

**16**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS**

**(2011-12)**

**MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS**

**(RAILWAY BOARD)**

**[Action taken by the Government on the recommendations/ observations contained in the 12<sup>th</sup> Report of the Standing Committee on Railways (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on 'New Railway Recruitment Policy']**

**SIXTEENTH REPORT**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

**NEW DELHI**

May, 2012/ Vaisakha, 1934 (Saka)

SCR NO. 165

**SIXTEENTH REPORT**  
**STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS**  
**(2011-12)**

**(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS**  
**(RAILWAY BOARD)**

**[Action taken by the Government on the recommendations/ observations contained in the 12<sup>th</sup> Report of the Standing Committee on Railways (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on 'New Railway Recruitment Policy']**

Presented to Lok Sabha on 21.05.2012

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 21.05.2012



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**  
**NEW DELHI**

May, 2012/ Vaisakha, 1934 (Saka)

## **CONTENTS**

		<b>PAGES</b>
<i>COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE</i> .....		<i>(iii)</i>
INTRODUCTION	.....	(v)
CHAPTER I	Report.....	1
CHAPTER II	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government .....	17
CHAPTER III	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies.....	34
CHAPTER IV	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration .....	42
CHAPTER V	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited .....	49
<b><u>APPENDICES</u></b>		
APPENDIX-I	Minutes of the sitting of the Standing Committee on Railways held on 15.05.2012.....	52
APPENDIX-II	Analysis of Action Taken by the Government on the Recommendations/Observations contained in the 12 <sup>th</sup> Report (15th Lok Sabha) on 'New Railway Recruitment Policy'.....	54

## **COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS (2011-12)**

**Shri T. R. Baalu- Chairman**

### ***MEMBERS***

#### **LOK SABHA**

2. Shri Khiladi Lal Bairwa
3. Shri Ram Sunder Das
4. Smt. Maneka Gandhi
5. Shri Pralhad Joshi
6. Shri Bapi Raju Kanumuru
7. Dr. Nirmal Khatri
8. Dr. (Smt.) Botcha Jhansi Lakshmi
9. Shri Anand Prakash Paranjape
10. Shri Somabhai G. Koli Patel
11. Dr. Padmsinha Bajirao Patil
12. Smt. Satabdi Roy
13. Smt. Yashodhara Raje Scindia
14. Shri Sharief-ud-din `Shariq`
15. Shri Gopal Singh Shekhawat
16. Shri Ganesh Singh
17. Chaudhary Lal Singh
18. Kunwar Rewati Raman Singh
19. Shri Lalji Tandon
20. Dr. Girija Vyas
21. Shri Nama Nageswara Rao

#### **RAJYA SABHA**

22. Shri K.E. Ismail
23. Shri Om Prakash Mathur
24. Smt. Kusum Rai
25. Shri Ambeth Rajan
26. Shri Tarini Kanta Roy
27. Shri T.M. Selvaganapathi
28. Shri Ishwar Singh
29. Shri Ramchandra Prasad Singh
30. Shri Palvai Govardhan Reddy
31. Shri Nandi Yellaiah

## **SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri K. Vijaykrishnan - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Abhijit Kumar - Director
3. Shri Arun K. Kaushik - Additional Director
4. Smt. Geeta Parmar - Under Secretary

## **INTRODUCTION**

I, the Chairman of the Standing Committee on Railways (2011-12), having been authorized by the Committee to present the Report on their behalf, present this Sixteenth Report on action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in their Twelfth Report on 'New Railway Recruitment Policy'.

2. The Twelfth Report was presented to the Lok Sabha on 30.08.2011 and it contained 35 recommendations/observations. The Ministry of Railways have furnished Action Taken Replies on all the recommendations/observations.

3. The Committee considered and adopted the Draft Action Taken Report at their sitting held on 15.05.2012.

4. An analysis of the action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Standing Committee on Railways (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) is given in Appendix-II.

NEW DELHI;

15 May, 2012  
25 Vaisakha, 1934 (Saka)

**T.R. BAALU,**  
**Chairman,**  
**Standing Committee on Railways**

## CHAPTER-I

### REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations and observations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Standing Committee on Railways on "New Railway Recruitment Policy". The Report was presented to the Lok Sabha on 30.08.2011. Simultaneously, the Report was also laid in the Rajya Sabha.

2. Action Taken Notes have been received from the Government on all the 35 recommendations/observations contained in the Report. These have been broadly categorized as follows:

- (i) Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Committee:-

Para Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 14, 21, 23, 24, 25, 27, 31, and 32

Total : 16  
Chapter-II

- (ii) Recommendations/observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies:-

Para Nos. 4, 6, 12, 13, 16, 17, 22, 29, 34 & 35

Total : 10  
Chapter-III

- (iii) Recommendations/observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:-

Para Nos. 11, 18, 20, 26, 30 and 33

Total : 6  
Chapter-IV

- (iv) Recommendations/observations in respect of which final replies are awaited:-

Para Nos. 15, 19 and 28

Total : 3  
Chapter-V

**3. The Committee desire that the final replies in respect of the recommendations for which interim replies have been given by the Government should be furnished to them expeditiously.**

4. The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their recommendations/observations.

### **Introductory**

#### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 1 & 2)**

5. The Committee had observed that the Railways had fixed no periodicity to review their recruitment system. In 1998-99, the Railway Board undertook a review of the set-up and functioning of the RRBs, when there were widespread allegations of irregularities and malpractices against the RRBs and the Railway Board cancelled a large number of examinations. Then, after a long period ten years, in 2009, a committee was constituted to review the system of recruitment in RRBs and instructions were issued on 28.10.2009 for streamlining the working of the RRBs. The review was again necessitated by many incidents of resentment and dissatisfaction amongst the people, coupled with several incidents of disturbances during the RRB examination at Mumbai on 19.10.2008, incidents of leakage of question papers of RRB, Allahabad, on 14.12.2008 and RRB, Ajmer, on 15.02.2009. The Committee were not convinced by the submission made by the Ministry that based on field experience, whenever considered necessary, the recruitment system was reviewed and necessary remedial action taken for system improvement and recommended that the Ministry of Railways should review professionally and scientifically their recruitment system at fixed intervals of time so as to make it more efficient to meet the requirement of staff in the Indian Railways.

6. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have stated as under:

“After the review of the functioning of the RRBs in 1998-99, another detailed review of RRBs was undertaken in 2009. However, during intervening period, regular monitoring of the system was carried out by the Railway Recruitment Control Board (RRCB) set up at the level of Ministry of Railways and instructions for system



improvement were issued from time to time. Further a technical audit of the system for transportation, storage and distribution of question papers has also been undertaken and necessary modifications in the system have been introduced.

To assess, monitor and suggest improvements in the recruitment system, conference of Chairmen, all RRBs with the RRCB is conducted at regular intervals. Review of the specific aspects of the system is done only when major change in the system is warranted. So far as the suggestion of Standing Committee regarding review of recruitment at fixed intervals is concerned, this has been referred to the Committee being constituted for working out the modalities for implementation of Standing Committee's recommendations."

**7. The Committee have been apprised that during the period from 1998-99 to 2009, the Railway Recruitment Control Board (RRCB) set up at the level of Ministry of Railways carried out regular monitoring of the recruitment system and instructions in this regard were issued from time to time. Further, review of the specific aspects of the system is done only when major change in the system is warranted. However, in view of the constant allegation of malpractices and irregularities against RRBs besides other major drawbacks in the previous recruitment policy, the Committee earnestly desire that besides regular monitoring of the recruitment system, Ministry of Railways should review professionally and scientifically their recruitment system at fixed intervals of time in order to strengthen the recruitment system, and making it fault free.**

**The Committee further note that the Ministry of Railways have referred their suggestion regarding review of recruitment system at fixed intervals to a committee being constituted for working out the modalities for implementation of their recommendations. The Committee would like to be informed of the decision taken by the Ministry in this regard.**

## **New Railway Recruitment Policy**

### **Recommendation Para No. 9**

8. The Committee had been constrained to note that as on 01.04.2010, there were about 1,66,100 vacancies in Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts and the Ministry had not prescribed any fixed timeframe for completion of the recruitment process initiated by the RRBs in respect of Group 'C' posts and by the Railway Recruitment Cells (RRCs) in respect of Group 'D' posts. The Committee were not convinced by the plea taken by the Ministry that the time taken in the recruitment process depended on the number of vacancies, number of applicants and different steps/stages followed in the recruitment process for particular post(s) / categories as in their view bottlenecks that hindered a smooth recruitment process should be identified. The Committee had urged the Ministry to urgently review the time taken in various stages of recruitment and accordingly take measures to streamline those stages so that the whole process of recruitment could be completed under a specified timeframe. They had recommended that the Ministry should fix a certain timeframe to complete their recruitment process as staff constraint should not impede the efficient functioning of the Indian Railways.

9. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have stated as under:

#### **Group 'C' :**

It is already submitted that examination for various categories of posts is generally conducted once in a year based on indents and Railways requirement. In view of the recommendation of Standing Committee, it has been decided to set up a Committee at Board's level to suggest annual calendar of RRB examinations for different categories with timeframe keeping in view the time taken at various stages of recruitment process.

