

76

TRAINING OF PILOTS IN THE INDIAN AIR FORCE

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of
the Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (15th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
2012-2013**

SEVENTY-SIXTH REPORT

FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

SEVENTY-SIXTH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2012-2013)

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

TRAINING OF PILOTS IN THE INDIAN
AIR FORCE

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the
Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (15th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

Presented to Lok Sabha on 21.03.2013

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 21.03.2013



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

March, 2013/Phalguna, 1934 (Saka)

PAC No. 2003

Price : ₹ 30.00

© 2013 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Fourteenth Edition) and Printed by the General Manager, Government of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi-110 002.

CONTENTS

| | PAGE |
|---|-------|
| COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2012-2013) | (iii) |
| INTRODUCTION | (v) |
| CHAPTER I Report | 1 |
| CHAPTER II Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government | 6 |
| CHAPTER III Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government | 17 |
| CHAPTER IV Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration | 18 |
| CHAPTER V Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies | 21 |

APPENDICES

| | |
|---|----|
| I. Minutes of the Twenty-seventh sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2012-13) held on 19th March, 2013 .. | 22 |
| II. Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) | 24 |

COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2012-2013)

Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi — *Chairman*

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Anandrao Vithoba Adsul
3. Dr. Baliram
4. Shri Sandeep Dikshit
5. Dr. M. Thambidurai
6. Shri T.K.S. Elangovan
7. Shri Anant Kumar Hegde
8. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
9. Shri Sanjay Nirupam
10. Shri Shripad Yesso Naik
- *11. Shri Abhijit Mukherjee
12. Shri Ashok Tanwar
- †13. Shri Takam Sanjoy
14. Dr. Girija Vyas
15. Shri Dharmendra Yadav

Rajya Sabha

16. Shri Prasanta Chatterjee
17. Shri Prakash Javadekar
18. Shri Satish Chandra Misra
19. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy
20. Shri J.D. Seelam
21. Shri N.K. Singh
22. Prof. Saif-ud-Din Soz

SECRETARIAT

- | | | |
|------------------------|---|-------------------------|
| 1. Shri Devender Singh | — | <i>Joint Secretary</i> |
| 2. Shri M.L.K. Raja | — | <i>Deputy Secretary</i> |
| 3. Shri S.L. Singh | — | <i>Under Secretary</i> |

*Elected *w.e.f.* 6th December, 2012 *vice* Shri Sarvey Sathyanarayana appointed as Minister on 28th October, 2012.

†Elected *w.e.f.* 6th December, 2012 *vice* Dr. Shashi Tharoor appointed as Minister on 28th October, 2012.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Public Accounts Committee (2012-13), having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Seventy-sixth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Training of Pilots in the Indian Air Force' relating to the Ministry of Defence.

2. The Fifty-second Report was presented to Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 30th March, 2012. Replies of the Government to the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Report were received on 18.2.2013. The Public Accounts Committee considered and adopted the Seventy-sixth Report at their sitting held on 19th March, 2013. Minutes of the sitting are given at *Appendix-I*.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

5. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Fifty-second Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) is given at *Appendix-II*.

NEW DELHI;
19 March, 2013

28 Phalguna, 1934 (*Saka*)

DR. MURLIMANO HAR JOSHI
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

CHAPTER I

REPORT

This Report of the Public Accounts Committee deals with the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (15th Lok Sabha) on 'Training of Pilots in the Indian Air Force' based on C&AG Report No. PA 5 of 2008 (Chapter II) relating to the Ministry of Defence.

2. The Fifty-second Report (15th Lok Sabha) was presented to the Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 30th March, 2012. The Report contained 11 Observations/Recommendations. Action Taken Notes in respect of all the Observations/Recommendations have been received from the Ministry of Defence and these have been categorized as under:—

- (i) Observations/Recommendations of the Committee which have been accepted by the Government:

Paragraph Nos. 1, 4-8 and 11

Total : 07

Chapter II

- (ii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government:

—NIL—

Total: Nil

Chapter III

- (iii) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:

Paragraph Nos. 2, 9 and 10

Total : 03

Chapter IV

- (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies:

Paragraph No. 3

Total : 01

Chapter V

3. The Committee desire that the Ministry of Defence furnish at the earliest final/conclusive Action Taken Note on the Observation/Recommendation No. 3 of their 52nd Report (15th Lok Sabha) in respect of which the Ministry have furnished interim replies.

4. The Action Taken Notes furnished by the Ministry of Defence on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (15th Lok Sabha) have been reproduced in the relevant Chapters of this Report. In the succeeding paragraphs, the Committee have dealt with the Action Taken by the Government on some of their Observations/Recommendations made in the Original Report which need reiteration.

I. Status of Pendency Position of Audit paras

[Observation/Recommendation Para No. 2 of the 52nd Report
(15th Lok Sabha)]

5. The Committee had been informed that the delay in submission of Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Notes occurred due to the time taken in coordination with the various units/field formations of the Ministry of Defence. The Committee were not convinced with the reasons put forth by the Ministry for pendency of a large number of Audit paragraphs and had expressed that there apparently was lack of coordination amongst various divisions/units/formations and a poor command structure in the Ministry as a total of 187 paragraphs were pending with them as on 31st May, 2010. The Committee had observed that coordination with various divisions/units/formations/agencies was an administrative issue and therefore the Ministry had to take appropriate steps to resolve their internal matters within the stipulated time frame. Expressing their displeasure over the mounting pendencies, the Committee had desired that the Ministry of Defence should urgently devise an effective monitoring mechanism and streamline the procedure to deal with the Audit Reports/paragraphs and make concerted efforts to furnish the Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Notes with the time limit of four months. The Committee had further desired that the reasons for delay in furnishing the Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Notes should be thoroughly inquired into and accountability ensured. The Committee had also asked the Ministry to state the action taken to wipe out the pendency.

6. In their Action Taken Note, the Ministry have stated as under:—

“The submission of ATNs is being regularly reviewed in the Ministry through the mechanism of Standing Audit Committee and ATN Adalat. The Service HQs have been requested to ensure speedy response to audit paras. As a result of sustained efforts, audit paras in respect of C&AG report presented up to 2009 are down to 32. Taking into account the outstanding paras pertaining to the reports presented in 2010 & 2011, the total outstanding as on 31.05.2012 is 120.”

