

**CLEANLINESS AND SANITATION ON
INDIAN RAILWAYS**

**[ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE
OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF
THE COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR
EIGHTY-THIRD REPORT (FOURTEENTH
LOK SABHA)]**

**MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS
(RAILWAY BOARD)**

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2009-10)**

TWENTY-FIRST REPORT

FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

TWENTY-FIRST REPORT
PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2009-10)

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)
CLEANLINESS AND SANITATION ON INDIAN
RAILWAYS

[ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE
OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE
COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR
EIGHTY-THIRD REPORT
(FOURTEENTH LOK SABHA)]

MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (RAILWAY BOARD)



*Presented to Lok Sabha on 29 April, 2010
Laid in Rajya Sabha on 29 April, 2010*

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

April, 2010/Vaisakha, 1932 (Saka)

P.A.C. NO. 1916

Price: Rs.60/-

© 2010 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Thirteenth Edition) and Printed by the General Manager, Government of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi-110 002

CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2009-10)	(iii)
INTRODUCITON	(v)
CHAPTER I. Report	1
CHAPTER II. Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government	10
CHAPTER III. Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government	31
CHAPTER IV. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration	34
CHAPTER V. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies	40
APPENDICES	
I. Minutes of the Eleventh Sitting of Public Accounts Committee (2009-10) held on 26.4.2010	41
II. Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Eighty-third Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha)	44

COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2009-2010)

*Shri Gopinath Munde— *Chairman*

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Anandrao Vithoba Adsul
3. Dr. Baliram
4. Shri Khagen Das
5. Shri Naveen Jindal
6. Shri Satpal Maharaj
7. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
8. Dr. K. Sambasiva Rao
9. Shri Jaswant Singh
10. Shri Jitendra Singh (Alwar)
11. Kunwar Rewati Raman Singh
12. Shri Yashwant Sinha
13. Shri K. Sudhakaran
14. Dr. M. Thambidurai
15. Shri Aruna Kumar Vundavalli

Rajya Sabha

16. Shri Prasanta Chatterjee
17. Shri Sharad Anantrao Joshi
- \$18. Vacant
19. Shri Shanta Kumar
20. Dr. K. Malaisamy
21. Shri N.K. Singh
22. Prof. Saif-ud-Din Soz

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Ashok Sarin — *Joint Secretary*
2. Shri Raj Shekhar Sharma — *Director*
3. Shri D.R. Mohanty — *Under Secretary*

* Appointed as the Chairman of the Committee *w.e.f.* 6th January, 2010 *vice* Shri Jaswant Singh resigned from the Chairmanship of the Committee.

\$ *Vice* Shri Ashwani Kumar retired from Rajya Sabha *w.e.f.* 9th April, 2010.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Public Accounts Committee (2009-10), having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Twenty-first Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Eighty-third Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on “Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways”.

2. This Eighty-third Report was presented to Lok Sabha on 20.2.2009. Replies of the Government to the Observations/Recommendations contained in their Report were received on 30.10.2009. The Committee considered and adopted the Twenty-first Report at their sitting held on 26th April, 2010. Minutes of the sitting are given at Appendix-I.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

5. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observation/Recommendations contained in the Eighty-third Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) is given at Appendix-II.

NEW DELHI;
26 April, 2010

6 Vaisakha, 1932 (Saka)

GOPINATH MUNDE
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

CHAPTER I

REPORT

This Report of the Public Accounts Committee deals with the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Eighty-third Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on "**Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways**".

2. The Eighty-third Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 20.2.2009. It contained 20 Observations/Recommendations. Action Taken Notes have been received from the Ministry of Railways in respect of all the Observations/Recommendations and are broadly categorized as follows:

- (i) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government.

Sl. Nos. 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10,11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 19 and 20

**Total: 14
Chapter-II**

- (ii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government.

Sl. Nos. 2 and 17

**Total: 2
Chapter-III**

- (iii) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.

Sl. Nos. 1, 3, 9 and 18

**Total: 4
Chapter-IV**

- (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies.

Nil

**Total: Nil
Chapter-V**

3. The Eighty-third Report of the Committee was based on Audit review of the C&AG relating to Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways. The Audit review was conducted to assess whether the plans and policies framed to maintain cleanliness and management of waste generated in railway stations and in trains were adequate, the measures taken on Cleanliness and Sanitation by Indian Railways at

railway stations and the feed back mechanism was adequate and useful in improving the system. The detailed examination of the subject by the Committee had revealed various shortcoming/lapses on Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways and the Committee had accordingly given their Observations/Recommendations in the Eighty-third Report.

GIST OF THE COMMITTEE'S OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

4. Some of the important Observations/Recommendations made by the Committee in their Eighty-third Report were as under:—

- The Ministry of Railways should strengthen co-ordination efforts and put in place an institutionalized mechanism at the Apex level dedicated towards Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways.
- The Ministry of Railways should ensure that the Housekeeper should undertake periodic inspection within the trains several times a day. He should also carry and display a checklist of his inspected items which may be submitted to the concerned authorities at terminal stations.
- The Ministry of Railways should frame a policy on Waste Management and lay down a mechanism whereby the quantum of garbage generated on stations (including garbage collected from trains and disposed off at the nominated stations) can be assessed realistically so that adequate collection, segregation and disposal facilities along with necessary infrastructure can be put in place.
- The Ministry should outlay a dedicated budget exclusively meant for sanitation and cleanliness on Indian Railways with a provision for year-wise increment on the same.
- The Ministry should draw up action plan for provision of setting up adequate infrastructure viz., water supply, washable aprons, drains and sewerage system and machines alongwith conducive platform surfaces for each station duly prioritizing requirements.
- The Ministry should evolve a clear-cut and effective promotional policy for Safaiwalas to boost their morale towards their duty.
- The Ministry should strengthen and modernize the existing mechanism of grievance redressal. The Ministry should also ensure that the existing complaint redressal system is modernized with effective use of technology.
- The Ministry should take steps to reduce the shortcomings of mechanized cleaning in various A and B category stations. The Ministry should also ensure that suitable infrastructure is laid down to carry out mechanized cleaning on all selected stations.

5. The Action Taken Notes furnished by the Ministry of Railways have been reproduced in the relevant Chapters of this Report. In the succeeding paragraphs, the Committee have dealt with action taken by the Government on some of their Observations/Recommendations which need reiteration or merit comments.

A. INADEQUACY OF STANDARDS, ACTION PLAN AND NORMS ON CLEANLINESS

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1, Para No.116)

6. Consequent upon the detailed examination of the subject, the Committee in their Eighty-third Report had observed that Indian Railways were yet to adopt any standards or performance indicators (*i.e.* the expected quality of the outcome) for any cleanliness related activities carried out in various stations and in trains against which the actual performance could be judged. The Committee had further noted that standards for supervision were also not prescribed by Railways for any cleanliness related activity on stations and in trains. Regarding the issue of prescribing physical benchmarks for the standard of cleanliness in stations and trains, the Committee had desired that Ministry must resort out-of-box thinking on this issue and must display readiness and swiftness to measure the sanitary conditions. The Committee had further recommended that the Divisional General Managers should carry out daily routine checks and inspections at least once in every fortnight which should be video recorded to clearly keep a track record of the sanitation levels available on the platform and Railway premises. The Committee had also desired that besides vigorously following the 'Clean Hour Concept', the recommendations given by the Task Force constituted to address the issues of cleanliness, gadgets and manpower should be executed in letter and spirit.

7. The Ministry in their Action Taken Note on the aforementioned recommendation have stated as under:—

"There are frequent checks on the standards of cleanliness at different levels which has lifted up the cleanliness standard considerably in the recent times. Various measures *e.g.* machine cleaning, outsources cleaning though reputed and experienced agencies etc. have been taken to achieve this objective. However, it is not feasible to quantify or lay down a benchmark for this. Providing CCTV Cameras for this activity is also not feasible as CCTV cameras are also provided/proposed to be provided for ensuring security in station premises. Both the functions by one agency will not be possible.

With a view to improve the cleanliness and hygiene standard in coaching trains, a number of policy decisions have been taken by the Ministry for use of standard mechanized cleaning systems and also regular attention on board as well as on enroute nominated stations. With these schemes, it is possible to standardize the equipment and resources to be used by each of the Railways, requisite man power, use of standard cleaning process and other required resources to sustain the quality of work. These schemes will ensure improved cleaning of the coaches before start of journey, enroute attention after certain kms. of travel and also in select trains, regular attention by professional on board house keeping team.

In order to make adequate assessment of the cleaning quality for sustained improvement, scheme also incorporates the system of monitoring each of the activity of cleanliness and hygiene using a score card and a feedback from the

passengers. The score card maintained by the coaching depot will help assess the standard of the cleanliness and also the passenger satisfaction".

8. The Ministry have further stated as under:

"Zonal Railways have been instructed to address the issue and take proper remedial action. In order to improve upon the standards of Cleanliness and Sanitation, mechanized cleaning of train rakes has been implemented on 41 coaching depots over Indian Railways. Besides, On Board Housekeeping Services (OBHS) for frequent cleaning of coach toilets, doorways, aisles and passenger compartments during the run of the trains has also been so far implemented on 107 train pairs".

9. The Committee note that the Railways have initiated various measures viz., machine cleaning, outsourced cleaning through reputed and experienced agencies etc. for streamlining the system of cleanliness and sanitation on Stations and in trains. Besides, mechanized cleaning of train rakes has been implemented on 41 coaching depots on Indian Railways and On Board House Keeping Service (OBHS) has been introduced in 107 train pairs. However, what concerns the Committee is the Ministry's inability to quantify or lay down a benchmark to assess the level of cleanliness at the Stations and in the trains. The Committee are not convinced with the Ministry's contention that providing CCTV Cameras for this activity is not feasible as CCTV Cameras are being used only for ensuring security in Station premises and both the functions by one agency will not be possible. In view of the desirability of lifting the standard of cleanliness in the Stations/Platforms/Railway premises, it seems imperative that visual recordings of the performance of the agencies engaged in such activities are maintained systematically so that corrective measures, as and when warranted, can be resorted to. The Committee, therefore, once again impress upon the Ministry to explore the feasibility of providing CCTV Cameras to keep a track on the level of cleanliness in the Stations/platforms, possibly by assigning the job to an agency other than that involved in ensuring security. The Committee also desire that the mechanized cleaning of train rakes and On Board Housekeeping Service (OBHS) be gradually extended to other coaching depots and trains respectively in order to improve the standards of cleanliness and sanitation.