As regards Committee's concern on large number of vacancies, it is submitted that in Group 'C' categories, out of a total 40,873 vacancies notified through Centralized Employment Notifications during 2010, written examinations have been conducted for about 36,000 vacancies including 31,000 safety category posts like Assistant Loco Pilot, Assistant Station Master, Section Engineer/Junior Engineer and Technicians. RRBs have started furnishing Panels for Safety category posts to the indenting Railways. For safety categories, panels for about 11,000 posts have already been supplied and balance will be supplied expeditiously.

**Erstwhile Group 'D' (Grade Pay Rs.1800) :**

It has been decided to initiate recruitment process annually in Grade Pay `1800 (erstwhile Group D) as per the following time schedule:

S. No.	Item	Month
1.	Issue of Notification	July
2.	Last date of receipt of application	30 <sup>th</sup> Sept.
3.	Scrutiny of application	Jan./Feb.
4.	Issue of call letter for Written Test	March/April
5.	Written Test	May/June
6.	(PET) Physical Efficiency Test	Sept./Oct.
7.	Medical Test//Documents verification	Nov./Dec.
8.	Declaration of Final Panel	Dec.

**10. The Committee note that the Ministry of Railways have decided to set up a committee at Railway Board's level to suggest annual calendar of RRB examinations for different categories with timeframe keeping in view the time taken at various stages of recruitment process. The Committee would like to be apprised of the progress made in this regard.**

**Recommendation Para No. 10**

11. The Committee had observed that for Group 'C' posts, the indents had been placed annually by the indenting Railways on the RRBs as per their requirement and examinations were conducted by all RRBs simultaneously once in a year. For Group 'D' posts, extant instructions prescribed the periodicity as two years while recruiting the current as well as anticipated vacancies to be accrued over the next two years. The Committee had desired that the periodicity of holding examinations

for Group 'C' posts and for Group 'D' posts should be increased, especially keeping in mind the large number of vacancies in the Railways and also the time consuming process involved in recruitments.

12. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have stated as under:

**Group 'C':**

As per the laid down system, indents for Group 'C' vacancies in different categories are placed annually by the Zonal Railway on RRBs as per their requirement and examination are conducted by all RRBs simultaneously once in a year. Sometimes, due to short panel or for certain reasons, vacancies remain unfilled. Accordingly, unfilled vacancies are carried forward by the indenting railway in their next indent placed on RRBs. Efforts are made to conduct examinations expeditiously.

However, the suggestion of the Standing Committee for increasing periodicity of holding of examinations for Group 'C' has been included in the terms of reference for the Committee being constituted in this context for suggesting timeframe for expeditious finalization of recruitments.

**Erstwhile Group 'D' (Grade Pay Rs.1800) :**

It has been decided to initiate recruitment process annually in Grade Pay `1800 (erstwhile Group D) as per the following time schedule:

S. No.	Item	Month
1.	Issue of Notification	July
2.	Last date of receipt of application	30 <sup>th</sup> Sept.
3.	Scrutiny of application	Jan./Feb.
4.	Issue of call letter for Written Test	March/April
5.	Written Test	May/June
6.	(PET) Physical Efficiency Test	Sept./Oct.
7.	Medical Test//Documents verification	Nov./Dec.
8.	Declaration of Final Panel	Dec.

13. The Committee have been apprised that their suggestion for increasing periodicity of holding of examinations for Group 'C' has been included in the terms of reference for the committee being constituted at Railway Board's level in this context for suggesting timeframe for expeditious finalization of recruitments. The Committee would like to be informed of the progress in the matter.

**Recommendation Para No. 11**

14. The Committee had expressed its deep concern that out of the 1,66,100 vacancies in Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts on 01.04.2011, no timeframe had been fixed for filling up of 85,663 Group 'D' posts and the last date for receiving applications was 31 March, 2011. The Committee failed to understand as to why the process of filling up 85, 663 Group 'D' posts was started so late when they had been lying vacant since 01.04.2010 which reflected poorly on the pace of the recruitment process in the Railways. The Committee had desired that they should be apprised of the status with regard to the 1,66,100 posts in Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts lying vacant as on 01.4.2010.

15. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have stated as under:

**"Group 'C':**

Occurrence and filling up of vacancy is a continuous process. Out of a total 40,873 vacancies notified through Centralized Employment Notifications during 2010 for Group 'C' categories, written examinations have been conducted for about 36,000 vacancies including 31,000 safety category posts like Assistant Loco Pilot, Assistant Station Master, Section Engineer/Junior Engineer and Technicians. RRBs have started furnishing Panels for Safety category posts to the indenting Railways. For safety categories, panels for about 11,000 posts have already been supplied and balance will be supplied expeditiously.

### **Erstwhile Group 'D' (Grade Pay Rs. 1800):**

Written Test has been held for recruitment initiated during the period 2006-08, for around 36,900 posts. Panels are expected to be published by December, 2011. For 10,324 posts of Eastern and East Coast Railway, recruitment has been held up owing to court cases. Further, special drive has already been completed for recruitment of 16,747 ex-servicemen vacancies, out of which around 7500 have been appointed so far. Also, for around 85,000 vacancies in Grade Pay of Rs.1800/- , notifications were issued in December / January 2010/2011 of which scrutiny of applications are underway.”

**16. The Committee are perturbed to note that panels for around 36,900 Group 'D' posts were expected to be published by December, 2011, recruitment for which was initiated during the period 2006-08 - that is, after a gap of 3 to 5 years. If the trend prevails, it will take another 4 to 5 years to fill 85,663 Group 'D' posts, recruitment process for which was initiated in December, 2010 as informed by the Ministry during examination of the subject 'New Railway Recruitment Policy'. In view of the large number of vacancies in Group 'D' posts, the Committee urge the Ministry to urgently take necessary action for recruitments in Group 'D' posts. The Committee would like to be apprised of the steps being taken/proposed to be taken in this regard.**

### **Substitute Recruitment**

#### **Recommendation Para No. 18**

17. The Committee had noted that from 01.04.2007 to 31.03.2010, out of 9847 substitutes appointed on the different Railway Zones/ PUs, 6183 had been regularized. For the North Western Railway, figures were available upto 31.08.2009, where out of 148 substitutes, 13 had been regularized and in the North East Frontier Railways, where out of 103, 50 substitutes had been regularized upto 09.02.2011.

The Committee had desired that they should be informed of the criteria laid down for regularization of the substitutes.

18. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have stated as under:

“As per the extant instructions a person engaged as substitute in Grade Pay Rs.1800 (erstwhile Group D) is eligible for absorption after he/she attains temporary status after continuously working for four months. He/she is regularized as and when screening is conducted by Railways.”

**19. The Committee are deeply concerned at the process of regularising of the substitutes in Railways. The Committee can understand the exigencies of work in Railways leading to appointment of substitutes in emergency situations to man those posts which cannot be kept vacant. However, they fail to understand how the eligibility period for regularization of substitutes can be kept as low as 4 months, since such a short period will not be enough for a substitute to get acquainted with the job assigned to him. The Committee would like the Ministry to review the matter and re-examine the eligibility period for regularization of substitutes.**

#### **Recommendation Para No. 20**

20. The Committee had observed that the difference between regular recruitment and substitute engagement was that the substitutes were being engaged in exigencies of work and fell under the General Manager's discretionary powers which was not so in the case of open market recruitment. Substitutes were engaged by way of screening done by a committee whereas regular recruitment was being done by specialized recruitment agencies. Though qualification for direct recruitment for posts in the Grade Pay of Rs. 1800/- had been Class 10<sup>th</sup> or ITI or equivalent, till 31.07.2011, the Railways had been permitted to engage substitutes, viz. fresh faces, Course Completed Act Apprentices, legal heirs of accident victims, etc., even with a qualification below the prescribed one. The substitutes thus appointed were

not subjected to Physical Efficiency Test (PET) though he/she was subjected to medical examination. On the other hand, for recruitment done through the open market, Physical Efficiency Test for Group 'D' is compulsory as a majority of the jobs required physical endurance. The Committee failed to understand how for jobs requiring physical endurance, the Physical Efficiency Test could be exempted in the case of substitutes. The Committee had therefore desired that suitable corrective measures should be taken in this regard.

21. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have stated as under:

"Engagement of substitutes is an emergency power where the norms of engagement have been streamlined vide RBE/137/2010 dated 17.9.2010 which stipulates that the applications should be screened by a committee of 3 Senior Administrative Grade level officers."