7. The Committee are constrained to note that though the Ministry have started reviewing the submission of Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Notes through the mechanism of standing Audit Committee and ATN Adalat, there is no appreciable improvement in the pendency position of Audit paras as there were 32 paras

pertaining to Audit Reports presented upto 2009 and as many as 120 Audit paras pending against the total Audit paras of 187 as on 31.05.2010. Obviously, the extant mechanism is far from effective and the Ministry need to streamline their system to reduce the pendency of Audit Reports/Paragraphs. The Action Taken Note of the Ministry is also conspicuously silent on the issue of inquiring into the reasons for delay in furnishing Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Notes and on the issue of accountability as recommended by the Committee earlier. The Committee deplore such cavalier attitude of the Ministry and reiterate that the Ministry of Defence should urgently devise an effective monitoring mechanism and streamline the procedure to deal with the Audit Reports/paragraphs and make concerted efforts to furnish the Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Notes within the prescribed time limit of four months. The Committee further recommend that the reasons for delay in furnishing the Remedial/Corrective Action Taken Note should be thoroughly inquired into and accountability ensured.

II. Induction of Basic Trainer Aircraft and Manufacturing of Intermediate jet Trainer

[Observation/Recommendation Para No. 9 of the 52nd Report
(15th Lok Sabha)]

8. The Committee in their Original Report had noted that the quality of training imparted to Indian Air Force cadets was adversely affected due to non-availability of modern aircraft. The HPT-32, a Basic Trainer Aircraft, which continued to be besieged with repeated engine problems had been grounded *w.e.f.* July, 2009. The Committee had been informed that the proposal for procurement of 75 modern Basic Trainer Aircraft had been approved by the Government. The procurement was at commercial negotiation stage and the aircraft was expected to be inducted for training by 2013. The Committee had also been informed that the case for indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft was being pursued with Hindustan Aeronautics Limited. Since aircraft is the most vital training aid in transforming a trainee cadet into a proficient pilot, it is imperative to ensure compatibility of the trainer aircraft with the latest technology to improve quality of training and smooth transition to sophisticated aircraft. Taking into consideration the present and long term need of Indian Air Force the Committee had recommended that the Basic Trainer Aircraft with latest avionics may be inducted for stage I training. The Committee had also urged the Ministry to steadfastly strive towards expeditious execution of the proposal so that modern Basic Trainer Aircraft becomes available for training during 2013. Further, the Committee had called for finalisation of the contract with Hindustan Aeronautics Limited for manufacturing of Intermediate Jet Trainer for Indian Air Force at the earliest with clear stipulation of timelines for manufacture of the said aircraft.

9. The Ministry in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:—

"(a) PC-7MK II of Pilatus Company of Switzerland with latest avionics has been short-listed for procurement as the Basic Trainer Aircraft for Indian Air Force. 75 aircraft are being procured to replace HPT-32 aircraft. The project contract was signed on 24 May, 2012. The first aircraft will be delivered by February, 2013 and delivery of all 75 aircraft will be completed by 2015.

(b) A proposal for production of 106 indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft at Design and Development (D&D) cost of Rs. 568.08 crore was approved in June, 2011. Subsequently, M/s. HAL requested for revision of the D&D cost from Rs. 568.08 crore to Rs. 659.46 crore. However, considering the high estimated cost as worked out on the basis of the DPR submitted by M/s. HAL, the proposal is being reviewed by the Ministry."

10. The Committee are distressed to note inordinate delay in induction of Trainer Aircraft—both imported as well as indigenously manufactured and the inability of the Ministry of Defence to foresee the implication of such delay on our defence preparedness. Further, the Ministry failed to replace the grounded HPT-32 Aircrafts by PC-7 MK-II. Worse, the inordinate delay in indigenisation of Trainer Aircraft after approval of design and development in June, 2011 led to cost escalation which cannot be condoned or overlooked considering the dire need for proper Basic Trainer Aircraft in the Indian Air Force for enhancing the skills of pilots and preventing aircraft accidents. The Committee, therefore, urge the Ministry to show a sense of urgency and finalise the proposal for production of 106 indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft with the HAL at the earliest. The Committee are also perturbed to note that the Action Taken Note furnished by the Ministry is silent on the issue of finalisation of the contract with HAL for manufacturing of Intermediate Jet Trainer with clear stipulation of timelines for manufacture of the said aircraft. The Committee deplore the unconscionable delay on the part of Ministry of Defence in induction of necessary trainer aircraft in the IAF and reiterate that the contract with HAL for manufacturing of Intermediate Jet Trainer for Indian Air Force should be finalised at the earliest with clear stipulation of timelines. The Committee would like to be apprised of the precise action taken in this regard.

III. Induction of Light Utility Helicopters

[Observation/Recommendation Para No. 10 of the 52nd Report (15th Lok Sabha)]

11. The Committee in their original Report had noted that Chetak helicopters inducted in Indian Air force in 1967 for imparting flying training to helicopter pilots. The training continued to be imparted in these helicopters without any replacement or modernization. The Ministry had informed the Committee that Chetak helicopters were still very much in operational service in frontline units and provided the lifeline to a number of personnel in extremely harsh terrain and weather environments. About the proposal to replace these vintage helicopters, the Committee had been informed that there was a plan to acquire 125 Light Utility Helicopters out of which 64 would be purchased and 61 to be manufactured by HAL. Since the helicopter pilots were being deprived of quality flying training on latest helicopters, the Committee had recommended that the proposal for induction of 125 Light Utility Helicopters may be finalised with a sense of urgency after obtaining all the necessary approval on top priority basis.

12. In their Action Taken Note, the Ministry have stated as under:—

"The case for procurement of 61 Light Utility Helicopters to replace Chetak Helicopters is at Design & Development (D&D) stage with HAL. HAL is in the process of procuring a suitable engine for Light Utility Helicopter through global tendering."

