

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF  
SCHEDULED CASTES AND  
SCHEDULED TRIBES  
(2013-2014)**

**(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**THIRTIETH REPORT**

**ON**

**MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT  
(Department of School Education and Literacy)**

**Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme  
in Government run schools.**

**Presented to Lok Sabha on 22.8.2013**

**Laid in Rajya Sabha on 22.8.2013**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

**NEW DELHI**

**22 August, 2013 /31 Sravana, 1935(Saka)**

## CONTENTS

### Page

#### Composition of the Committee

#### Introduction

CHAPTER I -	Background note	1 - 3
CHAPTER II -	Untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme	4 - 13
CHAPTER III -	Implementation of Mid Day Meal Scheme	14 - 19
CHAPTER IV -	Monitoring Mechanism and Progress	20 - 30
CHAPTER V -	Miscellaneous	31 - 36

## **APPENDICES**

- A. Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 16.11.2013.
- B. Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 07.08.2013.
- C. Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations contained in the Report.
- D. Observation of Monitoring Institute on social equality under Mid Day Meal Scheme.

## COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2013-2014)

Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar – Chairman

### MEMBERS – LOK SABHA

2. Shri M. Anandan
3. Shri Khiladi Lal Bairwa
4. Shri Bhudeo Choudhary
5. Smt. Jyoti Dhurve
6. Dr. Manda Jagannath
7. Shri Mohan Jena
8. Shri Mohinder Singh Kaypee
9. Shri Kamal Kishor "Commando"
10. Shri Mithilesh Kumar
11. Shri Basori Singh Masram
12. Shri Arjun Meghwal
13. Shri Kishanbhai V. Patel
14. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
15. Shri Bajju Ban Riyan
16. Shri C.L. Ruala
17. Shri Rajaiah Siricilla
18. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
19. Shri Bhausahab Rajaram Wakchaure
20. Smt. Rajesh Nandini Singh

### MEMBERS – RAJYA SABHA

21. Dr. Pradeep Kumar Balmuchu
22. Shri Shashi Bhusan Behera
23. Shri Thaawar Chand Gehlot
24. Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste
25. Shri Lalhming Liana
26. Shri Nand Kumar Sai
27. Shri Veer Singh
28. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
29. Shri Nandi Yellaiah
30. Vacant\*

### SECRETARIAT

- |    |                        |   |                      |
|----|------------------------|---|----------------------|
| 1. | Dr. R.K. Chadha        | - | Additional Secretary |
| 2. | Shri D.R. Shekhar      | - | Director             |
| 3. | Shri Shilpi Chatterjee | - | Additional Director  |
| 4. | Shri R.C. Wadhwa       | - | Under Secretary      |

\* Vacant due to retirement of Shri D.Raja from Rajya Sabha w.e.f. 24.07.2013.

## **INTRODUCTION**

I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes having been authorised by the Committee to finalise and submit the Report on their behalf, present this Thirtieth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) pertaining to the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) on the subject "Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools".

2. The Committee took evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) on 16 November, 2012. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the officers of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy) for placing before the Committee the material and information the Committee required in connection with the examination of the subject.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on 7th August, 2013.

4. A summary of conclusions/recommendations contained in the Report is appended (Appendix \_\_\_\_).

**New Delhi;**  
**22 August, 2013**  
**31 Shravana, 1935 (Saka)**

**GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR**  
**Chairman**  
**Committee on the Welfare**  
**of Scheduled Castes and**  
**Scheduled Tribes**

# **CHAPTER I**

## **BACKGROUND**

The Mid Day Meal Scheme is the world's largest school feeding programme reaching out to 10.54 crore children in 12.37 lakh institutions across the country. It was launched as a Centrally Sponsored Scheme on 15th August, 1995 as a dry ration scheme. Pursuant to the Hon'ble Supreme Court orders and policy pronouncements of Central Government, the scheme was revised in its content and coverage from time to time.

1.2 The salient features of the Scheme relating to objectives, coverage, quantity and calorific value, components of Central Assistance, etc. are given below:

### **(i) Objectives**

- (a) To encourage poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections, to attend school regularly and help them concentrate on classroom activities.
- (b) To improve the nutritional status of the children in Classes I-VIII in Government, local Body and Government aided schools. National Child Labour Project Schools and Education Guarantee Schemes (EGS)/Alternative & Innovative Education (AIE) including Madarsas/Maktabs supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA).
- (c) Provide nutritional support to children in drought-affected areas during summer vacation.

### **(ii) Coverage**

Mid-Day Meal Scheme covers children of classes' I-VIII studying in Government, Local Body, Government aided and National Child Labour Projects schools and the centres run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS)/Alternative & Innovative Education (AIE) centres including Madarsas/Maktabs supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). During the year 2011-12, against the Project Approval Board (PAB) approval of 12.12 lakh institutions, 12.37 lakh (102%) institutions have been covered

under MDMS. Against the PAB approval of 11.07 crore children, 10.54 crore (95%) have availed of the Mid Day Meal.

**(iii) Calorific Value of mid-day meal**

The cooked mid-day meal consists of 100 grams of wheat/rice, 20 grams of pulses, 50 grams of vegetables and 5 grams of oil/fat to provide 450 calories of energy and 12 grams of protein at primary stage. For upper primary stage children, it consists of 150 grams of wheat/rice, 30 grams of pulses, 75 grams of vegetables and 7.5 grams of oil/fat to provide 700 calories and 20 grams of protein at upper primary stage.

**(iv) Components of Central Assistance**

- (a) Foodgrains (wheat/rice) free of cost @ 100 grams per child per school day for primary & @ 150 gram per child per school day for upper primary.
- (b) Transportation – In the 11 Special Category States (viz. Assam, Arunachal Pradesh, Himachal Pradesh, Jammu & Kashmir, Manipur, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Nagaland, Sikkim, Uttarakhand and Tripura), transportation cost of foodgrains is provided at par with the PDS rates prevalent in these States. In case of all other States/UTs transportation of foodgrains is given @ Rs.75 per Quintal or the actual cost incurred whichever is less.
- (c) Monitoring, Management and Evaluation (MME) – It is calculated @2% of the total assistance for (a) foodgrains cost, (b) transportation cost, (c) cooking cost and (d) honorarium to cook-cum-helpers. Of the 2%, 1.8% is given to the States/UTs as Central Assistance and 0.2% is utilized at the national level for management, monitoring and evaluation purposes.
- (d) Procurement of kitchen devices – One time Central Assistance @ Rs.5000 is provided to States/UTs for provisioning and replacement of kitchen devices per school.
- (e) Components shared with States/UTs are:
  - (i) The cost of cooking mid day meals,
  - (ii) Construction of kitchen-cum-stores and
  - (iii) Honorarium to cook-cum-helpers

1.3 The cooking cost is shared between the Centre and the NER States on 90:10 basis and with other States/UTs on 75:25 basis.

1.4 The construction cost is now determined on the basis of plinth area norms and State Schedule of Rates prevalent in the State/UT. The Department of School Education and Literacy, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Government of India has prescribed 20 sq.mt. plinth area for construction of Kitchen-cum-Store in schools having upto 100 children. For every addition of up to 100 children, additional 4 sq.mt. plinth area will be added. States/UTs have the flexibility to modify the slab of 100 children depending upon the local conditions. Further an honorarium of Rs.1000 per month to each part time cook-cum-helper engaged by States/UTs is being paid from 1.12.2009. According to the norms prescribed under the scheme, one cook-cum-helper for up to 25 students, two cook-sum-helpers for schools with 26 to 100 students and one additional cook-cum-helper for every addition of up to 100 students can be engaged.



**CHAPTER II**  
**UNTOUCHABILITY IN MID DAY MEAL SCHEME**

2.1 The Committee have been informed that the Ministry of Human Resource Development has engaged 41 independent Monitoring Institutes to monitor the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) and Mid Day Meal (MDM) Scheme. The Monitoring Institutes (MIs) visit 40 schools in each district. Two working days are allotted for each school for review of the SSA and MDM. The Monitoring Institutes submit the report on half yearly basis for 25% of the allotted districts to State Government and to the Ministry of HRD. The Terms of Reference (ToR) for the Monitoring Institute have been clearly defined and focus on social equality. The MIs are expected to observe if there is any gender or caste or community discrimination in cooking of MDM or serving or seating arrangements. They also review the system of serving as well as seating arrangements for eating MDM. MIs undertake the field visit according to ToR as per the schedule. The State-wise and district-wise report of the Monitoring Institutes regarding discrimination/segregation are given at Appendix - IV. Based on the report of the Monitoring Institute, the Ministry of HRD constituted 7 teams to visit 4 States and to verify the report of the Monitoring Institutes.