B. CREATION OF INSTITUTIONALISED MECHANISM AT THE APEX LEVEL FOR CLEANLINESS AND SANITATION

Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 118)

10. Observing low priority being accorded to cleanliness in Indian Railways due to lack of effective co-ordination amongst various departments of Indian Railways, the Committee in their earlier Report, had recommended that the Ministry should constitute a committee to look into the entire gamut of issues regarding lack of co-ordination and clarity of approach *vis-a-vis* cleanliness and sanitation amongst various departments of the Railways. The Committee had further desired that an independent authority at the apex level solely responsible for cleanliness and sanitation on Indian Railways be created to oversee and co-ordinate such efforts amongst various departments of Indian Railways.

11. The Ministry in their Action Taken Note have *inter-alia* stated as under:—

"Presently, there is no proposal to have an apex body exclusively for cleanliness as functional members are looking after this area of concern. It is also not correct to say that very low priority has been accorded to this activity. All the levels, including the DRM, AGM, GM and Board and fully involved in making improvements in this area."

12. The Committee appreciate to note the statement that all the levels in the Indian Railways including the DRM, AGM, GM and the Railway Board are fully involved in making improvements in the cleanliness aspect. As functional members are looking after this area of concern, there is no proposal to have an apex body exclusively for cleanliness, contrary to the Recommendation made by the Committee in their earlier report. What the Committee tried to emphasize was that as the responsibility of maintenance of cleanliness, even within the Station premises, rested with different departments which lacked effective coordination, there was a need to have an independent authority at the apex level to oversee and coordinate the efforts amongst various departments of the Railways. The Ministry perhaps could not comprehended the essence of the Recommendation made by the Committee, as is substantiated by the fact that they have contested the Committee's observation regarding cleanliness being accorded a low priority by Railways. According to the Committee, the comments made in their ealier Report were based on facts and figures, furnished by the Ministry themselves and also the Audit. Moreover, the low level of cleanliness at Railway Stations/Platforms is an open secret. The Committee, therefore, are of the view that it is high time the Ministry realized the importance of proper cleanliness/sanitation at the stations/platforms. In order to achieve that, measures should be taken to put in place an effective mechanism at the apex level to oversee and coordinate the efforts by various agencies, entrusted with the job of keeping the Stations neat and clean.

C. STRENGTHENING OF INSPECTION OF CLEANLINESS STANDARDS ON RUNNING TRAINS

Recommendation (Sl. No. 4, Para No. 119)

13. The Committee in their Eighty-third Report, had observed that under the 'On Board Housekeeping Scheme', which was outsourced by the Railways, the Contractor had appointed an Executive Housekeeper, who was required to supervise and oversee the cleaning/sanitation operations in the running trains. In that context, the Committee had recommended that the presence of this Executive Housekeeper in running trains should be made more visible by providing him a special uniform and nameplate. His presence should be widely publicized to the travelling passengers by way of public address system at the beginning of the journey.

14. The Ministry of Railways in their Action Taken Notes have stated as follows:

"Under the On Board Housekeeping Scheme, the Executive Housekeeper is required to have a specially designed uniform. Carrying a nameplate is also mandated so as to make his presence more visible. Zonal Railways have been

advised to undertake public awareness campaign including announcement through Public-Address systems."

15. The Committee note that under the 'On Board Housekeeping Scheme', the Executive Housekeeper is required to have a specially designed uniform alongwith a nameplate. Whether the Executive Housekeeper is actually doing so is the moot point. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should prevail upon various Zonal Railways to carry out surprise checks in the running trains in order to ensure that the Executive Housekeepers are making their presence visible to the passengers in need. The Committee also desire that the public awareness campaign including announcement through Public Address System, as reportedly initiated by the Railways, should be continued unabated so that the passengers can easily approach the Executive Housekeeper for cleaning/sanitation work in the running trains.

D. POLICY ON WASTE MANAGEMENT

Recommendation (Sl. No. 5, Para No. 120)

16. Taking note of the absence of a policy on waste management and provisions for proper disposal of waste in the contract of Indian Railways Catering and Tourism Corporation (IRCTC), the Committee in their Eighty-third Report, had recommended that Railways should frame a policy on waste management and lay down a mechanism whereby the quantum of garbage generated on stations (including garbage collected from trains and disposed off at norminated stations) could be assessed realistically so that adequate collection, segregation and disposal facilities along with necessary infrastructure could be put in place by the authorities. The policy should be in compliance with the extant regulations and be applicable even in the case of outsourced contracts. The Committee had further recommended that while making use of plastic for such purposes, the Ministry must not lose sight of environmental concerns and ensure that applicable rules were adhered to.

17. The Ministry of Railways in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:—

"Garbage disposal system is already in place on Indian Railways. Its quantification is also done before tendering for fixing the appropriate agency for this work. Over the past three years cleanliness has also improved due to improved mechanism and monitoring.

Presently it does not seem practical to provide separate bins in busy stations on account of heavy traffic usage. We would consider such a system while developing the new world class stations.

As regards the absence of provisions in the contracts of IRCTC with licensees, with respect to proper disposal or segregation of waste before it is disposed of, IRCTC have been advised to take corrective measures in this regard."

18. According to the Ministry, the garbage disposal system is already in place on Indian Railways. Similarly, IRCTC has been advised to incorporate suitable

provisions in its contracts with the licensees for proper disposal or segregation of waste before disposal. In this context, the Committee are of the opinion that huge dumps of waste at various stations, as observed by Audit during their survey, indicate that poor and *ad hoc* collection and disposal practices were followed by the Zones and IRCTC, thus undermining the Ministry's statement that garbage disposal system is already in place. If at all such a system has been developed, the Committee desire that it should be streamlined and monitoring mechanism strengthened to enforce effective adherence of instructions relating to adequate and proper collection, segregation and disposal of waste in Railway Stations and by IRCTC also.

E. SHORTAGE OF WATER-TAPS AT THE STATIONS/PLATFORMS

Recommendation (Sl. No. 9, Para No. 124)

19. In their Eighty-third Report, the Committee had observed that the number of coaches in long distance as well as short distance trains had increased and on the contrary to this, the number of water-taps at the platform was not enough to realistically cater to the demand of the increased quantum of passengers. In view of the above, the Committee had recommended that the number of water-taps be increased expeditiously in a phased manner at all stations throughout the country. The Committee had also desired that possibility should be explored to introduce modernized taps such as push button taps as used at the Airports not only to maintain the cleanliness standards but also to check littering in terms of discarded water bottles.

20. The Ministry of Railways in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:—

"Regarding increasing number of water taps at stations, this issue has been examined along with other passenger amenities at stations by a Committee of Executive Directors. Revised norms for passenger amenities at stations as per category of stations have been laid down and necessary instructions issued to all Zonal Railways for implementation on 17th January, 2007. Further examination/revision at such a short interval is not called for."

21. The Committee note that revised norms for passenger amenities, including the provisioning of increased number of water taps, as per the category of stations have been laid down consequent upon the examination of the matter by a Committee of Executive Directors and necessary instructions were accordingly issued on 17th January, 2007. According to the Ministry, further examinations/revision of the matter at such a short interval is not called for. The Committee are surprised to note the indifferent statement of the Ministry on such an important matter of public utility. The instructions were issued in January, 2007 and the updated Action Taken Notes were furnished to the Committee in February, 2009. Even after two years of the issuance of the instructions, the Ministry are of the view that no further examination is needed as the intervening period is too short. It depicts utter callous attitude, to say the least, on the part of the Ministry. The Committee are of the firm view that the Railways are not doing any favour to the passengers by extending them basic amenities like drinking water facilities. In fact, it is their moral and social

obligation towards the travelling public. The Committee, therefore, urge upon the Ministry to discard the apathetic attitude towards basic passenger amenities, review the instructions of January, 2007 at the earliest and take urgent measures to provide adequate water taps, including push button taps, at the Stations/Platforms commensurate with the increase in the number of trains/coaches and volume of passengers.

F. INADEQUATE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL MECHANISM

Recommendation (Sl. No. 18, Para No. 133)

22. Observing inadequacy in the grievance redressal mechanism evolved by the Railways, the Committee in their earlier Report had recommended that the Ministry of Railways should strengthen the existing mechanism of grievance redressal by effective use of technology, ensuring easy accessibility of the designated officers to the passengers etc.

23. The Ministry in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:—

"Indian Railways function as a public utility service. In view of the enormity of operations and interface with a large number of passengers every day, grievances do occur and efforts are undertaken for their redressal and to find ways to eliminate causes for such complaints. Indian Railways has a well knit Public Grievances Redressal Machinery which takes prompt action on grievances/complaints registered by the traveling public.

At the Railway Board's level, Executive Director (Public Grievances) is the Public Grievances Redressal Officer. At the Zonal Railway's level, the Additional General Managers function as the Directors of Public Grievances and coordinate the work of redressal of public complaints. At the Divisional level, Additional Divisional Railway Managers have been nominated as Public Grievances Redressal Officers. They hold periodical meetings with the concerned officers/ Station Managers in this regard. At the stations, the Station Managers are personally responsible for the public grievances. Suggestion Boxes/Public Grievance Booths/May I Help You Booths' have been kept at important stations. Complaint and suggestion boxes are also available at key places like Stations/ Refreshments Rooms/Reservation Offices and with the Train Superintendent/ Guards of trains."

24. The Ministry have further stated as follows:—

"Comments/suggestions boxes in properly latched/locked conditions have been provided in all important trains over and above the complaint/suggestion books already available at important stations and trains. In trains these boxes are available with the Guard SLR. The process of providing these boxes in the pantry cars of trains is under progress. It has also been instructed to screen these complaints/suggestions at divisional level and bring the same to the GMs knowledge for taking appropriate remedial action. Railways have been advised to give wide publicity to the existence of these complaint/suggestion boxes also through Public Address System and publicity campaigns."