13. The Committee regret to note that Action Taken Note submitted by the Ministry has no mention of any proposal for purchasing the 64 Light Utility Helicopters. Worse, no sense of urgency has been shown to finalise manufacturing of remaining 61 Light Utility Helicopters by HAL and to fast-track the procurement of a suitable engine for this type of helicopter by the HAL despite knowing fully well that the Indian Air Force helicopter pilots are being deprived of the latest avionics with flight control systems and other state-of-the-art features. The Committee are of the considered view that the continuance of training of helicopter pilots in outdated helicopters would deprive them of the-state-of-the-art training and seriously jeopardise our air capability in competing with advance nations and in surmounting the emerging challenges to our national security. Further, such a delay would also incapacitate the Indian Air Force in handling emergency and relief and rescue operations in future, thereby compromising the security of the nation. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation that the Ministry should finalise the proposal for induction of 125 Light Utility Helicopters with a sense of urgency after obtaining the necessary approval on top priority basis.

CHAPTER II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Observation/Recommendation

In accordance with the recommendations made by the Public Accounts Committee in their 105th Report (Tenth Lok Sabha) the Ministries/Departments are required to furnish remedial/corrective Action Taken Notes to the Public Accounts Committee through the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) on those paragraphs of the Reports of the Comptroller & Auditor General of India (C&AG) which are not formally selected for examination by the Committee. With effect from March, 1996 such remedial/corrective ATNs are to be furnished within four months of the laying of the Audit Reports in Parliament. The Committee's examination of the subject has revealed that there has been inordinate delay on the part of various Ministries/Departments in furnishing the remedial/corrective ATNs within the prescribed time limit. As on 25th June, 2010, a total of 4191 audit paragraphs were pending with various Ministries/Departments upon which ATNs were to be furnished. Out of these pending paragraphs, 163 paras were pending with the Ministry of Defence.

[Para 01 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

As on 30.6.2010, 160 ATNs were pending against the Ministry of Defence.

Sd./-
Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that training to Pilots in IAF is covered in four stages. The initial and intermediate training is imparted in Stages I and II. Stages III and IV are 'applied' and 'advanced training' which involve training on specific stream/operational aircraft. The Committee's examination has revealed that the existing training policy in IAF does not meet the current and future requirements. The Committee are seriously concerned that training establishments are imparting training mostly, with outdated and ageing aircraft and IAF had not formulated any long term training plan for Pilots of fighter and other streams for developing its long term strategic objectives. Surprisingly, the Ministry claimed that long term training plan was not formulated mainly due to shortage/non-availability of trainer aircraft and delay in procurement of Advanced Jet Trainer. During oral evidence, the representatives of the services informed the Committee that the trainer aircraft HPT-32 which the Indian Air Force was using for more than two decades had been grounded due to unreliability of its

engine. As an alternative, IAF has been using Kiran Mark-I for basic training. For procurement of new basic trainer aircraft, negotiations were underway and the contract 'is expected to be finalised'. The Committee hope that by the time of presentation of this Report the contract would have been finalised. The Committee would like to be apprised about the decision taken in this regard. As regard the induction of Advanced Jet Trainer, the Committee were informed that the Hawk aircraft from British Aerospace were received in December, 2008 and deliveries from HAL are expected by 2012. The Intermediate Jet Trainer, to be designed and produced indigenously, is still reportedly under development. Having observed the chain of events as enumerated above, the Committee are unhappy to observe that IAF failed to plan a comprehensive LTTP covering not only the projected needs for trained Pilots but also the infrastructure required to be established including acquisition of trainer aircraft, explore alternative for the defective trainer aircraft and early induction of Advanced Jet Trainer to achieve its long term strategic goals. Keeping in view the rapid technological changes taking place and the burgeoning global security environment, the Committee recommend that IAF should take expeditious and effective measures and formulate a Long Term Training Plan to effectively address the requirement/deployment of Pilots for the present and the future. The Committee would like to be apprised of the concrete action taken to meet the training requirements of the IAF given the dynamic security challenges.

[Para 04 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

(a) A contract has been signed for the procurement of quantity—75 Basic Trainer Aircraft (PC-7 Mk II) of Pilatus Company of Switzerland. The first aircraft is likely to arrive by February, 2013 and first course on Basic Trainer Aircraft is planned for commencement in July, 2013.

(b) A proposal for production of 106 Indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft by HAL at Design & Development (D&D) cost of Rs. 568.08 crores was approved in June 2011. Subsequently, M/s. HAL requested for revision of the D&D cost from Rs. 568.08 crores to Rs. 659.46 crores. However, considering the high estimated cost, as worked out on the basis of the DPR submitted by M/s. HAL, the proposal is being reviewed by the Ministry.

(c) The case for procurement of 61 Light Utility Helicopters to replace Chetak helicopters is at Design & Development (D&D) stage with HAL. The project is delayed by two years mainly due to a delay in selection of engine by HAL.

(d) Mi-8 helicopters are planned to be replaced by Mi-17 V5 helicopter for State-III helicopter training by 2014-15. The procurement case is being progressed for seeking approval of the CCS.

(e) RFP has been issued on 06 September, 2012 for procurement of additional 14 Dornier aircraft to meet the transport pilot training.

(f) All An-32 aircraft which are used for Stage-III transport training along with Dornier 228 are already being refurbished in a phased manner.

(g) The IJT, Indigenous Design and Development project of HAL to replace the Kiran Mk I/IA aircraft is expected to replace the Kiran Mk I/IA by 2016.

(h) 66 Hawk AJTs have been inducted in IAF. Additional 40 Hawk AJTs are likely to commence induction in March, 2013 and complete delivery by April, 2016. All Hawk Stage-III fighter training has started in IAF since July, 2011. Hawk AJTs are fully used for fighter training along with its simulators. Additional 10 simulators are under process to be acquired.

(i) It is evident, from the above, that IAF is progressing with its plans to acquire replacement aircraft for meeting its training tasks in the future. By 2016, IAF will have a fleet of modern training aircraft and simulators to train its pilots for at least next 20 years.

(j) With the induction of latest aircraft and other weapon systems in its modernisation plans IAF has finalized its Long Term Training Plan (LTTP). Keeping the additional requirements in mind IAF is planning to increase the capacity of its Flying Training Establishments (FTEs). The capacity of Air Force Academy is planned to be increased to train total of 750 trainees from the present 480 trainees every six months. Out of these the strength of flying trainees is planned to be increased from the present 130 trainees to 225 trainees every six months. This will have a cascading effect on all downstream FTEs.