**22. The Committee are not satisfied with the reply of the Ministry that norms of engagement of substitutes stipulates that the applications should be screened by a committee of 3 Senior Administrative Grade level officers. Though the Committee endorse the exemption of physical efficiency test to legal heirs of the accident victims, they do not approve such relaxation in fresh cases. The Committee, therefore, reiterate that suitable corrective measures should be taken while engaging substitutes in Group 'D' posts which require physical endurance. If need be, the norms in this regard may be reviewed and urgent corrective measures taken.**



## Incidents of irregularities and malpractices in RRBs

### Recommendation Para No. 21

23. The Committee had been dismayed to note that there were four cases of leakage of question papers of RRB examinations in the recent past. First, the question paper of RRB examination for the post of Assistant Loco Pilot scheduled to be held on 27.04.2008 conducted by RRB/ Bhopal was leaked which was under investigation by the Madhya Pradesh Police. Second, a case of leakage of question paper for the examination scheduled for 14.12.2008 for the post of Assistant Loco Pilot conducted by RRB/Allahabad was reported, which was under investigation with the Allahabad Police, Uttar Pradesh. Third, a case of leakage of question paper for the examination scheduled for 15.02.2009 for the post of Asst. Station Master (ASM) conducted by RRB/Ajmer was reported, which was under investigation with the Special Operation Group, Rajasthan Police. The examination was subsequently cancelled. Fourthly, there was leakage of question papers of RRB examinations held on 06.06.2010 and 13.06.2010 for the post of Assistant Loco Pilot and Assistant Station Master. The CBI had unearthed a Railway recruitment scam and arrested ten persons, for allegedly running the racket. Further investigation in the matter was stated to be under progress with the CBI. The Committee had desired to be apprised of the progress in each of the above cases.

24. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have submitted the position of each of the four cases as under:-

- **RRB/BHOPAL:-** As per information obtained from Sr. S.P./Bhopal, one person had been arrested on 02.07.2008 and produced before Hon'ble Court. Efforts are being made to arrest other persons involved in this case.
- **RRB/ALLAHABAD:-** As per information obtained from the office of DIG/Police, Allahabad, the matter is under trial in the Hon'ble Court of Judicial Magistrate-III, Allahabad.
- **RRB/AJMER:-** As per information obtained from the Special Operation Group, Rajasthan Police, the challan against 105 accused has been produced in the court and is under consideration with Chief Judicial Magistrate, Jaipur.
- **RRB/MUMBAI:-** As per information obtained from the CBI/Hyderabad, investigation into the case has been completed and CBI has filed a charge Sheet on 13.09.2010 against the then Chairman, RRB/Mumbai and 14 others before the Hon'ble Court of Special Judge for CBI cases, Hyderabad u/s 120 (B), 409, 418, 420

& 201 IPC and Section 7, 8 & 13(2) r/w 13 (1) (c) & (d) of the Prevention of Corruption Act, 1988.

**25. The Committee desire that the Ministry should continue to follow up all the four cases of leakage of question papers of RRB examinations and keep them apprised at regular intervals.**

### **Compassionate appointments**

#### **Recommendation Para No. 26**

26. The Committee had been apprised that the extant rules provided for giving compensation to the dependents of those who had lost their lives in train accidents. However, in exceptional circumstances and on humanitarian grounds, jobs had been provided by way of engagement of wards/legal heirs of the victims as substitute in Group 'D' posts only under the General Manager's discretionary powers. From 01.04.2007 to 31.03.2010, a total of 14 persons had been provided employment on the Railways in such circumstances in the wake of train accidents. The Committee had desired that they should be informed of the casualties that had occurred in train accidents during the above period and the status with regard to the pending cases in which the victims' families had been assured of employment with the Railways.

27. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have submitted as under:-

“ Employment to dependants of victims of train accidents/incidents is provided as a humanitarian measure, only in cases where announcement to this effect has been made by Hon'ble Minister of Railways. During the period 01.4.2007 to 31.3.2010, in the following cases, announcement to this effect had been made by Hon'ble Minister for Railways. Position of employment given as on 31.7.2011, in these cases, is as under:

<b>S. No.</b>	<b>Name of the Accident/ Incident</b>	<b>No. of deaths</b>	<b>Employments given</b>	<b>Applications not received/ rejected/ Unwilling etc.</b>	<b>Pending Cases</b>
1.	Incidence of Stampede at Mughalsarai Junction on 3.10.2007	15	12	03	0
2.	Incident of run over at Danapur/East Central Rly. by 2387 UP Jan-Sadharan Express on 4.8.2008.	05	01	04	0
3.	CSTM Terrorist attack, Central Rly. on 26.11.2008.	52	35	13	04
	<b>Total</b>	<b>72</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>04</b>

In the same period, i.e. from 01.4.2007 to 31.3.2010, a total of 638 casualties have been reported.”

28. The Committee are unhappy to learn that employment to dependents of victims of train accidents/incidents is provided as a humanitarian measure, only in cases where announcement to this effect has been made by the Hon'ble Minister of Railways. The extant rules provides for giving compensation to the dependents of those who have lost their lives in train accidents. The Committee are distressed to note that while there were 638 casualties during the period 01.04.2007 to 31.03.2010, only 48 dependents were given employment. The Committee are of the view that the matter of employment to dependents of victims of train accidents/incidents cannot be kept case specific. The Ministry of Railways should, therefore, formulate specific guidelines urgently to deal with all such cases.

29. The Committee are further informed that in 20 cases applications were either not received or they were rejected or claimant showed unwillingness. The Committee would like to be apprised of the break-up of the 20 applications like how many were not received and how many were rejected and also the reasons for their rejection.

### **Representation of Women employees in Railways**

#### **Recommendation Para No. 30**

30. The Committee were sorry to note that the percentage of women employees on the Indian Railways (excluding MTP, Kolkata) as on 31.03.2010 in Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' was only 6.79 percent, 5.45 percent, 7.70 percent and 6.20 percent, respectively. The Committee welcomed the step of waiving off the examination fee for the women candidates; however, they considered that as inadequate and desired that the Ministry should take proactive steps to enable women to be adequately

represented in the Railways and that concerted efforts should be made to increase the percentage of women employees in the Railways.

31. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have submitted as under:-

“ In order to encourage participation of women in railway jobs, examination fee has been waived in case of women candidates while resorting to recruitment of staff from open market to Group ‘C’ categories and the posts in Grade Pay Rs.1800 (erstwhile Group D) with effect from 8.12 .2010.”

**32. The Committee are not satisfied with the reply of the Ministry that in order to encourage participation of women in railway jobs, examination fee has been waived in case of women candidates. Considering this step to be inadequate, the Committee reiterate that the Ministry should explore various ways and means in order to enhance the percentage of women employees in the Railways.**

### **Complaints/Grievances**

#### **Recommendation Para No. 33**

33. The Committee had noted that the Railway Recruitment Control Board had a system of lodging of complaints by the applicants relating to recruitment formalities. However, they were surprised to note that in spite of several reported issues relating to the Railway recruitment, only 107 complaints were reported to have been received by the Ministry in the last five years. As submitted, these were of a general nature like complaints/representations against rejection of applications by RRBs, prescribed educational qualifications for various posts, non-selection of candidates, non-receipt of call letters, delay in declaration of results by RRBs, re-medical examination, etc. those relating to policy issues and those arising out of/against unsatisfactory replies by the RRBs. The Committee felt that the extant mechanism

in the Ministry for lodging of complaints by applicants had not been adequately publicized and therefore the matter needed to be addressed accordingly.

34. In their action taken reply, the Ministry of Railways have submitted as under:-

“There are 21 RRBs located over Indian Railways. Generally candidates lodge their complaints / grievances to the respective RRB as necessary mechanism has been set up at RRBs also. Some complaints / grievances relating to particular RRB received in Board’s office are forwarded to RRB concerned for disposal. In addition, a full-fledged Public Grievances Directorate has been set up in the Ministry of Railways for redressal of public grievances including grievances concerning RRBs. Complaints / grievances involving more than one RRB or arising out of unsatisfactory replies by RRBs or on policy matters are dealt with at Board’s level. This explains the limited number of grievances received by Railway Recruitment Control Board.”

**34. The Committee are aware that a full-fledged Public Grievances Directorate has been set up in the Ministry of Railways to redress public grievances, including grievances concerning RRBs. However, in view of only 107 complaints received in the last five years, the Committee strongly believe that there is lack of awareness among the applicants about the existing mechanism in the Ministry which in all probability might be the reason for such a negligible number of complaints. The Committee, therefore, reiterate that the existing mechanism for redressal of complaints by the applicants should be widely publicized by using the print and electronic media.**

**NEW DELHI;**

**T.R. BAALU**

**15 May, 2012  
25 Vaisakha, 1934 (Saka)**

**Chairman,  
Standing Committee on Railways**

## CHAPTER – II

### RECOMMENDATIONS / OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

#### Recommendation (Para. No. 1)

The Committee observe that a Service Commission with a Chairman and two members was set up for the first time in the history of the Indian Railways in July 1942 for recruitment of Subordinate Staff on the then North West Railways. The position was reviewed in 1945 and the Service Commissions at Bombay, Calcutta, Madras and Lucknow were set up under the Railway Board with the two-fold function of recruiting Class III staff and also to tender advice to General Managers for dealing with appeals from subordinate staff on disciplinary matters. Subsequently, more Railway Service Commissions were established from time to time to cater to direct recruitment in Group 'C' posts. Further, in January 1985, the Railway Service Commissions were renamed as Railway Recruitment Boards (RRBs).

In 1998-99, there were widespread allegations of irregularities and malpractices against the RRBs, as a result of which the Railway Board had to cancel a large number of examinations. Subsequently, the Railway Board undertook a review of the set-up and functioning of the RRBs. Then, after a long period of ten years, in 2009, a committee was constituted to review the system of recruitment in RRBs and to suggest measures for expeditious formation of panels. Based on the review, instructions for streamlining the working of the RRBs were issued on 28.10.2009. Another review was necessitated by many incidents of resentment and dissatisfaction amongst the people, coupled with several incidents of disturbances during the RRB examination at Mumbai on 19.10.2008, incidents of leakage of question papers of RRB, Allahabad, on 14.12.2008 and RRB, Ajmer, on 15.02.2009. The Committee are dismayed at the lack of initiative on the part of the Ministry so far as review of the recruitment system undertaken by them is concerned. The reviews ought to have been done much earlier with a professional and scientific approach.