2.2 The composition of the teams are as under:

<b>S.No.</b>	<b>Team</b>	<b>SC/ST member in the team</b>	<b>Districts</b>	<b>State</b>
1.	Shri Rajeev Kumar, Section Officer and Dr. Mridula Sircar, Consultant	Nil	Kandhmal, Bhoud	Odisha
2.	Shri B.B. Sharma, Deputy Secretary and Dr. Anindita Shukla, Consultant	Nil	Bharatpur, Pratapgarh	Rajasthan
3.	Shri B.D. Shivani, Under Secretary and Mr. Tanmoy Ghatak, Consultant	Yes there was one SC member	Jaisalmer, Dungarpur	

4.	Smt. V. Jayanthi, Under Secretary and Shri Bhupendra Kumar, Consultant	Nil	Chamarajan, Agara, Haveri, Uttara, Kannada	Karnataka
5.	Shri V.K. Agarwal, Under Secretary and Shri Rajat Gupta, Consultant	Nil	Panna, Satna, Chhatarpur	Madhya Pradesh
6.	Shri Rishi sirohi, Sr. Consultant and Shri Dinesh Pradhan, Consultant	Nil	Chhindwada, Singrauli	
7.	Smt. Rita Chatterjee, Joint Secretary and Ms. Reena, Research Assistant	Yes there was one ST member in the team	Betul, Burhanpur	

### **Investigation of Untouchability in interior areas**

2.3 The Committee enquired whether investigating teams visited interior areas of the country where casteism and untouchability are prevalent even today, it has been informed that the Ministry of HRD had identified 144 poorly performing districts under the Mid Day Meal Scheme and the Monitoring Institutes have been requested to cover these districts on priority. The Government of India is covering these districts through field visits by the Central team and Review Missions. The State Government has also been requested to pay more attention on these districts to improve the performance of the Scheme. If any reports received from any corner of the country about casteism and untouchability, teams are sent from the Central Government to the State for detailed investigation.

2.4 On being enquired whether SC/ST representative is included in investigation team to find out irregularities and cases of untouchability in MDM schemes, the Committee have been informed that Central Teams were sent to the concerned States on receiving reports from Monitoring Institutes about discrimination meted out to children in schools under MDM scheme. Out of seven teams, SC/ST member was included only in two teams.

2.5 When asked whether the Government are contemplating to send investigating teams to visit interior areas of the country where discrimination reported, the Ministry in their written reply have stated that as and when any report of discrimination is received from any of the State/UT, the Central Government invariably deposes its team for detailed investigations and for taking necessary corrective action, wherever required. At present there is no report of any discrimination is pending for detailed investigation.

2.6 The Committee were also informed that the Government propose to send five Review Missions consisting of representatives of the Central Government, UNICEF, State Government of Karnataka, Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh, Sikkim and Nagaland to cover the remote areas and would specifically look for any instances of discrimination.

2.7 When asked about the procedure to investigate the matter, it was stated that the schools where discrimination/segregation had been reported by the Monitoring Institutes, were selected for field visit by the Ministry of Human Resource Development teams for verification of the findings of Monitoring Institutes (MIs).

2.8 When the Committee enquired about the time taken by the team to investigate, prepare and finalize the report, it was stated that the 7 teams constituted by the Ministry for the purpose visited 4 States during 6th-9th August, 2012. The teams completed their analysis and reports of the field visits are submitted within 4 days of completion of the field visit. Findings of the team were sent to the State Government for taking appropriate actions.

2.9 On being asked by the Committee whether the team also interacted with the family Members of the effected children, the Ministry stated that the teams reviewed records available at the school, teachers, children, members of the school management, Committee/Village Education Committee, cook-cum-helpers, parents etc.

The teams also interacted with officials of the States at various levels and discussed with nodal officers of the Monitoring Institutes.

2.10 During the evidence, the Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development informed that:-

"The Monitoring Committee reports have shown discrimination. We have taken it up with the State Governments for taking corresponding action after that. Some of the places where discrimination was there and there have been delays in the State Government's Report and others, directly from the Government of India central teams have been sent. Our central team was sent, for example, to four States and reports of which would be coming. This is the overall position in which we try to carry our task to try and ensure that children do not face discrimination, but reports of the Monitoring Committee and field reports suggest that discrimination is there".

2.11 During the evidence the Committee pointed out cases of untouchability in Ganjam, Cuttack, Dehkhna coastal districts of Odisha, the Additional Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development assured that:

"We will get those coastal areas inspected and give you a report on that".

2.12 On being asked about the instances where Mid Day Meal cooked by SC persons was refused by upper caste students, the Ministry of Human Resource Development in their written reply have stated that during the period 2004-2011, the State Governments concerned have reported as under:-

(i) In January, 2004, during MDM at Birbhanpur Primary School, block Sarenga, district Bankura, West Bengal a few students from Brahmin community did not take the food owing to caste issues. Sincere efforts were made by the local people and the

Block Administration to convince the guardians about the implication of bringing caste consideration in social life. When the cooked meal was resumed on 17.11.2004 after the break all the students of the school participated in the programme.

(ii) In May, 2005 the villagers have obstructed the distribution of MDM in Primary School, Pathri, Block Attri, district Gaya, Bihar as two persons from SC community were appointed as cooks. FIR was lodged against the persons concerned. The accused were arrested and children are having their MDM on a regular basis. The school was again visited in 2010 as per the Joint Review Mission for the State of Bihar. No discrimination was seen.

(iii) In August, 2007, the State Government of Bihar had filed an FIR against the Secretary of the Vidyalaya Shikshan Samiti (VSS) of Primary School Pipri, district Rohtas, Bihar and he was arrested by the police. The MDM is properly run in the village now.

(iv) In February, 2010 based on the report of Ketaki Sethi, a member of Self-Help Group, Sidha Nahakani school of Sanamarichipali village in the district of Kendrapara, Odisha an FIR has been filed against one of the guardians of the students. The person concerned has been arrested and presented in the Court. Now the Mid Day Meal programme is running smoothly.

2.13 When asked about instances where SC/ST students sit separately and their utensils for the Mid Day Meal are kept separately, the Committee were informed that the Monitoring Institute for Odisha has reported caste discrimination in seating arrangements while eating mid day meal in few schools. In the Amthapada Primary and Upper Primary school, discrimination on the basis of caste was observed. It was seen that SC children sit separately to eat the MDM. The Head Master of the school was aware about caste based sitting arrangement while serving mid day meal.

2.14 A team of two officials visited Boudh district in Odisha in August 2012. After visiting the particular school and after seeing the discrimination in seating arrangements and meeting the parents and community members, a Report was submitted. On the basis of the report submitted by the Team a letter was sent to Principal Secretary Education, Government of Odisha for taking a serious view of the matter. The State Government has suspended the Head Master and inquiry has been initiated.

2.15 Regarding discrimination in Boudh district in Odisha, the Additional Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development during the evidence informed that:-

"We also told the other teachers that this would not be tolerated".

2.16 When asked whether SC/ST persons are employed as cook-cum-helper, it was stated that the States/UTs have engaged 24.72 lakh cook-cum helper across the country during 2011-12. 42% of these cook-cum-helpers belong to SC/ST categories.

2.17 When asked about engagement of SC/ST persons for distribution of meal to students and instances where these persons were boycotted by general category students and criteria for employment of persons for cooking/supply of cooked mid day meal, the Committee were informed that none of the State Government reported any instances where these cook-cum-helpers were boycotted by general category students. The Village Education Committee/School Management Committee engaged the cook-cum-helpers for preparing and serving mid day meal in the schools. The MDM guidelines envisaged for engaging cook-cum-helper from disadvantaged groups viz. SC, ST, OBC, Women, Minority etc.

2.18 When asked about instances where students did not avail the mid day meals because of caste factor, the Committee was informed that two complaints, one each from Madhya Pradesh and Uttar Pradesh have been received since 01.01.2011. These

States were asked to enquire into the matters and take necessary action. The State Government of Madhya Pradesh has informed that the complaint was found baseless as the meals prepared by female cooks belonging to Scheduled Caste community were being consumed by all the children in the school. The State Government of Uttar Pradesh has informed that the complaint of the Principal of the school in Lakhimpur district regarding non-cooking of mid-day meals and caste discrimination was found baseless.

