

COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2010-2011)

FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA

FIFTH REPORT

**[Action Taken by Government on the recommendations/observations made by the
Committee in their Twentieth and Twenty First Reports (Fourteenth Lok Sabha)]**

(Presented on 24 March,2011)

S

E

A

L

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

Febraury2010/Phalguna 1932 (Saka)

C.B.II(CPL) No.

Price : Rs.

© 2006 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Fourteenth Edition) and Printed by the Manager, Government of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi- 110002

C O N T E N T S

	PAGE
COMPOSSITION OF THE COMMITTEE	(iii)
INTRODUCTION	(v)
REPORT : Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations/Observations made by the Committee in their Twentieth and Twenty First Reports (Fourteenth Lok Sabha)	01
<u>APPENDICES</u>	
Appendix-I Statement showing Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations/Observations of the Committee in their Twentieth Report (14th LS)	07
Appendix-II Statement showing Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations/Observations of the Committee in their Twenty First Report (14th LS)	13

**COMPOSITION OF COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2010-2011)**

Shri Harin Pathak - Chairman

MEMBERS

2. Shri Anto Antony
3. Shri Harish Choudhary
4. Shri Syed Shahnawaz Hussain
5. Shri Ram Singh Kaswan
6. Shri Pakauri Lal
7. Shri Baidyanath Prasad Mahato
8. Shri Narahari Mahato
9. Shri Basori Singh Masram
10. Dr. Vinay Kumar Pandey
11. Shri Nityananda Pradhan
12. Shri Ramesh Rathod
13. Shri Gutha Sukhender Reddy
14. Shri Mahendra Kumar Roy
15. Shri P. Viswanathan

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Deepak Mahna - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Neera Singh - Director
3. Shri J.M. Baisakh - Additional Director
4. Smt. Maya Lingi - Deputy Secretary

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table, having been authorized by the Committee to present the Report on their behalf, present this Fifth Report on the action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations contained in the Twentieth and Twenty First Reports (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee.

2. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 05 January, 2010.

3. For facility of reference, observations/recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report.

NEW DELHI

February, 2011
Magha 1932 (Saka)

HARIN PATHAK,
Chairman,
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table

REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations contained in their Twentieth and Twenty First Reports (14th Lok Sabha) which were presented to Lok Sabha on 22.10.2008 & 24.02.2009.

2. The Twentieth Report dealt with delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of (i) Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur and (ii) National Commission for Women, New Delhi.
3. The Twenty First Report dealt with Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of (i) National Horticulture Board, Gurgaon; and (ii) Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority, Manipur.
4. The Action Taken Notes have been received from the Government in respect of all the recommendations/observations contained in the above two Reports. Accordingly, statements showing the action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations contained in the Twentieth and Twenty First Reports (14th Lok Sabha) are given in **Appendix-I & II** respectively.
5. The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their recommendations/observations in the succeeding paragraphs.

(i) Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur

6. In paragraph 1.18 (20th Report, 14th Lok Sabha) relating to delay in laying of the documents of Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur the Committee had recommended as under:

“The Committee note that Malaviya National Institute of Technology under the Control of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts. A scrutiny of the dates of laying of these documents of the Institute pertaining to the years from 2000-2001 to 2005-2006 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 14 months to 23 months in respect of each year. The documents for the year 2006-2007 which should have been laid by 31.12.2007 have not been laid as yet. The delay in laying the Institute's documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee had as early as in 2001-02 (7th Report-13th Lok Sabha) brought out the Ministry's failure to adhere to the time schedule of laying Institute's documents. The Committee are distressed to point out that the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) have not cared all these years to evolve any mechanism to ensure timely laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts and prompt discharge of their responsibility towards Parliament regarding Institute which receives an annual grant of over Rs.13.32 crore a year. The Committee hope that the Ministry will institute a regular monitoring mechanism to adhering to the time schedule prepared by the Ministry so that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Institute are laid before Parliament in time in future. The Committee would like to be apprised of the time schedule prepared in this regard.”

7. In their Action Taken Note, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) have stated as under:

“There has been delay in submission of the Annual Report and Annual Accounts on the Table of Lok Sabha due to (i) Delay in conducting of audit and issue of audit certificate by A.G. Rajasthan (ii) Transition of the Institute from Malaviya Regional Engineering College, Jaipur to Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur (iii) Internal problem prevailing at that time.

The Institute has taken steps to clear the backlog of pending reports. As a result, the Annual Reports & Annual Accounts for 2003-04, 2004-05, 2005-06 have since been placed on the table of Lok Sabha.

The Annual Report & Annual Audited Accounts for the year 2006-07 were sent to the Lok Sabha Table office on 16.12.2008. The delay in preparation of the reports for 2006-07 was primarily due to late (i) arrival of Audit party for the Institute's Audit and (ii) issue of audit certificate by the A.G. Rajasthan. At the same time, the office of A.G. in Jaipur has been requested for timely conducting the audit of the Institute and issuing audit certificate at the earliest so that the same can be submitted in both the Houses of Parliament in time.

Another reason is insistence on the part of the A.G. Office to know whether the Annual Report & Audit Report for the previous year has been laid or not. As per State AG, they will take up audit only when the previous reports are laid. The State AG was informed not to insist on the same and take up the audit immediately on receipt of accounts from the Institute."

8. **The Committee regret to note that the action taken reply given by the Government on the recommendations contained in para 1.18 of 20th Report (14 Lok Sabha) is not satisfactory. The Committee had desired that the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) should evolve a regular monitoring mechanism to adhere to the time schedule so that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur are laid before Parliament in time in future. However, no concrete measures appear to have been taken in this direction. Instead of improving the position of incessant delays in laying of Reports on the Table of the House, the Committee are dismayed to note that the Annual Reports for the years 2007-2008 and 2008-2009 were again laid on the Table of the House with delay of 2 months and 7 months, respectively. The Committee are also disappointed to note that the Audited Accounts for the year 2007-2008 were laid on the Table of the House with delay of 16 months. Further more, the Audited Accounts for the year 2008-2009* and the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts for the year 2009-2010 have not been laid so far. The Committee, therefore, reiterate that the Ministry of Human Resources Development (Department of Higher Education) should institute an effective monitoring mechanism to ensure that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are laid on the Table of the House with in the stipulated time in future.**

***Laid on the Table of the House on 9th March, 2011**

(ii) National Commission for Women, New Delhi

9. In paragraph 2.25 of their 20th Report (14th Lok Sabha) relating to delay in laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of National Commission for Women, New Delhi, the Committee had recommended as under:-