25. The Committee note that the Railways have nominated various officers at the Headquarters as well as the Zonal, Divisional and even at the Station levels to register and redress the complaints/grievances of the passengers. Comments/Suggestion boxes in properly latched/locked conditions have been provided in all important trains over and above the complaint/suggestion books already provided at important stations. The process of providing such boxes in the Pantry Cars of trains is under progress. The Committee are further informed that Railways have been advised to give publicity to the existence of these complaint/suggestion boxes through Public Address System and publicity campaigns. The Committee appreciate the measures initiated by the Railways to redress the complaints/grievances of the passengers. They are, however, of the view that mere putting in place some mechanism or simple issuance of advisories to make the passengers aware of the existence of such mechanism will be of little help unless there is periodical and proper monitoring to ensure effective implementation of the measures initiated for the purpose. As a matter of fact, the enormity of operations by the Indian Railways and the interface with a large number of passengers call for a systematic and methodical monitoring of the arrangements put in place for the redressal of grievances. The Committee, therefore, impress upon the railways to intensify their 'public awareness' campaign and monitoring system at every level so that the complaints/grievances of the travelling public are timely registered and suitably redressed.

CHAPTER II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Observation and Recommendation-119

The Housekeeper should undertake periodic inspection within the trains several times a day and may also be required to carry and display a checklist of his inspected items which may be submitted to the concerned authorities at terminal stations. In addition, the Committee is also of the view that if required the help of Traveling Ticket Examiners (TTEs) or any other person so authorized may be taken to complement the work of the Executive Housekeeper. The person so authorized may not only be directly responsible for cleanliness and sanitation, but may also help in ensuring the system of checks and balances as far as cleanliness in the running trains is concerned.

As regards the designated officer responsible for Sanitation on running trains, the Ministry have informed the Committee that under the On Board Housekeeping Scheme, which is outsourced, the Contractor has an Executive Housekeeper, who is required to supervise and oversee the cleaning/sanitation operations in the running trains. The Committee feel that this executive housekeeper's presence should be made more visible. It can be done by providing him a special uniform and nameplate. His presence should be widely publicized to the traveling passengers by way of public address system at the beginning of the journey.

[Sl. No. 4 Appendix....., Para No. 119 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Labha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Under the On Board Housekeeping Scheme, the Executive Housekeeper is required to have a specially designed uniform carrying a nameplate is also mandated so as to make his presence more visible.

Audit vide U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The response is partial. Though instructions exist, the mechanism in place to enforce adherence is not addressed. The issue of making the passengers aware by providing wide publicity has also not been addressed.

Ministry's Comments

Zonal Railways have been suitably instructed. It has also been advised to undertake public awareness campaign including announcement through Public Address system.

Audit vide U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Comments of the Committee

Please See Para No. 15 of Chapter-I

Observation and Recommendation-120

Another area which has caught the serious attention of the Committee and where the Ministry need to take concerted action is the area of Waste Management. The Committee are appalled to note that the Ministry does not have a policy on waste management. The Ministry in their reply have categorically informed the Committee on this issue. Review of selected stations over all Zonal Railways revealed that Railways did not have any mechanism to realistically assess the quantum of garbage generated at any of these stations. Consequently, large quantities of garbage were either not reaching the vats or were strewn all over the place in the surrounding areas and around the vats at any given point in time creating an unhygienic atmosphere within the station premises. Large quantities of garbage were removed sporadically once in a while. Moreover, in the absence of any assessment of quantum of garbage generated, the infrastructure provided for garbage collection and arrangements made for garbage disposal in railway stations were adhoc, inadequate and unrealistic. The Committee, therefore, recommend to the Ministry to upgrade the existing infrastructure relating to garbage disposal on railway stations. The Ministry in a note furnished to the Committee have admitted that the tools and implements, used in this regard are still very rudimentary. It is very disturbing to note that the Ministry have been found wanting with regard to their efforts towards garbage disposal and management.

Scrutiny of the standard conditions of contract of Indian Railways Catering and Tourism Corporation (IRCTC) revealed that there were no provisions regarding either proper disposal or segregation of waste before its disposal. Further, no penalty was prescribed for improper disposal of waste. The Committee desire that the Ministry must form a high level study group to clearly bring out the various deficiencies in the existing mechanism and must take steps to modernize garbage collection and disposal methods being undertaken on Indian Railways. The Committee strongly recommend that Railways must frame a policy on waste management and lay down a mechanism whereby the quantum of garbage generated on stations (including garbage collected from trains and disposed off at nominated stations) can be assessed realistically so that adequate collection, segregation and disposal facilities along with necessary infrastructure can be put in place by the authorities. The Committee desire

this to take place within 6 months of the presentation of the Report. The policy so framed should be in compliance with extant regulations and be applicable even in the case of outsourced contracts.

The issue of garbage segregation into biodegradable and non-biodegradable by providing separate bins for garbage collection must be seriously taken care of by the Ministry and should be accorded due priority. It is dismaying to note that except for Gwalior and Jhansi, there was no mechanism to segregate such waste, not even in the four metropolitan cities. The Committee further recommend that while making use of plastic for such purposes, the Ministry must not lose sight of environmental concerns and ensure that applicable rules are adhered to. The Committee would like to be informed in detail about the corrective measures taken by the Railways in this regard in Action Taken Replies furnished by the Ministry.

[Sl. No. 5 Appendix....., Para No. 120 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Garbage disposal system is already in place on Indian Railways. Its quantification is also done before tendering for fixing the appropriate agency for this work.

Presently it does not seem practical to provide separate bins at busy stations on account of heavy traffic usage. We would consider such a system while developing the new world class stations.

As regards the absence of provisions in the contracts of IRCTC with licensees, with respect to proper disposal or segregation of waste before it is disposed of, IRCTC have been advised to take corrective measures in this regard.

Audit vide U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The response is partial. Framing a waste management policy and remedial measures put in place to enforce effective adherence of instructions relating to collection and disposal of waste in railway stations and by IRCTC have not been addressed. Audit observed that huge dumps of waste were collected at stations due to poor and adhoc collection and disposal practices followed by the zones. Audit had also observed that pantry car waste was being thrown from running trains in violation of extant rules and instructions.

Ministry's Comments

Garbage disposal system is already in place on Indian Railways. Its quantification is also done before tandering for fixing the appropriate agency for this work. Over the past 3 years cleanliness has also improved due to improved mechanization and monitoring.

IRCTC has been advised to take corrective measures in adherence to the observation.

Audit vide U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 18 of Chapter-I

Observation and Recommendation-121

The Committee found that lack of co-ordination in budgetary provisions and absence of an overall financial plan to tackle cleanliness related issues acted as a major impediment towards realizing cleanliness related goals in Indian Railways. The Committee have been given to understand that the working group on cleanliness suggested creation of a separate minor head under operating expenses traffic to book all the expenses of operating nature for cleanliness and housekeeping of stations, platforms, concourses and other areas. However, in stark contradiction to this suggestion the expenditure on various cleanliness activities was booked to different accounting heads depending upon the department undertaking the activity. The Committee have also learnt that the Railways did not have a mechanism to either assess the extent of expenditure incurred on cleanliness or to monitor this activity. The Committee are of the opinion that creation of a separate minor head under operating expenses will definitely rationalize the accounting process and will at the same time bring forth an alignment in the budgeting process geared towards specific allocation for cleanliness and sanitation. The Ministry however, in a written note have informed the Committee that the accounts of expenditure on specific items of sanitation and cleanliness, which form part of the projects under various plan heads, are not amenable for separation. Therefore, it may not be possible to work out the percentage of surplus being allocated specifically for sanitation and cleanliness. Not agreeing with the contention of the Ministry, the Committee recommend that Railways need to assess the financial requirements for cleanliness related activities and provide for them in the budget specifically. This would also enable Railways in monitoring of the cleanliness initiatives and to find focused attention to this prime area. They also need to have an overall financial plan for provision of infrastructure, amenities, user awareness campaigns etc. as per an action plan and actual field requirements.

The Committee would like to be apprised of the Action Taken by the Railways in this regard at the earliest but definitely whilst furnishing the Action Taken Replies to the Committee within the stipulated time frame. Further it has come to Committee's notice that foot over bridges, booking offices, washable aprons, drains, water supply, waiting hall/shed, seating arrangements etc., which impact the cleanliness levels is booked to Plan head 'Passenger Amenities'. Even under this Plan head, the Railways

spent Rs. 256.24 crore during 2005-06, equivalent to only 1.5 per cent of the total capital expenditure incurred and 1.69 per cent of the earnings from passenger services. Thus, the Railways had spent comparatively a very meagre amount for providing infrastructure and amenities to the passengers on railway stations. This resulted in inadequate infrastructure, amenities and resources which had an adverse impact on the cleanliness and sanitation levels of Railway premises. The Ministry in a note furnished to the Committee have informed that the amount likely to be spent on creating additional cleanliness related facilities is very nominal in the current year *i.e.* 0.1% of the investible surplus, the same will increase substantially in the coming years considering the cost of the projects undertaken. The Committee recommend that the Ministry must outlay a dedicated budget exclusively meant for sanitation and cleanliness on Indian Railways with a provision for year-wise increment on the same. The Committee expects the incremental increase to be registered in the ensuing Railway Budget.

[Sl. No. 6 Appendix....., Para No. 121 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Adequate powers have been delegated to the DRMs for the following:

- (a) Purchase of all tools and plants required for carrying out various sanitation related activities.
- (b) Granting specialized contracts involving large component of mechanized cleaning and pest control contracts.
- (c) Awarding one time contract cleaning of any area.

It has also been stipulated that Budget allocation under demand no. 9 minor head 200 and detailed Head 291/293 for payment under this activity should be allocated to each division for above purpose.

Zonal Railways have further been directed to go for mechanized cleaning at all A & B category stations. For this purpose, exclusive Health Inspectors should be provided at these stations. At A-I category stations having annual passenger earning of more than Rs. 50 Crore, Health Inspectors should be provided round the clock along with exclusive supervisors for the Engineering, Electrical & Commercial Departments for ensuring cleanliness/proper upkeep of the station premises. At A category stations, one or more Health Inspectors should be provided as per requirement. For B category stations, one Health Inspector should be provided. Posts for supervisors can be created, where necessary, by matching surrender on the Divisions. Such creations should be completed within one month and compliance reported to the Board.

The Inspectors/Supervisors of all departments exclusively provided for the cleanliness supervision will be under the administrative control of the Station Supdt/ Station Manager for the purpose of attendance, leave pay, awards, DAR etc.