2.19 Regarding remedial measures taken by the Government to tackle caste based discrimination in schools, it has been submitted by the Ministry that States/UTs have formed Committees/Samitis with members from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes to inspect preparation and distribution of food. Similarly, priority is given to these communities in recruitment of cook-cum-helpers. MDM guidelines lay down that on an average 25% of schools should be inspected every quarter by State Government officers belonging to different departments at District, Sub-Division, Tehsil/Taluka, block and other suitable levels. In addition the Joint Review Missions consisting of representatives of Central Government and the State also help in detecting the malaise. Similarly, 40 independent Monitoring Institutions such as IIT Chennai, and Visva-Bharati also monitor this aspect.

**2.20 The Committee are distressed to note that the instances of untouchability are still prevailing in the country even after 65 years of Independence, though it is prohibited in the Constitution and punishable under the penal laws. The Committee observe that untouchability is mostly found in the remotest of the remote areas of the country and in coastal areas particularly in the State of Odisha. The Committee also find that the Central teams were not sent to the affected areas in the State of Odisha particularly in the coastal belt and therefore recommend that the Central Government should depute special team to visit**

these areas at once to investigate the cases of untouchability, to see the gravity of the situation and to suggest ways and means to tackle the malaise accordingly. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.

2.21 The Committee are further distressed to note that some schools and few teachers are playing roles in perpetuating untouchability and sowing seeds of castes related discrimination in young minds. The Committee recommend that these schools and teachers involved in such deplorable practice of untouchability should be given exemplary punishment. The Committee also recommend that periodic interactive sessions should be held with the teachers by the school management to make them understand the social fall out of untouchability and its ever lasting impact on the tender minds of the children.

2.22 The Committee note with concern that the Ministry of Human Resource Development had identified 144 poorly performing districts under the Mid Day Meal Scheme. The Monitoring Institutes have been requested to cover these districts on priority. The Government of India is also sending Central team and Review Missions to these districts. The State Governments have also been requested to pay more attention on these districts to improve the performance of the scheme. The Committee find that though on paper the monitoring mechanism seems to be in order, still it is a matter of concern that 144 districts are under performing. The Committee would like to know the findings of the Government as to why these districts are under performing and corrective measures taken by the Government in this regard.

2.23 The Committee are happy to note that as and when any report of discrimination is received from any of the State/U.T. the Central Government invariably deposes its team for detailed investigation and for taking necessary



corrective action wherever required. At present, there is no report of any discrimination is pending for detailed investigation. However, the Committee would like to know the outcome of investigations made by the Central Government regarding discrimination in MDM for last one year.

2.24 The Committee are, however, unhappy to note that out of seven teams deputed to four States to verify the reports of MIs regarding untouchability, SC/ST members were included only in two teams. The Committee, therefore, recommend that whenever such team/s is constituted to verify the facts and smooth interaction with the affected members of the society, SC/ST member should invariably be included.

2.25 The Committee also note that the Government propose to send five Review Missions consisting of representatives of the Central Government, UNICEF, State Governments of Karnataka, Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh, Sikkim and Nagaland to cover the remote areas to check instances of discrimination. The Committee recommend that MP/MLA and Members of SC/ST Communities should be included in the Review Mission. The Committee would like to be apprised about the findings of the Review Mission district-wise and the action taken against the persons provoking or practicing untouchability and also the post visit performance of the schools.

2.26 The Committee note with satisfaction that as a remedial measure States/UTs have formed Committees/Samitis with members from Scheduled Castes & Scheduled Tribes to inspect preparation and distribution of food. Similarly, priority is given to these communities in recruitment of cook-cum-helpers. MDM guidelines lay down that on an average 25% of schools should be inspected every quarter by State Government officers belonging to different

departments at District, Sub-Division, Tehsil/Taluka, block and other suitable levels. In addition the Joint Review Missions consisting of representatives of Central Government, to the States also help in detecting the malaise. Similarly, 40 independent Monitoring Institutions such as IIT Chennai, and Visva-Bharati also monitor this aspect. The Committee, however, strongly recommend to the Government to explore further ways and means as to how the social evil of untouchability and discrimination could be totally eradicated not only from the schools but also from the society at large through spreading awareness, imparting education, training and holding workshops for the purpose. The Committee also desire that for dissemination of such information Government should use Radio, TV, Vernacular Newspaper and electronic media so that people of the country can realize the sense of equality and respect to dignity of individual.

## CHAPTER III

### IMPLEMENTATION OF MDM SCHEME

#### A. Responsibilities

3.1 The Committee have been informed that the responsibility of providing nutritious, cooked mid-day-meal to every child lies with the State Government and Union Territory Administrations, under the guidelines issued by the Government of India. In this regard State Governments/UT Administrations are required to designate the State Nodal Department and Nodal Officer or Agency at District and Block level. Funds are released by the Central Government on the basis of demands projected by the States/Union Territories and approved by the Project Approval Board (PAB) constituted at Central Government level. The Central Government conveys the State/UT-wise allocation of food grains, cooking costs, kitchen-cum-store, kitchen devices to the State Nodal Department and the FCI. The State Nodal Department makes district-wise allocations and conveys to all District Nodal Agencies, who have to ensure that each school is informed of its monthly allocation of foodgrains and financial sanctions for construction of kitchen-cum-store, cooking costs, kitchen-cum-cooking devices etc. Similarly, the FCI is responsible for allowing uninterrupted lifting of fair average quality foodgrains by the district authorities. Thus, State Governments/UT Administrations and FCI have joint responsibility of providing foodgrains to the Schools for providing Mid Day Meals to the children.

3.2 It has also been stated that the responsibility of cooking/supplying of cooked mid-day meal, as far as possible is assigned to one of the following:

- (i) Local women's/mothers; Self Help Group;
- (ii) Local Youth Club affiliated to the Nehru Yuvak Kendras;
- (iii) A voluntary organization fulfilling requirements laid down in para 3.9 of MDM Guidelines, and

- (iv) By personnel engaged directly by the Village Education Committee, School Management and Development Committee, Parent-Teacher Association and Municipality.

**3.3 The Committee note that the responsibilities of providing nutritious, cooked mid-day meal to every child lies with the State Government and Union Territory Administration under the guidelines issued by the Government of India. In this regard every State Government/UT Administration is required to designate the State Nodal Department and nodal officer or Agency at district and Block level. The Committee recommend that it must be made mandatory for nodal officer or nodal agency in the States to make regular field visit and conduct surprise checks every month to detect any violation of guidelines and persistence of untouchability, if any, and submit their report to the State Government concerned.**

**3.4 The Committee note that due to lukewarm approach of the implementing agencies, the untouchability still exist in some part of the country. The Committee strongly recommend that accountability should be fixed for non adhering to the rules and procedure and violating guidelines so as to implement the MDM scheme properly without any instances of discrimination and untouchability which otherwise defeat the very purpose of MDMS.**

#### **B. Involvement of NGO in implementing MDM**

3.5 The Committee have been informed that the Mid Day Meal Guidelines envisage that community participation is key to the successful implementation of the Mid Day Meal Scheme as it ensures effective monitoring at the local level and also generates a sense of ownership of the programme in the community. It is, therefore, desirable that Mid Day Meal is cooked locally in the school premises either through Self Help Groups or through the personnel engaged by the School Management Committee constituted

under the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act, 2009 or any other equivalent Committee responsible for implementing the scheme. However, for urban areas, where there is a space constraint for setting up school kitchens in individual schools, the Guidelines provide that a Centralised Kitchen could be set up for a cluster of schools where cooking can take place and the cooked hot meal may be transported under hygienic conditions through reliable transport systems to various schools. Operation of these Centralized kitchens may be entrusted to reputed NGOs under the PPP model. The Guidelines for engagement of voluntary organizations/ Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO) under Mid Day Meal Scheme have been prepared and circulated to all the States/UTs vide letter dated 8th September, 2010.

3.6 Accordingly, many States/UTs have engaged NGOs to supply hot cooked mid day meal to children studying in Government, Government aided, Local Body, NCLP, EGS/AIE, and Madarsa & Maqtabas supported under SSA.