The Committee are dismayed to note that the Commission took 22 months to send the documents to the Ministry after its approval for the year 2003-04. The reasons put forth by the Commission for the delay due to shortage of staff is not acceptable to the Committee. In their view, the Commission should have taken necessary steps to fill the vacancies in time. The Committee, therefore, recommend that immediate necessary steps should be taken by the Commission to fill up the vacancies so that delay in laying the documents in time should not occur in future on this account. The Committee also note that the Ministry took 25, 30 and 12 months in laying the final documents of the Commission for the years 2001-02, 2002-03 and 2003-04 respectively after receipt of the same from the Commission. It was stated that the delay was largely due to obtaining the Action Taken Report on the recommendations contained in the Annual Reports of the Commission as the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are to be laid in the Parliament alongwith the Memorandum of Action Taken in respect of the recommendations contained in the Annual Report as per section 14 of NCW Act. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should pursue the matter with the concerned Ministries/Departments and make concerted efforts for obtaining the Action Taken Reports well in time from the concerned Ministries/Departments to avoid delays in future in laying the documents on this account. The Committee also recommend that the Ministry should lay the Memoranda of Action Taken along with the Annual Reports which are received by the Commission by the scheduled time of sending the documents for laying before the Parliament and the remaining Memoranda of Action Taken which are received late after sending the documents to the Parliament should be laid separately. For this, if need be, Section 14 of NCW Act should be suitably amended. The Committee may be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

10. In their action taken note, the Ministry of Women and Child Development have stated as under:-

“An inter-Ministerial Committee co-chaired by Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development and Member-Secretary, National Commission for Women has been set up to monitor furnishing of ATNs on the recommendations contained in Annual Reports of the Commission. This Committee has the representation of those Ministries/Departments which are concerned with the recommendations, at a level not below the rank of Joint Secretary in the Concerned Ministries/Departments. Serious efforts made by Ministry of Women and Child Development resulted that the Annual Reports of NCW during the years 2004-05 & 2005-06 laid on the Table of the House on 24.10.2008 and 2006-07 was laid on 19.12.2008. Ministry of Women & Child Development is also taking necessary steps for the documents for the year 2007-08 to be laid with the stipulated period. The Annual Report for the year 2007-08 is under preparation of the Commission.”

11. Taking a serious note of the persistent delays in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of National Commission for Women, New Delhi for the years 2001-2002 to 2003-2004, the Committee in their 20th Report had recommended for remedial measures to overcome the problems relating to timely laying of the documents. In this regard, the Committee appreciate that an inter-Ministerial Committee co-chaired by Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development and Member-Secretary, National Commission for Women has been set up to monitor furnishing of ATNs on the recommendations contained in Annual Reports of the Commission. However, the Committee

are still concerned about delay in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of National Commission of Women. The Committee are unhappy to note that the Reports of the Commission for years 2004-2005 to 2007-2008 were delayed in laying on the Table of the House. Moreover, the documents for the years 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 which should have been laid by 31 December of their, respective, accounting years have not been laid so far. Evidently, the remedial steps taken so far by the Ministry/Commission are yet to yield the desired results. The Committee take strong exception to this state of affairs and urge the Ministry to evolve effective mechanism to ensure that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institute for the years 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 are laid on the Table of the House without any further delay. The Committee, therefore, would like to be apprised of the effective and conclusive actions taken by the Ministry in this regard to avoid future delay in laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts.

(iii) Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority, Manipur

12. In paragraph 2.17 (21st Report, 14th Lok Sabha) relating to delay in laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of State Mission Authority (Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan) Manipur, Imphal, the Committee had recommended as under :-

“The Committee find that one of the reasons for delay in laying of the documents on the Table of the House was due to the disturbances/ interference of different groups of unwanted elements which affect the working atmosphere. The Committee feel that even after accounting for such factors, nine months period was more than sufficient to complete the reports and lay them on the Table of the House. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Department of School Education & Literacy should pay due attention into the affairs of the Authority seriously to ensure that the Authority discharges its accountability to Parliament every year with in the laid down time frame.”

13. In their action taken note, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education & Literacy) have stated as under:-

“The State Implementation Society, SSA, Manipur has informed that as advised by the Parliamentary Committee on Papers Laid on the Table, the State has invited Expression of Interest from reputed CA Firms through open advertisement in the local and national dailies and selected two CA Firms as external auditors to ensure that all datelines are met as per guidelines of SSA. The audit of SSA account of Manipur will start very soon and the Annual Reports and Audited statements for 2008-09 will be submitted within the dateline.

14. The Committee note with concern that despite remedial measures taken by the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of School Education and Literacy)/Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority, Manipur, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Authority for the years 2006-07 and 2007-08 were laid on the Table of the House with delays of 14 months and 11 months, respectively. The Committee further note that even after the assurance given by the Ministry, the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for the years 2008-09* and 2009-2010 are yet to be laid on the Table of the House. The Committee are distressed to note that no effective steps by the Ministry have been taken in the matter in letter and spirit to ensure that the documents are laid within the prescribed period of time. The Committee reiterate that the Ministry should draw up a time schedule and institute a proper monitoring mechanism to ensure that the documents are laid on the Table of the House within the stipulated time.

NEW DELHI

December, 2010
Pausa 1932 (Saka)

HARIN PATHAK,
Chairman,
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table

*Laid on the Table of the House on 9th March, 2011

APPENDIX – I
(Vide Para 4 of the Report)

**STATEMENT SHOWING ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE
RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN
THEIR TWENTIETH REPORT (14TH LOK SABHA)**

Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1.18)

The Committee note that Malaviya National Institute of Technology under the Control of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts. A scrutiny of the dates of laying of these documents of the Institute pertaining to the years from 2000-2001 to 2005-2006 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 14 months to 23 months during these years.. The documents for the year 2006-2007 which should have been laid by 31.12.2007 have not been laid as yet. The delay in laying the Institute's documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee had as early as in 2001-02 (7th Report-13th Lok Sabha) brought out the Ministry's failure to adhere to the time schedule of laying Institute's documents. The Committee are distressed to point out that the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) have not cared all these years to evolve any mechanism to ensure timely laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts and prompt discharge of their responsibility towards Parliament regarding Institute which receives an annual grant of over Rs.13.32 crore a year. The Committee hope that the Ministry will institute a regular monitoring mechanism to adhering to the time schedule prepared by the Ministry so that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Institute are laid before Parliament in time in future. The Committee would like to be apprised of the time schedule prepared in this regard.

Reply by the Government

There has been delay in submission of the Annual Report and Annual Accounts on the Table of Lok Sabha due to (i) Delay in conducting of audit and issue of audit certificate by A.G. Rajasthan (ii) Transition of the Institute from Malaviya Regional Engineering College, Jaipur to Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur (iii) Internal problem prevailing at that time.

The Institute has taken steps to clear the backlog of pending reports. As a result, the Annual Reports & Annual Accounts for 2003-04, 2004-05, 2005-06 have since been placed on the table of Lok Sabha.

The Annual Report & Annual Audited Accounts for the year 2006-07 were sent to the Lok Sabha Table office on 16.12.2008. The delay in preparation of the reports for 2006-07 was primarily due to late (i) arrival of Audit party for the Institute's Audit and (ii) issue of audit certificate by the A.G. Rajasthan. At the same time, the office of A.G. in Jaipur has been requested for timely conducting the audit of the Institute and issuing audit certificate at the earliest so that the same can be submitted in both the Houses of Parliament in time.