Station Supdt/Station Managers should be provided with adequate cash imprest exclusively for cleaning.

Rag picking contracts are to be made available at all A-1, A, B and C category stations for areas around the station. DRMs ensure that these contracts are always current and renewal takes place timely. In case of any unforeseen delay in finalization of such contract, existing contract are suitably extended within the rules. DRMs have been instructed to ensure foolproof feedback system so that there is no discontinuity caused to such contracts. Any discontinuity is treated with urgency at par with accident cases. Garbage disposal contracts are also to be covered accordingly.

Audit vide U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The level of overall expenditure/spend on cleanliness and sanitation also needs to be progressively enhanced to achieve improved level of cleanliness.

Ministry's Comments

The audit observation has been noted in Railway Board.

Audit vide U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-122

The Committee has observed several shortcomings in the garbage collection area. The Committee understands that vats are secondary collection points where the garbage from dustbins and garbage off loaded from trains is dumped for carting away to land-fill sites. After going through the entire information and evidence collected by the Committee they feel that this area is still a neglected area. The Committee recommends that number of vats should be increased at the stations so that littering of the waste is not common sight around the station areas. They also recommend that such vats should be covered and hygienically maintained and periodically cleaned as per the established guidelines. The Committee strongly desires that Railways prioritize provision of garbage collection units after assessing the requirement on a realistic basis and ensure proper collection and disposal of garbage. Suitable manpower should be deployed to man these collection centres. In case where such activities are outsourced the erring contractors must be penalized for lack of proper disposal and non adherence to quality benchmarks meant for this purpose. Responsibility and accountability should be clearly identified to enable action for deficient performance. A senior level officer should be

designated for overseeing and supervising these activities on a weekly basis. The Ministry must ensure that garbage disposal undertaken at these units is done as per extant rules and regulations. Transportation of garbage to disposal sites should be done in the most careful way by resorting to highest professional standards. Garbage disposal contracts and Rag picking contracts must be given to very reputed organizations through a very transparent process. Performance of the contractors should be regularly reviewed. The Committee also desire that a penal clause should be prescribed and resorted to in all outsourced contracts where disposal of waste is done in an improper way. The Committee have found that all kinds of garbage, both recyclable and non-recyclable were collected in the same bins in violation of extant rules in various zonal railways including at the four metropolitan cities, *i.e.* New Delhi, Kolkata, Mumbai and Chennai. The Committee have taken a very serious view of this laxity on the part of Ministry and desire that the Ministry must ensure that this practice is discontinued with immediate effect and they must take necessary action to provide all the requisite infrastructure for this purpose.

[Sl. No. 7 Appendix....., Para No. 122 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

As regards absence of penal clause in all outsourced contracts where disposal of waste is done in an improper way, IRCTC has been advised to include in all contracts the requisite penal clause.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The response is inadequate. The mechanism of monitoring the performance of garbage disposal contractors at railway stations and the issue of increasing the capacity of existing vats have not been addressed.

Ministry's Comments

Presently the garbage disposal system is already in place and is being monitored regularly at various leveles. At present a total of 202 major stations have garbage disposal contracts. The Penal clause has been included in all garbage disposal contracts and is being implemented wherever required.

Noted IRCTC has been advised to take corrective measures in adherence to the observation.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-123

The Committee are of the opinion that Railways need to draw up a plan of action with identified milestones for provision of adequate infrastructure namely water supply, washable aprons, drains and sewerage system and machines alongwith conducive platform surfaces for each station duly prioritizing requirements. In this connection the Chairman, Railway Board during the course of the evidence held on the subject informed the Committee about 22 stations proposed to be developed into world class stations. The Ministry further apprised the Committee about 593 stations selected as model stations for the purpose of providing upgraded passenger amenities. Instructions given to DRMs regarding picking up of five stations on an annual basis towards their development on the touch and feel basis to have the best of the passenger amenities, cleanliness circulating area etc. is a step in the right direction.

The Committee nevertheless, desire that Railways must ensure that these steps are taken at the earliest and the Ministry must not adopt a lackadaisical approach in this case. Decentralization of financial powers to DRMs with delegation of power for sanctioning works up to Rs. 30 lakhs for a particular station on passenger amenities is also an attempt which will help in improved standards of Sanitation and cleanliness. However, the Committee desire that the Ministry should ensure that involved executives must display caution as well as responsibility while exercising these powers. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry should devise a time frame within which the selected stations will be upgraded to desired levels as far as passenger amenities are concerned. The Committee desire that the Ministry expedite all the efforts in this direction and they should inform the Committee about the developments made in this direction in a phased manner. The repair and maintenance of the infrastructure so created should be ensured through a suitable monitoring mechanism.

[Sl. No. 8 Appendix....., Para No. 123 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Upgradation of passenger amenities, commensurate with increase in passenger traffic, at stations including water supply, washable aprons, drains and sewerage system, etc. is a continuous process and is undertaken through Annual Works Programme depending upon availability of funds and other relative priorities. For provision of adequate infrastructure with respect to upgraded passenger amenities, number of stations identified for development as World Class Station has increased to 35. Following two new schemes for providing upgraded passenger amenities have also been introduced through Railway Budget 2009-10:

1. Adarsh Stations (361 nos.)
2. Multi-functional Complexes (64 nos.)

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The reply is partial. Ministry of Railways has not set out a time frame within which the stations would be developed as World Class stations, Adarsh stations and Multi-functional complexes.

Ministry's Comments

Instructions have been issued to the Zonal Railways for development of 358 stations as Adarsh stations within a period of one year from September, 2009. Monitoring of work of development at the apex level is being evolved. Development of World Class stations and Multifunctional complexes involves time consuming global tendering process and acquisition of land from local bodies. Moreover, it is an on-going process and therefore no time-frame can be set out for completion of the work.

Audit *vide* U.O.No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-125

The Committee are of the firm opinion that Railway must not lose sight of the big picture while executing their duty to the nation. Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways should be manifested as a top priority in every fresh project that the Railways undertake and consolidated emphasis paid to the existing ones.

The experience of Delhi Metro in monitoring Cleanliness and Sanitation standards is worth emulating. While contesting the Committee's suggestion regarding practice and procedures being followed by the Delhi Metro the Ministry stated that Delhi Metro is not catering to the kind of heterogeneous crowd that Railways do. However, Delhi has increasingly started catering to crowd from various walks of life which includes literate, semiliterate and illiterate passengers. Moreover, sanitation and cleanliness are very contagious. It has been observed that in Delhi Metro the entire work culture and attitudes of both the functionaries and travelling public have been more amenable to clean and neat surroundings. And this has been made possible only by the prevalent neat and clean conditions on the Metro premises. The Committee understand that major part of Metro operations are covered and fully air-conditioned and the journey is comparatively of lesser duration. Still that cannot be a reason for the Railways not to emulate this experience. With the availability of bins and clean surfaces, supervision with CCTV cameras, regular announcements regarding this subject and visible presence of staff who cater to this aspect, Committee are sure that Railways can definitely achieve the targets in this respect. Ministry's submission in this regard stating inclusion of modern machines, active supervision and overhauling of existing infrastructure by overhauling of platform surfaces with the

inclusion of kota stone etc. is a positive signal. It needs to be followed to the extent where the difference is tangibly felt by the passengers. The Committee still feel that Ministry's efforts in this regard should be widely publicized and should be spearheaded by the Chairman, Railway Board itself coupled with on-the-spot checks by Board Members or divisional Managers on a bi-monthly basis that will send a clear signal to all concerned regarding the seriousness of the senior executive towards this cause. The Committee recommends very strongly that the Ministry display enhanced enthusiasm towards this aspect and lead by example. Moreover, while handling out contracts to private parties, the Ministry must ensure that the functionary and supervisory authorities are not the same.

[Sl. No. 10 Appendix....., Para No. 125 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Railway Board has recently issued instructions to zonal Railways to accord high priority for cleanliness at Railway stations, trains and railway premises. Zonal Railways have also been advised to keep a check on cleanliness and keep the Railway Board apprised of the improvement of the same. The objective, strategy and action plans which need to be adopted have also been circulated. It has been emphasized that inspections has to be carried out on cleanliness once a fortnight by GMs and once a week by the DRMs. Other PHOD/SAG officers have also been nominated for inspection of trains and stations under specifically laid down schedules. Clear duties have also been assigned to staff and officers by zonal Railways for improvement of cleanliness and passenger amenities.

Audit *vide* their U.O. No.153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have vetted the Action Taken Note.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-126

Another area which has drawn attention of the Committee is the upgradation of toilets standards. After analyzing all the information, the Committee recommend that the Railways should expedite the process of providing Controlled Discharge Toilet System/Zero Discharge Toilet System toilets in as many trains/coaches as possible to improve the quality of hygiene. The Committee have been informed that Indian Railways have planned to instal environment friendly green toilet projects on all passenger coaches. Further more funds to the tune of Rs. 2450 crore have been sanctioned to fit "Green Toilets" in 24500 coaches to start with. The Committee hope and desire that this project is completed within a specified time frame. The Ministry should unequivocally intimate the Committee about the time schedule made for this purpose. Also the Ministry must ensure that the money meant to be spent for the purpose is not transferred elsewhere and is judiciously spent.

The Committee have also been informed during the course of the evidence that the Railways have started providing concrete aprons on the tracks so that they can be washed soon after the train departs. In this respect, the Committee desire that the Ministry must ensure that there is no paucity of these aprons while the entire Railway system is provided with Zero Discharge Toilets. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry must ensure that there is no manual scavenging in violation of 'Employment of Manual Scavengers and Construction of dry latrines (Prohibition) Act 1993' and direction of the Hon'ble Supreme Court. Explaining the delays in providing concrete aprons, Railways have informed that it was mainly due to long traffic blocks required and that the design was undergoing changes. In Committee's view Railways' reply only underlines the fact that non-provision of washable aprons and deficient maintenance of the existing ones has compromised effective cleaning of Railway tracks adjacent to platforms. The Committee are unhappy with the lackadaisical approach of the Ministry towards the cleanliness of railway tracks. The Committee strongly recommend that Ministry should implement all the projects geared towards sanitation on platforms and railway tracks in an efficient and time bound manner and should keep the Committee informed about the developments.