3.7 The Committee have also been informed about the Akshay Patra Foundation, a Non-Government Organisation which has been engaged by many States/UTs for providing Mid Day Meal to about 12 lakh children in more than 8000 schools in 21 districts of 9 States. The State-wise details are given as under:-

District wise details of Coverage of Akshaypatra under MDMS during 2011-12

S.No.	State	District	Institutions	Avg. Children covered
1.	Andhra Pradesh	Medak	244	37414
2.	Assam	Kamrup	510	47571
3.	Chattisgarh	Durg	159	32541
4.	Gujarat	Gandhi Nagar	429	49614
		Vadodara	617	100198
		Ahmedabad	99	21575
		Surat		50000
5.	Karnataka	Bangalore Urban	665	133615
		Ramanagar	19	3195
		Mysore	57	18265
		Dakshinkannada	65	8908
		Dharwad	770	148586
		Haveri	3	491
		Bellary	481	84056
6.	Odisha	Nayagarh	301	30044
		Puri	436	50000
7.	Rajasthan	Jaipur	1413	125108
		Rajsamand	228	17682
8.	Uttar Pradesh	Mathura	1717	172725
		Agra	47	6618
9.	Delhi	New Delhi		42000
	<b>Total</b>		<b>8260</b>	<b>1180206</b>

**Source: Annual Work Plan & Budget 2012-13 of MDMS**

The uniqueness of the Akshay Patra experience

- Focussed programme that is child-centric and directly addresses MDGs 1&2
- Works in a vibrant public-private partnership with Central and State Governments.
- Has successfully upscaled operations to cover 1.3 million children
- Centralised, automated kitchens that can cook close to 6,000 kilos of rice, 4.5 to 5 tonnes of vegetables and 6,000 litres of sambar, in under 6 hours.
- Roti making machines that can turn out 60000 rotis per hour.
- High quality meals at Rs.675 per child per year (deficit – national average after government subsidies)

- Supply chain that transports cooked food to schools through heat-insulated, dust-free special purpose vehicles.
- Caters to local dietary preferences
- ISO 22000 certification for ten Akshaya Patra Kitchens
- Providing micro-nutrients along with mid-day meals.

3.8 The Committee have been informed that allegation received from some quarters regarding unauthorized and illegal collection of donations/ contribution by ISKCON and Akshaya Patra from public in India and abroad for Government sponsored Mid Day Meal Scheme for school children in Karnataka.

3.9 The cook-cum-helpers have agitated on the involvement of Akshaya Patra Foundation in MDMS because it deprived them of their employment in the school based cooking and serving the meal to the children.

3.10 The independent Monitoring Institute engaged for monitoring of the MDM Scheme has also reported that the Foundation is not serving eggs to the children on demand on the plea that it serves only vegetarian meals.

**3.11 The Committee note that it has been alleged that ISKCON and Akshaya Patra are collecting unauthorized and illegal donations/contribution from public in India and abroad for the Government sponsored Mid Day Meal Scheme for school children in Karnataka. The Committee further note that cook-cum-helpers were agitating on the involvement of Akshaya Patra Foundation in MDMS because it was depriving their employment in the school based cooking and serving the meal to the children. The independent Monitoring Institute of the MDM Scheme has also reported that foundation is not serving eggs to the children on demand on the plea that it serves only vegetarian meals. The Committee are of the view that the allegations made against the Akshaya Patra Foundation should be examined**

thoroughly and if found guilty action should be initiated against the NGO and its involvement in the scheme should be reviewed/monitored. The Committee would like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.

3.12 The Committee feel that involvement of NGOs is essential as the Government alone cannot implement various schemes meant for the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes properly. The Committee, therefore, recommend that credentials of all NGOs involved in MDM schemes should be verified so that well established, public spirited, non profit making entity having a good reputation in the area can be given execution work of MDM Scheme. The Committee also recommend that monitoring team of the State Government should undertake field visits from time to time to verify the working of the NGOs and proper utilization of funds.



## CHAPTER IV

### MONITORING MECHANISM AND PROGRESS

#### A. Monitoring

4.1 The Committee have been informed that the Department of School Education and Literacy, Ministry of Human Resource Development has prescribed comprehensive and elaborate mechanism at National/State/District/Block and school levels for monitoring and supervision of the Mid Day Meal Scheme effectively. This includes display of information by all schools on quantity of food grains received, date of receipt, quantity of food grains utilized, number of children given mid day meal, daily menu and roster of community members for supervision and monitoring. Monitoring is required to be done through Block and District level committees, in addition inspections are carried out by the State Government Officers.

4.2 It was informed that the Scheme is also monitored by 41 independent institutions of social science research including IIT Chennai. It was pointed out that in their Second Half Yearly Reports for the period 1st October, 2011 to 31st March, 2012, five Monitoring Institutions viz. Nabakrushna Choudhury Centre for Development Studies, Bhubaneswar, Odisha; Centre for Development and Communication Studies, Jaipur, Rajasthan; Institute of Development Studies, Jaipur, Rajasthan; Regional Institute of Education, Mysore, Karnataka; M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain, Madhya Pradesh have reported that instances of caste discrimination came to light in Odisha, Karnataka, Rajasthan and Madhya Pradesh. Gender discrimination in sitting arrangement was observed in one school in Odisha as well as in one school in districts Chamrajanagara, Haveri and Uttara Kannada of Karnataka. Caste based discrimination has been reported in one school in Boudh District in Odisha and Bharatpur, Jaisalmer, Pratapgarh Districts of Rajasthan. Religion based discrimination was observed in

Dungarpur in the State of Rajasthan. It was also reported by Madhya Pradesh Institute of Social Science of Research, Ujjain that clear instances of untouchability even within the school premises during cooking, serving and eating Mid Day Meal were observed in Betul, Burhanpur, Chhindwada, Singrauli, Panna, Satna and Chattarpur districts of Madhya Pradesh.

4.3 Accordingly, 7 teams of officers and experts were sent to 9 districts of Madhya Pradesh, 5 districts of Rajasthan, 2 districts of Odisha and 3 districts of Karnataka to investigate into the matter and submit reports in the second week of August, 2012. The teams did not come across any discrimination except in one school in Boudh district in Odisha. The matter was viewed seriously by this Ministry and was taken up with the Government of Odisha for taking immediate remedial action in this regard.

4.4 The Government of Odisha have informed that they have also taken serious note of the matter and placed the Headmaster of the school under suspension and also initiated disciplinary action against the Sub-Inspector of Schools. The District Administration has been instructed by the State Government to ensure social equality in all the schools.

4.5 It has also been stated that letters were issued to all States/UTs to intimate instances of discrimination against Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. As per replies received from 26 States/UT no such cases of discrimination have come to their notice. Matter is being pursued with remaining 7 States/UTs to send their replies in this regard.

4.6 During the evidence on being asked about the monitoring of coastal areas of Odisha, the Additional Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development informed that the Ministry would get survey of coastal areas done by Monitoring Institutes and send the report to the Committee within two months.

4.7 Further in their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Human Resource Development has informed that the Monitoring Institutes were requested to send revised report on the following districts to the concerned Monitoring Institutes.

- (i) NKC Centre for Development Studies, Bhubaneswar to cover Angul, Ganjam and Cuttack districts of Odisha.
- (ii) Dr. PM Institute of Advanced study in Education, Sambhalpur to cover Dharikanal, Kendrapara

It has been stated that during the survey conducted in the above districts of Odisha, the Monitoring Institutes have not come across any form of discrimination in Mid Day Meal Scheme.

4.8 It was informed that the Members of Parliament representing the districts were also involved in the study conducted by NKC Centre for Development Studies, Bhubaneswar, Odisha.

4.9 The Monitoring Institutes representative was informed by Members of Parliament that they had never come across any incident of discrimination in schools. Further, ST and SC Vigilance Monitoring Committee had also never raised any issue in any of its meetings. One of the Members expressed his views that MDM Scheme has reduced the distance among students belonging to different castes/communities.

**4.10 The Committee note that 41 Independent Institutions of Social Sciences Research including IIT Chennai are engaged in monitoring MDM Scheme in the country. The Committee observe that monitoring of the MDM scheme is not satisfactory albeit involving 41 independent institutions. The Committee note with satisfaction that on the advise of the Committee, the Government have deputed two Monitoring Institutes to six districts of Odisha to see whether caste discrimination is prevalent in preparation, serving and eating of MDM in schools. The Monitoring Institutes in their report have stated that they have not come**

across any form of discrimination in MDM Scheme. One Monitoring Institutes also contacted the public representative representing the districts concerned. Three Public representatives from Cuttack, Ganjam, Aska had informed Monitoring Institutes that they had never come across any incident of discrimination in schools rather opined that MDM Scheme has reduced the distances among students belonging to different castes/communities. The Committee strongly recommend that SC/ST representative should always be included in the Monitoring Institutes/survey etc. The Committee appreciate that the letters were issued to all States/UTs to assess and report the cases of discrimination against SC/STs. Twenty six States/UTs in their replies stated that no such discrimination have come to their notice. The Committee would like to know the replies of the remaining 7 States/UTs.

#### **B. MAINTAIN HIGH STANDARD OF FOOD QUALITY**

4.11 The Committee have been informed the following objectives of MDMS:-

- (a) To encourage poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections, to attend school regularly and help them concentrate on classroom activities.
- (b) To improve the nutritional status of the children in classes I-VIII in Government, local Body and Government aided schools, National Child Labour Project Schools and Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS)/Alternative & Innovative Education (AIE) including Madarsas/Maktabs supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA).
- (c) Provide nutritional support to children in drought-affected areas during summer vacation.