Another reason is insistence on the part of the A.G. Office to know whether the Annual Report & Audit Report for the previous year has been laid or not. As per State AG, they will take up audit only when the previous reports are laid. The State AG was informed not to insist on the same and take up the audit immediately on receipt of accounts from the Institute.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development O.M. No. 7-21/2008-TS-III dated 18 March,2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1.19)

The Committee find from the information furnished by the Ministry that the main reasons for delay for the year 2000-01 to 2003-04 were primarily due to late finalisation, audit delay, transition of the Institute (on 26.6.2002) from a regional Engineering College to National Institute of Technology and getting approval of documents from the Board of Governors. The Committee have further been informed that presently there is no problem in convening the meeting of Board of Governors. The Committee also note that the Institute has hired a Chartered Accountant for internal auditing of the Institute accounts and to resolve the audit objection/queries, which will help the Institute in adhering to the timeframe by Ministry of Human Resource Development. The Committee hope that with the introduction of the internal audit cell, the number of audit queries will go down which would facilitate expeditious completion of audit of accounts.

Reply by the Government

The backlog of previous years' Annual Reports & Annual Audited Accounts has been cleared after October 2005.

The Annual Accounts of 2005-06 and 2006-07 were finalized by the Institute in time; but could not be sent to this Ministry because of long time taken by AG for issuing audit certificate. At present, Board of

Governors meetings are held at regular intervals and number of Audit observations/queries has come down considerably.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development O.M. No. 7-21/2008-TS-III dated 18 March, 2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1.20)

The Committee note that the time taken by Accountant General, Rajasthan for completing their task of audit report in respect of the Institute was 7 to 12 months from the years 2000-2001 to 2004-2005. The reasons for taking such a long time for completing the audit report was stated to be getting approval of the Annual Accounts along-with the Audit memos/paras from the CAG Office, New Delhi which were sent by Accountant General, Rajasthan . The Committee feel that the problem can be overcome if the matter is appropriately taken up with Audit Authorities. The Committee would like the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) to take up with the A.G. Rajasthan the question of the need for timely completion of audit to avoid consequential delay in laying the documents before Parliament.

Reply by the Government

The Institute sends request to the AG Rajasthan for sending the audit party for audit of the Institute. Now, timely action is taken by AG Rajasthan for sending the audit party; but it takes some time before the final audit report is received. The audit team came to the institute on 21st August, 2008 for auditing the accounts of 2007-08 and completed the inspection on 24th October 2008. English version of the draft audit report was received for comments and the Institute has since sent replies thereto. The audit report is still awaited from the AG Rajasthan. The Annual Report for 2007-08 has, however, been received in this Ministry. Once the Annual Accounts are received from the institute, necessary action will be taken to lay both these Reports on the Table of Lok Sabha.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development O.M. No. 7-21/2008-TS-III dated 18 March, 2009)

National Commission for Women, New Delhi

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2.20)

The Committee note that the National Commission for Women (NCW) under the administrative control of the Ministry of Women and Child Development has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of annual reports and audited accounts. A scrutiny of dates of laying of these documents of the Commission pertaining to the years 2001-02 to 2003-2004 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 33 to 38 months in respect of each year. The documents for the years 2004-05, 2005-06 and 2006-07 which should have been laid by 31.12.2005, 31.12.2006 and 31.12.2007 respectively have not been laid so far. The delay in laying the NCW documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee have earlier examined the NCW and recommended in their 11th Report (13th Lok Sabha) that the Ministry should adhere to Committee's recommendations scrupulously for initiating remedial measures to avoid delays in future. The Committee are constrained to observe that though the Ministry regretted for the delay and assured to initiate suitable steps to lay the documents in time, no improvement has since been noticed in this regard. The Committee feel that no serious efforts have been made by Ministry of Women and Child Development as well as NCW to ensure timely submission of the documents of the Commission to the House, which reflects negligence and abdication of responsibility on their part. Therefore, the Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation and recommend that the Ministry should make all out efforts to lay the documents of the Commission for the years 2004-05, 2005-06, and 2006-07 on the Table of the House at the earliest and the documents for the year 2007-08 be laid within the stipulated period. The Committee may be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

Reply by the Government

As per Section 14 of National Commission for Women (NCW) Act, 1990 the Annual Reports of the National Commission for Women (NCW) and the Audited Accounts/Audit Reports of the Commission are to be laid in Parliament alongwith the Memorandum of Action Taken in respect of the recommendations contained in the Annual Report. These recommendations pertain to many Ministries/Departments and obtaining Action Taken Reports from all the concerned Ministries/Departments becomes a time taking process. An inter-Ministerial Committee co-chaired by Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development and Member-Secretary, National Commission for Women has been set up to monitor furnishing of ATNs on the recommendations contained in Annual Reports of the Commission. This

Committee has the representatives of those Ministries/Departments which are concerned with recommendations at a level no below the rank of Joint Secretary in the concerned Ministries/Departments. Serious efforts made by Ministry of Women and Child Development resulted that the Annual Reports of NCW during the years 2004-05 & 2005-06 laid on the Table of the House on 24.10.2008 and 2006-07 was laid on 19.12.2008. Ministry of Women & Child Development is also taking necessary steps for the documents for the year 2007-08 to be laid within the stipulated period. The Annual Report for the year 2007-08 is under preparation by the Commission.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2.21)

One of the oft repeated recommendations of the Committee is that if for any reasons the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of an organization could not be laid within nine months after the close of accounting year, the concerned Ministry should lay a statement within 30 days after the expiry of nine months or as soon as the House meets, whichever is later stating the reasons why the Annual Report and Audited Accounts could not be laid within the stipulated time period. The Committee note that the Ministry did not comply even with this requirement for the years 2001-2002, 2002-03 and 2003-04. The Committee, therefore, deplore the lack of seriousness on the part of the Ministry as they did not care to lay even a statement in time to apprise the Parliament and its members of the reasons for delay in laying Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Commission. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Ministry should be more careful in future in such matters.

Reply by the Government

The reasons for delay in laying Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Commission have already been laid on the Table of the House with the Annual Report for the years 2001-02 to 2006-07. However, the recommendation of the Committee has been noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph. No. 2.22)

The Committee have also recommended that in the “Statement of reasons of delay”, the Government should invariably indicate in chronological order the dates of finalisation of reports and accounts, their submission to audit, issue of inspection report, replies given on points raised in the report, the receipt of audit report from the audit authorities, translation and printing of reports and finally the documents sent to the Ministry for laying so that the Committee may identify the stages and extent of delay and suggest remedial measures therefor. However the Committee observe that the delay statements laid by the Ministry did not contain the such details. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and expect the Ministry to follow it in future.

Reply by the Government

Recommendation noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph. No. 2.23)

The Committee also note that the time schedule indicating specific time for completion of the task at each stage involved in finalisation of the documents was not followed by the NCW, which indicates the negligence and lackadaisical approach adopted by the Commission. Therefore, the Committee strongly recommend that the time schedule should be strictly followed by the Commission in future, which will also help them in timely submission of the documents to the Ministry and if, need arises the Ministry may prepare a fresh time schedule after consulting the Commission.