Sd/-
Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Observation/Recommendation

Another disquieting feature noticed by the Committee was that there were short-falls in fulfilling the training requirements. The number of Pilots trained in various stream during 2001-06 was much lower than the planned targets. IAF had planned to train 220 Pilots per year during 2001-05 and 110 Pilots in 2006 in one course. However, the number of Pilots trained in various streams during 2001-06 was lesser than the planned targets. The shortfall in achieving the training targets varied from 15 to 31 per cent. The Committee are also concerned to note that while IAF intend to increase the number of squadrons and propose acquisition of new aircraft, no tangible measures have been initiated to meet the new strategic needs based on the changing security perception. Further, the Committee note that the training establishments were unable to accommodate increased load of trainees due to limitations of air space/runway occupancy and other difficulties. Regrettably, IAF failed to ensure adequate level of intake of Pilot trainees through an effective recruitment strategy. The Committee are surprised to note that based on the actual resources made available to IAF to undertake the training task, the number of Pilot trainees are decided and as part of the long term plan, IAF proposes to increase the number of trainees from 260 to 350 pilots every year by 2017. However, the reply of the Ministry is silent about addressing the additional infrastructure required to meet

the increased inductions. The Committee, therefore, reiterate that the training infrastructure has to match the training needs of the enhanced number of trainees, which may require upgradation of air space/runway, modern gadgets, computer aided learning systems and extensive use of simulators and devising new syllabi to meet future requirements. The Committee would, therefore, like to be apprised of the action taken to meet the state-of-the-art training requirements of the IAF.

[Para 05 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

The current Air Force target to give training to 220 pilots every year was being achieved till December, 2011 in spite of grounding of the Basic Trainer aircraft (HPT-32) in July, 2009 and reversion to "All Jet Training" on Kiran Mk I aircraft. Since January, 2012 the pilot training has been reduced to 200 every year which is ten percent below the target. This was done for the first time in January, 2012 and is likely to continue till the Basic Trainer Aircraft joins IAF and stabilizes by 2014. This was necessitated due to low availability of trainer aircraft (Kiran Mk I) at present. The shortage of trainer aircraft is planned to be met as follows:—

(a) 75 PC-7 Mk II aircraft of Pilatus Company of Switzerland are being procured as the Basic Trainer Aircraft for IAF to replace HPT-32 aircraft. The project contract has been signed on 24 May, 2012. The first aircraft will be delivered by February, 2013 and delivery of all 75 aircraft will be completed by 2015.

(b) A proposal for production of 106 Indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft by HAL at a D&D cost of Rs. 568.08 crores was approved in June, 2011. Subsequently, M/s. HAL requested for revision of the D&D cost from Rs. 568.08 crores to Rs. 659.46 crores. However, considering the high estimated cost, as worked out on the basis of the DPR submitted by M/s. HAL, the proposal is being reviewed by the Ministry.

(c) The case for procurement of 61 Light Utility helicopters to replace Chetak helicopters is at Design & Development (D & D) stage with HAL. The project is delayed by two years mainly due to a delay in selection of engine by HAL.

(d) Mi-8 helicopters are planned to be replaced by Mi-17 V5 helicopter for Stage-III helicopter training by 2014-15. The procurement case is being progressed for seeking approval of the CCS.

(e) RFP has been issued on 06 September, 2012 for procurement of additional 14 Dornier aircraft to meet the transport pilot training.

(f) All An-32 aircraft which are used for Stage-III transport training along with Dornier 228 are already being refurbished in a phased manner.

(g) The IJT, Indigenous Design and Development project of HAL to replace the Kiran Mk I/IA aircraft is expected to replace the Kiran Mk I/IA by 2016.

(h) 66 Hawk AJTs have been inducted in IAF. Additional 40 Hawk AJTs are likely to commence induction in March, 2013 and complete delivery by April, 2016.

All Hawk Stage-III fighter training has started in IAF since July, 2011. Hawk AJTs are fully used for fighter training along with its simulators. Additional 10 Simulators are under process to be acquired.

(i) It is evident, from the above, that IAF is progressing with its plans to acquire replacement aircraft for meeting its training tasks in the future. By 2016, IAF will have a fleet of modern training aircraft and simulators to train its pilots for at least next 20 years.

(j) With the induction of latest aircraft and other weapon systems in its modernization plans, IAF has finalized its Long Term Training Plan (LTTP). The syllabus modification of AJTs has already been achieved and for the other trainer aircraft shall be undertaken along with their induction. Keeping the additional requirements in mind IAF is planning to increase the capacity of its Flying Training Establishments (FTEs). The capacity of Air Force Academy is planned to be increased to train total of 750 trainees from the present 480 trainees every six months. Out of these the strength of flying trainees is planned to be increased from the present 130 trainees to 225 trainees every six months. This will have a cascading effect on all downstream FTEs.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012)]

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee also note that the process for acquisition of new aircraft has already been started and IAF is required to train pilots capable of flying these aircraft to meet future requirements. However, due to limitations of air space/runway occupancy and other constraints, the Forward Training Establishments were unable to accommodate increased load of trainees. The Committee also note that the existing maximum capacity of 270 trainees per year will be inadequate to meet the requirements of trained pilots which will substantially increase during 2008-18 due to proposed expansion and new acquisition of aircraft and vacancies on account of attrition of pilots. In this connection, explaining the steps being taken to bridge the gap in training of Pilots, the representative of IAF during evidence informed the Committee that most of the training aircraft would be in place by the end of 2011 to beef up the flying training and simultaneously the infrastructure requirement at Air Force Academy are also being upgraded. Further, IAF has started Short Service Commission for male pilots in 2008 to increase the pilot in take. The Committee are also informed that IAF would be able to fill up all the vacancies of pilots by 2015-17. The Committee, while noting the measures being taken, are of the considered view that a lot still needs to be done. The Committee therefore recommend that the proposed upgradation of infrastructure at Air Force Academy may be undertaken on priority basis and the project completed within a specified time limit. A suitable monitoring mechanism may be put in place for regular monitoring of the project. Further, the process of induction of new generation training aircraft for various stages of training should be fast tracked. Also, there is an urgent need to

devise an incentivized mechanism so that the Pilot may not leave the service after training and induction into service.