4.12 To a query about the monitoring of quality of food served in MDMS, the Ministry of Human Resource Development in their post-evidence reply informed that they have constituted an Expert Committee with Director, Nutrition Foundation of India, New Delhi as Chairperson to assess adequacy, improve quality and safety of Mid Day Meal served in the schools to ensure nutrient adequacy to submit their report within 2 months.

The terms of reference of this Committee were as under:-

- (i) To examine the current norms for quantity and quality of food stuffs to be used in MDM
- (ii) To assess the nutrient adequacy of the varying menus currently used for providing MDM in different states.
- (iii) To examine current guidelines for food safety of hot cooked meal served in MDM in rural settings where food is cooked in individual schools and in the metro settings where food is cooked in centralized kitchens and transported to the schools.
- (iv) To develop systems for continuous monitoring of quantity and quality of food stuffs used in cooking MDM and food safety in MDM in urban and rural areas.
- (v) To estimate the cost of establishing and operating the monitoring system developed under point (iv) above.
- (vi) To assess the feasibility of providing nutrition education messages using MDM as the focus.
- (vii) To suggest measures for convergence between school health and MDM for assessment of nutritional status of school children and provide appropriate interventions for management of under and over nutrition in children.

**4.13 The Committee note that Mid Day Meal Scheme has been launched by the Government in order to encourage poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections to attend school regularly and to improve nutritional status of children in Class I to VIII in Government, local body and Government aided school etc. The Committee fully support the objectives of the MDMS. However, recently it has been reported in print and electronic media that due to serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the State of Bihar some children died. The Committee take a serious view in the matter and, therefore, impress upon the Monitoring and Implementation agency of MDMS to maintain high standard of quality of food before serving to children and it must be checked and verified by the specialist Doctor to obviate any possibility of adulteration which is injurious to health or may cause death. The Committee strongly recommend that**

responsibility should be fixed for lapses in serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the light of incident taken place in State of Bihar recently. The Committee would also like to be briefed of the report of Expert Committee constituted in this regard.

### C. PROGRESS/ACHIEVEMENTS MADE IN IMPLEMENTATION OF MDM SCHEME

4.14 The Committee have been informed about the following achievement were made of the MDM Scheme:-

#### (i) Achievements regarding number of children covered, foodgrain & budgetary allocations during the period 2005-06 to 2011-12

Item	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08*	2008-09*	2009-10*	2010-11*	2011-12*
Approved number of children (in crore)		10.68	11.37	11.74	11.77	11.36	11.07
Average number of Children covered (in Cr.)	11.94	10.86	9.54	11.19	11.04	10.46	10.54
Foodgrain allocated (in lakh MTs)	22.51	21.60	24.79	29.30	29.45	29.40	29.20
Budget allocation (in crore)	3345.26	5348.00	7324.00	8000.00	8000.00	9440.00	10380.00
Revised allocation (Rs. in crore)	3345.26	5348.00	6678.00	8000.00	7359.15	9440.00	10380.00
Total Exp. (in Cr.)**	3185.13	5233.47	5835.44	6539.79	6937.79	9128.44	9901.91

\*Primary and Upper Primary combined

\*\*This includes cost of foodgrains.

Under the Mid-Day Meal Scheme, a total budget provision of Rs.48,000.00 crore has been allocated by Planning Commission during the 11th Five Year Plan. till 2011-12, a total of Rs.38343.37 crores has been spent.

4.15 The Committee note that expenditure made by the Government on MDM Scheme are less than the budget allocation for the scheme since 2005-06. The Committee desire to know the reasons for less utilizing the funds allocated for

the purpose thereby depriving target beneficiaries including SC/ST children of MDMS.

4.16 The Committee would also like to know whether any study has been conducted to ascertain the impact of MDMS on the drop-out rates of children from school and on the educational development of SCs/STs. The Committee recommend the Government to undertake such a study, to find out the efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries particularly SCs/STs. The Committee would also like to know the outcome of the study.

4.17 The Committee would also like to urge upon the Government to explore whether MDMS can be brought under the ambit of Corporate Social Responsibility so that more and more children get benefited from MDMS and inflow of funds is also increased substantially which can further be utilized to broaden the scope of MDMS and also the quality and quantity of food served and for betterment of infrastructure.

## **ii. Infrastructure development under Mid Day Meal Scheme**

Regarding infrastructure development under MDM Scheme, the following points were submitted to the Committee:-

### **a) Construction of Kitchen Sheds**

During 2006-07, Central Assistance towards construction of kitchen shed-cum-Stores @ Rs.60,000 per unit to the States/UTs was introduced under MDM Scheme. Since 1.12.2009, the scheme was revised, so that instead of a flat rate of Rs.60,000 for construction of kitchen-cum-store per school across the country, the construction cost is to be determined on the basis of plinth area norms and State Schedule of Rates

prevalent in the States/UTs. The cost of construction of Kitchen-cum-stores is shared from 1.12.2009 between the Centre and the NER States on 90:10 basis and with other States/UT on 75:25 basis. As per norms of plinth area, 20 sq.mt. area is prescribed for construction of Kitchen-cum-Store in schools having upto 100 children, and for every addition of upto 100 children, additional 4 sq.mt. plinth area will be added. States/UTs have the flexibility to modify the slab of 100 children depending upon the local conditions.

**(b) Procurement of Kitchen Devices**

4.18 The Central assistance towards procurement of kitchen devices @ Rs.5,000/- per school was introduced in the year 2006-07. Central assistance has already been released to States/UTs for procurement of kitchen devices for 1,185,479 schools, out of which kitchen devices have been procured by the States/UTs for 10,74,309 schools and procurement for 22,364 schools is under process.

**(c) Central Assistance**

4.19 Upto March, 2011, the central share of Rs.5,962 crores has already been released to States/UTs for construction of 9,55,473 Kitchen Sheds, out of which 5,60,546 kitchen sheds have been constructed and 95,867 are under construction.

4.20 During the evidence, the Committee enquired about the non-availability of space for kitchen in some schools, the Additional Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development has stated that there is a provision where there is no space available for kitchen, a cluster of five-six school is made for cooking mid day meal and distributed to them.



**4.21 The Committee observe that proper infrastructure facility for cooking and distributing the Mid Day Meal is not available in most of the schools across the country. The Committee note that where sufficient space is not available cluster of five-six schools is made for cooking and distributing mid day meal. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Government should provide proper infrastructure to each school for preparing MDM and its distribution. The Committee also recommend that Government should explore possibility to serve packed food having same calories and prepared in hygienic manner to the students where such facility is not available.**

**4.22 The Committee note that Rs.5,962 crore were released for construction of 9,55,433 kitchen sheds, out of which 5,60,546 kitchen sheds have been constructed and 95,867 are under construction. The Committee would like to know the present status of the construction of kitchen sheds and amount utilized for the construction. The Committee also desire to know about the status of remaining 2,99,060 kitchen sheds. The Committee, also recommend that construction work should be completed expeditiously without compromising quality of work to avoid the time and cost overrun.**

**(d) Coverage**

4.23 The Committee have been informed that Mid-Day Meal Scheme covers children of classes' I-VIII studying in Government, Local Body, Government aided and National Child Labour Project schools and the centres run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS)/Alternative & Innovative Education (AIE) centres including Madarasas/Maktabas supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). During the year 2011-12, against the Project Approval Board (PAB) approval of 12.12 lakh institutions, 12.37 lakh (102%)

institutions have been covered under MDMS. Against the PAB approval of 11.07 crore children, 10.54 crore (95%) have availed the Mid Day Meal Scheme.

4.24 During the evidence when pointed out by the Committee that some of the State Governments are extending the MDM to 9th and 10th class students without any Central assistance and asked whether the Government is giving them any assistance, the Additional Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development stated in negative and informed that in Andhra Pradesh, they have started the scheme for 9th and 10th class also.

He further informed that in Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh, Kerala, Puducherry, they were using their own funds and that the Government do not have a Central Programme for that.