Reply by the Government

Recommendation noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.24)

The Committee had recommended in their 11th Report (13th Lok Sabha) that the Commission should streamline the process of translation and printing of the documents. The tenders for printing may be invited to complete the printing work within a time bound schedule. But the Committee feel that the Commission did not take up the matter with the seriousness it deserved, as tenders were not invited by the Commission which resulted in 4 to 5 months delay in translation and Printing of the Accounts which

indicates the lack of urgency on the part of the Commission in this regard. Therefore, the Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation and recommend that the tenders for translation and Printing work be invited in time to avoid delays in future in laying the documents within stipulated time.

Reply by the Government

Recommendation noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2.25)

The Committee are dismayed to note that the Commission took 22 months to send the documents to the Ministry after its approval for the year 2003-04. The reasons put forth by the Commission for the delay due to shortage of staff is not acceptable to the Committee. In their view, the Commission should have taken necessary steps to fill the vacancies in time. The Committee, therefore, recommend that immediate necessary steps should be taken by the Commission to fill up the vacancies so that delay in laying the documents in time should not occur in future on this account. The Committee also note that the Ministry took 25, 30 and 12 months in laying the final documents of the Commission for the years 2001-02, 2002-03 and 2003-04 respectively after receipt of the same from the Commission. It was stated that the delay was largely due to obtaining the Action Taken Report on the recommendations contained in the Annual Reports of the Commission as the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are to be laid in the Parliament alongwith the Memorandum of Action Taken in respect of the recommendations contained in the Annual Report as per section 14 of NCW Act. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should pursue the matter with the concerned Ministries/Departments and make concerted efforts for obtaining the Action Taken Reports well in time from the concerned Ministries/Departments to avoid delays in future in laying the documents on this account. The Committee also recommend that the Ministry should lay the Memoranda of Action Taken along with the Annual Reports which are received by the Commission by the scheduled time of sending the documents for laying before the Parliament and the remaining Memoranda of Action Taken which are received late after sending the documents to the Parliament should be laid separately. For this, if need be, Section 14 of NCW Act should be suitably amended. The Committee may be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

Reply by the Government

An inter-Ministerial Committee co-chaired by Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development and Member-Secretary, National Commission for Women has been set up to monitor furnishing of ATNs on the recommendations contained in Annual Reports of the Commission. This Committee has the representation of those Ministries/Departments which are concerned with the recommendations, at a level not below the rank of Joint Secretary in the Concerned Ministries/Departments. Serious efforts made by Ministry of Women and Child Development resulted that the Annual Reports of NCW during the years 2004-05 & 2005-06 laid on the Table of the House on 24.10.2008 and 2006-07 was laid on 19.12.2008. Ministry of Women & Child Development is also taking necessary steps for the documents for the year 2007-08 to be laid with the stipulated period. The Annual Report for the year 2007-08 is under preparation of the Commission.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

**STATEMENT SHOWING ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE
RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR
TWENTY-FIRST REPORT (14TH LOK SABHA)**

National Horticulture Board, Gurgaon

Recommendation (Paragraph. No. 1.18)

National Horticulture Board, Gurgaon under the Control of the Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture and Cooperation) has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts. A scrutiny of the dates of laying of these documents of the Board pertaining to the years from 2003-04 to 2006-07 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 9½ to 16½ months in respect of these years. The documents for the year 2007-2008 which should have been laid by 31.12.2008 have not been laid as yet. The delay in laying the Board's documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee had as early as in their 5th Report and again in 21st Report (10 Lok Sabha) brought out the Ministry's failure to adhere to the time schedule of laying the documents pertaining to National Horticulture Board. The Committee are distressed to point out that the Ministry of Agriculture have not cared all these years to evolve any mechanism to ensure timely laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts and prompt discharge of their responsibility towards Parliament regarding National Horticulture Board which receives an annual grant of over Rs. 118 crore a year. The Committee has now been informed that the Joint Secretary (Administration) in the Department of Agriculture has been designated as a nodal officer to ensure timely laying of documents. The Committee recommend that the time schedule so drawn up should be strictly adhered to so that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Board are laid in time in future.

Reply of the Government

The Department of Agriculture & Cooperation has instructed the Managing Director, National Horticulture Board, vide letter No. 12-54/2008-Hort. Dated the 13th May, 2009, to note the observations of the Hon'ble Committee for compliance and strictly adhere to the prescribed time schedule.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1.19)

The Committee find that while the delay is partly attributable to the long time taken in auditing of accounts, the main reason for delay has been on the part of the Board for the years 2003-04 to 2006-07 in compilation of accounts, getting approval of documents and completing other formalities like translation of the documents in Hindi etc. The Committee find that the Board took 6 to 11 months in compilation of accounts for the years 2003-04 to 2005-06. The Board also took 9½ and 2½ months in translation of documents in Hindi for the years 2003-04 and 2005-06. The committee feel that the inordinate delay on the part of the Board in compilation of accounts and getting the documents translated into Hindi was within the control of the Board and thus avoidable. The committee, however, note that in order to avoid any such delay in future, the Board has taken a few steps such as outsourcing personnel for preparation of accounts and auditing, advance action for translation work etc. The Committee hope that with these measures the delay would be avoided in future.

Reply of the Government

From the year 2006-07, the Board has outsourced the internal audit work to the Chartered Accountant Firm, to ensure timely completion of accounts work and also to finalize the annual accounts. The translation work relating to Hindi has been done by the Hindi Division of the Board and that, in case it is not possible for the Board for translation of the Annual Report and audited accounts in time, the work will be outsourced to any agency, to complete the work in time and avoid any delay.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1.20)

The Committee also note that the time taken in auditing of accounts and furnishing the audit report ranges from 6 to 8 months every year. The reasons for taking such a long time for completing the audit report are not clear. The Committee would like the Ministry of Agriculture to take up with C&AG the issue of timely completion of audit to avoid consequential delay in laying the documents before the Parliament.

Reply of the Government

The Department of Agriculture & Cooperation has written to the Comptroller & Auditor General (C&AG) of India, vide letter No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated the 13th May, 2009, to note the observations of the Hon'ble Committee for suitable action.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1.21)

The Committee also note that after receipt of the Audited Accounts for the years 2003-04 to 2005-06 from C&AG, the Board took 1 to 5 months in getting approval of the documents from its Board of Directors. The Committee feel that the reasons of this nature are well within the control of the management of the National Horticulture Board and thus avoidable. The Committee, therefore, recommend that approval of documents from the Board of Directors should be obtained as soon as the documents are finalised so as to avoid any consequential delay. The Committee desire that they may be apprised of the steps taken by the Ministry/Board to avert such delays in future.