The Committee have noted that there has been manifold surge in the number of passengers using railways as their mode of transportation. The Committee are not oblivious to the fact that all passengers amenities are directly related in terms of numbers and infrastructure to the increase in number of passengers. In this context, the Committee can clearly see that the number of toilets at the Railway stations have not increased proportionately with the increase in quantum of passengers. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the number of toilets, urinals, at the platform/waiting rooms should be increased forthwith under intimation to the Committee. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry must ensure that toilets meant especially for the facility of people with special needs and bassinets for infants should be adequately provided both on Railway stations and on running trains. While supplying this reply, the Committee would like to know that total number of existing toilets at the time of presentation of this Report and accretion in the number that took place on the recommendation of the Committee.

[Sl. No. 11 Appendix....., Para No. 126 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Indian Railways have designed modular toilets with improved aesthetics and controlled discharge systems for use in Rajdhani and Shatabdi trains. A new design of stainless steel toilets fitted with concealed piping, improved interiors and fittings have also been designed and developed for use in air conditioned coaches being manufactured by RCF and ICF. As a step further, Indian Railways have also taken up project for development of environment friendly green toilets suitable for Indian Railways environment. The green toilets are under various stages of development

and field trials. One rake fitted with green toilet has already been put up in service for monitoring the performance and design validation. Further procurement is on hand for fitment in 25 more rakes being manufactured at RCF and ICF. The development work is also going on alternative technology/design being developed by Defence Research and Development Establishment (DRDE)/Gwalior, and another project under technology mission of Railway Safety taken up jointly by RDSO and IIT/Kanpur.

With the introduction of green toilets on Railways, direct dropping of human waste will be eliminated and waste will biologically treated before discharge.

Regarding increasing number of toilets/urinals at platforms and waiting rooms proportionately with the increase in passenger traffic, the issue has been examined along with other passenger amenities at stations by a Committee of Executive Directors. Revised norms for passenger amenities have been laid down and necessary instructions have been issued to all Zonal Railways for implementation on 17th January, 2007. Moreover, upgradation of passenger amenities commensurate with increase in passenger traffic is an on-going process and is undertaken depending upon availability of funds and other relative priorities. As regards toilets/urinals for people with special needs (Disabled persons), instructions exist for provision of at least one disabled friendly toilet/urinal at all A-1, A and B category stations. Such toilets/urinals have already been provided at A-1 and A category stations and at B category, these are planned to be provided by March 2010.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The time frame for provision of Controlled Discharge Toilets/Zero Discharge toilets has not been specified. Action initiated for maintaining an improved level of cleanliness of railway tracks adjacent to platforms has not been specified.

Ministry's Comments

Production Units have been advised to prioritize the fitment of CDTS in LHB design Coaches, ICF design coaches fitted with CBCs and in AC coaches and Sleeper class coaches in that order. A total number of approximately 1300 such coaches have been manufactured.

Field trials are also being conducted with different design/types of Environment friendly 'Green Toilets' and based on evaluation of these trials, a final view shall be taken on the type of environment friendly toilets to be adopted in Indian Railway coaches.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements

on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-127

The committee have been informed by the Ministry that additional General Manager at Zonal level, Additional Divisional Railway Manager at Divisional level and station Manager/Station Superintendent at station level are the nodal officers/supervisors who co-ordinate with various departments responsible for sanitation and cleanliness. The Committee desire that Railways should prescribe norms for regular inspection by various officers for all categories of stations and ensure that deficiencies pointed out by the inspecting authorities are actively followed up and rectified. The committee have been informed by the Ministry that there is no flying squad in the Ministry to conduct surprise check ups with regard to Cleanliness and Sanitation. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should formulate a permanent mechanism to conduct such surprise checks. The frequency of these periodic checks should be clearly outlined and the creation of a deterrence should be accorded top priority by the Ministry.

[Sl. No. 12 Appendix....., Para No. 127 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

There is already a well laid down schedule of inspections for various levels. Surprise checks are also made frequently. In fact, these measures only have resulted in improvement in the sanitation standards in the recent times.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The mechanism in place in the zones to actively follow up the deficiencies pointed out by the various inspecting authorities has not been brought out.

Ministry's Comments

Zonal Railways have been suitably instructed.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30.10.2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-128

The Committee have noted shortcomings in execution of penalty against those involved in defacing of Railway property and littering etc. In this regard the Committee desire that enforcement of penalty and proper fencing should be ensured by the Ministry at the divisional level. Moreover, the Ministry should clearly look at the sources of Garbage generation and try to avoid its spillage on the Railway premises. The Committee have also noted that garbage from the pantry cars is dumped in the station yard itself without adhering to prescribed procedures of further disposal. Apart from the disposable glasses, polythene, water bottle etc. create bulk of the garbage and also block the drain leading to water logging and accumulation of fifth. The Committee further strongly recommend that vendors operating on the stations should be directly held responsible for the spillage and should be suitable penalized. the Committee desire that the Ministry should ensure complete and adequate fencing of station premises thus avoiding entry of unauthorized persons like beggars, urchins and unauthorized vendors as they also contribute towards lack of cleanliness and sanitation on the Railway premises. The security on the station premises should be a key concern for the Ministry and presence of unauthorized persons on the station has to be dealt by any renewed mechanism to be devised by Railways in the manner they deem appropriate. The Committee further recommend that penal measures be strengthened to serve as an adequate deterrent against unauthorized occupation and misuse of Railway property.

[Sl. No. 13 Appenedix....., Para No. 128 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

At present, persons entering station premises unauthorizedly are dealt with as per extant provisions of section 147 of the Railways Act, 1989, which stipulates imprisonment for a term extending to six months or with fine which may extent to Rs. one thousand or both. Persons involved in unauthorized vending/hawking in station premises/trains are being dealt under section 144 of the Railways Act which envisages imprisonment for a term which may extend to one year or with fine which may extend to two thousand rupees or both.

In the year 2008, about 14 lakh offenders were prosecuted by the RPF under various sections of the Railways Act, out of which, position regarding prosecution of offenders under sections 144 & 147 in the year 2008 was as under:—

Section	Offence	No. of offenders prosecuted by RPF
144	Unauthorised vending/hawking	1,34,671
147	Trespassing	2,36,856

To enhance the surveillance mechanism over railway stations, Railway Board has decided to install an Integrated Security System at important stations with the following broad areas;

- (a) CCTV System
- (b) Access Control
- (c) Personal and baggage screening system
- (d) Explosive detection and disposal system

Fencing of station premises already exist at most of the important stations, especially A-1, A, B category stations. Further, provision of fencing/boundary wall at stations is a continuous process and is undertaken on need basis subject to availability of funds and other relative priority.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the followings:—

The existing penal provisions are inadequate and does not serve as a deterrent as seen in Audit. Apart from preventing entry of unauthorized persons, effective measures for permanently evicting the existing unauthorized users/encroachments needs to be put in place on priority.

Ministry's Comments

A proposal for amendments in the Railways' Act is under consideration of the Board to enable RPF to conduct enquiry and prosecution of offences related to thefts of passengers belongings and drugging of passengers in railways. This will facilitate immediate registration of cases, effective enquiry and prosecution with regular monitoring on daily basis from the Railway Board.

RPF staff are being deployed for access control duties at the major railway stations of country. Besides above, regular drives are being conducted by the RPF against unauthorized persons. During the year 2008, more than thirteen lakh offenders have been prosecuted under various sections of the Railways' Act by RPF.

To strengthen access control and surveillance mechanism, an Integrated Security System has been approved for sensitive/vulnerable Railway stations of the country. The above system comprises of the following four broad areas:—

- CCTV surveillance system
- Access control
- Personal and Baggage screening system
- Bomb detection and disposal system

In Works-Programme 2009-10, approval has been accorded for implementation of this scheme at 195 sensitive stations of the country at an estimated cost of Rs. 344.31 crore.

An amount of Rs. 67.09 crore has been sanctioned for procurement of modern security equipment like Door Frame Metal Detector, Hand Held Metal Detector, Night Vision Devices, Walkie-Talkie, VHF sets etc. to strengthn RPF. Proposal of Rs. 14.26 crore for purchase of vehicles for RPF/RPSF is under consideration.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II8-3/2006 (MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation-129

The Committee are perturbed to note the Audit observation regarding heavy absenteeism, poor work ethics and lack of motivation among the Safaiwalas. The Committee are of the opinion that role of the Safaiwalas is very important and low morale of these Safaiwals will definitely cause sanitation efforts on Indian Railways to suffer. While explaining their case on the matter and the efforts taken to remedy the situation, the Ministry informed the Committee that heavy absenteeism, poor work ethics and lack of motivation among the Safaiwalas is due to multiple factors viz. lack of promotional avenues, low self esteem, lack of variety in work environment, repetitiveness of job, shift duties, etc. The Committee have been further informed that counseling by supervisors on the job, development of training module and periodic training provision, awards and incentives for outstanding performers, improvement in work environment by increasing mechanized cleaning, better implements and equipments viz. floor scrubber and dryers, floor washing and scrubbing machines, high pressure jet cleaner, wet and dry mops, vacuum cleaners, manual sweeping machines etc. are some of the steps taken to upgrade the morale of these Safaiwalas. The Committee are appalled to note that there was no training module for these safaiwalas and it was only after the Audit observations that the Ministry realized such a need. It is needless to mention that priority be accorded by the Ministry to sanitation work. The Committee hope that the Ministry will take up this issue in right earnest and also take steps to strengthen the cadre of Safaiwalas.

[Sl. No. 14 Apendix....., Para No. 129 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

With utmost thrust on mechnized cleaning of stations through expert agencies, the strength of staff in safaiwala category is continuously being reviewed. The aspect of training is also taken care of whenever mechanized cleaning gets introduced.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

Cleaning activities in a large number of stations continue to be vested departmentally and it is imperative that Safaiwalas are adequately and apropiately trained.