[Para 06 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

The proposed upgradation of infrastructure at AFA is being undertaken on priority basis. A project management team has been formed for regular monitoring of the project.

2. The progress on induction of new generation training aircraft for various stages of training has been made as mentioned at point 5 above.

3. In addition following measures are being taken to stop pilots from leaving after training:—

(a) The pilots are being taught the traditions and customs of the service. This will help in instilling a sense of pride in uniform and aid in retention of the individual.

(b) More transparency at all levels are being exercised, every individual has an avenue to write freely about any issues which he is concerned about, directly to the CAS, AOP, DG (I&S) etc. on their websites.

(c) Improvement in the quality of accommodation and other admin services being provided to the aircrew at the Station level.

(d) Young aircrew are given chance to fly a modern generation ac.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P0/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that the number of pilots failing to complete their training successfully was significantly higher than the assessed average wastage rates. Under Stage I training, which is common to all the streams, the actual wastage rate varied between 16.20% and 26%. Under Stages II and III training, the actual wastage rate in respect of Fighter, Transport and Helicopter was also higher than the assessed average wastage rate. According to the Ministry average wastage rates are never to be considered as a factor for conduct of training and training standards are never altered to suit wastage rates in IAF. Further, during the last five years, the wastage rate has been brought down to 15% from an earlier average of 25% by improving training aids and inducting simulators. The Committee are of the view that the wastage over and above the norms at Stage III level of training is a reflection on the efficiency of the pilot training system since it has a direct impact upon the operational strengths as well. Since the introduction of better training aids and simulators have helped IAF in reducing

the wastage rate, the Committee expect that concerted efforts will be made by IAF to introduce modern training methodologies, contemporary training aids and computer based systems will be used in all the FTEs to confine the wastage rate within the accepted limits.

[Para 07 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

All concrete steps to modernize IAF's training methodology so as to reduce the wastage rate during flying training are being taken. The procurement of trainer aircraft with modern simulators is already under process. The various steps taken to improve the flying skills of the pilots are enumerated in the succeeding paragraphs:—

(a) IAF is acquiring modern aircraft and simulators for meeting its training tasks in the future. By 2016, IAF will have a fleet of modern training aircraft and simulators to train its pilots for at least next 20 years. With the induction of latest aircraft and other weapon systems in its modernisation plans IAF has finalised its Long Term Training Plan (LTTP).

(b) Simulator training has been given a lot of importance in all stages of training. Towards this, a number of appropriate simulators have been and are being procured to enhance the quality of training. As flying training is carried out in graduated steps called Stages of training, each six monthly stage has its unique requirements. Some stages are already in the process of being upgraded with a futuristic vision while others need replacement of assets. All *ab-initio* flying trainees are exposed to Disorientation training in the DISO Simulator.

(c) The advanced jet trainer Hawk Mk 132 has already been inducted into the IAF and is performing well in the training of fighter pilots. This stage of training has its own simulators and computerized training package. Additional 10 simulators are under process to be acquired.

(d) The simulators for Kiran aircraft have been refurbished and installed at AFA and Hakimpet.

(e) Modernisation plans are already being exercised in all Training Establishments to upgrade classroom environs. Computer Aided Learning Systems (CALs) will be used in a big way with 3D graphics and animation. The IAF with its own communication network (AFNET) will be able to work in a high speed data network to the extent of conducting specialist and guest lectures through video conferencing. Networking of student stations will greatly enhance assessment and assimilation production capability. Self study will become simpler. All these methods of modern training are already being put into practice.

(f) The process for replacement of the basic trainer HPT-32 with a modern state-of-the-art turboprop trainer that has its own STE and CALs as part of the package has already commenced. A contract to procure 75 PC-7 Mk II was signed with Pilatus Company of Switzerland on 24 May, 2012 and delivery of these aircraft would be in 2013. This induction would provide the IAF with an aircraft with the latest technology

required for pilot training. This package would include a Full Mission Simulator, Avionics Part Task Trainers and Cockpit Procedure Trainer simulators. All briefings and de-briefings would be computerized based and each pilot would be able to evaluate his own flying sitting on ground.

(g) The Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT) is being developed by HAL to replace the ageing Kirans. The IJT would have its own simulator and CALS as part of the package. One Fixed Base Full Mission Simulator (FBFMS) has been contracted for training along with the 12 LSP IJT. In addition, 01 Fixed Base Full Mission Simulator (FBFMS), 03 Cockpit Procedure Trainers (CPT) and 03 Avionics Part Task Trainer (APTT) is being proposed to be procured with the additional 73 Series Production aircraft.

(h) Mi-8 helicopters are planned to be replaced by the Mi-17 V5 helicopter along with simulators for Stage-III helicopter training by 2014-15.

Sd./-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II) 09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Observation/Recommendation

During the period 2001-06, 33 aircraft accidents were reported in the *ab-initio* training fleets in IAF in all the three streams (Fighter, Transport and Helicopter streams). The Committee observes that large scale cannibalization was being resorted to at various FTEs and operational squadrons while carrying out first and second line servicing of aircraft to avoid Aircraft on Ground. An expert Committee in IAF has attributed large scale cannibalization as one of the reasons for aircraft accidents. The representative of IAF admitted during oral testimony that cannibalization noticed by Audit was high primarily due to shortages of spares to maintain Kiran aircraft but assured that aircraft accidents do not occur due to cannibalization of spares. To ensure that aircraft accidents do not occur due to cannibalization of components, the Committee recommends that the requirement of demand and supply of spares be realistically projected and it must be ensured that spares in buffer are always available before stocks deplete to unacceptable levels. Further, cannibalization of spares in training aircraft may be resorted to in exceptional circumstances only.

[Para 08 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

Flying Data

After the year 2006, Kiran aircraft flying itself was being reduced and a large number of aircraft were put on storage. From a total flying hrs. of 17179 in 2006, flying was reduced to 11007 hrs. in 2008. However, due to grounding of HPT-32, the only option was to revive the Kiran ac fleet. More than 40 aircraft under storage were brought on line and 'All Jet Flying' commenced since 2010.