Reply of the Government

The instructions of the Hon'ble Committee have been noted and it will be ensured that whenever the Audit Report is received from the office of C&AG, the same will be placed before the Board of Directors within the stipulated time.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority, Manipur

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2.16)

The Committee note that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority for the years 2003-04 to 2005-06 were laid on the Table of the House after delays ranging from 12 to 24 months. The documents for the years 2006-07 and 2007-08 which were due to be laid by 31.12.2007 and 31.12.2008 respectively have not been laid so far. As per recommendation of the Committee where the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are not laid within the stipulated period of time (after 9 months of the accounting year), the delay statement should be laid on the Table of the House within 30 days after the expiry of the prescribed period or as soon as the House meets, whichever is later.

The Committee are distressed to note that the “Delay Statements” in respect of the Authority have also not been laid as per this requirement during the years 2004-05 to 2006-07. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Ministry/Authority should make vigorous efforts for laying of the Audited Accounts and Annual Report in time. The Committee also recommend that a delay statement should invariably be laid on the Table of the House within the stipulated period in future whenever the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are not laid within 9 months of the close of the accounting year.

Reply of the Government

The Annual Reports, Audited Accounts and delay statement of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan for the year 2006-07 were received from the State Implementation Society, Manipur on 12.02.2009. After getting it authenticated by MOS (HRD), requisite number of copies were sent to Lok Sabha/Rajya Sabha on 23.02.2009. The Annual Reports, Review Statement and Delay Statement were laid on the Table of Lok Sabha on 26.02.2009.

Government of Manipur have informed on 09.04.2009 that in respect of 2007-08 accounts of SSA, SMA Manipur, audit is in progress and expected to be completed by May,2009. As soon as the audit is completed, Annual Reports and Audited Reports for the year 2007-08 along with delay statement (both in Hindi and English) will be submitted to the Ministry of HRD, GOI for laying on the Table of Lok Sabha.

The recommendation of the Committee that a delay statement should invariably be laid on the Table of House within the stipulated period in future wherever the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are not laid within 9 months of the close of the accounting year, has been noted for compliance and the requirement will be complied with while laying Reports in future.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2.17)

The Committee find that one of the reasons for delay in laying of the documents on the Table of the House was due to the disturbances/ interference of different groups of unwanted elements which affect the working atmosphere. The Committee feel that even after accounting for such factors, nine months period was more than sufficient to complete the reports and lay them on the Table of the House. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Department of School Education & Literacy should pay due attention into the

affairs of the Authority seriously to ensure that the Authority discharges its accountability to Parliament every year within the laid down time frame.

Reply of the Government

The State Implementation Society, SSA, Manipur has informed that as advised by the Parliamentary Committee on Papers Laid on the Table, the State has invited Expression of Interest from reputed CA Firms through open advertisement in the local and national dailies and selected two CA Firms as external auditors to ensure that all datelines are met as per guidelines of SSA. The audit of SSA account of Manipur will start very soon and the Annual Reports and Audited statements for 2008-09 will be submitted within the dateline.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2.18)

The Committee find that another reason for the delay in finalisation of the documents was due to shortage of accounts knowing staff at the districts and the State level. It has, however, been informed that the Authority has now obtained approval of appointment of 14 accountants at the districts and the State level and one-audit officer at the State level. The Committee hope that with the help of 14 accountants at the districts and the state level, the work of finalisation of accounts will be completed within the stipulated time period. The Committee, therefore, recommend that immediate necessary steps should be taken by the Authority/Ministry to fill up the vacancies so that delay in laying the documents does not occur in future on this account. The Committee would also like to know the action taken in this regard.

Reply of the Government

As intimated by State Implementation Society, the SSA SMA Manipur has recently recruited one – Internal Audit Officer and 14 Accountants among others at the district and state level to improve accounting and financial reporting of SSA Manipur with a view to ensure timely audit of SSA Accounts and submission of Audited statements and Annual Reports to the Ministry within the timeline.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

Recommendation (Paragraph. No. 2.19)

From the information furnished by the Ministry/Authority the Committee find that another reason for delay in finalisation of the documents of the Authority is the long time taken in auditing of accounts and issue of audit certificate by C.A. Firm. The Committee note that after appointment of auditors, the C.A. Firm took 11 and 13½ for the years 2004-05 and 2005-06 respectively in auditing the accounts and furnishing the final Audit Certificate to the Authority. The reasons put forth for delay in auditing of the accounts is authorization of only two agencies for auditing in Manipur. On being pointed out by the Committee, the Ministry stated that they would take up the matter with C&AG and request them to place a bigger panel of auditors in the State. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the matter should be taken up with C&AG at a senior level to ensure that there is no delay at the stage of audit and release of audit certificate by them. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the outcome of the efforts made in this regard. They also desire that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Authority for the years 2006-07 and 2007-08 should be finalised and laid on the Table of the House without any further delay.

Reply of the Government

As regards the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for 2006-07, the printed copies of documents were received in the Ministry on 12.02.2009 and the same have been laid before Lok Sabha on 26.02.2009. With regard to Annual Report and Audited Accounts for 2007-08 the Ministry vide letter No. 15/19/2007-SSA(PR) dated 26.12.2008 has requested the Principal Director (Commercial), office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India, New Delhi to expand that list of empanelled Auditors for States where only two firms are empanelled and to convey the revised list to this Ministry. The States include Arunachal Pradesh, Manipur etc. No response has been received from the office of Comptroller and Auditor General of India as yet. The matter is being pursued with the office of C&AG. The State has however simultaneously taken steps to appoint CA Firms from outside Manipur as the lone firm in the State remained over burdened with work and took inordinately long time to complete audit. The Annual Reports and Audited Accounts 2006-07 of SSA State Mission Authority, Manipur were laid on the Table of Lok Sabha on 26.02.2009. The SSA State Mission Authority has intimated that the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for 2007-08 are under preparation and necessary exercise is proposed to be completed by June, 2009.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

**STATEMENT SHOWING ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE
RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN
THEIR TWENTIETH REPORT (14TH LOK SABHA)**

Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.18)

The Committee note that Malaviya National Institute of Technology under the Control of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts. A scrutiny of the dates of laying of these documents of the Institute pertaining to the years from 2000-2001 to 2005-2006 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 14 months to 23 months in respect of each year. The documents for the year 2006-2007 which should have been laid by 31.12.2007 have not been laid as yet. The delay in laying the Institute's documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee had as early as in 2001-02 (7th Report-13th Lok Sabha) brought out the Ministry's failure to adhere to the time schedule of laying Institute's documents. The Committee are distressed to point out that the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) have not cared all these years to evolve any mechanism to ensure timely laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts and prompt discharge of their responsibility towards Parliament regarding Institute which receives an annual grant of over Rs.13.32 crore a year. The Committee hope that the Ministry will institute a regular monitoring mechanism to adhering to the time schedule prepared by the Ministry so that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Institute are laid before Parliament in time in future. The Committee would like to be apprised of the time schedule prepared in this regard.