Ministry's Comments

Instructions have been issued to the Zonal Railways to take immediate action on the observation of Audit and ensure that all Safaiwalas are adequately trained.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation—130

Whilst deposing before the Committee, the Chairman, Railway Board was candid enough in his admission that there lie some anomalies regarding the promotion of Safaiwalas which negatively contributed towards their morale and also affected their performance. The Committee are happy to note this candid admission by the Chairman, nevertheless, they feel that Railway Board has not addressed this problem effectively enough so as to take it to logical conclusion. In all the information supplied by the Railways to the Committee, it is gleaned that no clear-cut promotional avenues have been put in place to regulate the promotion of Safaiwalas working not only at the platform but also at the yards and other establishments of Railways. The Committee, therefore, recommend that clear-cut and effective promotional policy for Safaiwalas to boost their morale towards their duty should be devised by the Railways within six months under intimation to the Committee and should be implemented expeditiously.

[Sl. No. 15 Appendix....., Para No. 130 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

As per extant instructions, in all Departments, quotas for Group 'D' staff for their promotion to Group 'C' have been earmarked. It is around 50% in all Technical Departments and other categories like Office Clerks, Commercial Clerk, Ticket Collectors. There were 4 grade structure *viz.* Rs. 2550-3200, Rs. 2610-3540, Rs. 2650-4000 and Rs. 2750-4400(RPS) available within Group 'D' in the fifth CPC scales. Safaiwalas were promoted as Sr. Safaiwalas and Peon within Group 'D' and also eligible for promotion to clerical categories in Group 'C' and for further promotion as Technicians and Artisans in Technical Departments. Provision for Safaiwalas of all departments for induction in Workshop cadre against 10% quota exists too. In Railway hospitals, Safaiwalas are eligible for promotion as Dressers and Laboratory Attendants.

Consequent upon implementation of the recommendations of the Vth CPC Assured Career Progression (ACP) Scheme *Vide* which two financial upgradations were to be given to Group 'D' staff on completion of 12/24 years' regular service, was

introduced and adopted on the Railways. Now, VI CPC has recommended three upgradations under ACP Scheme after the interval of 10, 20 and 30 years of regular service, which are still under consideration. The VI CPC have also recommended upgradation of all Group 'D' employees to Group 'C' in PB-I (Rs. 5200-20200) with grade pay of Rs. 1800 and those employees who do not possess the minimum qualification of Matric/ITI will be placed in PB-I (Rs. 5200-20200) with grade pay of Rs. 1800 after suitable training. In addition, staff can also avail the benefit of promotion under GDCE Scheme if they possess the direct recruitment qualification prescribed for such posts.

In view of the above, promotional prospects for Group 'D' staff including Safaiwalas are considered to be adequate.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 15.09.2009 have vetted the Action Taken Note.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation—131

The Committee have taken due note of the existing deficiencies in contract management which as observed have led to compromise in quality of service rendered by the contractors and have also resulted in ineffective cleaning initiatives. The Committee have found that the terms and conditions of various outsourced contracts were not well defined. While in some cases the processes and frequencies of cleanliness activities were not defined, in many others, the manpower to be provided and the cleaning machines to be utilized by the contractor, were not spelt out. As a result, the contractors across various zonal railways employed lesser resources thereby compromising the quality of cleanliness. Audit further revealed that penal clauses for unsatisfactory discharge of cleaning activities were not incorporated in five agreements of outsourced works. In three stations, no agreement was entered into though cleaning activities were outsourced. Award of contracts to the contractors without prescribing any maximum standard that the contractors would have to adhere to and also to the lowest bidder irrespective of viability of rates has been viewed very seriously by the Committee. In this connection, the committee very strongly desire that the Ministry must fine tune the system of Outsourcing in Railways. The Ministry should explore the possibilities of fixing responsibility on those officials who handed out faulty contracts and must ensure that system for outsourcing is made fool proof. Moreover, the Committee desires that there should be an effective supervisory mechanism in place to ensure that such anomalies are not repeated in future.

[Sl. No. 16 Appendix....., Para No. 131 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Necessary action will be taken to improve the existing contracting system as observed by the Committee.

All zonal railways have been instructed to follow standard model mechanized cleaning and trains based on pilot project of Puri Coach Depot/East Coast Railway.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The issue of accountability for finalizing faulty contracts has not been addressed in the response.

Ministry's Comments

Zonal Railways have been suitably instructed.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation—134

The Committee have learnt that various flaws exists in the execution of mechanized cleaning in various A and B category stations. The Committee have noted that in major stations like Howrah, Asansol, Bangalore Cantt., Hubli, New Delhi, H. Nizamuddin, Delhi, Chennai Central, Chappra etc. mechanized cleaning remained largely ineffective due to non-availability of smooth platform surfaces and various associated problems. It has been quite clear to the Committee that the Railways tried to execute this program without necessary infrastructure in place. The Committee note that the Ministry's approach in this regard lacked proper vision and comprehensive planning. The Committees are appalled to note that such an ambitious program was initiated without keeping in view the hurdles and possible solutions in mind. The Committee, therefore, very strongly recommend that the Ministry ensure that a suitable infrastructure is laid down to carry out such cleaning on all selected stations. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry must identify the flaws that were not perceived at the planning stage of this program and take steps to rectify the same without any further loss of time.

[Sl. No. 19 Appendix....., Para No. 134 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

As regards smooth surface of the platforms at major and important stations, home/main platforms have already been resurfaced with Kota-stone for smooth cleaning at most of such stations. More and more works are sanctioned through Annual Works Programme for resurfacing of platforms with Kota-stone or other means for smooth and mechanized cleaning. Further, 637 stations have been identified for modernization under 'Touch & Feel' Scheme. One of the area for improvement at such

stations is "Improvement to the platform surface." More than 70% stations have been modernized under this scheme and the remaining are targeted for completion during this fiscal year.

Audit *vide* their U.O No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have vetted the Action Taken Note.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation—135

Providing safe, tasty and hygienic food on Indian Railways is the duty of the Ministry and the concerned department *i.e.* the Indian Railway Catering and Tourism Corporation (IRCTC). The satisfaction level of traveling public which provides revenue to the Ministry should be given top priority. The Committee has noted various complaints regarding lack of hygiene and maintenance of base kitchen in the Railways. The Ministry in their reply have apprised the Committee about various certifications that have been acquired by house keeping services of the Ministry. The Committee laud the acquisition of international certifications and hopes that the corporation will provide efficient services to the traveling passengers and take into account the various tastes of the heterogeneous traveling public while serving them with a smile. The rates of various eatables both on the running trains and on platforms must be rationalized. The Ministry must curb the tendency of various vendors to charge exorbitant prices from the traveling public as far as food and beverage is concerned. The Ministry must inform the Committee about the steps taken in this regard. The Committee further recommends that the menu available on various prestigious trains like Rajdhani, Shatabdi etc. should have more variety and the passengers should be given an opportunity to exercise their choice while selecting the menu. The Committee have also taken note of the fact that outsourcing in catering services has not yielded very satisfactory results. The Committee, therefore, recommends that Ministry should enquire into the matter in depth and if necessary the role of the Indian Railway Catering and Tourism Corporation (IRCTC) be further enhanced to expand its catering services within the running trains and starting more food outlets at the stations. Where any inadequacy is found in getting the quality food by the passengers, the Ministry must take stern action.

[Sl. No. 20 Appendix....., Para No. 135 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

As regards providing safe, tasty and hygienic food on Indian Railways, regional varieties and choice of menu available on various prestigious trains like Rajdhani, Shatabdi etc. Other a-la-carte items and regional cuisine are sold by the mobile licensees besides the standard items. As regards rationalization of rates in Mail/ Express trains and at static catering units, the rates of tea/coffee, standard meals and breakfast are fixed by Railways and are uniform over Indian Railways. Instructions also exist that the waiters and bearers have to carry the menu card indicating the tariff duly approved by the licensing authority.

Stickers have been put on all the coaches/pantry cars of all the trains managed by IRCTC so as to advise the passengers about the quantity and prices to eliminate case of less quantity and avoid overcharging. Bi-lingual Menu Stickers have been designed depicting standard veg/non-veg meal and breakfast items along with the quantity and rates. The rates for other standard items such as packaged drinking water, readymade tea and standard coffee have also been indicated. Other miscellaneous information such as IRCTC website address and zonal control office nos. have been indicated for effective complaint redressal system. The drive for pasting of menu stickers was launched by IRCTC.

Besides, various drives by zonal railways and IRCTC takes care about overcharging by the licensee while serving various standard food items and proprietary food products, such as, packaged drinking water, biscuits, cold drinks etc. Stringent action is taken against the defaulting licensee by imposing severe fines etc.

As regards the recommended enhanced role of IRCTC in railway catering, it is stated that IRCTC has been formed to upgrade and professionalize the catering and hospitality services of Indian Railways. Accordingly, management of catering activities along with staff has been handed over to IRCTC. Presently, IRCTC is managing catering units at A, B and C category stations and in trains. Catering services at D, E and F category stations will be handed over to IRCTC when the corporation becomes equipped to take over these units.

Audit *vide* their U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have vetted the Action Taken Note.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

CHAPTER III

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM THE GOVERNMENT

Observation and Recommendation-117

The Committees are constrained to note that low priority has been accorded to sanitation and cleanliness activities on Indian Railways owing to a wide spectrum of responsibility assigned to various functionaries like Chief Health Inspector/Health Inspector (CHI/HI), Station Masters/Managers etc. Moreover, absence of a comprehensive action plan at the apex level led to efforts towards cleanliness remaining as isolated efforts, with sporadic instructions being issued from time to time without being cohesive. It is appalling to learn that even at the Railway Board level different directorates were responsible for different areas of cleanliness related activities and schemes. It is observed that multiple departments like commercial, medical and engineering departments are involved in cleaning operations. The Committee are of the opinion that the responsibility for cleaning should lie with one department most preferably with the medical department since their awareness levels and sensitivity regarding cleanliness is expected to be better than others. Various small controls handed out to various departments/agencies should be clubbed together for effective handling and financial viability. The Committee desire that the Ministry should create a comprehensive mechanism with a clearly laid out reporting structure whereby the responsibility of maintaining cleanliness and hygienic surroundings at railway stations and in trains, exclusively vests with one nodal agency *i.e.* medical department. Also all the other departments such as Engineering, mechanical and others would work in conjunction and unison with Medical Department. The Committee recommend that the decision taken by Railways should be finalized within six month of the presentation of this report.

[Sl.No. 2 Appendix....., Para No. 117 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

There is now a clean demarcation of responsibilities amongst the various departments involved in this activity. It is not practically possible to handle all activities by one department alone. The improvements seen in cleanliness standard during the recent times amply bring out the validity of the present set up.