4.25 Regarding implementation of MDM in 9th and 10th class, the Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development further informed that:

"Thinking is on that line but the decision is not on that"

**4.26 The Committee note that Mid-Day Meal Scheme covers children of Classes I – VIII studying in Government Local Body Government aided and National Child Labour Projects schools and the Centre run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) Alternative and Innovative Education (AIE) Centres including Madrasas/Marktabs Supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). The Committee feel that inclusion of students of Class IX and X under MDMS will help in reduction of dropout ratio particularly the students belonging to SC/ST community and improve the nutritional status. The Committee, therefore, desire that the scope of the scheme should be widen to cover the students studying in IX and X Class also.**

## CHAPTER V

### MISCELLANEOUS

#### **(a) Payment of Honorarium**

5.1 The Committee were informed that there are instances of less payment to Cook-cum-helpers on account of delay in release of funds, but there are no instances of less payment to SC/ST cook-cum-helpers. Whenever any instances regarding less payment, part payment and no payment is reported by any stakeholders of the Scheme, immediate action is taken in consultation with the concerned State Government. It was also informed that since 1.1.2009, 5 complaints (1 in 2009, 2 in 2011 and 2 in 2012) relating to irregularities in payment/appointment etc. of cook cum helpers in some States had been received. Three complaints received during 2009 and 2011 were found baseless and two complaints received in 2012 have been resolved.

5.2 It has also been submitted that the Working Group on Elementary Education for 12th Plan has recommended for enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers from existing Rs.1000 per cook per month to Rs.1500/- per cook per month for the year 2013-14 and 2014-15 and Rs.2000/- per cook per month for the last two years of the 12th Plan. The revision will be made after approval of the competent authority.

#### **(b) New initiatives**

5.3 The Working Group of Elementary Education for 12th Plan has recommended for inclusion of children in private unaided schools in 109 Scheduled Tribes (ST) and 61 Scheduled castes (SC) concentration district under the MDM Scheme in a phased manner.

5.4 During the evidence, the Committee enquired about providing Mid Day Meal to the private unaided schools, located in SC/ST concentrated districts, the Additional

Secretary of the Ministry informed that a Committee had been set up and the Committee have prepared a report in this regard. The report had been submitted to the Planning Commission. The Planning Commission has recommended that the Mid Day Meal should be given to the privately unaided school children in special focused districts. For this the Ministry is preparing a report for Expenditure Finance Committee. As soon as they get the approval, the Mid Day Meal Scheme would be started in these special focused districts.

5.5 Web-enabled Management Information System with Interactive Voice Response System for monitoring of Mid Day Meal Scheme on real time basis is being developed with the help of NIC. Regional Conferences had been held in July, 2011 at Jaipur, Hyderabad, Lucknow and Agartala to obtain feedback from States Governments. Thereafter, various developments have been taken place. Central Government Teams have already visited and imparted training on pre-requisite steps of data entry into MIS Portal to all the States/UTs. The States/UTs have also initiated the data entry and the progress made thereon is being constantly monitored at Central level and further guidance if any required by them is being given. Once this MIS data entry is complete, the training on IVRS will also be imparted to States/UTs. Thereafter, the system will be able to provide the reports instantly relating to children covered, food grains procured, utilized, non provision of meals in schools, irregularities if any etc.

5.6 For the year 2012-13, a budget of Rs.11937 crore has been allocated for implementation of MDM Scheme.

5.7 To a query regarding setting up a Committee at national level to review the extension of Mid Day Meal to include unaided minority institutions and the students receiving education in those unaided schools which are privately operated in tribal areas of the country under Mid day meal scheme, the Ministry replied positively. The Ministry

of HRD had set up a National Level Review Committee under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Department of School Education & Literacy to explore the possibilities of extension of mid day meal to private unaided schools located in SC, ST and minority concentrated districts across the country. The Terms of Reference of the said Committee are as under:

- (i) to examine the suggestions with regard to coverage of students studying in privately managed unaided schools with focus on Tribal areas and minorities under the ambit of Mid Day Meal Scheme.
- (ii) to estimate financial and other implications of such coverage/extension; and
- (iii) to ascertain whether State Governments/UT Administrations are agreeable to the extension of MDM Scheme to privately managed unaided recognized schools and share the cost.

5.8 The National Level Review Committee unanimously recommended for extension of mid day meal scheme to the private unaided schools located in SC, ST concentrated areas. The financial implications of the same are as under:

(Rs. in lakhs)					
S.No.	Category	Recurring costs	Non-Recurring costs	Total Cost for 77% enrolment	Total cost for 100% enrolment
1.	Scheduled Tribe dominant Districts (25% and above)	25182	16634	36542	42294
2.	Scheduled Caste dominant Districts (25% and above)	32133	19785	45024	51918

The Working Group on Elementary Education for 12th Plan has also recommended coverage of Mid Day Meal Scheme to private unaided schools located in SC, ST and minority concentrated districts.

The Planning Commission has allocated funds under 12th Plan for coverage of these schools under Mid Day Meal Scheme. The EFC note is being prepared to take approval of the competent authority.

5.9 During the evidence when asked about the new initiatives taken by the States, the Secretary of the Ministry of Human Resource Development informed that:

"Andhra Pradesh has been in the forefront of a number of initiatives including the residential school scheme. If I recall, it is much before the Navodaya system of schooling came. There are a lot of initiatives of Andhra Pradesh. Normally, the cost is sharable between 65:35 under SSA, but under MDM, it is 75:25. In some parts, the Government of India is paying the full cost of all the rice. The State does not have to pay any money. All the transportation cost is being given and all the monitoring cost of that is being given. The 65:35 sharing is only for the remaining items, vegetables, cooking oil and others. That is the pattern. The intention of the Government is there to extend it but funds constraints and fiscal position is coming in the way".

**5.10 The Committee note that the Working Group on Elementary Education (WGEE) for 12th Plan has recommended for enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers from existing Rs.1000 per cook per month to Rs.1500 for the year 2013-14 and 2014-15 and Rs.2000 per cook per month for the last two years of the 12th Plan. The revision will be made after approval of the competent authority. The Committee would like to endorse the view of WGEE and know the status of decision of the competent authority in the matter of enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers.**

**5.11 The Committee note that there is fund constraints in replicating various initiatives taken by the Government of Andhra Pradesh at the National level. The Committee recommend that other States should be persuaded to implement the new initiatives for the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the States and for the success of MDM Schemes. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.**

5.12 The Committee are happy to note that the Working Group of Elementary Education for 12th Plan has recommended for inclusion of children in private unaided schools in 109 Scheduled Tribes (ST) and 61 Scheduled castes (SC) concentration district under the MDM Scheme in a phased manner. The Committee recommend the Government to explore the possibilities for inclusion of more SC and ST concentrated districts in the country under MDMS. The Committee would also like to know the present status of 109 STs and 61 SC concentration districts for inclusion in MDM Scheme.

5.13 The Committee note that web-enabled Management Information System with Interactive Voice Response System for monitoring of Mid Day Meal Scheme on real time basis is being developed with the help of NIC. Regional Conference had been held in July, 2011 at Jaipur, Hyderabad, Lucknow and Agartala to obtain feedback from States Governments. The Committee would like to know the outcome of such conferences and the action taken on the decision arrived at the conferences and also the current status of the web enabled MIs for monitoring MDMS. The Ministry should further develop a web portal where students, parents or teachers can lodge their complain or feedback about the quality of food being served. Use of social networking sites should also be encouraged for the purpose. Patrons should be encouraged to upload the photographs of meals being stores, cooked, served etc. The Committee is of the view that strong monitoring mechanism will help in improving the MDM scheme to some extent.

New Delhi;  
22 August, 2013  
31 Sravana,1935 (Saka)

GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR  
Chairman  
Committee on the Welfare  
of Scheduled Castes and  
Scheduled Tribes

**MINUTES**

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES  
AND SCHEDULED TRIBES  
(2012-2013)**

**(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**TENTH SITTING**

**(16.11.2012)**

The Committee sat from 1430 to 1615 hrs. in Main Committee Room, Parliament House  
Annexe, New Delhi

**PRESENT**

Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Shri M. Anandan
3. Smt. Santosh Chowdhary
4. Smt. Jyoti Dhurve
5. Shri Prem Chand Guddu
6. Smt. Paramjit Kaur Gulshan
7. Dr. M. Jagannath
8. Shri Mohan Jena
9. Shri Mithilesh Kumar
10. Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal
11. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
12. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
13. Shri Lalit Mohan Suklabaidya

**RAJYA SABHA**

14. Shri Thaawar Chand Gehlot
15. Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste
16. Shri D. Raja
17. Shri Veer Singh
18. Shri A.V. Swamy



## SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. R.K. Chadha, Additional Secretary
2. Shri D.R. Shekhar, Director
3. Shri S. Chatterjee, Additional Director

## WITNESSES

### MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (Deptt. of School Education and Literacy)

1. Shri R. Bhattacharya, Secretary
2. Dr. Amarjit Singh, Additional Secretary
3. Ms. Rita Chatterjee, Joint Secretary

2. The Chairman welcomed the officials of the Ministry of Human Resource Development. Thereafter, the Committee took evidence of the Ministry on the subject "Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools". The members of the Committee then raised certain issues on the subject and sought clarifications which were responded to by the officials of the Ministry of Human Resource Development.