Reply by the Government

There has been delay in submission of the Annual Report and Annual Accounts on the Table of Lok Sabha due to (i) Delay in conducting of audit and issue of audit certificate by A.G. Rajasthan (ii) Transition of the Institute from Malaviya Regional Engineering College, Jaipur to Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur (iii) Internal problem prevailing at that time.

The Institute has taken steps to clear the backlog of pending reports. As a result, the Annual Reports & Annual Accounts for 2003-04, 2004-05, 2005-06 have since been placed on the table of Lok Sabha.

The Annual Report & Annual Audited Accounts for the year 2006-07 were sent to the Lok Sabha Table office on 16.12.2008. The delay in preparation of the reports for 2006-07 was primarily due to late (i) arrival of Audit party for the Institute's Audit and (ii) issue of audit certificate by the A.G. Rajasthan. At the same time, the office of A.G. in Jaipur has been requested for timely conducting the audit of the Institute and issuing audit certificate at the earliest so that the same can be submitted in both the Houses of Parliament in time.

Another reason is insistence on the part of the A.G. Office to know whether the Annual Report & Audit Report for the previous year has been laid or not. As per State AG, they will take up audit only when the previous reports are laid. The State AG was informed not to insist on the same and take up the audit immediately on receipt of accounts from the Institute.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development O.M. No. 7-21/2008-TS-III dated 18.3.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.19)

The Committee find from the information furnished by the Ministry that the main reasons for delay for the year 2000-01 to 2003-04 were primarily due to late finalisation, audit delay, transition of the Institute (on 26.6.2002) from a regional Engineering College to National Institute of Technology and getting approval of documents from the Board of Governors. The Committee have further been informed that presently there is no problem in convening the meeting of Board of Governors. The Committee also note that the Institute has hired a Chartered Accountant for internal auditing of the Institute accounts and to resolve the audit objection/queries, which will help the Institute in adhering to the timeframe by Ministry of Human Resource Development. The Committee hope that with the introduction of the internal audit cell, the number of audit queries will go down which would facilitate expeditious completion of audit of accounts.

Reply by the Government

The backlog of previous years' Annual Reports & Annual Audited Accounts has been cleared after October 2005.

The Annual Accounts of 2005-06 and 2006-07 were finalized by the Institute in time; but could not be sent to this Ministry because of long time taken by AG for issuing audit certificate. At present, Board of Governors meetings are held at regular intervals and number of Audit observations/queries has come down considerably.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development O.M. No. 7-21/2008-TS-III dated 18.3.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.20)

The Committee note that the time taken by Accountant General, Rajasthan for completing their task of audit report in respect of the Institute was 7 to 12 months from the years 2000-2001 to 2004-2005. The reasons for taking such a long time for completing the audit report was stated to be getting approval of the Annual Accounts along-with the Audit memos/paras from the CAG Office, New Delhi which were sent by Accountant General, Rajasthan. The Committee feel that the problem can be overcome if the matter is appropriately taken up with Audit Authorities. The Committee would like the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education) to take up with the A.G. Rajasthan the question of the need for timely completion of audit to avoid consequential delay in laying the documents before Parliament.

Reply by the Government

The Institute sends request to the AG Rajasthan for sending the audit party for audit of the Institute. Now, timely action is taken by AG Rajasthan for sending the audit party; but it takes some time before the final audit report is received. The audit team came to the institute on 21st August, 2008 for auditing the accounts of 2007-08 and completed the inspection on 24th October 2008. English version of the draft audit report was received for comments and the Institute has since sent replies thereto. The audit report is still awaited from the AG Rajasthan. The Annual Report for 2007-08 has, however, been received in this Ministry. Once the Annual Accounts are received from the institute, necessary action will be taken to lay both these Reports on the Table of Lok Sabha.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development O.M. No. 7-21/2008-TS-III dated 18.3.2009)

National Commission for Women, New Delhi

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.20)

The Committee note that the National Commission for Women (NCW) under the administrative control of the Ministry of Women and Child Development has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of annual reports and audited accounts. A scrutiny of dates of laying of these documents of the Commission pertaining to the years 2001-02 to 2003-2004 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 33 to 38 months in respect of each year. The documents for the years 2004-05, 2005-06 and 2006-07 which should have been laid by 31.12.2005, 31.12.2006 and 31.12.2007 respectively have not been laid so far. The delay in laying the NCW documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee have earlier examined the NCW and recommended in their 11th Report (13th Lok Sabha) that the Ministry should adhere to Committee's recommendations scrupulously for initiating remedial measures to avoid delays in future. The Committee are constrained to observe that though the Ministry regretted for the delay and assured to initiate suitable steps to lay the documents in time, no improvement has since been noticed in this regard. The Committee feel that no serious efforts have been made by Ministry of Women and Child Development as well as NCW to ensure timely submission of the documents of the Commission to the House, which reflects negligence and abdication of responsibility on their part. Therefore, the Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation and recommend that the Ministry should make all out efforts to lay the documents of the Commission for the years 2004-05, 2005-06, and 2006-7 on the Table of the House at the earliest and the documents for the year 2007-08 be laid within the stipulated period. The Committee may be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

Reply by the Government

As per Section 14 of National Commission for Women (NCW) Act, 1990 the Annual Reports of the National Commission for Women (NCW) and the Audited Accounts/Audit Reports of the Commission are to be laid in Parliament alongwith the Memorandum of Action Taken in respect of the recommendations contained in the Annual Report. These recommendations pertain to many Ministries/Departments and obtaining Action Taken Reports from all the concerned Ministries/Departments becomes a time taking process. An inter-Ministerial Committee co-chaired by Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development and Member-Secretary, National Commission for Women has been set up to monitor furnishing of ATNs on the recommendations contained in Annual Reports of the Commission. This Committee has the representatives of those Ministries/Departments. Serious efforts made by Ministry of Women and Child Development resulted that the Annual Reports of NCW during the years 2004-05 & 2005-06 laid on the Table of the House on 24.10.2008 and 2006-07 was laid on 19.12.2008. Ministry of Women & Child Development is also taking necessary steps for the documents for the year 2007-08 to be laid within the stipulated period. The Annual Report for the year 2007-08 is under preparation by the Commission.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.21)

One of the oft repeated recommendations of the Committee is that if for any reasons the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of an organization could not be laid within nine months after the close of accounting year, the concerned Ministry should lay a statement within 30 days after the expiry of nine months or as soon as the House meets, whichever is later stating the reasons why the Annual Report and Audited Accounts could not be laid within the stipulated time period. The Committee note that the Ministry did not comply even with this requirement for the years 2001-2002, 2002-03 and 2003-04. The Committee, therefore, deplore the lack of seriousness on the part of the Ministry as they did not care to lay even a statement in time to apprise the Parliament and its members of the reasons for delay in laying Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Commission. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Ministry should be more careful in future in such matters.