## **Reply of the Government**

After the review of the functioning of the RRBs in 1998-99, another detailed review of RRBs was undertaken in 2009. However, during intervening period, regular monitoring of the system was carried out by the Railway Recruitment Control Board (RRCB) set up at the level of Ministry of Railways and instructions for system improvement were issued from time to time. Further a technical audit of the system for transportation, storage and distribution of question papers has also been undertaken and necessary modifications in the system have been introduced.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

## **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 7 of Chapter I)

## **Recommendation (Para No.2)**

The Committee further note that no periodicity has been fixed by the Railways to review their recruitment system. The Committee are unable to accept the reasoning advanced by the Ministry that based on field experience, whenever considered necessary, the recruitment system is reviewed and necessary remedial action taken for system improvement. The Committee are at a loss to understand as to how and why the Ministry should wait for occurrence of such reprehensible incidents in the conduct of Railway examinations before they undertake a review of the recruitment system. They, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Railways should review professionally and scientifically their recruitment system at fixed intervals of time to make it more efficient to meet the requirement of staff in the Indian Railways.

## **Reply of the Government**

To assess, monitor and suggest improvements in the recruitment system, conference of Chairmen, all RRBs with the RRCB is conducted at regular intervals. Review of the specific aspects of the system is done only when major change in the system is warranted. So far as the suggestion of Standing Committee regarding



review of recruitment at fixed intervals is concerned, this has been referred to the Committee being constituted for working out the modalities for implementation of Standing Committee's recommendations.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 7 of Chapter I)

### **Recommendation (Para No.3)**

#### **New Railway Recruitment Policy**

The Committee have drawn some satisfaction from the changes incorporated in the new Railway Recruitment Policy in order to make the recruitments in the Indian Railways fair and transparent. The examination for a particular post will now be held on the same date simultaneously by all RRBs so that a person will appear only in one RRB of his / her choice. The Committee understand that the question papers for RRB examinations will be set up in the local languages listed in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Indian Constitution falling within the jurisdiction of that RRB in addition to Hindi, Urdu and English, so that local candidates can have question papers in local languages with a view to understanding the questions better. Further, examination fee for candidates belonging to women, minorities and economically backward classes with family income less than `50,000/- per annum has been waived off. The Committee feel that these are steps in the right direction and should be followed along with other innovative measures to make the recruitment system in the Railways more professional.

### **Reply of the Government**

Regular efforts are made for system improvement at RRCB level based on outcome of monitoring and the field experience. As per the recommendations of the Standing Committee, a committee of Senior Railway Officers at Board's level has

been set up for adoption of on-line submission of applications and operation of secure RRB web-sites.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para No.5)**

The Committee observe that out of the 21 RRBs, 10 major RRBs have been selected as nodal RRBs for issuing the Central Employment Notification (CEN) for particular category(s) on behalf of all participating RRBs. Each nodal RRB has been entrusted with specific categories of posts for compiling vacancy and issuing CENs. Receipt of applications and subsequent recruitment activities are done by the participating RRBs themselves. The Committee hope that the nodal RRBs selected for issuing CEN will be different for conducting examinations in different categories of posts as it will not be prudent to burden the same RRBs for all recruitments

### **Reply of the Government**

Nodal RRBs nominated for compiling vacancies of specific categories and issuing Centralized Employment Notifications on behalf of all participating RRBs will not be over-burdened, as prior to this system each RRB including nodal RRBs had to issue a number of separate notifications for different categories of vacancies individually based on the requirements of feeder Zonal Railway(s). Further, stages of recruitment activities have not been entrusted to Nodal RRBs and every one of the 21 RRBs is holding these activities individually. Thus, as per the revised recruitment system, work of individual RRBs including nodal RRBs has comparatively reduced. Further, some work of RRB examinations like storage, distribution and transportation of question papers has been offloaded to ADRM / CPO of the concerned Zonal Railway.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (para No.7)**

#### **Recruitment Procedure/Staff position:**

The Committee note that the recruitment to Group 'A' and 'B' posts in the Indian Railways is done through direct recruitment as well as through promotion. As on 01.4.2010, 1240 post in Groups 'A' and 'B' are lying vacant in the Indian Railways. Further, in certain Railway Zones, the employees on on-roll strength of Group 'A' and Group 'B' posts are more than their sanctioned strength. In Northern Railway, 32 employees are more on on-roll strength than the sanctioned strength; in North Frontier Railway, 86 employees are more on on-roll strength than the sanctioned strength; and in South Eastern Railway, 48 employees are more on on-roll strength than the sanctioned strength. The Committees would like to be apprised of the relevant facts in this regard.

#### **Reply of the Government**

(a) The figures submitted to the Standing Committee were provisional and final figures received from the Zonal Railways as on 31.03.2010 is as under:-

Railway	Group	Sanctioned Strength	On Roll	Vacancy
Northern	A+B	1662	1557	105
North East Frontier	A+B	1083	926	157
South Eastern	A+B	977	912	65

(b): It can be seen that as per the revised figures, there is no excess of on roll strength over the sanctioned strength in Group A & B employees in these Railways.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (para No.8)**

The Committee further note that vacancies in Group 'A' and Group 'B' posts in Central Railway, Eastern Railway, North Eastern Railway, Southern Railway, Western Railway and West Coast Railway are on the higher side numbering 141, 183, 156, 159, 258 and 123, respectively. The Committee consider it to be a matter of grave concern and desire that the process of filling up of the vacancies in Groups 'A' and 'B' should be expedited in the best interest of the Indian Railways.

### **Reply of the Government**

(a) Filling up of vacancies is a continuous process. As regards Group 'A', the direct recruitment to Group 'A' is conducted by the UPSC, separately for the Civil Services and the Engineering Services. Since these are all 'All India level' examinations, the same is time consuming. As regards, indents for Group 'A', in the past, in keeping with the Annual Direct Recruitment Plan of the Department by Personnel and Training, reductions were made in the number of Group 'A' recruited. These restrictions on annual intake have been withdrawn with effect from 01.04.2009 and the indents placed by Railways on UPSC for filling up Group 'A' posts have increased from 307 in the year 2007 to 640 in the year 2011.

(b) Vacancies in Group 'B' are generally filled up by the Ministry of Railways from amongst serving Group 'C' employees through a selection process which is also time consuming. Some amount of vacancies would always exist in an organization. However the intention of the Railways is to fill up these vacancies expeditiously as per laid down procedure.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (para No.9)**

The Committee find that as on 01.4.2010, there were about 1,66,100 vacancies in Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts, which is not at all a satisfactory position. They are further constrained to note that the Ministry has not prescribed any fixed timeframe for completion of the recruitment process initiated by the Railway Recruitment

Boards (RRBs) in respect of Group 'C' posts and by the Railway Recruitment Cells (RRCs) in respect of Group 'D' posts. The plea of the Ministry that the time taken in the recruitment process depends on the number of vacancies, number of applicants and different steps / stages to be followed in the recruitment process for particular post(s) / categories is hardly convincing. Needless to say, bottlenecks that hinder a smooth recruitment process required to be identified. The Committee urge the Ministry to urgently review the time being taken in various stages of recruitment and wherever required take measures to streamline those stages so that the whole process of recruitment is completed expeditiously under a specified timeframe. Staff constraint cannot be allowed to impede the efficient functioning of the Indian Railways. With this end in view, the Committee recommend that the Ministry should fix a certain timeframe to complete their recruitment process.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **Group 'C' :**

It is already submitted that examination for various categories of posts is generally conducted once in a year based on indents and Railways requirement. In view of the recommendation of Standing Committee, it has been decided to set up a Committee at Board's level to suggest annual calendar of RRB examinations for different categories with timeframe keeping in view the time taken at various stages of recruitment process.

As regards Committee's concern on large number of vacancies, it is submitted that in Group 'C' categories, out of a total 40,873 vacancies notified through Centralized Employment Notifications during 2010, written examinations have been conducted for about 36,000 vacancies including 31,000 safety category posts like Assistant Loco Pilot, Assistant Station Master, Section Engineer/Junior Engineer and Technicians. RRBs have started furnishing Panels for Safety category posts to the indenting Railways. For safety categories, panels for about 11,000 posts have already been supplied and balance will be supplied expeditiously.