3. While concluding, the Chairman requested the officials of the Ministry to send the points not covered during the evidence on which further information has been desired by the Committee to this Secretariat.

(The witnesses then withdrew)

4. A verbatim record of the proceedings was kept.

**The Committee then adjourned.**

**MINUTES**

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES  
AND SCHEDULED TRIBES  
(2013-2014)**

**(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**FOURTH SITTING**

**(07.08.2013)**

The Committee sat from 1500 to 1700 hrs. in Committee Room 'E', Parliament House  
Annexe, New Delhi

**PRESENT**

Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Shri Bhudeo Choudhary
3. Dr. Manda Jagannath
4. Shri Mohan Jena
5. Shri Mohinder Singh Kaypee
6. Shri Kamal Kishor "Commando"
7. Shri Basori Singh Masram
8. Shri Arjun Meghwal
9. Shri Rajaiah Siricilla
10. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
11. Shri Bhausahab Rajaram Wakchaure

**RAJYA SABHA**

12. Shri Thaawar Chand Gehlot
13. Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste
14. Shri Lalhming Liana
15. Shri Nand Kumar Sai
16. Smt. Wansuk Syiem

## **SECRETARIAT**

1. Dr. R.K. Chadha, Additional Secretary
2. Shri D.R. Shekhar, Director
3. Shri S. Chatterjee, Additional Director

## **WITNESSES**

### **MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS**

1. Shri Anil Goswami - Home Secretary
2. Dr. Gauri Kumar - Secretary (BM)
3. Shri Khurshid A. Ganai - Additional Secretary (Foreigners)
4. Shri K.K. Pathak - Joint Secretary (UT)

### **MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS (DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL & TRAINING)**

1. Dr. S.K. Sarkar - Secretary
2. Shri Manoj Joshi - Joint Secretary
3. Ms. Mamta Kundra - Joint Secretary
4. Shri G. Srinivasan - Deputy Secretary

### **NEW DELHI MUNICIPAL COUNCIL (NDMC)**

1. Shri Jalaj Srivastava - Chairperson
2. Shri Vikas Anand - Secretary, NDMC
3. Ms. Vidushi Chaturvedi - Director (Education)/NSES

### **MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE PRODUCTION)**

1. Shri G.C. Pati - Secretary (DP)
2. Shri A.K. Gupta - Additional Secretary
3. Ms. Kusum Singh - Joint Secretary (P&C)

### **ORDNANCE FACTORY BOARD (OFB)**

1. Shri H.S. Chaudhury - DG OF/Chairman
2. Shri Ravikant - Secretary (DP)
3. Shri C.B. Sharma - DDG/Coord

At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the officials of the Ministry of Home Affairs, Department of Personnel and Training and New Delhi Municipal Council (NDMC).

2. The Committee then took evidence of the officials of the Ministry of Home Affairs, Department of Personnel and Training and NDMC on the subject "Termination of 10 SC ex-teachers appointed by Navyug School Educational Society of New Delhi Municipal Council on contract basis during Special Recruitment Drives in 2005 and 2007".

3. The Hon'ble Members sought certain clarifications on the recruitment policy of the NDMC and requested the officials of the Ministry of Home Affairs and NDMC to reinstate the 10 SC teachers in pursuance of opinion given by DoPT whose services were terminated by Navyug School Educational Society. In response thereto, the Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs and the Chairman, NDMC stated that they had joined recently and requested to grant 4 months time to address the issue. The Committee however, agreed to grant 2 months' time only to the Ministry to address the issue and submit report thereon.

The evidence was completed.

(The witnesses then withdrew)

4. Thereafter, the Chairman welcomed the officials of the Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production) and Ordnance Factory Board (OFB).

5. The Committee then took evidence of the officials of Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production) and OFB and sought clarifications regarding grievance and harassment cases of Shri O.P. Rawat and Shri Gyanendra Kumar of Ordnance Factory, Kanpur. Besides, the Committee also sought clarifications on refusal of request for meeting sought by the SC/ST Employees Association with the Management and on other issues relating to grievances of SC/ST Employees of Ordnance Factories in other parts of the country. While concluding, the Chairman requested the officials of the Ministry to send the replies on the points on which further information has been desired by the Committee to this Secretariat within 15 days.

The evidence was completed.

(The witnesses then withdrew)

(A verbatim record of the proceedings was kept)

6. Further, in view of the discussion held with the officials of the Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production) and OFB, the Report on the subject "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Ordnance Factory Board" was also adopted by the Committee.

7. The Committee authorised the Chairman to finalise the report in the light of consequential and incidental changes and present the same to both the Houses of Parliament.

8. Thereafter, the Committee considered the draft Report on “Prevention of untouchability in Mid Day Meal Scheme in Government run schools” and adopted the same.

**The Committee then adjourned.**

## Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations contained in the Report

Sl. No.	Para No.	Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations
1.	2.	3.
1.	2.20	<p>The Committee are distressed to note that the instances of untouchability are still prevailing in the country even after 65 years of Independence, though it is prohibited in the Constitution and punishable under the penal laws. The Committee observe that untouchability is mostly found in the remotest of the remote areas of the country and in coastal areas particularly in the State of Odisha. The Committee also find that the Central teams were not sent to the affected areas in the State of Odisha particularly in the coastal belt and therefore recommend that the Central Government should depute special team to visit these areas at once to investigate the cases of untouchability, to see the gravity of the situation and to suggest ways and means to tackle the malaise accordingly. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.</p>
2.	2.21	<p>The Committee are further distressed to note that some schools and few teachers are playing roles in perpetuating untouchability and sowing seeds of castes related discrimination in young minds. The Committee recommend that these schools and teachers involved in such deplorable practice of untouchability should be given exemplary punishment. The Committee also recommend that periodic interactive sessions should be held with the teachers by the school management to make them understand the social fall out of untouchability and its ever lasting impact on the tender minds of the children.</p>
3.	2.22	<p>The Committee note with concern that the Ministry of Human Resource Development had identified 144</p>

poorly performing districts under the Mid Day Meal Scheme. The Monitoring Institutes have been requested to cover these districts on priority. The Government of India is also sending Central team and Review Missions to these districts. The State Governments have also been requested to pay more attention on these districts to improve the performance of the scheme. The Committee find that though on paper the monitoring mechanism seems to be in order, still it is a matter of concern that 144 districts are under performing. The Committee would like to know the findings of the Government as to why these districts are under performing and corrective measures taken by the Government in this regard.

4.

2.23

The Committee are happy to note that as and when any report of discrimination is received from any of the State/U.T. the Central Government invariably deposes its team for detailed investigation and for taking necessary corrective action wherever required. At present, there is no report of any discrimination is pending for detailed investigation. However, the Committee would like to know the outcome of investigations made by the Central Government regarding discrimination in MDM for last one year.

5.

2.24

The Committee are happy to note that as and when any report of discrimination is received from any of the State/U.T. the Central Government invariably deposes its team for detailed investigation and for taking necessary corrective action wherever required. At present, there is no report of any discrimination is pending for detailed investigation. However, the Committee would like to know the outcome of investigations made by the Central Government regarding discrimination in MDM for last one year.

6.

2.25

The Committee also note that the Government propose to send five Review Missions consisting of representatives of the Central Government, UNICEF, State Governments of Karnataka, Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh, Sikkim and Nagaland to cover the remote areas to check instances of discrimination. The Committee recommend that MP/MLA and Members of SC/ST Communities should be included in the Review Mission. The Committee would like to be apprised about the findings of the Review Mission district-wise and the action taken against the persons provoking or practicing untouchability and also the post visit performance of the schools.

7.

2.26

The Committee note with satisfaction that as a remedial measure States/UTs have formed Committees/Samitis with members from Scheduled Castes & Scheduled Tribes to inspect preparation and distribution of food. Similarly, priority is given to these communities in recruitment of cook-cum-helpers. MDM guidelines lay down that on an average 25% of schools should be inspected every quarter by State Government officers belonging to different departments at District, Sub-Division, Tehsil/Taluka, block and other suitable levels. In addition the Joint Review Missions consisting of representatives of Central Government, to the States also help in detecting the malaise. Similarly, 40 independent Monitoring Institutions such as IIT Chennai, and Visva-Bharati also monitor this aspect. The Committee, however, strongly recommend to the Government to explore further ways and means as to how the social evil of untouchability and discrimination could be totally eradicated not only from the schools but also from the society at large through spreading awareness, imparting education, training and holding workshops for the purpose. The Committee also



desire that for dissemination of such information Government should use Radio, TV, Vernacular Newspaper and electronic media so that people of the country can realize the sense of equality and respect to dignity of individual.