Reply by the Government

The reasons for delay in laying Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Commission have already been laid on the Table of the House with the Annual Report for the years 2001-02 to 2006-07. However, the recommendation of the Committee has been noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.22)

The Committee have also recommended that in the “Statement of reasons of delay”, the Government should invariably indicate in chronological order the dates of finalisation of reports and accounts, their submission to audit, issue of inspection report, replies given on points raised in the report, the receipt of audit report from the audit authorities, translation and printing of reports and finally the documents sent to the Ministry for laying so that the Committee may identify the stages and extent of delay and suggest remedial measures therefor. However the Committee observe that the delay statements laid by the Ministry did not contain the such details. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and expect the Ministry to follow it in future.

Reply by the Government

Recommendation noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.23)

The Committee also note that the time schedule indicating specific time for completion of the task at each stage involved in finalisation of the documents was not followed by the NCW, which indicates the negligence and lackadaisical approach adopted by the Commission. Therefore, the Committee strongly recommend that the time schedule should be strictly followed by the Commission in future, which will also help them in timely submission of the documents to the Ministry and if, need arises the Ministry may prepare a fresh time schedule after consulting the Commission.

Reply by the Government

Recommendation noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.24)

The Committee had recommended in their 11th Report (13th Lok Sabha) that the Commission should streamline the process of translation and printing of the documents. The tenders for printing may be invited to complete the printing work within a time bound schedule. But the Committee feel that the Commission did not take up the matter with the seriousness it deserved, as tenders were not invited by the Commission which resulted in 4 to 5 months delay in translation and Printing of the Accounts which indicates the lack of urgency on the part of the Commission in this regard. Therefore, the Committee reiterate their earlier recommendation and recommend that the tenders for translation and Printing work be invited in time to avoid delays in future in laying the documents within stipulated time.

Reply by the Government

Recommendation noted for future compliance.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.25)

The Committee are dismayed to note that the Commission took 22 months to send the documents to the Ministry after its approval for the year 2003-04. The reasons put forth by the Commission for the delay due to shortage of staff is not acceptable to the Committee. In their view, the Commission should have taken necessary steps to fill the vacancies in time. The Committee, therefore, recommend that immediate necessary steps should be taken by the Commission to fill up the vacancies so that delay in laying the documents in time should not occur in future on this account. The Committee also note that the Ministry took 25, 30 and 12 months in laying the final documents of the Commission for the years 2001-02, 2002-03 and 2003-04 respectively after receipt of the same from the Commission. It was stated that the delay was largely due to obtaining the Action Taken Report on the recommendations contained in the Annual Reports of the Commission as the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are to be laid in the Parliament alongwith the Memorandum of Action Taken in respect of the recommendations contained in the Annual Report as per section 14 of NCW Act. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should pursue the matter with the concerned Ministries/Departments and make concerted efforts for obtaining the Action Taken Reports well in time from the concerned Ministries/Departments to avoid delays in future in laying the documents on this account. The Committee also recommend that the Ministry should lay the Memoranda of Action Taken along with the Annual Reports which are received by the Commission by the scheduled time of sending the documents for laying before the Parliament and the remaining Memoranda of Action Taken which are received late after sending the documents to the Parliament should be laid separately. For this, if need be, Section 14 of NCW Act should be suitably amended. The Committee may be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

Reply by the Government

An inter-Ministerial Committee co-chaired by Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development and Member-Secretary, National Commission for Women has been set up to monitor furnishing of ATNs on the recommendations contained in Annual Reports of the Commission. This Committee has the representation of those Ministries/Departments which are concerned with the recommendations, at a level not below the rank of Joint Secretary in the Concerned Ministries/Departments. Serious efforts made by Ministry of Women and Child Development resulted that the Annual Reports of NCW during the years 2004-05 & 2005-06 laid on the Table of

the House on 24.10.2008 and 2006-07 was laid on 19.12.2008. Ministry of Women & Child Development is also taking necessary steps for the documents for the year 2007-08 to be laid with the stipulated period. The Annual Report for the year 2007-08 is under preparation of the Commission.

(Ministry of Women and Child Development O.M. No. 6-56/2007-WW dated 23.01.2009)

**STATEMENT SHOWING ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE
RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN
THEIR TWENTY FIRST REPORT (14TH LOK SABHA)**

National Horticulture Board, Gurgaon

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.18)

National Horticulture Board, Gurgaon under the Control of the Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture and Cooperation) has been a habitual defaulter in the matter of timely laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts. A scrutiny of the dates of laying of these documents of the Board pertaining to the years from 2003-04 to 2006-07 shows that the delay in laying the documents ranges from 9½ to 16½ months in respect of these years. The documents for the year 2007-2008 which should have been laid by 31.12.2008 have not been laid as yet. The delay in laying the Board's documents by the Ministry is not of recent origin. The Committee had as early as in their 5th Report and again in 21st Report (10 Lok Sabha) brought out the Ministry's failure to adhere to the time schedule of laying the documents pertaining to National Horticulture Board. The Committee are distressed to point out that the Ministry of Agriculture have not cared all these years to evolve any mechanism to ensure timely laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts and prompt discharge of their responsibility towards Parliament regarding National Horticulture Board which receives an annual grant of over Rs. 118 crore a year. The Committee has now been informed that the Joint Secretary (Administration) in the Department of Agriculture has been designated as a nodal officer to ensure timely laying of documents. The Committee recommend that the time schedule so drawn up should be strictly adhered to so that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Board are laid in time in future.

Reply of the Government

The Department of Agriculture & Cooperation has instructed the Managing Director, National Horticulture Board, vide letter No. 12-54/2008-Hort. Dated the 13th May, 2009, to note the observations of the Hon'ble Committee for compliance and strictly adhere to the prescribed time schedule.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.19)

The Committee find that while the delay is partly attributable to the long time taken in auditing of accounts, the main reason for delay has been on the part of the Board for the years 2003-04 to 2006-07 in compilation of accounts, getting approval of documents and completing other formalities like translation of the documents in Hindi etc. The Committee find that the Board took 6 to 11 months in compilation of accounts for the years 2003-04 to 2005-06. The Board also took 9½ and 2½ months in translation of documents in Hindi for the years 2003-04 and 2005-06. The committee feel that the inordinate delay on the part of the Board in compilation of accounts and getting the documents translated into Hindi was within the control of the Board and thus avoidable. The committee, however, note that in order to avoid any such delay in future, the Board has taken a few steps such as outsourcing personnel for preparation of accounts and auditing, advance action for translation work etc. The Committee hope that with these measures the delay would be avoided in future.

Reply of the Government

From the year 2006-07, the Board has outsourced the internal audit work to the Chartered Accountant Firm, to ensure timely completion of accounts work and also to finalize the annual accounts. The translation work relating to Hindi has been done by the Hindi Division of the Board and that, in case it is not possible for the Board for translation of the Annual Report and audited accounts in time, the work will be outsourced to any agency, to complete the work in time and avoid any delay.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.20)

The Committee also note that the time taken in auditing of accounts and furnishing the audit report ranges from 6 to 8 months every year. The reasons for taking such a long time for completing the audit report are not clear. The Committee would like the Ministry of Agriculture to take up with C&AG the issue of timely completion of audit to avoid consequential delay in laying the documents before the Parliament.