2. Increased Spares Procurement

(a) Spares procurement through Life of Type Review (LOTR) 2006-17 has been done and 97% of the spares contracted have been received effectively leading to

higher production of overhauled rotables for aircraft and engines, ensuring higher availability of components of FTEs. The details of the line procured and expenditure incurred is given in the table below:—

| Sl. No. | LOTR 2006-17 | Lines Contracted | Expenditure in Rs. |
|---------|--------------|------------------|----------------------------|
| 1. | 12 contracts | 222 lines | 1097316963 (109.73 crores) |

(b) After commencement of 'All Jet Flying', additional 13 (LOTRs) has been raised for 2010-17 to cater for higher utilization rate of Kiran 1/1A ac. Out of 13 LOTRs, contracts (total 37 contracts) against 11 LOTRs have been placed on vendors abroad against an expenditure of Rs. 30 crore. These contracts cater for 86 lines of critical spares which would ensure further increase in the rotables availability at FTEs and another 125 lines are under procurement. A total of 220 lines would be procured against the total expenditure of Rs. 82 crore.

(c) The "Reduced to Procedure" (RTP) route is also followed to ensure availability of break-down spares for critical rotables and engines.

3. Monitoring and Control of Cannibalization (MCC):

(a) Only the CEO of the station in consultation with Command HQ authorizes cannibalization for which documentation is mandatory.

(b) MCC allots a component/rotable to be cannibalized from a particular ac after checking the life of the component, state of the ac from which the items is to be cannibalized and any other reasons affecting the state of the donor and done ac.

(c) Before cannibalization, serviceability of the component to be cannibalized is mandatorily checked by a supervisor.

(d) After cannibalized, serviceability of the component and the entire system is re-checked by a worker and supervisor on that particular ac.

(e) If the component to be cannibalized warrants an air-test, the ac is air-tested by an experienced pilot to confirm the serviceability of the affected system and the ac for its entire envelop.

(f) All cases of accidents are investigated and the cause is ascertained through a Court of Inquiry. Till date, in none of the cases, the cause of an accident has been proven to be due to cannibalization of a component.

4. From the above measures, the following has been achieved:—

(a) There is a drastic drop in cannibalization of rotables at FTEs for Kiran Mk I and Kiran Mk II ac.

(b) Drop in cannibalization can be attributed to availability of rotables at FTEs as buffer stock.

(c) Increased availability of rotables at FTEs could be achieved through procurement of a large number of spares realistically required and higher productions of rotables by overhaul/repair agencies (HAL and 4 BRD).

(d) Strict control and monitoring of cannibalization procedure at FTEs is being adhered to at all levels.

5. Cannibalization is no more a way of life for maintenance of trainer ac at FTEs but is resorted to only as and when required under exceptional circumstances.

Sd/-
Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee are concerned that IAF failed to procure/upgrade Simulators for trainer aircraft for more than a decade thus depriving the trainees of a safe and non-hazardous means of learning to fly aircraft. Simulators are the only safe means by which a pilot can practice procedures which would otherwise be hazardous and at times, impossible to attempt in the air. While conceding that adequate simulators were not available in IAF, the Ministry claimed that the use of modern simulator technology was not readily available to be adapted for training pattern. The simulators available with IAF faced upgrade inabilities due to obsolescence. DRDO which initially accepted the task of simulator upgradation of lone Kiran, later expressed inability to upgrade the simulator. IAF in the meantime identified a private vendor, who developed and supplied 18 Kiran and HPT-32 flying simulators which have been operationalized at all FTEs. Since flight training simulators are cost effective and safer way of giving training, the Committee recommend that the desired upgradation in Flying Training Establishments along with fine tuning of the training syllabus may be carried out in view of the proposed induction of new aircraft and they be apprised in due course.

[Para 11 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

- (a) With the induction of latest aircraft and other weapon systems in its modernisation plans IAF has finalised its Long Term Training Plan (LTTP). The syllabus modification for AJTs has already been achieved and for the other trainer aircraft shall be undertaken along with their induction. Keeping the additional requirements in mind IAF is planning to increase the capacity of its Flying Training Establishments (FTEs). The capacity of Air Force Academy is planned to be increased to train total of 750 trainees from the present 480 trainees every six months. Out of these the strength of flying trainees is planned to be increased from the present 130 trainees to 225 trainees every six months. This will have a cascading effect on all downstream FTEs.
- (b) The present FTEs are capable of taking on training of trainee pilots with an induction of 130 trainees per course. Once this figure increases to 225 trainees per course the requirements of all Stage-II and Stage-III training establishments will have to correspondingly increased to take on additional task. IAF embarked on this task of decongestion of downstream FTEs in early 2010 and finalised it by July, 2011. The broad plan is as follows:—
 - (i) Entire Stage-I training will continue to be at Air Force Academy at Hyderabad.

- (ii) Fighters—Stage-II training will be conducted at a new IAF Base at Deesa in Gujarat. The Stage-III training will be conducted at Bidar in Karnataka and Kalaikunda in West Bengal.
 - (iii) Transports—The entire Stage-II and Stage-III Dornier aircraft training will be conducted at Yelahanka. Stage-III training on An-32 aircraft will be conducted at Jorhat in Assam.
 - (iv) Helicopters—The entire Stage-II and Stage-III helicopter training is planned to be conducted at Hakimpet in Hyderabad. The Stage-III helicopter training is planned to shift from Yelahanka to Hakimpet.
- (c) The infrastructure development at the Air Force Academy, Deesa, Kalaikunda and other IAF bases is likely to be achieved by 2016. Thereafter, IAF will be able to take on increased training to meet its requirements in a phased manner in the years to come.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

CHAPTER III

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE
DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES
RECEIVED FROM THE GOVERNMENT

—NIL—

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

Observation/Recommendation

Asked to furnish the reasons for delay in submission of Action Taken Notes, Ministry submitted that the delay occurred due to the time taken in coordination with the various units/field formations of the Ministry. The Committee are not convinced with the reasons put forth by the Ministry of Defence for pendency of a large number of audit paragraphs. Apparently, there is lack of coordination amongst various divisions/units/formations and a poor command structure as a total of 187 paragraphs were pending with the Ministry of Defence as on 31st May, 2010. The Committee are of the considered view that coordination with the various agencies is an administrative issue and therefore the Ministry has to take appropriate steps to resolve their internal matters within the stipulated time frame. While expressing their displeasure over the mounting pendencies, the Committee desire that the Ministry of Defence should urgently devise an effective monitoring mechanism and streamline the procedure to deal with the Audit Reports/paragraphs and make concerted efforts to furnish the ATNs to the Audit within the time limit of four months. The Committee further desire that the reasons for delay in furnishing the ATNs to Audit should be thoroughly inquired into and accountability ensured. The Committee would like to be apprised, within three months of the presentation of this Report, of the action taken to wipe out the pendency.

