainee Technicians, Graduate Engineer Trainees, AME

Trainees, Trainee Cabin Crew/Sr. Trainee Cabin Crew/Trainee Pilot/Sr. Trainee Pilot etc., absorption to regular scale of pay is subject to clearance of training imparted by Air India. All the new recruits in these categories including those belonging to SC/ST categories are imparted in-service training.

Comments of the Committee

4.6 Please see Para 1.17 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 17, Para No. 3.45)

4.7 The Committee note that during the years 2007 and 2008, a number of lacunae were noticed while inspecting the rosters of Air India (H.O. at Mumbai) by the representative of the Ministry and reported to Air India for corrective action and compliance. The Committee desire to know the details of the remedial action taken by NACIL on the lacunae noticed during the inspection and recommend that requisite steps should be taken to prevent recurrence of such lacunae in future. The Committee also recommend that the officials responsible for maintenance of rosters should be imparted proper training so that the chances of any lacunae are obviated.

Reply of the Government

4.8 The action taken is amended as Annexure – 'F'.

Comments of the Committee

4.9 Please see Para 1.20 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 23, Para No. 4.6)

4.10 The Committee note that 11 cases of false caste certificates in NACIL-A are pending for verification with various agencies. The Committee recommend that the State Governments concerned should be pursued to complete the verification of caste certificates referred to them by the Company in a time bound manner. However, the

Committee are happy to note that NACIL-I has registered criminal cases against five persons who obtained employment in the company on production of false caste certificates. The Committee recommend that extra care should be taken while examining the caste certificates at the time of offering appointment letter itself by resorting to compulsory verification of all caste certificates at entry level. The Committee would also like to be apprised about the present status of pending cases in both the divisions of the Company.

Reply of the Government

4.11 The present status of False Certificate cases is enclosed at Annexure – 'I'.

Comments of the Committee

4.12 Please see Para 1.27 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 24, Para No. 4.15)

4.13 The Committee regret to note that NACIL-A does not provide any reservation in Company's accommodation for SC/ST employees. Further, no housing loan facilities are provided to SCs/STs by both the divisions of the Company. The Committee strongly recommend that the Company should reserve quota in accommodation for its SC/ST employees in consonance with the orders of the Government of India and also provide housing loan to SC/ST employees on priority basis.

Reply of the Government

4.14 Revised guidelines have since been issued vide circular dated 10.04.2012 which provide for reservation in allotment of quarters for SC/ST across both erstwhile companies as under:

Type of Flats	SC/ST	
A-1	10%	In respect of ER, NR and SR.
A&B	5%	
A	10%	In respect of WR since no A-1 type of quarters available
B	5%	

Comments of the Committee

4.15 Please see Para 1.30 of Chapter I.

Recommendation (Sl. No. 25, Para No. 4.20)

4.16 The Committee are concerned to note that no specific projects have been initiated by the Company for the upliftment of SC/ST people at any point of time. The Committee further note with concern that under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SC/ST communities, no funds have been provided by the Company. The Committee feel that the company is avoiding its social responsibility for upliftment of the down trodden section of the society. The Committee therefore, recommend that the Company must provide sufficient funds under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SCs/STs on priority basis.

Reply of the Government

4.17 Air India extends a number of welfare schemes to its employees such as canteen facilities, subsidized transport, holiday homes, medical facilities, educational scholarships for the wards of employees, financial assistance for pursuing higher studies, staff housing colonies etc. For certain welfare amenities such as Housing Colonies, Educational Scholarship Schemes for the wards of the employees, employees belonging to SC/ST categories are given reservation/relaxation in eligibility in comparison to general category employees. However, a few welfare schemes have temporarily been withdrawn for the time being in view of present financial crunch in the Company.

Comments of the Committee

4.18 Please see Para 1.33 of Chapter I.

CHAPTER V

**RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH FINAL REPLIES
OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN RECEIVED**

-----NIL-----

NEW DELHI;

February, 2014

Magh, 1935 (Saka)

**(GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR)
CHAIRMAN
COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE
OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES**

APPENDIX V
(Vide Para 4 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE TWENTY FIRST REPORT (FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA) OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES.

1.	Total number of recommendations.....	26
2.	Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 5, 11, 12, 21 and 26)	
	Number.....	5
	Percentage to the total.....	19%
3.	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20 and 22)	
	Number.....	15
	Percentage to the total.....	58%
4.	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (vide recommendations Sl. Nos. 4, 13, 17, 23, 24 and 25)	
	Number	6
	Percentage to the total.....	23%
5.	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received - NIL	