**Erstwhile Group 'D' (Grade Pay Rs.1800) :**

It has been decided to initiate recruitment process annually in Grade Pay `1800 (erstwhile Group D) as per the following time schedule:

S. No.	Item	Month
1.	Issue of Notification	July
2.	Last date of receipt of application	30 <sup>th</sup> Sept.
3.	Scrutiny of application	Jan./Feb.
4.	Issue of call letter for Written Test	March/April
5.	Written Test	May/June
6.	(PET) Physical Efficiency Test	Sept./Oct.
7.	Medical Test//Documents verification	Nov./Dec.
8.	Declaration of Final Panel	Dec.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

**Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 10 of Chapter I)

**Recommendation (para No.10)**

The Committee note that for Group 'C' posts, the indents are placed annually by the indenting Railways on the RRBs as per their requirement and examinations are conducted by all RRBs simultaneously once in a year. For Group 'D' posts, extant instructions already prescribe the periodicity as two years while recruiting the current as well as anticipated vacancies to be accrued over the next two years. As

submitted, the periodicity is required to be maintained as per need. The Committee desire that the periodicity of holding examinations for Group 'C' posts and for Group 'D' posts should be increased, especially keeping in mind the large number of vacancies in the Railways and also the time consuming process involved in recruitments.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **Group 'C':**

As per the laid down system, indents for Group 'C' vacancies in different categories are placed annually by the Zonal Railway on RRBs as per their requirement and examination are conducted by all RRBs simultaneously once in a year. Sometimes, due to short panel or for certain reasons, vacancies remain unfulfilled. Accordingly, unfilled vacancies are carried forward by the indenting railway in their next indent placed on RRBs. Efforts are made to conduct examinations expeditiously.

However, the suggestion of the Standing Committee for increasing periodicity of holding of examinations for Group 'C' has been included in the terms of reference for the Committee being constituted in this context for suggesting timeframe for expeditious finalization of recruitments.

#### **Erstwhile Group 'D' (Grade Pay Rs. 1800):**

It has been decided to initiate recruitment process annually in Grade Pay Rs.1800 (erstwhile Group D) as per the following time schedule:

S.No.	Item	Month
1.	Issue of Notification	July
2.	Last date of receipt of application	30 <sup>th</sup> Sept.
3.	Scrutiny of application	Jan./Feb.
4.	Issue of call letter for Written Test	March/April
5.	Written Test	May/June
6.	(PET) Physical Efficiency Test	Sept./Oct.

7.	Medical Test//Documents verification	Nov./Dec.
8.	Declaration of Final Panel	Dec.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 13 of Chapter I)

### **Recommendation (Para No. 14)**

#### **Backlog for SC/ST and other reserved categories:**

The Committee note with grave concern that as on 01.04.2010, the backlog vacancies for SCs, STs, and OBCs were 8304, 10939 and 5336, respectively. Special Recruitment Drive and Special Promotion Drive had been launched under the instructions of Department of Personnel and Training (DoP&T) and the recruitment process of filling up the backlog vacancies was under way. The Committee are aware that on 14 July, 2011, the Government had given a direction to all the Ministries / Departments to fill up the vacant posts for SCs, STs, and OBCs by 31.03.2012. In line with that direction, the Committee would like the Ministry to ensure that by 31.03.2012, the backlog of vacancies in respect of SCs, STs and OBCs is cleared.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Department of Personnel and Training (DoP&T) vide their Office Memorandum dated 26.07.2011 has directed the Ministries/Departments to re-launch Special Recruitment Drive for filling up backlog reserved vacancies for SCs, STs & OBCs by 31.03.2012. In this connection, it is stated that this issue is being monitored at Apex level in the Ministry of Railways and every possible effort is being made to wipe out the remaining backlog vacancies. All the Zonal Railways/Production Units have already been instructed to complete the recruitment process by 31.12.2011.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]



## **Recommendation (Para No.21)**

### **Incidents or irregularities and malpractices in RRBs:**

The Committee note to their dismay that there had been four cases of leakage of question papers of RRB examinations in the recent past. First, the question paper of RRB examination for the post of Assistant Loco Pilot scheduled to be held on 27.04.2008 conducted by RRB/ Bhopal was leaked which was under investigation by the Madhya Pradesh Police. Second, a case of leakage of question paper for the examination scheduled for 14.12.2008 for the post of Assistant Loco Pilot conducted by RRB/Allahabad was reported, which was under investigation with the Allahabad Police, Uttar Pradesh. Third, a case of leakage of question paper for the examination scheduled for 15.02.2009 for the post of Asst. Station Master (ASM) conducted by RRB/Ajmer was reported, which was under investigation with the Special Operation Group, Rajasthan Police. The examination was subsequently cancelled. Fourthly, there was leakage of question papers of RRB examinations held on 06.06.2010 and 13.06.2010 for the post of Assistant Loco Pilot and Assistant Station Master. The CBI had unearthed a Railway recruitment scam and arrested ten persons, for allegedly running the racket. Further investigation in the matter is stated to be under progress with the CBI. The Committee would like to be apprised of the progress in each of the above cases.

### **Reply of the Government**

The position of each of the four cases as mentioned above is as under:-

- RRB/BHOPAL:- As per information obtained from Sr. S.P./Bhopal, one person namely Shri Rameshwar Prasad Sahu had been arrested on 02.07.2008 and produced before Hon'ble Court. Efforts are being made to arrest other persons involved in this case.
- RRB/ALLAHABAD:- As per information obtained from the office of DIG/Police, Allahabad, the matter is under trial in the Hon'ble Court of Judicial Magistrate-III, Allahabad.

- RRB/AJMER:- As per information obtained from the Special Operation Group, Rajasthan Police, the challan against 105 accused has been produced in the court and is under consideration with Chief Judicial Magistrate, Jaipur.
- RRB/MUMBAI:- As per information obtained from the CBI/Hyderabad, investigation into the case has been completed and CBI has filed a charge Sheet on 13.09.2010 against Shri S.M.Sharma, the then Chairman, RRB/Mumbai and 14 others before the Hon'ble Court of Special Judge for CBI cases, Hyderabad u/s 120 (B), 409, 418, 420 & 201 IPC and Section 7, 8 & 13(2) r/w 13 (1) (c) & (d) of the Prevention of Corruption Act, 1988.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 25 of Chapter I)

### **Recommendation (Para No.23)**

The Committee note that the Railway Recruitment Boards carried out a technical audit of the system of examination for the first time after receipt of reports of leakage of question papers of RRB/Mumbai in the year 2010. After the technical audit was done, necessary changes in the system of printing, transportation, storage and distribution of question papers for examinations have been made and the instructions in this regard were issued on 11 August, 2010. In order to make the system foolproof, the Ministry have now diversified the process under which one person cannot have total information of printing, storage and distribution of question papers, as was prevalent in the earlier system. The Committee strongly feel that had such technical audit been done earlier, subsequent incidents of leakage of question papers could have been averted.

### **Reply of the Government**

After the leakage of question papers of Assistant Loco Pilot and Assistant Station Master, in the written examinations of RRB/Mumbai held on 06.06.2010 and

13.06.2010 and prima facie involvement of Chairman, RRB/Mumbai, it was felt necessary to carry out the technical audit of the system and as a result, system for transportation, storage and distribution of question papers was modified in August, 2010. Now the question paper is not set by the Chairman of the RRB which is conducting the examinations. Question papers are received from three different sources by the officer nominated for the purpose and no one person has a control over setting, printing, storage and distribution of question papers.

Thereafter, written exam for Enquiry-cum-Reservation-Clerk / Goods Guard, Commercial Apprentice / Traffic Apprentice, Section Engineers / Junior Engineers and Technicians have been held smoothly and successfully as per new methodology.

[[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para No.24)**

#### **Recruitment in RPF/RPSF**

The Committee note that at present the staff strength of RPF is 61,671, with the total sanctioned strength being 69,307, thus leaving 7636 vacancies in all categories of posts. Recalling the grievances with regard to the shortage of RPF/RPSF personnel of the Western Railway, Central Railway, South Central Railway and Southern Railway during their visit to these Zonal Railways in May, 2010, the Committee recommend that vacant posts in RPF/RPSF should be filled up on a priority basis, specially keeping in view the security scenario in the country. Further, if need be, steps should be taken for the creation of posts in all Railway Zones to meet the shortage of the manpower in RPF.

### **Reply of the Government**

On a proposal of the Ministry of Railways, the Ministry of Finance had sanctioned 5134 additional posts for RPF in March, 2010. The newly created posts

were distributed amongst all the Zonal Railways in a proportionate manner. Three RPSF Battalions including a Lady Battalion and one Mahila Vahini have been created out of the newly sanctioned posts. Moreover, sanctioned order for 723 posts for security of Kolkata Metro Rail has also been received from the Ministry of Finance and the formal orders to this effect are being issued by the Ministry of Railways. As on 31.05.2011, the posted strength of RPF is 61058 as against the sanctioned strength of 74538 (approx.) leaving 13480 numbers of vacancies on all Zonal Railways. Efforts are being made to fill up these vacancies on priority basis. An Employment Notice No. 1/2011 dated 27.02.2011 has been issued inviting applications from eligible candidates for filling 11952 vacancies of Constable in RPF/RPSF. Similarly, 511 vacancies of Sub-Inspector in RPF/RPSF have been advertised vide Employment Notice No. 2/2011 dated 13.04.2011. These vacancies include vacancies of all Zonal Railways taking into account the existing and the anticipated vacancies upto 31.12.2012.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para No.25)**

As apprised, the National Police Mission (NPM) set up in December, 2005 under the aegis of the Ministry of Home Affairs had prepared a project called Project Transparent Recruitment Process or 'Project TRP'. The vision of the 'Project TRP' is to ensure a fair, impartial, transparent, objective, tamperproof, scientific, merit-based recruitment process so as to induct into the police, individuals best suited for their job, who have earned their way into the police on their own merit and without favour of unfair means by using simple but well defined procedures reinforced by technology and the use of information technology.