Reply of the Government

The Department of Agriculture & Cooperation has written to the Comptroller & Auditor General (C&AG) of India, vide letter No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated the 13th May, 2009, to note the observations of the Hon'ble Committee for suitable action.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 1.21)

The Committee also note that after receipt of the Audited Accounts for the years 2003-04 to 2005-06 from C&AG, the Board took 1 to 5 months in getting approval of the documents from its Board of Directors. The Committee feel that the reasons of this nature are well within the control of the management of the National Horticulture Board and thus avoidable. The Committee, therefore, recommend that approval of documents from the Board of Directors should be obtained as soon as the documents are finalised so as to avoid any consequential delay. The Committee desire that they may be apprised of the steps taken by the Ministry/Board to avert such delays in future.

Reply of the Government

The instructions of the Hon'ble Committee have been noted and it will be ensured that whatever the Audit Report is received from the office of C&AG, the same will be placed before the Board of Directors within the stipulated time.

(Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agriculture & Cooperation) O.M. No. 12.54/2008-Hort. Dated 22.5.2009)

Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority, Manipur

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.16)

The Committee note that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan State Mission Authority for the years 2003-04 to 2005-06 were laid on the Table of the House after delays ranging from 12 to 24 months. The documents for the years 2006-07 and 2007-08 which were due to be laid by 31.12.2007 and 31.12.2008 respectively have not been laid so far. As per recommendation of the Committee where the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are not laid within the stipulated period of time (after 9 months of the accounting year), the delay statement should be laid on the Table of the House within 30 days after the expiry of the prescribed period or as soon as the House meets, whichever is later. The Committee are distressed to note that the "Delay Statements" in respect of the Authority have also not been laid as per this requirement during the years 2004-05 to 2006-07. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Ministry/Authority should make vigorous efforts for laying of the Audited Accounts and Annual Report in time. The Committee also recommend that a delay statement should invariably be laid on the Table of the House within the stipulated period in future whenever the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are not laid within 9 months of the close of the accounting year.

Reply of the Government

The Annual Reports, Audited Accounts and delay statement of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan for the year 2006-07 were received from the State Implementation Society, Manipur on 12.02.2009. After getting it authenticated by MOS (HRD), requisite number of copies were sent to Lok Sabha/Rajya Sabha on 23.02.2009. The Annual Reports, Review Statement and Delay Statement were laid on the Table of Lok Sabha on 26.02.2009.

Government of Manipur have informed on 09.04.2009 that in respect of 2007-08 accounts of SSA, SMA Manipur, audit is in progress and expected to be completed by May,2009. As soon as the audit is complete, Annual Reports and Audited Reports for the year 2007-08 along with delay statement (both in Hindi and English) will be submitted to the Ministry of HRD, GOI for laying on the Table of Lok Sabha.

The recommendation of the Committee that a delay statement should invariably be laid on the Table of House within the stipulated period in further wherever the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts are not laid within 9 months of the close of the accounting year, has been noted for compliance and the requirement will be complied with while laying Reports in future.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.17)

The Committee find that one of the reasons for delay in laying of the documents on the Table of the House was due to the disturbances/ interference of different groups of unwanted elements which affect the working atmosphere. The Committee feel that even after accounting for such factors, nine months period was more than sufficient to complete the reports and lay them on the Table of the House. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Department of School Education & Literacy should pay due attention into the affairs of the Authority seriously to ensure that the Authority discharges its accountability to Parliament every year with in the laid down time frame.

Reply of the Government

The State Implementation Society, SSA, Manipur has informed that as advised by the Parliamentary Committee on Papers Laid on the Table, the State has invited Expression of Interest from reputed CA Firms through open advertisement in the local and national dailies and selected two CA Firms as external auditors to ensure that all datelines are met as per guidelines of SSA. The audit of SSA account of Manipur will start very soon and the Annual Reports and Audited statements for 2008-09 will be submitted within the dateline.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

Recommendation (Sl. No. 2.18)

The Committee find that another reason for the delay in finalisation of the documents was due to shortage of accounts knowing staff at the districts and the State level. It has, however, been informed that the Authority has now obtained approval of appointment of 14 accountants at the districts and the State level and one-audit officer at the State level. The Committee hope that with the help of 14 accountants at the districts and the state level, the work of finalisation of accounts will be completed with in the stipulated time period. The Committee, therefore, recommend that immediate necessary steps should be taken by the Authority/Ministry to fill up the vacancies so

that delay in laying the documents does not occur in future on this account. The Committee would also like to know the action taken in this regard.

Reply of the Government

As intimated by State Implementation Society, the SSA SMA Manipur has recently recruited one – Internal Audit Officer and 14 Accountants among others at the district and state level to improve accounting and financial reporting of SSA Manipur with a view to ensure timely audit of SSA Accounts and submission of Audited statements and Annual Reports to the Ministry within the timeline.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009)

Recommendation (Paragarph No. 2.19)

From the information furnished by the Ministry/Authority the Committee find that another reason for delay in finalisation of the documents of the Authority is the long time taken in auditing of accounts and issue of audit certificate by C.A. Firm. The Committee note that after appointment of auditors, the C.A. Firm took 11 and 13½ for the years 2004-05 and 2005-06 respectively in auditing the accounts and furnishing the final Audit Certificate to the Authority. The reasons put forth for delay in auditing of the accounts is authorization of only two agencies for auditing in Manipur. On being pointed out by the Committee, the Ministry stated that they would take up the matter with C&AG and request them to place a bigger panel of auditors in the State. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the matter should be taken up with C&AG at a senior level to ensure that there is no delay at the stage of audit and release of audit certificate by them. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the outcome of the efforts made in this regard. They also desire that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Authority for the years 2006-07 and 2007-08 should be finalised and laid on the Table of the House without any further delay.

Reply of the Government

As regards the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for 2006-07, the printed copies of documents were received in the Ministry on 12.02.2009 and the same have been laid before Lok Sabha on 26.02.2009. With regard to Annual Report and Audited Accounts for 2007-08 the Ministry vide letter No. 15/19/2007-SSA(PR) dated 26.12.2008 has requested the Principal

Director (Commercial), office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India, New Delhi to expand that list of empanelled Auditors for States where only two firms are empanelled and to convey the revised list to this Ministry. The States include Arunachal Pradesh, Manipur etc. No response has been received from the office of Comptroller and Auditor General of India as yet. The matter is being pursued with the office of C&AG. The State has however simultaneously taken steps to appoint CA Firms from outside Manipur as the lone firm in the State remained overburdened with work and took inordinately long time to complete audit. The Annual Reports and Audited Accounts 2006-07 of SSA State Mission Authority, Manipur were laid on the Table of Lok Sabha on 26.02.2009. The SSA State Mission Authority has intimated that the Annual Report and Audited Accounts for 2007-08 are under preparation and necessary exercise is proposed to be completed by June, 2009.

(Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy O.M. No. F. 2-2/2008-EE.14 dated 24.4.2009