[Para 2 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

The submission of ATNs is being regularly reviewed in the Ministry through the mechanism of Standing Audit Committee and ATN Adalat. The service HQs have been requested to ensure speedy response to audit paras. As a result of sustained efforts, audit paras in respect of C&AG Report presented up to 2009 are down to 32. Taking into account the outstanding paras pertaining to the reports presented in 2010 and 2011, the total outstanding as on 31.5.2012 is 120.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Comments of the Committee

Please see Para No. 7 of Chapter I.

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee are concerned to note that the quality of training imparted to IAF cadets was adversely affected due to non-availability of modern aircraft. The HPT-32 a basic trainer aircraft used for training of IAF cadets is technologically outdated and beset by flight safety hazards. The aircraft which continued to be besieged with repeated engine problems has been grounded *w.e.f.* July, 2009. The Committee have been informed that the proposal for procurement of 75 modern basic trainer aircraft has been approved by the Government. The procurement is at commercial negotiation stage and the aircraft is expected to be inducted for training by 2013. The Committee have also been informed that the case for indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft is being pursued with HAL. Since aircraft is the most vital training aid in transforming a trainee cadet into a proficient pilot, it is imperative to ensure compatibility of the trainer aircraft with the latest technology to improve quality of training and smooth transition to sophisticated aircraft. Taking into consideration the present and long term needs of IAF, the Committee recommend that the Basic Trainer Aircraft with latest avionics may be inducted for stage-I training. The Ministry should steadfastly strive towards expeditious execution of the proposal so that modern basic trainer aircraft becomes available for training during 2013. Further, the contract with HAL for manufacturing of Intermediate Jet Trainer for IAF may be finalized at the earliest with clear stipulation of timelines for manufacture of the said aircraft. All the desired initiatives should be taken within the specified time limit and the Committee informed accordingly.

[Para 9 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

(a) PC — 7 Mk II of Pilatus Company of Switzerland with latest avionics has been short listed for procurement as the Basic Trainer Aircraft for IAF. 75 aircrafts are being procured to replace HPT-32 aircraft. The project contract was signed on 24 May, 2012. The first aircraft will be delivered by February 2013 and delivery of all 75 aircraft will be completed by 2015.

(b) A proposal for production of 106 indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft at Design and Development (D&D) cost of Rs. 568.08 crores was approved in June, 2011. Subsequently, M/s. HAL requested for revision of the D&D cost from Rs. 568.08 crores to Rs. 659.46 crores. However, considering the high estimated cost as worked out on the basis of the DPR submitted by M/s. HAL, the proposal is being reviewed by the Ministry.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Comments of the Committee

Please see Para No. 10 of Chapter I.

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that Chetak helicopters were inducted in IAF in 1967 for imparting flying training to helicopter pilots. Worse, training continues to be imparted in these helicopters without any replacement or modernization. When asked about the justification, the Ministry informed the Committee that Chetak helicopters still very much in operational service in frontline units and provides the lifeline to a number of personnel in extremely harsh terrain and weather environments. Asked about the proposal to replace these vintage helicopters, the representative of IAF informed the Committee that there is a plan to acquire 125 Light Utility Helicopters out of which 64 will be purchased and 61 to be manufactured by HAL. Since the helicopter Pilots are being deprived of quality flying training on latest helicopters, the Committee recommend that the proposal for induction of 125 Light Utility Helicopters may be finalized with a sense of urgency after obtaining all the necessary approval on top priority basis.

[Para 10 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

The case for procurement of 61 Light Utility Helicopters to replace Chetak helicopters is at Design & Development (D&D) stage with the HAL. HAL is in the process of procuring a suitable engine for Light Utility Helicopter through global tendering.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 13 of Chapter I.

CHAPTER V

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note with concern the discrepancy in the number of paragraphs pending with the Ministry of Defence. According to the Department of Expenditure 163 paragraphs were pending with the Ministry of Defence whereas the Audit has indicated the figures as 187. The Committee, therefore, desire that the discrepancy in the number of pending audit paragraphs should be reconciled expeditiously by the Ministry of Defence in consultation with the Audit and the Monitoring Cell and the correct figures intimated to the Committee while furnishing the action taken replies on this Report.

[Para 3 of the Fifty-second Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(15th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

While the present outstanding has been reconciled with the figures being maintained by Monitoring Cell, Ministry of Finance, there is some variation in the figure being maintained by DGADS and the same is being reconciled.

Sd/-

Joint Secretary

[Ministry of Defence, OM No. 537/DO(P)/D(Air-II)/09, dt. 19.12.2012]

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 3 of Chapter I.

NEW DELHI;
19 March, 2013

28 Phalgun, 1934 (Saka)

DR. MURLIMANO HAR JOSHI
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

APPENDIX I

MINUTES OF THE TWENTY-SEVENTH SITTING OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2012-13) HELD ON 19TH MARCH, 2013

The Committee sat on Tuesday, the 19th March, 2013 from 1500 hrs. to 1615 hrs. in Room No. '62', Parliament House, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi — *Chairman*

MEMBERS

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Anandrao Vithoba Adsul
3. Shri Sandeep Dikshit
4. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
5. Shri Shripad Yesso Naik
6. Shri Abhijit Mukherjee
7. Shri Ashok Tanwar
8. Dr. Girija Vyas

Rajya Sabha

9. Shri Prasanta Chatterjee
10. Shri Prakash Javadekar
11. Shri J. D. Seelam
12. Shri N. K. Singh

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Devender Singh — *Joint Secretary*
2. Shri Abhijit Kumar — *Director*
3. Shri M. L. K. Raja — *Deputy Secretary*
4. Shri D. R. Mohanty — *Deputy Secretary*
5. Smt. A. Jyothirmayi — *Deputy Secretary*
6. Shri S. L. Singh — *Under Secretary*
7. Smt. Anju Kukreja — *Under Secretary*