The Committee understand that the Project TRP envisages formation of a Recruitment Board in every organization so as to ensure a transparent recruitment process in all recruitments in Central Para Military Forces and Indian Reserved Battalions. The Committee note that the proposal to constitute a permanent RPF

Recruitment Board as envisaged in Project TRP is still under consideration in the Ministry of Railway and nothing concrete has been finalized as yet. The Committee would like to be apprised of the reasons for the delay in finalizing the proposal for the constitution of a permanent RPF Recruitment Board. They recommend that the needful be done at the earliest in this direction to ensure on-board security and safety of passengers.

### **Reply of the Government**

The feasibility of implementing National Police Mission's Project Transparent Recruitment Process of 'Project TRP' under the Ministry of Home Affairs was examined vis-à-vis the existing system of recruitment being followed by Railway Protection Force within the ambit of RPF Rules, 1987. It was found that the existing system of recruitment where the 16 Zonal Railways/RPF and RPSF divided into four recruitment groups is as close to the procedure prescribed by the Ministry of Home Affairs as possible within the existing limits. It was, therefore, decided in the year 2010 itself that the recruitment in RPF should be conducted as per existing procedure. Accordingly, employment notices for filling 11952 posts of Constable and 511 posts of Sub-Inspector have already been issued. These manpowers, when finally recruited and deployed in the mainstream would strengthen on-board security and safety of passengers.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para No.27)**

The Committee are unhappy to note the callous approach of the Ministry in supplying information to them. At one place, a representative of the Ministry during evidence on 23 November, 2010 submitted that the policy of giving jobs to land losers started only this year and that there was no such policy earlier. That is why in the past, they could not offer any appointment to whosoever had given land to the Railways. Elsewhere, they have stated that the policy to provide employment to those whose land was acquired for the purpose of Railway projects came into

existence with the issue of instructions dated 01.01.1983. The Committee desire the Ministry to ensure supply of correct information to them in future.

### **Reply of the Government**

Recommendation is noted for strict compliance.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para No.31)**

The Committee are aware that a recent central directive issued by the Department of Personnel and Training envisages that all government appointing authorities should ensure the presence of women officers in selection committees and recruitment boards to see that there is no bias against women during hiring. The Committee trust that the Ministry would take suitable steps in this direction, wherever warranted.

### **Reply of the Government**

In order to remove subjectivity in selection, viva voce / interview has been dispensed with in recruitment from open market and in departmental promotion in all categories except in the categories of Law Assistants, Teachers, Physiotherapists, Telephone Operators, District Extension Educator, Senior Publicity Inspector in which the personality test is a must for assessing the suitability of the candidate. As regards DoPT circular regarding representation of women, the same is being considered for circulation.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

## **Recommendation (Para No.32)**

### **Complaints/Grievances**

The Committee note that there are no provisions in the Ministry for tracking of applications by candidates applying for various categories of posts and for online printing of admit cards in the case of non-receipt of the same. Further, the facility for online submission of applications is available with only a few RRBs. Considering these to be the basic requirements for a smooth and efficient recruitment system, the Committee desire that the facility for online submission of applications should be extended expeditiously to all RRBs and the facility of online printing of admit cards in case of their non-receipt by the applications should be extended at the earliest possible.

### **Reply of the Government**

In view of the above recommendation of Standing Committee, it has now been decided to set up a Committee at Board's level to examine the feasibility for on-line submission of application forms for RRBs examination and printing of admit cards for RRB examinations.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

## **CHAPTER – III**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS / OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE GOVERNMENT'S REPLIES**

#### **Recommendation (Para. No. 4)**

However, the Committee take a serious view of the fact that up till now, the Ministry had conveniently overlooked such a glaring fault in the recruitment process in which different RRBs were holding examinations of the same category of posts separately on different dates and as a result, the same candidate used to get selected at a number of RRBs for a particular post(s). This had resulted in shortfall as one candidate could join at one place only, leaving vacant his post in the other RRB, thus nullifying the efforts made in the recruitment exercise. Such a short-sighted approach had resulted in shortage of staff in the Railways on the one hand and denial of opportunity to many candidates on the other.

#### **Reply of the Government**

It is submitted that the concept of the same day examinations simultaneously by all the RRBs for major safety categories like Assistant Loco Pilot, Assistant Station Master, Goods Guard, Senior Engineers / Junior Engineers as well as also for isolated categories was tried earlier in 2004-05. However, the same was subsequently discontinued for major safety categories due to formation of short panels but it was retained for isolated categories. Now on the recommendation of the Review Committee constituted in 2009, the concept has been adopted again and extended to all categories of posts. With the new system under Centralized Employment Notifications, RRB examinations have been conducted successfully yielding positive results.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]



### **Recommendation (Para. No. 6)**

The Committee note that as per the new Railway Recruitment Policy, free travelling authority is issued to SC/ST candidates for attending the examination. This facility has, however, not been provided to other weaker sections like minorities, economically backward classes, women, differently abled and Other Backward Class candidates and no such proposal is presently under the consideration of the Ministry. The Committee recommend that the matter for a similar provision for minorities, economically backward classes, women, differently abled and other Backward Class candidates may be examined / considered by the Ministry.

### **Reply of the Government**

A number of facilities have recently been extended to other weaker sections viz: examination fee for women candidates and candidates belonging to minorities and economically backward classes with family income less than `50,000/- per annum has been waived off. Candidates belonging to Other Backward Classes (OBCs) and Physically handicapped are given reservation in recruitment as per Government policy. OBC candidates are also given relaxation in prescribed minimum qualifying marks. Feasibility of extending other facilities like free travelling authority will be considered in due course keeping in view the resources position.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para. No. 12)**

The Committee are unhappy with the way the Railways address the problem of shortage of staff by resorting to alternative methods like re-engagement of retired staff on non-safety jobs, managing through leave reserve, etc. As informed, the running staff, after their recruitment, undergo a training schedule of 18 months and are available for actual service in about two years' time. In order to cover this duration, the Railway Board have granted permission to re-engage retired gangman, keyman, gateman, trolleyman and loco pilots (both electrical and diesel drivers) and guards to ensure that operational requirements are attended to, without

compromising on safety. The Committee can understand the Railway Board taking this decision as a one-time measure or in some unavoidable circumstances. However, the Committee are of the view that these steps cannot be resorted to as permanent remedy when the problem of shortage of regular staff is confronted by the Railways on a regular basis.

### **Reply of the Government:**

As indicated in reply to Para 9 & 10, it has now been decided to initiate recruitment in Grade Pay `1800 (erstwhile Group 'D') every year in July. The recruitment exercise will take care of the current and anticipated vacancies upto next 1 year i.e. the date when next notification for recruitment will be issued. Once the recruitment cycle is stabilized, there will hardly be any large scale vacancies which will require emergency measure of augmenting the work force through re-engagement of retired staff.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para. No. 13)**

The Committee further observe that the posts falling under the running staff are Loco Pilot (Mail), Loco Pilot (Passenger)/Motorman, Loco Pilot (Goods), Loco Pilot (Shunting) Gr.I, Loco Pilot (Shunting) Gr.II, Sr. FM-1, Sr. Asstt. Loco Pilot (Diesel / Elect), FM-I, Asstt. Loco Pilot (Diesel / Elec.), Sr. Second Fireman, Second Fireman, Mail Express Guard, Passenger Guard, Sr. Goods Guard, Goods Guard, Sr. Asstt. Guard / Sr. Brakeman and Asstt. Guard / Brakesman. The Committee are not happy with the induction of retired persons in case of non-availability of running staff, thus jeopardizing the safety and security of passengers as the nature of job of running staff require physical endurance. They would like to suggest this practice of engaging retired personnel should be curtailed / discontinued in due course and vigorous efforts should be made to recruit proper running staff.

### **Reply of the Government:**

As indicated in reply to Para 9 & 10, it has now been decided to initiate recruitment in Grade Pay Rs. 1800 (erstwhile Group 'D') every year in July. The recruitment exercise will take care of the current and anticipated vacancies upto next 1 year i.e. the date when next notification for recruitment will be issued. Once the recruitment cycle is stabilized, there will hardly be any large scale vacancies which will require emergency measure of augmenting the work force through re-engagement of retired staff.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para. No. 16)**

#### **Substitute Recruitment:**

The Committee learn that a General Manager in the Indian Railways, at his discretion, can appoint substitutes to make up the work of track maintenance and station work and shunting operations which need manpower and that this provision has been in existence for decades. The Committee are not convinced by the explanation given by the Ministry that when there are so many vacancies, it is considered necessary in the interest of safety to have such a provision. It can only be termed as a lack of serious effort and lack of foresight on the part of the Ministry of Railways to fill up the existing vacancies. The Committee firmly believe that such adhocism would invite allegations of corruption and nepotism and recommend that such discretionary power of the General Manager may be withdrawn.