Audit *vide* their U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3-/2006(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have vetted the Action taken Note.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation—132

The Scheme 'Clean Train Station' (CTS) was launched in October 2002 as a major initiative for improving train cleanliness. Under this scheme mechanized enroute cleaning of trains was introduced during halts at identified stations on major trunk routes of Indian Railways. As per the scheme select trains were to be cleaned at the nominated stations and necessary arrangements were to be made on the specified platforms in a planned manner. However, to the utter dismay of the Committee it has been found that a large number of nominated trains could not be attended due to non-placement of the trains on the nominated platforms. At some stations in East Railway, even the nomination of platforms was not done judiciously, Inadequate coordination between departments also resulted in non-availability of adequate infrastructure and requisite time for implementing the scheme. Thus the CTS scheme though ambitious and well intentioned could not achieve its perceived goals. Chairman, Railway Board, during the course of evidence also apprised the Committee of various initiatives being taken by the Ministry which included cleaning of the trains at their originating point with high powered jet machines. The Committee hope that Ministry will take remedial action to plug the gaps and intensify their efforts towards achieving the said objective of the scheme in a sustained manner.

[Sl. No. 17 Appendix....., Para No. 132 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

All efforts are made to place the passenger carrying trains on the nominated platforms. However, sometimes this is not feasible due to the late running of trains, maintenance of platform/tracks and other operational constraints etc. In those conditions, the affected train has to be placed at other suitable platform. However, announcements are made well in advance about the new platform of the train giving ample time to the CTS staff to equip themselves at the new platform.

In order to provide clean and hygienic environment in trains, railways are progressively adopting intensive mechanized cleaning of coaches/trains in the coaching maintenance depots before originating.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3-/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The response is partial. Apart from ensuring that the designated trains are brought on nominated platforms adequate manpower needs to be ensured so as to clean all the reserved coaches of the trains within the scheduled stoppage time. Otherwise CTS is largely restricted to cleaning the AC coaches.

Ministry's Comments

Clean Train Station scheme has so far been made operational at 27 important stations of Indian Railways. The standard project specifications for this scheme details the manpower requirements besides other resource specifications. Railways have been advised to ensure adherence to the specifications.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

Observation and Recommendation-116

The Committee note that Indian Railways cover over 8 thousand stations and ferry around 16 million passengers everyday which comprise of various socio-economic backgrounds and literacy levels. Keeping in view the magnitude and scale of operations of Railways, the Committee has examined this subject with utmost profundity. The Committee's Recommendations which have been brought out in the successive paragraphs are based on the audit findings and Committee's own inquiry based on written and oral evidence tendered before the Committee by the officials of the Ministry of Railways. The Committee also sought responses from interested organizations and members of the public for understanding this subject in depth. A close scrutiny of the subject and the material gathered by the Committee reveals a sorry state of affairs as far as cleanliness and sanitation on Indian Railways is concerned. The deficiencies and shortcomings which warrant immediate attention of the railways have been brought out in the successive paragraphs. Committee's examination of the subject has led to inescapable conclusion that cleanliness and sanitation activities on Railways require immediate attention of the Ministry. The Committee are astonished to note that Railways are yet to adopt any standards or performance indicators (*i.e.* the expected quality of the outcome) for any cleanliness related activity carried out in stations and in trains against which the actual performance could be judged. The Committee also note that standards for supervision were also not prescribed by Railways for any cleanliness related activity on stations and in trains. The Ministry in their detailed reply in this regard have stated that they have devised a comprehensive plan for the purpose which admitting that prescribing physical benchmarks for the standard of cleanliness is not possible as the level of cleanliness is not quantifiable. In this connection the Committee strongly feel that Ministry must resort to out-of-box thinking on this issue and must display readiness and swiftness to measure the sanitary conditions. The Committee recommend that there should be daily routine checks by the Divisional General Managers and inspections at least once in every fortnight and it should be video recorded to clearly keep a tract record of the sanitation levels available on the platform and Railway premises. Strict action must be taken against the offenders who resort to spillage etc. on the platforms. This can be easily done with the help of CCTV cameras on all the major stations across the country which have been earmarked for 'World Class Standards'.

The Committee further note the 'Clean Hour concept' i.e. during a notified lean period entire station premises are thoroughly cleaned on daily basis should

be vigorously followed by all the Zones. In this connection, the Committee desire that the Recommendations, furnished by the task force constituted to address the issues of cleanliness, gadgets and manpower should be executed in letter and spirit. Moreover, the Ministry must bring out a status report on the subject of execution of these recommendations within six months of presentation of this report.

[Sl. No. 1 Appendix....., Para No. 116 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

There are frequent checks on the standard of cleanliness at different levels which has lifted up the cleanliness standard considerably in the recent times. Various important measures e.g. machine cleaning, outsourced cleaning through reputed and experienced agencies etc. have been taken to achieve this objective. However, it is not feasible to quantify or lay down a benchmark for this. Providing CCTV Cameras for this activity is also not feasible as CCTV cameras are also provided/proposed to be provided for ensuring security in station premises. Both the functions by one agency will not be possible.

With a view to improve the cleanliness and hygiene standard in coaching trains, a number of policy decisions have been taken by the Ministry for use of standard mechanized cleaning systems and also regular attention on board as well as on enroute nominated stations. With these schemes, it is possible to standardize the equipment and resources to be used by each of the Railways, requisite man power, use of standard cleaning process and other required resources to sustain the quality of work. These schemes will ensure improved cleaning of the coaches before start of journey, enroute attention after certain kms. of travel and also in select trains, regular attention by professional on board house keeping team.

In order to make adequate assessment of the cleaning quality for sustained improvement, scheme also incorporates the system of monitoring each of the activity of cleanliness and hygiene using a score card and a feedback from the passengers. The score card maintained by the coaching depot will help assess the standard of the cleanliness and also the passenger satisfaction.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

Though various measures have been initiated to achieve a higher level of cleanliness in station premises and in trains, remedial measures initiated towards systematic and effective implementation of these initiatives have not been addressed in the response. Audit observed that schemes such as 'Pay and Use toilets' and 'Clean Train Stations' and initiatives such as mechanized cleaning were poorly implemented in the zones.

Ministry's Comments

Zonal Railways have been instructed to address the issue and take proper remedial action.

In order to improve upon the standards of Cleanliness and Sanitation, mechanized cleaning of train rakes has been implemented on 41 coaching depots over Indian Railways. Besides, On Board Housekeeping Services (OBHS) for frequent cleaning of coach toilets, doorways, aisles and passenger compartments during the run of the trains has also been so far implemented on 107 train pairs.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 9 of Chapter I.

Observation and Recommendation-118

The Committee have been informed by the Ministry that Additional General Manager is the nodal officer at the Zonal level. The Committee strongly recommend that the Ministry should constitute a Committee to look into the entire gamut of issues regarding lack of co-ordination and clarity of approach *vis-a-vis* Cleanliness and Sanitation amongst various departments of the Railways. The Committee desire that they be informed about the steps taken by the Ministry to ensure better co-ordination between the various concerned departments. Regarding the creation of a new post of Member exclusively for cleanliness and Sanitation, the Ministry have informed the Committee that this will lead to overlapping/duplication of functions with the other Board Members which itself will defeat the very purpose for which the post is created. The Ministry have also stated that responsibility of cleanliness has been appropriately distributed among Board Members and they are looking after their respective areas of cleanliness with utmost focus and control over the department under them. This does not address the anomalies that allocation of multiple and varied tasks to specialized functionaries resulted in diffused focus on maintaining cleanliness on railway stations. Owing to wide spectrum of responsibilities assigned to Station Master/Manager etc., cleanliness was viewed as a very low priority area. Since the responsibility of maintenance of cleanliness even within the station premises rested with different departments various areas were left unattended due to lack of effective co-ordination. The Committee have taken a very serious view of the matter and desire that an independent authority at the apex level solely responsible for cleanliness and sanitation on Indian Railways should be created under intimation to the Committee to oversee and co-ordinate such efforts amongst various departments of Indian Railways. This will facilitate a focused approach in policy making and development of a comprehensive action plan at the apex level including budgetary considerations for a subhead specifically assigned for Cleanliness and

Sanitation activities. In view of this, the committee very strongly reiterate that the Ministry must strengthen co-ordination efforts and put in place an institutionalized mechanism at the Apex level at the earliest but definitely by the time of furnishing ACTION TAKEN replies to the recommendations contained in this report dedicated towards Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways to establish a clear cut administrative control in this respect. If required, the function of medical department may be placed directly under this apex body.

[Sl.No. 3 Appendix....., Para No. 118 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Presently, there is no proposal to have an apex body exclusively for cleanliness as functional members are looking after this area of concern. It is also not correct to say that very low priority has been accorded to this activity. All the levels, including the DRM, AGM, GM and Board are fully involved in making improvements in this area.

Audit *vide* their U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have vetted the Action Taken Note.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 12 of Chapter I.

Observation and Recommendation-124

The Committee understand that the number of coaches in long distance as well as short distance trains have also increased with increased quantum of passenger traffic. Contrary to this the Committee find that number of water-taps at the platform are not enough to realistically cater to the demand of the increased quantum of passengers. At times, especially during the summer months, long queues are seen at the taps. Frightening situation is also observed if the stoppage time of the train is of very short duration. In view of this, the Committee feel that this situation can be easily solved by increasing the number of taps of potable water at all the stations. By doing so lesser number of passengers will accumulate on one tap at a given point of time which will check the spilling of water around the tap and will also help in the cleanliness of surrounding area of the tap. Possibility should also be explored if modernized taps such as push button taps as seen at the airports can be introduced not only to maintain the cleanliness standards but also to check littering in terms of discarded water bottles. The Committee, therefore, desire that the number of taps be increased expeditiously in phased manner at all stations throughout the country. The steps initiated in this regard should be intimated to the Committee and they are confident that the Ministry will take all necessary steps based on their recommendations to bring about tangible results.

[Sl. No. 9 Appendix....., Para No. 124 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Regarding increasing number of water taps at stations, this issue has been examined along with other passenger amenities at stations by a Committee of Executive Directors. Revised norms for passenger amenities at stations as per category of stations have been laid down and necessary instructions issued to all Zonal Railways for implementation on 17th January, 2007. Further examination/revision at such a short interval is not called for.