Representatives of the office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India

1. Ms. Shubha Kumar — Director General (Report Central)
2. Shri Venkatesh Mohan — Director General of Audit
3. Ms. Anim Cherian — Principal Director (ST)
4. Shri Rajiv Kumar Pandey — Principal Director of Audit

2. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members and the representatives of the Office of the C&AG of India to the sitting of the Committee. The Chairman, then, apprised that the meeting had been convened to consider the following Draft Reports of the Committee:—

- | | | | |
|--------|--|-----|-----|
| (i) | *** | *** | *** |
| (ii) | *** | *** | *** |
| (iii) | *** | *** | *** |
| (iv) | *** | *** | *** |
| (v) | *** | *** | *** |
| (vi) | *** | *** | *** |
| (vii) | Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Fifty-second Report (15th Lok Sabha) on ‘Training of Pilots in the Indian Air Force’; | | |
| (viii) | *** | *** | *** |
| (ix) | *** | *** | *** |
| (x) | *** | *** | *** |

3. Giving an overview of the issues contained in the Draft Reports and the comments of the Committee thereupon, the Chairman solicited the views/suggestions of the Members.

4. After some discussions, the Committee adopted the above mentioned Draft Reports. The Committee, then, authorized the Chairman to finalise the Reports in the light of the factual verifications, if any, made by the Audit and present them to Parliament on a convenient date.

5. The Chairman thanked the Members for their active participation in the consideration and adoption of the Reports.

The Committee then adjourned.

APPENDIX II

(Vide para 5 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR FIFTY-SECOND REPORT (FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

| | |
|--|-------------------|
| (i) Total No. of Observations/Recommendations | 11 |
| (ii) Observations/Recommendations of the Committee which have been accepted by the Government: | |
| | Total : 07 |
| Para Nos. 1, 4-8 and 11 | Percentage—63.63% |
| (iii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government: | |
| | —NIL— |
| | Total : 0 |
| | Percentage—0% |
| (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration: | |
| | Total : 03 |
| Para Nos. 2, 9 and 10 | Percentage—27.27% |
| (v) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies: | |
| | Total : 01 |
| Para No. 3 | Percentage—9.10% |

PARLIAMENTARY PUBLICATIONS CAN ALSO BE OBTAINED FROM THE FOLLOWING AUTHORISED AGENTS:—

| Sl.No. | Name of Agent | Sl.No. | Name of Agent |
|---------------|---|---------------|--|
| | ANDHRA PRADESH | 13. | M/s. Jayna Book Depot, Chowk Chhapparwala, Bank Street, Karol Bagh, New Delhi-110 005. |
| 1. | M/s. Ashok Book Centre, Benz Circle, Vasavya Nagar, Vijaywada-520 006 (AP). | 14. | M/s. Standard Book Co., 125, Municipal Market, Connaught Place, P.B. No. 708, New Delhi-110 001 (T. No. 23411919). |
| | BIHAR | 15. | M/s. D.K. Agencies (P) Ltd., A/15-17, Mohan Garden, Najafgarh Road, New Delhi-110 059. |
| 2. | M/s. Progressive Book Centre, Zila School, Pani Tanki Chowk, Ramna, Muzaffarpur-842 002 (Bihar). | 16. | M/s. Vijay Book Service, C-D/123/C, Pitam Pura, New Delhi-110 034. |
| | DELHI | | MADHYA PRADESH |
| 3. | M/s. Jain Book Agency, C-9, Prem House, Connaught Place, P.B. No. 1113, New Delhi-110 001. | 17. | M/s. Suvidha Law House, 28, Malviya Nagar, Roshanpura, Bhopal-462 003. |
| 4. | M/s. Bookwell, 2/72, Sant Nirankari Colony, Kingsway Camp, Delhi-110 009. | | MAHARASHTRA |
| 5. | M/s. Rajendra Book Agency, IV-D-50, Lajpat Nagar, Old Double Storey, New Delhi-110 024 (T. Nos. 26412362 & 26412131). | 18. | M/s. Usha Book Depot, 585/A, Chitra Bazar, Khan House, P.B. No. 2621, Mumbai-400 002. |
| 6. | M/s. Central News Agency Pvt. Ltd., P-23, Connaught Circus, New Delhi-110 001. | 19. | M/s. Jaina Book Agency (India), 649-A, Girgaum Road, Opp. 2nd Dhobi Talao Lane, Mumbai-400 002. |
| 7. | The Manager, M/s. Books India Corporation, Publishers, Importers & Exporters, L-27, Shastri Nagar, Delhi-110 052. | | PUDUCHERRY |
| 8. | M/s. Sangam Book Depot, LG-3, Akarshan Bhawan, 23, Ansari Road, Darya Ganj, New Delhi-110 002. | 20. | Editor of Debates, Legislative Assembly Department, Puducherry-605 001. |
| 9. | M/s. Biblia Impex Pvt. Ltd., 2/18, Ansari Road, New Delhi-110 002 (T.No. 23262515). | | TAMILNADU |
| 10. | M/s. Universal Book Traders, 80, Gokhale Market, Opp. New Courts, Delhi-110 054 (T. No. 23911966). | 21. | M/s. M.M. Subscription Agencies, 123, Third Street, Tatabad, Coimbatore-641 012. |
| 11. | M/s. Seth & Co., Room No. 31D, Block-B, Delhi High Court, Sher Shah Road, New Delhi-110 003. | 22. | M/s. C. Sitaraman & Co., 73/37, Royappettah High Road, Chennai-600 014. |
| 12. | M/s. Dhanwantra Medical & Law House, 592, Lajpat Rai Market, Delhi-110 006 (T. No. 23866768). | | UTTAR PRADESH |
| | | 23. | M/s. Law Publishers, Sardar Patel Marg, P.B. No. 1077, Allahabad (UP). |
| | | 24. | M/s. Ram Advani Bookseller, Mayfair Building, Hazrat Ganj, GPO Box No. 154, Lucknow-226 001. |