### **Reply of the Government**

Engagement of Substitutes is a discretionary power to be exercised by General Manager in emergency situations requiring administrative measures to man a vacant post when the process of filling up is delayed and the post cannot be kept vacant due to exigencies of work otherwise railway's work may be adversely affected. These powers have been vested in Railways since 1960s as these are emergency powers. However, as per remarks for para 9 & 10 where it has been

stated that recruitment will be initiated in Grade Pay Rs.1800 (erstwhile Group 'D') every year. Once the recruitment cycle is stabilized there will hardly be any large vacancies which will require use of emergency power of engaging substitutes.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para. No. 17)**

The Committee conclude that the Railways have been facing the problem of shortage of staff for decades as is evident from the fact that the provision of appointment of substitutes has also been prevalent in the Railways for decades. This is a poor commentary on the recruitment process in the Railways. As provision of recruitment of substitutes has only been made to fill that post which cannot be kept vacant due to exigencies of work, the Committee earnestly desire that the Ministry should give focused attention to filling up of the vacancies through direct recruitment by exploring ways and means to expedite the recruitment process and the system of substitute recruitment should eventually be phased out. The Committee desire the Ministry to expeditiously review the matter for provision of appointment of substitutes at the appropriate level.

### **Reply of the Government:**

Engagement of Substitutes is a discretionary power to be exercised by General Manager in emergency situations requiring administrative measures to man a vacant post when the process of filling up is delayed and the post cannot be kept vacant due to exigencies of work otherwise railway's work may be adversely affected. These powers have been vested in Railways since 1960s as these are emergency powers. However, as per remarks for para 9 & 10 where it has been stated that recruitment will be initiated in Grade Pay Rs.1800 (erstwhile Group 'D') every year. Once the recruitment cycle is stabilized there will hardly be any large vacancies which will require use of emergency power of engaging substitutes.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para. No. 22)**

The Committee express their serious concern at the frequent occurrence of allegations of irregularities and malpractices against the RRBs and strongly recommend that the Ministry should take effective steps to check the recurrence of such incidents. The Committee would further like to be assured that all those who indulge in such malpractices are dealt with very severely.

### **Reply of the Government**

A technical audit of the system of examination has been carried out in August, 2010 and significant/substantial changes in the system of transportation, storage and distribution of question papers for RRB examinations have been made in order to make the system foolproof.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Para. No. 29)**

Employment on compassionate grounds is a significant and unique mode of employment in the Indian Railways. Around 9000-10000 posts are filled up in this manner annually all over Indian Railways which is much beyond the prescribed limit of 5 per cent as imposed by the Department of Personnel and Training (DoP&T). About 36000 persons have been employed under this compassionate ground employment between 2005-06 and 2008-09. Of this, about 85 per cent jobs had been given to wards of staff who died in harness and the remaining 15 per cent on account of retirement on medical grounds when the employees were de-categorised for medical reasons. This especially happens in the case of Gangmen and the running staff. The Committee note that the Railways have not obtained any permission from the DoP&T for making compassionate appointment beyond their prescribed limit of 5 per cent. The plea given by the Ministry that no permission had been obtained from DoP&T since the Railways are an operational department whose working is unique, is not convincing. The Committee desire that the Railways

should follow the rules with regard to compassionate appointments and place their position before the DoP&T to seek formal permission in this regard to avoid any complications in future.

### **Reply of the Government**

Railways are essentially an operating department and a labour intensive organisation with large employee strength. There are a large number of cases of death or medical decategorisation connected to it. The broad policy of compassionate ground appointment as enumerated by DoPT is followed by Railways with regard to age, qualifications etc except that the maximum limit prescribed is not strictly adhered to. Though formal approval has not been taken, DoPT has been kept informed of action taken by the Railways in exceeding the prescribed percentage in view of its operational requirements and need to maintain harmonious industrial relations.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Recommendation (Paras. Nos. 34 and 35)**

#### **Sports Quota:**

34. The committee are unhappy to note that during 2007-08, 2008-09 and 2009-10, out of 1181 vacancies allotted each year in the sports quota for Group 'C' and 'D' posts, only 586, 509 and 233 vacancies, respectively, have been filled. The plea given by the Ministry that due to non-availability of suitable candidates, it becomes difficult for the Railways to utilize their full quota is hardly convincing. The Committee desire that suitable steps should be taken to recruit sports persons and that the sports quota should be filled up to the best possible extent.

35. As appraised, there is no separate sports cadre in the Railways and, therefore, vacancy position is not maintained for the sports quota. Since the existing policy for recruitment of sports persons on the Indian Railways under the sports quota allotted to the Zonal Railways and Production Units and the criteria and procedure for

selection, etc. is being revised and such a proposal is under consideration, the Committee desire that these factors should be taken into account before finalizing the new policy.

**Reply of the Government (Paras. Nos. 34 and 35)**

The revised policy guidelines for recruitment of sports persons on Indian Railways have been issued on 31.12.2010 (copy at Annexure 'A'). In the revised policy instructions, suitable measures are taken in order to maximum utilization of sports quota. In this regard, time frames have been fixed for conducting trials and completing all formalities for recruitment through Talent Scouting. Similarly, in the case of recruitment through Open Advertisement Quota, target dates for issuing notification and completing recruitment process have also been fixed up (copy at Annexure 'B').

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

## CHAPTER-IV

### RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

#### Recommendation (Para No. 11)

The Committee are deeply concerned to note that out of the 1,66,100 vacancies in Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts on 01.4.2011, no timeframe has been fixed for filling up of 85,663 Group 'D' posts; the last date for receiving applications for these posts was 31 March, 2011. The Committee fail to understand as to why the process of filling up these posts had been started so late when they had been lying vacant since 01.04.2010. This reflects poorly on the pace of the recruitment process in the Railways. Though efforts are stated to have been made to fill up the vacancies as early as possible and notifications against most of the vacancies have already been published, much more is required to be done to accelerate the pace of the recruitment process. The Committee would further like to be apprised of the present status with regard to the 1,66,100 posts which were lying vacant in Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts as on 01.4.2010.

#### Reply of the Government

##### Group 'C':

Occurrence and filling up of vacancy is a continuous process. Out of a total 40,873 vacancies notified through Centralized Employment Notifications during 2010 for Group 'C' categories, written examinations have been conducted for about 36,000 vacancies including 31,000 safety category posts like Assistant Loco Pilot, Assistant Station Master, Section Engineer/Junior Engineer and Technicians. RRBs have started furnishing Panels for Safety category posts to the indenting Railways. For safety categories, panels for about 11,000 posts have already been supplied and balance will be supplied expeditiously.



Erstwhile Group 'D' (Grade Pay Rs. 1800):

Written Test has been held for recruitment initiated during the period 2006-08, for around 36,900 posts. Panels are expected to be published by December, 2011. For 10,324 posts of Eastern and East Coast Railway, recruitment has been held up owing to court cases. Further, special drive has already been completed for recruitment of 16,747 ex-servicemen vacancies, out of which around 7500 have been appointed so far. Also, for around 85,000 vacancies in Grade Pay of Rs.1800/- , notifications were issued in December / January 2010/2011 of which scrutiny of applications are underway.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

**Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 16 of Chapter I)

**Recommendation (Para No. 18)**

The Committee note that from 01.04.2007 to 31.03.2010, out of 9847 substitutes appointed on the different Railway zones/ PUs, 6183 have been regularized. For the North Western Railway, figures are available upto 31.08.2009, where out of 148 substitutes, 13 have been regularized and in the North East Frontier Railways, where out of 103, 50 substitutes have been regularized upto 09.02.2011. The Committee may be informed of the criteria laid down for regularization of the substitutes.

**Reply of the Government**

As per the extant instructions a person engaged as substitute in Grade Pay Rs.1800 (erstwhile Group D) is eligible for absorption after he/she attains temporary status after continuously working for four months. He/she is regularized as and when screening is conducted by Railways.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 19 of Chapter I)

### **Recommendation (Para No.20)**

The Committee note that the difference between a regular recruitment and substitute engagement is that the substitutes are engaged in exigencies of work and fall under the General Manager's discretionary powers which is not so in case of open market recruitment. Substitutes are engaged by way of screening done by a committee whereas regular recruitment is done by specialized recruitment agencies. Though qualification for direct recruitment for posts in Grade Pay of Rs. 1800/- is Class 10<sup>th</sup> or ITI or equivalent, till 31.07.2011, the Railways have been permitted to engage substitutes, viz. fresh faces, Course Completed Act Apprentices, legal heirs of accident victims, etc., even with a qualification below the prescribed one. The substitute thus appointed is not subjected to Physical Efficiency Test though he/she is subjected to medical examination. On the other hand, for recruitment done through the open market, Physical Efficiency Test (PET) for Group 'D' is compulsory as a majority of the jobs is stated to be those involving physical endurance. The Committee fail to understand how for jobs requiring physical endurance, Physical Efficiency Test can be exempted in the case of substitutes. The Committee desire that suitable corrective measures should be taken in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

Engagement of substitutes is an emergency power where the norms of engagement have been streamlined vide RBE/137/2010 dated 17.9.2010 which stipulates that the applications should be screened by a committee of 3 Senior Administrative Grade level officers.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 22 of Chapter I)

## Recommendation (Para No.26)

### Compassionate appointments

The Committee have been apprised that the extant rules provided for giving compensation to the dependents of those who have lost their lives in train accidents. However, in exceptional circumstances and on humanitarian grounds, jobs have been provided by way of engagement of wards/legal heirs of the victims as substitute in Group 'D' posts only under the General Manager's discretionary powers. From 01.04.2007 to 31.03.2010, a total of 14 persons have been provided employment on the Railways in such circumstances in the wake of train accidents. The Committee desire to be informed of the casualties that had occurred in train accidents during the above period and the status with regard to the pending cases in which the victims' families have been assured of employment with the Railways.