8.

3.3

The Committee note that the responsibilities of providing nutritious, cooked mid-day meal to every child lies with the State Government and Union Territory Administration under the guidelines issued by the Government of India. In this regard every State Government/UT Administration is required to designate the State Nodal Department and nodal officer or Agency at district and Block level. The Committee recommend that it must be made mandatory for nodal officer or nodal agency in the States to make regular field visit and conduct surprise checks every month to detect any violation of guidelines and persistence of untouchability, if any, and submit their report to the State Government concerned.

9.

3.4

The Committee note that due to lukewarm approach of the implementing agencies, the untouchability still exist in some part of the country. The Committee strongly recommend that accountability should be fixed for non adhering to the rules and procedure and violating guidelines so as to implement the MDM scheme properly without any instances of discrimination and untouchability which otherwise defeat the very purpose of MDMS.

10.

3.11

The Committee note that it has been alleged that ISKCON and Akshay Patra are collecting unauthorized and illegal donations/contribution from public in India and abroad for the Government sponsored Mid Day Meal Scheme for school children in Karnataka. The Committee further note that cook-cum-helpers were agitating on the

		<p>involvement of Akshaya Patra Foundation in MDMS because it was depriving their employment in the school based cooking and serving the meal to the children. The independent Monitoring Institute of the MDM Scheme has also reported that foundation is not serving eggs to the children on demand on the plea that it serves only vegetarian meals. The Committee are of the view that the allegations made against the Akshaya Patra Foundation should be examined thoroughly and if found guilty action should be initiated against the NGO and its involvement in the scheme should be reviewed/monitored. The Committee would like to be apprised of the action taken in the matter.</p>
11.	3.12	<p>The Committee feel that involvement of NGOs is essential as the Government alone cannot implement various schemes meant for the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes properly. The Committee, therefore, recommend that credentials of all NGOs involved in MDM schemes should be verified so that well established, public spirited, non profit making entity having a good reputation in the area can be given execution work of MDM Scheme. The Committee also recommend that monitoring team of the State Government should undertake field visits from time to time to verify the working of the NGOs and proper utilization of funds.</p>
12.	4.10	<p>The Committee note that 41 Independent Institutions of Social Sciences Research including IIT Chennai are engaged in monitoring MDM Scheme in the country. The Committee observe that monitoring of the MDM scheme is not satisfactory albeit involving 41 independent institutions. The Committee note with satisfaction that on the advise of the Committee, the Government have deputed two Monitoring Institutes to six</p>

districts of Odisha to see whether caste discrimination is prevalent in preparation, serving and eating of MDM in schools. The Monitoring Institutes in their report have stated that they have not come across any form of discrimination in MDM Scheme. One Monitoring Institutes also contacted the public representative representing the districts concerned. Three Public representatives from Cuttack, Ganjam, Aska had informed Monitoring Institutes that they had never come across any incident of discrimination in schools rather opined that MDM Scheme has reduced the distances among students belonging to different castes/communities. The Committee strongly recommend that SC/ST representative should always be included in the Monitoring Institutes/survey etc. The Committee appreciate that the letters were issued to all States/UTs to assess and report the cases of discrimination against SC/STs. Twenty six States/UTs in their replies stated that no such discrimination have come to their notice. The Committee would like to know the replies of the remaining 7 States/UTs.

13.

4.13

The Committee note that Mid Day Meal Scheme has been launched by the Government in order to encourage poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections to attend school regularly and to improve nutritional status of children in Class I to VIII in Government, local body and Government aided school etc. The Committee fully support the objectives of the MDMS. However, recently it has been reported in print and electronic media that due to serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the State of Bihar some children died. The Committee take a serious view in the matter and, therefore, impress upon the Monitoring and Implementation agency of MDMS to maintain high standard of quality of food before serving to children and it

must be checked and verified by the specialist Doctor to obviate any possibility of adulteration which is injurious to health or may cause death. The Committee strongly recommend that responsibility should be fixed for lapses in serving adulterated/poisonous Mid Day Meal in the light of incident taken place in State of Bihar recently. The Committee would also like to be briefed of the report of Expert Committee constituted in this regard.

14.

4.15

The Committee note that expenditure made by the Government on MDM Scheme are less than the budget allocation for the scheme since 2005-06. The Committee desire to know the reasons for less utilizing the funds allocated for the purpose thereby depriving target beneficiaries including SC/ST children of MDMS.

15.

4.16

The Committee would also like to know whether any study has been conducted to ascertain the impact of MDMS on the drop-out rates of children from school and on the educational development of SCs/STs. The Committee recommend the Government to undertake such a study, to find out the efficacy of MDMS and its social, economic and educational impact on the beneficiaries particularly SCs/STs. The Committee would also like to know the outcome of the study.

16.

4.17

The Committee would also like to urge upon the Government to explore whether MDMS can be brought under the ambit of Corporate Social Responsibility so that more and more children get benefited from MDMS and inflow of funds is also increased substantially which can further be utilized to broaden the scope of MDMS and also the quality and quantity of food served and for betterment of infrastructure.

17.	4.21	<p>The Committee observe that proper infrastructure facility for cooking and distributing the Mid Day Meal is not available in most of the schools across the country. The Committee note that where sufficient space is not available cluster of five-six schools is made for cooking and distributing mid day meal. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Government should provide proper infrastructure to each school for preparing MDM and its distribution. The Committee also recommend that Government should explore possibility to serve packed food having same calories and prepared in hygienic manner to the students where such facility is not available.</p>
18.	4.22	<p>The Committee note that Rs.5,962 crore were released for construction of 9,55,433 kitchen sheds, out of which 5,60,546 kitchen sheds have been constructed and 95,867 are under construction. The Committee would like to know the present status of the construction of kitchen sheds and amount utilized for the construction. The Committee also desire to know about the status of remaining 2,99,060 kitchen sheds. The Committee, also recommend that construction work should be completed expeditiously without compromising quality of work to avoid the time and cost overrun.</p>
19.	4.26	<p>The Committee note that Mid-Day Meal Scheme covers children of Classes I – VIII studying in Government Local Body Government aided and National Child Labour Projects schools and the Centre run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) Alternative and Innovative Education (AIE) Centres including Madrasas/Marktabs Supported under Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA). The Committee feel that inclusion of students of Class IX and X under MDMS will help in</p>

		reduction of dropout ratio particularly the students belonging to SC/ST community and improve the nutritional status. The Committee, therefore, desire that the scope of the scheme should be widen to cover the students studying in IX and X Class also.
20.	5.10	<p>The Committee note that the Working Group on Elementary Education (WGEE) for 12th Plan has recommended for enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers from existing Rs.1000 per cook per month to Rs.1500 for the year 2013-14 and 2014-15 and Rs.2000 per cook per month for the last two years of the 12th Plan. The revision will be made after approval of the competent authority. The Committee would like to endorse the view of WGEE and know the status of decision of the competent authority in the matter of enhancement of honorarium to cook-cum-helpers.</p>
21.	5.11	<p>The Committee note that there is fund constraints in replicating various initiatives taken by the Government of Andhra Pradesh at the National level. The Committee recommend that other States should be persuaded to implement the new initiatives for the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the States and for the success of MDM Schemes. The Committee would like to be apprised in this regard.</p>
22.	5.12	<p>The Committee are happy to note that the Working Group of Elementary Education for 12th Plan has recommended for inclusion of children in private unaided schools in 109 Scheduled Tribes (ST) and 61 Scheduled castes (SC) concentration district under the MDM Scheme in a phased manner. The Committee recommend the Government to explore the possibilities for inclusion of more SC and ST concentrated districts in the country</p>

under MDMS. The Committee would also like to know the present status of 109 STs and 61 SC concentration districts for inclusion in MDM Scheme.

23.

5.13

The Committee note that web-enabled Management Information System with Interactive Voice Response System for monitoring of Mid Day Meal Scheme on real time basis is being developed with the help of NIC. Regional Conference had been held in July, 2011 at Jaipur, Hyderabad, Lucknow and Agartala to obtain feedback from States Governments. The Committee would like to know the outcome of such conferences and the action taken on the decision arrived at the conferences and also the current status of the web enabled MIs for monitoring MDMS. The Ministry should further develop a web portal where students, parents or teachers can lodge their complain or feedback about the quality of food being served. Use of social networking sites should also be encouraged for the purpose. Patrons should be encouraged to upload the photographs of meals being stores, cooked, served etc. The Committee is of the view that strong monitoring mechanism will help in improving the MDM scheme to some extent.