Audit *vide* their U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have vetted the Action Taken Note.

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 21 of Chapter-I.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Observation and Recommendation—133

In Committee's view a responsive and effective grievance redressal of passengers at railway stations and in trains with respect to cleanliness and sanitation is of extreme importance in order to restore faith of the traveling passengers on the systems in place in the Indian Railways. Responding to a question about the mechanism evolved by the Ministry in this regard the Ministry informed the Committee that there is a laid down system of registration of complaints including cleanliness, by passengers. At all the stations a complaint cum suggestion book is maintained with the station manager/station superintendent. In trains, guards of passenger and Mail/Express trains carry such complaint books. In addition, the Manager of the pantry car is also required to make the complaint book available to passengers on demand. The Complaints/suggestions given by the travelling public are duly acknowledged at the time of registration. The Committee are not happy with the reply of the Ministry. The Committee recommend that the Ministry must strengthen the existing mechanism of grievance redressal. The designated officer meant for the purpose should be easily approachable to the travelling passengers. The Ministry should further ensure that this system is modernized with the effective usage of technology. There should be an automatic system of complaint registration and a time limit should be prescribed for the redressal of these complaints. The Committee strongly recommend the setting up of a call centre especially for the purpose. This facility can also be utilized for voicing and registering security concerns of the travelling passengers. A team of officials should be allocated this task and they should be allocated this function on the running trains. While selecting the team, the Ministry must keep in mind that it displays readiness and cheerfulness in sorting out the problems of those in distress. Moreover contact numbers of the concerned officials should be prominently displayed within the coaches to reassure the passengers on the subject.

[Sl. No. 18 Appendix....., Para No. 133 of 83rd Report of PAC (14th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Indian Railways function as a public utility service. In view of the enormity of operations and interface with a large number of passengers every day, grievances

do occur and efforts are undertaken for their redressal and to find ways to eliminate causes for such complaints. Indian Railways has a well knit Public Grievances Redressal Machinery which takes prompt action on grievances/complaints registered by the travelling public.

At the Railway Board's level, Executive Director (Public Grievances) is the Public Grievances Redressal Officer. At the Zonal Railway's level, the Additional General Managers function as the Directors of Public Grievances and coordinate the work of redressal of public complaints. At Divisional level, Additional Divisional Railway Managers have been nominated as Public Grievances Redressal Officers. They hold periodical meetings with the concerned officers/Station Managers in this regard. At the stations, the Station Managers are personally responsible for the public grievances. Suggestion Boxes/Public Grievance Booths/May I help you Booths have been kept at important stations. Complaint and suggestion boxes are also available at key places like Stations/Refreshment Rooms/Reservation Offices and with the Train Superintendent/Guards of trains.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 153/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 15.9.2009 have observed the following:—

The response only elaborates the existing system of responsibility/accountability at various levels for redressal of grievances. The issues of easy accessibility and complaint/suggestion books, promoting awareness amongst users have not been addressed. The survey conducted as a part of Audit indicated a low awareness level amongst users.

Ministry's Comments

Comments/suggestion boxes in properly latched/locked conditions have been provided in all important trains over and above the complaint/suggestion books already available at important stations and trains. In trains these boxes are available with the Guard SLR. The process of providing these boxes in the pantry cars of trains is under progress. It has also been instructed to screen these complaints/suggestions at divisional level and bring the same to the GMs knowledge for taking appropriate remedial action.

Railways have been advised to give wide publicity to the existence of these complaint/suggestion boxes also through Public Address System and publicity campaigns.

Audit *vide* U.O. No. 168/RA-II/8-3/2006/(MIP) dated 20.10.2009 have observed the following:—

The replies of the Ministry of Railways may be taken as vetted by Audit. However, since these instructions need to ultimately translate into improvements on the ground, the actual condition obtaining on the ground would be assessed subsequently in future and the PAC suitably apprised.

(Ministry of Railways' case No. 2009-BC-PAC/XIV/83 dated 30-10-2009.)

Comments of the Committee

Please *see* Para No. 25 of Chapter-I.

CHAPTER V

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE
GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

—NIL—

NEW DELHI;
26 April, 2010

6 Vaisakha, 1932 (*Saka*)

GOPINATH MUNDE
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

APPENDIX I

MINUTES OF THE ELEVENTH SITTING OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2009-10) HELD ON 26TH APRIL, 2010

The Committee sat on Monday, the 26th April, 2010 from 1530 hrs to 1650 hrs. in Committee Room 'C', Ground Floor, Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Gopinath Munde — *Chairman*

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Anandrao Vithoba Adsul
3. Shri Khagen Das
4. Shri Naveen Jindal
5. Shri Satpal Maharaj
6. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
7. Dr. K. Sambasiva Rao
8. Shri Yashwant Sinha
9. Shri Aruna Kumar Vundavalli

Rajya Sabha

10. Dr. K. Malaisamy
11. Shri N.K. Singh

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Raj Shekhar Sharma — *Director*
2. Shri M.K. Madhusudhan — *Additional Director*
3. Shri D.R. Mohanty — *Under Secretary*

Representatives of the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India

1. Ms. Rekha Gupta, — Dy. CAG Central (RC)
2. Shri R.B. Sinha — Director General (Report Central)
3. Ms. Usha Sankar — Director General (Autonomous Bodies)
4. Shri Gautham Guha — Director General of Audit (Defence Services)
5. Shri P.K. Kataria — Pr. Director of Audit, Report Central (RC)
6. Shri K.R. Sriram — Pr. Director of Audit, Report Central (Economic & Services Ministries)

- | | | |
|-----|-------------------------|---|
| 7. | Shri R.G. Viswanathan | — Pr. Director of Audit, (Scientific Departments) |
| 8. | Shri C.M. Sane | — Pr. Director of Audit (Air Force & Navy) |
| 9. | Shri H.K. Dharmadhekari | — Pr. Director (State Report Audit) |
| 10. | Shri Rajvir Singh | — Accountant General (Audit) Delhi |
| 11. | Ms. Divya Malhotra | — Pr. Director of Audit. (Railways) |

2. At the outset, the Chairman, PAC welcomed the Members of the Committee and the Audit Officers to the sitting of the Committee. The Chairman, then apprised the Committee that out of the eleven Draft Reports slated for consideration, eight have been finalized by Sub-Committee V. Thereafter, the Committee took up the following Draft Reports for consideration and adoption:

- (i) Draft Report on "**Non-compliance by Ministries/Departments in timely submission of Action Taken Notes on Non-selected Audit Paragraphs**" (Ministry of Finance-Department of Expenditure);
- (ii) Draft Report on "**Functioning of A.D.G.E.S. Radar, Procurement of Special Clothing and Mountaineering Equipment and Delay in Execution/Renewal of lease**" (Ministry of Defence) based on Chapter 1 of C&AG Report No. PA 5 of 2008 (Air Force and Navy), Para No. 3.1 of C&AG Report No. CA 4 of 2008 (Army) and Para No. 2.1 of C&AG Report No. 4 of 2007 (Army) respectively;
- (iii) Draft Report on "**Revenue loss due to delay in levy of Toll Fees**" (Ministry of Road Transport and Highways) based on Chapter XIV of C&AG Report No. CA 2 of 2007;
- (iv) Draft Report on "**Administration of Universal Service Obligation (USO) FUND**" (Ministry of Communications and Information Technology-Department of Telecommunications) based on Chapter 1 of C&AG Report No. PA 1 of 2008;
- (v) Draft Report on "**Loss of Revenue due to Short Levy of Tax, Incorrect Classification of Excisable Goods and Non-fulfillment of Export Obligation**" (Ministry of Finance-Department of Revenue) based on Para No. 3.24.4 of C&AG Report No. 8 of 2007 (Direct Taxes), Para No. 2.2.1 of C&AG Report No. CA 7 of 2008 (Central Excise) & Para No. 7.1 of C&AG Report No. 10 of 1998 (Customs) respectively;
- (vi) Draft Report on "**Disaster Management and Land Management in Indian Railways**" (Ministry of Railways) based on Chapter I and Chapter II respectively of C&AG Report No. 8 of 2008;
- (vii) Draft Report on "**Conservation and Protection of Tigers in Tiger Reserves**" (Ministry of Environment and Forests) based on C&AG Report No. 18 of 2006;

- (viii) Draft Report on "**Procurement of Stores and Inventory Control**" (Department of Space) based on Chapter II of C&AG Report No. PA 2 of 2008;
- (ix) Draft Report on "**Freight and Wagon Management on Indian Railways**" (Ministry of Railways) based on Chapter I of C&AG Report No. 6 of 2007 (Railway-Performance Audit);
- (x) Draft Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/ Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Fifty-fifth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on "**Development of Land by Delhi Development Authority**" (Ministry of Urban Development); and
- (xi) Draft Report on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/ Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Eighty-third Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on "**Cleanliness and Sanitation on Indian Railways**" (Ministry of Railways).

3. After some deliberations, the Committee adopted the above mentioned Draft Reports with some modifications and authorized the Chairman to finalise these Reports in light of the suggestions made by the Members and the consequential changes arising out of the factual verification by the Audit and present the same to Parliament.

4. The Chairman thanked the Members for their cooperation and active participation in the Committee's deliberations. He also thanked the PAC Secretariat and the Audit Officers for the assistance rendered to the Committee in the examination of the subject and finalization of the Reports.

5. The Members of the Committee thanked the Chairman for his guidance in the smooth conduct of the meetings of the Committee.

The Committee then adjourned.

APPENDIX II

(Vide Paragraph 5 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR EIGHTY-THIRD REPORT (FOURTEENTH LOK SABHA)

(i) Total number of Observations/Recommendations	20
(ii) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government;	
<i>Paragraph Nos. 4-8, 10-16, 19 and 20</i>	<i>Total: 14</i>
	<i>Percentage: 70%</i>
(iii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the reply of the Government:	
<i>Paragraph Nos. 2, 17</i>	<i>Total: 2</i>
	<i>Percentage: 10%</i>
(iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:	
<i>Paragraph Nos. 1,3,9 and 18</i>	<i>Total: 4</i>
	<i>Percentage: 20%</i>
(v) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies:	
- <i>Nil</i> -	