### Reply of the Government

Employment to dependants of victims of train accidents/incidents is provided as a humanitarian measure, only in cases where announcement to this effect has been made by Hon'ble Minister of Railways. During the period 01.4.2007 to 31.3.2010, in the following cases, announcement to this effect had been made by Hon'ble Minister for Railways. Position of employment given as on 31.7.2011, in these cases, is as under:

S. No.	Name of the Accident/ Incident	No. of deaths	Employments given	Applications not received/ rejected/ Unwilling etc.	Pending Cases
1.	Incidence of Stampede at Mughalsarai Junction on 3.10.2007	15	12	03	0
2.	Incident of run over at Danapur/East Central Rly. by 2387 UP Jan-Sadharan Express on 4.8.2008.	05	01	04	0

3.	CSTM Terrorist attack, Central Rly. on 26.11.2008.	52	35	13	04
	Total	72	48	20	04

In the same period, i.e. from 01.4.2007 to 31.3.2010, a total of 638 casualties have been reported.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 28 & 29 of Chapter I)

### **Recommendation (Para No.30)**

#### **Representation of Women employees in Railways**

The Committee are unhappy to note that the percentage of women employees on the Indian Railways (excluding MTP, Kolkata) as on 31.03.2010 in Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' is only 6.79 percent, 5.45 percent, 7.70 percent and 6.20 percent, respectively. Though waiving off the examination fee for the women candidates is a welcome step in order to encourage participation of women candidates in the Railway recruitment process, it cannot be termed as adequate. The Committee desire that the Ministry may take proactive steps to enable women to be adequately represented in the Railways and that concerted efforts should be made to increase the percentage of women employees in the Railways.

### **Reply of the Government**

In order to encourage participation of women in railway jobs, examination fee has been waived in case of women candidates while resorting to recruitment of staff from open market to Group 'C' categories and the posts in Grade Pay Rs.1800

(erstwhile Group D) with effect from 8.12 .2010.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 32 of Chapter I)

### **Recommendation (Para No.33)**

The Committee find that that there is a system of lodging of complaints by the applications relating to recruitment formalities with the Railway Recruitment Control Board, for redresal. However, they are surprised to note that in spite of several reported issues relating to the Railway recruitment, only 107 complaints were received by the Ministry in the last five years. The Complaints are of a general nature like complaints/representations against rejection of applications by RRBs, prescribed educational qualifications for various posts, non-selection of candidates, non- receipt of call letters, delay in declaration of results by RRBs, re-medical examination, etc. those relating to policy issues and those arising out of/against unsatisfactory replies by the RRBs. The Committee feel that the extant mechanism in the Ministry for lodging of complaints by applicants has not been adequately publicized and therefore the matter need to be addressed accordingly.

### **Reply of the Government**

There are 21 RRBs located over Indian Railways. Generally candidates lodge their complaints / grievances to the respective RRB as necessary mechanism has been set up at RRBs also. Some complaints / grievances relating to particular RRB received in Board's office are forwarded to RRB concerned for disposal. In addition, a full-fledged Public Grievances Directorate has been set up in the Ministry of Railways for redressal of public grievances including grievances concerning RRBs.

Complaints / grievances involving more than one RRB or arising out of unsatisfactory replies by RRBs or on policy matters are dealt with at Board's level. This explains the limited number of grievances received by Railway Recruitment Control Board.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

**Comments of the Committee**

(Please see recommendation para no. 35 of Chapter I)

## **CHAPTER-V**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH FINAL REPLIES ARE STILL AWAITED**

#### **Recommendation (Para No.15)**

The Committee note that the post-wise information in this regard is not available in the Ministry of Railways as the Railways find it difficult to collect such information and compile them in the Railway Board office as many categories of posts are available in Zonal Railways and Production Units in all the Groups, viz. Group A, B, C and D. The Committee do not consider it a convincing reply as in the absence of such data, the Ministry would not have the exact figures of backlog vacancies of SCs / STs / OBCs for different categories of posts. The Committee desire the Ministry to act immediately in this direction and inform the Committee of the same within six months.

#### **Reply of the Government**

As desired by the Committee, information is being collected from Zonal Railways/Production Units and will be submitted to the Committee immediately after compilation. Collection and compilation of this huge data from Divisions & Sub-divisions by Zonal Railways/Production Units will requires time as there are around one lac rosters maintained in Railways for different grades in various posts.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

#### **Recommendation (Para No.19)**

The Committee note to their dismay that the position pertaining to the number of substitutes whose services have been regularized is not maintained in the Ministry since recruitment/engagement of Group 'D' posts is done by the Zonal Railways; cadre for Group 'D' is also maintained by the Zonal Railways, with the details being called for only as and when required. Railway administrations, while

engaging substitutes, have been directed to keep the intake of SC/ST/OBC against each individual category in various Departments not below the prescribed percentage of reservation in favour of these communities and the shortfall, if any, be made good by resorting to direct recruitment in each category. As informed, the figures for SCs/STs/OBCs substitutes engaged category-wise during the last three years are being obtained from the Railway establishments. The Committee may be apprised of the same.

### **Reply of the Government**

Information is being collected from the field units and will be furnished shortly.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]



### **Recommendation (Para No.28)**

The Committee note that during the period 01.04.2007 to 31.01.2010, a total of 478 employment has been given on the East Central Railway and Northern Railway only in Group 'D' category in lieu of land acquired. The Committee are dismayed to find that the Ministry does not have the detailed data with regard to employment given since 01.01.1983 in such cases. The Committee would like to be informed of the reasons for such lapse on the part of the Ministry.

### **Reply of the Government**

As the appointment under the category is delegated to General Managers in the zonal Railways /Production Units, the information is maintained by the railway establishments in the field. The information is called for by the Ministry as and when required. Information as to how many jobs have been given since 1983 is being obtained separately and will be furnished shortly.

[Ministry of Railways O.M. No. 2011/BC-II/XV/300/2,  
Dated 29.11.2011]

**NEW DELHI;**

**15 May, 2012**  
**25 Vaisakha, 1934 (Saka)**

**T.R. BAALU**

**Chairman,**  
**Standing Committee on Railways**

**MINUTES OF THE ELEVENTH SITTING OF THE  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS (2011-12)**

The Committee sat on Tuesday, the 15<sup>th</sup> May, 2012 from 1500 Hrs. to 1615 Hrs. in Committee Room 'C', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

**PRESENT**

**SHRI T.R. BAALU - CHAIRMAN**

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Shri Ram Sunder Das
3. Shri K. Bapiraju
4. Dr. Nirmal Khatri
5. Dr. (Smt.) Botcha Jhansi Lakshmi
6. Shri Somabhai G. Koli Patel
7. Dr. Padmsinha Bajirao Patil
8. Smt. Yashodhara Raje Scindia
9. Shri Sharif-ud-din 'Shariq'
10. Shri Gopal Singh Shekhawat
11. Shri Ganesh Singh
12. Chaudhary Lal Singh
13. Shri Nama Nageswara Rao

**RAJYA SABHA**

14. Shri Om Prakash Mathur
15. Smt. Kusum Rai
16. Shri Tarini Kanta Roy
17. Shri Ishwar Singh

**SECRETARIAT**

- |                           |   |                     |
|---------------------------|---|---------------------|
| 1. Shri K. Vijayakrishnan | - | Joint Secretary     |
| 2. Shri Abhijit Kumar     | - | Director            |
| 3. Shri Arun K. Kaushik   | - | Additional Director |

xxx

xxx

xxx

xxx

2. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee. Thereafter, the Committee took up for consideration the following Reports:-

(i) xxx xxx xxx xxx

(ii) Draft Report on action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in their 12<sup>th</sup> Report on 'New Railway Recruitment Policy'

3. The Committee adopted the Report at (i) with some modification as indicated at the Annexure and the Report at (ii) without any modification.

4. The Committee, then authorized the Chairman to finalise the Report at (i) in light of the factual verification and present/lay both the Reports at (i) and (ii) in both the houses of the Parliament.

5. xxx xxx xxx xxx

6. A copy of the Verbatim Report of the sitting has been kept.

**The Committee then adjourned.**

## APPENDIX-II

### **ANALYSIS OF ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS CONTAINED IN THE 12<sup>TH</sup> REPORT (15<sup>TH</sup> LOK SABHA) ON 'NEW RAILWAY RECRUITMENT POLICY'**

Total number of Recommendations/Observations	35
(i) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government – Para Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 14, 21, 23, 24, 25, 27, 31 and 32	16
Percentage of total	45.71%
(ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies – Para Nos. 4, 6, 12, 13, 16, 17, 22, 29, 34 and 35	10
Percentage of total	28.57%
(iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration – Para Nos. 11, 18, 20, 26, 30 and 33	6
Percentage of total	17.14%
(iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies are still awaited - Para Nos. 15, 19 and 28	3
Percentage of total	8.57